

# **ESTONIA**

## PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS 1 March 2015

## OSCE/ODIHR NEEDS ASSESSMENT MISSION REPORT 19-21 January 2015



Warsaw 9 February 2015

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	.1
II.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	.1
III.	FINDINGS	.3
A.	BACKGROUND	. 3
B.	ELECTORAL SYSTEM	
C.	Legal Framework	. 4
D.	ELECTION ADMINISTRATION	
E.	VOTER REGISTRATION	
F.	CANDIDATE REGISTRATION	
G.	INTERNET VOTING	. 6
H.	CAMPAIGN AND POLITICAL FINANCE	. 7
I.	Media	. 8
J.	NATIONAL MINORITIES	. 9
IV.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	.9
ANNEX: LIST OF MEETINGS10		

#### ESTONIA PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS 1 March 2015

#### OSCE/ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report 19-21 January 2015

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Following an invitation from the Permanent Mission of the Republic of Estonia to the OSCE to observe the 1 March 2015 parliamentary elections and in accordance with its mandate, the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (OSCE/ODIHR) undertook a Needs Assessment Mission (NAM) from 19 to 21 January. The NAM was composed of Steven Martin, OSCE/ODIHR Senior Adviser on New Voting Technologies, Alexander Shlyk, OSCE/ODIHR Election Adviser, and Oleksii Lychkovakh, OSCE/ODIHR Election Adviser.

The purpose of the mission was to assess the pre-election environment and the preparations for the parliamentary elections. Based on this assessment, the NAM should recommend whether to deploy an OSCE/ODIHR election-related activity for the forthcoming elections, and if so, what type of activity best meets the identified needs. Meetings were held with officials from state institutions and the election administration, as well as with representatives of political parties, media, and civil society. A list of meetings is annexed to this report.

The OSCE/ODIHR would like to thank the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the National Electoral Committee for their assistance and co-operation in organizing the visit. The OSCE/ODIHR would also like to thank all of its interlocutors for having taken the time to meet with the mission and sharing their views.

#### II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On 1 March, voters will elect 101 members of the *Riigikogu* (parliament) for a 4-year term in 12 multi-member electoral districts by proportional representation with open lists. A nationwide 5 per cent threshold for entry into the parliament is in place.

Some amendments have been introduced to the electoral legislation since the 2011 elections. In particular, the Election Act was amended to further detail provisions pertaining to Internet voting as well as to extend some timelines related to the organization of elections and for the consideration of complaints. While these changes partly addressed previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendations, some previous recommendations remain unaddressed. Specifically, the disenfranchisement of citizens imprisoned for criminal offences, prohibition of outdoor political advertisement, and the limitations on participation of national minorities in parliamentary elections remain. Interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM expressed general confidence in the legal framework as a solid basis for conducting democratic elections.

Elections are administered by electoral committees at three levels: the National Electoral Committee (NEC), 17 County and City Electoral Committees, and 547 Division Committees. All interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM expressed full confidence in the impartiality and professionalism of the election administration.

Citizens who have attained 18 years of age by election day have the right to vote. Individuals who have been deprived of their legal capacity by a court decision and prisoners who have been convicted of any criminal offence are deprived of the right to vote.

Citizens of at least 21 years of age who have the right to vote are eligible to stand as candidates either through nomination by a registered political party or independently. The NEC registered a total of 863 candidates from 10 political parties, as well as 11 independents, for the upcoming elections.

Starting in 2005, Estonia was the first OSCE participating State to give all eligible voters the possibility to vote via the Internet. Voters can cast their ballots online during early voting from the tenth to the fourth day prior to election day. Following previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendations, a number of amendments were introduced to the Election Act to further regulate and consolidate aspects of Internet voting and to establish an Electronic Voting Committee (EVC) to prepare and organize Internet voting. In partially addressing another OSCE/ODIHR recommendation, the NEC introduced a verification process for voters to confirm that an online vote was cast as intended and recorded as cast. Most OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed full confidence in the Internet voting system and its administration by the NEC, although several political parties remain sceptical with regard to overall security of Internet voting.

Both the Political Parties Financing Surveillance Committee (PPFSC) and the political parties expressed an overall satisfaction with the system and oversight of political and campaign finance. Some interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM pointed out that the PPFSC may lack resources and have limited access to the information on the services provided to the electoral contestants by third parties, and noted that the co-ordination between the PPFSC and law enforcement agencies might have scope for improvement. A number of OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors highlighted the issue of possible misuse of administrative resources during the campaign.

