

COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS

(Covering Working Sessions 1-3)

This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is organized by Working Sessions and by what was submitted by Delegations / International Organizations / NGOs to participating States and, separately, to OSCE Institutions / Field Missions or other International Organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language. This compilation contains recommendations from all documents received at the HDIM Documentation Centre by the end of Working Session 3; documents received after this time will be included later in the Consolidated Summary.

Monday, 26 September 2011 **OPENING PLENARY SESSION**

Recommendations to participating States

Delegation of Switzerland

Es muss unser aller Anliegen sein, den umfangreichen Normenkatalog der OSZE zu bewahren und einer regelmässigen und systematischen Umsetzungsprüfung zu unterziehen.

Dabei gilt zu bedenken, dass eine Überprüfung des Normenkatalogs in der menschlichen Dimension - sollte sie umfassend, systematisch und unter Einbezug der Zivilgesellschaft erfolgen - anspruchsvoll ist.

Von den Teilnehmerstaaten kann der Ausschuss zur menschlichen Dimension genutzt werden, um offen und transparent über Erfolge, aber auch Mängel und neue Herausforderungen zu sprechen. Andererseits kann auch die OSZE – das Sekretariat, die Institutionen und die Feldoperationen – von diesem Ausschuss profitieren, indem sie sich proaktiv in die dort geführten Debatten einbringen.

Schliesslich sollten wir in Zukunft darauf achten, dass die drei speziell vom Vorsitzenden ausgewählten Spezialthemen des Implementierungstreffens - dieses Jahr sind es die Themen Bewegungsfreiheit; Wahlen; Roma und Sinti -, dazu dienen, den Ministerrat vorzubereiten und auch einem konkreten follow-up zugeführt werden.

Monday, 26 September 2011 **WORKING SESSION 1: Fundamental Freedoms 1**

Recommendations to participating States

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

We call upon the Greek State,

- To respect the right to freedom of expression and the press freedom, in particular smaller and minority press in order to protect and enrich diversity of opinion in the media,
- To put an end to selective penalization of media institutions and press by ethnic, sectarian, and political motives,
- To uphold the principle of fair and proportional punishment in judicial process,

- To guarantee that the legal amount of compensation should not enrich the claimant in an unjust way, but compensate the moral loss of the claimant,
- To reconsider and revise the relevant legislation and ensure that the principle of equality is guaranteed for each element in society, including the Turkish minority of Western Thrace
- To respect the letter and the spirit of the Treaty of Lisbon along with all other European covenants and declarations while implementing article 14 of the Constitution of the Hellenic Republic on freedom of expression and press.

Associazione culturale “Giuseppe Dossetti: i Valori”

Participating States are urged to:

- Create an atmosphere of tolerance and appreciation of religions within which freedom of religion or belief can best flourish. This space should be open to all and the media can play an important role in the creation of this space.
- Adopt practical measures to assure that the media as well as the political and public discourse are respectful for religions, their representatives, teaching and symbols.
- Protect all religions – also the majority ones – from prejudices and misrepresentation, particularly in the field of education, culture and information.

Delegation of Switzerland

La Suisse aimerait faire trois recommandations:

- Tout d’abord, nous recommandons aux Etats participants la nécessité de revoir, lors de la conférence ministérielle, les engagements de l’OSCE en matière de liberté d’expression par l’obtention de deux décisions ministérielles concernant la liberté d’expression : dans le domaine des nouveaux médias et dans celui de la sécurité des journalistes.
- Deuxièmement, nous recommandons au Bureau de la Représentante des médias de se pencher sur la question des « journalistes citoyens » afin de proposer des mesures visant à les faire bénéficier d’une protection similaire à celle des journalistes oeuvrant dans les médias traditionnels.
- Enfin, la Suisse recommande aux Etats participants de tenir compte dans leur approche relative à la lutte anti-terrorisme des droits humains et des opportunités que peuvent représenter les médias dans ce cadre. Dans tous les cas, nous appelons les Etats à circonscrire au minimum nécessaire les restrictions à la liberté d’expression.

European Union

Participating States should:

- reaffirm the existing principles and commitments in the field of freedom of expression and freedom of the media as well as their determination to implement them,
- consider how to enhance the implementation of commitments with regard to freedom of the media as well as to examine the updating and strengthening of those commitments including to reflect technological developments such as the internet,
- extend open invitations to the Representative and her office,
- ensure that media laws are in line with international standards and OSCE commitments and are implemented subsequently,

- strengthen their commitment to ensure freedom of opinion and expression, and especially to protect journalistic activities from an inappropriate application of criminal law,
- ensure that journalists in the OSCE area can work safely and without being threatened by physical violence, persecution, detention, harassment, intimidation, direct or indirect economic pressure or any other form of interference,
- act decisively to investigate thoroughly all acts of violence against journalists and bring offenders to justice, and fight the climate of impunity,
- ensure that press freedom is guaranteed by an independent judiciary to which journalists can appeal in cases of alleged violations,
- ensure the right of journalists to keep their sources of information confidential by enacting appropriate legislation (“shield laws”),
- ensure that these commitments equally apply to journalists who are also Human Rights Defenders.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

We recommend to OSCE Participating States:

- To recognize and condemn intolerance and discrimination against Christians and ensure Freedom of Expression and the right of Christians to participate fully in public life, as stated in the recent OSCE Parliamentary Assembly’s “Resolution on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in the OSCE Area”
- To take measures against the rising intolerance against and negative stereotyping of Christians in the media.
- To avoid legislation which would hinder freedom of speech or cause partialities.
- As stated in the annotated agenda: „attempts at silencing critical voices with the help of violence should be seen and handled by law,“ also when victims are Christians.

Recommendations to the OSCE

European Union

The OSCE Representative on Freedom of the media should:

- continue to assist participating states in achieving full implementation of the OSCE commitments,
- continue efforts to promote adoption of legislation which is in line with OSCE and other international standards notably in the field of libel and defamation,
- continue to elaborate how comprehensive and non-discriminatory access to information in particular to the internet can be ensured,
- continue to strengthen freedom of the media through capacity building in the framework of training activities and media conferences,
- in co-ordination with the ODIHR's Point of Contact on Human Rights Defenders, assist the participating states in delivering on their commitments to protect the journalists who are also Human Rights Defenders,

- continue to develop new media, including internet and digital broadcasting, as a focus area,
- continue to co-operate with other regional and international organisations such as the Council of Europe or the United Nations on freedom of media issues.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

We recommend to OSCE/ODIHR, and OSCE Missions:

- To continue to make freedom of expression a key focus and to be aware of current threats to Christians by attempts to curb the rights of those who use new or traditional media to present differing or critical views.
- To monitor legislation, with special attention to so called hate-speech legislation, its content, interpretation and application; that such legislation neither impair free speech, debate or disagreement, nor exercise partiality to special interest groups at the expense of others.
- To use all available OSCE means to work against intolerance against Christians, inter alia by encouraging the media not to spread prejudices against Christians, and by working more closely with representatives of Christian churches.

Almaty Confederation of NGOs 'Ariptes'

Рекомендации для ОБСЕ:

1. Обучающие и образовательные программы для журналистов по социальным сетям.
2. Представителю ОБСЕ по вопросам свободы слова выставить на сайте лекции экспертов и «звезд-журналистов» по опыту работы в социальных сетях и их рекомендации.
3. В странах ОБСЕ. Внедрение международных стандартов, разработанных ЮНЕСКО, в образовании журналистов согласно Болонскому процессу, в том числе и по социальным сетям.
4. Постоянный мониторинг социальных сетей в области нетерпимости и дискриминации, нетолерантного отношения, насилия в отношении женщин и детей, порнографии, терроризма и др. Единые международные стандарты в этой области, возможно, только для стран ОБСЕ.
5. Новые технологии, новые подходы, новые СМИ должны иметь единые международные стандарты стран ОБСЕ в целом. Работа огромная, но посильная для ОБСЕ. Пока этого не будет, каждый будет трактовать все по-своему. А ОБСЕ только констатировать факты: это – хорошо, а вот это – плохо!
6. Могу поделиться нашим казахстанским опытом. Мы активно включаемся в информационное сообщество. Обсуждается законопроект о телевизионном и радиовещании – один из шагов странового подхода к цифровому эфирному телерадиовещанию. Идет обсуждение и экспертиза. Сейчас приводился пример о том, что экспертизу проводил и г-н Андрей Рихтер, Директор Бюро Представителя ОБСЕ по вопросам свободы СМИ.
Проектом закона предусмотрены гарантии соблюдения прав на доступ к информации для граждан страны и свободу распространения информации для телевизионных и радиоканалов.

Законопроект предусматривает процедуру упрощения создания новых телевизионных и радиоканалов. Это даст возможность развития отечественным телевидению и радиовещанию.

7. На сайди-венде г-жа Агата Вацлавик-Вейман, Советник по политическим вопросам Google, сказала в отношении социальных сетей:

- Мы только в начале пути в Интернет.

Действительно, все еще впереди, и именно «на берегу», сейчас надо не только обсуждать, но и, не смотря на трудность и «долгость» процесса – выработать международные стандарты по социальным сетям среди стран ОБСЕ.

Associazione culturale “Giuseppe Dossetti: i Valori”

The OSCE Representative on the Freedom of the Media is called upon to:

- Provide – in close cooperation with the OSCE-ODIHR and the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – guidelines for voluntary professional standards and self-regulation of the media in order to prevent intolerant discourse against religions.

HazteOir.org

To use all available OSCE means to work against intolerance against Christians, inter alia by calling upon media groups to show respect for religious beliefs (Christians in particular, as they are the preferred target of offensive contents) and to take responsibility in maintaining an open, tolerant and free society.

