



Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting

UPHOLDING THE PRINCIPLES OF TOLERANCE AND NON-DISCRIMINATION INCLUDING PROMOTION AND PROTECTION OF FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF

**1 – 2 April 2019
Hofburg, Vienna**

FINAL REPORT



TABLE OF CONTENTS

OVERVIEW	4
I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
II. SYNOPSIS OF THE SESSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	4
OPENING SESSION	5
SESSION I.....	8
SESSION II	11
SESSION III.....	14
CLOSING SESSION.....	17
ANNEX 1: AGENDA	18
ANNEX 2: BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION: Keynote Speaker, Introducers and Moderators.....	21

OVERVIEW

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting (SHDM) on “Upholding the Principles of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, including in the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief” was held in Vienna on 1-2 April 2019. It was organized by the Slovak OSCE Chair-in-Office (CiO), with the support of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR). The meeting provided an opportunity to assess the progress made by participating States in implementing OSCE commitments to address all forms of discrimination, including racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism, intolerance against Muslims, Christians and members of other religious or belief communities. It also served as a platform to present and share good practices that show how governments, intergovernmental organizations, educational experts, religious or belief communities and civil society can prevent and respond to intolerance and create an appreciation for diversity through a variety of initiatives and tools, including education policies and awareness raising strategies.

The meeting brought together 166 participants (90 men, 76 women), including 96 representatives from 44 OSCE participating States, 38 representatives of 29 non-governmental organizations, and others.

II. SYNOPSIS OF THE SESSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This section summarizes the discussions which took place during the opening session, the three thematic sessions, and presents recommendations made by participants. The recommendations were directed towards a variety of actors, including OSCE participating States, OSCE institutions and field operations, and civil society organizations. These recommendations have no official status as they are not based on consensus among the 57 OSCE participating States. Further, the inclusion of a recommendation in this report does not suggest that it reflects the views or policies of the OSCE. Nevertheless, these recommendations serve as useful indicators of how participating States are meeting their commitments to combat intolerance and discrimination, including on religious grounds as well as promoting mutual respect and understanding.

OPENING SESSION



Professor Ingeborg Gabriel, Rabbi Andrew Baker and Ambassador Mehmet Paçacı, OSCE Chairperson's Personal Representatives on combatting discrimination and promoting tolerance, OSCE/Micky Kroell, 1 April 2019

Welcoming remarks:

Amb. Radomír Boháč, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council
Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director, OSCE ODIHR

Summary of opening remarks:

Amb. Radomír Boháč, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council welcomed the participants stating that the promotion of tolerance and non-discrimination is a key priority for the 2019 Slovak OSCE Chair-in-Office, including its very first event of 2019, in Bratislava, dedicated to combating anti-Semitism, and the appointment of three Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination to foster tolerance and dialogue in support of the Chair's agenda. He shared with the participants that hate crimes and violent manifestations of racism, intolerance and discrimination, including against religious or belief communities, are present in all participating States. The OSCE's efforts must be focused on reporting and recording of such crimes as well as on their proper prosecution. This includes the challenges of racism, xenophobia, combatting anti-Semitism, and intolerance and discrimination against Christians, Muslims, and members of other religions or beliefs. Similarly the right to freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief, and fostering mutual respect and understanding are among the original tenets of the OSCE, since the 1975 Helsinki Final Act.

He noted that Slovakia closely co-operates with ODIHR on issues linked to tolerance and non-discrimination, and has utilized ODIHR's expertise in providing several trainings over the last years on hate crime. Slovakia actively provides statistical data to ODIHR hate crime reports and encourages all participating States to do the same, as reliable data helps us better understand the root causes of discrimination and intolerance and makes participating States better equipped to respond to them. In conclusion, Amb. Boháč encouraged all stakeholders to engage in lively discussions and an open dialogue on the interrelationship between the tolerance and non-discrimination, the right to freedom of religion or belief and security, to share best practices and positive examples in this regard, and to provide concrete recommendations to participating States.

In her opening speech, ODIHR's First Deputy Director, Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze reminded the participants about key commitments to take effective measures to prevent and respond to hate crimes and other manifestations of intolerance and discrimination. Freedom of religion or belief requires an enabling environment in which everyone, religious believer or non-believer, man or woman, is free to hold and practice the belief of their choice. The failure to provide such an environment leads to the violation of everyone's rights. Thus, it is an important role of the OSCE and its participating States to ensure a climate of mutual tolerance and respect and to fight intolerance and discrimination, and to protect freedom of religion or belief for all. Ms. Gardapkhadze stressed that over the past few years, the issue of tolerance has gained greater importance in light of the recent challenges facing multicultural, multi-religious and multi-ethnic societies.

Tolerance and mutual respect, robust responses to manifestations of intolerance, discrimination, including hate crimes and intolerant discourse or "hate speech" have been promoted as ways to address the many deep-rooted tensions and conflicts in a number of participating States. A growing number of civil society initiatives and proactive governmental programmes indicate that there is a strong political will to counter intolerance and discrimination on the grounds of religion or belief and to advance freedom of religion or belief for all. She concluded by encouraging the participants of the meeting to share good practices from across the OSCE region and gather valuable insights and "lessons learned," giving special attention to how different manifestations of racism and intolerance affect women and men.

