SUMMARY REPORT

SECOND ROUNDTABLE MEETING TO PROMOTE THE
GUIDELINES FOR EDUCATORS ON COUNTERING INTOLERANCE AND
DISCRIMINATION AGAINST MUSLIMS:

Globalization, Diversity and Social Cohesion in Educational Settings

5 November 2012, Paris
TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction

II. Summary of Sessions
    Session I: Role of Education in Enhancing Social Cohesion
    Session II: Sharing Experiences: Lessons Learned and Good Practices
    Session III: Promotion of the Guidelines – Next Steps

III. Recommendations

IV. Annexes
    Annex I: Meeting Agenda
    Annex II: List of Participants
I. INTRODUCTION

A roundtable meeting was held at UNESCO’s headquarter in Paris on 5 November 2012 on “Globalization, Diversity and Social Cohesion in Educational Settings”. This was the second in a series of three roundtables convened by the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) in co-operation with the Council of Europe (CoE) and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) aimed at promoting use of the publication Guidelines for Educators on Countering Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims: Addressing Islamophobia through Education. The Guidelines were jointly published by the three organizations in 2011. The objective of the publication is to empower educators to challenge intolerance and discrimination against Muslims in schools. The Guidelines are a resource with examples of good practices and a list of websites where further information and resources can be found.

The objective of the roundtable was to promote the Guidelines among UNESCO’s network of educators, discuss how they can be used to raise awareness of and respect for diversity and social cohesion in the era of globalization and exchange regional experiences. The meeting brought together representatives of governments, intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations, educators and independent experts.

The Guidelines were developed in line with the commitment of OSCE participating States to promote tolerance, mutual respect and understanding for different cultures and to counter prejudice, intolerance and discrimination, including against Muslims, through the development of comprehensive educational policies, strategies and awareness-raising measures. OSCE Ministerial Council decisions encourage participating States to consider drawing on ODIHR expertise and assistance in designing methods and curricula for tolerance education.2

This report provides a summary of the discussions at the Paris meeting and the recommendations emerging from the meeting. A separate report summarized the Vienna roundtable. The third roundtable, entitled “Challenging Anti-Muslim Prejudice and Promotion of Mutual Understanding in Multicultural Societies through Education” has been planned for 2013.3

---

1 The Guidelines are available in English, French, German, Russian and Spanish at http://www.osce.org/odihr/84495.
3 Date and venue to be confirmed.
II. SUMMARY OF SESSIONS

The opening session consisted of introductory statements by representatives of the three organizations that co-operated in the production of the *Guidelines*. Ms. Kate Moriarty, Chief of UNESCO’s Section of Education for Peace and Human Rights, thanked ODIHR for taking the initiative to develop the *Guidelines* in partnership with UNESCO and the Council of Europe. Referring to a number of UNESCO Documents, she expressed the Organization’s commitment to promote the values of peace, human rights, tolerance, intercultural understanding, democracy, non-violence and respect through education. She stressed that UNESCO will continue to work in close co-operation with ODIHR and the Council of Europe to support policy-makers and teachers in addressing intolerance and discrimination in schools.

Ms. Azra Junuzović, Deputy Head of ODIHR’s Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, stressed that adequate responses to bias and prejudice in the classroom need to be developed since such acts can have an enormous impact on individuals, communities and societies. Ms. Junuzović explained that to help address the problem ODIHR has developed a number of educational programmes to support participating States in their efforts to promote mutual respect and understanding. In addition to the *Guidelines*, she mentioned teaching materials on anti-Semitism and combating discrimination against Roma, organization of workshops for students on countering prejudice, creation of forums for discussion, and publications such as a *Human Rights Education in the School Systems of Europe, Central Asia and North America: Compendium of Good Practice* and *Preparing Holocaust Memorial Days: Suggestions for Educators*.

