



**OFFICE FOR DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS
AND HUMAN RIGHTS**

**ANNUAL
REPORT
1997**

**OSCE ODIHR
1 December 1997
Warsaw, Poland**

For more information about the ODIHR please look into the *OSCE Newsletter* – a monthly publication issued by the OSCE Secretariat in English and Russian.

It is available free of charge at the OSCE Prague Office –
Rytirska 31, 110 00 Praha 1, Czech Republic; tel. (420 2) 216 10 217, fax (420 2) 2422 38 83
e-mail: mail@osceprag.cz

Additional source of information is the ODIHR Internet Site – where in addition to the information about the ODIHR, its activities and priorities, one can find all election-related statements, press releases and reports.

The address is <http://www.osceprag.cz/inst/odihr/odihr.htm>

ODIHR ANNUAL REPORT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD BY THE DIRECTOR.....	3
ODIHR ACTIVITIES IN 1997	4
Introduction.....	5
ODIHR Restructuring.....	5
Elections.....	5
Human Dimension / Democracy Building.....	7
Implementation of Human Dimension Commitments	9
Conclusions	10
1998 ACTION PLAN	11
ANNEX 1. ELECTION OBSERVATION IN 1997 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	25
Election of Representatives to the Chamber of Counties of the Parliament and of Representatives of Local Government and Self-Government Bodies of the Republic of Croatia, 13 April 1997.....	27
Bulgarian Parliamentary elections 19 April 1997	30
Presidential Election in the Republic of Croatia 15 June 1997.....	32
Parliamentary Elections in Albania 29 June - 6 July 1997.....	33
Bosnia and Herzegovina Municipal Elections 13-14 September 1997	35
Republic of Serbia Parliamentary and Presidential Elections September 21	37
Presidential Elections in the Republic of Montenegro, 5 and 19 October 1997.....	40
National Assembly Elections in Republica Srpska, 22-23 November 1997.....	44
Re-Run of the Presidential Elections, Republic of Serbia, 7 December 1997.....	45
ANNEX 2. OSCE HUMAN DIMENSION IMPLEMENTATION MEETING COMPILATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS MADE IN THE RAPORTEURS' REPORTS.....	47
ANNEX 3. ODIHR ORGANISATIONAL CHART	57

FOREWORD BY THE DIRECTOR

This is the first semi-annual report prepared by the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. In the future, we intend to issue such reports twice a year. They present what has been done in the last months and give some hints on the priorities for the times to come. Our intention is also to make out of this document something useful. For easy reference, all practical recommendations made during election observation operations and during the Warsaw review of implementation meeting are listed as annexes.

Our hope is that this will stimulate the thinking in the OSCE community at large and, who knows, that creative ideas will be brought to our attention. Improvement to our action knows no limits. We rely very much on everyone to increase our efficiency and the relevance of what we are doing. This means that every reader is welcome to provide us with his views and thoughts on what should be done and how it should be done.

It is indeed our deep belief that international organizations are there to serve anyone's needs. We can't of course be overambitious on what ODIHR can achieve. But within its mandate, the Office should make the best possible use of the resources available to contribute to the respect for human dimension commitments, the rule of law and democratic principles throughout the OSCE region. This is a noble task. It is also a demanding one.

The ODIHR has become one of the leading international institutions in the field of election observations. It is developing concrete projects aimed at consolidating the human rights in various countries. It is also continuing to follow closely the evolution of the situation in this field in the whole of the OSCE area. We are aware that the task ahead is enormous, but challenging.

We therefore count on everyone's energy to support advancing our cause, the cause of human dignity, in our region.

Gérard Stoudmann
Ambassador

ODIHR ACTIVITIES IN 1997

Introduction

1997 was a year of changes and challenges for the ODIHR. A new concept was defined. Consequently, new structures were created, with a significant build-up of the personnel resources. But mainly, the Office was actively involved in the field. The most serious challenge faced by the ODIHR this year was the assistance to and the observation of the crucial parliamentary elections, which took place in Albania in June and July under very difficult conditions. The Office also increased its involvement in the promotion of democratic structures and human rights. One of the important achievements in this context was the signature of a Memorandum of Understanding with the Government of Uzbekistan in October. In accordance with its mandate relating to the implementation of commitments, the Office supported the meeting on the review of implementation of OSCE commitments in the human dimension, which was held in Warsaw in November. During this meeting, new ideas were developed in view of increasing the efficiency of the review by the OSCE of the implementation of these commitments.

With these new developments, the Office consolidated its operational capabilities and prepared the ground for more intense efforts in the coming year. Several important elections will take place in 1998. In addition, it is foreseen to develop further democracy-building projects in various regions, such as the Caucasus and Central Asia.

ODIHR Restructuring

Following his appointment, the incoming ODIHR Director presented a concept paper for future ODIHR action, which outlined a plan to transform the ODIHR into an operational instrument of the OSCE. That plan, positively received by the Permanent Council, urged that ODIHR set distinctive priorities within its broad mandate, that the organisation increase its focus on operational activities, and that its staff and structure be adapted accordingly. These priorities cover three areas: the promotion of elections held in line with the OSCE commitments, the promotion of civil society and democratic institutions, and the practical involvement in the monitoring of implementation of the OSCE human dimension commitments.

The proposal for a new organisational structure of the ODIHR has to a large degree been implemented. Two sections, Elections and Human Dimension, were established to unify the activities of the existing ODIHR units and a new deputy director position was created. By dividing administrative and financial duties among two senior staff members, the ODIHR was able to improve its integration with the Chairman in Office, the Permanent Council, OSCE institutions and other international actors and advisers. Unfortunately, this strengthening of the Office is undermined by the inability of the host State to provide adequate office space.

Elections

As the practice of sending election observer missions to assess elections has developed rapidly in recent years, it has become increasingly obvious that an informed assessment of an election process cannot be made on the basis of Election Day observations only. An election process is not a one-

day event. As a result of the Budapest Summit in December 1994, the mandate of the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) is now more comprehensive and aims to achieve long-term observation of the entire election process.

The ODIHR has therefore orientated its activities towards the pursuit of long-term observation of the election process, rather than limited short-term observations on Election Day. This more complete approach was successfully adopted by the ODIHR in a number of elections in 1997: in Croatia (13 April); Bulgaria (19 April); Croatia (15 June); Albania (29 June – 6 July); Bosnia and Herzegovina (13-14 September); Republic of Serbia - Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (21 September - 5 October); Republika Srpska - Bosnia and Herzegovina (22-23 November); Montenegro - Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (5 - 19 October). (See Annex 1 for the list of recommendations made). The ODIHR has also organised Technical Assessment Mission, a smaller election observation mission focussed mainly on the election administration, for the Rerun of the Presidential Election in the Republic of Serbia, on December 7. In addition to the information on the OSCE/ODIHR Website, a compilation of the 1996 and 1997 Election Observation Reports is now available from the Election Section of the ODIHR upon request.

The elections in Albania were a major challenge for the OSCE and the ODIHR, given the prevailing circumstances in the country, and the overall context of conflict resolution in which the elections took place. The ODIHR undertook a vast Election Observation Mission, and fielded also a solid Technical Advisory Group (TAG) with the role of advising the Albanian authorities on practical questions pertaining to the administration of the election (Voter Registration, the Election Law and its implementation, the Media and Voter Education), and to give assistance within the mandate of the OSCE Presence in Albania.

All election observation missions conducted in 1997 based their conclusions on the observation of the whole election process, taking into account the various stages of the election cycle, including: the implementation of the law and election regulations, the effectiveness and impartiality of the pre-election administration, the independence of the media, the nature of the campaign and political environment prior to election day, election day, the final vote count, the announcement of the results, and the handling of the appeals and complaints. Long-term observers are responsible for viewing the pre-election period, and thus assisting short-term observers to place election day observations within an informed context.

Election Administration and Observation was the subject of an ODIHR Human Dimension Seminar on 8 to 11 April 1997, attended by representatives of 45 participating States, Egypt, as Mediterranean partner and four international organisations. On this occasion a broad consensus emerged as to the long-term approach and standard methodology adopted by the ODIHR, as documented in the OSCE/ODIHR Election Observation Handbook. Recommendations were made focusing on the need for the ODIHR to receive an invitation to observe elections three months prior to election day, and on encouraging the participating States to contact the ODIHR for assistance on the implementation of recommendations. Concerns were also expressed over the need for closer co-operation and co-ordination between representatives of various international organisations present on the spot.

In accordance with its mandate, the ODIHR is now able to offer a framework for co-operation, to include observers from other international organisations such as the Council of Europe and the European Parliament, and from relevant non-governmental organisations wishing to participate. The ODIHR offers a common briefing, deployment plan, observer report forms -or checklists- for

statistical analysis, and a forum for debriefing and reporting for all international observers. The Co-operation Agreement signed on September 9 between the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly and the ODIHR creates the framework for joint observation missions and the issuance of a joint statement following an election. The importance of this politically significant step should be emphasised, as from now on the OSCE speaks with one voice and the common recommendations of the observation missions are further enhanced with the support of the Parliamentary Assembly.