Opening remarks:

Professor Ingeborg Gabriel, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

Amb. Mehmet Paçacı, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

Rabbi Andrew Baker, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism

Summary of opening remarks:

Professor Ingeborg Gabriel, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

Professor Gabriel highlighted that many instances of intolerance and discrimination are intersectional in nature, which means that they are motivated by bias against more than one aspect of a person's identity, such as religion or belief, gender or race. Racism and xenophobia are strongly intertwined with many religion or belief concerns across the OSCE region. Approaching them requires taking all of these concerns and their interaction adequately into account. She also pointed out that both tolerance and non-discrimination, as well as the right to freedom of religion or belief, for all are under threat and under significant pressure with differing impacts on men and women. Women are disproportionately targets of multiple forms of discrimination. The gender aspects of intolerance and discrimination deserve greater attention, as men and women are both suffering, but experiencing these human rights abuses differently.

Amb. Mehmet Paçacı, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

Ambassador Paçacı stated his concern for the rise of intolerance throughout the world. He highlighted the issue of hate crimes against Muslims, particularly in the wake of the attack in Christchurch. Ambassador Paçacı underscored the need for a strong government response to hate crime, particularly from law enforcement officials. He commended the work of ODIHR in this area and urged participating States to continue close cooperation with ODIHR in this regard. He closed by urging participants to be proactive in planning for future threats in order to ensure present security.

Rabbi Andrew Baker, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism

In his presentation, Rabbi Baker presented some statistical data on hate crimes against Jews, as well as experiences and perceptions of Jews in some OSCE participating States, and described anti-Semitic expressions and actions across the political spectrum. He mentioned the Working Definition of Anti-Semitism of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) as a comprehensive set of examples of how anti-Semitism may manifest today. Rabbi Baker also spoke of the freedom of religion as surely predicated on the basic safety and security of its practitioners to gather in prayer and fellowship, to be free to engage in the religious observance and practice that shape their identity, and in this context he flagged his concerns about a "growing secular environment that is hostile to religion more generally." Rabbi Baker also mentioned the ODIHR-managed project, Words into Action to Address Anti-Semitism, which produced important guidance in the areas of Jewish community security and education, which remain critical subjects. It created parallel and common tools that can be applied more broadly, to other endangered and minority communities. Considering the particular challenges still facing the Jewish community and the persistence of anti-Semitic incidents and hatred, Rabbi Baker recommended that the Words into Action project continue to be implemented.

SESSION I: Root Causes and Consequences of Racism and Discrimination in Connection to Religion or Belief: Implementing the OSCE's Comprehensive Approach while Addressing the Particular Needs of Marginalized Groups

Introducers:

Mr. Ján Figel', Special Envoy for Promotion of Freedom of Religion outside the EU

Mr. Ioannis N. Dimitrakopoulos, Scientific Adviser, Director's Office, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights

Moderator

Ms. Cristina Finch, Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR

Summary of introducer's interventions:

Mr. Figel' stressed that the trends related to the freedom of religion or belief are very concerning all over the world. Prejudice, intolerance, discrimination, persecutions and violence based on religion or belief systems are often overlaid with ethnic and racial dimensions. This is a global phenomenon, which requires a global and coordinated response, including "collective intelligence" and "collective action." According to Mr. Figel', it is crucial to look into the root causes of the current negative trends and issues, however, it is also important to take the context into account, which includes history, culture, religion, laws, the constitution and the legal frameworks all together in a unique complex model. Ideas and ideologies are also very crucial contextual elements often contributing to spreading of a plethora of exclusionary ideas, when "my religion first" leads to "my race first" and vice versa, and such approach is used to justify abuses and violations. It is important to remember that freedom of religion or belief is an essential anchor in a broad human rights approach including universality, indivisibility and non-discrimination. These concepts are key to embrace a freedom of religion or belief for all and they are fully conforming to the EU policy on freedom of religion or belief and to the OSCE commitments. In conclusion, Mr. Figel' highlighted the importance of taking multiple aspects of a person's identity into account. The challenge is to reconcile the need for identity with respect and tolerance of other cultures.

Mr. Dimitrakopoulos presented key aspects of the work of the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA), highlighting that the Agency was created to provide assistance and expertise to the institutions and Member States of the European Union on fundamental rights issues. This includes analysing legal provisions, and, in particular, analysing both official data and objective, comparable statistical data which is collected through the FRA's own surveys which are regularly conducted across the European Union, especially on phenomena of hate crime and discrimination, including those motivated by religion or belief.

Mr. Dimitrakopoulos specifically stressed the prevailing issue of underreporting of discrimination and violent manifestations of intolerance which was demonstrated by the recent surveys conducted by FRA. Such surveys included thousands of interviewees across all Member States and allowed FRA to record human rights abuses which were unreported, unrecorded and therefore not investigated or prosecuted, which ultimately contributes to impunity for perpetrators and the denial of the victims' right to justice.

In his conclusion, Mr. Dimitrakopoulos mentioned that the scale of religiously motivated discrimination and hate crimes, especially affecting Jewish and Muslim communities living in the EU, leaves no room for complacency. The EU and its Member States will persist in improving the effectiveness and impact of measures and institutional arrangements in order to enforce the law and protect the human and fundamental rights of everyone living in the EU.

In the following discussion, participants strongly condemned all manifestations of discrimination and intolerance and raised their concerns about information about growing reports of violations of human rights and violent manifestations of intolerance on the grounds of race and/or religion or belief.