Estonia's media environment is open and pluralistic. The Broadcasting Council can receive and consider complaints with regard to the activities of the public broadcaster. Disputes over media coverage by the private outlets are addressed to the Press Council, a consultative body comprised of the chief editors of the major media outlets. All OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed their trust in the neutrality of the Press Council as a self-regulatory body and highlighted its effectiveness.

Individuals with undetermined citizenship still constitute some 5.9 per cent of the total registered population and are not allowed to vote nor stand for office in the parliamentary elections. The NEC informed the OSCE/ODIHR NAM that it disseminates voter education information in national minority languages. However, the interface of the application used for Internet voting remains solely in Estonian, as does the website of the NEC.

The OSCE/ODIHR NAM noted full stakeholder confidence in the integrity of the electoral process and the professionalism and impartiality of the election administration. The existence of a wide range of political parties and media contributes to a pluralistic election environment. Considering the significance attributed by interlocutors to Internet voting, as well as the scope and significance of the amendments introduced to regulate this method of voting, the OSCE/ODIHR NAM sees benefit in undertaking a more in-depth assessment of Internet voting, accompanying legal provisions and their implementation, as well as the impact of recent changes. In light of the views shared by interlocutors concerning political party and campaign financing, further review of the existing regulations and implementation could be of added value. In addition, the participation of national minorities in the electoral process may benefit from further scrutiny. The majority of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors welcomed the presence of an OSCE/ODIHR observation activity as a way to further improve the electoral process. Accordingly, the OSCE/ODIHR NAM recommends the deployment of an Election Expert Team for the upcoming parliamentary elections to specifically assess Internet voting, the regulation and practice related to political party and campaign finance and the participation of national minorities.

#### III. FINDINGS

#### A. BACKGROUND

Estonia is a parliamentary republic with legislative authority exercised by a unicameral *Riigikogu* (parliament). The president is elected by the parliament for a five-year term and nominates the prime minister for approval by the parliament.

Following the 6 March 2011 parliamentary elections, four political parties gained representation in the parliament. The Reform Party obtained the largest number of seats (33), followed by the Center Party (26), the Union of *Pro Patria* and *Res Publica* (23), and the Social Democratic Party (19). Subsequently five deputies left the Center Party faction and one left the faction of the Union of *Pro Patria* and *Res Publica* to sit as independents. The Reform Party initially formed a coalition government with the Union of *Pro Patria* and *Res Publica*, however, in March 2014, it was dissolved and the Reform Party partnered with the Social Democratic Party.

The OSCE/ODIHR has previously observed four elections in Estonia since 1995.<sup>1</sup> For the 6 March 2011 elections, the OSCE/ODIHR deployed an Election Assessment Mission, which concluded that the elections "were conducted in an environment characterized by respect for fundamental rights and freedoms and a high degree of trust in the impartiality of the election administration."

#### **B. ELECTORAL SYSTEM**

On 1 March, voters will elect 101 members of the parliament for a 4-year term in 12 multi-member electoral districts by proportional representation with open-lists. A nationwide five-per cent threshold for entry into the parliament is in place. The number of mandates in each constituency is determined on the basis of the number of registered voters in each constituency and ranges from 5 to 14.

Mandates are allocated in three steps. Initially, individual mandates are distributed among candidates who reach the simple quota (the number of valid votes divided by the number of mandates) in the district. Parties that exceed the five per cent threshold nationwide participate in a further distribution of seats, with the positions of candidates on district party lists re-ordered in line with the number of votes each candidate received. Each party receives as many district mandates as the number of times the total number of votes cast for the candidates on the district party list exceeds the simple quota. Finally, the remaining seats are distributed at the national level using a version of the *d'Hondt* method.

1

All previous OSCE/ODIHR reports on Estonia can be found at: http://www.osce.org/odihr/elections/estonia.

#### C. LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Parliamentary elections are regulated primarily by the 1992 Constitution and the 2002 *Riigikogu* Election Act. Other applicable laws include the Political Parties Act, Media Services Act, National Broadcasting Act, Constitutional Review Court Procedure Act, Penal Code and Code of Misdemeanour Procedure. These laws are complemented by regulations and decrees of the National Electoral Committee (NEC). Interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM expressed general confidence in the legal framework as a solid basis for conducting democratic elections.

