

HDIM.NGO/0153/2017/EN 13 September 2017

# THE CONSTANTINOPOLITAN SOCIETY

GREEKS EXPATRIATED FROM ISTANBUL BY TURKISH COERCION

#### 2017 HUMAN DIMENSION IMPLEMENTATION MEETING

Warsaw, 11 September - 22 September 2017

Thursday, 14 September 2017

Working session 7: Tolerance and non-discrimination I, including:

- Combating racism, xenophobia, and discrimination
- Combating anti-Semitism and intolerance and discrimination against Christians, Muslims and members of other religions
- Prevention and responses to hate crimes in the OSCE area

### The Greek Minority in Turkey

#### **STATEMENT**

#### Introduction

We thank the OSCE and the Austrian Chairmanship for the opportunity to address our concerns about the actual implementation of OSCE human dimension commitments and identify further action which may be taken by Turkey, as participating State, regarding human rights of the Greek Minority in this country.

We represent the Constantinopolitan Society, a non - governmental / non - profit organization, established in 1928 in Greece by forcibly expatriated members of the Greek minority of Istanbul.

Our intervention will focus on the basic issues that are related to the human rights and religious freedoms of the Greek minority in Turkey, which have not yet been resolved and are in contrast with what is in effect internationally and with the EU criteria regarding the protection of the non - Muslim minorities of Turkey.

#### **General remarks**

Non-Muslim minorities in Turkey have suffered numerous injustices, as a result of discriminatory and oppressive state policies. With regard to the Greek minority in particular, these policies have led to the dramatic decline of the Greek population of Turkey, from over 100,000 in the 1950's to less than 2,000 at present.

Despite official reassuring statements, the Turkish government has failed to take decisive actions to make the necessary institutional and administrative reforms to reverse these conditions. Full respect for and protection of education, culture and fundamental rights in accordance with European standards have yet to be achieved.

The Turkish government continues to impose significant restrictions and serious limitations on human rights, thereby threatening the sustainable vitality, survival and future of the Greek minority in Turkey.

#### **Persisting shortcomings**

The Greek minority in Turkey is faced with persisting difficulties and problems, namely:

#### **Minority Foundations**

The property rights of the Greek Minority Foundations continue to be violated. Specifically, the Greek Minority's Foundations have suffered from massive confiscations of their properties. The government established a process by issuing a decree in 2011 to return some properties or pay compensation when return is not possible. Unfortunately, decree's scope is narrow and does not fully redress the magnitude of the damage inflicted, excluding some important categories of confiscated property. It is important to note that the Decree does not address the property of seized community foundations (mazbut vakif).

Further measures / actions would allow for:

- Putting an end to the fragmentation of minority Foundations (70 in number) as a result of the Wakifs system in force; in other words allowing for the unification of the various minority Foundations by establishing a Body of Coordination of minority Foundations, as a key to their survival, efficiency and cost effective functioning.
- Returning the archives and the library of 50.000 valuable volumes of the Hellenic Literary Society of Constantinople -which has been illegally confiscated in 1925- to a Greek Minority Foundation in Istanbul. This library represents the intellectual heritage of the Hellenism of Constantinople.

#### Suspension of the electoral process in minority foundations by the Turkish authorities

Over a period of 4 years (since January 2013), the elections within the minority foundations' administrations cannot be held, because the Turkish authorities has not yet issued new regulations. This *de facto* abolition on conducting of elections in all non-Muslim foundations by the General Directorate of Foundations openly breaches the Treaty of Lausanne, and in particular Article 40, concerning the right of management of charitable institutions from non-Muslim communities. It also violates the country's laws, seeing as the latest Foundations Act provides for the existence of Electoral Rules and for non-Muslim foundations to be run by elected bodies.

#### **Educational problems**

Despite some favorable regulations, Greek Minority schools still face a number of procedural difficulties and bureaucratic obstacles.

- Minority schools are still governed by the Law No. 5580 on Private Educational Institutions, they are treated as private schools and they continue to be listed as foreign schools. This prevents them from enrolling students above a certain quota and they are being deprived of state funds, despite the fact that it is foreseen by the Treaty of Lausanne.
- Anti-minority references continue to exist in schoolbooks used for teaching in Turkey.
   Turkish identity and nationalism are promoted as fundamental values in the education

system, while minority culture is ignored. While school books do not include information about Greek minority, its history and culture, some of them include discriminatory, xenophobic statements against it.

All these measures are limiting, among others, the fundamental right of free access to education and thus leading to the gradual disappearance of the minority schools protected under the Treaty of Lausanne.

Overall, Turkey has made no progress on ensuring cultural diversity and promoting respect for protection of minorities in accordance with international and European principles and standards.

#### **Denial of succession rights**

Turkey continues refusing the succession rights of members of the minority with Greek nationality, in particular following application by the Turkish authorities of the amended Land Registry Law, including their interpretation of the provisions on reciprocity. As regards reciprocity, the ECtHR held that there had been a violation of Article 1 of Protocol 1 (peaceful enjoyment of possessions) to the ECHR and ordered either the return of property or financial compensation be paid to the applicants. Implementation of the March 2010 recommendations of the Council of Europe Venice Commission on the protection of property rights is pending. A new law enforces the sale of property that is inherited, having essentially as a result the annulment of the succession right.

#### **Restrictions against the Individuals' Property Rights**

The descendants of expatriated minority Greeks are deprived of their hereditary rights and forced to liquidate or sell their properties.