Some of the participants reaffirmed the crucial importance of the OSCE commitments on religious freedoms and reminded the participating States about their obligations to implement these commitments and take a robust response to the violations of human rights.

At the same time, a number of participants noted that if the freedom of religion or belief approach proves to be not effective, there is an urgent need to look for different approaches and a wider discussion of various religious identities and how these identities can communicate with other identities is necessary. It is important to understand that interfaith dialogue is a key for peacebuilding and preventing diplomacy. Racism and discrimination should be perceived not only as a violation of rights of an individual, but it has impact on the whole community.

Many participants noted an increase of ethnic and cultural diversity in the era of globalization. However, identifying and addressing causes of ethnic tensions and conflicts should be addressed so that triggers of inter-ethnic tensions do not lead to wider conflicts. Governments should take into account policies of multiculturalism as an effective means to protect rights of every religious or minority group, which serves to combat hate crimes and to protect values of ethnic minorities.

Participants made the following specific recommendations in Session I:

Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:

- OSCE participating States should implement all OSCE human dimension commitments in order to reinforce fight against intolerance across the region;
- OSCE participating States should introduce mechanisms to monitor media to decrease intolerance against Muslims;
- OSCE participating States should strengthen international commitments in the area of combatting intolerance on religious grounds and to obey all current international commitments and human rights standards;
- OSCE participating States should collect reliable data on hate crimes and disaggregate data on hate crimes per bias motivations.

Specific recommendations for the OSCE institutions and field operations):

- OSCE institutions should promote policy of multiculturalism among its participating States;
- OSCE institutions should work together with the participating States to advance religious freedoms across the region;
- OSCE should suggest clear definitions of hatred and hate crimes, as well as anti-Muslim racism and intolerance against Muslims.

SESSION II: Security of Communities and Support to Victims: Good Practices of Addressing Discrimination, Hate and Violence against Christians, Jews, Muslims and other Religious or Belief Communities

Introducers:

Mr. Levan Meshkoradze, Team Leader of EU project "Combating All Forms of Discrimination in Georgia", Office of the Ombudsman, Georgia

Ms. Stamatia (Tina) Stavrinaki, Coordinator, Racist Violence Recording Network of UNHCR Greece

Moderator

Ms. Christie Edwards, Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR

Summary of introducer's interventions:

Mr. Meshkoradze stressed that OSCE participating States have the necessary tools at their disposal to address intolerance on grounds of religion or belief. In his view, however, the political will to use these tools was of vital importance. Mr. Meshkoradze enumerated the key strategies related to security of communities and support to victims. He focused on the necessity to put in place adequate legal safeguards, facilitate hate crime reporting, address victims' needs, and design protection and support mechanisms for victims. Moreover, Mr. Meshkoradze stressed that beyond legal safeguards and remedies, educational activities promoting tolerance, respect and mutual understanding, capacity building and awareness-raising pertaining to freedom of religion or belief were especially important. According to Mr. Meshkoradze, leaders in government, religious or belief communities, business and society must stand ready to condemn incidents of violence and vigorously defend the right of individuals to manifest their religion or belief and exercise their freedom of expression.

Ms. Stavrinaki presented the key elements of tools and practices developed by the Racist Violence Recording Network (RVRN) in Greece. Through its composition and rules of operation, the RVRN constitutes an inclusive coalition of forty-six civil society organizations coordinated by the UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR) and the Greek National Commission for Human Rights. The RVRN contributes to making bias-motivated crimes more visible and promotes effective legislation addressing racism and hate crimes in practice.

In her speech, Ms. Stavrinaki analyzed how the RVRN seeks to build connections with all targeted communities and maintain close cooperation with the authorities in order to collect reliable data and support the victims. Ms. Stavrinaki mentioned that building bridges between authorities and victims has been RVRN's key objective and urged civil society organisations to act as bridge builders in a similar way. She further underscored that civil society organizations should strengthen the victim-centred approach and bring this approach to the attention of the authorities. Ms. Stavrinaki also mentioned that broad coalitions of affected communities were needed to tackle hate crimes. Moreover, she underlined the need to take into account intersectionality and multiple biases when monitoring hate crimes, and disaggregate data accordingly.

In the subsequent discussion, participants reaffirmed the vital importance of OSCE commitments on freedom of religion or belief and tolerance and non-discrimination and called on participating States to bring their domestic legislation in line with OSCE commitments and international human rights standards. Certain participants underscored the importance of the OSCE ODIHR-Venice Commission Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religious or Belief Communities in this regard.

A number of participants reported on the discriminatory impact of restrictive laws and practices adopted by authorities in relation to legal personality of religious or belief and called on participating States to rescind all laws and practices limiting the full enjoyment of freedom of religion or belief. Some participants also encouraged OSCE participating States to increase their efforts to promote religious literacy and raise awareness about religious or belief diversity.

Participants also drew attention to the ongoing persecution of Christians within the OSCE region and outside, as well as the rising levels of intolerance, discrimination and acts perpetrated against Muslims.

A number of participants expressed concern at the discrimination faced by minority religious communities in the OSCE region, and called on participating States to protect the rights of all religious minorities. Other participants underlined the worrying trend of rising xenophobic populism coupled with the trivialization of acts of discrimination.

