Freedom of Assembly in Crimea Occupied by the Russian Federation

Problem Statement

A rapid collapse of freedom of peaceful assembly in Crimea started at the very beginning of the annexion with the use of both the proven practices in accordance to Russian federal laws (restricting the peaceful assemblies and persecuting their members) and extralegal methods such as beating, kidnapping and even murders. Human rights organizations have documented the beatings of participants of peaceful assemblies and accelerations for the unity of Ukraine, kidnapping and torturing of their organizers, falsifying administrative and criminal cases against members using various means of administrative pressure (preventive talks with the FSB, illegal searches and seizure of personal stuff, discharging from employment).

The paramilitary criminal group called "Crimean self-defense" is one of the main tools for limiting freedom of assembly in Crimea. It was founded in the middle of February 2014 as a riot squad force for non-peaceful assemblies and capturing of the administrative buildings. June 11, 2014 the occupation authorities passed a special law¹ that gave control to the so-called "Crimean self-defense" directly from the self-proclaimed Crimea head S. Aksionov and Crimean Council of Ministers awarded the status of "people's guard" to these paramilitary criminal groups. Despite the evidence proving that "Crimean self-defense" committed a number of serious crimes, no one of the representatives was prosecuted.

There is a clear traceable connection between the actions of these paramilitary criminal groups and law enforcement. Thus on March 9, 2014 after illegal arrest of the organizer of the rally for the unity of Ukraine, Andriy Shchekun and the social activist Anatoly Kowalski by the "Crimean self-defense" at the railway station, both of them were brought to the nearest police office. Police officers at the police office detained both of these community activists without any registration and gave them back to the hands of other members of the "Crimean self-defense." Both men were held captive for 11 days; during these days Andriy Shchekun was constantly tortured (by electric current, shooting limbs, etc.).

In contrast to the Ukrainian law, where only a preliminary notice of peaceful assembly is needed, Russian law establishes a series of harsh restrictions incompatible with the guiding principles of freedom of peaceful assembly. Here are some of them: the authorization procedure for peaceful assemblies, limiting the number of places for peaceful assemblies, prohibition for children younger than 14 to participate in assemblies, criminal liability for repeated violations of procedure or peaceful assembly and so on.

The occupation authorities pled the Russian law to make their decisions. Thus, the State Council of the Republic of Crimea passed the Law "On ensuring the right of citizens of the Russian Federation to hold meetings, gatherings, demonstrations and pickets in the Republic of Crimea"

August 8, 2014, restricting the freedom of peaceful assemblies. This law requires the notification submitted in writing directly to the local authority of the municipality in time no earlier than 15 and no later than 10 days before the public event. The designated places for the peaceful assembly are determined by the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Crimea taking into account the requirements of the Federal Law "On meetings, gatherings, demonstrations, marches and pickets." For example, Simferopol, a city with more than three hundred thousand people, has only four such places.

There is an obvious discriminatory approach in the application of the Russian laws in Crimea. Some cases of unjustified refusals on granting the permission to peaceful assembly were documented, while the others where allowed when the topic of the assembly was acceptable for the occupying authority. A striking example of this is the "Antimaidan" campaign, held in Simferopol, on February 21, 2015 supporting the policy of Russian President Vladimir Putin. The Crimean branch of the "United Fatherland" party, "Antymaidan" social movement and Russian biker club called "Night Wolves" (who have taken part in the dispersal of Ukrainian shares on the southern coast of Crimea) were the organizers. The event was held in the center of Simferopol, at the intersection of Karl Marx and Pushkin streets. In addition to that, the occupation authorities allowed the organizers to drive cars and motorcycles in the pedestrian zone. Earlier, the very same authorities have identified only four places in Simferopol, where peaceful assembly were allowed to be conducted, and the center of Simferopol is not one of them.

According to the Human Rights Watch: «The last eight months actual Crimean authorities restricted the freedom of speech and the freedom of assembly and intimidated and persecuted those who were opposing Russia's actions in Crimea2". Because of this deliberate policy of the occupation authorities the number of assemblies in Crimea has declined dramatically. The situation is complicated by the fact that there are no NGOs or lawyers specializing in defense of the freedom of peaceful assembly in Crimea. Almost all of them were forced to leave the peninsula for fear of politically motivated prosecutions or impossibility of continuing professional activities.

