

# REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN

# **EARLY PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION 9 June 2019**

# ODIHR NEEDS ASSESSMENT MISSION REPORT 16-18 April 2019



Warsaw 25 April 2019

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
III.	FINDINGS	3
A.	BACKGROUND	3
B.	LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND ELECTORAL SYSTEM	4
C.	ELECTION ADMINISTRATION	
D.	VOTER REGISTRATION	5
E.	CANDIDATE REGISTRATION	
F.	CAMPAIGN AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE	7
G.	Media	7
H.	COMPLAINTS AND APPEALS	8
I.	ELECTION OBSERVATION	8
IV.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	9
ANNEX: LIST OF MEETINGS		

## REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN EARLY PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION 9 June 2019

#### **ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report**

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Following an official invitation to observe the 9 June 2019 early presidential election and in accordance with its mandate, the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) undertook a Needs Assessment Mission (NAM) to Kazakhstan from 16 to 18 April. The ODIHR NAM included Radivoje Grujić and Vladimir Misev, ODIHR Election Advisers. The ODIHR NAM was joined by Dimitrije Todorić, OSCE Parliamentary Assembly Administration and Logistics Officer.

The purpose of the mission was to assess the pre-election environment and the preparations for the presidential election. Based on this assessment, the NAM was to recommend whether to deploy an ODIHR election-related activity for the forthcoming election, and if so, what type of activity best meets the identified needs. Meetings were held with officials from state institutions, as well as with representatives of political parties, media, civil society, and the international community. A list of meetings is annexed to this report.

ODIHR would like to thank the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the OSCE Programme Office in Nur-Sultan for their assistance and co-operation in organizing the visit. ODIHR would also like to thank all of its interlocutors for meeting with the mission and sharing their views.

#### II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Following the 19 March resignation of President Nursultan Nazarbayev, the acting president on 9 April called for an early presidential election to be held on 9 June. If no candidate receives a majority of votes, a second round will be held within two months between the two candidates who receive the most votes. Mr. Nazarbayev retains the title of First President and remains the chairperson of the Security Council and leader of the ruling *Nur Otan* political party. This will be the sixth consecutive direct national election to be called early.

Presidential elections are primarily regulated by the Constitution, the Constitutional Law on Elections (Election Law), and regulations of the Central Election Commission (CEC). Since the last elections there have been amendments to the Election Law, including changes related to candidate rights and registration, voter registration, and the structure of lower-level election administration. Some of these changes aim to address past ODIHR recommendations. However, many previous ODIHR priority recommendations remain unaddressed, including those related to fundamental rights and freedoms, as well as to the impartiality of election administration, candidate rights and registration, and media environment. While several ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed concerns regarding the restrictive legal framework, the authorities underlined their commitment to conduct a democratic election.

The election will be administered by a three-tiered system of commissions, headed by the CEC. The CEC informed the ODIHR NAM that the election calendar is adopted and that preparations for the election are ongoing. The CEC chairperson and two members are appointed by the president, while the lower and upper chambers of parliament each appoint two members. Members of lower-level commissions are selected by local councils, based on nominations from political parties. Several

ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised concerns about the impartiality of lower-level commissions and the consistent implementation of election day procedures, including voting, counting and tabulation processes.

All citizens over 18 years of age have the right to vote, except those recognized as incapable by a court and those serving prison sentences, irrespective of the gravity of the crime. Voter registration is passive and city councils compile voter lists based on the state civil registry. The CEC maintains a nationwide electronic voter list to identify duplicate entries. While the CEC informed the ODIHR NAM of several efforts to increase the accuracy of voter lists, some ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted concerns about the procedures for Absentee Voting Certificates and election day registration, which could raise the possibility of multiple voting.

In addition to having the right to vote, candidates are required to be citizens by birth, at least 40 years old, fluent in the state language, and officially resident in Kazakhstan for the last 15 years. Following amendments to the Constitution and Election Law in 2017, candidates are also required to possess a higher education and at least five years of experience in either public service or elected office. Candidates are required to support their candidature with signatures from one per cent of the electorate, pay a financial deposit, and pass a language test. Several ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed concern about the eligibility requirements, stating that it stifles an already restrictive framework for potential candidates to register.