Some amendments have been introduced to the electoral legislation since the 2011 elections. In particular, the Election Act was amended in 2012 and 2014 to further detail provisions pertaining to Internet voting as well as to extend some timelines related to the organization of elections and for the consideration of complaints. While these changes partly addressed previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendations, some previous recommendations remain unaddressed. Specifically, the disenfranchisement of citizens imprisoned for criminal offences, prohibition of outdoor political advertisement, and the limitations on participation of national minorities in parliamentary elections remain.

The Political Parties Act was also amended since the 2011 elections, most significantly in 2013, and some amendments introduced in 2010 and 2011 came into force after the 2011 elections. The number of supporters needed to establish a political party was lowered from 1,000 to 500, which was welcomed by a number of OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors. After the 2011 elections, the Political Parties Financing Surveillance Committee (PPFSC) assumed oversight of political party and campaign finance.

The Election Act provides for full access of citizen and international observers to the electoral process. A number of civil society organizations provided comments on the draft amendments to the electoral legal framework and are planning to observe the upcoming elections and publish weekly reports. Some political parties are also planning to deploy their agents to the polling stations on election day.

#### **D. ELECTION ADMINISTRATION**

Elections are administered by electoral committees at three levels: the NEC, 17 County and City Electoral Committees (CCECs),<sup>2</sup> and 547 Division Committees. The NEC and the CCECs have four-year terms, while Division Committees are appointed anew for each election. Regulations of the NEC, together with resolutions and instructions of higher-level committees, are binding for lower level committees. Decisions of the lower-level committees can be challenged with the higher-level ones, and the decisions of the NEC can be appealed to the Supreme Court.

The NEC comprises seven members appointed by the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court (two members), and one each from the Chancellor of Justice, the Auditor General, the Chief Public Prosecutor, the Secretaries of the Parliament Chancellery and of the State Chancellery. NEC members elect a chairperson and a deputy from amongst themselves.

CCECs comprise up to 13 members appointed by county governors or city councils based on proposal of the county/city secretaries who chair the CCECs. Members of the CCECs elect deputy chairpersons from amongst themselves.

<sup>2</sup> 

The cities are Tallinn and Tartu.

The Division Committees administer elections at the polling station level and include up to nine members. Half of the members are nominated by rural municipalities or city secretaries and the rest by political parties taking part in the elections. The chairperson and members are appointed by local government councils. The Election Act mandates that the "principle of political balance" is observed during formation of these committees.

All interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM expressed full confidence in the impartiality and professionalism of the election administration.

#### **E. VOTER REGISTRATION**

Citizens who have attained 18 years of age by election day have the right to vote. Individuals who have been deprived of their legal capacity by a court decision and prisoners who have been convicted of any criminal offence are deprived of the right to vote. The list of citizens permanently living abroad, which is kept by the Population Registration Bureau, will be sent to the diplomatic missions. No OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors raised concerns with regard to voter registration.

The OSCE/ODIHR NAM was informed, however, about several cases lodged with the Constitutional Review Chamber of the Supreme Court with regard to the disenfranchisement of prisoners regardless of the nature of their conviction. Despite the Supreme Court's call on the parliament to consider the issue, the parliament has not addressed it since the 2011 elections. Some interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM expected that this issue may become a subject of complaint during the upcoming elections.

#### F. CANDIDATE REGISTRATION

In accordance with the Election Act, citizens of at least 21 years of age who have the right to vote are eligible to stand as candidates either through nomination by a registered political party or independently. The NEC registered a total of 863 candidates from 10 political parties, as well as 11 independents, for the upcoming elections.

Each political party can nominate up to two more candidates per constituency list as compared to the number of available seats. Six parties (four parliamentary and two non-parliamentary) nominated the maximum possible number of 125 candidates throughout the country.

Every candidate is required to pay a deposit to be registered. The amount of this deposit was decreased from two minimum monthly salaries to one (EUR 355 in 2015), which followed a previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendation. Deposits are reimbursed to candidates who are elected or receive at least half of the simple quota in the electoral district or to a political party that receives at least five per cent of the votes nationally.

Political party interlocutors informed the OSCE/ODIHR NAM that while they strive to increase the participation of women as candidates, women remain underrepresented on party lists, especially in winnable positions. Overall, parties did not report any problems with the registration of their candidates for the upcoming elections.