Participants made the following specific recommendations in Session II:

Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:

- OSCE participating States should fully implement all OSCE human dimension commitments, including the 2009 Athens Ministerial Council Decision 9/09 on Combatting Hate Crimes and the 2013 Kyiv Ministerial Council Decision 3/13 on Freedom of Thought, Conscience, Religion or Belief;
- OSCE participating States should increase their efforts to promote religious literacy and raise awareness about religious or belief diversity;
- OSCE participating States should bring their domestic legislation in line with OSCE commitments and international human rights standards pertaining to freedom of religion or belief and tolerance and non-discrimination, in particular so that the provisions are in congruity with the recommendations contained in the OSCE/ODIHR-Venice Commission Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religious or Belief Communities;
- OSCE participating States should collect, maintain and make public, reliable data on hate crimes and violent manifestations of intolerance against members of religious or belief communities in line with the 2009 Athens Ministerial Council Decision 9/09 on Combatting Hate Crimes.

Specific recommendations for the OSCE institutions and field operations:

- OSCE Special Monitoring Mission to Ukraine should continue to monitor the implementation of the OSCE Freedom of Religion or Belief (FoRB) commitments in and around Ukraine.

SESSION III: The Role of Educational Programs and Civil Society Initiatives as a Means to Address Negative Stereotyping and Stigmatization and Promote Mutual Respect and Understanding: State Responses, Coalition Building, Community Resilience

Introducers:

Ms. Salpy Eskidijan Weiderud, Executive Director, Office of the Religious Track of the Cyprus Peace Process

Mr. Emir Kovačević, Vice President, Commission on Freedom of Religion of Islamic Community in Bosnia and Herzegovina

Moderator:

Mr. Omer Fisher, Head, Human Rights Department, OSCE ODIHR

Summary of introducer's interventions:

Ms. Weiderud presented the activities of the Religious Track of the Cyprus Peace Process under the Auspices of the Embassy of Sweden (RTCYPP), which is a peacebuilding initiative with religious leaders who have committed themselves to work together for human rights, peace and reconciliation. The experience was used to highlight how such processes can encourage, facilitate and serve religious leaders' with dialogue and efforts for religious freedom and to contribute positively and constructively to peace processes.

Ms. Weiderud described how such initiatives can evolve into active peace building effort for faith community representatives working together and advocating for the respect of human rights and fundamental freedoms, including the freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief. She stressed that experiences of interfaith dialogue can be replicated in other countries as well. This kind of interfaith dialogue can help building trust among the religious leaders and respective faith communities, promote confidence-building measures and advocate for religious freedom, in particular the right to free access and worship at churches, mosques and monasteries.

Mr. Kovačević presented a project on monitoring and responding to attacks on religious buildings and protecting of holy sites in Bosnia and Herzegovina. The main goal of the project is to enhance trust and improve relations between various religious and ethnic communities in Bosnia and Herzegovina as well as to provide better protection of religious objects in the country. Mr. Kovačević explained that attacks on religious objects or holy sites are defined as physical attacks on properties, as well as any forms of vandalism and desecration of religious buildings or other places of religious significance. As a good practice in the framework of the project, a database of such attacks was developed. This database is currently used for the analysis of the particular areas at risk, motives of such attacks, most vulnerable communities, suspects identified etc. Based on the analysis, an annual report is issued which includes recommendations to introduce stronger sanctions for perpetrators of attacks, encouraging public condemnation of attacks, or setting up video surveillance systems for religious buildings that were attacked several times. The project demonstrates the importance of

collecting and analyzing disaggregated data on hate crimes to develop stronger response to bias-motivated violence and attacks on property.

Following the best practices shared by the introducers of the Session III, the participants stressed the importance of education as a tool to promote human rights, equality, diversity, inclusion and to prevent issues like intolerance, hate crimes, discrimination. Education is essential for future generations, as it brings together children of all backgrounds and religions, teaches them tolerance and respect. Some of the participants shared their examples of educating and training teachers in schools, raising awareness, which leads to social inclusion of children of various backgrounds. Participants highlighted that intercultural education is the key to establish safe environment for all children in schools. There is a strong need to establish intercultural society and raising awareness about multiple cultures and diversity to ensure respect, understanding of differences and values of various communities.

Some of the delegations shared best practices of their countries in ensuring interfaith dialogue and consultations with various religious communities. Interreligious dialogue is important for promoting mutual understanding and respect between the communities. Having a dialogue means accepting other communities with the same dignity and values. Such dialogue helps to establish collaborations, work together on the similar issues, to discuss basics of various religious. It is also about how to give space to various religions and believes without conflict and competition, and to contribute to the mutual culture of respect. Communities need additional encouragement to establish such dialogue while respecting identity and values of each other.

A number of participants strongly praised OSCE and ODIHR for its efforts in combatting intolerance and discrimination, and welcomed various initiatives including ODIHR's "Addressing Anti-Semitism through Education: Guidelines for Policymakers" and ODIHR's teaching materials to challenge anti-Semitism.

Participants made the following specific recommendations in Session III:

Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:

- OSCE participating States should encourage media to add a note to each publication related to intolerance against religious communities mentioning that freedom of religion or belief is a fundamental right and this right is respected;
- OSCE participating States should introduce methodology to fight against hate speech;
- OSCE participating States should make efforts to establish inclusive and multicultural educational programmes to avoid further increase of xenophobia and racism across the region;
- OSCE participating States should recognize intolerance against Muslims as a form of racism;
- OSCE participating States should launch training campaigns to better understand gender equality and diversity, they also should initiate training on combating radicalization for law enforcement. Professional training and coaching on anti-

discrimination legislation as well as introduction of anti-discrimination guidelines for employers should become part of the best practices;

- OSCE participating States should fully implement their commitments related to education, promotion of mutual respect and understanding;
- OSCE participating States should promote establishment of intercultural societies ensuring respect, understanding of diversity and common values.