The Election Observation Missions are part of the ODIHR's on-going support to countries in democratic institution building in line with agreed-upon OSCE Commitments. Its Final Reports, when critical, are not meant to condemn, but offer a balanced assessment of the entire process and include recommendations for reform (see Annex 1 for conclusions and Recommendations of OSCE / ODIHR 1997 Election Reports). Participating States are encouraged to contact the ODIHR for assistance in implementing the recommendations that may result from an ODIHR election observation and which are contained in these Final Reports.

As a result of the restructuring of the ODIHR, the Election Section is now able to offer and further develop its technical assistance programmes, as already initiated in Albania (Voter Registration Programme) and in Montenegro (Review of the Election Law). A long-term Technical Assistance Strategy is also being developed for Central Asia. These missions can be a follow-up to the ODIHR recommendations or a very long-term assistance for the preparation of an election.

Human Dimension / Democracy Building

In the area of Human Dimension / Democracy Building, the ODIHR has begun the practice of developing formal and integrated workplans. The projects developed in this framework are focused on practical issues. One such example is the Memorandum of Understanding signed on 16 October with the Government of Uzbekistan, which includes a commitment to implement several projects in the field of democratisation and human rights. Similar ODIHR projects are envisaged for the other Central Asian States. In addition, proposals have been developed for Armenia, Azerbaijan and Georgia, taking into account the very specific issues in the field of democracy building these countries face.

The 1997 activities of the **Rule of Law** Unit can be summarised under three general headings: expert assessment and review missions, technical assistance projects and special initiatives. In support of OSCE operations in several countries, legal expert assessment and review missions were dispatched to Albania, Armenia, Belarus, Croatia, Moldova, Ukraine and Uzbekistan. Each mission travelled under a specific mandate and produced a report to support the activities of the Chairman-in-Office and to develop follow-on ODIHR assistance projects. Technical assistance was also provided to several participating States including Albania, Armenia, Croatia, Georgia, Moldova, the Russian Federation, Ukraine and Uzbekistan, in an array of fields including expert analysis and assistance in the preparation of laws, practical management training for constitutional courts and multi-phase prison official training projects. The Unit also co-sponsored a Roundtable on Justice and Reconciliation in Bosnia-Herzegovina with the U.S. Institute of Peace and the Council of Europe in an effort to develop a series of recommendations to contribute to national reconciliation

The Human Dimension Unit has provided assistance to the establishment of National Human Rights Protection (**Ombudsman Institutions**) to several participating States. In this regard

the ODIHR has established privileged working relations with Uzbek, Kirgiz, Georgian, Polish and Albanian authorities and is examining co-operation with several additional countries. The ODIHR has also been co-sponsoring or attending international/regional consultations in this field in close co-operation with the CoE, UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and the UNDP.

The recommendation of the 1996 OSCE/ODIHR Seminar on the constitutional, legal and administrative aspects of **freedom of religion**, namely that the ODIHR establish a **panel of experts** to address the issue, was implemented in 1997. The work of the panel was very timely, professional (cf. their individual contributions and common report), unique (no other IGO has been active in a comparable scope) and committed (on a voluntary basis). The issue is still very important as can be witnessed by its conflict potential within and among a number of participating states.

Human Dimension education/training is one of the core elements of the ODIHR's mandate. In addition to NGO specific projects, education projects carried out by OSCE missions and the annual/bi-annual OSCE / ODIHR Human Dimensions Seminars the ODIHR is implementing Human Rights education projects on an increasingly frequent basis. Regional and sub-regional workshops were conducted. Human Dimension education in the last year included a multitude of training activities such as professionally tailored projects for media, teachers, NGOs, ombudspersons, legal bodies, refugee or Roma representatives, and others. The ODIHR, for many education activities, co-operates with UN Agencies, the Council of Europe, international and local NGOs, as well as with national human rights institutions and institutes. With a special Danish contribution, the ODIHR is engaged in a three-phase human rights education program in the five Central Asian countries.

The OSCE / ODIHR conducted the human dimension seminar on the **Promotion of Women's** participation in Society (14-17 October 1997). The recommendations stemming from that seminar included the demand to the participating States to make more efforts in general toward the promotion of gender equality at all levels: staffing, activities, projects. ODIHR will conduct Regional Consultations on this issue in Tashkent in 1998.

In 1997 the **NGO Unit** initiated a series of innovative activities designed to increase co-operation between national and international NGOs as well as to stimulate the development of consultative mechanisms between non-governmental and governmental actors. In the fall of 1997 two such programs were initiated in Albania and Uzbekistan. In Albania, the NGO Network met on two occasions in a local Tirana meeting followed by a larger national meeting, which included regional NGO representatives. This meeting produced a focussed compilation of issues, problems and recommended solutions, which were presented to the Albanian government and to the Working Group established by the Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office, Dr. Vranitzky. In Uzbekistan, the NGO Unit, in co-operation with the National Human Rights Centre and the OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia began to implement the first-ever series of NGO meetings with government officials. Each focuses on specific and current issues related to human rights. Simultaneously, the Unit has begun to restructure the NGO database in order to facilitate its application for ODIHR units as well as NGOs and participating States, to increase its outreach activities and to facilitate the incorporation of NGOs into the daily activities of OSCE institutions.

The ODIHR's activities in the area of migration focused on **the follow-up to the CIS Migration Conference**. The main objective of these activities is to assist the recently admitted OSCE participating States meet their OSCE commitments on topics of immediate relevance for issues related to displaced persons. A project was developed to examine the transition of CIS states from the registration permit (*propiska*) system to a registration system that conforms to OSCE commitments and international standards on freedom of movement. The ODIHR co-sponsored experts' meeting on this issue with the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees in Kiev in December 1997. A number of OSCE participating States requested to have training projects on freedom of movement in 1998.

The ODIHR has also co-operated closely with OSCE Missions of Long Duration on migration issues. For example, in Georgia, the ODIHR is working with the OSCE Mission, with the Georgian government, and with the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and the Council of Europe on resolving legal issues concerning the return of persons displaced as a result of the Georgian-South Ossetian conflict. In 1998, the ODIHR is planning to assist the return of displaced persons by training the relevant officials and by developing projects on tolerance building in the areas of return.

In addition to an increased co-operation with OSCE Missions, the ODIHR is also working more closely with interested participating States and other OSCE institutions. Contacts with international organisations have been expanded to combine resources and develop mutually reinforcing programs. Joint projects are currently underway in Albania, Armenia, Georgia, Azerbaijan and Central Asian countries.

Implementation of Human Dimension Commitments

The ODIHR continues to collect and disseminate facts, figures and opinions about the state of implementation in the human dimension. It continues to fulfil an early warning function by informing the Chairman-in-Office of alleged non-implementation of human dimension commitments. The ODIHR is ready to enhance, if so requested, its role as an advisory body to the Permanent Council and the Chairman-in-Office. The ODIHR continues also to serve as point of contact on Roma and Sinti issues.

Fulfilling its mandate of assisting in the review of implementation of human dimension commitments, the ODIHR provided material and organisational support to the OSCE Human Dimension Implementation Meeting, which took place in Warsaw, November 12-28. It gave the opportunity to participating States, NGOs and international organisations to thoroughly review the implementation of all OSCE commitments in this field (see Rapporteurs' Reports in Annex 2). Proposals were made to enhance the review process in the future. It will be up to the Chairman-in-Office and the participating States to agree on a formula allowing for a more efficient and result-oriented review of implementation.

Conclusions

The biggest challenge for the ODIHR in the coming years will be the translation into practical activities of its tasks in election assistance and the promotion of the human dimension. The more project-oriented approach this warrants will require a new attitude of both the ODIHR and its officials and also the OSCE community at large. The goal is to turn the ODIHR into a flexible human dimension tool, always at the disposal of the OSCE and its participating States, thus helping the consolidation and reinforcement of the OSCE's human dimension in all its aspects.

Through a combination of structural, administrative and substantive changes implemented this past year the ODIHR has begun to quickly transform itself into a flexible, integrated and fully operational instrument of the OSCE. The ODIHR is now well prepared to further assist participating States consolidate and implement their human dimension commitments.

Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights

I. ELECTION SECTION

COUNTRY	TYPE OF ELECTION	TIMING
A. Tentative Observation Schedule		
MOLDOVA	Parliamentary Elections	March 22
UKRAINE	Parliamentary Elections	March 29
FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF YUGOSLAVIA (REPUBLIC OF MONTENEGRO)	Parliamentary Elections	Spring (TBC)
BOSNIA & HERZEGOVINA	Presidential Elections	Spring - Autumn
	Parliamentary Elections	Autumn
SLOVAK REPUBLIC	Parliamentary Elections	Autumn (TBC)
THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA	Parliamentary Elections	Spring - Autumn (TBC)
LATVIA	Parliamentary Elections	October

COUNTRY	TYPE OF ELECTION	TIMING
Tentative Observation Schedule (continued)		
AZERBAIJAN	Presidential Elections Municipal Elections	<i>Autumn (TBC)</i>
TAJIKISTAN	Parliamentary Elections	<i>TBC</i>
B. Technical Assistance Projects		
ALBANIA	Civic and Voter Registration Review of the Election Law	<i>September 1997</i> <i>Pending</i>
FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF YUGOSLAVIA (REPUBLIC OF MONTENEGRO)	Technical Assistance for the Upcoming Parliamentary Elections (scheduled first half of 1998)	<i>November 1997 -</i>
ARMENIA	Review of Draft Election Law	<i>December 1997 January 1998</i>
UZBEKISTAN	Preliminary Experts Visit to Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan to Assess the Needs for Technical Assistance in View of Preparations for Future Elections Regional Seminar: Training Programme for Central Asian Election Administrators	<i>October 16 - 23, 1997</i> <i>Spring Summer 1998</i>
TAJIKISTAN	Assessment for Technical Assistance (Jointly with UN)	<i>January - February</i>

* TBC: to be confirmed

II. HUMAN DIMENSION SECTION

COUNTRY	EVENT	OBJECTIVE	TIMING	PARTNER	FUNDING	UNIT
A. Projects						
ALBANIA						
	Human Rights Expert Mission Phase I	Consultation with regard to the preparation of a national human rights programme and the establishment of a national human rights/ombudsman institution	<i>January</i>	OSCE Presence in Albania / CoE	ODIHR	HD
	Human Rights Expert Mission Phase II	To assist government prepare for national human rights/ombudsman institution and human rights plan	<i>February-March</i>	OSCE Presence in Albania / CoE	ODIHR / Voluntary contribution	HD
	Technical Assistance	To strengthen and reform the Albanian legal education system	<i>January December</i>	OSCE Presence in Albania / International Rule of Law Centre	ODIHR	RL
	Technical Assistance	For the development of a national alternative dispute resolution network	<i>January December</i>	OSCE Presence in Albania / International Rule of Law Centre / Foundation "Conflict Resolution and Reconciliation of Disputes"	ODIHR	RL / NGO
	NGO Network (Continuation)	To ensure input of civil society into national human rights policy	<i>January - December</i>	OSCE Presence in Albania	ODIHR / OSCE Presence in Albania	NGO
	Correctional Officer Training Programme	To implement a multi-phase training project and third-country apprenticeship programme	<i>January - December</i>	OSCE Presence in Albania / CoE / Ministry of Justice / Ministry of Interior / Polish Association of Legal Education	ODIHR	RL

COUNTRY	EVENT	OBJECTIVE	TIMING	PARTNER	FUNDING	UNIT
ARMENIA						
	Human Rights Education Expert Mission	To assist the authorities establish a national human rights plan	<i>April</i>	CoE / EU Commission	ODIHR	HD
	Ombudsman Expert Mission	To assist the authorities establish a national Ombudsman office	<i>April</i>	CoE / EU Commission	ODIHR	HD
	Freedom of Movement Programme Phase I	To demonstrate internationally accepted methods of registering population movements	<i>May</i>	Pending	Proposal to be submitted to the EU	HD
BELARUS						
	Regular Government-NGO Consultations	To facilitate the input of civil society into decision making processes	<i>February December</i>	Pending	ODIHR	NGO
BOSNIA-HERZEGOVINA						
	Legal Training Project	To train judicial officials on the "Rules of the Road"	<i>Pending</i>	OSCE Mission to Bosnia-Herzegovina / CoE	US Department of State	RL
AZERBAIJAN						
	Human Rights Education Expert Mission	To assist the authorities establish a national human rights plan	<i>March</i>	CoE / EU Commission	ODIHR	HD
	Ombudsman Expert Mission	To assist the authorities establish a national Ombudsman office	<i>March</i>	CoE / EU Commission	ODIHR	HD
	Training Programme: Techniques to Combat Organised Crime	To train law enforcement officials on the legal and technical methods to combat organised crime	<i>March</i>	Ministry of Justice / Prosecutor General / Ministry of Foreign Affairs	ODIHR	RL
GEORGIA						
	NGO Network	To ensure the input of civil society into national human rights policy	<i>January December</i>	OSCE Mission to Georgia	ODIHR	NGO
	Training Programme: Techniques to Combat Organised Crime	To train law enforcement officials on the legal and technical methods to combat organised crime	<i>March</i>	Ministry of Justice / Prosecutor General / Ministry of Foreign Affairs / OSCE Mission to Georgia	ODIHR	RL
	Human Rights Education Expert Mission	To assist authorities establish a national human rights plan	<i>March</i>	CoE / EU Commission / OSCE Mission to Georgia	ODIHR	HD

COUNTRY	EVENT	OBJECTIVE	TIMING	PARTNER	FUNDING	UNIT
GEORGIA (continued)						
	Ombudsman Expert Mission	To advise newly nominated Ombudsman and prepare follow-up assistance	<i>March</i>	CoE / EU Commission / OSCE Mission to Georgia	ODIHR	HD
	Freedom of Movement Training	To train relevant officials on implementation of the new law on freedom of movement	<i>May</i>	Government of Georgia / OSCE Mission to Georgia	Proposal to be submitted to the EU Commission	HD
	Training of Law Enforcement Officials on Refugee Issues	To assist Georgian authorities manage the return of persons displaced as a result of Georgian-Ossetian conflict	<i>February</i>	UNHCR / OSCE Mission to Georgia	Proposal to be submitted	HD
KAZAKSTAN						
	Technical Assistance Programme	To provide judicial training and assist in legal infrastructure development	<i>Pending</i>	Pending	Ministry of Justice / OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	RL
KYRGYZSTAN						
	Constitutional Court Training Programme	To provide technical assistance	<i>January December</i>	University of Paris / Constitutional Court of France / OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR	RL
	Regular Government-NGO Consultations	To facilitate the input of civil society in decision-making processes	<i>Spring</i>	OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR	NGO
	Legal Expertise	To assist prepare a draft law on the establishment of a national human rights institution	<i>Pending</i>	Ministry of Foreign Affairs / OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR / Voluntary contribution	HD
	Police Training Programme Phase I and II	To train on international management techniques	<i>Pending</i>	Polish Association of Legal Education / HMS Prison Service / OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR	RL
MOLDOVA						
	Prison Training Project Phase IV	Training of Trainers Programme; Presentation of Manual	<i>January</i>	Ministry of Justice / Polish Association of Legal Education / OSCE Mission to Moldova	ODIHR	RL
	Training Programme on Legal Reform and Implementation	To assist the Ministry of Justice implement legal reforms	<i>Pending</i>	OSCE Mission to Moldova / Polish Association of Legal Education	ODIHR	RL

COUNTRY	EVENT	OBJECTIVE	TIMING	PARTNER	FUNDING	UNIT
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Professional Training Programme for the Judiciary Phase IV	To implement the fourth phase of the training programme	<i>Pending</i>	Supreme Court of the Russian Federation	ODIHR / Canada	RL
TAJIKISTAN	Government-NGO Consultations	To strengthen the role of local NGOs in the peace process and the post conflict period in Tajikistan	<i>Spring</i>	OSCE Mission to Tajikistan	ODIHR	NGO
	Political Training of NGOs	To provide training for NGOs likely to develop into political parties	<i>Prior to parliamentary elections</i>	OSCE Mission to Tajikistan	ODIHR	NGO
	Prison Official Training Programme	To implement a multi-phase prison official training programme	<i>Pending</i>	Polish Association of Legal Education / OSCE Mission to Tajikistan	ODIHR	RL
	Technical Assistance	To examine the legislation and implementation of the Tajik human rights institution	<i>Pending</i>	UNDP / OSCE Mission to Tajikistan	OSCE special fund	HD
	Expert Mission on Technical Assistance for Refugees	To assist authorities draft regulations governing returnee property issues	<i>January - February</i>	OSCE Mission to Tajikistan	ODIHR	HD
TURKEY	<i>These project proposals are subject to a formal confirmation by the Turkish authorities</i>					
	Ombudsman Expert Mission Phase I	To consult with authorities on the establishment of a national human rights institution	<i>February</i>	Pending	ODIHR	HD
	Ombudsman Expert Mission Phase II	To provide legal expertise and organise a national roundtable on national human rights protection institutions	<i>Pending</i>	Pending	ODIHR	HD
	Correctional Officer Initiative	To develop a comprehensive targeted correctional officer training programme	<i>Pending</i>	Pending	Pending	RL

COUNTRY	EVENT	OBJECTIVE	TIMING	PARTNER	FUNDING	UNIT
UKRAINE						
	Constitutional Court Training Programme	Technical assistance to support administrative and management reforms	<i>January December</i>	OSCE Mission to Ukraine / Constitutional Court of Spain	ODIHR	RL
UZBEKISTAN						
	Expert Mission	To develop the national human rights plan	<i>January</i>	OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia / UNDP	ODIHR	HD
	Constitutional Court Training Programme	A multi-phase constitutional court management training programme	<i>January December</i>	University of Paris / Constitutional Court of France	ODIHR	RL
	Regular Government-NGO Consultations	To facilitate the input of civil society in decision-making process	<i>January- December</i>	OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia / National Centre for Human Rights	ODIHR	NGO
	Human Rights Programme for Law Enforcement Agencies	To incorporate international human rights standards in police reform programme	<i>Pending</i>	OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR	HD
	Follow-up Assistance to the Uzbek Ombudsman s Office	To enhance the newly established Ombudsman office by training and study tours and assist with developing a national human rights plan	<i>Continuous</i>	UNDP	ODIHR / UNDP	HD
	Border Guard Training	To train border guards on international human rights standards and trans-border humanitarian assistance	<i>Spring</i>	IOM	ODIHR	HD
REGIONAL						
	Regional Human Rights Training for Human Rights Teachers and Experts with Selected Participants from Central Asian States	To train regional human rights experts and teachers and to promote regional human rights networking	<i>Spring</i>	OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR / Voluntary contribution	HD
B. Other Activities						
RUSSIAN FEDERATION						
	Expert Roundtable on Human Rights and Displaced Persons	To examine issues pertaining to the human rights of displaced persons	<i>Pending</i>	Office of the Presidential Commissioner for Human Rights of the Russian Federation	Proposal to be submitted	HD

