

## COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS

*(Covering Working Sessions 1-3)*

*This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is organized by Working Sessions and by what was submitted by Delegations / International Organizations / NGOs to participating States and, separately, to OSCE Institutions / Field Missions or other International Organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language. This compilation contains recommendations from all documents received at the HDIM Documentation Centre by the end of Working Session 3; documents received after this time will be included later in the Consolidated Summary.*

**Monday, 23 September 2013**

### **Opening Plenary Session**

Recommendations to participating States

#### **OSCE Parliamentary Assembly**

- All states must make efforts to make schools inclusive and desegregated. They must ensure all citizens have equal access to education. Curricula must be scrutinized and changed to ensure balanced and non-discriminatory coverage; particularly in the subjects of history and religious studies. It is the view of the Parliamentary Assembly, as stated in the resolution that more must be done to develop new educational materials, along with extra-curricular activities, in the name of tolerance and social cohesion. We must invest in training our educators to challenge intolerance in the classroom. To end intolerance, the focus clearly has to be on youth. Discrimination is learned behavior, as no child is born intolerant or racist. Classrooms, but also the media, are they key areas where racism and xenophobia must be challenged.

Recommendations for International Organizations

#### **Russian Federation**

- Мы призываем ВКНМ более активно работать над исправлением ситуации в странах Прибалтики. Надеемся, что новый Верховный комиссар г-жа Астрид Торс добьется выполнения этими странами международных рекомендаций.

Recommendations to the OSCE

#### **Russian Federation**

- Россия давно требует навести порядок в работе БДИПЧ по наблюдению за выборами. Сейчас она ведется избирательно, по неясным критериям и правилам.
- Подтверждаем наше предложение актуализировать устаревший мандат Представителя ОБСЕ по свободе СМИ. Он был принят в 1997 году, когда совсем другими были интернет, СМИ, журналисты и журналистика.

**Monday, 23 September 2013**

**WORKING SESSION 1: Tolerance and non-discrimination I**

## Recommendations to participating States

### **Switzerland**

Recommandation:

- La diversité des communautés est un atout qu'il faut sauvegarder et promouvoir. Nous recommandons aux Etats participants de poursuivre leurs efforts pour mettre en oeuvre leurs engagements et développer l'échange de bonnes pratiques.

### **Constantinopolitan Society**

Due to significant restrictions and serious limitations on human rights which are threatening the sustainable vitality, survival and vibrant future of the Greek Minority in Turkey, OSCE / ODHIR is called upon to urge Turkey as an OSCE participating State to:

#### ***Property rights***

- Properties of minority foundations registered in the 1936 Declarations should be returned, without precondition and bureaucratic obstacles, to their rightful owners. If there is any kind of dispute as for the ownership of a particular property, the burden of proof should lay on the state and not on the foundations.
- Amend the Law on non Muslim Welfare Foundations in such a way that would allow for, among others:
  - Putting an end to the fragmentation of minority Foundations as a result of the Wakifs system in force; allowing for the unification of the various Greek Minority Foundations is key to their survival as well as cost effective functioning.
  - Solving the question of property that was seized and sold to third parties, including by provide for proper compensations.
  - Recognizing the equality of the minority Foundations and all other Foundations, thus terminating discriminatory practices against them.
  - Returning the archives and the library of 50.000 valuable volumes of the Hellenic Literary Society of Constantinople (Ellinikos Filologikos Syllogos Konstantinoupoleos) –which has been illegally confiscated in 1925 to a Greek Minority Foundation in Istanbul. This library represents the intellectual heritage of the Hellenism of Constantinople.
- Ensure that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property, by implementing as of March 2010 recommendations of the Council of Europe Venice Commission on the protection of property rights. Turkey should conform to the relevant rulings of the European Court for Human Rights.

#### ***Educational rights***

- Lift all educational and administrative restrictions regarding the Greek Minority, specifically:
  - Amend the Law on Private Schools Education, so as the diplomas of students of European and other nationalities are officially recognized and validated for their admittance in Turkish Universities etc.

- Support financially minority schools, as it is foreseen by the Treaty of Lausanne.
- Eliminate all anti minority references in schoolbooks used for teaching in Turkey, as it forges historic realities, fosters discriminatory behavior against members of the minority and incites hate actions.

***Human rights, non discrimination in general***

- Turkey should ensure that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property.
- The Turkish authorities should abolish the confidential “race codes” given to the members of non Muslim minorities.
- Give effect to ECRI’s General Policy Recommendation N° 7 on National Legislation to combat Racism and Racial Discrimination (13/12/2002) and ratify promptly Protocol N° 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights.
- Turkey is called upon to take seriously into consideration the recommendations by EU and international organizations pertaining to human rights and act upon them and make more strenuous efforts to prevent discrimination, intolerance and religiously motivated acts of violence.

**Center for Information and Analysis (SOVA)**

Recommendations to the countries - members of the OSCE:

- There is a need to adopt and develop comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation or a series of individual acts containing effective rules and procedures of proving discrimination.
- When enforcing the laws relating to violations of the rules of entry and residence in the country, obtaining work permits, etc., officials should avoid making public statements linking these disorders with specific ethnic groups, and avoid holding large campaigns. Such enforcement should be carried out systematically and uniformly.
- Ethnic minorities of immigrant origin need to be considered on an equal footing with the minorities that are indigenous to the country, particularly in the context of practical integration programs.
- Freedom of speech presupposes the possibility of public expression of intolerance, and resistance to such intolerance should first take the form of counter-polemics and social stigma. It has to be recognized that widespread condemnation of manifestations of ethnic intolerance is the only truly effective method, as opposed to prosecution, which is also sometimes necessary, but is bound to remain extremely selective in this respect.
- Public officials should have no right to express publicly their intolerance or even disrespect to any minorities. Civil service legislation should include effective sanctions against such actions. These penalties also need to be made public.

**Turkische Akademiker Dresden**

Recommendations:

- German government must implement legal regulations against nationalism instead of evaluating it as extreme Right thought.

- German government must revise their Integration politics. Especially in the matter of Dual nationality right, education rights and social rights. New legal regulations and incentive activities should be organized for national minorities.
- German government must organize and support intercultural activities more, and must compensate intercultural academic researches more.

### **Public Union "Kyrgyz Indigo"**

#### ***Recommendations to Member States from Central Asia:***

- Decriminalize consensual sexual relations between men;
- Follow human rights based approach in policies, laws and programs and reaffirm that cultural, traditional and religious values can't justify any form of violence and discrimination against LGBTIQ;
- Eliminate any legal and policy limitations to freedom of assembly, association and expression of LGBTIQ;
- Introduce comprehensive laws, policies and mechanisms on the protection of LGBTIQ individuals from hate crime, violence and discrimination;
- Provide necessary remedies and support to victims of violence or hate crime on a basis of sexual orientation and gender identity;
- Introduce necessary laws and regulations that ease the procedures of changing gender markers and names in the passports for transgender people;
- Together with the civil society systematically monitor cases of violence, hate crime and discrimination against LGBTIQ;
- Criminalize, condemn and fight against police violence and brutality against LGBTI;

#### ***Recommendations to Other Member States:***

- Inform the country delegations and representatives from CA region about the urgency of responding to violence, hate crime and discrimination against LGBTIQ in the region;
- Actively condemn any policies and laws that criminalize consensual same sex sexual relationships, promote violence and discrimination against LGBTIQ;
- React to cases of violation of rights of LGBTIQ human rights defenders in CA and to individual cases;
- Share experiences and best practices of protecting the rights of LGBTIQ with the representatives of the Governments of Central Asia;

### **No Borders- Ukraine**

КПД обращается к странам-членам ОБСЕ с просьбой продолжить мониторинг выполнения Украиной своих обязательств в сфере недискриминации и рекомендовать ей немедленно внести изменения в антидискриминационное законодательство для обеспечения следующего:

- Наличия четкого определения основных понятий и полного перечня защищаемых характеристик в законе;
- Создания эффективного механизма обжалования дискриминации;
- Разработки базовых стандартов и принципов доказывания фактов дискриминации;

- Разработки образовательных и методологических материалов для правоохранительных органов и судей по работе с заявителями и рассмотрению дел связанных с нарушением равенства и дискриминацией;
- Создания и обеспечения эффективной работы национальной институции обеспечивающей защиту равенства и недискриминации.

КПД считает, что национальное законодательство должно отображать обязанность государства устанавливать и проводить позитивные меры по предупреждению дискриминации, так же как и по информированию граждан о том, что дискриминация недопустима и у них есть механизм защиты от нее. Для выполнения таких функций в государстве необходимо создание национальной институции обеспечивающей мониторинг соблюдения равенства и принципа недискриминации. Данные функции на сегодня возложены на Такой институцией на сегодня является офис Уполномоченного ВР по правам человека. Признавая работу Уполномоченного в сфере прав человека и принципа недискриминации офису Уполномоченного необходимы не только законодательное расширение полномочий и эффективный механизм, но и изменение подхода к проблеме дискриминации, который включал бы в себя более активную адвокацию защиты прав всех уязвимых групп и меньшинств, более тесное сотрудничество и консультации с гражданским обществом, и также системный подход к мониторингу не только отдельных проявлений дискриминации, но и законодательных инициатив и практики соблюдения норм в данной сфере.