Ms. Yulia Pererva, Representative of the Council of Europe’s Division on Citizenship and Human Rights Education, mentioned that the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe encouraged Member States to use the *Guidelines* as part of a resolution adopted by the Assembly on 26 June 2012 concerning multiple discrimination against Muslim women in Europe. She mentioned also that the Council of Europe promotes the *Guidelines* in the framework of its programme on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights, which is a powerful tool to prevent intolerance and discrimination.

**Session I** examined the role of education in enhancing social cohesion. In an opening statement, Mr. Robin Richardson, Co-Chair of the In-service Training and Educational Development (INSTED), recalled six recurring stereotypes commonly found in public discourse about Muslims which were listed in the *Guidelines*: 1) they are all the same, 2) they are all motivated exclusively by religion, 3) they are totally “other”, 4) they are...
culturally and morally inferior, 5) they represent a threat and, because of all these, 6) cooperation is impossible. He underlined that educational responses to such stereotypes should not be limited to providing information on Muslims and Islam. There is need for more focus on the problem of Islamophobia and what it means in terms of intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. This requires challenging the dominant narrative in Europe about Islam and replacing it with an alternative which acknowledges the diversity among Muslims, the common characteristics that they share with others, and the contributions that Muslims have made throughout history and during modern times.

The second opening statement of the session was delivered by Ms. Jasmine Zine, Associate Professor of Sociology at Wilfrid Laurier University. She emphasized that the global tensions which have been used to justify a distorted image of Muslims present new challenges for educators committed to promoting social justice in schools. She stated that social cohesion and global citizenship cannot be achieved without social justice, which creates conditions for active participation in society and equal access to opportunities to develop individual talents and capacities. Social justice education, she said, challenges the individual and systemic practices surrounding differential treatment, racism and intolerance against Muslims in schools and society. In this way, it demystifies the underlying stereotypes and ideologies that justify and sustain intolerance.

Following the opening statements, participants discussed ways of developing a culture of respect for diversity and mutual understanding. Speakers drew attention to the advantages and challenges that result as globalization increases interaction among people with diverse social and cultural backgrounds as a result of the growing mobility of goods, services, capital and labour. The challenge of managing diversity can sometimes increase tensions among various communities.

During the discussion, many participants agreed that social justice is a precondition for social cohesion and pointed out that the Guidelines underscore the importance of education in this regard. Some speakers expressed concern about biased reporting in the media which exacerbates tensions among communities. To deal with this, they suggested that educators should assist students in developing media literacy and critical thinking so that they seek access to multiple sources of information and analyze each one critically. Other participants pointed out that teachers and educators may face challenges in preventing violence motivated by bias in schools. Educators may need more training in this field or may need to confront their own prejudices. The importance of in-service teacher training was emphasized by many speakers, together with the need for teachers to reflect on their own attitudes and values and to develop skills to address intolerance in the classroom.

A number of participants underlined that international organizations such as UNESCO, the OSCE and the Council of Europe can provide an invaluable contribution to raising awareness about mutual respect based on dialogue. They advocated using the Guidelines to supplement existing efforts, suggesting that the visibility of the Guidelines should be increased and that educators should use the document whenever possible. Several speakers also commented that policy-makers should be encouraged to promote the document. The UN Alliance of Civilizations was mentioned as a very important international forum which can help to increase the visibility of the Guidelines and their implementation in educational systems.

Session II was dedicated to sharing experiences, lessons learned and good educational practices for action to encourage respect for diversity and promote social cohesion. Mr.
Eduardo Vargas, Director of Advocacy and Public Policy for Intersections International, made an opening statement describing three projects undertaken by his organization. The first, entitled “Change the Story”, was designed as an on-line resource tool to challenge negative perceptions and stereotypes against the Muslims in the United States. The website for this project provides educational information on Muslims, including the role of Muslim women in Islam, a timeline of events in Muslim-American history and a comparison of different holy books. The second project, “Theater Engagement and Action” is an interactive documentary theatre initiative, which seeks to engage creatively in conversation on harmful divisions in society, as in the recent play “Under the Veil: Being Muslim (and non-Muslim) in New York City, post 9/11”, which focused on Muslim experiences with intolerance and discrimination. A third initiative brought together the leaders of six multi-faith organizations – the Auburn Seminary, Odyssey Networks, the Interfaith Center of New York, Quest, the Tanenbaum Center and Intersections International – and used the 10th anniversary of 9/11 as an opportunity to dispel misunderstandings resulting from a controversy over the development of a Muslim community centre in lower Manhattan. The organizations formed a coalition called “Prepare New York”. The coalition’s website serves as an information tool about initiatives to shift the narrative away from fear and ignorance to mutual respect and understanding.