The European Commission on Turkey 2016 Report, released in Nov. 9, 2016, in page 74 refers explicitly to the "problems that were reported for Greek nationals in inheriting and registering property, in particular following the Turkish authorities' implementation of the amended land registry law of 2012, which included a measure to limit the acquisition of property by Greek nationals".

In this context, not only the restitution of the Turkish Republic citizenship to Greek minority members living abroad should be facilitated, but Turkish authorities should primarily issue permanent residence and work permit to those who are willing to live in Turkey.

Turkey should ensure that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property, and Turkey conform to the relevant rulings of the European Court for Human Rights and implement its own Registry Law.

#### Other issues

#### **Discriminatory practices**

In 2010, the ECtHR ruled that a mandatory listing of religious affiliation on Turkish identification cards violated the European Convention. Thereafter, the Turkish parliament passed a law removing the requirement from the face of the cards. The new identification cards, which went into effect on January 2, 2017, do not show the holders' religious identification, although it is a non-required biodata point on the card's microchip. Minority communities remain concerned that a biodata field on religious affiliation could lead to discrimination if the field is left blank or lists a faith other than Islam.

All members of non-Muslim minorities continue to be treated by the Turkish authorities as "aliens". As a consequence, the members belonging to the non-Muslim minorities are excluded from posts in public sector and services, the police forces, the army or the judiciary.

#### **Closing statement**

This was only an indicative review of some of the challenges that the Greek minority continue to face in Turkey. They were by no means exhaustive; this would require a detailed account of the historic and religious background of the matters in question.

It should be noted that Turkey is a party to the UN International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), the UN Covenant on Economic, Social & Cultural Rights (ICESCR) and to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD). However, Turkey's reservations and declarations - pertaining to the rights of minorities, the right to education, etc. - upon the ratification of these Covenants and Convention, continue to be causes for concern.

Turkey is called upon to take seriously into consideration the recommendations by EU and international organizations pertaining to human rights and act upon them and make more strenuous efforts to prevent discrimination and intolerance.

The Turkish government should not only abide fully by its constitutional and international obligations, as far as the protection of human and minority rights is concerned, but rather initiate measures and policies of affirmative action that would guarantee the survival, the well-being and the future of the Greek Minority.

As a concluding remark, we would like to underline that respect for human and minority rights is a responsibility for every State. It is not a matter that statements of good intentions alone can address. It calls for firm will, constructive dialogue and continuity of effort.

Finally, every process is judged by the real and measurable outcome it brings to a challenging situation.\_



#### THE CONSTANTINOPOLITAN SOCIETY

GREEKS EXPATRIATED FROM ISTANBUL BY TURKISH COERCION

#### 2017 HUMAN DIMENSION IMPLEMENTATION MEETING

Warsaw, 11 September - 22 September 2017

Thursday, 14 September 2017

Working session 7: Tolerance and non-discrimination I, including:

- Combating racism, xenophobia, and discrimination
- Combating anti-Semitism and intolerance and discrimination against Christians, Muslims and members of other religions
- Prevention and responses to hate crimes in the OSCE area

## The Greek Minority in Turkey

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS TO OSCE / ODIHR**

Due to significant restrictions and serious limitations on human rights which are threatening the sustainable vitality, survival and vibrant future of the Greek Minority in Turkey, OSCE / ODHIR are called upon to urge Turkey -as OSCE participating State- to:

#### **Property rights**

- Issue immediately new regulations for the arbitrarily suspended elections within the minority foundations and permit conduct of elections of board members in all foundations.
- Put an end to the fragmentation of minority Foundations (70 in number), thus allowing
  for the unification of the various minority Foundations by establishing a Body of
  Coordination of minority Foundations, as a key to their survival, efficiency and cost effective functioning.
- Solve the question of property that was seized and sold to third parties.
- Return the archives and the library of 50,000 valuable volumes of the Hellenic Literary Society of Constantinople- which has been illegally confiscated in 1925- to a Greek Minority Foundation in Istanbul. This library represents the intellectual heritage of the Hellenism of Constantinople.

• Ensuring that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property, by implementing as of March 2010 recommendations of the Council of Europe Venice Commission on the protection of property rights. Turkey should conform to the relevant rulings of the European Court for Human Rights.

#### **Educational rights**

- Amend the Law on Private Schools Education, so as the diplomas of students of European and other nationalities are officially recognized and validated for their admittance in Turkish Universities etc.
- Facilitate the approval of textbooks used by Greek minority schools through a simple and speedy process.
- Support financially minority schools, as it is foreseen by the 1923 Lausanne Treaty.
- Delete all anti-minority references from schoolbooks used for teaching in Turkey, as it forges historic realities, fosters discriminatory behavior against members of the minority and incites hate actions.

#### Human rights, non-discrimination issues

- Restitute Turkish Republic citizenship to Greek minority members living abroad and issue permanent residence and work permit to those who are willing to return to Turkey.
- Ensure that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property.
- Fully implement the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and interpret the 1923 Lausanne Treaty so as to provide equal rights to the Greek Minority in Turkey.
- Sign and ratify the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM) of the Council of Europe.

Overall, Turkey is called upon to take seriously into consideration the recommendations by EU and international organizations pertaining to human rights and act upon them and make more strenuous efforts to prevent discrimination and intolerance.\_