Alliance Defense Fund

For this reason, the Alliance Defense Fund calls upon the OSCE to restrict “hate” speech laws to punishing only speech which is inciteful and where an imminent threat of violence occurs. “Hate” speech laws must also exempt religious speech, including that which deals with moral views.

Tuesday, 27 September 2011

WORKING SESSION 2: Fundamental Freedoms 1 (cont.)

Recommendations to participating States

Public Fund "Information and Consultative Group "Perspective”

По-прежнему актуальной задачей для Казахстана является создание экспертного аналитического центра, в функции которого должны входить: мониторинг и анализ ситуации и тенденций развития религиозности, экспертиза псевдорелигиозной литературы, оценка деструктивной деятельности псевдорелигиозных организаций. Поэтому представляется необходимым объединять профессиональные возможности по комплексному мониторингу, раннему распознаванию, выявлению и предупреждению деструктивной деятельности псевдорелигий с выработкой эффективных механизмов ее блокирования и нераспространения, как на национальном, так и на межгосударственном уровнях. Мы предлагаем на международном уровне разработать критерии для определения псевдорелигиозной деятельности и принять решение о механизме их применения при мониторинге прав граждан на свободу вероисповедания.

Поэтому складывающаяся идеологическая ситуация обязывает осуществлять сильную научно-обоснованную политическую идеологию как способ консолидации общества. В плане эффективного противодействия религиозно-экстремистским

попыткам навязывания несвойственной менталитету казахстанцев псевдорелигиозной идентичности, необходимо:

1. Провести перерегистрацию всех религиозных организаций, а во время перерегистрации - осуществить аудит всех неорелигиозных образований, срок присутствия которых в стране составляет не более 25 лет на предмет изучения а) мировоззренческой части распространяемой доктрины; б) социальной доктрины и социальной деятельности организации; в) связи с политическими претензиями, противостоящими государственной политике.

2. Приступить к разработке комплекса взаимосвязанных положений в части совершенствования законодательства в области религии, образования, воспитания, семейно-брачных отношений, производственных отношений и др. Необходимо найти и внести критерии, определяющие границы возможной (в смысле допустимости) деятельности на религиозной основе. Законодательно ввести концепты «псевдорелигиозной», «деструктивной» деятельности. Разработать критерии для определения такой деятельности.

3. Для проведения аудита необходимо выработать систему научно-обоснованных и аксиологических критериев с позиций соответствия а) системе общегражданских ценностей, исторически сложившихся и принятых в казахстанском обществе; б) законодательным нормам РК; с точки зрения опыта (практики, прецедентов) в) проявления негативной деятельности организации, ее реальных угроз и потенциальных последствий для общества и личности.

3. Предложить всем религиозным организациям представить гражданскому обществу свои социальные программы и результаты их претворения для всестороннего обсуждения.

4. Провести мониторинг деятельности всех международных организаций, так или иначе вмешивающихся в духовно-культурную ситуацию в Казахстане.

5. Выявить ангажированность казахстанских НПО, работающих под патронатом международных партнеров. Провести разносторонний аудит целей, задач, эффективности их деятельности.

6. Разработать методические комментарии для проведения аудита псевдорелигиозной деятельности.

7. Осуществить переподготовку экспертов социогуманитариев с аттестацией, занимающихся проведением экспертиз в сфере религиоведения, философии религии, психологии религии, социологии религии др.

8. Открыть соответствующую специализацию в закрытых учебных заведениях для подготовки молодежи к квалифицированной профессиональной работе.

9. Создать цикл просветительских программ о традиционных религиях на государственных ТВ и радиоканалах.

10. Создать единый банк данных социогуманитарных исследований религиозности в РК.

11. Показать политическую уязвимость терминологических споров о толерантности, свободе совести.

12. Разработать эффективный в применении и непротиворечивый глоссарий для законодательства о религии.

13. Разработать положения о псевдорелигиозной, квазирелигиозной, деструктивной деятельности, имеющей политический характер и оказывающей негативное воздействие на личностное развитие, групповую идентичность и общественную безопасность.

14. Разработать подзаконные акты в виде перечня деструктивных организаций, камуфлирующих свою деятельность под религиозную и запрещенных в других регионах мира. Сделать этот перечень открытым и широко известным.

15. Разработать новые правила регистрации религиозных организаций и мониторинга религиозной деятельности, включая миссионерскую, исключить в структуре и в содержании такой деятельности политические мотивы и устремления.

16. Проводить экспертный анализ массивов ввозимой и распространяемой религиозной литературы на предмет соответствия/несоответствия Конституции и Законам РК.

17. Разработать положение о Центре реабилитации и социальной адаптации пострадавших от деструктивной деятельности псевдорелигий и создать такие центры во всех регионах.

18. Провести мониторинг публикаций по тематическим рубрикам «Религия в Казахстане», включая Интернет порталы и блоги. Изучить уровень напряженности дискуссий по предмету.

19. Осуществить мониторинг деятельности государственных органов, научных организаций, учебных заведений, выступлений и публикаций их руководителей и сотрудников на предмет соответствия/несоответствия государственной политике в области религии.

20. Разработать Государственную программу досуга (выделив ее специальной строкой в Республиканском бюджете как приоритетную) для различных групп населения.

Muslim Denomination in Bulgaria

RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE BULGARIAN AUTHORITIES:

- Prevent the interference of the state organizations in the religious matters and the political regulation of religious problems.
- Encourage Bulgarian authorities to make amendments on the Law On Religious Communities of 2002 so that the decisions taken at the “National Conferences of Muslims in Bulgaria” are not subject to court registration.
- Streamline the Criminal Code so that attempts and actions of this nature against religious and ethnic minorities will not be treated as “hooligan activities”, but will be considered as acts “threatening ethnic and religious peace” in the country and be punished strictly and uncompromisingly, regardless of ethnic and religious affiliation of the perpetrator and to whom they are directed.
- Undertake measures to ensure that the Council for Electronic Media and the Law of Media to be effective in controlling and combating with the explicit form of racism and discrimination committed through media and internet.
- Introduce amendments to the relevant law which will facilitate restitution of foundation properties of the Religious Denominations.
- Urge Bulgarian authorities to submit periodically the annual hate crime list to ODIHR.
- Facilitate religious self-identification of the Bulgarian citizens by acknowledging that Orthodox and Muslims religious practices are traditional for Bulgaria.
- Guarantee freedom of belief and implement effectively anti discriminatory legislation.

Institute on Religion and Public Policy

The INSTITUTE urges Kazakhstan to request the assistance of the OSCE Panel of Religious Experts to review the draft Religion Law so that the panel may advise the government of Kazakhstan regarding the compatibility of the provisions of the proposed legislation with OSCE standards and international human rights law.

Human Rights Without Frontiers

Human Rights Without Frontiers recommends to the Hungarian Parliament to revise this law so as to put its legislation in conformity with international standards.

Human Rights Without Frontiers recommends to the Russian authorities

- To put a moratorium on the implementation of the 2002 Law On Fighting Extremist Activity as it is used and abused to restrict religious freedom, to repress and attempt to ban non-violent religious groups such as Jehovah's Witnesses or Said Nursi readers;
- To revise Article 14 of the 1997 Law on Freedom of conscience and association which deals with the banning of the activities of Religious Organizations and their liquidation as several of its provisions are not necessary in a democratic society;
- To establish clear guidelines for the implementation of Article 282 of the Criminal Code (incitement of national, racial or religious enmity) so as to stop the misuse of it in restricting the legitimate activities of religious communities (e.g. teaching the superiority of their doctrine over those of other religions);
- To reconsider cases against individuals and organizations which have been accused of extremism for conducting normal religious activities protected under international norms and laws;
- To put an end to the harassment of Jehovah's Witnesses and Said Nursi's readers (innumerable check ups, banning of their religious literature, accusations of extremism and religious enmity);
- To dissolve the Expert Council for Conducting State-Religious Studies put in place under the Ministry of Justice as its powers have been unduly extended to limit the freedom of "non-traditional" religious movements and its members include activists of the Orthodox Church and anti-sect movements;
- To fully implement the decisions of the European Court.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

In this respect we call upon the Greek State to:

- Take necessary steps to recognize elected muftis of the Turkish Minority, and abolish the practice of state appointed imams (law no: 3536/2007) that is against the religious autonomy of the Turkish-Muslim minority that was enshrined in the 1913 Athens, 1920 Greek Sevres and 1923 Lausanne Treaties.
- Take into consideration the minority's recommendations and after a concrete dialogue between the government and the minority make the necessary changes and revise the law No: 3647/2008 regarding the pious foundations (Wakfs) passed by the Greek Parliament and entered into force on February 29, 2008, which was prepared without taking the opinion and will of Western Thrace Turkish Minority.

European Association of Jehovah's Christian Witnesses

Jehovah's Witnesses call upon the government of Kyrgyzstan to:

(1) Release Iskandar Kambarov and Jonibek Nosirov from pre-trial detention where they have been since January 29, 2011.

- (2) Permit Jehovah's Witnesses to register local religious organizations in the cities of Osh, Naryn, Jalal-Abad, and Kadamjay.
- (3) Stop the unwarranted criminal and civil cases against the Religious Center.
- (4) Provide for alternative service that does not require a monetary contribution to the Ministry of Defense, since this also violates the religious conscience of individual Jehovah's Witnesses of military age.

Jehovah's Witnesses call upon the government of Tajikistan to:

- (1) Re-register the national organization of Jehovah's Witnesses in Tajikistan.
- (2) Discontinue unlawful and unwarranted searches for religious literature in private homes; and cease interrogating and mistreating individuals professing religion of Jehovah's Witnesses.