The second introductory statement of the session was delivered by Ms. Barbara Unterlerchner, Trainer of the Austrian non-governmental organization Civic Courage and Anti-Racism Work (ZARA). She briefed participants on ZARA’s activities and shared information on two projects. One project involved workshops and training organized for students in Vienna’s secondary schools, which included interactive exercises on how to handle discriminatory practices, taking into account the emotional aspects of such experiences. In another project, entitled the “Peer-Education Project”, students in three vocational schools were trained as trainers to deal with intolerance.

Following the introductory statements, participants took the floor to provide information on other examples of good practices. The project “Historiana - your portal to the past”, which was implemented by the European Association of History Teachers, was mentioned as a comprehensive teaching resource about discrimination against Jews and Muslims in sixteenth century Spain. Another initiative mentioned was the “well-being units” in schools in Belgium, where the Ministry of Education deployed social welfare workers and psychologists to undertake appropriate interventions in case of discriminatory incidents. Participants also provided information on the project “Ombudsperson mediators”, which was launched in Brussels schools following youth riots. This project assigned professional mediators to schools to listen to the challenges experienced by students, teachers and parents in the education system and to discuss possible solutions with them.

Many speakers pointed out specific challenges in combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims through education. Concerns were raised in relation to standardized curricula which disregard diversity in schools and practices that marginalize minority students. Lack of instruction in students’ mother tongues was mentioned as a form of

9 Information on the Change the Story is available at http://www.changethestory.net/.
11 Information on the Prepare New York Coalition is available at http://www.prepareny.com/.
12 Information on the Peer-Education Project is available at http://www.zara.or.at/index.php/multilingual/about-zara.
assimilation policy which affects Muslim minorities across Europe. Some participants underlined that history textbooks must be reviewed to reduce possible bias. Others argued that there is need for teaching materials not only focusing on the history of Islamic communities, but also the history of Islamophobia. While reaffirming the important role that teachers play in countering intolerance against Muslims, many interventions made the point that all stakeholders, including policy-makers, teacher training institutions and school administrations, must be involved in this process. Some participants underlined that classroom activities addressing intolerance against Muslims could be most effective if they tackle burning issues and are built on concrete examples. In this regard, the importance of challenging stereotypes fueled by some media was emphasized because students are influenced not only by what they hear in school, but also by other spheres of social life.

Session III focused on developing recommendations to promote the use of the Guidelines in educational settings. The session began with a presentation by Ms. Pascale Monpoint-Gaillard, an independent consultant, on the Pestalozzi Modules for Educational Projects, of which she is General Rapporteur. This project deals with teacher training and development with a view to enhancing their knowledge and skills in the priority fields of the Council of Europe: democracy, human rights and the rule of law. She also mentioned the “Inter-Cultural Cities” project implemented by the Council of Europe, which seeks to equip teachers with inter-cultural competencies to combat prejudice and stereotypes. She stated that a self-evaluation tool employed during the training was useful for raising the awareness of teachers about their own prejudices. She also pointed out that the Council of Europe’s human rights based approach was needed and timely, because many schools in Europe focus predominantly on transmitting knowledge and not on the acquisition of human rights competencies.