The election campaign starts on 11 May and ends at midnight on 7 June. The Election Law guarantees the right to conduct an unimpeded campaign for or against any candidate. Candidates require advance approval, rather than notification, to hold campaign events. A number of ODIHR NAM interlocutors stated that they are concerned about the potential abuse of state resources during the campaign, including pressure on public sector employees. The law outlines provisions for public and private financing of election campaigns.

Freedom of expression, media freedom and the right of access to information are guaranteed in the Constitution, but the legal framework for media contains a number of restrictive provisions, including on defamation and insult. Concerns were shared with the ODIHR NAM about pressure on media outlets and journalists. Television is widely considered to be the main source of political news. Most media are privately owned, but several ODIHR NAM interlocutors questioned their capacity to provide balanced coverage, taking also into account that they receive significant funds from the state budget. The Election Law provides equal access to state-funded airtime and print space, as well as the right to purchase additional airtime and space.

Election-related complaints may be filed by all electoral participants with either the superior election commission or the courts within ten days of the decision, action or inaction in question. Complaints should generally be considered within five days or, if close to election day, immediately, and can be further appealed by all electoral participants. The right to appeal the final election results is limited to the president and parliament.

The Election Law provides for citizen and international observation of elections, as well as proxies of the candidates. Citizen observers may be nominated by public associations and non-profit organizations. The authorities informed the ODIHR NAM that the invitation to observe the upcoming early presidential election was sent to several international organizations.

Most ODIHR NAM interlocutors emphasized the value of an ODIHR election observation activity for this election. Representatives of state institutions stressed their intention to conduct the electoral process transparently, in adherence to international standards for democratic elections, and welcomed observation by ODIHR and any potential recommendations to improve the electoral process. Other interlocutors stated that, although they do not expect the election to be conducted in line with democratic standards, they still see the merit of ODIHR observing all stages of the electoral process to record potential shortcomings and offer recommendations for improvements. A number of issues would benefit from specific attention. These include the impartiality of the election administration, candidate registration, the conduct of the campaign and respect for fundamental freedoms, media coverage of the elections, and the administration of election day procedures, including the vote count and tabulation of results.

Based on the findings of this report, the ODIHR NAM recommends the deployment of an Election Observation Mission for the upcoming early presidential election. In addition to a core team of experts, ODIHR will request the secondment by OSCE participating States of 24 long-term observers to follow the electoral process countrywide, as well as 300 short-term observers to follow election day procedures. In line with the ODIHR's standard methodology, the EOM will include a media monitoring element.

#### III. FINDINGS

#### A. BACKGROUND

On 19 March, Nursultan Nazarbayev, the country's president since 1991, resigned from office. In line with the Constitution, the Senate Speaker, Kassym-Jomart Tokayev, assumed the role of acting president. Mr. Nazarbayev retains the title of First President and remains the chairperson of the Security Council and leader of the ruling *Nur Otan* political party. On 9 April, Mr. Tokayev, after consulting with Mr. Nazarbayev, as well as with speakers of both houses of the parliament and the prime minister, and in agreement with the Constitutional Council, called for an early presidential election to be held on 9 June.

Kazakhstan has a presidential system in which the executive branch exercises wide authority relative to the parliament. The president appoints the prime minister and government, upon consultation with the parliament, as well as the foreign, internal and defence ministers, the prosecutor general and executive authorities at the regional level. The president may veto legislation passed by the parliament and has the power to dissolve parliament.

Following the 2016 early parliamentary elections, the ruling *Nur Otan* party holds 84 of the 98 directly-elected seats in the lower chamber of parliament (*Majilis*). An additional nine seats are indirectly elected by the Assembly of the People of Kazakhstan, an advisory body appointed by the president.<sup>3</sup> Several international organizations have raised concerns over the human rights situation

\_

The Constitution provides that in case of resignation, the Senate Speaker assumes the role of acting president until the end of term. The term of former president Nazarbayev would regularly end in 2020. Dariga Nazarbayeva, the daughter of Mr. Nazarbayev, was appointed as the new Senate Speaker.