Here are some cases to illustrate the observation of the right to peaceful assembly in Crimea.

**Prohibition of peaceful actions on cultic dates of Crimean Tatars**

May 16, 2014 self-proclaimed Crimean Prime Minister Sergei Aksionov issued a decree prohibiting the assemblies in Crimea until June 6, 2014, including mourning actions on the occasion of the 70th anniversary of the deportation of Crimean Tatars. S. Aksionov justified the decision in such a way: "Taking into account the continuing events in many cities of the south-eastern Ukraine, resulting in injured and killed civilians, in order to eliminate possible provocations performed by extremists, who are able to enter the territory of Republic of Crimea, to avoid disruption of the holiday season in the Republic of Crimea, we prohibit any mass events in the Republic of Crimea until June 6, 2014".

During negotiations, the Crimean Tatars were allowed to hold the collective prayer and memorial run on May 18, but only on the suburbs of Simferopol. In all other cities of Crimea the Crimean Tatar memorial events were prohibited. During several meetings between the organizers and the self-proclaimed authorities, the authorities repeatedly demanded the Crimean Tatars to demonstrate their loyalty to the Russian Federation in the form of appropriate public

---

2 [http://www.hrw.org/sv/node/124221](http://www.hrw.org/sv/node/124221)
statements or performance of the Russian national anthem during the celebration; however, the Crimean Tatars refused to do that.

June 11, 2014 Tatar Mejlis gave notice to the Simferopil City Council about the mass cultural event dedicated to Tatar Crimean flag on June 26 that was to be held in the city central park. However, on June 17, Mejlis received a written response, refusing to hold this assembly.

The refusal of the local authorities states the following: "In the park named after K.A. Trenov there are playgrounds and attractions currently functioning, especially popular during the school holidays; classes, competitions, exhibitions and other events involving hundreds of children are held here, the School of Music is enrolling students on the 2014-2015 academic year (listening)... gathering of a large number of people in a limited area, not intended for extra number of participants, can create conditions that would disturb public order, the rights and legitimate interests of the others".

In addition, Simferopil City Council refused to approve the route of the motor rally proposed by Mejlis on the Crimean Tatar Flag Day. The city authorities proposed to change the route of the rally and exclude the downtown streets from it. Thus, the Crimean Tatars were prevented from holding a peaceful assembly (rally) in the sight of the target audience.

Crimean Tatar NGO "Kardashlyk" planned to hold a mourning meeting devoted to the European Day of Remembrance for the Victims of Stalinism and Nazism on August 23, 2014. The assembly had to be held in Simferopil in the Gurzufskay street in the "Salgirka" park. The Notice of the assembly was directed to the Simferopil City Council on August 13, 2014, but in 10 days authorities forbade to hold memorial service, explaining its refusal by hot weather, which, according to the local authorities, might harm the health of the participants.

They also forbade the remembrance assembly dedicated to the national hero of Crimean Tatar Noman Chelebidzhihan on February 23, 2015, despite the fact that Crimean Tatar Mejlis proposed to move the action from Simferopil to the private courtyard of the palace Khan in Saray, Bakhchisarai.

"The case of February 26": prosecution for participating in the assembly against the annexion of Crimea

A mass assembly of the pro-Ukrainian activists devoted to the unity of Ukraine was held on February 26, 2014 in front of the building of the Supreme Soviet of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea. At the same time under the building of the Verkhovna Rada of Crimea was counter collections, one of which was attended by representatives of the pro-Russian organizations demanding autonomy joining into. Given neefktyvni actions of the police to ensure the safety of peaceful assembly sutychkya occurred, which resulted in 30 people injured. Thus, participants received head injuries, blunt abdominal trauma etc. 6 people were hospitalized, three of them were in serious condition, 3 - Average³. According to the leader of the Crimean Tatars Mustafa Dzhemilev a rally in support of saving the Crimea as part of Ukraine was attended by about 12-13 thousand Tatars; He also reported the death of 2 people during the confrontation, one man had a heart attack, another woman trampled crowd.