Jehovah's Witnesses in Uzbekistan and their over 7 million co-religionists call upon the government of Uzbekistan to:

- (1) Grant amnesty to the three Witness men who are prisoners of conscience. This would be in compliance with the Uzbekistan Constitution and international guarantees of religious freedom.
- (2) Accept registration applications for congregations in the localities where these Witnesses live, which would eliminate the prison sentences for Jehovah's Witnesses who were found guilty of "criminal activity."

Jehovah's Witnesses in Turkmenistan call upon President of Turkmenistan as the ultimate Guarantor of the Constitution and human rights to:

- (1) Grant amnesty to the eight men who are imprisoned as conscientious objectors.
- (2) Consider the introduction of a genuine alternative civilian service.

Jehovah's Witnesses in Armenia and as a worldwide organization respectfully request the government of Armenia to:

- (1) Apply the judgment of the Grand Chamber of the ECHR in Bayatyan and abide by its earlier commitments to the Council of Europe and immediately release all conscientious objectors who are Jehovah's Witnesses from prison, stop arresting and convicting new conscientious objectors, and allow for acceptable alternative civilian service.
- (2) Recognize their right to hold peaceful annual religious conventions without interference and protect their right to assemble, in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Armenia and the European Convention of Human Rights.
- (3) Reduce the valuations on donated religious literature, thus allowing Jehovah's Witnesses to freely import religious literature used for worship.

Jehovah's Witnesses in Azerbaijan and as a worldwide organization call upon the government of Azerbaijan to:

- (1) Provide re-registration to the religious community of Jehovah's Witnesses.
- (2) Protect the right to profess one's religious beliefs individually or jointly with others.
- (3) Prevent further illegal interference from the police authorities with the peaceful exercise of the freedom of religion and freedom of assembly.
- (4) Provide acceptable alternative civilian service for conscientious objectors.
- (5) Allow importation of Bible literature without censorship, as guaranteed by the Azerbaijan Constitution and the European Convention on Human Rights.

Jehovah's Witnesses in Bulgaria and worldwide call upon the government of Bulgaria to:

- (1) Allow Jehovah's Witnesses, without interference or harassment, to build houses of worship, hold worship services, and share information from the Bible with others.
- (2) Sanction those who use the media as a vehicle for baseless slander.
- (3) Stop the aggression by political elements such as the VMRO and ATAKA parties against the legally registered and peaceful religious minority of Jehovah's Witnesses.
- (4) Inform governmental agencies about the rights of minority religious denominations in Bulgaria as well as the potential repercussions of governmental officials and/or public servants spreading false, slanderous and discriminatory information.

Jehovah's Witnesses in France suffer discrimination at the hands of both government officials and private individuals and organizations. We respectfully request the government of France to:

- (1) Stop its stigmatization policy conducted against Jehovah's Witnesses.
- (2) Allow prisoners to receive faith-based help from Jehovah's Witnesses in the same manner as they do from other religions.

- (1) Jehovah's Witnesses in Kazakhstan and as a worldwide organization call upon the government of Kazakhstan to expeditiously conclude the unlawful second "expert study" of their literature.
- (2) We call on the Almaty city administration to provide the final construction approval permits to construct the Assembly Hall and Kingdom Hall on the property of the Religious Center.
- (3) Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request that the police and other authorities protect the rights of the citizens of Kazakhstan to freely practice their religion without fear of harassment or physical assault.

Jehovah's Witnesses in Russia and as a worldwide organization respectfully request the government of Russia to:

- (1) End its campaign of harassment and the misapplication of the Extremist Law against Jehovah's Witnesses, and terminate all legal cases and criminal investigations based on extremist charges.
- (2) Remove the religious publications of Jehovah's Witnesses from the Federal List of Extremist Materials.
- (3) Register the Moscow Community of Jehovah's Witnesses and allow them to peacefully enjoy their worship as guaranteed by the Russian Constitution and the European Convention on Human Rights.
- (4) Abide by their commitment to uphold the fundamental freedoms guaranteed by the Constitution of Russia and the European Convention for all citizens, including minority religious groups.

Associazione culturale "Giuseppe Dossetti: i Valori"

Participating States are urged to:

- Adopt anti-discrimination laws which do not violate the autonomy and self-organization of the religious communities.
- Not force children to a compulsory sexual, religious or ethical teaching which may be not consistent with the convictions of the children's parents, providing for this case non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities.

- Guarantee the right to wear religious symbols and attire in public space which is encompassed by the freedom of religion or belief.
- Guarantee the conscientious objection not only to the compulsory military service but also in relation to all ethical sensitive questions pertaining family and human life.

Chernivtsy Regional NGO 'Human Rights'

Рекомендации: мониторинг Украины по поводу выполнения обязательств, связанных со свободой религии и убеждений

Recommendations to International Organizations

Human Rights Without Frontiers

Human Rights Without Frontiers recommends to the EU Fundamental Rights Agency which has remained silent about this discriminatory law to tackle this issue.

Recommendations to the OSCE

Associazione culturale “Giuseppe Dossetti: i Valori”

The OSCE/ODIHR and to the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief are called upon to:

Assist the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee (a) that the liberty of parents to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions is fully respected and (b) that the participating States provide non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities that would accommodate the wishes of parents.

Institute on Religion and Public Policy

THE INSTITUTE calls on all OSCE participating states to give greater importance to the issue of religious liberty in their internal deliberations, and calls on the OSCE institutions to consider methods by which to strengthen monitoring and response mechanisms to institutional violations of freedom of religion and belief by participating states.

Muslim Denomination in Bulgaria

RECOMMENDATIONS TO ODIHR/OSCE:

- ODIHR’s Panel of Advisers on Freedom of Religion or Belief to observe whether Bulgarian authorities are implementing the Religious rights of Muslims in the country, as well to recommend and advise Bulgarian government on the issue of Religious freedom and Fundamental rights;
- Bulgaria ratified international convention for abolition of all kinds of discrimination. It has also passed a special law for protection from discrimination. In fact, discriminatory practices against religious and ethnical minorities take place very often. ODIHR should suggest specific measures to prevent intolerance, xenophobia and hate crimes.
- ODIHR to observe closely the process of Freedom of Religion of Muslim minorities in non-Muslim countries.

Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

We would like to the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief to ensure that the participating States respect the right of the religious minorities and communities to select, appoint and replace their personnel in accordance with their respective requirements and standards in accordance with Vienna 1989, Questions Relating to Security in Europe. In this regard, we urge Greece and all participating States to act in accordance with the OSCE Commitments related to the freedom of religion or belief. We request the

OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Panel on Freedom of Religion or Belief to have a greater role in the work of the OSCE on further implementation of the freedom of religion or belief in all participating States.

HazteOir.org

- To demand the same degree of protection for Christians expressing their beliefs that as for any other citizen.
- To Maintain Freedom of Religion, Conscience and Expression as a Key Mandate of OSCE/ODIHR and the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office's Personal Representative on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination
- To create working documents on hate crimes against Christians – as they exist for example with regard to anti-semitism.
- To research and document hate crimes against Christians separately, because this pressing issue must not to be mixed up with differently motivated crimes.
- To create an international day against discrimination against Christians; or a day of commemoration of contemporary violence against Christians. There are many such days, but the Christian issue is largely missing.

Forum 18 News Service

To stand in solidarity with civil society activists working for the implementation of human dimension commitments, recommendations for participating States and OSCE institutions would include:

- freedom of religion or belief violations to be seen as not only attacks on particular people or communities, but also as attacks on the fundamental rights and freedoms of all people;
- insisting that politically binding human dimension commitments are for implementation by all participating States;
- OSCE institutions and field operations mainstreaming freedom of religion or belief for all in human dimension work, taking full advantage of the ODIHR's expertise;
- and implementing in full legal reviews and opinions provided by the Venice Commission and OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Council of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief.

Alliance Defense Fund

The Alliance Defense Fund therefore calls upon the OSCE to ensure that parental rights in education are respected by providing opt-outs from classes parents deem to contradict their religious beliefs and with how they wish to raise their children. We also recommend that alternative methods of education done with the best interests of the child in mind be protected rather than punished.

ADF therefore recommends that the OSCE promote the concept of reasonable accommodations for religious belief and practices within the spectrum of employment and the provision of goods and services.

Centre d'Action Laïque

CAL therefore urges OSCE countries to remove blasphemy crime from their domestic laws.

Church of Scientology, Russian Federation

We urge the members of the OSCE to urge Kazakhstan to immediately implement its obligations to protect the right to freedom of religion, ban the new law on religion and stop persecution of religious minorities.

Tuesday, 27 September 2011

WORKING SESSION 3: Fundamental Freedoms 2

Recommendations to participating States

Delegation of the United States of America

USCIRF recommends that the U.S. government re-designate Uzbekistan as a CPC, drop the waiver, and, as a consequence of the designation, impose sanctions, including a ban on visits to the United States by high-level Uzbek officials. In addition, as described more fully below, USCIRF recommends that the U.S. government should prioritize freedom of religion or belief as an issue in U.S.-Uzbek bilateral relations, encourage greater international scrutiny of Uzbekistan's human rights record, and support Uzbek human rights defenders and religious freedom initiatives.