The First President is granted significant powers for life, including membership to Security and Constitutional Councils and the right to submit initiatives to the government and other officials related to internal and foreign policy, and national security.

Two other parties are represented in the parliament: *Ak-Jol* and the Communist People's Party of Kazakhstan, with 7 seats each. In total, there are seven registered political parties. Other registered political parties are: *Auyl, Azat, Birlik*, and the National Social Democratic Party. Women hold some 27 per cent of seats in the lower chamber of the parliament and 2 of 18 ministerial posts. Concern about women's overall political participations have been raised, see: UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) Concluding observations on the combined third and fourth periodic reports of Kazakhstan (10 March 2014).

and ability to participate in political life in Kazakhstan.<sup>4</sup> In an address to the nation, Mr. Tokayev stressed that the election will be free, transparent and fair.<sup>5</sup> This was reiterated by the authorities met with by the ODIHR NAM. The upcoming election will be the sixth consecutive direct national election to be called early.

ODIHR has observed nine elections in Kazakhstan since 1999.<sup>6</sup> The ODIHR Election Observation Mission for the 2015 early presidential election found that "preparations for the 26 April election were efficiently administered, however, necessary reforms for holding genuine democratic elections still have to materialize. The predominant position of the incumbent and the lack of genuine opposition limited voter choice. A restricted media environment stifled public debate and freedom of expression. Election day generally proceeded in an orderly manner, but serious procedural deficiencies and irregularities were noted throughout the voting, counting and tabulation processes".

#### B. LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND ELECTORAL SYSTEM

The legal framework for presidential elections includes the Constitution, the Constitutional Law on Elections (Election Law), and regulations of the Central Election Commission (CEC). Kazakhstan is a party to major international and regional instruments related to the holding of democratic elections.

Following amendments to the Constitution in 2017, mainly related to the transfer of certain powers from the president to the government, the Election Law was amended in 2017 and 2018. The amendments included changes related to candidate rights and registration, voter registration and the structure of lower-level election administration. Some of these changes aim to address past ODIHR recommendations. However, many previous ODIHR priority recommendations remain unaddressed, including those related to freedoms of assembly, association and expression, as well as to the impartiality of election administration, candidate rights and registration, and media environment. A number of ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised concerns about the enforcement of the overall legal framework, especially regarding the right to stand in the presidential election, as well as the exercise of fundamental freedoms. <sup>10</sup>

The president is directly elected for a five-year term by an absolute majority. If no candidate receives above 50 per cent of the votes cast, a second round between the two candidates with the highest number of votes is held within two months. In the second round, the candidate who receives the higher number of votes is elected.

See, for example, UN Human Rights Committee (CCPR) Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Kazakhstan (9 August 2016).

See <u>previous ODIHR election reports on the Republic of Kazakhstan.</u>

Other relevant laws include the Law on the President, the Law on Political Parties, the Civil Procedures Code, the Criminal Code, the Administrative Offences Code, the Law on Peaceful Assemblies, and various local regulations related to public assemblies.

Including the 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 1979 Convention for Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 1965 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 2003 Convention against Corruption, 2006 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), and the 2002 Convention on the Standards of Democratic Elections, Electoral Rights and Freedoms in the Member States of the Commonwealth of Independent States.

Changes related to the eligibility to stand harmonize provisions of the Election Law with the Constitution. Other changes include additional mechanisms for cross-checking voter registration data, determining the start date of the campaign, and increasing the amounts for campaign deposit by candidates.

See the 9 April Address of the president to the nation.

See, for example, UN CCPR <u>Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Kazakhstan</u> (9 August 2016), particularly paragraphs 51-53.

#### C. ELECTION ADMINISTRATION

The election administration is three-tiered, comprising of the CEC, 232 Territorial Election Commissions (TECs), and 9,970 Precinct Election Commissions (PECs). Three of seven members of the CEC and some 67 per cent of all lower-level commissioners are women.