### **Latvian Human Rights Committee**

For Latvia:

- To swiftly implement the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights and views of the UN Human Rights Committee, as well as to allow bringing individual communications under the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination;
- To withdraw the restrictive declarations to Articles 10 and 11, made while ratifying FCNM;
- To expand the possibility of dual citizenship, at least, to all OSCE participating states;
- To make the requirements for naturalization more flexible, in particular for those elderly, born in Latvia or married to Latvian citizens; to open it as a possibility for those excluded on basis of belonging to organizations dissolved in a non-judicial way.
- To grant voting rights in the local elections to all permanent residents;
- To reconsider the language policy based on wider use of minority languages as a medium of instruction in public education and as a means of communication with local authorities,
- To affirm the leading role of individual choice in the writing of personal names in documents, as long as Latvian alphabet is used;
- To ensure proportionality of government-imposed professional Latvian language requirements and to avoid their interference with the freedom of

association and freedom to conduct business, regarding the private sector, including NGOs.

- To recognize that a requirement by an employer for an employee to have a command a minority language can be justified, if there is a demand to services in that minority language (for jobs implying work with customers) or a need to use it in the own affairs of an enterprise.

### **Armenia**

Recommendations:

- strengthening monitoring of situation with national minorities and identify warning signs,
- establishment of close cooperation with ombudsmen offices aimed to assist them in protection of minority rights and dissemination of international standards in the field,
- inclusion of human rights education subject in school's curricula

### **International Civil Liberties Alliance**

- L'International Civil Liberties Alliance recommande aux états participants de veiller avec une attention accrue a ce que la lutte légitime contre les nationalismes agressifs ne se fasse pas au détriment du devoir d'égalité protection de toutes les catégories de populations. Devoir a maintes reprises réitéré dans les engagements pris par les états participants de l'OSCE.

### **Amnesty International**

Amnesty International is calling on all OSCE participating states to ensure that:

- Roma are not targeted with forced evictions, relocation to segregated and inadequate housing, and discriminated against in accessing social housing;
- Roma are not discriminated against in access to services such as water and electricity;
- Romani pupils are not segregated in Roma-only schools and classes or in special schools or classes for pupils with mild mental disabilities;
- State authorities, including the police, prevent and effectively and thoroughly investigate violent attacks against the Roma.

### **Center for Security Policy**

- Recommendation to ODIHR and Participating States to refrain from using these terms until they are precisely and officially defined and accepted by the consensus of all participating groups holding diverse views.

### *Recommendations to International Organizations*

#### **Georgia**

- The Government of Georgia urges the international organizations to duly assess Russia's illegal activities, and undertake appropriate measures in response to the deteriorating security and human rights situation, including, through activating human rights monitoring mechanisms.

### *Recommendations to the OSCE*

### **Turkische Akademiker Dresden**

Recommendations for OSCE:

- OSCE must advise and encourage Germany on their politics against Racism and Nationalism, and Integration.

### **International Human Rights Movement "World Without Nazism" - Russia**

- Вообще тема агрессивного национализма, расовой, религиозной, этнической и пр. дискриминации является темой отдельного разговора. Я призываю Швейцарию, которая принимает на себя скоро председательство в ОБСЕ созвать отдельную конференцию на эту тему в 2014 году.

### **Latvian Human Rights Committee**

For OSCE:

- To reaffirm its commitment to the use of minority languages in education, as expressed in the Hague Recommendations Regarding the Education Rights of National Minorities of 1996;
- To invite all participating states to swiftly implement the decisions of international human rights courts and quasi-judicial bodies in individual cases, as well as to join the communications procedures of human rights treaty bodies, if they have not already done so;
- To express recognition that, in order not to be discriminatory, professional language requirements, be they established by employers or governments and be they related to official or non-official languages, should respect proportionality; as regards those working in the private sector, governmental requirements should also respect freedom of association and freedom to conduct business, as well as be limited by public interests.

### **Center for Security Policy**

- Recommendation to ODIHR and Participating States to refrain from using these terms until they are precisely and officially defined and accepted by the consensus of all participating groups holding diverse views.

**Tuesday, 24 September 2013**

### **WORKING SESSION 2: Tolerance and non-discrimination II- Review of the implementation of commitments on promotion of mutual respect and understanding**

*Recommendations to participating States*

**Amaro Drom e.V.**

- We call upon the OSCE and all participating states to build comprehensive strategies and to enhance their efforts in combating antigypsyism, racism and hate speech especially among young people.
- We recommend to all stakeholders to invest into the empowerment, education

and capacity-building of Roma youth, through scholarships, human rights education and the support of youth self-organizations in order to promote tolerance and non-discrimination between Roma and non-Roma youth.

- We recommend to the OSCE to call upon its member states to recognize the Roma Genocide.
- We recommend to all participating states and civil society stakeholders to support remembrance and educational activities on 2 August as the Roma Genocide Remembrance Day.

### **Gustav Stresemann Stiftung e.V.**

The Stresemann Foundation recommends that the OSCE urge the participating States that:

- Human rights apply only to individuals, but do not protect a god, a religion or a prophet; only intolerance against human beings should thus be banned.
- Politicians of a constitutional state should not decide which opinions are allowed and which ones are forbidden; only an independent court can make a judgment on this.

### **OSCE Chairperson-in-Office**

- Participating States should draw more political attention to the extent of violence used in physical attacks on Muslim communities. The terrorist plots targeting several mosques in the UK and France are recent examples of this worrying trend, which we already observed in the Oslo massacre and the spate of neo-Nazi serial killings in Germany. The responses by governments and their political leadership to these incidents are commendable, but both OSCE institutions and participating States still need to do more to prevent the threats posed by violent organizations and individuals on the security of Muslims in North America and Europe.
- In addition to developing more comprehensive security policies, this would require enhanced co-operation between law enforcement officers and Muslim communities in combating hate crimes. However, anti-Muslim hate crimes remain significantly under-reported and under-recorded, because the victims have the perception that
- they will not be taken seriously by the police or some police officers have biased views about Muslims. Participating States should increase confidence in law enforcement by avoiding the practice of religious profiling, conducting training activities for police officers to deconstruct stereotypes against Muslims, promoting religious diversity in public services and institutionalizing co-operation with Muslim community-based organizations. In these efforts, special attention should be paid to the vulnerability of Muslim women to hate crimes.
- Furthermore, participating States should have a better understanding of the context when and how anti-Muslim hate crimes are being committed, because as indicated in ODIHR's annual hate crime reports, such crimes do not take place in a vacuum. There are a number of indicators concerning the motives behind these incidents suggesting that the perpetrators are influenced by the widespread prejudices and stereotypes about Muslims. Glorification and justification of hatred, such as the Oslo massacre, and the spread of conspiracy



theories against Muslims through the Internet should concern all of us and must be consistently countered across the OSCE region. To this end, political figures and the media should take the lead in raising awareness of intolerance against Muslims and promote mutual understanding through public campaigns and educational activities.

- But first and foremost, by preventing discriminatory practices against Muslims, especially violations of their freedom of religion or belief, States should send a clear message to the society that intolerance against Muslims is not acceptable. For this reason, governments should refrain from intervening in the religious matters of Muslims, in particular, in relation to the election of their religious leaders and appointment of imams. They should also ensure that any restriction to the manifestation of religion or belief does not lead to direct or indirect discrimination against a certain community. The issues concerning access to places of worship and wearing religious clothes should be resolved in accordance with the established international human rights standards and in a broad consultation with all stakeholders.
- During my country visits I have been pleased to observe that there is increasing civil society activism to combat intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. Government institutions should work closely with these NGOs and support their activities to prevent and respond to hate crimes as well as promote freedom of religion.
- I also strongly encourage participating States to draw on ODIHR's expertise in combating hate crimes and developing educational programmes to counter stereotypes. Since 2011, ODIHR has provided training seminars for NGOs on hate crimes against Muslims in a number of countries, including Bulgaria, Denmark, France, Germany and Spain. I hope that these activities will continue in the future. Moreover, since 2012, ODIHR has organized several regional roundtable meetings for government officials, experts and civil society representative to promote the Guidelines for Educators on Countering Intolerance against Muslims and collect recommendations from participants. I look forward to seeing the implementation of these recommendations.

## **Norway**

- First, states and international organisations should take effective measures to address and combat hate crime, hate speech and other forms of intolerance.
- Second, states should swiftly investigate and effectively sanction incidents of hate crime. They should provide access to justice and the right to remedy when appropriate.
- Third, states should enact legislation to combat intolerance, discrimination and violence against minorities, including through the Internet and social media. But they must at the same time safeguard other fundamental rights, particularly freedom of expression.
- Fourth, states should guarantee the systematic collection and analysis of data on hate crime, hate speech and other forms of intolerance, in order to ensure informed public debates and policy-making.
- Fifth, civil society organisations should contribute to the monitoring and reporting of discrimination and hate crime. They should provide practical assistance, such as legal advice and counselling. States should provide the necessary legal and political framework.

- Sixth, states and political leaders should implement national action plans to combat discrimination, hate crime and intolerance. It is of particular concern when negative stereotypes of minorities are ignored, or even condoned, by political leaders.
- Seventh, governments, politicians, national human rights institutions and civil society organisations should engage in debate on these issues and publicly condemn manifestations of hate and acts of violence.
- Eighth, in order to avoid duplication of efforts and secure the sharing of best practices, the Conference further recommended international cooperation in the search for new and more effective measures to counter right-wing extremism, hate crime, hate speech and other forms of intolerance.

