Anti-Semitism and National Memory Discourse

Teaching Aid

WORDS INTO ACTION TO ADDRESS ANTI-SEMITISM

OSCE ODIHR
1. Increasing Knowledge about Jews and Judaism
2. Overcoming Unconscious Biases
3. Addressing Anti-Semitic Stereotypes and Prejudice
4. Challenging Conspiracy Theories
5. Teaching about Anti-Semitism through Holocaust Education
6. Addressing Holocaust Denial, Distortion and Trivialization

7. Anti-Semitism and National Memory Discourse

8. Dealing with Anti-Semitic Incidents
9. Dealing with Online Anti-Semitism
10. Anti-Semitism and the Situation in the Middle East
Anti-Semitism and National Memory Discourse

In a modern world dominated by nation states, national histories play a crucial role in the development of national identity. Who we are as individuals, our cultures and society in general are all influenced by the stories, legends, and heroes that have emerged from past events. These interpretations of the past help us come to terms with histories that may be painful, thereby shaping our individual and national understanding of who we are and who we aim to become.

Both within and between nations, public discussion about the narratives that have evolved around the collective national memory influence how the subject of anti-Semitism may be brought up and discussed in the classroom. This is because historical and current events are interpreted through different lenses and views of them are shaped by discourse related to national memory in countries. Canadian archivist Terry Cook observes that, “Such collective ‘remembering’ – and ‘forgetting’ – occurs in galleries, museums, libraries, historical sites, historical monuments, public commemorations, and archives – perhaps most especially through archives.” Teachers have the arduous challenge of reviewing historical moments through these diverse lenses and deciding what is most appropriate to bring into their classrooms.

As such, part of teachers’ tasks may include identifying what may be “missing” or “forgotten” in the historical events covered in teaching materials. This is particularly the case when the written history of a country features “golden heroes” of the past while failing to mention those heroes’ darker sides. If the widely accepted narrative of a historical figure does not include negative details, there may be great variations in understanding among students and parents about how their actions or decisions affected certain groups of people. At the same time, bringing up “forgotten histories” can create tension and mistrust in classroom discussions. Any new information that teachers bring into the classroom has the potential to spark controversy among students and possibly the school’s administration. This is especially the case with the topic of anti-Semitism.

This teaching aid looks at how teachers can acknowledge, challenge and reject anti-Semitism when it arises in classroom discussions, specifically when it is triggered by narratives of national memory.

“Until the lions have their own historians, the history of the hunt will always glorify the hunter.”

African proverb

The development of national historical memory is a complicated process, as people from (and within) different societies have various experiences and outlooks. Throughout the OSCE region, historical memory of the twentieth century has been greatly marked by the two World Wars, the Holocaust and the Cold War. The United Nations were specifically established in the aftermath of World War II to maintain international peace and security and “to reaffirm faith in fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person,” through a new international legal order. These events also gave rise to the establishment of other international and regional organizations, such as the OSCE and the European Union, while hastening the demise of imperial structures. Despite a shared history, there are great differences in how each country, city, town or village remembers these historical events and important historical figures. Certain aspects of history are emphasized in different ways, while others may be hidden entirely.

For example, some countries emphasize Nazi crimes and the horrors experienced by the Jews in the Holocaust, whereas others may choose to give greater precedence to the crimes committed during the Stalinist period or by fascist or communist governments. Other countries may acknowledge the horrors of the Holocaust committed by Germany under Adolf Hitler’s Nazi regime, but disregard the responsibility of other national authorities or populations who may have collaborated with the Nazis. Today, the trope of the communist Jew re-surfaces in discussions about national identity or the history of World War II as crimes against Jews before, during and after the Holocaust can be justified by anti-communist fervour, rather than anti-Semitism or Nazi collaboration. Some national narratives place an emphasis on the victims of atrocities, whereas others focus on resistance or victory.2