COUNTRY	EVENT	OBJECTIVE	TIMING	PARTNER	FUNDING	UNIT
TURKMENISTAN						
	National Roundtable on Human Rights Institutions	To examine practical requirements for the establishment of a national human rights / ombudsman institution	<i>Pending</i>	UNDP / OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR / Voluntary contribution	HD
REGIONAL						
	Women in Public Life	Regional consultation in Tashkent for participants from Central Asian countries	<i>First week of June</i>	OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia	ODIHR / Voluntary contribution	HD
	Public Awareness Campaign	To bring various Human Dimension issues to the attention of the general public	<i>In conjunction with ODIHR projects</i>	Local associations of journalists and broadcasters	ODIHR	PR
	OSCE Human Dimension Seminar for National Human Rights / Ombudsman Institutions and Institutes	To promote information exchange and the establishment of national human rights plans	<i>Pending</i>	Office of the Polish Ombudsman / CoE	ODIHR / Office of the Polish Ombudsman / CoE	ODIHR / HD
	Follow-up to the Freedom of Movement Experts Workshop (of the CIS and interested states)	To report on the implementation of OSCE freedom of movement commitments	<i>April</i>	Other international organisations and NGOs	ODIHR	HD
	Regional Roma and Sinti NGO Meeting	To formulate a strategy for assistance from the international community	<i>Pending</i>	Pending	ODIHR	HD
OTHER						
	"Human Rights and You"	Human Rights training manual	<i>Pending</i>	US Federal Judicial Center	US Department of State / USAID	RL
	Ad Hoc Assessment Missions and Reports on Human Rights Implementation	To monitor upcoming critical developments with regard to human rights in the OSCE region	<i>Pending</i>	Other international organizations and NGOs	ODIHR	HD
	Roundtable on Human Rights Monitoring	To improve working methods and tools in monitoring human dimension commitments in the OSCE region	<i>Pending</i>	International Human Rights Trust	ODIHR / EU Commission	HD
	1998 Review Meeting	Preparation of reports on relevant human dimension issues	<i>November</i>	Chairman-in-Office / OSCE Secretary general	OSCE	ODIHR / HD

ANNEX 1

ELECTION OBSERVATION IN 1997

RECOMMENDATIONS

Election of Representatives to the Chamber of Counties of the Parliament and of Representatives of Local Government and Self-Government Bodies of the Republic of Croatia, 13 April 1997

Elections in the Republic of Croatia (Excluding the UNTAES Region)

The ODIHR commends the election administration in the Republic of Croatia for administering a generally efficient election process. The voting arrangements for displaced persons constitute a complicated voting procedure, which was reportedly handled in a professional manner. However, despite the fact that the administration of the elections represented an improvement over the administration of the parliamentary elections of October 1995, some significant issues of concern remain and the ODIHR would like to offer a number of recommendations.

Elections in the UNTAES Region

The OSCE / ODIHR enjoyed good co-operation with UNTAES and recognises the commitment of UNTAES to oversee an election process in challenging circumstances and according to a very demanding time schedule due to political considerations on the necessity of elections. Without any doubt, a high level of voter participation was achieved.

The short time available created extreme difficulties when it comes to the preparations. The election was characterised by significant technical problems mainly resulting from the tight time schedule., including: last minute changes, even after voting began, of election regulations and the late notification of the changed regulations to polling commissions and voters; inaccuracies in the voters lists; the late delivery and absence of election materials; and the late opening of polling stations.

Once technical problems became apparent on election day, UNTAES should be commended for taking prompt and far reaching steps in order to correct the process. It can be reasonably assumed that despite extensive prevailing technical problems those who wanted to vote had the possibility to do so. Furthermore, the parties to the election have accepted the results.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The time-frame

The Croatian election law provides the rule that an election must be announced 30 days before the election day. The obvious consequence is that the time constraint put on the election administration is heavy. An example on the extreme time constraint is that polling station committees can be appointed just five days before the election. The same time limit is valid for decision on polling station locations.

The time constraint had serious implications when it comes to the possibilities to carry out a proper voter education campaign, sufficient training of the election officials and time for the political parties to register, nominate and campaign.

In any country, an election within a month is a mighty challenge. Therefore a longer period of technical and political preparation for the next election is very essential and the election should be called for at longer notice.

The legal framework

The legal framework was changed by mandatory instructions at a very late stage of the process. In recent years there has been a pattern of significant changes to election regulations, sometimes shortly before the election, which has again been repeated in this election. For example, there were changes on the regulations for spoilt and invalid ballots, which were introduced just days before the election.

The late adjustments to the legal framework were difficult to communicate to the election officials and therefore it was difficult to ensure that the rules were implemented in a uniform manner. Such changes can create an unstable and unpredictable environment in which political parties in Croatia compete for election.

The election rules were to be found in several laws. As election laws often are implemented by non lawyers it is essential that the rules are simple and straight forward and easily understood by lay men. It would be an advantage if the laws could be integrated into one comprehensive election law and if the rules could be simplified.

One specific feature of the Croatian law is the concept of "the bearer of the list," a human symbol for the party, whose name was on every list of the party even when the bearer was not a candidate in the election. Such concepts are not likely to make the rules clear and easily understood by anybody.

Composition of the Election Commissions

A significant concern is that the Central and Commune Election Commissions and the Polling Station Committees may not be selected in an unbiased manner. Many of the judges and lawyers that compose the so-called independent Central and Commune Election Commissions are state employees. In turn they appoint the Polling Station Committees which administer the election at polling station level. As long as this remains the case, there will remain a lack of confidence in Croatia that the Central and Commune Election Commissions and Polling Station Committees are composed of independent persons.

In February 1997, the HDZ-controlled House of Representatives rejected an opposition-proposed draft law mandating that election commissions be multi-party. Earlier, the one-party HDZ Government had also denounced the proposed draft law.

The Croatian government should consider amending its electoral law to ensure clearly defined multi-party participation in election commissions at all levels. While it is recognised that political parties can place observers in the commissions, this is no substitute for full fledged multi-party commissions.

Transparency in the preparations

In the ODIHR report from the 1995 parliamentary elections, the lack of transparency of the process was pointed out as a major concern. Some of this concern still remains. Reports on manipulation on constituency borders, late amendments to the regulations and limited information shows clearly that the reliance and confidence in the electoral process is not widely spread. It is necessary go further to establish clear, transparent and widely accepted procedures for the preparations of the elections.

Training of election officials

An efficient training of all election officials is a prerequisite for a uniform implementation of the election rules. The training of the officials therefore is of extreme importance. Under a less tight timetable, more resources should be put into the training of the officials.

Training of party observers

Party observers were reportedly not very well informed about the procedures in the polling stations and in many cases were reported satisfied with the proceeding in cases when international observers were not satisfied. More training of party observers is necessary to guarantee the public transparency and control of the process.

Domestic observers

The ODIHR recognises an improvement in the access of party observers to the election process. However transparency is one of the main OSCE commitments and there is room for further developments in this field, especially with regard to civic organisations trained in election observation.

The Media

Concerning the pre-election period, the ODIHR has previously noted in the 1995 elections that proper access for all parties to the state media was not assured, and there is no clear sign that this issue has been seriously addressed when it comes to the state radio and television. However, reports indicate that at the local level the media situation varies from region to region.

Further steps must be taken to guarantee equal access to state media, otherwise the reliance in the political and electoral process is seriously threatened.

Voter education

Many of the reported technical short-comings when it comes to the voting procedures can be explained with lack of voter education. Family voting, the lack of secrecy of the vote, not using the polling booths, etc. can be addressed with increased voter education for the next election.

Similar problems occurred in the 1995 parliamentary elections, where on numerous occasions it was reported that voters voted in public view. This ongoing problem indicates that voter education and training of the election officials on this issue have not yet been sufficient. A fundamental OSCE commitment is to ensure that votes are cast by secret ballot.

Bulgarian Parliamentary elections 19 April 1997

Summary of conclusions

The OSCE/ODIHR Observation Mission concludes that the election was conducted generally in line with the OSCE Commitments. However, anomalies in the election legislation will have to be addressed before future elections / a full-scale review of the election law and related legislation needs to take place prior to the next set of National Assembly elections to bring the legal framework up to date with the new political realities that exist in Bulgaria.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Following the National Assembly elections of 19 April 1997 the mission would wish to suggest the following recommendations based on its observations:

Election Law

The 1991 Law on the Election of Members of the National Assembly, Municipal Councillors and Mayors needs to be reviewed, reformed and brought up to date. In particular the sections relating to the election of mayors and municipalities should be amended as well as sections relating to the appointment of District Election Commissions.

