



Working Session No 13 (3:00 to 6:00 p.m.)
Tolerance and Non-Discrimination II (continued), Including:
- Combating Racism, Xenophobia, and Discrimination
- Combating Anti-Semitism and Discrimination against Christians, Muslims and
Members of Other Religions

OSCE / ODIHR
Warsaw, Poland
24 September 2019

Thank you, madam moderator, ladies and gentlemen.

“Aufheben der Kultur” – Negate the Culture - is a process of systematic negation of cultures.

Have you ever noticed that **multi-culturalism** always seems to mean every culture but you own - whatever culture that might be? This reflects the Marcusean application of narratives operationalized by Marcuse in **“Repressive Tolerance”** where words mean their opposite such that **“tolerance”** is the deliberate **“intolerance”** of the existing social order – whatever social order that may be – and hence, **multiculturalism** becomes the imposition of a hostile group on a target group for the purpose of destroying it through dialectical negation – **“Aufheben der Kultur!”** Alongside these narratives, **hate speech** memes serve as enforcement mechanisms through the direct application of Habermas’s **“Discourse Theory”** of **imposed consensus** designed to suppresses dissent. Of course, this is undertaken by those capable of **self-empowering** themselves to make such determinations as to which cultures are to be destroyed.

There are many ways to interpret OSCE language like the **“commitment to respect human rights and fundamental freedoms for all without distinction.”** Who wouldn’t support this? I certainly do! But there is a growing perception that the tolerance being expressed in forums like the OSCE leaves them feeling on the suppressed side of repressive tolerance formulas.

The concern is that the language of tolerance is being purposefully repurposed through **cynical narratives** that turn such ennobling aspirations on their head. The pall of Marcuse’s **“Repressive Tolerance”** hangs over this forum. To quote Marcuse:

- “The conclusion reached is that the realization of the objective of **tolerance** would call for **intolerance** toward [certain] prevailing policies,



attitudes [and] opinions . . . Liberating tolerance, then, would mean **intolerance against movements from the Right** and toleration of movements from the Left.”

The reason many find themselves surprised when designated as members of the “**right**” is because that term, like **racism** and **xenophobia**, are simply applied to those who refuse to conform to repressive tolerance regimes that seek to deny people, cultures and nations of their identity. **Aufheben der Kultur** is about the destruction of cultures through the destruction of identity.

Unconstrained Analytics recommends that the OSCE and all participating States – pause to undertake an inventory of the “**racism, xenophobia and discrimination**” narratives to determine whether they have, **indeed**, crossed over to the repressive tolerance application of the term. After all, delegates of **participating Members** are supposed to represent their people, not destroy them. Thank you!