I. Prioritizing Freedom of Religion or Belief as an Issue in Bilateral Relations

In addition to continuing to designate Uzbekistan as a CPC, the U.S. government should:

- lift the waiver that has been in place since January 2009 and impose sanctions, including a ban on visits to the United States by high-level Uzbek officials, as a consequence of Uzbekistan's CPC designation;
- reduce aid and arms sales to Uzbekistan and ban visits by high-level Uzbek officials in response to the Uzbek government's refusal to allow an independent investigation into the violence in Andijon in May 2005;
- ensure that U.S. statements and actions are coordinated across agencies to ensure that U.S. concerns about human rights conditions in Uzbekistan are reflected in its public and private arrangements with the Uzbek government;
- ensure that U.S. assistance to the Uzbek government, with the exception of assistance to improve humanitarian conditions and advance human rights, be made contingent upon establishing and implementing a specific timetable for the government to take concrete steps to improve conditions of freedom of religion or belief and observe international human rights standards, steps which should include:
 - --ending reliance on convictions based solely on confessions and implementing the recommendations of the UN Committee Against Torture (June 2002) and the UN Special Rapporteur on Torture (February 2003);
 - --establishing a mechanism to review the cases of persons previously detained under suspicion of or charged with religious, political, or security offenses, including Criminal Code Articles 159 (criminalizing "anti-state activity") and 216 (criminalizing membership in a "forbidden religious organization");

releasing those who have been imprisoned solely because of their religious beliefs or practices as well as any others who have been unjustly detained or sentenced; and making public a list of specific and detailed information about individuals who are currently detained under these articles or imprisoned following conviction;

- --revising the 1998 Law on Freedom of Conscience and Religious Organizations to bring it into compliance with international standards, including making changes consistent with recommendations made by the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief, and registering religious groups that have sought to comply with the legal requirements; and
- --ensuring that every prisoner has access to his or her family, human rights monitors, adequate medical care, and a lawyer, as specified in international human rights instruments, and allowing prisoners to practice their religion while in detention to the fullest extent compatible with the specific nature of their detention;
- ensure that U.S. security and other forms of assistance are scrutinized to make certain that this assistance does not go to Uzbek government agencies, such as certain branches of the Interior and Justice Ministries, which have been responsible for particularly severe violations of religious freedom as defined by the International Religious Freedom Act of 1998; and
- use appropriate avenues of public diplomacy to explain to the people of Uzbekistan both why religious freedom is an important element of U.S. foreign policy and what specific concerns about violations of religious freedom exist in their country.

II. Encouraging Greater International Scrutiny of Uzbekistan's Human Rights Record The U.S. government should:

- work with other governments to urge the UN Human Rights Council to reverse its decision ending human rights scrutiny of Uzbekistan under the confidential 1503 procedure and to address this situation in a public country resolution at the Council;
- encourage public scrutiny of Uzbek human rights concerns in appropriate international fora, such as the OSCE and other multilateral venues, and facilitate the participation of Uzbek human rights defenders in multilateral human rights mechanisms; and
- urge the Uzbek government to agree to visits by UN Special Rapporteurs on Freedom of Religion or Belief, the Independence of the Judiciary, and Torture, set specific visit dates, and provide the full and necessary conditions for such a visit.

III. Supporting Uzbek Human Rights Defenders and Religious Freedom Initiatives The U.S. government should:

- continue to monitor closely the status of individuals who are arrested for alleged religious, political, and security offenses, and continue efforts to improve the situation of Uzbek human rights defenders, including by pressing for human rights groups and religious communities to be allowed to register or to operate freely without registration;
- support efforts to counteract the Uzbek government's blockade on information into the country by increasing radio, Internet, and other broadcasting of objective news and information on issues relevant to Uzbekistan, including education, human rights, freedom of religion, and religious tolerance, and continue funding for the Voice of America (VOA) Uzbek Language Service;
- ensure that the U.S. Embassy in Uzbekistan maintains active contacts with Uzbek human rights activists and publicly recognizes their contributions;
- increase foreign travel opportunities for civil society activists, religious leaders, and others in Uzbekistan concerned with religious freedom so as to permit them to take part in relevant international conferences;
- work to develop effective assistance programs to encourage the creation of civil society institutions to protect human rights and promote religious freedom in Uzbekistan, including training in human rights, the rule of law, and crime investigation for police and other law enforcement officials, for example by:
 - --expanding legal assistance programs for Uzbek relatives of detainees and expanding "train-the-trainer" legal assistance programs for representatives of religious communities to act as legal advisers in the registration process;
 - --specifying freedom of religion as a grants category and area of activity in the Democracy and Conflict Mitigation program of the U.S. Agency for International Development and the Democracy Commission Small Grants program administered by the U.S. Embassy; and
 - --encouraging national and local public roundtables between Uzbek officials and representatives of Uzbek civil society on freedom of religion; and
- increase opportunities in its exchange programs for Uzbek human rights advocates and religious figures, and
 - --expand exchange programs for Uzbek religious leaders to include representatives from all religious communities;
 - --ensure that the U.S. Embassy vigorously protests if Uzbek authorities harass participants in such exchange programs after their return to Uzbekistan, and if such harassment continues, impose negative consequences in other areas of U.S.-Uzbek bilateral relations, including a ban on high-level meetings.

USCIRF's trip to Turkey and northern Cyprus in February 2011 highlighted the ongoing religious freedom restrictions imposed on religious minorities in both Turkey and northern Cyprus by the Turkish government and military. USCIRF recommends that the U.S. government, in its bilateral relations with Turkey, urge the Turkish

government to bring its laws and practices into compliance with international standards on freedom of religion or belief.

I. Pressing for Immediate Improvements to End Religious Freedom Violations

- On the legal status of minority religious communities and governance of their internal affairs, the United States should urge Turkey to:
- grant full legal recognition for all religious communities in Turkey, such as the Alevi; Greek, Armenian, Georgian and Syriac Orthodox; Roman Catholics; Protestants; Jews; and others, by:
- --fully implementing the 1923 Lausanne Treaty and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and providing all non-Muslim communities with legal status that affords them full property rights including the right to inherit, purchase, possess, maintain, and sell property; or
- --amending the Law on Associations so that it provides religious communities with legal status that affords them the right to inherit, purchase, possess, maintain, and sell property; and
- --fully respecting articles 18 and 27 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and withdrawing the reservation that limits its application to the three Lausanne minorities;

- permit religious communities to select and appoint their leadership in accordance with their internal guidelines and beliefs, according to Turkey's international obligations, end Turkish citizenship requirements for the Ecumenical Patriarchate and Holy Synod of the Greek Orthodox Church, and grant official recognition to the Ecumenical status of the Greek Orthodox Patriarch, in line with the 2010 opinion by the Council of Europe's Venice Commission;

- encourage the Prime Minister's office and the Diyanet to work with the Alevi community regarding the recognition of that community in Turkey, and grant legal status to Alevi cem houses of worship as places of worship; and

- allow for the independent and peaceful practice of Islam outside of the Diyanet and end the legal prohibitions on Shi'a Islam and on Sufi spiritual orders.

- Regarding restrictions on religious expression, the United States should urge Turkey to:
- abolish Article 301 of the Turkish Penal Code, which restricts the freedoms of thought and expression and negatively affects the freedom of religion or belief;

- remove restrictions on all clergy and members of religious minority communities to wear religious garb in public areas, state institutions, and public and private universities, and remove additional restrictions on leaders

of the minority Christian, Jewish, or other religious communities from wearing clerical garb in the public space;

- allow women the freedom to express their religious or non-religious views through dress so as to respect their beliefs, as well as the secular status of the Turkish republic, while ensuring a lack of coercion for those choosing not to wear headscarves and protecting the rights and freedoms of others, and providing access to public education and to public sector employment for those choosing to wear a headscarf;
- draft legislation to provide alternative service to military service, on the grounds of conscientious objection and release imprisoned conscientious objectors; and
- omit the legal requirement to list religious affiliation on official identification cards, in line with the March 2010 ruling by the European Court of Human Rights, including the adoption of specific steps to implement this new requirement.
- Regarding property and education rights for religious minorities, the United States should urge Turkey to:
 - expand the process to regain clear title or fair compensation for expropriated holdings to include properties sold to third parties or held by the government, end the authority of the Vakiflar or any government agency to seize the property of any religious community, and submit the recent Supreme Court decision on the land property case of the Mor Gabriel Syrian Orthodox monastery to Turkey's constitutional court or to the European Court of Human Rights;
 - permit all religious minorities, including those not covered by the Lausanne Treaty, to train religious clergy, including by:
 - --permitting the reopening of the Halki Theological Seminary, according to Turkey's international obligations, and allowing for religious training to occur;
 - --organizing a technical committee comprised of representatives from the Ecumenical Patriarchate and Turkish government representatives, to review all technical details relevant to expeditious opening of the Halki seminary;
 - --returning the Greek Orthodox school on the island of Imvros to the Ecumenical Patriarchate and approving the Patriarchate's application for the operation of the school; and
 - --encouraging the Ministry of Education to respond favorably to the official request of the Armenian Patriarch to permit his community to establish a theological faculty on Christian theology that incorporates instruction from the Patriarch, as required under Turkey's international obligations;

- encourage the Ministry of Education to respond favorably to requests from the Armenian community to allow children of migrant workers to attend Armenian minority schools in Turkey; and
- amend public school curricula on religion in line with the 2010 European Court of Human Rights ruling in the case brought by an Alevi.
- Regarding combating intolerance, the United States should urge Turkey to:
 - continue to undertake practical initiatives to establish and enhance trust among the country's diverse religious and ethnic communities, including: convening public roundtables on the local and national levels; at a high political level, publicly expressing commitments to a democratic and diverse Turkish society; and developing civic education programs that reflect the religious and ethnic diversity of Turkish society, past and present;
 - continue to condemn violent hate crimes against members of religious and ethnic communities and ensure prompt investigation and prosecutions of such crimes;
 - take all appropriate steps to prevent and punish acts of anti-Semitism, including condemnation of such acts, and, while vigorously protecting freedom of expression, counteract anti-Semitic rhetoric and other organized anti-Semitic activities; and
 - act in accordance with international human rights obligations to protect and punish discrimination against Alevis.