### **United States of America**

At the Tirana Tolerance Conference earlier this year, we urged the OSCE community to move beyond meetings to *actions*. Specifically, we call upon the participating States to:

- **Support and fully utilize ODIHR's Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Unit.** The Tolerance Unit has received numerous requests for training in handling hate crimes and for support of ad hoc tolerance meetings in addition to the five annual human dimension meetings. Additionally, there are many calls for increased monitoring and capacity building tools to combat racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism, intolerance and discrimination against Muslims, violence and discrimination against LGBT persons, and violent extremism. Funding for the Tolerance Unit has declined in spite of its increasing workload. Providing increased funding for ODIHR within the unified budget and through extra-budgetary projects would support the current work of the Tolerance Unit and allow for its expansion in the face of growing intolerance.
- **Fulfill OSCE hate crimes commitments.** Despite the Athens Ministerial Decision on Combating Hate Crimes and the adoption of other related commitments, the OSCE Annual Hate Crimes report documented more than 1,300 bias-motivated crimes to date this year and more than 5,000 last year. Eight EU States have experienced increases in hate crimes, with several studies suggesting that hate crimes may be underreported by as much as 60 percent. In accordance with OSCE commitments, participating States should monitor and evaluate their national hate crimes policies and initiatives, provide disaggregated national hate crimes data to the Tolerance Unit, provide support to victims and ensure their access to justice, and use the Tolerance Unit capacity building measures as needed to improve current efforts.
- **Strengthen Efforts to combat anti-Semitism and intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.** Both anti-Semitism and intolerance and discrimination against Muslims are on the rise, as evidenced by physical assaults, desecration of cemeteries and places of worship, and defacement of Holocaust memorials. In my own country, nearly two out of three religion-based hate crimes are committed against Jews. In France, in 2012, the Jewish community recorded a 58 percent increase over the previous year in the number of anti-Semitic attacks. Developments such as these not only led the OSCE to hold this June its first experts' conference on the security of members of Jewish communities, but have also highlighted the need for participating States to review and strengthen efforts to combat anti-Semitism

as outlined in the Berlin Declaration. In Hungary, anti-Semitic rhetoric by Jobbik party leaders still sometimes goes unchallenged by the government. In Greece, the neo-Nazi party Golden Dawn has repeatedly been linked to anti-Semitic, anti-immigrant, and racist activities. Many similar political parties have resorted to political rhetoric against the Roma community and immigrants, especially those from Muslim countries, contributing to their societal exclusion and intimidation. In France in 2012, the Committee Against Islamophobia reported a 57 percent increase over the previous year in anti-Muslim acts. This year in the United Kingdom, in a two-week period alone after the shooting of a British soldier in London by an extremist Muslim, there were more than 16 attacks on mosques and other buildings. In Russia, the government conducted raids on mosques and detained hundreds of Muslims, raising concerns about the vagueness and broad application the extremism law. We welcome the steps the Polish government is taking to find a solution to allow the practice of ritual animal slaughter to continue in Poland, as it is an essential part of religious practice for many faiths, including Jews and Muslims who adhere to kosher and halal dietary laws. We encourage Poland to continue to work diligently to protect Jewish, Muslim, and other religious practices.

- **Strengthen efforts to promote religious tolerance, including toward Christians and members of other religions.** Onerous religious registration requirements and restrictive religion laws in several participating States discriminate against members of so-called *nontraditional* religions, including Protestants, Jehovah's Witnesses, Scientologists, and readers of Said Nursi. Consequently, some religious organizations were unable to legally build, rent, or purchase places of worship and their members faced harassment and even criminal charges because of their religion. We will discuss this in detail in Session 7.
- **Fulfill OSCE commitments relating to the human rights of Roma individuals, and support the Roma Action Plan.** We will discuss this in detail during next week's session.
- **Strengthen OSCE tools for combating racism and xenophobia.** In my own country, many hate crimes continue to be motivated by racial bias. In Greece, attacks on immigrants have been escalating, while Sweden has seen an increase in hate crimes against Roma individuals and persons of African origin. A barrage of racist discourse met the appointment of Italy's first Minister of African descent, Cécile Kyenge. It is regrettable, therefore, that no agreement was reached on a Ministerial Decision on Racism and Xenophobia last year. To mark the tenth anniversary of the OSCE's first *Conference on Tolerance and the Fight Against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination*, the participating States, in cooperation with ODIHR and other relevant OSCE institutions, should elaborate an Action Plan, and direct ODIHR to publish a report on racism and xenophobia in the OSCE region that includes a focus on African descendants. In light of the *European Network Against Racism* report detailing the high levels of discrimination faced by people of African descent and the many racially motivated murders and violent assaults against people of African origin reported in the OSCE Annual Hate Crimes Report, we also encourage ODIHR to continue and expand its hate crimes outreach, training, and monitoring efforts to communities of African descent in the OSCE region.
- **Condemn and combat violations of the human rights of all persons and**

**attacks on their inherent dignity, including the human rights and human dignity of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender individuals.** The brutal attacks on LGBT persons around the world and in the OSCE region are appalling and utterly unacceptable. These crimes should be condemned, thoroughly investigated and prosecuted by all participating States. It is deeply concerning when participating States, which have committed themselves under Principle VII of the Helsinki Final Act to respect the human rights of all human beings -- rights that derive from “the inherent dignity of the human person” -- take actions that contribute to an environment where violence against LGBT persons is tolerated and the exercise of fundamental freedoms by LGBT individuals and their supporters is criminalized. We are especially concerned about the anti-gay “propaganda” legislation being adopted and enforced in Russia and the concurrent rise in violence against LGBT persons there, and about the criminalization of homosexual acts in a number of participating States.

## **Turkey**

*Recommendations made by Turkey at the High-Level Conference on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination held in Tirana on 21-22 May 2013*

- Hostility and hate crimes against Muslims have had a serious impact on the sense of security among Muslim communities. We call on all participating States to take the necessary legal, administrative and educational measures to combat manifestations of anti-Muslim sentiment, including stereotypes and prejudice against Muslims.
- Participating States should intensify their exchange of best practices in combating intolerance and discrimination towards Muslims, including examples of good cooperation between Muslim communities and law enforcement officers in combating hate crimes against members of these communities.
- Participating States should step up their efforts in monitoring and reporting on hate crimes, including a more effective partnering with civil society as well as the collection of disaggregated data in order to shed more light on the extent of manifestations of hostility towards Muslims.
- Participating States should develop community projects that aim to provide around-the-clock support to victims of anti-Muslim hate crimes; participating States should also take measures to thoroughly address forms of intolerance and discrimination other than hate crimes experienced by Muslim communities.
- Participating States should develop training programs on Islamophobia for law enforcement officers, other public officials, as well as teachers, clergy and imams, requesting ODIHR to provide the necessary support if required.
- Participating States should support and increase funding for the work of the ODIHR and the three Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office on combating intolerance and discrimination.
- Participating States should make better use of ODIHR's capacity to raise awareness on intolerance, discrimination and xenophobia. Additional activities can be proposed by ODIHR, within its current

tasking, to tackle issues going beyond those addressed by current programs. ODIHR has the potential to do more, if provided with more resources.

- Participating States should initiate increased cooperation to address intolerant public discourse concerning Muslims, including by political leaders, in the media, and on the internet. In addition, ODIHR and the Representative on Freedom of the Media should enhance their collaboration in addressing anti-Muslim media activities, biased reporting and negative stereotyping.
- Participating States should consider possible avenues of cooperation and coordination in countering the growing cohesion and networking of across the OSCE area of groups promoting an Islamophobic agenda.

### **Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association**

Taking into consideration increasing xenophobic, racist and hate-motivated crimes as well as Islamophobic attacks against the ethnic Turkish and Muslim identities in the Western Thrace region of Greece, some examples of which are mentioned above, the Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association calls upon Greece to:

- comply fully with OSCE commitments
- identify, arrest and punish hate-oriented attackers against the Minority survival in Western Thrace.
- prevent any kind of verbal and physical hate-based and Islamophobic action that endangers the coexistence of these two fundamental entities of Western Thrace
- strengthen basic principles of respect and tolerance towards the ethnic Turkish and Muslim identities not only inside Western Thrace but also across the country

### **Canada**

- For participating States to further increase their efforts to implement their OSCE commitments on tolerance and non discrimination, including by combating discrimination on the basis of race, religion, sex or sexual orientation.
- For participating States to make and support efforts to confront violence towards persons based on their sexual orientation by providing meaningful responses to such violations.

### **Institute European de Recherches et D'Etudes Des Sciences Sociales et Religieuses**

- Nous appelons le Royaume de Belgique comme tous les Pays Participants à contrer l'islamophobie institutionnelle qui existe parfois dans certains espaces publics. Comment lutter contre ce phénomène si, de fait, l'Etat déroge lui même au principe d'égalité entre les citoyens comme c'est le cas pour le voile islamique.
- Nous appelons le Royaume de Belgique comme tous les Pays Participants à veiller au respect des droits fondamentaux et de la dignité de chaque individu

sans tenir compte de sa situation légale. Le gouvernement belge doit être le garant de la protection de toutes les personnes vivant sur son territoire.