This can be referred to as the “politics of memory” – the organization of collective memory by political agents and the political means by which events are remembered and recorded, or discarded.3 Eventually, the politics of memory may determine the way history is written and passed on. The creators of national memory not only determine what to remember and what to forget, but may also present a one-sided or over-simplified version of complex events. Such narratives can affect how individuals in different countries

---

2 Over seventy years after the end of World War II, memories of it remain sensitive. For example, in 2017, a Russian school boy sparked public outrage for suggesting in a speech to the Bundestag that some German soldiers were themselves victims of the conflict. Russian government officials responded that the pupil was not to blame, but a review of WWII education in Russia would be necessary. “Выступивший в бундестаге школьник из Нового Уренгоя похудел из-за травли [Schoolboy from New Urengoy lost weight because of harassment after speaking in the Bundestag]”, RIA-Novosti, 20 December 2017, <https://ria.ru/20171220/1511298000.html>


---
understand the past or relate to different groups of people.

In every country or territory, there are specific events or time periods that form an essential part of national or collective memory. Periods marked by slavery, colonialism and imperialism have each been told or untold to different extents. To develop a comprehensive understanding of all historical events, they must be explored from multiple points of view, especially in school curricula. If multiple points of view are not covered in the classroom, individual students, educators, their families or whole communities may feel excluded from the social and historical narrative, resulting in frustrations surfacing in the classroom. A simplistic approach to teaching about important events may also discourage students from developing critical thinking skills.

Specific events and historical figures can take on symbolic significance in national memory. For example, an annual national holiday that marks a country’s independence is an important way of constructing historical memory and national identity. Other national holidays can be established to ensure that particular episodes of history are never forgotten. For example, Canada’s National Indigenous People’s Day marks the country’s struggle for civil rights and recognizes the contributions of the First Nations, Inuit and Métis.\(^4\) International Holocaust Memorial Day was established in 2005 by a United Nations resolution marking the sixtieth anniversary of the liberation of Auschwitz-Birkenau.

There can be discrepancies in discourses around national memory: some narratives can dominate while others may be silenced, resulting in what are sometimes referred to as hidden histories. Thanksgiving in the United States of America is an example of a tradition that has been crucial in shaping national memory and identity, but its pervading narrative hides the cultural destruction and conquest of Native Americans by the colonists. Thanksgiving celebrations reflect a general political and cultural amnesia about the complete history and consequences of relations between the first European settlers and indigenous peoples. Some Native American tribes consider it a Day of Mourning. Many States across the United States no longer celebrate Columbus Day and see it as marking the beginning of a historic genocide.\(^5\) They now refer to the holiday as Indigenous Peoples’ Day,\(^6\) which celebrates and honours the indigenous peoples of America and commemorates their shared history and culture. Indigenous Peoples’ Day in the United States of America is an example of how national memory may change over time, including when new understandings or perspectives enter the collective awareness or when nation states are re-shaped.

\(^4\) National Indigenous People’s Day was first celebrated on 21 June 1996 as National Aboriginal Day, which was renamed in 2017.


There can also be generation-al differences in the collective memory of a nation. There appears to be a critical period between the ages of 12 and 25 for the construction of identity; national events that happen during this period of a person’s life have been shown to have a stronger impact on an individual’s memory.  

National memory discourse that changes over time can be indicative of, or can influence, how a minority is seen within wider society. In the case of the Soviet Union, the fact that one third of all Jews killed in the Holocaust were Soviet citizens was in many ways absorbed into, and lost within, a broader narrative that tried to come to terms with the far higher total number of Soviet citizens who perished during the war. Many have blamed Stalinist anti-Semitism for the omission of the word “Holocaust” from the work of Soviet historians during the decades after the war, although most historians now agree that there were a variety of factors and motivations behind this policy. As a result, the role of anti-Semitism in the treatment of Jews by Nazis was not widely covered in Soviet historiography until the dissolution of the Soviet Union.