II. Advancing Religious Freedom through Multilateral Efforts

The U.S. government should:

- encourage the Turkish government, in view of its invitation to UN human rights special rapporteurs, to actively schedule such visits, including by the UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief and the UN Independent Expert on Minority Issues;
- encourage the Turkish government to remove its reservation to Article 27 of the ICCPR to ensure full respect for the protection of freedom of religion or belief to minority communities;
- speak out publicly at Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) meetings and events about violations by the government of Turkey of OSCE human rights commitments, including those concerning respect for freedom of religion or belief;
- urge the Turkish government to request that the OSCE Office of Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief to:

- --provide an assessment of Turkey's legislation relating to that issue;
- --conduct conferences with relevant government officials, leaders of religious communities, and members of civil society on teaching about religion in public schools from a human rights perspective; and
- --provide training sessions for members of the Turkish judiciary and law enforcement on how to combat hate crimes, including those motivated by religious prejudice; and
- urge the Turkish government to interpret the Turkish Constitution and the Lausanne Treaty consistent with international obligations, such as Article 18 of the ICCPR and OSCE commitments on freedom of religion or belief.

III. Recommendations concerning northern Cyprus

The U.S. government should:

- urge the Turkish government to allow religious communities living in the Republic of Cyprus and religious minority communities living in northern Cyprus access to (including rights to restore, maintain, and utilize) religious sites, places of worship, and cemeteries that are located within the borders of Turkish military bases and zones in northern Cyprus;
- urge the Turkish government and/or Turkish Cypriot authorities to abandon all restrictions on the access and use of churches and other places of worship, including requiring applications for permission to hold religious services;
- urge the Turkish Cypriot authorities and Turkish military to return all religious places of worship and cemeteries to their rightful owners; cease any ongoing desecration and destruction of Greek Orthodox, Maronite, Armenian Orthodox, and Jewish religious properties; and cease using any such religious sites as stables, military storage sites, vehicle repair shops, and public entertainment venues or any other non-religious purpose;
- urge the Turkish government and/or the Turkish Cypriot authorities to permit the restoration of St. Andreas monastery and other churches located in northern Cyprus;
- urge the Turkish government and/or the Turkish Cypriot authorities to return Christian religious iconography and other religious art that is in the hands of Turkish Cypriot authorities and that remain in churches to their rightful owners; and
- urge the Turkish Cypriot authorities to provide a full list of catalogued religious artifacts and to allow access by UNESCO authorities, if UNESCO deems it appropriate and necessary to review such materials under possession of the Turkish Cypriot authorities and/or Turkish military.

Tajikistan

I. Promoting Reform to Protect Freedom of Religion or Belief

The U.S. government should:

- urge the Tajik government to limit its definition of extremism to address only acts that involve violence or incitement to imminent violence and to drop bans on non-violent organizations, literature, and groups;
- work with Tajik government officials responsible for religious affairs, human rights, and legal issues, as well as Tajik parliamentarians, civil society representatives, and the international community, to seek amendments to the 2009 religion law and other relevant legislation to bring it into conformity with Tajikistan's international commitments, including those of the OSCE, on freedom of religion or belief;
- continue to monitor the status of individuals who are arrested for alleged religious, political, and security offenses, and continue to monitor the trials of leaders or members of religious communities that lose their registration and urge that appropriate legal measures be adopted;
- urge the Tajik government officials, particularly President Rahmon, to affirm publicly their intention to comply fully with Tajikistan's international commitments to respect freedom of religion or belief, as well as the rights of members of all non-violent religious communities in the country.

II. Emphasizing Tajikistan's Religious Freedom and Human Rights Record

The U.S. government should:

- publicly criticize Tajik government violations of international and OSCE commitments on human rights, including respect for freedom of religion or belief, in Tajikistan and at international meetings, particularly at the October 2011 UN Human Rights Council Universal Periodic Review (UPR);
- urge the OSCE Mission in Tajikistan to pay particular attention to violations of freedom of religion or belief and to undertake relevant programs, including holding training sessions with local officials and journalists on international obligations;
- ensure that U.S. assistance to the Tajik government, with the exception of assistance to improve humanitarian conditions and advance human rights, be contingent upon establishing and implementing a specific timetable for the government to take concrete steps to reform the religion law and improve conditions of freedom of religion or belief;
- ensure that U.S. security and other forms of assistance are scrutinized to make certain that this assistance does not go to Tajik government agencies, such as certain branches of the Interior and Justice Ministries, which have been responsible for violations of religious freedom;

- work with the international community in Tajikistan to undertake efforts to improve judicial standards and to provide training for judges and prosecutors in civil law and international human rights standards; and
- increase opportunities for Tajik human rights advocates and religious figures to participate in exchange programs, and use appropriate avenues of public diplomacy to explain to the people of Tajikistan both why religious freedom is an important element of U.S. foreign policy and what specific concerns about violations of religious freedom exist in their country

USCIRF concludes that the human rights and security aspects of the issue of freedom of religion or belief should be given a higher priority in the “reset” of U.S.-Russian bilateral relations. Russia faces security concerns as a result of serious threats from groups which advocate or perpetrate violence in the name of religion. Nevertheless, the Russian government’s broad-brush approach to this situation is problematic, due to its arbitrary application of vague anti-extremism laws against religious adherents and others who pose no credible threat to security. In USCIRF’s view, despite certain improvements, more can and should be done to ensure that Russian law enforcement agencies do not dismiss hate crimes as “hooliganism,” but recognize them for what they are—human rights abuses—and take steps to prevent and punish such crimes, including those involving ethnicity and religion.

Accordingly, USCIRF recommends that the U.S. government respond to the deteriorating conditions in the Russian Federation by taking specific steps to strengthen promotion of human rights, including freedom of religion or belief; prioritize this problem in its bilateral and multilateral diplomacy; and address specific Russian human rights issues, particularly by pressing the Russian government to amend the extremism law, ensure the equal legal status and treatment of all of Russia’s religious communities, and combat xenophobia, intolerance, and hate crimes.

I. Strengthening U.S. Promotion of Human Rights, including Freedom of Religion or Belief

The U.S. government should:

- urge the Russian government, in public and at high political levels, to undertake programs and adopt legal reforms to ensure respect for international norms on freedom of religion or belief;
- implement the provisions of the “Smith Amendment” of the 2010 Consolidated Appropriations Act (Section 7074 of P.L. 111-117) to prohibit U.S. financial assistance to the Russian Federation government due to, inter alia, its discrimination against religious groups through laws and government actions, excessive application of the vague and overly-broad

- maintain a mechanism to monitor publicly the status of human rights in Russia, including freedom of religion or belief, particularly in the case of repeal of the Jackson-Vanik amendment with respect to Russia, as well as establish a program to monitor implementation of Russia's law on non-commercial organizations (NGO Law), including its impact on religious organizations,
- reinstitute regular roundtables in Washington with members of the National Security Council and representatives of religious communities and civil society as well as academic specialists on the status of freedom of religion or belief in Russia;
- ensure that U.S. government-funded grants to NGOs and other sectors in Russian society include projects on legal protections and respect for freedom of religion or belief and methods to combat xenophobia, such as by funding training programs on freedom of religion or belief, promoting interreligious cooperation, encouraging pluralism, and combating hate crimes;
- support programs to train lawyers to contest violations of Russian and international law regarding freedom of religion or belief in Russian courts and before the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR);
- translate into Russian and make available, including on the U.S. Embassy Web site, U.S. Federal Bureau of Investigation and Department of Justice materials on combating hate crimes and information relating to international standards on freedom of religion or belief, xenophobia, and hate crimes, including relevant U.S. Department of State and USCIRF reports;
- ensure that Russia's citizens have access to U.S. government-funded radio and TV broadcasts, as well as Internet communications, including information on freedom of religion or belief and on combating xenophobia and hate crimes, in particular by:
 - --restoring the previous levels of Russian-language radio broadcasts of Voice of America and Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), restoring staffing levels, and considering new broadcast vehicles; and
 - --increasing funding for programs in minority languages, including the RFE/RL Tatar and North Caucasus services;
- include in U.S.-funded exchange programs a wider ethnic and religious mix of students, including from the North Caucasus, Tatarstan, and other regions of Russia with sizeable Muslim and other religious and ethnic minority populations;
- implement a U.S. visa ban and asset freeze against Chechen leader Ramzan Kadyrov, whom the ECtHR has found responsible for severe and on-going human rights abuses, and urge
- ensure that U.S.-funded conflict resolution and post-conflict reconstruction programs for the North Caucasus also fund credible local partners; and

- initiate International Visitor Programs on the prevention and prosecution of hate crimes for Russian officials and other relevant figures and include training sessions by the Department of Justice and the Federal Bureau of Investigation as well as relevant NGOs and academic experts.

