

PRINCIPALITY OF MONACO

PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS 5 February 2023

ODIHR NEEDS ASSESSMENT MISSION REPORT 12-14 December 2022



Warsaw 26 January 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
III.	FINDINGS	2
A.	Background	2
B.		
C.	ELECTION ADMINISTRATION	4
D.		5
E.	CANDIDATE REGISTRATION	<i>6</i>
F.	ELECTION CAMPAIGN AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE	<i>6</i>
G.		
Н.	COMPLAINTS AND APPEALS	8
IV.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION	9
ANNI	EX: LIST OF MEETINGS	. 10

PRINCIPALITY OF MONACO PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS 5 February 2023

ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report

I. INTRODUCTION

Following an invitation from the authorities of the Principality of Monaco to observe the 5 February 2023 parliamentary elections, and in accordance with its mandate, the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) undertook a Needs Assessment Mission (NAM) from 12 to 14 December 2022. The NAM included Alexey Gromov, ODIHR Senior Election Adviser, and Kakha Inaishvili, ODIHR Election Adviser.

The purpose of the mission was to assess the pre-election environment and the preparations for the elections. Based on this assessment, the NAM recommends whether to deploy an ODIHR election-related activity for the forthcoming elections, and if so, what type of activity best meets the identified needs. Meetings were held with officials from state institutions and the election administration, as well as representatives of political parties, media and the international community. A list of meetings is annexed to this report.

ODIHR would like to thank the Permanent Mission of the Principality of Monaco to the OSCE and Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Co-operation for their assistance in organizing the visit. ODIHR would like to thank all of its interlocutors for taking the time to meet with the NAM and to share their views.

II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Monaco is a hereditary and constitutional monarchy, with executive power vested in the supreme authority of the Prince, who is the head of state. Legislative power is exercised jointly by the Prince and a unicameral parliament, the 24-member National Council. The parliament is elected for five years under a mixed electoral system with open candidate lists in a single nationwide constituency.

The legal framework governing the conduct of the elections has remained largely unchanged after the 2018 parliamentary elections. The recent amendments simplified the procedure for proxy voting and specified the cases of incompatibility of certain positions with the elected office. Most previous ODIHR recommendations remain unaddressed, including those related to the status of international observers, suffrage rights of citizens and criminal liability for defamation. Nonetheless, all ODIHR NAM interlocutors consider the legal framework conducive to holding democratic elections.

Elections are administered by the City Hall of Monaco which is responsible for the preparation of voter lists, registration of candidates, distribution of voter information, as well as administering voting and counting procedures. Only one polling station will be established for election day. All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed confidence in the election administration and raised no concerns regarding the technical preparations to the elections, which are well underway.

Citizens aged 18 years or older on election day are entitled to vote, and there are some 7,500 registered voters. Citizens may be disenfranchised for committing crimes irrespective of their gravity. Citizens deprived of legal capacity, including those with intellectual or psychosocial disabilities, are ineligible to vote. Voter registration is passive, and voter lists are regularly updated by the municipality. No ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised any concerns over the voter registration process.

Any registered voter who has reached 25 years of age and has been a citizen for at least five years is entitled to contest the elections. Candidates may stand within the lists of political associations, but not individually. There are no legal requirements to promote women candidates. Overall, ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not express concerns with the inclusiveness of the registration process.

The official campaign period lasts 15 days and ends 24 hours before election day. The campaign is expected to focus on social policies, housing and infrastructure, cost of living, EU association and climate change. For campaigning purposes, the candidates largely rely on personal contacts, small gatherings, posters, televised debates and, to a lesser extent, social networks. No ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised any issues regarding the ability to campaign freely.

Election campaigns may be financed from political associations' and candidates' own funds, including loans, as well as private monetary and in-kind donations. The law limits the campaign expenditures at EUR 325,000 per candidate list, and candidate lists are entitled to partial reimbursement of their expenses depending on election results. The law provides for reporting and disclosure requirements, and the Campaign Accounts Supervisory Commission is in charge of campaign finance oversight. Most ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed overall satisfaction with the level of accountability and transparency of campaign finances.

The media landscape is limited, and local media are required to ensure objectivity, impartiality, accuracy and diversity in political programmes. The Constitution guarantees freedom of expression; however, defamation of the royal family is prohibited by the Penal Code. Distribution of false and slanderous information is punishable by imprisonment up to two years. Candidate lists are entitled to free airtime, and contestants may distribute paid political advertisements in the media. Majority of ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed overall satisfaction with access to media and sufficient coverage of elections. Few interlocutors noted undue dependence of local media on state subsidies and resultant shortage of objective political information offered by journalists to voters.