Political Parties Law

The 1991 Political Parties Law should also be included in any review of the legal framework. In particular the review of the Political Parties Law should take account of the anomalies regarding the threshold for nomination of non party candidates and the extremely liberal threshold of only 50 members required to register a political party and contest elections.

Voters Lists

The compilation of voters lists requires further attention. In particular municipalities should be encouraged, either through legislation or otherwise, to regularly update the lists in cases where citizens have either left the district or are deceased.

Nomination of Candidates

Clear guidelines should be issued by the CEC to all registered parties regarding the nomination of candidates. In particular, parties should be made aware of the deadlines for the nomination of candidates and parties contesting the election should either have observer status at meetings of the CEC or should receive copies of the CEC's resolutions.

Coloured Ballot Paper System

The coloured ballot paper system should be reviewed: not only is it extremely expensive but it no longer commands the confidence of the political parties. The system could either be brought into line with the system of white ballots for Presidential elections and for non party candidates in National Assembly elections or a single ballot system could be considered.

Campaign Finance

There is a clear need to review the regulation regarding campaign finance, particularly as one major party eschewed their allotment of state funds, and most category A parties made substantial donations, through social and charitable organisations and municipalities, to the poor and needy during the election campaign. Furthermore, consideration should be given during such a review for the need to improve the accountability of campaign donations, particularly as they were a source of considerable speculation during the campaign.

Access to Media

Clearly the original regulatory framework regarding the access to the media has been superseded by events and is in need of reform. Any review of the system of allotting media time should take account of the concerns of the broadcasters as well as the political parties. Given the growth of the private sector some consideration should be given to the regulations governing both state and private broadcasters. Furthermore, the criteria for dividing parties into two unequal categories should be reviewed in the light of any reform to the election law and the political parties law, particularly if the effect of this reform would dramatically reduce the number of contestants.

Administration of the Electoral Process

The administration of the electoral process was overall assessed very positively. However, the failure of some SECs to fill out their protocols according to procedures does require attention. A review of training, particular of urban SECs, should take place. Consideration should be given to amending the wording of the protocols and to reinstate a check on the numbers of additional voters, the number of voters on the original lists and the number of certificate voters should be added to the additional verification checks in the computer software.

Presidential Election in the Republic of Croatia 15 June 1997

Summary of Conclusions

The Mission has concluded that the process leading up to the election was fundamentally flawed, and did not meet the minimum standards for a meaningful and democratic election in line with OSCE standards.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The OSCE / ODIHR Observation Mission offers the following recommendations:

Independent Media

The Croatian authorities should consider taking immediate steps to ensure that the governing board of HRT becomes a truly de-politicised and independent body, in order to prevent future abuses of access to the state media.

Out of Country Voting

The issue of whether or not ethnic Croats who permanently reside in Bosnia-Herzegovina should be afforded Croatian citizenship should be addressed. If present practice is considered out of keeping with OSCE commitments, or with the Dayton Agreement, legislation should be introduced to bring it into line with OSCE standards.

Composition of Election commissions

The Croatian government should consider amending its electoral law to ensure clearly defined multi-party participation in election commissions at all levels. While it is recognised that political parties can place observers in the commissions, this is no substitute for full fledged multi-party commissions.

Disenfranchisement of Refugees

The Croatian government should take appropriate steps to ensure that all individuals with the right to Croatian citizenship (and franchise) are able to take advantage of that right without unnecessary impediment.

Election Monitoring

The Croatian Government should take all necessary steps to ensure accreditation of non-partisan domestic monitors in future elections.

Campaign Resources

Croatian regulations relating to campaign, financing and transparency thereof should be reviewed, in order to enable all parties to compete with each other on a basis of equal treatment as stipulated in the OSCE commitments.

Candidate Debates

The major candidates in the next election should consider participating in televised debates, a practice now followed in most democracies.

Parliamentary Elections in Albania

29 June - 6 July 1997

Background Information

After a deep political and economic crisis struck Albania at the beginning of 1997, a Government of National Reconciliation was formed with the participation of all major political parties of Albania. One of the main points of the platform of the Government of National Reconciliation, signed on March 9 1997, was the organisation of new Parliamentary elections, no later than June 1997, under full international monitoring. The election of a new Parliament was considered a crucial step in the process which aimed at putting an end to the political, social and economic crisis disrupting the country.

Dr. Franz Vranitzky, former Chancellor of the Republic of Austria, was appointed as a Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office in Albania. In accordance with the OSCE Permanent Council Decisions N.158/March 20 1997 and N.160/March 27 1997 the OSCE, in co-ordination with other international organisations, established a Presence in Tirana to provide, among other things, advice and assistance in election preparation and to observe the elections. The experts of the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) joined the OSCE Presence in Albania in early May to start the operation.

Summary of Conclusions

The ODIHR concluded that the Albanian Parliamentary Elections of 1997 can be deemed as acceptable, given the prevailing circumstances in the country. This election process has to be viewed within the context of a conflict resolution process following the grave political crisis that preceded the election, and which had immediate consequences for the election standards.

The Referendum

A Referendum on the adoption of a Constitutional Monarchy was conducted at the same time as the Parliamentary elections. The OSCE was not mandated to monitor the Referendum and therefore did not report on it. The TAG counselled against the dual running of two election processes, but the Albanian authorities chose not to take this advice.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The ODIHR would like to offer the following recommendations for electoral reform in the Republic of Albania:

Election Law

There should be continued examination of the Election law to ensure that it precisely reflects modifications in the election system.

Consideration should also be given to achieving a broad consensus for reform of the electoral system, which could guarantee that the proportion of the mandates of the parties be as close as possible as the proportion of the votes cast for those parties.

The process of establishing election commissions of a multi-party nature as soon as the election is officially called for, and before the registration process for candidates commences should be encouraged. The composition of the election commissions might be extended after the registration of parties/candidates to include a potential representation of all contestants of the elections

Note should be taken of the compressed election timescale brought about by recent reforms; it is suggested that these timescales be re-examined in the light of events during this election and

previous ODIHR recommendations. The establishment of a more realistic timetable in the election law for election-related deadlines would ensure a more orderly, transparent and uniform process.

The law should explicitly state all details concerning the validity or invalidity of a ballot paper.

Central Election Commission

A close examination of the procedures and methods of working within the Central Election Commission will be necessary to overcome the existing difficulties in achieving effective, uniform and transparent election administration. The reluctance of the CEC to follow the advice of the TAG, which could have improved the process, was particularly disturbing during this election. The lack of transparency in the process of registration of candidates and the aggregation of the votes is a point of serious concern. A uniform and transparent election administration by the CEC would be greatly improved by the issuance of timely guidelines and written decisions explaining the implementation of the Election Law, which should be uniformly supplied to ZEC's without delay.

Zone & Polling Station Commission Training

Standardised training in the election process will be necessary for zone and polling station commission staff which should follow from improvements at Central Election Commission level. This training should be undertaken as a matter of urgency and should cover all aspects of the implementation of the Election Law.

Voter Registration

A complete voter registration exercise should be undertaken immediately in order to prepare for any forthcoming elections. This can be combined with a civic registration process which will be necessary in view of recent large-scale movements of the population. The right to easily inspect the register should be ensured in practice as well as in the law, and the process for amending the register should be explained to the electorate

It should, however, be stressed that a complete and accurate voter registration process is not a one month event.

The Media

The Republic of Albania should continue the process of establishing democratic standards in the performance of the State media, which should ensure equitable time and editorial presentation to political parties to convey their message to voters, and augment programs that allow parties/candidates to exchange their views in dialogue with one another. The governing board of the State Radio and Television should represent a cross-section of political opinion and act as an independent and depoliticized body.

Voter Education

More time should be devoted by the election and State administration, and by the media, during the run-up to an election, to the explanation of voting procedures and to the election campaign. This must be done in conjunction with improvements in media coverage noted above.

Domestic Observers

The Albanian authorities should take all necessary steps to ensure accreditation of non-partisan civic observers, as well as party observers, in all future elections.

Bosnia and Herzegovina Municipal Elections

13-14 September 1997

Background information

The achievements of the OSCE Mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina, who worked in co-operation with its local counterparts at all levels of the election administration in order to realise these elections, should be commended. These Municipal Elections are a considerable achievement, despite some of the technical shortcomings, given the fact that they were organised within the context of a conflict resolution process. In particular, the fact that it was possible to achieve 100% supervision during the registration period and the election days has been an important factor in significantly improving upon last years elections and in preventing large scale manipulation and fraud.

These elections must be assessed in the post-war context, and in full recognition that the Dayton agreement is far from being fully complied with. This is particularly true in the areas of freedom of movement, return of displaced persons and freedom of the media. The elections have also been conducted under the shadow of the large number of indicted war criminals who are still at large and influential in this society.

Conclusions

While recognising the long way ahead before elections in Bosnia and Herzegovina become a routine event in compliance with the OSCE commitments, these municipal elections do represent a significant accomplishment in the peace process. Their ultimate success will depend upon the parties fully implementing and complying with the final results.

The parties carry a huge responsibility in implementing all the other parts of the GFAP like freedom of movement, return of refugees, etc. to create the right basis for all democratic processes.