A year after on 30th of December in Bakhchysarai law enforcement officers conducted a search in the house of the deputy head of Mejlis (executive-representative body of the Crimean Tatars) Akhtem Chyigoz⁴. On 4th of February they conducted the interrogation of Asan Chebiyev, a

close relative of one of the coordinators of The Committee for the Protection of Rights of Crimean Tatars Abmedjit Suleimanov. On 7th of February 2015 they arrested Iskender Kantemyr who was suspected in the organization and participation in civil disorder. On 8th of February the court decided to keep Iskender Kantemyrov in prison for two months. According to the investigators he “inflicted bodily harm on several people on 26th of February 2014 in Simferopol”. Akhtem Chyigoz was arrested on 29th of January 2015 on suspicion of organizing and participating in civil disorder. Right now he is under arrest.

On 11th of March 2015 a Crimean Tatar activist Taliata Junusov was arrested; on 23th of March 2015 another member of Mejlis, Ilm Umerov was called for an interrogation. On 27th of March 2015 another interrogation of a member of Mejlis Nariman Jelial was conducted. According to the members of Mejlis legal proceedings directed at them are conducted by the Investigating Committee of the Russian Federation nearly every day.

It should be noted that the rally itself was held on 26th of February 2014 before the pseudo-referendum “at the point of the gun” and the attempts of Russia to legally settle the annexion of Crimea. The human-rights Ombudsman in the Supreme Council of Ukraine commented on the situation the following way “It is the jurisprudential surrealism – I can’t think of a different name for it, because people had the right to participate in peaceful assemblies on Ukrainian territory according to the law. At the moment there is no particular law that would regulate the freedom of assembly, but there is a direct constitutional provision giving each person the right to take part in peaceful assemblies. It is absolutely certain. Actually, these people have been arrested and their houses have been searched, because they used their constitutional right according to Ukrainian law. This is a clear indicator of how the occupying authority treats the law and by the law I mean both, international and Ukrainian.”

The murder of Reshat Akhmetov and the kidnapping of Andriy Shchekun

On 3rd of March 2014 Reshat Akhmetov, 39-year-old inhabitant of Simferopol, the father of three children, left his house. The video cameras recorded his one-man protest against the occupation of Crimea by the Russian military troops on Lenin Square in front of the Crimean Minister’s Council building. There is an episode in the video that clearly shows how several members of the “Crimean self-defense” put an armlock on him and force him to go into the car right at the square. After two weeks Reshat Akhmetov was found dead in the middle of the field near the village called Sunychne of Bilohirskyi district. Numerous signs of torture were found on his body, his head was covered in scotch tape, next to him there was a pair of handcuffs. The cause of his death, as it was later found out, is the stabbing in the ocular region.

The Investigation Committee of the Russian Federation launched criminal proceedings into the murder only at the beginning of April 2014. The bother of the murdered claims that despite the fact that the Russian police has supposedly identified several people accessorial to kidnapping, there is no apprehension or accusation and it is already March, 2015. According to the report of the international organization “In one of the cases documented by the Human Rights Watch in

7 http://www.szona.org/ubijtsy-ne-najdeny-s-momenta-pohishheniya-i-ubijstva-reshata-ametova-proshel-god/
8 http://www.slideshare.net/UkraineCrisisMediaCenter/1-201520150312132710441
March, there were signs of the involvement of self-defense to kidnapping and death through violence of Reshat Akhmetov.

At the same time, namely before the initiative dedicated to the 200 anniversary of Taras Shevchenko’s birthday, there was another heinous kidnapping. This time it happened to the civic activist Andriy Shchekun who was the manager and promoter of the initiative planned to honour the Ukraininan poet. On 9th of March he was arrested at the Simferopil railway station by paramilitary groups. Police denied the fact of Andrew Shchekun mobile group Euromaidan SOS is 10 minutes after the incident came to police station. Instead, police officers gave Andrew the hands of other members of the "Crimean self" captivity in which he and others stayed for 11 days.

During the illegal detention Andrew used torture (electric current, prostrileni limbs, beating). According to him, questioning a so-called "experts", most likely representatives of special services of Russia. March 20, 2014 was released with six Ukrainian, who also were in captivity paramilitary criminal gang. "Both Andriy’s hand are shot by traumatic rubber guns” his wife Liudmyla Shchekum says, wife of Andrew.