### **Human Rights Movement “Resistance”**

Подводя итог выступлению, хотелось бы отметить и рекомендовать государствам-участникам, с учетом выполнения принятых ранее обязательств в рамках ОБСЕ, следующее:

- необходимо на национальных уровнях активизировать работу по выполнению своих международных обязательств в сфере обеспечения гендерного равенства, защиты женщин и детей от насилия;
- необходимо расширить обмен опытом государств-участников по поддержке материнства и детства, повышению качества жизни семьи, повышению рождаемости, по созданию условий для полноценного участия родителей в политической, экономической и общественной жизни, по укреплению роли женщин в сохранении традиционных семейных ценностей;
- необходимо создавать и развивать условия для самообеспечения и благосостояния семьи, как базовой ячейки общества;
- необходимо активнее пропагандировать семейные ценности, престиж семьи и укрепление её роли в современном обществе, используя международные правовые инструменты, институты ОБСЕ, а также активно привлекать к этой деятельности СМИ;
- необходимо уделять больше внимания вопросам защиты женщин и детей от преступных посягательств;
- необходимо развивать неправительственные межгосударственные отношения среди профильных общественных правозащитных организаций, развивать сотрудничество в этой сфере, а также в сфере мониторинга семей, усыновивших детей из других стран;
- при решении вопросов защиты женщин и детей от насилия необходимо уделить особое внимание проведению своевременной виктимологической профилактики и пресечению насильственных преступлений, оптимизации
- наказания за преступные посягательства, созданию государственных механизмов компенсации причиненного вреда и решению вопросов социальной реабилитации потерпевших от преступлений.

### **ABTTF - Federation of Western Thracians in Europe**

- We invite the Government of Greece to impose effective penalties or prohibition, if necessary for the extremist activities of political organizations, including Golden Dawn political party. Such political parties where evidence demonstrates that they advocate for and are involved directly or indirectly in acts of racist violence, must be banned and excluded from all state subsidies which are usually provided to political parties.

### **Chernivtsy Regional NGO ‘Human Rights’**

- Провести перепись населения Украины.

- Принять анти дискриминационный Закон Украины в соответствии со стандартами ЕС та рекомендациями ОБСЕ
- Создать специализированный государственный орган для борьбы с нетерпимостью и дискриминацией.
- Провести широкое обсуждение Национальной стратегии борьбы с дискриминацией
- Разработать и ввести в программы всех учебных заведений курсы по терпимости и недискриминации.

### **Center for Information and Analysis (SOVA)**

- More actively use the information collected by non-governmental organizations that perform systematic monitoring of racist groups, and consult NGOs on law enforcement issues. Despite methodological, and even political, differences, such cooperation can be very productive.
- Adjust the legislative framework covering hate crimes and related activities, including public incitement, organizing, financing, etc. Legislation should focus law enforcement efforts, first and foremost, on prosecuting the most dangerous crimes against the person. The internal policies and regulations of the law enforcement agencies should reflect the same priorities.
- Change the crime reporting system so that suspected hate motive could be recorded at any stage, including the earliest one. Specialized police units are more effective in investigating hate crimes, but regular police should conduct such investigations as well.
- Publish hate crime statistics, highlighting the different types, regions, and number of victims. Official statistics should be based on court decisions (for both proven and unproven cases), and not on the number of opened criminal cases.
- Actively participate in the TAHCLE training program for police officers.
- Train law enforcement personnel in detecting and deterring any unusual forms of offenses motivated by racial and similar hatred.

### **Constantinopolitan Society**

Due to systematic, ongoing, and egregious violations of religious freedom, OSCE / ODHIR is called upon to urge the Turkish government to bring its laws and practices into compliance with international standards on freedom of religion or belief.

Specifically: OSCE / ODHIR is called upon to urge Turkey as an OSCE participating State to:

- Give the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate the right to officially use the ecclesiastical title of “Ecumenical”, as it is a title that is historically established since the 6th century and globally recognized.
- Grant full legal personality to the Ecumenical Patriarchate, so that the latter may enjoy, inter alia, ownership rights and exercise property ownership / management.
- Lift the prerequisite that the election of the Ecumenical Patriarch depends on the pre approval of the Prefecture of Istanbul.
- End Turkish citizenship requirements for the Ecumenical Patriarch and the Holy Synod of the Greek Orthodox Church, and permit them to select and

appoint their leadership and members in accordance with their internal guidelines and beliefs.

- Resolve the question of those non Muslim Foundations considered fused / mazbut, which, along with their properties, should be returned to the Greek Orthodox community and the Ecumenical Patriarchate.
- Re open without any delay and prerequisite the Theological Seminary of Halki with exactly the same status it held before 1971 and permit students to enroll from both within and outside Turkey.
- Restore historical Byzantine churches of Haghia Sophia in Nicaea (Iznik) and Haghia Sophia in Trebizond, which were arbitrarily turned into mosques, to their previous function as museums.
- Give permission to the Ecumenical Patriarchate to have its own printing facilities for the publishing of religious editions (books, journals etc.).
- Abolish Article 301 of the Turkish Penal Code, which restricts the freedoms of thought and expression and negatively affects the freedom of religion or belief.
- Return the three churches of Panayia Kafatiani, Aya Yani and Aya Nikola in the district of Karakoy Galata in Istanbul, as well as their 72 immovable properties, which have been illegally and forcibly occupied by the self – declared and nonexistent “Turkish Orthodox Patriarchate (TOP)”.
- Implement the Turkish Constitution and the Lausanne Treaty consistent with international obligations, such as OSCE commitments on freedom of religion or belief.
- Implement the Turkish Constitution and the Lausanne Treaty consistent with international obligations, such as Article 18 of the ICCPR and OSCE commitments on freedom of religion or belief.

### **Anti Defamation League**

Here are the Anti-Defamation League’s recommendations for governments to begin the process to combat anti-Semitism and hate or to build on steps already taken to institutionalize a systemic, comprehensive strategy:

- ***Start by using your own bully pulpit to speak out.*** Political leaders have the most immediate and significant opportunity to set the tone of a national response to an anti-Semitic incident, an anti-Semitic party, or an anti-Semitic parliamentarian. I welcome the statements made in this room by participating States, I urge you to publicize your pledges and commitments in your media at home. This is Europe’s largest human rights conference and communities barely read a word about it in the media. Each of your governments has a significant media platform to promote the messages and commitments you are elevating here today. I hope you will leave this room committed to use it.
- ***Stop fearing hate crime data and information about anti-Semitism in your country.*** The measure of your countries' commitment to protect Jews and others from hate crime is not in the number of hate crimes. The real measure is in the quality of your government’s response. The existence of a data collection mechanism is a sign that your government is recognizing the problem and taking the first step to respond. Then, what the state does with it, is the next important measure. The lack of recorded incidents does not mean your country is safe for a targeted group, it can mean quite the contrary.



- ***Fulfill your pledge to monitor and address hate crime.*** Hate crime data is the essential foundation for a whole range of political, policy education, prevention, and response measures. This monitoring is a powerful tool to confront anti-Semitism and other forms of bigotry and it prompts government outreach and police training to identify, report, and respond to hate violence. Governments should maintain official systems of monitoring and reporting to provide accurate data for informed policy decisions to combat violent hate crimes. Participating States should, at a minimum provide ODIHR basic information and data on the nature, incidence, and response to hate crimes as they have committed to do.
- ***Convene a “Berlin-plus Ten.”*** The Ministerial Council in December should endorse a high-level conference marking the tenth anniversary of the landmark Berlin declaration in which States pledged to fight anti-Semitism and which gave birth to ODIHR’s Tolerance and non-Discrimination Program. We urge participating States to register support here at the HDIM for the organization of a high-level meeting in 2014 and committing to high level participation.
- ***Support the specialized work of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), Tolerance, and Non-Discrimination Department and promote its reporting, education and training programs and other tools to combat anti-Semitism and hate crime.*** ODIHR tools, like *Hate Crime Laws: A Practical Guide*, which ADL is proud to have played a role in drafting, encourage governments to partner with communities and empower them to help address hate crime. These tools are designed to help establish a common framework to improve hate crime response with models for lawmakers, community organizations, and law enforcement.
- ***Forge links with civil society:*** States should establish a framework for regular communication between communities and relevant officials and involve communities in efforts to craft and implement policies. States should support ODIHR efforts to build the capacity of non-governmental organizations to serve as a bridge between officials and law enforcement and communities to ensure an effective response.
- ***Parliaments should have zero-tolerance for anti-Semitism and bigotry.*** Voters are free to cast votes for any party on the ballot, but parliamentarians also have the ability to reject the anti-Semitism espoused by some parties and to ensure that parliaments are a platform to showcase a society’s highest values and not its basest ideas. Parliaments can also be a vehicle for positive proactive action of all types. In December 2012, over 150 members of parliaments from 30 countries wrote a letter to the President, Prime Minister, and the Speaker of the Parliament of Hungary to condemn the Jobbik MP’s statement in Parliament asking for a list of Jews in government and parliament to be created. Anti-Semitism and hatred is a shared problem across the OSCE Region and all States, all sectors of society in each of our countries share a stake in our collective effort to combat it.

#### **Wuestenstrom e.V.**

#### **Recommendations to OSCE/ODIHR and Participating States:**

- Please do not allow politicians, parties or governments to fight against fundamental rights like therapeutic choice, freedom of profession, the freedom of sexual self-determination and the parents’ right to educate.

- Please do not prevent minors and grownups from any kind of psychotherapy to find themselves in their identities in a process of autonomous self-presentation. With that you guarantee the inviolability of human dignity.
- Please do not promote efforts to implement culturally particular ideologies like the idea of an inherent “sexual identity” in constitutions and laws and with that make it more and more difficult for men and women to find support, when they experience unwanted sexual orientations.