Specific recommendations for the OSCE institutions and field operations:

- OSCE should further promote and support tools on addressing manifestations of intolerance, discrimination and prejudice;
- ODIHR should follow and address the cases of prosecution of journalists.

CLOSING SESSION

Ms. Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir, Director, ODIHR

Ms. Gísladóttir expressed satisfaction with the course of the meeting and highlighted the importance of discussing challenges that are faced across the OSCE region in the area of tolerance, non-discrimination, and issues related to promoting and protecting freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief. Ms. Gísladóttir stressed the significance of the meeting serving as a platform to share concrete actions that participating States and civil society can take to promote mutual respect and understanding and to address manifestations of intolerance including hate crimes. She concluded by stating that the work on combatting all forms of intolerance and discrimination on grounds of religion or belief requires a comprehensive and collaborative approach and co-ordinated efforts by the key actors. Robust responses from law enforcement, prosecutors and other criminal justice professionals, as well as reporting and recording of bias-motivated crimes along with legal mechanisms and governmental policies are critical. Ms. Gísladóttir agreed with many participants that these responses alone will not guarantee the protection of the dignity of each and every human being and the promotion of a culture of peaceful coexistence in our societies without the indispensable contribution from civil society and religious and belief communities.

Amb. Radomír Boháč, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

Amb. Boháč noted that tolerance and mutual understanding are among the bedrocks of fundamental rights and represent a goal which all participating States wish to achieve. In addition to the root causes of intolerance and discrimination, the meeting also explored the nature and extent of intolerance and discrimination and emphasized the pertinent challenge in addressing the various manifestations of intolerance. The discussions over the day and a half meeting recognized the inherent challenges facing participating States in ensuring freedom of expression whilst preventing and responding to hate crimes and other manifestations of intolerance and discrimination. According to Amb. Boháč, the SHDM also allowed participants to discuss a number of best practices from both state and civil society practitioners in addressing hate crimes and incidents, including responding to the very challenging contemporary manifestations of intolerance, discrimination and violence against various groups and communities within the OSCE region. Amb. Boháč noted that the meeting generated keen interest from across the OSCE region with a total of more than 150 participants, and reminded all of the need to remain committed to working with governments, businesses, faith communities, and civil society across the OSCE region to combat intolerance based on religion or belief in building an inclusive, tolerant and prosperous society.

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: AGENDA



Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting
**Upholding the Principles of Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, Including
in the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief**

**1 – 2 April 2019
Hofburg, Vienna**

AGENDA

Day 1 1 April

15.00 – 16.00

OPENING SESSION

Opening remarks:

- **Amb. Radomír Boháč**, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council
- **Katarzyna Gardapkhadze**, First Deputy Director, OSCE/ODIHR

Introductory addresses:

- **Professor Ingeborg Gabriel**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions
- **Amb. Mehmet Paçacı**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims
- **Rabbi Andrew Baker**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism

Technical information: Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director, OSCE/ODIHR

16.00 – 18.00 **SESSION I: Root Causes and Consequences of Racism and Discrimination in Connection to Religion or Belief: Implementing the OSCE's Comprehensive Approach while Addressing the Particular Needs of Marginalized Groups**

Introducers:

- **Mr. Ján Figel'**, Special Envoy for Promotion of Freedom of Religion outside the EU
- **Mr. Ioannis N. Dimitrakopoulos**, Scientific Adviser, Director's Office, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights

***Moderator:* Ms. Cristina Finch**, Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE/ODIHR

18.00 Reception hosted by the Slovak Chairmanship of the OSCE
Palmenhaus (Burggarten 1, 1010 Vienna)

Day 2 **2 April**

10.30 – 12.30 **SESSION II: Security of Communities and Support to Victims: Good Practices of Addressing Discrimination, Hate and Violence against Christians, Jews, Muslims and other Religious or Belief Communities**

Introducers:

- **Mr. Levan Meshkoradze**, Team Leader of EU project "Combating All Forms of Discrimination in Georgia, Office of the Ombudsman, Georgia
- **Dr. Stamatia (Tina) Stavrinaki**, Coordinator, Racist Violence Recording Network of UNHCR Greece

***Moderator:* Ms. Christie Edwards**, Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE/ODIHR

14.30 – 16.30 **SESSION III: The Role of Educational Programs and Civil Society Initiatives as a Means to Address Negative Stereotyping and Stigmatization and Promote Mutual Respect and Understanding: State Responses, Coalition Building, Community Resilience**

Introducers:

- **Ms. Salpy Eskidijan Weiderud**, Executive Director, Office of the Religious Track of the Cyprus Peace Process
- **Mr. Emir Kovačević**, Vice President, Commission on Freedom of Religion of Islamic Community in Bosnia and Herzegovina

Moderator: **Mr. Omer Fisher**, Head, Human Rights Department, OSCE/ODIHR

16.30 – 17.30

CLOSING SESSION

Rapports from the working sessions
Comments from the floor

Closing remarks:

- **Ms. Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir**, Director, OSCE/ODIHR
- **Amb. Radomír Boháč**, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