All commissions are formed for five years and consist of seven members. <sup>12</sup> The CEC chairperson and two members are appointed by the president (incumbents were appointed on 30 September 2016), while the lower and upper chambers of parliament each appoint two members (last appointments were in 2017 and 2018). Members of lower-level commissions are selected by local councils (*Mashlikhats*), based on nominations from political parties. In January 2019, the new lower-level commissioners were appointed, following the expiration of the mandates of previous commissioners. The CEC informed the ODIHR NAM that the new commissions are composed of about 40 per cent new members, and that a comprehensive training programme focused on new members has been developed to cover election day proceedings, as well as participation of voters with disabilities. Several ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised concerns about the impartiality of lower-level commissions and the consistent implementation of election day procedures, including voting, counting and tabulation processes.

The CEC is responsible for the overall conduct of the election, including the registration of candidates and maintenance of the nationwide voter list. It is also in charge of campaign finance oversight. The CEC informed the ODIHR NAM that the election calendar is adopted and that preparations for the election are ongoing, including the appointment of the Linguistic Commission, which is responsible for testing the state language proficiency of prospective candidates (see *Candidate Registration*). <sup>13</sup> The CEC website provides a range of election-related information to the public.

#### D. VOTER REGISTRATION

All citizens over 18 years of age have the right to vote, except those declared incompetent by a court or those serving prison sentences, irrespective of the gravity of the crime. <sup>14</sup> Voter registration is passive and several changes have been introduced since the last elections, with an aim to address some previous ODIHR recommendations. The primary change is that city councils (*Akimats*) are now tasked to compile voter lists based exclusively on data from the state civil register, instead of data from various state databases. The city councils submit data about registered voters to the respective TEC twice a year, electronically and in hardcopy. The TECs cross-check this data with information they receive from the CEC, which maintains a nationwide electronic voter list. In case of discrepancies between the nationwide voter list and the state civil register, the TEC may request the city councils to make changes. The CEC informed the ODIHR NAM that by 2020 it is envisioned to have a functional unified and centralized state register of voters. According to the CEC, there are some 11.8 million voters.

In addition, 65 PECs will be established abroad, in 51 countries.

Except for PECs, where the 2018 amendments to the Election Law determine 5 to 7 PEC members for polling stations with less than 2,000 voters, and between 7 to 11 PEC members, for polling stations with more than 2,000 voters. The number of PEC members should be odd.

See <u>electoral calendar</u>, adopted by the CEC on 10 April 2019. On 19 April, after consultations with the Ministry of Education and Science, the Ministry of Information and Social Development, and the rectors of leading universities in the country, the CEC appointed the Linguistic Commission and issued rules on testing of language abilities of prospective candidates.

See also the 19 January 2018 Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on the rights of persons with disabilities on her mission to Kazakhstan, paragraphs 55 and 91.

Extracts of the voter lists will be forwarded by the city councils to the PECs 20 days before the election and will be made available at polling stations for public scrutiny. Voters may verify their data and polling location by visiting a respective PEC, calling hotlines established for that purpose, or through an email system. Eligible voters not included in the voter list, and who can prove their residence within the precinct, can be added to the lists before or on election day.

No later than 30 days before election day, citizens who will be away from their registered residence on election day may apply to be temporarily included in the voter list at their temporary location. In addition, within two weeks before election day, voters may apply for an Absentee Voting Certificate (AVC), which allows them to vote in any polling station outside the city, town or village where they are registered. <sup>15</sup> The CEC informed the ODIHR NAM that it has made an additional regulation to specify the tracking of issued and used AVCs, in line with a previous ODIHR recommendation.

While the CEC informed the ODIHR NAM of several efforts to increase the accuracy of voter lists, some ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted concerns about the procedures for AVCs and election day registration, which could raise the possibility of multiple voting.