Citizens may challenge decisions on different aspects of elections with relevant administrative bodies and further appeal to the courts. According to many ODIHR NAM interlocutors, the election dispute resolution mechanism generally provides for effective and timely redress.

All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed a high level of confidence in the electoral process as well as the ability of the election administration to manage the elections in a professional, impartial and transparent manner. No significant concerns were expressed relating to the respect for fundamental freedoms, the campaign environment and election day proceedings. While acknowledging a potential usefulness of an external assessment, most ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted lack of specific need for an observation activity for the upcoming elections. Based on these findings, the ODIHR NAM does not recommend an election-related activity for the 5 February 2023 parliamentary elections. ODIHR, however, reiterates that many of its previous recommendations remain unaddressed and stands ready to offer its assistance in a post-electoral follow-up process.

III. FINDINGS

A. BACKGROUND

Monaco is a hereditary and constitutional monarchy headed by Prince Albert II. The Prince directly appoints the Minister of State who leads the government which is not accountable to the National Council (parliament). The legislative power is vested in both the sovereign Prince and the 24-member

unicameral National Council. The parliament deliberates and votes on bills; however, only the Prince can initiate new legislation and retains a power of veto. A network of advisory bodies mitigates the extensive powers of the Prince.

The last 2018 parliamentary elections resulted in the victory of political association *Primo! Priorité Monaco* which obtained 21 seats in the National Council. The then ruling *Horizon Monaco* gained only two seats while Monegasque Union – one seat. While several ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted a lack of barriers for women to participate in political life, women hold only seven mandates (29 per cent) in the outgoing National Council and two out of five ministerial positions. Recently elected president of the National Council is the first woman president in the history of this institution.

ODIHR has previously observed only the 2013 parliamentary elections in the Principality of Monaco. Its final report contains 17 recommendations, including 6 priority ones, for the authorities to improve the electoral process and bring it closer in line with OSCE commitments. Among priority issues, ODIHR recommended to improve certain elements of the legal framework providing for a review of the practices of proxy voting and blanket withdrawal of voting rights of prisoners, a full access of international observers to the electoral process, enhancing transparency in the sessions of the election administration as well as removing undue restrictions of the right to stand.

B. LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND ELECTORAL SYSTEM

Elections of the National Council are primarily governed by the 1962 Constitution (last amended in 2002) and the 1968 National Elections Law (electoral law, last amended in December 2022). Specific aspects of elections are regulated by the Law on the Financing of Election Campaigns (last amended in 2018). Other relevant laws include the 2008 Law on Associations and Federations of Associations (hereinafter Law on Associations), and relevant provisions of the Civil and Civil Procedure Codes and Criminal Code. The electoral legal framework is also supplemented by various governmental orders, including Ministerial Ordinances, as well as municipal acts regulating the display of election campaign materials. Monaco is a party to major international and regional instruments related to the holding of democratic elections.³

Overall, the electoral legal framework has remained largely unchanged since the 2018 parliamentary elections. Recent amendments simplified the procedure for proxy voting, including for voters serving a prison sentence and those at detention facilities, and specified the cases of incompatibility of certain public positions with the mandate of the member of the parliament (MP). Some of the previous ODIHR recommendations remain unaddressed, including on eligibility of candidates, criminalized defamation, proxy voting, and election dispute resolution. Overall, ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed confidence in the legal framework as a sound basis for the conduct of democratic elections.

All registered candidate lists have the right to appoint up to two representatives to the polling station. The counting process is open to observation by any citizen of Monaco. Despite a previous ODIHR recommendation, there are no legal provisions related to international election observation, contrary

See previous <u>ODIHR</u> election-related reports on the Principality of Monaco.

In Paragraph 25 of the 1999 OSCE Istanbul Document, OSCE participating States committed themselves "to follow up promptly the ODIHR's election assessment and recommendations". See ODIHR Electoral Recommendations Database at Paragraph25.odihr.pl.

Including the 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 1979 Convention for Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, 1965 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 2006 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), European Convention on Human Rights. Monaco is also a member of the Council of Europe's Venice Commission and Group of States against Corruption (GRECO).

to OSCE commitments.⁴ The authorities assured the ODIHR NAM that the ODIHR experts and observers would have full access to all stages of the electoral process.