"These horrific kidnapping and evidence of torture in Crimea necessarily require a thorough investigation," - said Hugh Williamson, a representative of Human Rights Watch, - "for a few weeks unidentified armed groups had free rein on the Crimean peninsula without explicit legal authority or accountability, and this resulted in a dangerous situation, arbitrary detention, kidnapping and torture."

“Case of May 3”: the pursuit of Crimean Tatars

The occupying authorities banned Mustafa Dzhemilev from entering the territory of Crimea after his stay in mainland Ukraine. On May 2, 2014 he was prevented from flying from Moscow to Simferopol. Next, the leader of Crimean tatars attempted to enter the peninsula by car, but was stopped at a checkpoint “Turetskiy Val” in Armyansk. In protest, crimean tatars headed towards him and blocked the road and the neutral territory (no man’s land). Nevertheless, occupying authorities still prevented Mustafa Dzhemilev from entering the Crimean peninsula. In order to prevent escalation of the situation, Mustafa Dzhemilev urged the protesters to return to Crimea before going back to Kyiv. Self-proclaimed attorney of Crimea Nataliya Poklonska sent the investigative committee and the Federal Security Service of the Russian Federation a resolution on basis of “unlawful public events” in Armyansk during the greeting of Dzhemilev by crimean Tatars. According to Nataliya Poklonska, “Crimean Tatar Mejlis, led by Refat Abdurahmanovich Chubarov held illegal public events of extremist nature in connection with mass disturbances, road blockings, illegal crossing of international border with RF, combined with unlawful obstruction of government agencies, as well as violence.”

“The persecution of those who attempted to peacefully meet Mustafa Dzhemilev in Armyansk or the ones who protested the prohibition of Dzhemilev’s entrance to Crimea, became the first evidence of the government’s intent to restrict the right to freedom of peaceful assembly in Crimea. Until the recent occupation of the peninsula by Russia, such restrictions did not exist.”

This was the comment on the situation in the report of department of operations security of interim president of Ukraine in the affairs of Crimean Tatar people. “Crimean Tatar people on the threshold of 2015”

---

9 https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1ZWd_F4UTTs
10 http://www.wz.lviv.ua/ukraine/126295
11 http://www.hrw.org/sv/node/124221
12 http://www.slideshare.net/UkraineCrisisMediaCenter/1-201520150312132710441
After this incident occupying authorities filed administrative proceedings against dozens of Crimean Tatars across the entire peninsula. Licence plates of cars of Crimean Tatars that came to meet Dzhemilev were recorded on video. Attendants of the peaceful gathering were accused of participating in “public disturbances” and “illegal crossing of the Russian border.” During the first three weeks of hearings at least 49 persons were made to pay fines ranging from 10,000 (approximately $160) to 15,000 Rubles (approximately $240), additionally another six people had to pay a 40,000 Ruble fine (approximately $640). According to “Crimean Field Mission,” as of February 13, 2015, over 100 persons have been fined.

Additionally, 5 persons who were detained in cells with video surveillance had criminal cases opened against them for use of force against the police officers. In December of 2014, Musa Apkerimov, Rustam Abdurakhmanov, Tahir Smedlyayev, Eden Ebulisov. Later they were released on bail due to changes in their preventive measures at the request of the self-proclaimed head of Crimea Sergey Aksenov. On January 19, 2015, 34 year old Eden Osamanov, who was meeting the leader of Crimean Tatars in Armyansk with thousands of other Crimean Tatars, was arrested. On February 6, 2015 investigation unit of FSB of Russia in Crimea and Sevastopol called in to testify the head of CEC of Kurultai of Crimean people, ex member of Mejlis Zair Smedlyayev. However examination scheduled for February 6, 2015 did not take place, due to the lack of Crimean Tatar language interpreter. Investigation on these criminal cases is currently in progress.