### **No Borders- Ukraine**

No Borders Project has a number of recommendations for the State and urges member-states to continue monitoring Ukraine's progress in implementation of the following:

- Reform relevant legislation and implementation mechanisms to ensure access to redress for victims of all kinds of discrimination including hate crimes.
- The State must ensure access to the fair justice in courts, as well as for free legal assistance, for all victims of discrimination.
- Provide human rights trainings for the police, prosecutors, border guards, staff of temporary detention facilities and judiciary, as well as facilitate the reporting of cases when Roma people are abused due to their ethnicity, as well as when it happens to other persons of different ethnic origin, or LGBT persons: effectively investigate complaints and bring those found guilty of such acts to justice.
- Develop dialogue with the civil society organizations aimed at improvement of reporting and investigation practices, as well as at building cooperation mechanisms for better provision of services.<sup>5</sup> Take measures to effectively identify and ban illegal profiling practices within law enforcement authorities and establish independent mechanism of complaints on human rights abuses committed by police.

### **France**

- En conclusion et en guise de recommandation, la France réitère son appel à une application pleine et entière des engagements de l'OSCE dans la lutte contre les crimes de haine et pour combattre toutes les formes de discrimination et d'intolérance, quels qu'en soient leurs motifs. A ce titre, laisser dire ou laisser croire que certains motifs de discriminations et de crimes de haine sont moins dignes de combat que d'autres est contraire à nos engagements en faveur de l'égalité de dignité de toute personne humaine.

### **Order of St. Andrew the Apostle**

We respectfully submit that OSCE should immediately impress upon the Government of Turkey the need to fully comply with the principles of OSCE, of which Turkey is a member, and specifically, to:

- Fully adhere to the principles on the rights of expression, assembly and association, dissent, and religious faith and practice of all citizens without discrimination.

- Allow full legal status for Turkey's religious institutions (minorities), including religious leadership organs, by making all the necessary legal changes and imbed the changes into the new constitution.
- Establish and defend a climate of respect, tolerance, and legitimate assistance toward the free functioning of ethnic and religious minorities and their various institutions.
- Convert the Decree on the Return of Properties into a Law of the Land, and appoint a truly independent body for its oversight and implementation. The law must correct the deficiencies that have been pointed out in the Decree, including extending property losses before 1936. The Law should also mandate full cooperation of the bureaucracy, with strong incentives and strict penalties for stone-walling and other non-compliance.
- Extend the deadline as needed and provide for the full implementation of the Government Decree of 27-August-2011, on the return of confiscated properties with full cooperation by VGM and its Assembly.
- Appoint a Public Advocate with the necessary staff and power to assist applicants and help them work with the government (modeled after a similar institution of the European Union).

#### **Forum for Religious Freedom Europe (FOREF)**

- We demand that the degree of freedom of religion in Hungary is restored to its pre 2011 level and that the legislation concerning freedom of religion in Hungary is adjusted with European and UN guidelines and recommendations. We believe that the legislation violating fundamental human rights should not be ignored as it can serve as dangerous precedent and a bad example that other countries in the region might follow.

#### **European Union**

En guise de conclusion, l'UE souhaite formuler les recommandations suivantes :

- garantir la pleine mise en oeuvre des engagements existants de l'OSCE dans la lutte contre toutes les formes d'intolérance ;
- coopérer avec le BIDDH pour l'élaboration du rapport sur les crimes de haine et participer à ses formations sur ce sujet ;
- renforcer les politiques de lutte contre les stigmatisations quels qu'en soient les motifs et faire preuve d'une vigilance renforcée contre toute incitation publique à la haine ou à la violence ;
- mieux prendre en compte les formes multiples de discrimination et évaluer régulièrement l'efficacité des plans nationaux de lutte contre le racisme.

#### **Anti Defamation League**

- *Acknowledge and condemn violent hate crimes whenever they occur.* Senior government leaders should send immediate, strong, public, and consistent messages that violent crimes which appear to be motivated by prejudice and intolerance will be investigated thoroughly and prosecuted to the full extent of the law.

- ***Enact laws that expressly address hate crimes.*** Recognizing the particular harm caused by violent hate crimes, governments should enact laws that establish specific offenses or provide enhanced penalties for violent crimes committed because of the victim's race, religion, ethnicity, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity, mental and physical disabilities, or other similar status.
- ***Strengthen enforcement and prosecute offenders.*** Governments should ensure that those responsible for hate crimes are held accountable under the law, that the enforcement of hate crime laws is a priority for the criminal justice system, and that the record of their enforcement is well documented and publicized.
- ***Provide adequate instructions and resources to law enforcement bodies.*** Governments should ensure that police and investigators—as the first responders in cases of violent crime—are specifically instructed and have the necessary procedures, resources and training to identify, investigate and register bias motives before the courts, and that prosecutors have been trained to bring evidence of bias motivations and apply the legal measures required to prosecute hate crimes.
- ***Undertake parliamentary, interagency or other special inquiries into the problem of hate crimes.*** Such public, official inquiries should encourage public debate, investigate ways to better respond to hate crimes, and seek creative ways to address the roots of intolerance and discrimination through education and other means.
- ***Monitor and report on hate crimes.*** Governments should maintain official systems of monitoring and public reporting to provide accurate data for informed policy decisions to combat violent hate crimes. Such systems should include anonymous and disaggregated information on bias motivations and/or victim groups, and should monitor incidents and offenses, as well as prosecutions. Governments should consider establishing third party complaint procedures to encourage greater reporting of hate crimes and conducting periodic hate crime victimization surveys to monitor underreporting by victims and underrecording by police.
- ***Create and strengthen antidiscrimination bodies.*** Official antidiscrimination and human rights bodies should have the authority to address hate crimes through monitoring, reporting, and assistance to victims.
- ***Reach out to community groups.*** Governments should conduct outreach and education efforts to communities and civil society groups to reduce fear and assist victims, advance police-community relations, encourage improved reporting of hate crimes to the police and improve the quality of data collection by law enforcement bodies.
- ***Speak out against official intolerance and bigotry.*** Freedom of speech allows considerable latitude for offensive and hateful speech, but public figures should be held to a higher standard. Members of parliament and local government leaders should be held politically accountable for bigoted words that encourage discrimination and violence and create a climate of fear for minorities.
- ***Encourage international cooperation on hate crimes.*** Governments should support and strengthen the mandates of intergovernmental organizations that are addressing discrimination—like the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, the European Commission against Racism and

Intolerance, and the Fundamental Rights Agency—by encouraging such organizations to raise the capacity of and train police, prosecutors, and judges, as well as other official bodies and civil society groups to combat violent hate crimes. Governments should also provide a detailed accounting on the incidence and nature of hate crimes to these bodies in accordance with relevant commitments.

**Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe**  
**Additionally we recommend:**

- To combat underreporting by collecting disaggregated data on hate crimes against Christians. In some countries, vandalism against a Christian site is only listed as vandalism against a public building.
- Combating persecution of Christians outside the OSCE area must become a priority of the foreign secretaries of participating states in their foreign policy.

**Turkische Akademiker Dresden**

- German government must go over these illegal organizations bravely.
- German government must show more effort in the effectively education of civil servants (especially police units, teachers, officers, etc.) against to Xenophobia (and police violence).

**European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC)**

Key Recommendations for Government Action:

- Scale up or implement programmes to increase the number of Roma employed in police forces;
- Develop community safety and policing programmes, with close cooperation between police, Romani NGOs and Romani communities;
- Respective authorities should regularly collect, publish and analyse data disaggregated by ethnicity on violence against Roma, including hate crimes, and their prosecution;
- Ensure full assistance, protection, prosecution and compensation to the victims of violence;
- Senior government officials should publicly denounce every instance of anti-Roma violence and other kinds of hate crimes;
- Draft and distribute to all respective authorities clear guidance on the investigation and prosecution of violence against Roma and hate crimes, in line with guidance available from the OSCE and countries such as the United Kingdom;
- Provide systematic and ongoing training to police officers, prosecutors and judges on addressing violence against Roma and hate crimes; and
- Prosecute to the fullest extent of the law all perpetrators of violence and hate crimes against Roma.

**Council of Europe**

The Council of Europe presents the following specific recommendations:

- Member States of the Council of Europe are encouraged to sign and ratify Protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights, which provides for the general prohibition of discrimination.
- OSCE participating States are encouraged to sign and ratify the Additional Protocol to the Council of Europe's Convention on Cybercrime, on the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.
- Member States of the Council of Europe are encouraged to enact and implement legislation against racism and racial discrimination, if such legislation does not already exist or is incomplete, and to ensure that such legislation reflects the key elements in ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 7, which include the setting up of an independent body specialised in the fight against racism and racial discrimination.
- In particular, ECRI urges member States of the Council of Europe to base their policies relating to employment on its most recent General Policy Recommendation on combating racism and racial discrimination in employment. Member States of the Council of Europe are also encouraged to implement ECRI's remaining General Policy Recommendations as well as its country-by-country recommendations.

### **Alliance Defending Freedom**

- My recommendation is that participating OSCE States must find a fair balance between the different competing rights that have been created by non-discrimination laws, so that citizens are not unfairly penalized and punished for upholding their deeply held religious beliefs in the workplace or in other areas of public life.