The 24 MPs are elected under a mixed electoral system from a single nationwide constituency. They are elected from open candidate lists, each consisting of between 13 and 24 candidates. The 16 candidates who receive the largest number of votes are elected through a majoritarian system. The remaining eight seats are filled through a proportional system from among the candidate lists that received at least 5 per cent of valid votes cast. Each list is presented on a separate ballot sheet, and voters can only cast one ballot as well as modify a ballot paper by striking and/or adding candidates from other lists (so-called cross-voting).

C. ELECTION ADMINISTRATION

Elections are administered by the City Hall of Monaco.⁵ It is responsible for the preparation of voter lists, registration of candidates, distribution of voter information, as well as organizing voting and counting of votes.⁶ The mayor acts as a chairperson of the Electoral Committee, a temporary body comprised of city council members and city hall employees. The Electoral Committee convenes on an *ad hoc* basis, and its sessions are not open for public and observers, despite a previous ODIHR recommendation. All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed confidence in the professionalism, impartiality and transparency of the election administration, and no concerns were raised regarding the technical preparations or conduct of elections.

The City Hall informed the ODIHR NAM that voters would receive some practical information about elections and election day procedures, including through guidelines sent to each household, official publications in the media, and on social networks. Voter information would also specify modalities for proxy voting. Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted that more efforts were needed to adjust the voter information for the needs of different groups of persons with disabilities.

While the City Hall provides envelopes for casting ballots, electoral contestants are financially and logistically responsible for providing ballots on election day. Voters can cast ballots in-person at the only polling station in Monaco or by proxy. The recent legal amendments simplified the procedure for proxy voting, whereby voters are no longer required to justify their absence and provide a reason for using proxy voting. Voters may apply either online or by signing a paper form by 27 January 2023. Most ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not express any concern and regarded the longstanding practice of proxy voting as a convenient tool for voter participation, especially for those who are temporarily abroad. ODIHR has previously recommended that the practice of proxy voting be reviewed due to potential risks for the secrecy of the vote as provided for by OSCE commitments and other international obligations for democratic elections.

Paragraph 8 of the 1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document provides that "the presence of observers, both foreign and domestic, can enhance the electoral process for States in which elections are taking place".

The Ministry of Interior supports the City Hall by providing necessary legal interpretations and advice as well as by ensuring the security of the electoral process.

The Minister of State publishes the election results in the official newspaper.

Monegasque voters holding a new identity card and having activated their digital identity can <u>apply online</u> through the website of the City Hall. Application forms can also be downloaded or obtained and filled in the City Hall.

According to the authorities, some 900 Monegasque voters currently reside abroad.

Paragraph 7.4 of the 1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document commits participating States to "ensure that votes are cast by secret ballot or by equivalent free voting procedure". See also Article 25 of the ICCPR and Paragraph 20 of the 1996 CCPR General Comment No. 25 to the ICCPR. In its 2013 Final Report, ODIHR recommended to explore "alternative voting methods for voters unable to vote in person on election day so as to bring legislation more fully in line with OSCE commitments and other international standards for democratic elections".

Only one polling station will be established for election day. The polling station board is responsible for organizing voting and counting of votes and consists of the mayor or deputy mayor and at least two members of the local council. In addition, the mayor appoints assessors from among non-candidate voters who are state or municipal officials. The board also elects a secretary with a consultative voice. During the voting, at least three members, excluding the secretary, must be present in the polling station. The ODIHR NAM was informed that voting results for the upcoming elections would be aggregated by using a special results management system to facilitate expedited publication of the election results. The authorities also informed that special arrangements will be provided for barrier-free access to the voting process.

D. VOTER REGISTRATION

Citizens aged 18 years or older on election day are eligible to vote. Despite a previous ODIHR recommendation, the law denies the right to vote for citizens with criminal conviction, irrespective of the gravity of the crime committed. Blanket withdrawal of suffrage rights runs against OSCE commitments and other international standards. Contrary to the CRPD, the electoral law disenfranchises citizens deprived of legal capacity, including persons with intellectual or psychosocial disabilities. 11

The Principality has some 39,300 residents, of whom some 9,600 are Monegasque citizens. There are some 7,500 registered voters as of December 2022. Voter registration is passive. The interagency committee (hereinafter Revision Committee), comprised of the mayor, a representative of the Minister of State and two representatives of the Municipal Council, reviews the voter register each year starting from 15 October. The voter register closes on 31 December. Following the revision and no later than on 10 January, the Revision Committee publishes a list of voters who were added and removed from the voter register due to various reasons. ¹² No ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised any concerns over the voter registration process.