The second opening statement of the session was given by Ms. Brigitte Ernst Cremer, Project Leader for Religion and Culture of Zurich Cantonal School Government, in which she talked about a new course on religion and culture in Swiss schools. She explained that the aim of the course is to raise awareness of different religions and cultures and to promote respect for diversity among students. She added that in order to ensure the suitability and success of the project, a number of steps were put in place, including teacher training activities, teaching materials, continuous evaluation of the activities and the inclusion of different religious communities. Ms. Cremer also underlined the importance of co-operation between schools and intercultural mediators in countering intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.

During the discussions which followed, participants expressed the common view that the Guidelines are a valuable tool to foster mutual respect and understanding. Examples of good practices listed in the Guidelines could inspire teachers to develop activities to challenge misperceptions and stereotypes and to encourage critical thinking among students. They can provide governments with ideas on what educational policies they should put into practice in order to make sure that schools are safe for all students. In addition, speakers suggested that the Guidelines should be used by other intergovernmental organizations in their educational projects and activities, such as the Council of Europe’s Youth Programme, which trains civil society organizations.

13 Information on the Pestalozzi Projects is available at http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/education/pestalozzi/home/default_en.asp.
14 Information on the Council of Europe’s Youth Programme is available at http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/culture/cities/default_en.asp.
III. RECOMMENDATIONS

Participants recommended a number of steps to promote and increase the use of the Guidelines. The bullets below summarize these recommendations. The recommendations were not formally adopted and have no official status. Nevertheless, participants considered that the recommendations provided useful suggestions for follow up and implementation of the Guidelines.

- Make the Guidelines more visible and easier to implement;
- Develop a set of lesson plans, activities and exercises based on the Guidelines which could be used for primary and secondary levels, and for teacher training, as well as by parents;
- Develop in-service training modules following the recommendations in the Guidelines to help teachers implement lesson plans;
- Create an easily navigable webpage for the Guidelines which could be supported by social media;
- Promote the use of school twinning projects, which provide a forum to engage the teachers and students in discussions on the issues raised by the Guidelines;
- Record the incidents and manifestation of intolerance, including against Muslims, in schools by organizing an expert meeting on sharing experiences in this area;
- Use recording systems, which collect information on bias-motivated incidents in schools, to help to analyze the problem and formulate a strategy based on facts;
- Organize country-specific seminars for school administrators and high level educational authorities to obtain their support for the implementation of the Guidelines;
- Increase co-operation with other inter-governmental agencies, including the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency, the United Nations Alliance of Civilizations and the Islamic Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization in order to advance mutual understanding and respect for diversity through education;
- Complement the Guidelines with other measures such as teacher training, peer education and advocacy;
- Develop awareness-raising programmes for teachers in countering stereotypes and prejudice;
- Train students and educational staff to become mediators who can address conflicts before they escalate;
- Support the efforts of educators in reaching out to families in order to counter intolerance and discrimination in schools;
- Put a comprehensive approach in place in schools to implement the Guidelines, including pre-service and in-service teacher training, and training for school authorities, school directors and senior school managers. UNESCO’s Associated Schools Network\(^\text{15}\) could provide a valuable platform in this regard.

IV. ANNEXES

Annex I: Meeting Agenda

Globalization, Diversity and Social Cohesion in Educational Settings
5 November 2012, Paris
UNESCO Headquarters, Room IX, 7, Place de Fontenoy

09:30 Opening Remarks

- Kate Moriarty, Chief, Section of Education for Peace and Human Rights, Education Sector, UNESCO
- Azra Junuzović, Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE/ODIHR
- Yulia Pererva, Division on Citizenship and Human Rights Education, Directorate General IV - Education, Culture and Heritage, Youth and Sport, Council of Europe

09:45 Introduction: Presentation of the Guidelines for Educators on Countering Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

- Taşkın Tankut Soykan, Adviser on Combating Intolerance against Muslims, OSCE/ODIHR