Similarly, a country’s “golden heroes” of the past may have a darker side that can spark controversy in discussions about how they are remembered now in textbooks, monuments and statues. In modern Romania, for example, members of the main interwar fascist movement (known as the Iron Guard) are remembered primarily for their later role in fighting communism. This portrayal plays down their anti-Semitic, racist and undemocratic beliefs and adherence to a far-right ideology.

Debate in Ukraine about the participation of Ukrainian nationalist groups in atrocities during World War II is similarly

---

contentious, with parallel discussions taking place in other Central and Eastern European States, such as Croatia and Slovakia. The question of collaboration of the French wartime government with the German occupation after 1940 remains a difficult subject, contrasting with other national narratives of resistance. Historical figures are as complex and multi-faceted as history itself, sometimes challenging popular portrayals.

Hidden histories can come to light with the building or destruction of monuments to controversial figures or moments in national history. Should these monuments be dismantled to symbolize the modern state’s desire to uphold the human rights of all, or is there a more pedagogically effective way to remember and teach the role of these historical figures in episodes of national history that should not be forgotten?

The world-famous Diary of Anne Frank – an autobiographical account of a young Jewish girl who came of age hiding from the Nazis in Amsterdam – has long been the dominant narrative through which World War II is remembered in the Netherlands. It is a story of inspiration and resistance that has captured the public imagination, both in the Netherlands and around the world. In contrast, Dutch collaboration with the Nazis led to the deaths of

Across the United States and in several European countries, monuments to the legendary World War II General George S. Patton can be found. Despite being a crucial force for defeating the Nazis, General Patton was also a virulent anti-Semite and racist, expressing in his personal journal that “Jews are lower than animals” in response to criticism from President Truman for treating the liberated Jews the same as the Nazis, only without killing them.


Public authorities in the Italian town of Bolzano adopted a participative educational approach in response to calls to destroy or preserve a massive bas-relief of Benito Mussolini on horseback, which bears the slogan “Credere, Obbedire, Combattere” (“Believe, Obey, Combat”). A public bid was launched, and more than 500 ideas for how to “defuse and contextualize” the monument were submitted. The five finalist proposals were put online for public scrutiny before the winning proposal was selected: to superimpose on the bas relief an LED-illuminated inscription of a quote by the German Jewish philosopher Hannah Arendt that reads “Nobody has the right to obey.”


---


by the European Parliament on the challenges of European historical memory recommends that, in order to achieve a critical and open-minded approach to understanding the past and the present, history teaching should:

- Increase awareness of the diversity of cultures, histories and memories, and promote mutual respect;

- Provide students with the necessary knowledge and skills to assess their own local and national past, without bias, in comparison and relation to other national, regional and global realities; and, in doing so,

- Encourage students to become active critical thinkers and participants of “historical remembrance.”

Finding the right balance of perspectives is crucial for ensuring that students appreciate and support open, diverse and democratic societies that respect the values of human rights and equality for all.

---


---

75 to 80 per cent of Jews in the Netherlands during the Holocaust. The story of Anne Frank has become a foundational document for introducing the Holocaust to students. Her diary is not only a historical source in its own right but also a good entry point for learners to engage with the Holocaust: a personal family account can be more relatable, while addressing the worst atrocities only indirectly. Creating empathy with those who lived through atrocities is a powerful educational tool. Yet, teachers must also address the full story of what happened to the Jews before, during and after the Holocaust to illustrate the implications of stories like Anne Frank’s in context.

Examples abound of histories, legends and monuments that tell only partial stories. Education plays a fundamental role in promoting historical consciousness. The pedagogical challenge for teachers lies in providing a balance of perspectives, in addition to historical facts, when approaching topics that may seem controversial within a particular national or political context. A 2015 study commissioned by the European Parliament on the challenges of European historical memory recommends that, in order to achieve a critical and open-minded approach to understanding the past and the present, history teaching should:

- Increase awareness of the diversity of cultures, histories and memories, and promote mutual respect;

- Provide students with the necessary knowledge and skills to assess their own local and national past, without bias, in comparison and relation to other national, regional and global realities; and, in doing so,

- Encourage students to become active critical thinkers and participants of “historical remembrance.”