However, further progress will have to be made in view of the next elections. The international community must remain fully engaged in its efforts to maintain the peace and assist the development and institutionalisation of democracy in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The ODIHR would like to recommend the following changes to be made for future elections in Bosnia and Herzegovina:

The Responsibilities of the Parties

- The parties should recognise the importance of abiding by the Rules and Regulations and adhering to the words and spirit of the Dayton Agreement.
- Country-wide official media must be given a framework which offers the public a pluralistic spectrum of news and comment. It should also be ensured that inflammatory language and war mongering propaganda are not broadcast.

Rules and Administration

- The expertise in electoral systems should be strengthened within the election administration, and the rules should be made less open for tactical considerations by the parties (e.g. in Mostar). A transfer to a division-based method, such as Laguë, from the present Method of

Largest Remainder should be considered. If ethnic quotas are to be combined with proportional distribution between parties such as in Mostar, the rules should be properly authorised and the effects clearly analysed and understood by the parties involved.

- Electoral Rules and Regulations should be adopted well in advance of an election. Administrative procedures should also be adopted in advance, ensuring full understanding by all parties.
- The electoral staff on the ground should have enough time and resources to plan sufficiently ahead and to train those tasked with the administrative implementation. This was a pertinent lesson learned from the early stages of the voter registration process for Municipal Elections.

Transfer of Responsibilities

- The Rules and Regulations should be clear and coherent, so they can be applied even in difficult political situations. In particular the provisions for the PEC, or its Chairman, to overrule decisions made by PEC sub-commissions should be clearly defined. This is extremely important in the transfer of authority to regular civic institutions.
- The administrative structure should be changed in such a way that the Bosnia and Herzegovina authorities are in a position to take over the full responsibility eventually. At present the administration of the Voters Registers, the logistics, the decision-making etc. is all decided by the OSCE, and the effort involved in transferring this to a Permanent Election Commission should not be underestimated.
- Taking Recommendation C.2 into account, it must, however, be stressed that the international presence and a heavy involvement in the elections from the OSCE will still be required.

Transparency

- The transparency of the process should be improved, so that registration figures and detailed election results are made available to the public, enabling full scrutiny of the figures. The strategy for making them public needs to be established well in advance.

Republic of Serbia Parliamentary Election
September 21, 1997
And
Presidential Election
September 21 and October 5, 1997

Summary of Conclusions

The OSCE has completed its observation of the Presidential and Parliamentary elections in the Republic of Serbia and has concluded that the serious issues raised in the Gonzalez Report still remain unresolved. While the Election Day procedures at polling station level were for the most part carried out in an adequate manner, an election process is not a one day event, and the overall election process is fundamentally flawed. While this election did represent a limited attempt to address some of the recommendations of the Gonzalez Report, the election process was neither transparent nor uniformly administered, and offers a distinct procedural advantage to the incumbent. The following points are of particular concern to the integrity of the election process:

The Election Law governing the election process is vague and ambiguous on a number of crucial points in the process, and the Republic Election Commission failed to issue clear guidelines which could have alleviated this problem. Furthermore, the division of Serbia in 29 constituencies with the introduction of a regionally proportional election system was elaborated very late and passed without sufficient transparency and lacking a broad political consensus.

The Election Administration, at the central and regional levels, did not set forth clear guidelines necessary for achieving a transparent and uniform process, and its regulations were often not in line with the text of the election law. The fact that a large part of the present election administration also administered the disputed 1996 municipal elections, including the Chairman of the Republic Election Commission (REC) and 198 out of 464 Commissioners at Unit Election Commission (UEC) level, did not instil confidence in the process.

The State Television and Radio are still strongly biased in favour of the ruling party. The obstacles identified in the Gonzalez report for independent broadcasters to register for frequency licensing still remain.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The OSCE Election Observation Mission would like to offer the following recommendations:

The Election System

The recent introduction of the Regionally Proportional Election System based on 29 districts should be re-assessed. A more transparent and inclusive process should be conducted when establishing or amending election legislation, so that all parties can have greater confidence in future elections.

Composition of Election Commissions

The Serbian authorities should consider amending their electoral law to ensure full-fledged multi-party election commissions at all levels throughout the entire election process. While it is recognised that political parties can presently place members of the commission on the expanded staff, this is no substitute for full fledged multi-party commissions. The current appointment of two-tiered election commissions consisting of a permanent core staff who actually administers the election, and party representatives on the expanded commission, results in the marginalisation of

the latter. The decision-making mechanism for the election administration at all levels should require that decisions are based on more than a simple majority.

Application of the Election Laws

Although the election laws are vague in many respects, a common interpretation and standard application of the law could permit uniform and transparent elections. The REC should issue timely and regular rulings and communicate these rulings within 24 hours to the Unit Election Commissions (UEC). The Election Administration, at the central and regional levels, did not set forth clear guidelines necessary for achieving a transparent and uniform process. The REC should work on a permanent basis from the announcement of the elections until the instalment in office of the newly elected officials.

Voter Register

A review should be made of the way in which the election authorities, throughout the country, compile the voter register. The voter registration process is best assured by a permanent, well-maintained and regularly updated voter register. This process would be greatly assisted if the national residency register of the Ministry of Interior was regularly updated and made continuously available to the municipalities. The right to easily inspect the voter register should be ensured in practice as well as in the law, and the process for amending the register should be explained to the electorate.

Ballot Production, Distribution and Security

Safeguarding the integrity of the ballot is essential for instilling confidence in an election process. All details concerning the number of ballots to be ordered to the printing house should be contained in an official regulation of the REC, guaranteeing complete accountability for the ballot order, production, packing and delivery process. The law should be amended to provide that the ballot papers should be validated by stamping each of them, at the time of issue in the polling station, with a unique stamp for each polling station. The law should also be amended to provide for a public tender for the purchase of the ballot paper and for the printing of the ballots. Detailed requirements should be issued before the tender is identified.

Candidate Lists

The law could be amended to ensure that the lists of candidates are finalised before the election campaign, so that the electorate can make informed choices based on full knowledge of the candidate lists.

Media

The state media should become truly de-politicised and obstacles to independent media coverage lifted. The problems of licensing regulations, governing the independent media, need to be urgently addressed. The order and content of television news items, which heavily favoured the ruling party in this election, also need to be addressed. The tendency towards selective coverage of opposition campaign events should be corrected, as this, in many cases, distorts political parties' campaign messages.

Vote Count

The transparency of the vote count and aggregation procedures should include the public posting of results for each polling station at that polling station immediately upon the completion of the count. The receipt forms (PRS-15 and NP-21) which confirm the delivery of the polling station results by the Polling Board representatives (which should include three Polling Board members

representing different political parties) and the transfer of the results to the Unit Election Commission (which should also be represented by three members from different political parties) should be amended to include all the results for the particular parties and candidates and the voter turnout, in addition to the data already contained in them. These forms should be carbon backed and issued in three copies - one for the Polling Board, one for the unit election commission, and the third should be returned to the polling station and displayed next to the second copy of the minute as described in Article 91 a paragraph 4. All figures in the “minutes” and the receipts in the above form should be written in digits and in words.

Computer Software

The software used for the vote count at the unit and central level should be safeguarded against all possible unauthorised operations. In order to improve the efficiency and confidence in the software and the computer processing of the results, the Serbian authorities should consider opening a public tender so that the specific expertise of professional and academic groups from Serbian institutions could compete to offer their services.

International Observers

Clear guidelines should be set articulating the rights and obligations of international observers throughout the election process, in line the OSCE Election Observation Methodology.

Domestic Observers

The Serbian authorities should also take all necessary steps to ensure accreditation of non-partisan civic observers in future elections, as stated in paragraph 8 of the OSCE Copenhagen Document.

Republic of Montenegro Presidential Election 5th and 19th October 1997

Summary of Conclusions

The OSCE has completed its observation of the Presidential election in the Republic of Montenegro and it has concluded that from an overall administrative and technical point of view the election was generally well conducted. Therefore it can be said that the final result reflects the will of the voters.

The election was held in an atmosphere of peace and calm. It is important to note the turnout of 68% for the first ballot and an even higher turnout of 73% for the second ballot.

An election process in any country may be subject to imperfections and infractions and Montenegro is no exception in this respect. Whilst of concern the culmination of such imperfections and infractions was not of a level to bring into question the final result.

The electoral laws provide a reasonable framework for participation in the election and for their administration and conduct. However there is an absence of clear and detailed legal and administrative provisions, particularly in respect of the electoral procedures in the event of a second round. There were administrative and procedural shortcomings, particularly concerning the registration of electors and in respect of the late introduction for the second round of an additional measure for recording the electors' signature on attendance at the polling station on polling day.

The interpretation of the legal provisions was not wholly correct and uniform particularly in respect of:

- determination of eligibility to stand as a candidate
- composition of the Polling Station Committees (PSC's) as regards permanent and extended membership
- presence of candidates' representatives at an early stage on the extended membership of the electoral bodies.

Registration of electors was a main issue at this election. The Registers used on 5th October contained many errors and omissions. However, it is encouraging to note the administration's awareness of this deficiency, although somewhat belated, and a desire to attempt to remedy the situation in time for the second round on 19th October. These measures did serve to uphold the paramount principle that each and every eligible voter be able to cast their ballot.