II. Prioritizing Freedom of Religion or Belief in U.S. Bilateral and Multilateral Diplomacy

The U.S. government should:

- organize as part of the U.S.-Russia Bilateral Presidential Commission a working group comprised of legal experts on international norms on freedom of religion or belief;
- ensure that U.S. Embassy officials and programs engage with local officials throughout the Russian Federation and disseminate information on international norms on freedom of religion or belief, including unregistered religious communities;
- urge the Russian government to invite and schedule dates for one or more of the three Personal Representatives of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) on combating intolerance and the UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief to visit the country during 2011;
- ensure that human rights issues, including freedom of religion or belief, are raised in the context of negotiations on Russian accession to the World Trade Organization, and work with members of the G-8 to ensure that human rights issues, including issues concerning migration and counter-terrorism, are raised at bilateral and multilateral meetings;
- ensure that the humanitarian crisis in Chechnya and human rights abuses perpetrated by the Russian federal military and local security and police forces there, as well as in other North Caucasus republics, are issues raised in U.S.-Russian bilateral relations;
- urge the Russian government to respect all resolutions of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe on the human rights and humanitarian situation in the North Caucasus and reinstate regular on-site visits by the Council of Europe's Special Rapporteur for Chechnya;
- urge the Russian government to address the issues raised by the UN Human Rights Council's Universal Periodic Review and relevant treaty bodies concerning Chechnya, accept visits to Chechnya by the UN Special Rapporteurs on Extrajudicial Executions and Torture, and fully cooperate with those Special Rapporteurs; and
- advocate , along with other OSCE States, that human rights abuses in the North Caucasus receive greater attention in OSCE deliberations and programs and also encourage the OSCE to offer humanitarian and other assistance to the civilian populations affected by the decade-long conflict in Chechnya and in the North Caucasus.

III. Addressing Russian Human Rights Issues

The U.S. government should urge the Russian government to:

- implement the February 2010 Constitutional Court decision that the Civil Procedural Code be amended to require Russian courts to abide by decisions by the ECtHR rather than the payment of fines as is current practice;
- reform the Ministry of Internal Affairs system of quotas for arrests and detentions of alleged suspects which may result in denials of justice;
- amend the Russian extremism law to address acts that involve violence or incitement to imminent violence, and drop bans on nonviolent organizations, literature and religious communities;
- halt current investigations, and reconsider previous legal cases, against individuals and organizations accused of extremism solely for their exercise of internationally protected rights, including freedom of religion or belief;
- withdraw or substantially amend the NGO law or develop regulations consistent with international standards limiting the state's discretion to interfere with the activities of NGOs, including religious organizations; and
- cease and prosecute all alleged acts of involuntary detention, disappearances, torture, rape, and other human rights abuses by the Russian security services in Chechnya, including by pro-Kremlin Chechen forces, and in other republics of the North Caucasus.

IV. Ensuring the Equal Legal Status and Treatment of Russia's Religious Communities

The U.S. government should urge the Russian government to:

- affirm publicly at a high political level the multi-ethnic and multi-confessional nature of Russian society and that all religious communities in Russia are equal under the law and entitled to equal treatment regardless of registration status, and direct government officials at all levels not to grant preferences to or discriminate against members of religious, ethnic and migrant groups;
- refrain from media attacks on any peaceful religious community and adopt administrative measures against government officials who engage in such attacks;
- cease interference in the internal affairs of religious communities, unless stipulated by law and in conformity with international human rights standards;
- ensure that law enforcement officials investigate and prosecute crimes against members of all religious communities and establish a fair and effective review

mechanism outside the Procuracy to investigate and sanction any officials who are found to have encouraged or condoned such crimes;

- amend the legal provision of the extremism law allowing any court to rule that the Russian translation of a text constitutes extremism, resulting in its ban throughout Russia, and re-examine recent court rulings deeming as extremist the publications of the Jehovah's Witnesses and the Turkish theologian Said Nursi;
- reform the mandate and personnel of the Ministry of Justice's 2009 Expert Religious Studies Council in order to diversify its membership and revoke its authority to recommend investigations of religious groups, including of their activities and literature;
- distribute on a regular basis updated information on freedom of religion or belief, including international law, relevant OSCE commitments, Russian constitutional provisions, relevant legislation and court decisions, to the Russian judiciary, religious affairs officials, the Justice Ministry, the Procuracy, and law enforcement bodies;
- extend the current annual training program for regional and local religious affairs officials to include the judiciary, the Procuracy, law enforcement agencies, and the Justice Ministry;
- direct the Russian Federation Human Rights Ombudsman to set up a nationwide monitoring system on the status of freedom of religion or belief in the 84 regions of Russia; and
- accept visits from the three OSCE Tolerance Representatives and the UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief, and grant unrestricted access for these officials to religious communities and regions.

V. Combating Xenophobia, Intolerance, and Hate Crimes

The U.S. government should urge the Russian government to:

- condemn – publicly, promptly and specifically – acts of xenophobia, anti-Semitism, intolerance, and hate crimes, and ensure that such acts will be fully and promptly investigated and prosecuted as human rights abuses and not “hooliganism”;
- condemn publicly rhetoric that promotes xenophobia or intolerance, including religious intolerance, while vigorously promoting freedom of expression;
- provide training programs for law enforcement officers and other officials to address ethnic and religious hatred and promote tolerance;
- establish a special nationwide anti-discrimination body that provides regular reports to the press, public, and parliament;

- implement recommendations on addressing anti-Semitism, xenophobia, and hate crimes from the Russia Federation Presidential Council on Human Rights, the Russian Federation Human Rights Ombudsman, the Council of Europe's Commission against Racism and Intolerance, and implement the decisions of the ECHR; and
- report, as required, to the OSCE on national measures to address hate crimes, including legislative initiatives and statistics, and participate in relevant OSCE training programs for law enforcement and judicial officials.
- In response to the prevailing state of religious freedom and related human rights in Belarus, USCIRF urges the U.S. government to support a number of measures to aid in the fight to end religious freedom violations and to promote religious liberty through bilateral and multilateral diplomacy, as well as through specific U.S. programs and policies.

Belarus

I. Ending Violations of Religious Freedom in Belarus

- The U.S. government should urge the government of Belarus to:
- repeal the highly restrictive 2002 religion law, as several of its provisions violate international norms on freedom of religion or belief, as called for in the 2008 popular petition urging reform of the religion law, which was the largest non-party political petition in Belarusian history;
- end the practice of denying registration to religious groups and then erecting obstacles to religious practice because of that unregistered status;
- ensure that no religious community is given a privileged status that may result in, or be used to justify, discrimination against individuals who are secular or belong to other religious groups;
- provide the right to conduct religious education and distribute religious material;
- adopt effective measures to halt attacks on the persons and property of minority religious groups and prosecute individuals who perpetrate such attacks;
- ensure a greater effort on the part of government officials to find and hold accountable perpetrators of attacks on the persons and property of members of religious minorities;

- publicly condemn, investigate, and prosecute criminal acts targeting Jews and the Jewish community, as well as members of other ethnic and religious communities; and
- provide free access by domestic and international human rights groups and others to sites of religious violence or the destruction of places of worship.

II. Advancing Religious Freedom through Bilateral and Multilateral Diplomacy

The U.S. government should:

- use public and private diplomacy to advance the protection of religious freedom and human rights in Belarus, such as conducting enhanced monitoring and public reporting by the U.S. Department of State, including the Special Envoy on Anti-Semitism and the Ambassador-at-Large for International Religious Freedom, and by the appropriate international organizations, including the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and the UN;
- coordinate with the European Union on the application of financial sanctions and visa bans on high-ranking Belarusian officials, particularly those who are directly responsible for or who have carried out the government's abuses of religious freedom;
- work with international partners to reinstate the position of UN Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Belarus and support that position's efforts to gain unrestricted access to the country, and work to reopen the OSCE Mission in Minsk;
- use diplomatic contact with representatives of the Belarusian government as a forum to discuss the failure of religious oppression tactics to further policy goals of prosperity, international comity, and political stability; and
- urge the Belarusian government to issue invitations to relevant UN Special Procedures, including the Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment; the Special Rapporteur on the Promotion and Protection of the Right to Freedom of Expression; the Special Representative of the Secretary-General on the Situation of Human Rights Defenders; the Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief; and the Working Group on Enforced and Involuntary Disappearances.

III. Advancing Religious Freedom through U.S. Programs and Policies

The U.S. government should:

- ensure that the activities to promote democracy authorized by the Belarus Democracy Reauthorization Act, as well as in the Belarus civil society programs of the National Endowment for Democracy, include the right to freedom of religion or belief and the promotion of religious tolerance;

- ensure that U.S. government-funded radio broadcasts to Belarus, including those of RFE/RL, continue at least at their present levels; that efforts are made to secure sufficient transmission capacity to ensure reliable reception throughout that country; and that the programs discuss issues relating to freedom of thought, conscience, and religion or belief;
- use appropriated Internet freedom funds to develop free and secure email access for use in Belarus; facilitate the dissemination of high-speed Internet access via satellite; and immediately distribute proven field-tested counter-censorship programs in order to prevent the arrest and harassment of religious freedom and human rights activists, helping them maintain their freedom of expression and legitimate expectations of privacy;
- award funds appropriated by Congress to counter censorship in Belarus, including those from the FY2010 Consolidated Appropriations Act, through a competitive and merit based process;
- provide increased international travel opportunities – particularly opportunities to attend international conferences – for Belarusian civil society leaders, including representatives of human rights organizations and religious groups, as well as others who defend freedom of religion in that country;
- continue to privately and publicly support those engaged in the struggle against repression in Belarus, including the group of religious and opposition activists who make up the Freedom of Religion Initiative that published the “White Book;”
- organize roundtables inside Belarus between members of registered and unregistered religious communities and international experts on freedom of religion, particularly the OSCE Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief; and
- assist in funding Belarusian NGOs seeking reform of the country’s religion law

While the geo-strategic importance of Turkmenistan is on the rise, the United States should continue raising concerns about human rights and religious freedom in its meetings with the Turkmen government, urge it to implement new laws and practices that comply with international human rights standards, and, if concrete improvements are not met, designate Turkmenistan as a CPC. To this end, USCIRF recommends that the U.S. government take a number of specific steps to expand its bilateral relations with Turkmenistan, promote religious freedom and related human rights, and expand U.S. programs and other activities in pursuit of this aim.