#### G. INTERNET VOTING

Starting in 2005, Estonia was the first OSCE participating State to give all eligible voters the possibility to vote via the Internet.<sup>3</sup> Voters can cast their ballots online during early voting from the tenth to the fourth day prior to election day. The Internet voting system relies on activated identity document cards that offer a possibility of digital identification and authentication, including via mobile phones with specially enabled SIM cards. Electronic identity documents are widely used by the citizens to access to a range of e-government services.

Secrecy of votes cast online is protected through the use of a process that can be compared to the 'double envelope' system used in postal voting.<sup>4</sup> As an additional secrecy protection measure, voters can cast their vote via the Internet as many times as they wish during the Internet voting period or cancel it by casting a paper ballot at a polling station during the seven-day period of early voting.

Encrypted votes are transferred to an offline vote counting server. Only the last vote is processed (or cancelled if a voter cast a paper ballot during early voting). Votes are then sorted by constituency, and voters' digital signatures are removed and stored separately to preserve the secrecy of the vote. Subsequently, the encrypted votes are decrypted using the NEC's key and counted. The generation of the key and its management by the NEC is one of the critical processes to ensure the overall end-to-end security of the system.

Following previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendations, a number of amendments were introduced to the Election Act to further regulate and consolidate aspects of Internet voting. One new chapter describes the general principles and procedures for Internet voting. In addition, the NEC issued a special decree to regulate Internet voting.

Following amendments since the 2011 elections, the Election Act formally establishes an Electronic Voting Committee (EVC) under the auspices of the NEC and regulates its activities of preparation and organization of Internet voting. The EVC comprises up to seven members who are appointed by the NEC. It is currently composed of seven members who were all appointed, according to the NEC, on the basis of their technical expertise. While OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors pointed out that establishment of the EVC aims to enhance the oversight of Internet voting in line with a previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendation, the effectiveness and scope of the EVC's activities remain to be assessed.

In partially addressing another OSCE/ODIHR recommendation, the NEC introduced a verification process for voters to confirm that an online vote was cast as intended and recorded as cast.<sup>5</sup> Verification is done using a separate smart device (mobile phone or tablet), which reads a code displayed on the screen upon the completion of voting and temporarily displays the voter's choice.

Since the last parliamentary elections, the NEC has facilitated a number of tests and other scrutiny exercises for the Internet voting system. This includes publishing the source code and initiating

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> During the 2011 parliamentary elections, 140,846 votes, or 24.3 per cent of all valid votes, were cast via the Internet. During the 2014 European Parliament elections, the share of the votes cast via the Internet among all valid votes cast reached 31.3 per cent. See <u>http://www.vvk.ee/voting-methods-in-estonia/engindex/statistics/</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In the 'double envelope' system, the completed ballot has no information about the voter and is sealed in an envelope. This is placed inside another envelope that identifies the voter. After the eligibility of the voter is confirmed, the outer envelope is opened and the ballot is placed into the ballot box.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> End-to-end verifiability consist of three steps: cast as intended, recorded as cast and counted as recorded.

discussions with outside experts on potential vulnerabilities.<sup>6</sup> Amendments in 2014 prescribe obligatory testing and more stringent requirements for auditing of the Internet voting system. However, despite a previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendation, there remain no provisions to formally certify the system by an independent organization.

According to the NEC, to further transparency of the process, video recordings of EVC meetings and all procedures related to Internet voting will be available online. In addition, while observers or party/candidate agents are permitted to observe all stages of Internet voting, the NEC requires they attend its week-long training session on Internet voting. Most OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed full confidence in the Internet voting system and its administration by the NEC, although several political parties remain sceptical with regard to overall security of the Internet voting.

#### H. CAMPAIGN AND POLITICAL FINANCE

In accordance with the Election Act, the official campaign period started upon the registration of candidates by the NEC on 21 January. The prohibition of outdoor political advertisement during the official campaign period was questioned by the Chancellor of Justice after its adoption in 2005, and the Supreme Court deemed that it is not in conflict with the Constitution. The matter has not since been formally raised.

Political parties informed the OSCE/ODIHR NAM that they intend to set up campaign tents and use leafleting and door-to-door visits to reach out to voters. Topics such as European and national security, economic development and social assistance, as well as the reform of state institutions, are expected to dominate the pre-election campaign. All OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors highlighted the importance of campaigning online, including the extensive use of social media.

The Political Parties Act is the primary law regulating campaign financing. Public funding of political parties is provided, and private donations from natural persons are permitted. In-kind donations and loans are also permitted by the law. Anonymous donations and those from national and foreign legal entities are forbidden. The law does not provide for limits on campaign expenditure.