The OSCE recognises the important part played by the representatives of the candidates as members of the electoral bodies. It is noted that particularly during the second round there was full representation and participation on all electoral bodies by the representatives of the two candidates, especially on polling station level. Each member of an electoral body had the right to have his or her complaint recorded in the Polling Committee's Record and a further right to refuse to sign the Record in the event of any irregularities. There was a right of all members of electoral bodies to have a copy of the respective protocols. Decisions taken by the electoral

bodies were open to review within a prescribed timescale through a mechanism for claims and appeals both at levels within the electoral administration and before the judiciary.

The presence of the candidates' representatives as participants and monitors of the process, especially at polling station level, was crucial and provided the essential safeguard to ensure fairness, transparency and proper conduct of the process.

Thus there was a series of checks and safeguards built into the process to provide the required level of transparency and to ensure the proper conduct of the election.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Legal Framework and Administrative Procedures

There is an overriding need for consolidation of the existing legal framework, with clear and precise laws as well as rules and regulations, which further expand on the laws, and define and clarify the various technical and administrative aspects of the electoral process.

The Election Timeframe

A more realistic timetable in the Election Law for election-related deadlines should be established.

The Introduction of Additional Safeguards

The introduction of an additional safeguard requiring voters to sign their name to the register, led to a delay in the close of poll, particularly at those polling stations with over 1,500 electors. Such safeguards should already be envisaged in the Election Rules and Regulations, thus avoiding their late introduction and accompanying administrative delays.

The Voters Register

There is a need to review the fragmented practices and procedures, to produce a central Register for the whole of Montenegro and not on a purely Municipality basis. There is need to conduct a registration exercise so as to update the Registers in order improve their completeness and accuracy. There should be one central body with overall responsibility for registration and close liaison between this body and the relevant central and local public administration in order to ensure effective procedures for the administration and computerisation of registration. Such a vital part of the democratic process should not be left to each Municipality to undertake this exercise separately without control and clear direction from the centre. It is essential to enforce uniform practices and procedures, and introduce the required measures for publication, claims, appeals and a high level of transparency.

Electoral Bodies

The electoral law should be clarified in respect of the presence and participation of candidates' representatives, and should provide for their full participation on all electoral bodies at each and every stage of the electoral process.

There is also a need to include a more detailed provision in the electoral law as regards the independence and impartiality of the permanent members of electoral bodies in the performance of their duties under the law.

Public Administration

There is a need to review the provisions of the law in respect of the powers and competencies of the electoral bodies, and to define more clearly the roles of the various Ministries and other public administration bodies. A distinction must be established between electoral administration on the one part and executive and logistical operations on the other part.

Ballots

It is recommended that each ballot paper should be authenticated with an official stamp, unique for each Polling Station, and each ballot paper stamped at the time of issue to each elector.

Civic Education

A civic education exercise is called for, focusing on the importance of the right to register as an elector and the civic responsibility of all citizens to be registered as voters.

Nomination Procedures

There is a need to review the provisions in respect of the nomination procedure with a prescribed timetable providing for:

- ❑ start of nominations
- ❑ close of nominations
- ❑ publication of provisional list of candidates
- ❑ period for (i) claims against rejection and (ii) claims of objection to acceptance to the Commission and subsequent appeal to the Court
- ❑ publication of the final list of validly nominated candidates.

The Media

It is important to strive for a more equitable and unbiased formula in respect of both the print media and the radio and television media, so as to permit contestants reasonable access and coverage for the contesting points of view to be equitably communicated. In the realisation that larger and better financed parties and candidates may be able to purchase media time or space an equitable formula should be reached to ensure that all the contesting points of view be fairly and equitably communicated.

It is considered that improvements can be made in respect of media coverage with regards to distinguishing between coverage of campaign events and other events such as state affairs.

The Media Control Committee

Consideration should be given to review of the legal provisions in respect of Media control with a view to establishing a more effective body comprising of independent members and representatives of the competing political interests.

The Election Campaign

Although there is provision in Article 59 of the electoral law (Parliamentary) there was an indiscriminate display of campaign posters on traffic signs etc. Consideration should be given to more detailed legal provisions in respect of the designation of places for display and proper control over such activities by the public administration.

Out of Polling Station Voting

It is considered that the conduct of out-of-polling-station-voting should not be performed by one person. It is suggested that provision should be made for the designation of a specified number of deputies of PSC Members, not excluding the Members of the extended composition, to undertake this task jointly and in such a way as to maintain the secrecy of voting.

Voting by Military, by Post and by Persons in Custody

Consideration should be given to measures with required practical solutions for an inclusive, controlled, transparent and uniform process, in respect of persons voting in the military, by post, and persons in custody.

International and Domestic Observers

Whilst it is encouraging to note that observation by international and domestic organisations was welcomed it is considered that for future elections the electoral law should provide for observation by international and domestic observers with full participation at all levels of the electoral process.

Announcement of the Final Results

All parts of the electoral process should be carried out in an open and transparent manner and this includes the final totalling of the results at REC level. Any delay in publication of results, either in part, or as a whole, will lead to doubt and suspicion. It is imperative that the competing political interests, the media and particularly the citizens be kept fully informed at this critical stage of the process.

Repeated or Fresh Elections

In respect of “repeated” or “fresh elections”, there is a need for a clearer definition of these terms.

Election Observation Mission
National Assembly Elections in Republika Srpska
22-23 November 1997

**Preliminary Report issued 24 November 1997 by the
Special Representative of the OSCE Chairman-in-Office,
Mr. Javier Rupérez**

Following the decision of President Plavsic to dissolve the National Assembly of Republika Srpska on 3 July 1997 and the Agreements reached by all involved parties to carry out the new elections for the Assembly, the OSCE Mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina took up the role of organising the elections under the same arrangements as for the recent Municipal Elections.

Conclusions

The Observation Mission has concluded that the RS National Assembly election was well administered and a technically correct process. However, it has also concluded that a technically correct process has been grafted onto a political environment which falls far short of democratic standards. While recognising that this election is part of an ongoing conflict resolution process, this process can only be effective if the political parties take serious steps in the implementation of all aspects of the Dayton Agreement.

This election does represent a further step forward. The electorate met their civic responsibility by participating in the election process and expressing their political preferences in a peaceful manner. However, the elected institutions in Bosnia and Herzegovina are still not meeting their responsibility to the electorate and are not functioning in an effective manner. The bodies at national level are failing to pass laws and make decisions that are absolutely crucial to the development of an independent state.

It should also be stressed that the success of the elections is dependent upon the full loyalty of all parties to the results, and that the National Assembly will meet and conduct its duties effectively. Regardless of how the distribution of seats will be, the obligation of all parties to actively contribute to the peace agreement implementation process should be underlined.

The Presidential, Parliamentary, Cantonal and Municipal elections that have taken place in Bosnia and Herzegovina over the last two years could not have been realised without the OSCE Mission to Bosnia and Herzegovina. The thorough involvement of the OSCE will also be crucial for the upcoming 1998 elections. Nevertheless, during the 1998 election process, the local election authorities should become more engaged in order to prepare for a smooth transfer of a Provisional Election Commission to a Permanent one.

Re-Run of the Presidential Election Republic of Serbia, December 7, 1997

Background information

The Technical Assessment Mission has conducted a focused observation of the election administration, and in particular assessed any steps taken to address the serious concerns and recommendations contained in the recent OSCE/ODIHR Final Report on the 1997 Parliamentary and Presidential Elections.

CONCLUSIONS

While recognising that there were no possibilities to formally change the election law in line with the OSCE recommendations between the September and December elections, the OSCE notes that the Republic Electoral Commission (REC) has committed itself to endorse certain recommendations, including:

- q the need to safeguard the integrity of the ballot in future elections, by stamping individual ballots as they are issued at the polling station, thereby greatly reducing the possibility of ballot related fraud;
- q recognition that party representatives on the expanded membership of the election commissions are full and equal members of the commissions and should participate equally in each and every stage in the process.

However, the Technical Assessment Mission regrets that certain of the recommendations that could have been achieved before the re-run, were not seriously addressed, including:

Media

According to the assessment made by the Osservatorio di Pavia¹, and confirmed by the European Institute for the Media, the State Television continued to show significant bias in the news programming toward the candidate from the ruling party. While there was a commendable effort to provide all the candidates with free political advertising, the main news programs allotted a disproportionate amount of time to the candidate of the ruling party. Moreover, according to the Osservatorio di Pavia, 74% of the coverage of Mr. Milutinovic was assessed to be positive, while the positive coverage for Mr. Draskovic and Mr. Seselj was considerably less, at 45% and 9% respectively. The European Institute for the Media also found that the programming of the municipal station, Studio B, was biased in favour of the Mr. Draskovic, while the programming on BK TV was generally balanced.

Accreditation of domestic observers

The Serbian authorities continue to deny the application of domestic observers.

Transparency of the process

The REC has so far failed to recognise the importance of publicly distributing a bulletin detailing the results of the election polling station by polling station. The political parties, authorities at central and local level and relevant civic organisations should have access to such a bulletin, so

¹ As part of the OSCE Technical Assessment Mission, and financed by the Italian Ministry for Foreign Affairs, the Osservatorio di Pavia has conducted a media monitoring mission, with full coverage of the two State television channels during the two rounds of this election.

that the official results can be verified. Such a document is essential to instil confidence in the process.