I. Expanding U.S.-Turkmen Bilateral Relations

The U.S. government should:

- urge the Turkmen government to limit its operational definition of extremism to address only acts that involve violence or incitement to imminent violence;

- urge the Turkmen government to embrace fully USAID’s technical critique of Turkmen laws affecting religious freedom; and
- discuss human rights and freedom of religion or belief during bilateral meetings with the government of Turkmenistan, explore ways in which Turkmenistan can implement laws and practices to comply with international human rights standards, and establish a regular reporting mechanism on these issues.

II. Promoting Freedom of Religion or Belief and Other Human Rights

The U.S. government should urge the government of Turkmenistan to:

- repeal all laws, decrees or regulations, and amend those articles of the religion law, that violate international norms on freedom of religion or belief, for example by implementing the recommendations of the USAID-funded analysis of that law;
- eliminate intrusive and onerous registration procedures and abolish criminal or other penalties for engaging in religious or other peaceful activity solely because it has not been approved by the state;
- halt unlawful arrest, detention, harassment, deportation, fines, and residential and workplace intimidation of members of religious communities due to their peaceful practice of religious or other beliefs;
- end fully the harassment and unlawful deportation of religious leaders and the imposition of fines on members of peaceful unregistered religious communities whose activities are deemed “illegal;”
- pledge that it will fully respect the human rights, including the right to life, of Turkmen émigré human rights and other activists;
- end the imposition of the Ruhnama or other state-sponsored texts or ideology in public institutions and religious organizations;
- end discriminatory construction codes that restrict non-Russian-Orthodox communities from building places of worship;
- end restrictions on the study of religion in higher education, including bans on non-Islamic theology;
- allow women to study Islamic theology;
- promulgate new regulations and adopt new policies to ease the importation of religious and other material for all communities, and to permit the domestic printing and dissemination of such material in accordance with international standards;

- restore genuine legal alternatives to military service on the grounds of religious or conscientious objection based on international precedents, including those of the OSCE, and cease the criminal prosecution and fully restore the civil and political rights of Jehovah's Witnesses and others who refuse to serve in the army on the grounds of conscience;
- expand and regularize the systematic and effective involvement of international legal experts, such as those of the OSCE Panel of Experts on Religion or Belief and the OSCE Panel on Freedom of Association, and relevant UN experts;
- end state interference in the management of religious communities and in the selection and training of religious leaders, including those from Sunni and Shi'a Muslim and the Russian Orthodox communities, as well as from Protestant and other minority communities; and
- permit a USCIRF delegation to return to Turkmenistan to assess current conditions for freedom of religion or belief, speak with current or former prisoners of conscience in places of detention, and speak unimpeded with religious and other organizations and their members.

II. Expanding U.S. Programs and Other Activities to Promote Human Rights and Reform Efforts

The U.S. government should:

- increase and improve radio, Internet, and other broadcasts of objective news and information, including on topics such as freedom of religion or belief and on other human rights and religious tolerance, by:
 - --expanding and improving broadcasts to Turkmenistan by the Turkmen Service of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), including by increasing coverage of issues relating to freedom of religion or belief, adding Russian-language broadcasts; and
 - --restoring Voice of America's Russian-language television and radio broadcasts to Central Asia, particularly those broadcasts relating to human rights, including freedom of religion or belief.
- assist in improving Turkmenistan's educational system, particularly with regard to curricula on religious freedom and other human rights, by:
 - --reprinting Russian and Turkmen language materials on human rights, particularly on international norms on freedom of religion or belief; and
 - --providing funds for libraries in Ashgabat and other cities, including materials on human rights, as well as freedom of religion or belief, tolerance, civic education, and international legal standards;
- develop assistance programs to encourage civil society groups that protect human rights and promote freedom of religion or belief, including by expanding legal assistance programs for representatives of religious communities through grants that address freedom of religion or belief via the

USAID Democracy and Conflict Mitigation or the Democracy Commission
Small Grants program administered by the U.S. Embassy;

- expand international contacts and increase U.S. involvement in communities in Turkmenistan, including through Peace Corps and USAID programs, include religious leaders in community projects in order to address social problems and increase tolerance, and expand exchange programs, including with civil society leaders, students, and others concerned with human rights; and
- cooperate with the OSCE Center in Ashgabat, including by resuming joint activities with human rights activists from Turkmenistan to encourage civic education, including on international norms on freedom of religion or belief as well as other human rights.

III. Strengthening Efforts in the International Arena

With regard to international fora, the U.S. government should urge the government of Turkmenistan to:

- implement the recommendations of the October 2006 Report of the UN Secretary General on the Situation of Human Rights in Turkmenistan and the 2008 recommendations of the UN Human Rights Council during the UPR of Turkmenistan;
- agree to the numerous requests for visits by the UN Special Rapporteurs, as well as representatives of the OSCE, including its Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief, and provide the full and necessary conditions for such visits; and
- participate fully in the OSCE, including in the annual Human Dimension meeting in Warsaw, and expand the activities of the OSCE Center in Ashgabat, particularly on human rights, including programs with local schools, universities, and institutes on human rights standards, including freedom of religion or belief.

Netherlands Helsinki Committee

To all OSCE participating States:

The Astana Commemorative Declaration confirmed the principle that issues relating to human dimension commitments are matters of direct and legitimate concern to all participating States.¹⁹ In view of this principle, all participating States should make use of any opportunities to raise concerns about violations of freedom of expression, assembly and association, as well as repression of civil society with the governments of other participating States where such violations occur. They should call on these governments to take concrete and specific measures to address existing violations.

To the authorities of Kazakhstan:

- Ensure that no one who is involved in the ongoing labor protests in western Kazakhstan, or who offers support to the protesting workers is punished (through fines, arrests, criminal charges or in other ways) for the legitimate and peaceful exercise of the rights to freedom of expression, association and assembly, the right to strike, and the right to form, join and freely carry out trade union activities;

- Ensure that the appeal hearing in the case of trade union activist Natalia Sokolova is carried out in full accordance with international fair trial standards and protects the rights mentioned above. Also ensure that the case of trade union leader Akzhanat Aminov is reconsidered in a fair process that protects fundamental rights in this area;
- Promptly and thoroughly investigate all allegations of disproportionate and unlawful action by law enforcement authorities in connection with the labor protests, as well as reported cases of violent attacks on individuals associated with the protests. Bring those responsible to justice;
- Bring legislation and practice regulating the organization of assemblies, as well as the registration of public associations into full compliance with international standards on freedom of assembly, freedom of association and other fundamental rights;
- Stop blocking access to Live Journal or other websites containing information on controversial issues, and ensure that any measure taken to prevent the spread of website content deemed illegal is limited to that material and meets the full requirements of the law;
- Ensure that Yevgeniy Zhovtis' request for parole is considered in a fair and comprehensive manner, taking into account all relevant circumstances of his case, with a view to making possible a speedy release. As long as he remains imprisoned, ensure that he is treated adequately and on an equal footing with other prisoners in his colony.

To the authorities of Turkmenistan:

- Ensure that independent NGOs that so wish can obtain legal status in a fair and transparent process, and allow international organizations and foundations that promote and support human rights, the rule of law, and the development of civil society to operate in the country;
- Put an end to intimidation and harassment targeting members of Turkmen civil society who exercise their fundamental rights to express, receive and share views challenging official accounts of the state of affairs in Turkmenistan, as well as their relatives. In particular, do not restrict the right of such individuals to travel abroad, through the use of "black lists" or other similar practices;
- Ensure that TIHR can carry out its work without obstruction; no one is subjected to repression for contributing, reading or commenting on information published on the TIHR website; and local officials in Dashoguz do not pay any further intimidating visits to Mrs. Tukhbatullin, hold her under surveillance or intimidate or harass her in any other ways;
- Adopt legislation on the conduct of assemblies that is consistent with international human rights standards and refrain from suppressing and punishing the participants in peaceful public protest actions. Drop any possible charges leveled against the four women accused of organizing the June protest action in Ashgabat and release them immediately if they are still held by police;
- Protect residents' right to seek and receive information on human rights and other issues from outside Turkmenistan by refraining from measures that restrict the use of the internet or access to satellite TV and radio channels.

To the authorities of Uzbekistan:

- Enable national and international NGOs to obtain registration in an uncomplicated, fair and transparent process and promptly grant/restore registration to all human rights groups that have been denied or deprived of registration on arbitrary grounds, including Human Rights Watch;
- Allow members of civil society to carry out activities to promote human rights in the country without facing intimidation, harassment or undue interference by authorities and immediately and unconditionally release all human rights defenders who have been imprisoned on fabricated criminal charges;
- Stop blocking the websites of human rights groups and human rights portals and do not restrict the use of the internet for the purpose of obtaining or exchanging information on issues relating to the promotion and protection of human rights;
- As proposed in the recent draft National Action Program on Human Rights, adopt specific legislation governing the organization of assemblies, thereby ensuring that this legislation fully corresponds with international human rights standards. Involve civil society representatives in the elaboration of the legislation, make use of advice offered by international experts (such as ODIHR experts), and draw on international best practice in this area;
- Also before new legislation has been adopted, ensure that civil society members can gather peacefully to express concerns and misgivings without being arrested, fined or punished in other ways.