17.30

Closing of the meeting

* * * * *

ANNEX 2: BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION: Keynote Speaker, Introducers and Moderators

Day 1: Monday, 1 April

15:00 – 16:00

OPENING SESSION

Opening remarks:

Amb. Radomír Boháč, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

Radomír Boháč is a career diplomat who served the Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs of Slovak Republic for the last 30 years. Mr. Boháč held various positions at home - in Slovakia. Abroad, he served in various Ambassadorial posts, including Permanent Representative of Slovakia to the UN office at Nairobi, and as Slovak Ambassador of Ethiopia, Kenya, Seychelles, and Uganda, from 1999 to 2001; Slovak Ambassador to Portugal from 2004 to 2008; and Slovak Ambassador to Denmark from 2011 to 2014. From 2017 onwards, Mr. Boháč served as Permanent Representative of Slovakia to the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe in Vienna, where he chaired the OSCE Forum for Security Co-operation from January to April 2018, and the OSCE Mediterranean Contact Group also in 2018. Currently, he chairs the OSCE Permanent Council as part of the 2019 Slovak OSCE Chairmanship. Mr. Boháč acquired his legal education at the Comenius University in Bratislava, the Moscow State Institute for International Relations, International Institute for Public Administration in Paris, France, and the George C. Marshall Center for European Security in Garmisch-Partenkirchen, Germany. He also holds a PhD in Economic Diplomacy from the University of Economics in Bratislava.

Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director, OSCE/ODIHR

Katarzyna Gardapkhadze is the First Deputy Director of ODIHR, where she oversees activities of the Election, Democratization, Human Rights, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, and Roma and Sinti Programmes. Prior to her current appointment in August 2016, she was the Head of ODIHR's Human Rights Department. Ms. Gardapkhadze is an expert in strategic planning and change management, conflict resolution and mediation, with a thematic expertise in human and children rights and gender equality. She has more than 20 years of professional experience from Poland, the United States, Western Balkans, the South Caucasus and Central Asia. In 2003-2011, Ms. Gardapkhadze led conflict resolution, human rights and child/social welfare reform programs in the South Caucasus, also advising similar programs in Central Asia. In 2000 – 2002, she managed initiatives focused on human rights, minorities and inter-ethnic dialogue in Western Balkans. Fluent in Polish, English and Russian, Ms. Gardapkhadze holds a Master's Degree in social sciences.

Introductory addresses:

Professor Ingeborg Gabriel, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions, Austria

Professor Ingeborg Gabriel was appointed as the Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination in 2019. Her role also focuses on combating intolerance and discrimination against Christians and other religious faiths. Since the 1980s, she has been active in encouraging interreligious dialogue, both at an academic and diplomatic level: serving as the director of the Austrian Justice and Peace Commission and co-founding the Vienna Christian-Islamic Summer University in 2006. She is a professor of Social Ethics at the University of Vienna, Austria, serving in the Faculty of Catholic Theology since 1997. She holds a Master's degree in Economics and International Relations from the Diplomatic Academy in Vienna. She has previously worked for the United Nations Development Programme in New York for the nations of Nepal and Mongolia.

Amb. Mehmet Paçacı, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

Ambassador Mehmet Paçacı is a Turkish diplomat and university professor. He served as Ambassador of Turkey to the Holy See from 2014 to 2019. Previously he acted as Director General of Foreign Relations in the Presidency of Religious Affairs in Ankara and Attaché of the Presidency of Religious Affairs at the Turkish Embassy in Washington DC. He has a PhD degree from the Faculty of Theology of Ankara University where he was a member of the academic staff between 1983 and 2008. He has been a visiting scholar and lecturer at various universities, including Prince Alwaleed Bin Talal Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding at the Georgetown University School of Foreign Service, the Wesley Theological Seminary in Washington D.C., Manchester University, the King Saud University in Riyadh, the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome, Bamberg University and Kuala Lumpur International Islamic University. He has specifically worked on hermeneutical questions of interpreting the Muslim Holy Scripture, the Qur'an, in modern times.

Rabbi Andrew Baker, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism

Rabbi Andrew Baker is director of International Jewish Affairs at the American Jewish Committee (AJC), which he joined in 1979. A leading expert on anti-Semitism in Europe, he travels extensively to strengthen relations between the AJC and Jewish communities worldwide. Throughout most of the 1990s, as director of European Affairs, Rabbi Baker promoted tolerance in the emerging democracies of Central and Eastern Europe. He is active in Holocaust restitution issues and in 2003 was awarded the Officer's Cross of the Order of Merit by Germany for his work on German-Jewish relations.

16:00 – 18:00

SESSION I: Root Causes and Consequences of Racism and Discrimination in Connection to Religion or Belief: Implementing the OSCE's Comprehensive Approach while Addressing the Particular Needs of Marginalized Groups

Introducers:

Mr. Ján Figel', Special Envoy for Promotion of Freedom of Religion outside the EU
Since May 2016 Ján Figel' was nominated by the European Commission as the first Special Envoy for promotion of freedom of religion or belief (FoRB) outside the European Union. Mandate represents a new task to engage in this sensitive area mainly through international cooperation and development aid policy of the EU. Figel' often underlines that FoRB is an essential value for human dignity everywhere, for peace and justice in the world. His role is to work closely with other institutions within the EU (EEAS, Council, Parliament) and Member States especially in most critical countries. He named several regions as his priority: Middle East, especially Iraq and Syria, Northern and Central Africa, South Eastern and Southern Asia. Mandates includes Special Envoy's reporting within the regular dialogue of the EU with churches and religious communities based on Art. 17 of the Lisbon Treaty. Ján Figel' is experienced Slovak and European politician. He was Slovakia's Chief Negotiator and the first EU Commissioner responsible for education, culture and youth policies and Deputy Prime Minister and Vice-president of the National Council.