10:00 – 11:00 Role of Education in Enhancing Social Cohesion

Education can play a key role in promoting social cohesion, by raising awareness of multifaceted identities in the society and appreciation of diversity as a value. Education can shape an inclusive notion of democratic citizenship and an understanding of respect for human rights, where all students can feel safe and respected. Although not all social and political tensions in the society can be resolved through education alone, it is important that educational approaches go beyond countering explicit manifestations of intolerance and discrimination and challenge the validity of implicit assumptions within the school curriculum. Education should also promote learning opportunities through which students can be involved with joint common activities for experiencing ‘living together’ in daily life. International standards and commitments dealing with education provide a useful basis for discussions on how to enhance social cohesion and respect for diversity. Within this framework, the Guidelines for Educators on Countering Intolerance against Muslims make a unique contribution to the international efforts to increase intercultural dialogue and combat discrimination.

Moderator: Jun Morohashi, Programme Specialist, Section of Education for Peace and Human Rights, UNESCO

Speakers:
- Robin Richardson, Co-Chair, Insted Educational Consultancy, UK
- Jasmin Zine, Associate Professor, Sociology Department, Wilfrid Laurier University, Canada

11:00 – 11:30 Coffee Break
11:30 – 13.00 Sharing Experiences: Lessons Learned and Good Practices

Educational initiatives to counter intolerance and discrimination against Muslims can include various components. It may be necessary to incorporate tolerance education into integration policies and strategies as a means to promote respect for diversity and equality among students. Teaching materials and extracurricular activities can be put in practice to break stereotypes and recognize evolving identities in the society. Teacher training institutions can develop pre-service and in-service training programmes to enhance the competencies of educators to address intolerance and discrimination, including against Muslims. It is important to discuss what lessons can be learned from existing educational initiatives and how the Guidelines can support their improvement.

Moderator: Yulia Pererva, Division on Citizenship and Human Rights Education, Directorate General IV - Education, Culture and Heritage, Youth and Sport, Council of Europe

Speakers:
- C. Eduardo Vargas, Director of Advocacy & Public Policy / Representative to the United Nations, Intersections International, USA
- Barbara Unterlerchner, Trainer, ZARA Civic Courage and Anti-Racism Work, Austria

13:00 Lunch

14:30 – 15:30 Promotion of the Guidelines – Next Steps

The publication of the Guidelines is only an initial step to promote mutual understanding and respect. In order to implement the Guidelines, it is necessary to identify other concrete actions for the use of this document in educational systems and discuss how the Guidelines can be used in different educational settings and national contexts. This session will identify recommendations which will address policy makers, educational institutions and intergovernmental organizations. It will also provide an opportunity to identify what educational policies and strategies have to be developed to enhance social cohesion in our increasingly diverse societies, what competencies teachers need to counter prejudice and how international organizations can support authorities in their efforts to ensure that educational settings are inclusive.

Moderator: Azra Junuzović, Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE/ODIHR

Speakers:
- Brigitte Ernst Cremer, Project Leader for Religion and Culture, Zurich Cantonal School Government, Switzerland
- Pascale Mompoint-Gaillard, Independent Consultant and General Rapporteur for Pestalozzi Modules for Educational Projects, France

15:30 – 16.00 Concluding Remarks

16:00: End of the meeting
ANNEX II: List of Participants

**Government Officials:**

1. Iqbal Bhana, Deputy Chair, Hate Crime Programme, Ministry of Justice, UK
2. Thalia Dragonas, Project Manager "Education of the Muslim minority Children", Ministry of Education, Lifelong learning and Religious Affairs, Greece
3. Brigitte Ernst Cremer, Project leader for Religion and Culture, School Government of Canton Zurich, Switzerland
4. Paul Giannasi, Police Superintendent, Ministry of Justice, UK
5. Daniela Gronold, Department for Migration and Languages, Ministry of Education, Arts and Culture, Austria
6. Oliver Henhapel, Head of Department for Religious Affairs, Ministry of Education, Arts and Culture, Austria
8. Karin Steimle-Rohde, Pedagogical Advisor, National Academy for Training and Human Development in Schools, Germany
9. Oystein Sundelin, Chairman of the Standing, Committee of Education and Cultural Affairs, City Council of Oslo, Norway
10. Arre Wuillevnier, National Institute of Higher Education on Security and Justice, France
11. Denis Xavier, National Institute of Higher Education on Security and Justice, France