“Lawyers for Constitutional Rights and Freedoms (JURIX)”

- Recommendation: Ordinary participants of peaceful assemblies should not be detained even in cases when regulatory authorities and organizers do not reach agreement about the time, place and manner of the event.
- Recommendation: Lack of approval of the regulatory authorities regarding the time and place of the event should not be a reason for the dispersal of the peaceful assembly.
- Recommendation: Ordinary participants should not be burdened with the obligation to establish the consent of regulatory authorities about the holding of the peaceful assembly, and should not be subject to sanction for participating in such peaceful assemblies.
- Recommendation: Any sanctions for organizers, who did not reach agreement with regulatory authorities about the time, place and manner of the event, should be proportionate.
- Recommendation: Applying a penalty of an administrative arrest for several days (from two to fifteen) for holding a peaceful assembly should be considered a disproportionate restriction on freedom of peaceful assembly.
- Recommendation: Political opposition should not receive harsher penalties for holding ‘unauthorized’ peaceful assemblies.
- Recommendation: The procedure of notifying the regulatory authorities on the time and place of the assembly and obtaining their consent should not be used as a tool to prevent protest and critical expression at the peaceful assembly.
- Recommendation: Peaceful assemblies should be allowed to be held in front of their intended audience and with maximum publicity. They have as much right to use the public venues as everyone else.

- Recommendation: Regulatory authorities should operate with the presumption for holding the peaceful assembly, not aiming to restrict it. The regulation of time, place, size and manner of the assembly should not be based on the content of its message, if it has a peaceful nature and does not call for violence and hatred.
- Recommendation: Sensibilities of the opponents of the assembly or of the alleged majority should not be a sufficient reason for banning a peaceful assembly or dispersing it.
- Recommendation: Police should protect the participants of the peaceful assembly from violent attacks.
- Recommendation: Police should not treat the participants of the peaceful assembly on the basis of the message of the assembly and personal expression of its participants.

HazteOir.org

- To explicitly leave out of human rights education controverted topics as emotional/sexual education.
- To provide effective instruments in order to guarantee the right of parents to educate their children according to their convictions.
- To defend parents "prior right to choose the kind of education that shall be given to their children" as stated in the UDHR, ICCPR, ECHR and multiple other international documents: "...the State shall respect the right of parents to ensure such education and teaching in conformity with their own religions and philosophical convictions" (ECHR Art. 8, Art. 9, Art. 2 of Protocol 1).
- To monitor legislation, with special attention to so called hate-speech legislation, its content, interpretation, application and its influence in the education system; that such legislation neither impair free speech, debate or disagreement, nor exercise partiality to special interest groups at the expense of others.
- To Defend Freedom of Speech - to include that Christians can teach Christian understanding of the human person, faith and morality.

The Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians in Europe

We recommend to OSCE and the participating states to ensure that the composition of national human rights bodies is balanced with regard to political affiliation and views, and that the members are not or were not attached to radical advocacy groups.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

We call upon the Greek State

- To respect and implement its duties from the international instruments in which the freedom of association is safeguarded,
- To recognize and implement the ECtHR decisions.

Christian Legal Centre

Therefore, the CLC urges member states of the OSCE to protect and promote the freedom of association of churches and religious organizations, and ensure that national human rights institutions do not take sides when it comes to protecting and promoting human rights.

Alliance Defense Fund, Associazione "Dossetti: i Valori" - Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom, Christian Legal Centre, HazteOir.org, Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians in Europe

Participating States are urged to not force children to a compulsory sexual, religious or ethical teaching which may be not consistent with the convictions of the children's parents, providing for this case non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities.

Human Rights House Foundation

- We would like to recommend the OSCE participating States to invite the newly appointed UN Special Rapporteur for an official visit to your country for conducting consultations with the State, civil society, national human rights institutions and other stakeholders to discuss the country-based situation and how to nationally improve and strengthen the freedom of association and peaceful assembly.
- We recommend the States to use these consultations as a tool for your follow up of recommendations set by the Universal Periodic Review as well as preparing for your new UPR report, where States are expected to have consultations with the civil society and other stakeholders on human rights issues.
- When doing so, also invite OSCE ODIHR to introduce their practical and important handbooks on the monitoring of freedom of peaceful assembly and now also on freedom of association. The States should further include the OSCE recommendations into the national legislation and practices.

Federation of Western Thracian Turks in Europe

In light of the information above, we urge all participating States, in particular Greece to ensure the effective enjoyment of the right to freedom expression and freedom of associations, particularly in the case of ethnic, religious and linguistic groups though they are not officially recognized as minorities, and fully execute or enforce ECtHR's judgements to ensure that its obligations are fulfilled in practice. And, we kindly request the OSCE, its institutions and field operations to establish a mechanism that would allow the OSCE/ODIHR to monitor and review the implementation of OSCE participating States' commitments in regard to the freedom of association.

Delegation of Switzerland

A ce titre, la Suisse aimerait faire trois recommandations :

- D'abord en ce qui concerne la lutte contre l'impunité : nous appelons les Etats à combattre ce fléau en menant des enquêtes indépendantes, transparentes et effectives sur les allégations de crimes commis dans le contexte d'assemblée pacifique.
- Ensuite concernant les causes profondes de telles manifestations : la Suisse invite les Etats participants et partenaires à saisir les opportunités qui se présentent pour s'engager dans un dialogue national et à assurer l'existence d'un espace de liberté et de concertation.
- Enfin, nous souhaitons encourager la continuation de la coordination entre notre organisation et les autres organisations régionales ou internationales, dans le but de répertorier les bonnes pratiques protégeant cette liberté.

Chernivtsy Regional NGO 'Human Rights'

Ратифицирование Украиной Декларации ООН о праве и обязанности отдельных лиц, групп и органов общества поощрять и защищать общепризнанные права человека и основные свободы;

Обеспечение защиты правозащитников на законодательном уровне;

Создание системы непрерывного образования в области прав человека

Human Rights First

Participating States must not only permit LGBTI pride parades and equality events and gatherings, but guarantee the participants' safety and security. We call on governments to respect OSCE commitments on freedom of assembly and association.

Social Found "Prometei"

Для того, чтобы совместить соблюдение прав человека и борьбы с преступностью, необходимы следующие меры:

- а) разработка и реализация механизма определения принципиальных границ и предварительных условий ограничений прав человека при проведении профилактических и иных мероприятий, связанных с противодействием криминальным деяниям;
- б) формирование новых и совершенствование действующих структур глобальной криминологической безопасности, основанных на тесном международном сотрудничестве;
- в) формирование правового, организационного и материально обеспеченного механизма реализации закрепленных в законе и подзаконных актах положений, в силу которых защита прав человека является одной из ведущих функций всех правоохранительных органов;
- г) признание наличия у системы защиты прав человека функции профилактики преступлений и переориентация содержания профилактической деятельности с правоограничительных мер на правозащитные;
- д) повышение статуса и гарантий прав потерпевшего от преступления;
- е) признание лиц, находящихся в социально опасном положении и склонных в силу этого к совершению преступлений, объектами защитной деятельности.

Freedom House, Partners in Human Rights Project in Kyrgyzstan

Рекомендуем добиваться от правительства Кыргызской Республики:

- - осуждения и пресечения актов насилия на собраниях граждан
- - принятия мер для обеспечения безопасности участников мирных собраний и обеспечения правопорядка в местах проведения публичных акций
- - принятия мер по адекватному и своевременному реагированию на общественные протесты, связанные с нарушением прав и свобод
- - ускорения работы, связанной с принятием нового закона «О мирных собраниях», с учетом рекомендаций высказанных международными экспертами БДИПЧ ОБСЕ и Венецианской комиссии

European Union

The EU calls on OSCE participating States:

- To ensure the promotion and protection of human rights and all fundamental freedoms, including through enabling their relevant national authorities to effectively carry out their roles.
- To draw on the expertise of ODIHR and its field missions and take concrete action to enable individuals to effectively exercise their rights to peaceful assembly and association, freedom of expression and freedom of movement.

Recommendations to the OSCE

European Union

The EU recognises the important work of OSCE field presences in strengthening civil society and calls on ODIHR and field missions:

- to assist the participating States in reviewing legislation and practice with regard to international and regional human rights standards and OSCE commitments, particularly in the area of freedom of association and assembly.
- to continue to engage with national human rights institutions and Human Rights Defenders across the OSCE area, to strengthen their capacity to promote and protect, monitor and report on respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.

Human Rights House Foundation

The Human Rights House Foundation with many of our partners invite OSeE and ODIHR to:

- to follow up the UN Special Rapporteur's invitation to look at both best and worst practices with regards to freedom of assembly and association. We need to look at both best and worst practices, since one relates to the other. We recommend OSeE to come up with a list of minimum standards of practices OSeE can accept for these two fundamental rights;
- to create both international and national expert and monitoring groups on the situation on freedom of association in the OSeE area;
- to actively promote the Guidelines on freedom of peaceful assembly and association, and actively promote their integration into national legislation and practice;
- to expand the activities of the OSeE ODIHR expert panel on freedom of assembly and ensure the involvement of civil society groups within OSeE in both the monitoring and promotion work of the Guidelines;
- National Human Rights Institutions should monitor and report on the two freedoms, and actively promote and defend the protection of these fundamental

freedoms at the national level. They should also be asked to provide information and analysis to the UN Special Rapporteur and regional mechanisms;

- National Human Rights Institutions should safeguard their independence, and professionalize and consolidate their role as a bridge between government and civil society. They should collaborate, engage and consult with a broad and diverse range of civil society actors and ensure that inputs and comments are brought to the authorities.

Alliance Defense Fund, Associazione "Dossetti: i Valori" - Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom, Christian Legal Centre, HazteOir.org, Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians in Europe

The OSCE/ODIHR and to the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief are called upon to assist the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining to freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee (a) that the liberty of parents to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions is fully respected and (b) that the participating States provide non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities that would accommodate the right of parents.