Within 15 days after the publication, a voter whose records are wrong or were omitted, may submit a written complaint to the mayor. Within further seven days, the Revision Committee has to handle all complaints, and the mayor notifies the voters on the results within 48 hours after the decision has been made. Decisions of the Revision Committee can be appealed to the court of first instance and further to the Court of Appeals. Any registered voter or the Minister of State may request registration of another voter or removal of relevant records. In this case, the voter in question is immediately notified by the mayor and has the right to present objections within no less than three days.

Any Monegasque citizen, including candidates, may obtain a paper or electronic copy of the voter list free of charge, under the condition that the personal data will be used only for electoral purposes.

Paragraph 24 of the 1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document provides that restrictions on rights and freedoms must be "strictly proportionate to the aim of the law." Paragraph 14 of the 1996 CCPR General Comment No. 25 to the ICCPR requires that grounds for the deprivation of voting rights should be "objective and reasonable".

According to Articles 12 and 29 of the <u>CRPD</u>, "State Parties shall recognize that persons with disabilities enjoy legal capacity on an equal basis with others in all aspects of life" and ensure their "right and opportunity [...] to vote and be elected". Paragraph 48 of the CRPD Committee's <u>General Comment No. 1 to Article 12 of the CRPD</u> states that "a person's decision-making ability cannot be a justification for any exclusion of persons with disabilities from exercising [...] the right to vote [and] the right to stand for election".

This list is posted in the City Hall and published in the *Journal de Monaco*. The Revision Committee adds voters who have reached voting age, regained their voting rights after suspension and those who were omitted. Records of deceased voters, of those declared incompetent by a court and of incorrectly registered voters are removed.

E. CANDIDATE REGISTRATION

Citizens with active suffrage right, aged 25 years or older and having the citizenship of Monaco for at least five years may stand for the elections. Despite a previous ODIHR recommendation, the provision regarding the length of citizenship has not been reviewed. The Crown and State advisers, members of the Supreme Court, members of the royal family, diplomatic or consular officials, judges, as well as voters who by virtue of other nationality hold elective office in another country are also ineligible. In addition, the law identifies a broad range of governmental and non-governmental positions as incompatible with the status of an MP.

Candidates may stand only on behalf of political associations. ¹⁴ Despite a previous ODIHR recommendation, independent candidates may not run individually; ¹⁵ however, candidate lists may be composed of independent candidates, provided that a list must contain at least 13 candidates. There are no legal requirements to promote women candidates. According to several ODIHR NAM interlocutors, it is difficult to attract a sufficient number of qualified candidates, and some believed that legal limitations imposed on eligibility and compatibility could be revised. Overall, ODIHR NAM interlocutors did not express concerns with the inclusiveness of the candidate registration process.

Between 16 and 20 January, potential candidates have to submit their applications to the City Hall, and the head of the relevant political association has to approve the final list of candidates. Following the verification of candidates' eligibility, the mayor has to register the lists of candidates by 21 January. A refusal of registration can be appealed within 24 hours to the president of the court of first instance who needs to decide on the matter within 48 hours. This decision may be challenged only after election day as a general complaint against electoral operations.

F. ELECTION CAMPAIGN AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE

The official campaign period begins on 21 January and ends 24 hours prior to election day. ¹⁶ The Constitution guarantees freedoms of association, peaceful assembly and expression, and no ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised any issues regarding the ability to exercise the fundamental rights. During the campaign, the posting of printed materials is limited to spaces designated by the mayor, which are provided free-of-charge on a strictly equal basis. Unauthorized posting and defacing of campaign posters is prohibited. Each list of candidates is entitled to use twice a meeting venue provided for free by the mayor.

The campaign is expected to focus on social policies, housing and infrastructure, cost of living, EU association and climate change. It is widely expected that the candidates will rely on personal contacts and traditional campaign methods, including small gatherings to ensure proximity with population, as well as posters and TV debates to reach out to broader public, and to a lesser extent on social networks.

Paragraph 15 of the CCPR General Comment No. 25 to the ICCPR states that the "persons who are otherwise eligible to stand for election should not be excluded by unreasonable or discriminatory requirements such as education, residence or descent, or by reason of political affiliation".

The Law on Associations governs all types of associations, and there is no specific legislation on political parties. When associations are established under this law, they acquire legal personality.