### **Pro Igual**

Recommendations:

- The Governments must recognize the reality and the danger of the extreme right ascent to power, and not dismiss the right wing extremism as fringe behavior of a handful of marginalized youths.
- It is also important to recognize that the extreme right has received a Public Relations makeover. We are no longer dealing with just crude manifestations, such as shaven heads or military boots. The contemporary extreme right is an increasingly sophisticated and insidious ideology that masks hate as care and violence as freedom, and actively uses democratic means to attain undemocratic ends.
- Appeasement does not work. Some of the mainstream parties tried to woo the extreme right voters by embracing xenophobia. But they will never be radical enough for the extreme rights, but will instead lose their core supporters alongside with integrity.
- Economic crisis and corruption must be addressed urgently, as they feed into the extreme right's popularity. Ineptitude in handling the economic crisis, lack of transparency and seemingly endemic corruption turn the mainstream, moderate voters away from the established parties into the grip of the extreme right.
- Laws must protect the victims of right wing extremism, not provide loopholes and excuses for perpetrators.

- It is not enough to be reactive; it is essential to become pro active. This means the alarm must be raised BEFORE the extreme right ascend to power. Otherwise, with each new victory of the extreme right, there will be fewer countries even left to condemn it.
- Last but not least, the Governments should work treat civil society as an ally, and not as a nuisance, as presently civil society is the only force resisting the rise of the extreme right to power.

### **Burgerbewegung Pax Europa**

BPE recommends the following to OSCE, ODIHR and participating States:

- That the term “racism” be used sparingly by OSCE, and only to explicit obstacles to human rights and fundamental freedoms.
- That OSCE and participating States respond to the staggering number of crimes committed in the name of Islam.

### **Switzerland**

Sur la base de ces considérations, nous formulons les deux recommandations suivantes :

- Concernant la discrimination des personnes LGBT, nous recommandons à tous les Etats participants d’engager un dialogue constructif entre eux et avec la société civile, et ce en dépit des différentes opinions et positions qui prévalent.
- Nous encourageons les Etats participants à renforcer les mesures de prévention et de sensibilisation en faveur des victimes de discrimination.

### **Human Rights Without Frontiers**

Human Rights Without Frontiers Int’l is deeply concerned about the increasing number of acts of vandalism and violence committed against members and buildings of new religious movements in countries of Western Europe, Central Europe and Eastern Europe whatever their political regime and recommends to the OSCE Participating States

- to combat any form of social hostility and any act of violence against any religious or belief community, not just Christians, Muslims or Jews;
- to organize human rights seminars with a wide range of religious institutions in order to promote inter-religious tolerance and peaceful co-existence.

### **Muslim Denomination in Bulgaria**

With reference to the above mentioned matters I’d like to make the following recommendations to the Bulgarian authorities:

- National authorities to ensure implementation of OSCE Ministerial Decision No. 9/09 on Hate Crime and OSCE Permanent Council Decisions 607 and 621 on Tolerance and the Fight against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, as well as other related commitments established by Ministerial Council decisions between 2003 and 2007;
- To undertake specific measures in strengthening and implementing legislation and data collection mechanisms to address hate crime and in identifying and implementing good practices;

- The authorities actively engage with civil society organizations to combat hate crimes and other manifestations of intolerance, whilst recognizing the independent role played by the latter;
- To undertake specific measures so that attempts and actions of this nature against religious and ethnic groups as a whole will not be treated as “hooligan acts”, but will be considered as acts “threatening ethnic and religious peace” in the country and be punished strictly and uncompromisingly, regardless of ethnic and religious affiliation of the perpetrator and to whom they are directed;
- The national authorities to implement the commitments of OSCE to address intolerance and discrimination by conducting awareness-raising activities, developing educational programmes in order to raise awareness among youth of the value of mutual respect and understanding, encouraging the establishment of national institutions and specialized bodies and co-operating with civil society;
- The national authorities to submit periodically the annual hate crime list to ODIHR.

### **Teskedorden (The Order of the Teaspoon)**

- We therefore encourage all of you to take a look into the structure, the methodology and the result of this programme called the Tolerance project. A project and method that our organization has received support from the Swedish government to implement all over Sweden. And ask yourselves if you can afford not to implement a similar programme.

### **Amnesty International**

To conclude, Amnesty International calls on OSCE Participating States to enhance take all measures necessary in combating hate crimes by:

- Ensuring that their laws prohibit all crimes that are perpetrated against individuals or property because of their real or perceived association with, or belonging to, a group defined by a protected characteristic according to international human rights law;
- Including real or perceived sexual orientation and gender identity as protected characteristics on the basis of which a hate crime can be perpetrated;
- Ensuring that investigative authorities do their utmost to unveil any alleged hate motive associated with a crime, even when such hate motive was not reported by the victim;
- Ensuring that prosecuting authorities consistently bring alleged hate motives to the attention of the court when there is sufficient evidence to do so;
- Collecting data on hate crimes at all levels, including reporting, investigation, prosecution and sentencing. Such data must be disaggregated by hate motive including sexual orientation and gender identity. This data should be made publicly available and authorities should develop policies to combat all forms of discrimination on the basis of such data;
- Ensuring that victims of hate crimes receive thorough and prompt information about the developments of their cases, be able to be heard in the legal proceedings and be provided with legal and psychological support as appropriate;



- Providing police, judicial authorities and health professionals with general training on discrimination on multiple grounds and specific training on hate crimes.

### **Freedom House**

- The OSCE and Participating States should continue to work with Ukraine to see that it passes relevant legislation to ensure that LGBTI people are not discriminated against, in the workplace or anywhere.

### **Association "Inva-Sodeystvie"**

- We fully recommend Georgia to acknowledge Abkhazia/South Ossetia as fully authorised negotiating partners rather than “occupied territories” ruled from outside. Such an agreement would definitely create a more favourable and useful atmosphere between the three states, which have essentially been in a state of war for the last 20 years and have at times, suffered severe violations of human rights.

### Recommendations to International Organizations

#### **Institut d'Alisher Navoi**

- Мы обращаемся к международному сообществу, к европейским организациям с призывом, наконец то, сформулировать консолидированную позицию и программу действий в отношении зафиксированных очевидных и вопиющих фактов нарушения прав человека в этой стране. Задача таких действий – не допустить рецидива трагических событий 2010 года. А они, как я говорил, могут повториться, поскольку до сих пор нет серьёзных внешних ограничителей для тех или иных решений, которые власти Киргизстана принимают в нарушении всяческих международных норм.

#### **Russian Federation**

- Призываем государства-участники ОБСЕ снять оговорки к статье 4 Международной конвенции о ликвидации всех форм расовой дискриминации и обеспечить, чтобы национальное законодательство учитывало ее положения. Следует включить в уголовное законодательство положения, согласно которым мотивы или цели, связанные с расизмом или 4 ксенофобией, являются отягчающим обстоятельством при совершении преступления.

### Recommendations to the OSCE

#### **Amaro Drom e.V.**

- We recommend to the OSCE and especially to ODIHR to initiate a research about the education on the Roma genocide in school curriculums.

#### **Faculte des Sciences Islamiques de Bruxelles**

- We encourage the Ministerial Council of the OSCE to adopt a global and deep decision in order to prevent racial discrimination, xenophobia and hatred against Muslims, by promoting educational initiatives and raising public awareness.

- We encourage the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) to support the Swiss presidency in an effort to conceive and implement “islamophobia prevention projects”, particularly by promoting educational initiatives and raising public awareness in the media as well as in political discourse.
- We suggest that the ODIHR create tools to support the efforts of media experts in developing and implementing codes of conduct, mechanisms of self-regulation and other adequate measures that ensure equal representation of people and groups in the society. The ODIHR should commit itself in an open dialogue with civil society and political figures. This dialogue will pave the way for encouraging responsibility and ethics in public discourse. Eventually, it will help to take concrete measures by implementing codes of behaviour that will allow treating the widespread and growing use of anti-Islamic attacks in the public sphere. Educational Institutions, like the BFIS, could be effective partners in this matter.
- We call out the Belgian State to consider Institutions specialised in the teaching of Islam as trusted partners for managing the Islamic religion in Belgium, with full transparency and taking into account the principles and values of our Kingdom. The FISB is ready to take part in all these kinds of cooperation.
- In conclusion, we want to congratulate the ODIHR for having written a guide that helps teachers and educators address intolerance against Muslims. This guide will serve as a model in order to fight racism and xenophobia and we will use it within our educational system. The FISB is preparing a module that will draw inspiration from this guide.

### **Institute Europeen de Recherches et D'Etudes Des Sciences Sociales et Religieuses**

- Nous appelons la prochaine Présidence Suisse de l’OSCE, à renforcer les moyens du BIDDH pour qu’il puisse mieux prévenir les attaques vécues par les minorités religieuses au sein des Pays Participants comme en Belgique. Nous tenons à souligner que, pour assurer une participation plus équilibrée de toutes les communautés dans la région de l’OSCE, le BIDDH doit promouvoir davantage la participation à ses activités des ONG musulmanes.
- Le fait anti musulman s’est désormais normalisé dans un grand nombre de pays à l’Ouest de Vienne. Il s’est même institutionnalisé par le biais de l’intervention publique dans les medias des personnes que nous pouvons appeler les "*terroristes culturelles*". C’est pourquoi, nous appelons la prochaine Présidence Suisse de l’OSCE à ce qu’elle tienne compte de l’intolérance et de la discrimination croissante envers les musulmans, et à la lumière de cette situation inquiétante, de suivre son évolution de plus près et de ne plus permettre aux individus ou organisations xénophobes et d’extrêmes droites de polémiquer sur la question, notamment ici même. Plusieurs organisations ont émis depuis plusieurs années le souhait de la tenue à l’OSCE d’une Haute Conférence sur la question de l’islamophobie, nous soutenons bien évidemment ce souhait.
- Enfin, l’islamophobie s’est transformée en une nouvelle forme de racisme et de xénophobie. Nous invitons l’OSCE à poursuivre la promotion des Principes Directeurs pour les éducateurs développés par le BIDDH à cet égard. Cet outil

qui permet de mieux cerner ce phénomène est disponible en Français et pourrait être utilisé au sein des instances éducatives en Belgique.