Human Rights Watch has reported that organization “did not have an opportunity to hold an independent investigation on the events of May 3 and assess compliance of administrative charges and fines in the particular situation. Eventually the self proclaimed authorities used these events to justify mass searches, warnings and other measures in relations to Crimean Tatar groups and individuals. No additional specific grounds for such measures were cited y the self proclaimed authorities. Considering the scale and intensity and also the vagueness of charges, these measures were likely used as a means of pressure on the representatives of the Crimean Tatar community, who are opposed to the occupation of Crimea and therefore are against Russia.”

The prosecution of participants of the peaceful assembly on August 23, 2014

On August 22-23, 2014 in honor of the state holiday - the Day of National Flag of Ukraine, residents of various regions in Crimea placed Ukrainian flags (in nature reserves, on the tops of mountains, in the park areas, etc.). In different cities Crimeans went out in public places with Ukrainian flag or other Ukrainian symbols.

On this day representatives of the "Crimean self-defense" illegally detained Sergei Oak, the head of the Adult Intensive Care Department of the Simferopol Perinatal Center, who came to the monument to Taras Shevchenko in Simferopol with Ukrainian flag. Representatives of the "Crimean self-defense" illegally handcuffed him and without police participation took Sergei to the police station. The interrogation was led by the chief of the Central Police Department and one of the captains, who, according to Sergei’s words, acted in accordance with the instructions, which the head of the "Crimean self-defence" gave him by telephone. Sergey said that police officers were ordered to apply Art. 20.1 of the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation which meant "petty hooliganism". The "Crimean self-defense" accused him of using foul language in the public place, which is denied both by Sergei, and other witnesses. Sergey

has paid a fine of 1,000 Rubles (approximately $16) and was removed from the post of the head of department, currently he is an ordinary doctor.  

On August 24, 2014 on the Independence Day of Ukraine in Sevastopol, 8 people with the flags of Ukraine came to the pedestal, which was installed in the place of the monument to Ukrainian hetman P. Sahaydachny. After that two activists Victor Nehanov, who was the organizer of the assembly, and Sergey Kornienko were detained by police and taken to the police station of Gagarin district. The attendants of peaceful gathering were held in the police station of Gagarin district for several hours and released without charges. Victor reported that he was threatened with physical violence and that psychological pressure was used against him. During the illegal detention passports and car keys were seized. During the arrest of Sergei Kornienko he felt bad, but the police refused to call the ambulance, which led to his fainting.

The prohibition of the peaceful assembly on the International Human Rights Day

On December 2, 2014, the Chairman of the Central Election Commission Zaire Kurultai Smedlyayev reported that the self-proclaimed authorities of Simferopol do not permit a Crimean Tatar demonstration dedicated to the International Human Rights Day.

On December 7, 2014 the self-proclaimed Crimean prosecutor's office made a warning to Ahtem Chyhyhoza, the deputy chairman of the Majlis, about the inadmissibility of unauthorized assemblies. The corresponding document was handed to him on Saturday night at the border of Ukraine and Crimea in the checkpoint "Armiansk." In response, the organizers Eskender Bariev, Sinaver Kadyrov and Abmedzhyt Suleymanov decided to stage a protest on December 10, 2014, and informed local authorities about their plan. They did not receive a response on their letter. Instead, the Crimean prosecutor's office made an official warning to the three men that holding protests without official permission will be considered illegal.

On December 9, 2014 the Simferopol authorities refused Committee for the Protection of the Crimean Tatars to hold a peaceful protest on December 10 on the Lenin square. The refusal was substantiated by the needs to hold activities connected with celebrations of Christmas and New Year. Later on January 23, 2015 Eskender Bariev, Sinaver Kadyrov and Abmedzhyt Suleymanov were trying to get to the mainland Ukraine, but were stopped by the Russian border guards at the checkpoint in Armyansk. After checking the documents Sinaver Kadyrov was said that as a "foreigner" (Sinaver is a resident of Crimea with Ukrainian passport) he exceeded the maximum time period of 90 days on the peninsula. On the same day he was taken to court, which ruled his deportation from Crimea and ordered to pay a fine of 2000 Rubles (approximately $30). Sinaver Kadyrov was immediately deported and the appeal against the judgment was denied on February 6.