Mr. Ioannis N. Dimitrakopoulos, Scientific Adviser, Director's Office, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights

Ioannis N. Dimitrakopoulos is scientific advisor to the Director of the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA). He is a social scientist, educated in the UK, with extensive research experience on a range of human rights issues. He led the Agency's research for the past 15 years developing its research and policy work on equality, non-discrimination and hate crime.

Moderator:

Ms. Cristina Finch, Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE/ODIHR
Cristina M. Finch served as the head of the Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department at the OSCE's Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights in 2014-2020. Ms. Finch is a human rights lawyer and advocate with twenty years of experience advancing human rights in the areas of hate crime, women's and LGBT rights. She is the former managing director for the Identity and Discrimination Unit at Amnesty International USA (AIUSA) where she was at the forefront of successful efforts to expand human rights protections against sexual and gender-based violence and to advance LGBT rights. Prior to joining AIUSA, she served as senior counsel to the Human Rights Campaign where she focused on the issue of hate crime. Ms. Finch has served as legal counsel to the Congresses of both the United States and the Republic of Palau; providing legal advice, negotiating international agreements and drafting legislation. She is a former adjunct law professor at George Mason University School of Law and has provided expert testimony on legal and policy issues before the UN Human Rights Council, Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe and the U.S. Congress. She is a featured expert on the Women's Media Center's SheSource and on the Brussels Binder. She holds a JD from George Mason University, and a BA from the University of Michigan.

Day 2: Tuesday, 2 April 2019

10:30 – 12:30

**SESSION II: Security of Communities and Support to Victims:
Good Practices of Addressing Discrimination, Hate and Violence
against Christians, Jews, Muslims and other Religious or Belief
Communities**

Introducers:

Mr. Levan Meshkoradze, Team Leader of EU project "Combating All Forms of Discrimination in Georgia, Office of the Ombudsman, Georgia

Levan Meskhoradze is a professional lawyer with 15 years of experience at national and international level, specialized in international and human rights law, rule of law, criminal justice reform and policy, anti-discrimination, legal training and management. Levan Meskhoradze is the Team Leader of EU Project "Combating All Forms of Discrimination in Georgia". He is in charge of overseeing and contributing the implementation of specific activities, e.g. increase capacity of the Public Defender's Office to address the human rights situation of various minorities and vulnerable groups; enhancing capacity of the Public Defender's Office as operational institutional mechanism foreseen under anti-discrimination law; expertise anti-discrimination legislation and practice; organize awareness-raising campaigns to combat prejudices that lead to discrimination. In 2008-2016, Levan Meskhoradze was Agent of the Government of Georgia to the European Court of Human Rights and UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies Head, he was head of Department of the State Representations to the International Human Rights Courts, Ministry of Justice of Georgia (presented more than 150 cases) Levan Meskhoradze is actively involved in international consultancy for Council for Council of Europe, EU and OSCE.

Dr. Stamatia (Tina) Stavrinaki, Coordinator, Racist Violence Recording Network of UNHCR Greece

Dr. Tina Stavrinaki is a lawyer specialised in international and human rights law. She holds a PhD in international law from University Paris 2, a DEA from the Institut des Hautes Etudes Européennes (University Strasbourg 3) and a LLB from the Faculty of Law of Athens University. She has worked as a legal officer with the National Commission for Human Rights and earlier as a research fellow for the Marangopoulos Foundation for Human Rights. She has drafted several reports and papers on a wide range of human rights issues. As an independent expert she participated in a Special Drafting Committee on substantive gender equality and in the Economic and Social Committee of Greece. She is currently the Assistant Coordinator of the Racist Violence Recording Network (RVRN) and one of the persons that set up the Network in 2011. The RVRN is an umbrella network of 46 civil society organizations coordinated by UNHCR and the Greek National Commission for Human Rights. The participating organizations provide medical, social and legal services to victims of hate and bias motivated crimes, or have been established by the groups which are usually targeted by racist violence themselves.

Moderator:

Ms. Christie Edwards, Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE/ODIHR

Christie Edwards is an internationally recognized and published expert with over nineteen years of experience working on international humanitarian and human rights law, gender, international policy and advocacy, and international community development. Ms. Edwards has led successful non-profit management and implementation programs, strategic planning, and grant management in senior leadership roles at the national and international level with prominent NGOs and international organizations. Ms. Edwards has served as the Deputy Head of the Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights since 2018, including serving as Acting Head of Department in February-July 2020, addressing issues of racism, xenophobia, religious discrimination, and hate crimes. Previously, as the Director of International Humanitarian Law at the American Red Cross, Ms. Edwards led the organization's legal education, public, and youth outreach efforts on IHL, directly reaching over 60,000 people per year with a social reach of over 24 million. Finally, Ms. Edwards serves as the Vice Chair of the International Organizations Interest Group of the American Society of International Law (ASIL). She received her J.D. from Thomas Jefferson School of Law, specializing in international human rights law. While in San Diego, she worked at a torture treatment clinic for political refugees, served as pro bono counsel for asylum seekers, and taught an international human rights course at TJSL as an Adjunct Professor and Pro Bono Fellow. Ms. Edwards then completed her LL.M. degree at AU's Washington College of Law, with dual specializations in international human rights and gender.