### **Center for Information and Analysis (SOVA)**

- Compile and distribute the experience gained from prior comprehensive efforts against groups that practice racist violence, including specific criminal investigations, detection and destruction of the groups' infrastructure, isolation of their funding sources, identifying organizers and coordinators of violent actions, etc. Hold an international expert workshop on this topic, if needed.
- Organize a seminar for law enforcement officials from different countries, presenting a summary of successful practices for collecting information and recording hate crimes statistics.

### **Council of Europe**

The Council of Europe presents the following specific recommendations:

- OSCE institutions are encouraged to continue their co-operation in the fight against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance with the Council of Europe, and in particular ECRI, by further strengthening mechanisms enabling the free flow of and exchange of information and data and common action.

### **Turkische Akademiker Dresden**

- OSCE must be the observer of this serial hate crimes' judgment.
- OSCE must continue to bring all religions' delegates together and to encourage them to make consensus against to the hate crimes.
- OSCE should consider the increasing police violence especially at the social events and organizations (mostly against to the foreigners (as Xenophobia)).

### **Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe**

The Observatory on Intolerance against Christians recommends:

- The targeted and purposeful implementation of the OSCE's own recommendations put forth by the Parliamentary Assembly's "Resolution on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians in the OSCE Area", adopted in Belgrade in July 2011, particularly:
  - that a "public debate on intolerance and discrimination against Christians be initiated and that the right of Christians to participate fully in public life be ensured";
  - that, legislation in the participating States, including
    - labour law,
    - equality law,
    - laws on freedom of expression and assembly,
    - and laws related to religious communities and rights of conscientious objection be assessed in view of discrimination and intolerance against Christians;
  - The Resolution also "encourages the media not to spread prejudices against Christians and to combat negative stereotyping".

- Additionally we recommend to the OSCE/ODIHR: to develop materials on how to combat intolerance against Christians and to disseminate this through the OSCE region.

### **Latvian Anti-fascist Committee**

- Уважаемые коллеги, весь послевоенный мир в Европе построен на самом главном основополагающем принципе: «Never again!». И я бы очень хотел, чтобы ОБСЕ приняла документ, жестко и однозначно определяющий, что никогда европейская толерантность не будет распространяться ни на какие попытки реанимировать нацизм или реабилитировать нацистское и эсэсовское прошлое, и любые попытки нарушить этот постулат будут приравниваться к преступлением против человечности.

### **International Human Rights Movement "World Without Nazism"- Russia**

- Я предлагаю в рамках ОБСЕ провести отдельную конференцию, посвященную проблеме агрессивного национализма и ксенофобии, где ознакомиться с выводами и рекомендациями экспертов, ознакомиться с позициями отдельных стран дискриминируемых групп и ариступить, наконец, к системному решению проблемы.

### **Burgerbewegung Pax Europa**

BPE recommends the following to OSCE, ODIHR and participating States:

- That the term “racism” be used sparingly by OSCE, and only to explicit obstacles to human rights and fundamental freedoms.
- That OSCE and participating States respond to the staggering number of crimes committed in the name of Islam.

### **Gustav Stresemann Stiftung e.V.**

Recommendations

- The STRESEMANN FOUNDATION recommends the OSCE to urge its individual divisions, participating states and NGOs, that statements be supported by (statistical) facts and that speculations (of an ideological nature) be omitted wherever possible.

### **International Civil Liberties Alliance**

We therefore make the following recommendations:

- That the OSCE provide an official definition of the term “Islamophobia” including a comprehensive list of what Islamophobia is not. This would go a long way to helping organisations like ICLA to articulate their messages in the most sensitive way possible.
- That the OSCE organize a much more diverse range of stakeholders to come together to create a revised booklet for educators that is both fair and politically neutral. For such an important publication to achieve what it purports to want to achieve, it has to be more inclusive with regard to those who compile it.

### **Russian Federation**

- Важно, что ОБСЕ и ее институты, такие как БДИПЧ, Представитель по свободе СМИ, ВКНМ, личные представители Действующего председательства уделяли особое внимание выполнению обязательств ОБСЕ в этой сфере, провели в следующем году тематические мероприятия, посвященные анализу ситуации и мерам борьбы с расизмом, ксенофобией, антисемитизмом, исламофобией и христианофобией.

### **Muslim Denomination in Bulgaria**

Recommendations to ODIHR/OSCE:

- ODIHR should suggest specific measures to prevent intolerance, xenophobia and hate crimes;
- ODIHR and other OSCE institutions, including the Personal Representatives of the Chairperson in Office on tolerance and non-discrimination issues, to undertake measures for better supporting OSCE participating States in implementing their commitments on tolerance and nondiscrimination;
- ODIHR to continue with the training programmes on responding to hate crimes and all kind of intolerance for law enforcement, educators, NGOs and representatives of religious organizations

### **International Civil Liberties Alliance**

- L'international Civil Liberties Alliance lance aujourd'hui un appel urgent solennel au directeur du BIDDH. Le livret « Principes directeurs à l'attention des éducateurs pour combattre l'intolérance et la discrimination à l'encontre des musulmans : aborder l'islamophobie à travers l'éducation » doit être immédiatement retiré de la distribution.

### **Center for Security Policy**

- CSP RECOMMENDS THAT the OSCE and ODIHR suspend this practice until a published definition of terms is provided that meets EU Human Rights and U.S. Civil Rights scrutiny.

### Recommendations to NGOs

#### **Center for Information and Analysis (SOVA)**

- Actively participate in monitoring of hate crimes.
- Organize public debates in order to explain the importance and meaning of the combating hate crimes and discrimination to citizens.

**Tuesday, 24 September 2013**

## **WORKING SESSION 3: Tolerance and non-discrimination II (continued)**

### Recommendations to participating States

#### **Canada**

- For States to enact, reinforce or amend domestic legislation to enhance the protection of women and girls subjected to sexual violence.

- That States publicly condemn violence against women and girls and provide visible and sustained leadership to prevent acts of violence, including sexually based violence.

### **Foundation "CitizenGO"**

- To demand the respect and protection (in terms of social security and in other areas) of women who decide to educate their children personally at home;
- To promote maternity as the most important goal for a woman and not as a obstacle, which interferes with her career;
- To research and document the situation of woman in the beginning as well as in the continuation of their professional career after giving birth and raising children.

### **Chernivtsy Regional NGO 'Human Rights'**

- Принять законодательство, обеспечивающее увеличение участие женщин в политической жизни - все политические партии законодательно обязать соблюдать принцип 50/50 в избирательном списке (мужчина/женщина).
- Повести эффективное расследование преступлений, совершенных властями относительно меня и моей семьи – нанесение телесных повреждений, незаконное преследование и арест имущества, давление на членов семьи.
- Ратифицировать Конвенцию Совета Европы по предупреждению и борьбу с насилием относительно женщин и домашним насилием.
- Публиковать статистику по домашнему насилию и насилию над женщинами, обеспечить эффективное раскрытие этих преступлений
- Подписать и ратифицировать Декларацию ООН о правозащитниках для защиты женщин-правозащитниц, принять соответствующее внутреннее законодательство.
- Прекратить политические преследования, обеспечить лечение и участие в выборах лидера оппозиционной партии «Батькивщина» Ю. Тимошенко

### **Austria**

Austria would like to offer the following recommendations:

- Step up national and regional efforts to eradicate all forms of violence against women and girls and in this context become a party to the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence.
- Effectively protect children from all forms of violence and abuse, i.e. through effective legislation and prevention programmes, including particularly children living in institutional settings or otherwise deprived of their liberty.
- Systemize and exchange best practices concerning the development of National Action Plans or other national measures for the implementation of UN Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000).
- Adopt as soon as possible an OSCE system-wide Action Plan on Woman, Peace and Security.

## **Centro de Investigaciones en Derechos Humanos (CIDH) PRO IGUAL**

Recommendations for the Spanish Government:

- The relevant authorities should collect disaggregated data on migrant women in irregular administrative situation.
- The authorities should permit human rights monitors and NGOs to enter CIEs and privately interview inmates in order to document their situation.
- All CIE personnel must be required to wear visible identification badges and sanctioned for failure to comply.
- The authorities must investigate all allegations of ill treatment of inmates by CIE guards and prosecute those found responsible for human rights violations and sexual harassment.
- All CIE inmates should be provided with independent legal counsel, and an interpreter if necessary.
- The authorities should declare a temporary moratorium on expulsions of undocumented migrants, pending the review of their cases.
- All CIE inmates should have access to medical assistance as necessary, and women should have gender sensitive care and adequate nutrition; translation services should be available to help inmates communicate their health concerns.
- Pregnant and lactating women and women with young children should under no circumstances be detained in CIEs or separated from their children and families.
- Suspected victims of human trafficking should receive necessary legal, medical and other assistance and granted residence on humanitarian grounds.
- The authorities should decisively end ethnic profiling practices by the police and law enforcement.