#### E. CANDIDATE REGISTRATION

Presidential candidates can be nominated by public associations, including political parties. The 2018 amendments to the Election Law, removed the possibility for candidates to be self-nominated. In addition to having the right to vote, prospective candidates are required to be citizens by birth, at least 40 years old, fluent in the Kazakh language, and officially resident in Kazakhstan for the last 15 years. Following the 2017 amendments to the Constitution and Election Law, candidates are also required to have a higher education and at least five years of experience in either public service or elected office. Many ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed concern that the new candidacy requirements are unreasonable and discriminatory and would likely stifle already restrictive grounds for persons to be able to stand. Some interlocutors informed the ODIHR NAM that they have requested clarifications from the CEC on certain parts of the candidate registration process, including on eligibility criteria.

Following the eligibility verification of nominees, which ends on 28 April, the process of registration starts, lasting until 11 May. The first step of this process is support signature collection. Each nominee should collect signatures from at least one per cent of the total number of registered voters (118,140 for this election), equally representing at least two thirds of the regions and cities of 'national significance' and the capital. In addition, they need to pay a deposit of some EUR 5,000 for this election and present tax declarations for themselves and their spouse. <sup>16</sup> Completed signature sheets are submitted to the respective TECs for verification. The TECs have five days to check the authenticity of signatures and submit results to the CEC.

Several ODIHR NAM interlocutors commended the CEC for shortening the time for verifying the signatures, effectively leaving more time for signature collection. However, some noted that the signature collection process is still challenging due to the geographical size of the country. Interlocutors also voiced concerns that the process of signature verification may lack transparency. While the CEC has issued guidance to the TECs on which signatures should be deemed invalid, it was unclear whether this would be binding.

Voters can also vote in rest homes, hospitals or other medical centres, in remote places, in pre-trial detention centres, in consular offices and state agencies abroad, in military units and on ships-at-sea, at specially established polling stations. In these cases, the voter lists are finalized the day before the election.

The deposit is 2,125,000 Kazakhstan *Tenge* (KZT) and is based on 50-times minimum wage; approximately EUR 1 = KZT 426. The deposit is returned to those who obtain at least five per cent of votes.

In addition, prospective candidates need to pass a language test, consisting of an examination of reading, writing and speaking abilities. For this purpose, the CEC established the Linguistic Commission, an independent body tasked to provide its conclusions to the CEC who make the final decision on candidatures. Several ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed concerns about the composition of the Linguistic Commission, as well the criteria for assessing language skills.

All three parliamentary parties stated their intention to nominate candidates for the upcoming election. 17

#### F. CAMPAIGN AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE

The recent changes to the Election Law introduced a uniform start to the campaign, which will begin once candidate registration is finished on 11 May. The campaign lasts until midnight on 7 June, when a silence period starts. The Election Law guarantees the right to conduct an unimpeded campaign for or against any candidate. The Law on Peaceful Assemblies includes rules on the holding of public assemblies. In particular, it requires advance approval, rather than notification, for meetings. There are designated places for campaign events in each city. Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted that this system can restrict freedom of peaceful assembly and may reduce the ability of candidates to conduct an effective campaign. <sup>18</sup>

Political parties met with by the ODIHR NAM informed that, once their candidates are selected and registered, they will conduct a nationwide campaign for them, primarily through meetings with citizens and by disseminating materials, but also increasingly using social media and the Internet. Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors voiced concerns about potential abuse of state resources during the campaign, including pressure on public sector employees and students.

To finance their campaign, candidates can use public and private funds. The amount that candidates can spend may not exceed 12,000 times the minimum wage (some EUR 1.12 million). Candidates can accept donations from citizens and organizations, up to 15,000 times the minimum wage. <sup>19</sup> Foreign and anonymous donations are prohibited. Candidates are obliged to open dedicated bank accounts for campaign finance and banks should notify the CEC if the spending limit is exceeded. Five days after the announcement of the election results, candidates are obliged to submit a report on their campaign finance to the CEC, which is published on the CEC website. No ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised concerns related to campaign finance and its transparency.