According to the law, parliamentary parties, as well as any party that obtained at least one per cent of the votes cast in the latest elections are eligible to receive state support. Some OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors took issue with the parliamentary parties receiving greater state support compared to the other parties.

Several amendments introduced in 2010 only came into force after the last parliamentary elections and are applicable for the first time.<sup>7</sup> Amendments include a prohibition on the use of public resources for campaigning apart from those specifically provided by the state, expanded provisions regulating donations, and more detailed and regular reporting requirements by parties.

The PPFSC is tasked with oversight of political party and campaign finance and political parties are required to submit their quarterly and annual reports to the PPFSC for review. Both the PPFSC and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> This pertains to the server-side source code, although the NEC explained that certain parts of it were not published for security reasons.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> In its 2012 Compliance Report on Estonia on Transparency of Party Funding (p.13), the Group of States against Corruption (GRECO) of the Council of Europe noted "remarkable progress" made since the 2008 evaluation. It encouraged Estonian authorities "to ensure that the new regulations and mechanisms are fully operational and effective in practice and to keep their functioning under review." See <a href="http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/greco/evaluations/round3/GrecoRC3(2012)1">http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/greco/evaluations/round3/GrecoRC3(2012)1</a> Second Estonia EN.pdf.

Page: 8

the political parties expressed an overall satisfaction with the system and oversight of political and campaign finance. Some interlocutors of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM pointed out that the PPFSC may lack resources and have limited access to the information on the services provided to the electoral contestants by third parties, and noted that the co-ordination between the PPFSC and law enforcement agencies might have scope for improvement.

A number of OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors highlighted the issue of possible misuse of administrative resources during the campaign. Specifically, they highlighted concern that some municipal authorities, in particular in Tallinn, organize and sponsor public events that may benefit certain political parties. Many referred to a recently released report of the National Audit Office on the 2013 local elections, which specifically highlighted the use of public resources during for political benefit.<sup>8</sup> However, OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors also pointed out that while such instances are especially pronounced in larger cities, similar cases also occur in smaller municipalities.

#### I. MEDIA

Estonia's media environment is open and pluralistic. The national broadcaster (ERR) comprises *Eesti Televisioon* and *Eesti Raadio* and is regulated by the National Broadcasting Act, which establishes a Broadcasting Council and tasks it with oversight of the ERR activities. Private media, including such television channels as *Kanal 2* and TV3, which that enjoy the largest viewership, and a broad range of radio stations are largely unregulated in terms of coverage of elections and campaigning.

The Broadcasting Council consists of eight members appointed by the parliament – each faction is represented by one council member and four other members are media experts. The National Broadcasting Act specifies that ERR programming is to be politically balanced, in particular during the official campaign period. Political party representatives that the OSCE/ODIHR NAM met with expressed no concerns with regard to access to the media or the amount of coverage they receive.

The Broadcasting Council, together with the ethics advisor of the ERR, can receive and consider complaints with regard to the activities of the public broadcaster. Disputes over media coverage by the private outlets are addressed to the Press Council, a consultative body comprised of the chief editors of the major media outlets. All OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors expressed their trust in the neutrality of the Press Council as a self-regulatory body and highlighted its effectiveness.

The ERR is planning to hold six thematic debates among the political parties contesting the elections. Three debates will include the six parties that nominated the maximum number of candidates, two debates will be among the other four parties contesting the elections, and the final debate among party leaders will also separate the parties as per the other debates but will be aired on the same day. Broadcasts of all debates will be repeated with Russian-language subtitles on the second channel of the ERR, and a separate debate among the political parties will be held in Russian. The ERR also plans to conduct interviews with all independent candidates. A number of private media outlets, including television and radio stations, as well as online media, are also planning to organize debates among political parties throughout the campaign period.

There are several daily and weekly newspapers in both Estonian and Russian. *Postimees* and *Eesti Paevaleht* are the two largest non-tabloid papers with estimated readerships of 240,000 and

<sup>8</sup> 

Summary of the National Audit Office report from 13 January 2015 is available at: <u>http://www.riigikontroll.ee/DesktopModules/DigiDetail/FileDownloader.aspx?AuditId=2342&FileId=13258</u>.

120,000, respectively. The Russian language service of *Delfi* is the most popular Russian language news source, followed by the Russian edition and website of *Postimees*. There is no licensing of print media in Estonia.