## **Penal Reform International**

PRI recommends for all OSCE Member States to review its penal legislation, policies and practices, by reference of the UN Bangkok Rules including by:

- Undertaking research and data-collection on the background, characteristics and rehabilitative needs of women offenders and prisoners, in line with Rule 67 of the UN Bangkok Rules;
- Including the UN Bangkok Rules as part of the training curriculum of criminal justice actors, including prison authorities and staff.

## **International Federation for Therapeutic Choice (IFTC)**

We therefore recommend to OSCE Participating States, in light the aforementioned fundamental rights upheld by the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* and the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*:

- To recognize and condemn intolerance and discrimination against sexual minorities who freely choose to receive help in order to overcome or diminish their unwanted sexual attractions, orientation, behaviors, and/or identity.
- To draft legislation to safeguard the freedom of medical and mental health practitioners and educators: to offer their professional guidance and

therapeutic expertise to all people, whose own whose sexual minority concerns are *unwanted* and who *freely* choose help in order to overcome or diminish their unwanted sexual attractions, orientation, behaviors, and/or identity. This includes minor children who themselves freely seek such services with the consent of their parents.

### **COC Netherlands**

We recommend OSCE member states:

- To prevent, investigate, and punish the perpetrators of physical and sexual violence against LBT women (in compliance with the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women);
- To protect LBT girls against discrimination and violence; and to ensure education on sexual orientation and gender identity (in compliance with the Convention on the Rights of the Child), including to repeal the anti propaganda legislation in the Russian Federation.

### **Pro Igual**

On the basis of these findings, we would like to recommend to the Spanish authorities the following:

- Human rights NGOs and monitors should be allowed to enter detention centers and privately interview inmates – this is often sabotaged by the centers' directors.
- All personnel of the detention centers must wear visible identification badges and face sanctions for failure to comply.
- All allegations of ill treatment, especially sexual abuse of female inmates, by the guards must be investigated and prosecuted.
- All inmates should have access to independent legal counsel, and translation if necessary.
- The authorities should declare a temporary moratorium on expulsions of migrant women, pending the review of their cases.
- Women detainees in particular should have gender sensitive healthcare and adequate nutrition.
- Pregnant and breastfeeding women should under no circumstances be detained or separated from their children and families.
- Suspected victims of human trafficking should receive necessary legal, medical and other assistance.
- The authorities should decisively end ethnic profiling practices by the police.

### **Humanitas Helvetica**

Empfehlungen für Regierungen

- Anstelle der Kriminalisierung der Prostitution und der damit verbundenen Verdrängung in den undurchsichtigen illegalen Untergrund, empfiehlt Humanitas Helvetica den Regierungen, die aus freien Stücken ausgeübte Prostitution von Frauen und Männern als selbständige Erwerbsgrundlage anzuerkennen. Hingegen muss dem Menschenhandel mit aller Härte des Gesetzes entgegengetreten werden. Gesetzliche Grundlagen müssen geschaffen oder wo vorhanden ausgebaut werden, damit schon der Versuch des Menschenhandels im Keim erstickt werden kann. Parallel empfiehlt Humanitas Helvetica die verstärkte Sensibilisierung aller involvierter Stellen



(Polizei, Justiz, Migrationsämter, Arbeitsämter, Botschaften etc.), um Fällen von Menschenhandel rascher entgegenwirken zu können, respektive frühzeitig Anzeichen eines möglichen Menschenhandels erkennen zu können.

### **Buergerbewegung Pax Europa**

Recommendation to participating States:

Violence against women and children can only be combatted if the problem is recognized. This recognition is especially important with respect to the barbaric practice of female genital mutilation.

- We recommend that participating States recognize that FGM is not a cultural practice, but a religious one as it is endorsed by many Islamic clerics and scholars due to its justification in Islamic law.
- Endorsement, performance and support of FGM must be reported to the authorities and prosecuted.
- Legal penalties for FGM should be raised.
- Educational awareness programs in health education should be introduced.
- As for best practices, it is deplorable that none exist yet.

### **Buergerbewegung PAX EUROPA**

In addition to the high numbers, BPE-Austria is concerned over the apparent pattern that the native majority population is targeted by Muslim immigrants, a trend that calls for more research and investigation. Therefore BPE-Austria recommends for participating States (among others):

- that law enforcement is encouraged to do their best, and that lack of proper investigation must be treated as complicity to crime. Fear of being labeled 'racist' or 'xenophobic' is no sound excuse.

### **Womenforfreedom**

Women For Freedom suggests the following, especially to the German government:

- That FGM should explicitly be added to the catalogue of human rights offenses.
- FGM should be classified as severe bodily harm in all of Europe, as it constitutes a lifelong suffering, and should be punished accordingly.
- Training about FGM should be conducted for teachers, doctors and police officers, that they will be able to handle it in real life.
- Children at risk of FGM should be taken out of their families for their own safety.
- Children who are already victims of FGM should have a clear path towards taking guilty parties to court, including possibly their own parents.

### **ACT! For Canada – Education**

- We recommend the unequivocal condemnation of OSCE participating States of Islamic misogyny, gender apartheid and the dehumanization of women. We recommend that participating States do not stand by silently while the Islamic world brutalizes women.

### Recommendations to the OSCE

#### **European Union**

Finally, we would like to reiterate the four main recommendations of the EU with regard to promoting gender equality:

- Continue mainstreaming of gender issues in OSCE policies and activities, with a focus on the cross-dimensionality of gender issues;
- Adopt an OSCE-Wide Action Plan on UNSCR 1325, as well as develop further the tools for implementation of the 2004 OSCE Action Plan for the Promotion of Gender Equality;
- Take concrete steps to ensure that field missions have the capacity to implement the OSCE gender commitments;
- Increase focus on tackling violence against women and girls, particularly those that are most prevalent such as domestic violence, and involve men and boys in gender equality promotion activities.

### **International Federation for Therapeutic Choice (IFTC)**

We recommend to OSCE/ODIHR and OSCE Missions:

- To be aware of and condemn intolerance and discrimination against sexual minorities who freely choose help in order to eliminate, diminish, or manage unwanted feelings, thoughts, behavior, and/or identity.
- To assist OSCE Participating States in monitoring and drafting legislation, with special attention to safeguarding the above-mentioned rights upheld by the CRC and the UDHR.

### **COC Netherlands**

We recommend the OSCE:

- To ensure that discrimination and violence against LBBT women are properly and explicitly addressed in the OSCE trainings for law enforcement and prosecutors.

### **Switzerland**

Für die zukünftigen Anstrengungen der OSZE zur Beachtung der Gen-derdimension empfehlen wir:

- Die Stärkung der OSZE-Strukturen für die Implementierung des OSZE-Aktionsplans zur Förderung der Gleichstellung von Frauen und Männern. Wir begrüßen die Erarbeitung eines Implementierungs-plans zur Umsetzung des Aktionsplans. Auch prüfen wir gerne die Erarbeitung eines Addendums zum Aktionsplan, welches den Entwicklungen seit 2004 Rechnung trägt.
- Den Erfahrungsaustausch über die Staatenpraxis zur Umsetzung der UNO Sicherheitsratsresolution 1325 mit dem Ziel, die Kohärenz zu verstärken,
- Die Förderung der politischen Partizipation von Frauen als Akteure der Konflikttransformation auf allen gesellschaftlichen Ebenen.

### **Russian Federation**

Полагаем, что ОБСЕ и ее государства-участники должны адекватно реагировать на возникшие вызовы в этой сфере, объединять усилия в борьбе за будущее наших детей. В этой связи рекомендовали бы институтам ОБСЕ провести:

- всесторонний анализ положения детей, касающийся всех сфер их жизни, оценку наиболее часто встречающихся нарушений прав детей, обзор

национального законодательства, направленного на защиту материнства и детства, анализ соответствия национального законодательства международным обязательствам, выявление пробелов в обязательствах ОБСЕ, касающихся защиты детей;

- обзор национальных инструментов и институтов по защите прав детей, обмен наилучшими практиками;
- развивать сотрудничество с международными институтами по защите детей.

### **Buergerbewegung PAX EUROPA**

In addition to the high numbers, BPE-Austria is concerned over the apparent pattern that the native majority population is targeted by Muslim immigrants, a trend that calls for more research and investigation. Therefore BPE-Austria recommends for participating States:

- That relevant agencies conduct information campaigns targeting immigrant communities, making it clear that rape is an inexcusable crime, that woman reporting such crimes will be protected by the state, and that perpetrators will face the full force of the law, including possible deportation.
- Victims and witnesses should be protected as soon as they have reported a crime. Threats and intimidation intended to silence witnesses need to be systematically punished.
- That law enforcement is encouraged to do their best, and that lack of proper investigation must be treated as complicity to crime. Fear of being labeled 'racist' or 'xenophobic' is no sound excuse.
- Deportation should be considered as a punishment whenever possible.
- Finally, BPE recommends that agreements be negotiated with foreign countries so that foreign criminals can serve their sentences in their home countries.

### **Franco-Egyptian Organization for Human Rights**

Recommendation to the Delegations, NGO, OSCE, ODIHR

- OFEDH is recommending OSCE to define actions to prevent such barbaric acts from occurring in their state members.

### **Salut et Misericorde**

- L'association Salut et Miséricorde recommande à l'OSCE de s'assurer auprès des États membres qu'ils empêchent et pénalisent la diffusion d'ouvrages enseignant un statut inférieur et dégradant de la femme et des enfants.