Finding the right balance of perspectives is crucial for ensuring that students appreciate and support open, diverse and democratic societies that respect the values of human rights and equality for all.
Classroom Strategies for Addressing “Golden Heroes” and Conflicting Discourse within National Memory

What to do if ...?

...competing national memory narratives arise in a classroom?

Before approaching a topic, consider who your students are, the sort of questions they might ask or the historical ties they may share. The diversity of the classroom can be a great resource for providing a more well-rounded understanding of historical events, taking care to avoid strengthening existing prejudices or trauma by singling out students of minority or “different” backgrounds.

The positions held and actions taken on all sides in a past conflict or negotiation have to be understood by the class in order for them to learn the lessons that are offered from the past. Ignoring the experiences of one side or the other will prevent such learning from taking place.

Nowadays, history scholars consider sources unreliable that only tell the narrative of the dominant community. That

Activity

A multi-perspective approach to teaching a historical event or era is recommended to help develop students’ critical consciousness of the different narratives surrounding it. Practically speaking, this can involve providing reading materials from three or four different points of view, and perhaps additional background information to better understand each perspective.

Working in small groups, students can analyse different sources presenting a range of perspectives and respond to the following questions for subsequent presentation to the class.

• For each source, make a note of the following: title, authors, web site/publisher and any other information about the authors/publishers (look in the “About” section of the host website and conduct a search to learn more about the authors and the organization that is hosting this author’s content).
• In your own words, how do these authors tell the story of what happened?
• What evidence did these authors use to support their version of the story?
• How might the writers’ point of view help determine their interpretation of the story?
• What is at stake in the interpretation of the story?
• What do the differences in the telling of this story suggest about how history is written?

is why teaching history from multiple perspectives is recommended. This can be done in the classroom by incorporating source materials that express different views on a certain topic, by using more varied primary source materials or by directing several students to approach an assignment from the perspectives of different protagonists. Be aware, however, that some families and communities may be highly sensitive to certain historical events; teachers should use their judgement when introducing multiple historical perspectives on whether these may be harmful for peaceful relations or result in resistance, depending on the composition of the class. Preparation for these lessons is crucial. It may be helpful to first engage the class in a historical perspective exercise on an uncontroversial topic to allow them to develop the skills and openness required to consider events from different points of view. Only by looking at the bigger picture can a student better understand different approaches to interpreting history and how these approaches have arisen. Teachers can help students think beyond their immediate national horizons and consider a regional or global perspective of the historical event in question. In this way, teachers can better prepare their students to understand the historical basis for modern discussions on certain issues.

The multiple perspectives approach is complemented by teaching the history of the Jews as part of shared local, national and international history.

...a student points out that the experience of a certain group or groups are hidden from the standard historical narrative? History is very often told and documented by those who were in power during that period of time. For example, until the 1960s and 1970s, history was overwhelmingly written and documented by men. This history usually focused on the activities of men: the conquests of political leaders, who were mostly men, and usually only from the point of view of the winner. Only in the late twentieth century, in some countries, was there a specific discipline dedicated to “women’s history,” or what some call “herstory.” The prevailing historical narrative features relatively few female role models, military or political leaders, or other women heroes who have been part of the public consciousness. Primary sources, often private, such as diaries and letters, have proven to be a crucial resource for reconstructing the parts of history that were left out of mainstream or textbook accounts. Unfortunately, even these are only available from times when women became generally literate.

Educating from a gender perspective is essential for students to begin to understand the dynamics of identity and power relations in general, but taking this approach can also be helpful because it highlights to educators tested pedagogical approaches that can be adapted for unmasking other prejudices or discrimination.

Understanding historical context is a useful exercise for students to get a better understanding of whose history is being recounted and for what purpose. Historical context refers to the social, religious, economic and political conditions that existed during a certain time and place. It is what enables us to interpret and analyse works or events of the past, rather than judging them by contemporary standards or expectations.