14:30 – 16:30

SESSION III: The Role of Educational Programs and Civil Society Initiatives as a Means to Address Negative Stereotyping and Stigmatization and Promote Mutual Respect and Understanding: State Responses, Coalition Building, Community Resilience

Introducers:

Ms. Salpy Eskidjian Weiderud, Executive Director, Office of the Religious Track of the Cyprus Peace Process

Ms. Salpy Eskidjian Weiderud is one of the architects and facilitators of the Religious Track of the Cyprus Peace Process under the Auspices of the Embassy of Sweden (RTCYPP) based in Nicosia, Cyprus and serves as the Executive Director of the Office of RTCYPP based at the Home for Cooperation, Nicosia. She has extensive experience working with the role of religion in conflict, human rights and peacebuilding locally, regionally and globally. Salpy holds a Master's diploma in Human Rights and Diplomacy from University of New South Wales, Australia, a Post Graduate Diploma from the Graduate Institute in The Hague on Development and Human Rights, BA (Hons) in Sociology and Criminal Justice, George Washington University, Washington D.C USA.

Mr. Emir Kovačević, Vice President, Commission on Freedom of Religion of Islamic Community in Bosnia and Herzegovina

Emir Kovačević is from Bosnia and Herzegovina. He is lawyer and run Law office in Sarajevo. He was working for Inter religious Council in BiH from June 1998 until December

2018. He was responsible for different projects such as: Monitoring on attacks on religious buildings, visiting places of suffer, establishing new chapters and others projects. He was coordinator of Legal experts group and he was involved in drafting of the Law on Freedom of Religion and the legal status of churches and religious communities in BiH and the Anti-Discrimination Law in BiH. He is member of Panel of experts for freedom of religion or belief ODIHR/OSCE since 2016 and Deputy president of Commission for Freedom of religion, Islamic Community in BiH.

Moderator:

Mr. Omer Fisher, Head, Human Rights Department, OSCE/ODIHR

Omer Fisher is Head of the Human Rights Department of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR). Mr. Fisher joined ODIHR in 2010 as a Human Rights Advisor, working primarily on freedom of peaceful assembly. Previously, he worked at the International Secretariat of Amnesty International in London as Researcher on the Balkans and as Senior Research Policy Advisor, developing and providing advice on human rights fact-finding standards and methodology. In these capacities, he authored or co-authored a number of human rights reports. Omer Fisher holds a PhD in Politics from the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, UK and a degree in Economics from Bocconi University, Milan, Italy.

16:30 – 17:30

CLOSING SESSION

Closing remarks:

Ms. Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir, Director, OSCE/ODIHR

Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir was appointed as Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights on 18 July 2017. Ms. Gísladóttir has 35 years of leadership experience working on human rights, democratic governance and the rule of law at the international, national and local levels. Before taking up the position of ODIHR Director, she served from 2014 as Regional Director for Europe and Central Asia and Country Representative to Turkey for UN Women. From 2011 to 2014 she was Country Representative of UN Women to Afghanistan. From 2007 to 2009, Ms. Gísladóttir served as Minister for Foreign Affairs of Iceland. She was previously a Member of Parliament and Chairperson and Leader of the Social Democratic Alliance (2005 – 2009) and Mayor of the City of Reykjavik (1994 – 2003). Throughout her career, she has been involved in policy and development work in conflict and non-conflict countries, aimed at strengthening democratic institutions and human rights. In the early years of her political career, in 1982, Ms. Gísladóttir was one the founders of the Women's Party, laying the ground for Iceland's remarkable progress in gender equality. Gísladóttir holds a Bachelor's degree in history and literature from the University of Iceland (1979), and pursued Post-graduate studies in history at the University of Copenhagen (1979-1981). In 2004, she was a Visiting Scholar at the European Institute, London School of Economics (LSE). She speaks English, French and Danish.

Amb. Radomír Boháč, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

Radomír Boháč is a career diplomat who served the Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs of Slovak Republic for the last 30 years. Mr. Boháč held various positions at home - in Slovakia. Abroad, he served in various Ambassadorial posts, including Permanent Representative of Slovakia to the UN office at Nairobi, and as Slovak Ambassador of

Ethiopia, Kenya, Seychelles, and Uganda, from 1999 to 2001; Slovak Ambassador to Portugal from 2004 to 2008; and Slovak Ambassador to Denmark from 2011 to 2014. From 2017 onwards, Mr. Boháč served as Permanent Representative of Slovakia to the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe in Vienna, where he chaired the OSCE Forum for Security Co-operation from January to April 2018, and the OSCE Mediterranean Contact Group also in 2018. Currently, he chairs the OSCE Permanent Council as part of the 2019 Slovak OSCE Chairmanship. Mr. Boháč acquired his legal education at the Comenius University in Bratislava, the Moscow State Institute for International Relations, International Institute for Public Administration in Paris, France, and the George C. Marshall Center for European Security in Garmisch-Partenkirchen, Germany. He also holds a PhD in Economic Diplomacy from the University of Economics in Bratislava.