Some time later Eskender Bariev and Limit Suleymanov also left the Crimea, due to the notice from the self-proclaimed Crimean prosecutor about initiating criminal proceedings against them. The notice mentioned that "... among the current criminal investigations there are files concerning the illegal actions of three coordinators of one of unregistered organizations" which is a direct reference to these people as the "Committee for Protection the Rights of the Crimean Tatars" is the only unregistered organization in accordance with Russian law which has three coordinators.

14 http://www.pravda.com.ua/rus/articles/2015/02/27/7059999/view_print/?attempt=1

Persecution of the members of a peaceful assembly commemorating Taras Shevchenko's birth anniversary.

Restriction of peaceful assembly is realized not only in political sphere but also in cultural sphere by occupation power. A peaceful assembly commemorating Taras Shevchenko's birth anniversary on 9 March, 2015 was restricted too. An application for the peaceful assembly in front of a poet’s monument in Simferopol was declined. Afterwards the organizers of the peaceful assembly moved on another place where around 50 persons recited poetries and shouted pro-Ukrainian slogans with Ukrainian symbols.

Oleksandr Kravchenko, Vilidar Shukurdzhiev and Leonid Kuzmin were arrested because of participation in “illegal” assembly. Their cases are considered apart. Court decided that an organizer of the assembly Leonid Kuzmin made a violation because Ukrainian symbols were demonstrated on the assembly and this fact was not indicated in the application. Leonid was fired from a school where he had worked as a history teacher because of “discrepancy of filled post”.

Besides, court decided that a member of the assembly Oleksandr Kravchenko violated order of the assembly because he used symbols which were not indicated in the application, in particular he was dressed with a national Ukrainian shirt and he kept in his hand Ukrainian flag. Vilidar Shukurdzhiev was adjudged guilty of using forbidden symbols, which were not indicated in the application, during the assembly because he kept in his hand Ukrainian flag too. He was imposed punishment 40 hours of corrective labor but no more than 4 hours per day.16

Persecution of Alexander Kostenko, who took part in Euromaidan

The alarm bell was detention of Alexander Kostenko, Euromaidan participant, on 8 February 2015, with his further arrest. The charge against him is that on 18 February 2014, in Kyiv, “being aware of mass unrest in Kyiv aimed at unlawful overthrow of constitutional system” (this is how the occupation powers call Euromaidan protest movement), “he cast a stone with precision” at a militia man due to “the feeling of ideological hatred and animosity to internal affairs officers”.

Thus, a dangerous precedent has occurred, when the Russian Federation prosecutes a Ukrainian citizen for the acts allegedly committed by him in Kyiv, Ukraine, during Euromaidan, against another Ukrainian citizen (according to their words), moreover against a person who, at the time, represented the Ukrainian law-enforcement authorities, i.e. served in a subdivision of the Crimean Berkut. Needless to say that such charge is outside of the legal territory. Given the indefinite number of people in the Crimea who may be subject to prosecution of such kind for participation in or support of Euromaidan and in view of vigorous activity of so called International Civil Committee for Protection of the Rights of People Who Suffered from Maidan founded in March of 2014, such illegal practice may become quite common.17

«This incident [Kostenko’s case], like the case of the Deputy Head of Majlis, is tied to «March Referendum» and transition to the Russian Federation Laws. It obviously contradicts Article 15(1) of ICCPR «No one shall be held guilty of any criminal offence on account of any act or omission which did not constitute a criminal offence, under national or international law, at the time when it was committed» as provides the report of UN High Commissioner.18

16 http://www.newsru.ua/ukraine/12mar2015/ispravitelnuye.html
17 http://www.rada.crimea.ua/news/02_04_14
Conclusion

The occupation powers of the Crimea use all the tools developed by the legislation and practice of the Russian Federation to suppress peaceable assemblies. Instead they arrange and encourage activities loyal to the Russian Federation. The situation is aggravated by the current absence of any efficient mechanism on the peninsula for protection against the political persecutions of peaceable assembly participants arranged by the occupation powers both with application of legal mechanisms (false arrests, interrogations, invention of criminal and administrative cases) and by non-legal means (kindnapping, torture and murder).

For any additional information, please contact:
Center for Civil Liberties (Ukraine)
9G Baseina St., Office 25, Kyiv 01004
ccl.org.ua@gmail.com
+380674494839