Paragraph 7.5 of the 1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document commits participating States to respect "the right of citizens to seek political or public office, individually or as representatives of political parties or organizations, without discrimination".

The election campaign is divided into three phases: a pre-election period which starts 150 days before election day; candidate nomination period and the official campaign period.

Election campaign finance is primarily regulated by the Law on the Financing of Election Campaigns and further complemented by ministerial ordinances. The Campaign Accounts Supervisory Commission (CASC), a permanent independent body comprised of seven members and appointed for five-year terms, oversees the campaign finance.

Campaigns are primarily funded by political associations' and candidates' own funds, including loans, as well as donations in monetary and in-kind form. Anonymous donations for campaign purposes are not allowed. At the same time, political associations may receive monetary, including anonymous, and in-kind donations for their regular activities.¹⁷

The campaign expenditure ceiling for these elections is set at EUR 325,000 per candidate list. Individuals and legal entities can donate for a campaign up to 10 per cent of this limit, and the cumulative total amount of donations cannot exceed 20 per cent of the ceiling. Several ODIHR NAM interlocutors assessed the expenditure limit as sufficient to provide for level playing field for all contestants in the light of relatively modest expenses for travels, public gatherings and advertising.

Candidate lists surpassing the 5 per cent threshold in proportional component and any list whose candidate has obtained a number of votes of at least 25 per cent of registered voters are entitled to a reimbursement of up to a half of the campaign expenditure ceiling. The lists that polled at least 10 per cent of valid votes cast and got at least one candidate elected are entitled to reimbursement of up to 80 per cent of the expenditure ceiling. The decision on the partial reimbursement of campaign expenses is taken by the Minister of State based on the CASC's opinion.

Every candidate is obliged to appoint a financial agent who manages a dedicated account for recording all campaign related incomes and expenditures. There is no oversight during the campaign and until the accounts are submitted to the CASC despite a previous ODIHR recommendation. Within two months after elections, candidate lists are required to submit aggregated campaign finance reports detailing campaign incomes and expenses and having been certified by an external auditor. According to some ODIHR NAM interlocutors, the reporting rules are clear and not burdensome. The CASC has three months to approve, reject, or require revision of these reports. The CASC draws a review report but publishes only the summaries of these reviews, while any voter, at their expense, may obtain the full version of these reports. The Council of Europe's Group of States against Corruption (GRECO) and ODIHR have previously recommended publication of campaign finance reports, but the law still does not provide for this. ¹⁹

By law, any natural or legal person (a third party) who has contributed to a campaign fund or incurred campaign expenses, on their own behalf or on behalf of another person, has to submit to the CASC, when requested, all required documents justifying such expenses. Some ODIHR NAM interlocutors referred to a lack of effective oversight of expenses related to campaign on social networks.

The legislation provides for sanctions for various types of campaign finance irregularities such as exceeding the expenditure ceiling, unlawful financing, failure to submit reports, as well as for false reporting. Exceeding the limit on campaign expenditures can result in reducing or revoking the reimbursement of expenses, while sanctions for other violations may include fines and imprisonment. Exceeding the expenditure ceiling may also lead to partial or total annulment of election results if the

Financing of regular activities of political associations is regulated by the <u>Law on Associations</u> which stipulates that an association may accept a donation or a legacy if authorized by sovereign order following an opinion from the Council of State. Donations higher than EUR 1,000, made directly by individuals or companies to the political associations, must be paid by check or bank transfer. Political associations receive no state subsidies.

The campaign expenditure limit was defined by the Ministerial Order 2022-417 of 5 August 2022.

See GRECO 2017 Addendum to the Second Compliance Report on Monaco.

court establishes that this has affected the equality among the candidates and the integrity of the vote. The ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed overall satisfaction with the regulation of campaign finances and the level of accountability and transparency ensured through the scrutiny by the CASC.

G. MEDIA

The media landscape is limited due to the small size of the population. The state-owned *Monaco Info* operates under public service obligations and is required to ensure objectivity, impartiality, accuracy and diversity in its programmes. In addition to local media, broadcast and print media from neighbouring France and Italy also provide some coverage of political developments in the Principality. The relevance of online media as a source of news continues to grow.