#### J. NATIONAL MINORITIES

According to the Ministry of Interior, as of 1 January 2015, there were 1,350,548 people registered in Estonia. Of them, 1,143,183 are Estonian citizens (an additional 100,800 Estonian citizens live abroad), 114,371 are citizens of other countries (including 92,338 citizens of Russian Federation), and 85,312 are residents with undetermined citizenship.<sup>9</sup>

The rate of naturalization has remained steady at between 1,300–1,500 people per year since the 2011 parliamentary elections. Individuals with undetermined citizenship still, however, constitute some 5.9 per cent of the total registered population and are not allowed to vote nor stand for office in the parliamentary elections.<sup>10</sup> In 2014, the parliament passed an amendment proposed by the Chancellor of Justice that eases the citizenship application process for minors whose legal guardians have not applied for a residence permit on their behalf before they reached the age of 15, but who have been living in Estonia for at least eight years. Previously, a written request by at least one parent (or legal guardian) was necessary for a minor to receive citizenship by naturalization.

The NEC informed the OSCE/ODIHR NAM that it disseminates voter education information in national minority languages, including publishing instructions on Internet voting in English and Russian. However, the Internet voting application interface remains solely in Estonian. Political party representatives also informed the OSCE/ODIHR NAM about their efforts to include representatives of national minorities in their candidate lists.

#### IV. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The OSCE/ODIHR NAM noted full stakeholder confidence in the integrity of the electoral process and the professionalism and impartiality of the election administration. The existence of a wide range of political parties and media contributes to a pluralistic election environment. Considering the significance attributed by interlocutors to Internet voting, as well as the scope and significance of the amendments introduced to regulate this method of voting, the OSCE/ODIHR NAM sees benefit in undertaking a more in-depth assessment of Internet voting, accompanying legal provisions and their implementation, as well as the impact of recent changes. In light of the views shared by interlocutors concerning political party and campaign financing, further review of the existing regulations and implementation could be of added value. In addition, the participation of national minorities in the electoral process may benefit from further scrutiny. The majority of the OSCE/ODIHR NAM interlocutors welcomed the presence of an OSCE/ODIHR observation activity as a way to further improve the electoral process. Accordingly, the OSCE/ODIHR NAM recommends the deployment of an Election Expert Team for the upcoming parliamentary elections to specifically assess Internet voting, the regulation and practice related to political party and campaign finance, and the participation of national minorities.

<sup>9</sup> See <u>http://estonia.eu/about-estonia/society/citizenship.html</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> They are allowed to vote, but not stand for office, in local government elections.

#### **ANNEX: LIST OF MEETINGS**

#### **Officials**

#### **Ministry of Foreign Affairs**

Karmen Laus, Director of Division of International Organizations Peeter Püvi, Lawyer, Consular Department,

#### Office of the Chancellor of Justice

Nele Parrest, Deputy Chancellor of Justice Kertti Pilvik, Head of International Relation Liina Lust, Senior Adviser

#### **National Electoral Committee**

Alo Heinsalu, Chairperson Priit Vinkel, Head of Secretariat Epp Maaten, Deputy Chairperson, Electronic Voting Committee

#### **Political Party Financing Surveillance Committee**

Ardo Ojasalu, Chairman Zoja Masso, Auditor Liis Ipsberg, Lawyer

**Constitutional Review Chamber of the Supreme Court of Estonia** Katri Jaanimägi, Counsellor

#### **Political Party Representatives**

**Centre Party of Estonia** Mailis Reps, MP

**Estonian Conservative Party** Martin Helme, Deputy Chairperson

## Estonian Reform Party

Rait Maruste, MP Paul-Eerik Rummo, MP

**Social Democratic Party of Estonia** Indrek Saar, MP

**Union of** *Pro Patria* and *Res Publica* Urmas Reinsalu, MP

#### Media Representatives

**Estonian Broadcasting Council** Margus Allikmaa, Chairperson Ainar Ruussaar, Member

#### Estonia Parliamentary Elections 2015 OSCE/ODIHR Needs Assessment Mission Report

#### **Estonian National Broadcaster**

Andres Kuusk, Head of the Programme Department

#### **Postimees** Newspaper

Argo Ideon, Political and Economic Analyst

#### **Civil Society Representatives**

Legal Information Center for Human Rights Aleksei Semjonov, Director

**Network of Estonian Nonprofit Organizations** Maris Jõgeva, Executive Director

#### **Open Estonia Foundation**

Andrei Liimets, Project Co-ordinator