#### G. MEDIA

Freedom of expression, media freedom and the right of access to information are guaranteed in the Constitution, but the legal framework for media contains a number of restrictive provisions. The Criminal Code contains penalties for defamation and insult and provides special protection for the president and his family and public officials. The Criminal Code also contains a provision on incitement of social, national and religious discord, and on spreading false information, with a penalty of up to 20 and 10 years of imprisonment, respectively. The Committee for Communication, Informatization and Information (Media Committee) under the Ministry of Information and Social Development is responsible for overseeing broadcast media and granting broadcasting licenses. The

On 23 April, the Congress of *Nur-Otan* party nominated Kassym-Jomart Tokayev, acting president, as its candidate for the upcoming election.

See also, <u>16 June 2015 Report</u> of the UN Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association.

The CEC informed the ODIHR NAM that it will determine the amount of public funds for candidates at its session on 25 April. In 2015, candidates were entitled to at least KZT 7 million.

2015 amendments to the Law on Communication gives authority to the Media Committee, as well as Prosecutor General, to block websites and ban media outlet operation, without a court decision. Many ODIHR NAM interlocutors opined that these restrictions generate self-censorship. The OSCE Representative on Freedom of Media (RFoM), on several recent occasions, has stressed that "blocking of news website and detention of journalists in Kazakhstan is of grave concern". <sup>21</sup>

The Election Law provides equal access for candidates to state-funded airtime and print space, as well as the right to purchase additional airtime and space. Each candidate is entitled to 15 minutes of free airtime on television, 10 minutes of free airtime on radio, and 2 free articles in newspapers. For paid advertisement, all media are obliged to provide the price list of paid advertisements to the CEC, no later than 10 days after the election is announced. The CEC has also developed rules for organizing debates between candidates during the campaign in media.

Television is widely considered to be the main source of political news. Most media are privately owned, but several ODIHR NAM interlocutors questioned their capacity to provide balanced political coverage, taking also into account that they receive significant funds from the state budget.<sup>22</sup>

#### H. COMPLAINTS AND APPEALS

The complaints and appeals process is primarily regulated by the Election Law, as well as the Civil Procedures Code and the Law on Procedures for Consideration of Petitions by Individuals and Legal Entities. Election-related complaints may be filed by all electoral participants with either the superior election commission or the courts within ten days of the decision, action or inaction. Courts must consider complaints within five days or immediately if submitted less than five days before the election. Election commissions have three days for consideration of complaints. Decisions can be further appealed by all electoral participants. Appeals against CEC decisions on candidate registration can be made to the Supreme Court within ten days from the denial of registration, whose decisions are final. Allegations of election offenses can also be filed with public prosecutors, who are proactively monitoring media, the Internet and social media networks to ensure compliance with the law.

Final election results may be appealed to the Constitutional Council within ten days of the announcement by a limited number of complainants, including the president, speakers of both houses of parliament, or at least one fifth of the members of parliament and the prime minister.

#### I. ELECTION OBSERVATION

The Election Law provides for citizen and international observation of elections. Citizen observers may be nominated by public associations and non-profit organizations. Candidates are entitled to have proxies who enjoy similar rights as observers, and, in addition, can also request recounts of results in a polling station.

There is no formal accreditation procedure for citizen observers, who are required to present a letter from their nominating organization and their identification document to the election commission

According to some <u>media organizations</u>, there were more than 100 blocked and closed websites and media outlets in 2018, without court decision. Also, around 100 journalists were subject to arrest, detention and sanctions in 2018, mostly for reporting on social issues and criminal cases.

See OSCE RFoM statements from <u>27 February 2019</u>, as well on <u>5 April 2018</u>. See also UN CCPR <u>Concluding observations on the second periodic report of Kazakhstan</u> (9 August 2016), paragraph 49.

According to some ODIHR NAM interlocutors, some EUR 150 million from state budget is allocated to the media annually.

where they observe. The authorities informed the ODIHR NAM that the invitation to observe the upcoming election was sent to several international organizations.

#### IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Most ODIHR NAM interlocutors emphasized the value of an ODIHR election observation activity for this election. Representatives of state institutions stressed their intention to conduct the electoral process transparently, in adherence to international standards for democratic elections, and welcomed observation by ODIHR and any potential recommendations to improve the electoral process. Other interlocutors stated that, although they do not expect the election to be conducted in line with democratic standards, they still see the merit of ODIHR observing all stages of the electoral process, to record potential shortcomings and offer recommendations for improvements. A number of issues would benefit from specific attention. These include the impartiality of the election administration, candidate registration, the conduct of the campaign and respect for fundamental freedoms, media coverage of the elections, and the administration of election day procedures, including the vote count and tabulation of results.

Based on the findings of this report, the ODIHR NAM recommends the deployment of an Election Observation Mission for the upcoming early presidential election. In addition to a core team of experts, ODIHR will request the secondment by OSCE participating States of 24 long-term observers to follow the electoral process countrywide, as well as 300 short-term observers to follow election day procedures. In line with the ODIHR's standard methodology, the EOM will include a media monitoring element.

#### **ANNEX: LIST OF MEETINGS**

#### **Ministry of Foreign Affairs**

Anuar Ahmetov, Head, Department for Europe Erzhan Kistafin, Head, Administration Department Marlen Kalambayev, Head, European Division Zhaslan Nurtazin, Counsellor, Department for Europe

#### **Central Election Commission**

Berik Imashev, Chairperson Konstantin Petrov, Deputy Chairperson Zauresh Baimoldina, Member Sabila Mustafina, Secretary

#### **Supreme Court**

Aigul Kidirbaeva, Chairperson, Specialized Court Division Raushan Isabekova, Secretary, Specialized Court Division Erbol Ismailov, Judge Gulnara Huanova, Head, International Relations Department and Protocol

#### **Prosecutor General**

Andrey Lukin, Deputy Prosecutor General
Aidos Chormanov, Head, Department for Administrative Cases
Nurdaulet Suindikov, Deputy Head, Department for Socio-Economic Cases
Galymzhan Koigeldiev, Head, Department for International Co-operation
Aibek Nurakhmetov, Deputy Head, Department for International Co-operation
Arsen Rahimkulov, Aide to Prosecutor General

#### **Communications and Information**

Mikhail Komissarov, Deputy Chairperson Kairat Baibolding, Head, Civil Society Department Asel Syzdykova, Head, Department for International Co-operation

#### Media

Aigul Adilova, Director of News and Analytical Programmes, Khabar 24 TV Anar Bekbassova, Freelance Journalist Ainur Koskina, Freelance Journalist Olga Tsoy, Director, Khabar 24 TV Zhaniya Urankoeva, Sputnik Kazakhstan

## **Political Parties**

Aigul Zhumabayeva, Chief of Staff, Parliamentary faction, *Ak-Jol*Assem Akkozha, Head, International Department, *Ak-Jol*Viktor Smirnov, Chief of Staff, Communist People's Party of Kazakhstan
Dastaibek Mukanov, Lawyer, Communist People's Party of Kazakhstan
Svetlana Yeremeeyeva, Trainer, Communist People's Party of Kazakhstan
Maulen Ashimbayev, First Deputy Chairman, *Nur Otan*Farkhad Kuanganov, Ideology Secretary, *Nur Otan*Madi Ospanov, Chief of Staff, *Nur Otan*Ersain Ospanov, Deputy Chief of Staff, *Nur Otan* 

Republic of Kazakhstan Early Presidential Election, 9 June 2019 ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report Page: 11

#### **Civil Society**

Meiram Kanapianov, Representative, Foundation for Support of Civil Initiatives
Diana Okremova, Director, Legal Media Centre
Zauresh Battalova, Director, Public Foundation for Parliamentary Development in Kazakhstan
Arsen Kudabayev, Public Foundation for Parliamentary Development in Kazakhstan
Yermek Baizhanov, Youth Solidarity Fund
Kairbolat Sakhmetov, Youth Business Council

## **International Community**

Diana Digol, Deputy Head, OSCE Programme Office in Nur-Sultan H.E. Milan Kollar, Ambassador, Embassy of Slovak Republic Representatives of OSCE participating States in Nur-Sultan and Delegation of the European Union to Kazakhstan