**Experts:**

12. Rolf Gollob Head, International Projects in Education (IPE), Zurich University of Teacher Education, Switzerland
13. Kjersti Toverud Klette, Adviser of the European Wergeland Centre, Norway
14. Chris Rowe, European Association of History Teachers, Netherlands
15. Pascale Mompoint-Gaillard, Independent Consultant and General Rapporteur for Pestalozzi Modules for Educational Projects, Council of Europe, France
16. Robin Richardson, Co-Chair, Inservice Training and Educational Development, United Kingdom
17. Barbara Unterlerchner, Trainer, ZARA -Civil Courage and Anti-Racism Work, Austria
18. C. Eduardo Vargas, Director of Advocacy & Public Policy / Representative to the United Nations, Intersections International, USA
19. Jasmin Zine, Associate Professor, Sociology Department, Wilfrid Laurier University, Canada
NGOs:
20. Haovat Mohamed Lashi, Vice-President of l’AFAL, President d’ASILEC, France
21. Pervin Chairoula, Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association, Greece
22. Bouaziz Monique, International Alliance of Women, France
23. Dauny Margueritte Pax, ROMANA, France
24. Tanoglu Esra, Présidence des Turcs de l’Étranger et des Communautés Affiliées, France
25. Micheline D’Agostino, Organisation Mondiale Pour l’éducation Préscolaire, France
26. Tuncay Cakmak, Chief of International Affairs, COJEP INTERNATIONAL, France

Delegations to UNESCO:
27. Gurcan Turkoglu, Permanent Delegation of Turkey to UNESCO
28. Ozkaya Simla Yasemin, Permanent Delegation of Turkey to UNESCO
29. Stephane Teicher, Permanent Delegation of France to UNESCO
30. Emilie Siraut, Permanent Delegation of Belgium to UNESCO
31. Eva Maria Wirlgen, Permanent Delegation of Germany to UNESCO
32. Blackburn Jean-Pierre, Permanent Delegation of Canada to UNESCO
33. Sanja Kehig, Permanent Delegation of Bosnia and Herzegovina to UNESCO
34. Jean-Pierre Poncet, Permanent Delegation of France to UNESCO
35. Ina Klinkenberg, Permanent Delegation of Norway to UNESCO

Intergovernmental organizations
36. Kate Moriarty Chief, Section of Education for Peace and Human Rights, Education Sector, UNESCO, France
37. Jun Morohashi Programme Specialist, Section of Education for Peace and Human Rights, UNESCO, France
38. Talib Kakic Naser, UNESCO, France
39. Miriam Tereick, UNESCO, France
40. Amina Hamshani, UNESCO, France
41. Ngandeu Jeugne, UNESCO, France
42. Nihel Zoubeidi, UNESCO, France
43. Jaques Plouin, UNESCO, France
44. Damae Koromoraki, UNESCO, France
45. Yulia Pererva Division on Citizenship and Human Rights Education, Directorate General IV - Education, Culture and Heritage, Youth and Sport, Council of Europe, France
46. Slimane Chikh, Organization of Islamic Cooperation, Permanent Observer to The UN Office in Geneva, Switzerland
47. Salima Dalibey, Organization of Islamic Cooperation, France
48. Mariama Ndiaye Niang, Programme Specialist, Directorate for Education, Islamic Educational, Cultural and Scientific Organization (ISESCO), Morocco
49. Azra Junuzović Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, ODIHR, Poland
50. Taskin Tankut Soykan, Advisor Combating Intolerance against Muslims, ODIHR, Poland
51. Gulnoz Saydaminova, Associate Program Officer, ODIHR, Poland