Films and books about historical figures and events can be an interesting introduction to the past, as well as a vehicle for encouraging students to look critically at both the events and how they are represented.

European Association for Gender Research, Education and Documentation (ATGENDER)

ATGENDER is a broad association for academics, practitioners, activists and institutions in the field of women’s and gender studies, feminist research, women’s rights, gender equality and diversity. It provides educators with a rich body of resources and teaching material which can be downloaded for free, including the book series Teaching with Gender which presents a wide range of teaching practices. Titles include Teaching “Race” with a Gendered Edge, Teaching Against Violence, Teaching Intersectionality, etc.

The association counts among its many aims: recognizing past and present inequalities, dispossessions and exclusions in Europe and beyond, and fighting them; learning to recognize, solidarize and embrace like-minded struggles; and creating a space for complicated conversations and critiques.

For more information, see: <https://atgender.eu/category/publications/volumes/>.
Activity

Help students to appreciate the fuller version of a story, while also learning to see it from multiple perspectives.

• Prepare a photograph containing several different characters and/or elements. Explain to students that you are going to give them a piece of a larger picture, which you cut into pieces.
• Divide the students into small groups and give each group one piece of the picture. Have students draw, or describe, what they think the rest of the photo might look like, without looking at the other pieces.
• Have the members of each group share their illustrations or descriptions with one another. Engage students in a discussion about the similarities and differences of their illustrations. Ask them to predict what the entire picture might be.
• Assemble all of the pieces of the picture to reveal the entire image.
• Introduce the concept of perspective. Explain that perspective is a point of view: how someone sees a situation, their feelings about a situation and their opinions and recollections about what happened. Continue to explore the implications for having multiple perspectives on a story, or on a historical event.


Teachers can ask the class, for example:

• How can you find out more about the difference between the actual events of the past and how they are represented in the film/book?

• Do the characters use modern language and forms of address, or the language and dialects of the time?

• Are women or others enjoying a broader role or more freedoms than they generally had at the time?

• Do the clothes or visual elements look like they really did at the time (handmade with more or less skill)?

• Do the characters’ ideas or reactions to certain plot developments reflect those of the period, or more modern attitudes?

• Do they conform to particular stereotypes?
• Which other groups were active at the time whose voices are not reflected in this particular representation of the story?

• Are the themes included – such as national pride or consciousness of social injustice – real reflections of the political geography, social norms and preoccupations of the period, or are they a reflection of more modern concepts, that are being projected onto the past?

This type of critical approach will help students understand how historical narratives are created and re-created over generations, and how they connect with the present.

...certain views or actions of an important historical figure lead to a controversial classroom discussion?

Taking a multi-perspective approach and providing historical context are important pedagogical strategies for dealing with controversial aspects of a historical figure who may be revered for their achievements, but who may also have displayed beliefs or behaviours that were then, or are now, perceived negatively.

Unearthing lesser-known dimensions of the character of a historical figure may require accessing different kinds of primary sources, such as archives, newspaper articles or their diaries, letters or speeches, or by introducing other figures who may have been influenced by the ideas and behaviours of the controversial figure. By drawing upon and analyzing a rich variety of appropriate and stimulating resources, such as music, poetry, film and pictures, it will be more likely that students will personally engage with the lesson.

For example, students could also consider the actions of historical figures who took a stand against anti-Semitism, prejudice and discrimination (e.g., Emile Zola, Eleanor Roosevelt, Pope John Paul II, Sophie Scholl or Thomas Masaryk).
Resources and Materials for Further Reading


• The Network fosters dialogue on 20th-century European history through exhibitions, publications, workshops, study visits and conferences, see: www.enrs.eu/en.

EUROCLIO – European Association of History Educators is an umbrella association of more than seventy history, heritage and citizenship educators’ associations, and other organizations active in the field. The Association supports the development of responsible and innovative history, citizenship and heritage education by promoting critical thinking, multi-perspectivity, mutual respect, and the inclusion of controversial issues, see: www.euroclio.eu/resources/.