The Constitution guarantees freedom of expression; however, defamation of the royal family is prohibited by the Penal Code. Distribution of false and slanderous information is punishable by imprisonment up to two years. While there is no specific law on the role of the media during elections, the Ministerial Ordinance on campaign coverage on television (TV) serves as the primary legal instrument to ensure balanced coverage of the election campaign.²⁰

For these elections, the candidate lists are entitled to broadcast on *Monaco Info* four campaign clips of five minutes each during the official campaign period.²¹ These clips are aired five times a day thrice a week. Sequence and timing of the campaign broadcasts is determined by drawing lots.²² All contestants can buy political advertisements in the media. However, the ODIHR NAM was informed that due to a limited space on *Monaco Info*, paid political advertising would be rather limited or absent. Nonetheless, contestants may produce and circulate paid content via social networks, although campaign in Internet is not specifically regulated. In addition to free airtime, TV debates may be organized on *Monaco Info* following the consultation with the candidates willing to participate.

Majority of ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed overall satisfaction with general access to media and sufficient coverage of elections. According to few interlocutors, the local media are highly dependent on state subsidies, which results in mostly pro-government coverage of political developments, limited access to the media for those expressing critical views and fewer journalist research and investigative reporting offered to citizens.

H. COMPLAINTS AND APPEALS

Election dispute resolution is primarily regulated by the electoral law, including by provisions related to voter and candidate registration, campaigning, and the election results. Complaint proceedings regarding the media coverage and campaign finance are additionally regulated by respective legislation on these issues. Each voter or electoral contestant has the right to complain to the court of first instance whose decisions can be appealed to the court of appeals.

There is a 10-day deadline for adjudicating election-related complaints by the court of first instance, and up to one month for deciding a case on appeal. However, the electoral law provides for the consideration of a case as an "urgent matter" to ensure that relevant disputes are settled before election day. The law provides for elections to be annulled and repeated in the event of serious irregularities, although there are no strict criteria for this annulment. In such a case, new elections should take place

See Ministerial Ordinance No 2022-418 of 1 August 2022 on coverage of the election campaign on TV.

The production of these clips is funded from the state budget and is subject to oversight by a dedicated Coordinating Committee. Some prohibitions exist for campaign clips, including a ban on featuring the Royal Palace, the Palace of Justice, the national anthem and flag of the Principality.

Allocated unused time slots cannot be transferred or added to a different time slot or to another candidate.

within three months after a final court judgment is rendered. No ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed concerns related to election dispute resolution mechanism, adding that there is a longstanding tradition of well administered elections and that remedy is rarely needed.

IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

All ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed a high level of confidence in the electoral process as well as the ability of the election administration to manage the elections in a professional, impartial and transparent manner. No significant concerns were expressed relating to the respect for fundamental freedoms, the campaign environment and election day proceedings. While acknowledging a potential usefulness of an external assessment, most ODIHR NAM interlocutors noted lack of specific need for an observation activity for the upcoming elections. Based on these findings, the ODIHR NAM does not recommend an election-related activity for the 5 February 2023 parliamentary elections. ODIHR, however, reiterates that many of its previous recommendations remain unaddressed and stands ready to offer its assistance in a post-electoral follow-up process.

ANNEX: LIST OF MEETINGS

Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Co-operation

Isabelle Berro-Amadei, Government Counsellor-Minister

Lorenzo Ravano, Ambassador, Permanent Representative of the Principality of Monaco to the International Organizations in Vienna

Anaïs Kemblinsky-Fanjat, Secretary of External Relations, Foreign Relations Secretary

National Council

Brigitte Boccone-Pages, MP, President, *Primo! Priorité Monaco*Thomas Brezzo, MP, President of the Legislation Commission
Virginie Cotta, Head of Cabinet
Cédric Braquetti, General Secretary
Karine Marquet, International Affairs Officer, the President's Cabinet

City Hall

Georges Marsan, Mayor of Monaco Romain Druenne, Secretary General Sandrine Ostan Bonetti, Head, Legal Department

Judiciary

Françoise Barbier-Chassaing, President, the Court of First Instance Sébastien Biancheri, Judge, Court of First Instance Valérie Sagne, First Deputy Prosecutor General Virginie Sangiorgio, Chief Clerk

Campaign Accounts Supervisory Commission

Christian Descheemaeker, Chairperson Antoine Dinkel, Vice-President Julien Veglia, Secretary General

Political Associations

Béatrice Fresko-Rolfo, MP, *Horizon Monaco* Daniel Boeri, MP, Non-registered Monegasques

Media

Geneviève Berti, Director, Government Communication Department

International Community

Representatives of diplomatic missions of Norway and the Russian Federation²³

The ODIHR NAM extended an invitation to representations of all OSCE participating States resident in the Principality of Monaco.