The Kosovo region

There is clearly a distinct pattern in the Kosovo region, characterised by low voter participation, and a flawed election administration. In addition to polling stations that did not open or closed before the official hour, there were reports that the political party representatives of the expanded boards were discouraged to undertake their duties on election day.

Other serious problems identified in the election process

- q the introduction of a collection point for the polling station materials at municipal level, was not envisaged by the law. There is no guarantee of multi-party representation at this stage of the vote aggregation, thereby violating the spirit of the law and introducing a lack of confidence in the process;
- q copies of the protocols detailing results are still not systematically displayed in public at polling station level, contrary to the law, and to the detriment of full transparency in the process;
- q many of the permanent core staff of the election commissions are state employees, thereby their independence may be questionable. The legal requirement that no political party has a majority of members on the election commissions therefore cannot be verified under existing procedure;
- q the voters registers are still not sufficiently cross-checked against the citizens register to avoid inaccuracies;
- q the evident lack of training of the election administration in some parts of the country, which is detrimental to a uniform application of the law;
- q the fees have still not been paid to some expanded board members, even for the second round of the presidential election on October 5;
- q the delay of payment of the state allocated campaign funds to the candidates until just two days before the election.

In the expectation of an upcoming review of the election laws and procedures, the need to achieve a broad consensus through a genuine political dialogue should be achieved, as emphasised in the Gonzalez Report. This dialogue should involve all parties, beyond the regular legal procedure of the parliamentary consultations, if it is to create an environment whereby the electorate as a whole, wishes to participate in the democratic process.

A timetable should be established for consideration and implementation of recommendations of the OSCE. The passive acknowledgement of OSCE recommendations is not sufficient to seriously address the flaws in the system, and a more active approach on the part of the Serbian authorities is necessary, if the general distrust in the overall system is to be overcome. The OSCE has made it clear that it remains available to assist in the implementation of the recommendations and to bring the election process in the Republic of Serbia into line with the OSCE standards.

ANNEX 2

OSCE HUMAN DIMENSION IMPLEMENTATION MEETING

COMPILATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS MADE IN THE RAPPORTEURS REPORTS

SUBSIDIARY WORKING BODY #1 - REVIEW OF IMPLEMENTATION

The work of the subsidiary working body was organised according to a thematic list drawn up by the moderator on the basis of the previously agreed distribution of subjects laid down in the relevant decision of the Permanent Council on the organisation of the meeting. On the basis of the discussion, the following informal recommendations can be made:

Freedom of thought, conscience and religion or belief

- The ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion should continue its assessment of religious freedom within the OSCE-region, and make practical recommendations to enhance the implementation of relevant OSCE commitments, as well as provide expertise on draft laws when requested by participating States.
- The ODIHR should consider developing a comparative overview of the legislation and practices in OSCE participating States related to religious freedom.
- The OSCE participating States should consider giving the ODIHR the task of serving as a clearinghouse for the exchange of information concerning conscientious objection to military service.

Freedom of expression, free media and information

- OSCE participating States with broadcast regulatory expertise should consider developing programs to assist other participating States in finding an appropriate balance between regulation in the public interest and free expression.
- The OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media should be appointed at the OSCE Ministerial Meeting in Copenhagen in December this year.
- The OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media should enhance OSCE's operational capacity and visibility in respect to freedom of expression and free media; give particular emphasis to the promotion of equitable access to media by minority groups and languages; work for the protection of journalists; and develop a reputation for accuracy and fairness.

Prevention of torture

- The OSCE participating States should consider making additional financial contributions to the United Nations Voluntary Fund for Victims of Torture, so as to allow for the establishment of treatment centres for torture victims in OSCE countries.
- The OSCE participating States which have not already set up rehabilitation centres for torture victims should consider taking the necessary steps to establish such centres.
- The OSCE participating States which have not yet done so should consider ratifying the first Protocol amending the European Convention for the Prevention of Torture, which opens the Convention for accession of countries which are not members of the Council of Europe.
- The ODIHR, in co-operation with other relevant international organisations and NGOs, should consider initiating an information campaign to increase awareness about the prohibition of the use of torture, as well as to develop and implement projects aimed at training law enforcement personnel.
- The ODIHR should consider establishing an advisory expert group on torture, to examine what mechanisms have been successful in some participating States to end the practice of torture, as well as to draw upon the experience of other relevant international organisations, and to investigate which means are available to ensure a higher degree of implementation of relevant international commitments in regard to the prevention of torture.

International humanitarian law

- ❑ OSCE participating States which have not already done so, should consider concluding agreements with the International Criminal Tribunal, to assist with witness relocation and long-term incarceration of indictees convicted by the Tribunal.
- ❑ OSCE participating States should give careful and serious consideration to the budget requests of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia, when it comes before the Fifth Committee of the United Nations' General Assembly in December this year.
- ❑ OSCE participating States should consider lending their support to the efforts within the United Nations to develop a declaration on minimum humanitarian standards.
- ❑ OSCE participating States were encouraged to sign the Ottawa Convention on the ban of anti-personnel mines.

Culture, cultural heritage and education

- ❑ OSCE participating States should give priority to the financing of cultural and educational programs relating to national minorities in their respective countries.

Tolerance and non-discrimination

- ❑ OSCE participating States should actively initiate and pursue policies aimed at combating manifestations of intolerance and discrimination, including the development of relevant education and information programmes.
- ❑ The OSCE should develop a stronger gender perspective in relation to all its policies and activities. An informal meeting of the OSCE Permanent Council should be organised in early 1998, in order to discuss a follow-up of the recommendations from the OSCE human dimension seminar on the promotion of women's participation in society.

Migration, refugees and displaced persons

- ❑ The OSCE needs to strengthen its mechanisms of long-term crisis prevention, so as to impede the eruption of new crisis situations that force people in large numbers to leave their home countries.
- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider adopting refugee legislation in line with international standards; develop the structural capacity and expertise to establish fair and efficient refugee status determination procedures; take steps to ensure effective refugee protection; as well as introduce measures aiming at the local integration of refugees in the country of asylum.
- ❑ The OSCE should continue its role in the follow-up of the 1996 Regional Conference on Refugees in the CIS area. A continuation of the established practice of having informal Permanent Council meetings with guest speakers on the issue should be considered, as well as the possibility of extending the current contract of the ODIHR migration adviser. The possibility of an expanded OSCE role in the follow up of the said CIS conference should also be discussed.

Migrant workers

- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, so as to ensure that the convention enters into force in the near future.

National minorities

- ❑ The OSCE participating States should develop both effective legislation and practical means to protect and promote the rights of persons belonging to national or ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities.

- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider submitting to the relevant procedures and mechanisms within the United Nations specific information on the measures they have adopted to promote and protect the rights of persons belonging to national minorities.
- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider ratifying relevant international human rights instruments, including the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities.
- ❑ Close links should be established between the OSCE High Commissioner for National Minorities (HCNM) and the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights in order to strengthen complementarity, avoid duplication and share information.
- ❑ The OSCE High Commissioner for National Minorities should consider developing a comparative study on the situation of national minorities in OSCE participating States.

Roma and Sinti

- ❑ OSCE participating States should consider developing a comprehensive approach to issues relating to Roma and Sinti. These comprehensive programs or plans should be developed in close co-operation with representatives of Roma and Sinti, and should draw upon the expertise of NGOs and relevant international organisations, such as the Council of Europe.
- ❑ The ODIHR's Contact Point for Roma and Sinti Issues should continue its valuable work, particularly as regards its advisory role and awareness raising activities.

Rule of law

- ❑ OSCE participating States that are experiencing difficulties in complying with commitments in regard to the rule of law, should consider seeking appropriate technical assistance from other participating States, the ODIHR, as well as other relevant international organisations.

Exchange of information on the abolition of capital punishment

- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider introducing measures aimed at facilitating the exchange of information on the question of the abolition of capital punishment to which they are already committed under existing OSCE provisions.

Democratic institutions, citizenship and political rights, civic education

- ❑ The OSCE participating States should take steps to resolve existing citizenship problems, in particular to reduce and prevent the phenomena of statelessness.
- ❑ OSCE participating States should consider signing and ratifying the new European Convention on Nationality.

Role of NGOs

- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider identifying measures aimed at further strengthening the relationship between the OSCE and NGOs, including the assessment of the proposals contained in the report of the OSCE Secretary General on the enhancement of NGO participation in the OSCE.
- ❑ The OSCE participating States should consider lending their support to the development within the United Nations of a declaration on the protection of human rights defenders.

SUBSIDIARY WORKING BODY #2 - Review of the Human Dimension of the OSCE with a special focus on monitoring and enhancing compliance with commitments and on the use of existing mechanisms and procedures

On the basis of the discussion, the following informal recommendations can be made:

Enhancing implementation of Human Dimension commitments

- ❑ Human dimension compliance issues should be better integrated into the work of the Permanent Council and all other OSCE institutions and operations.

- The OSCE Chairman-in-Office and the Permanent Council should continue their efforts to increase the compliance with commitments. These efforts include a number of measures, such as the dispatch of personal representatives, fact-finding missions, missions of long duration and Rapporteurs.
- The effect of conflict and non-compliance on women should be further examined and women's contribution to enhancing compliance should be integrated into human dimension activities.
- The information and expertise provided by NGOs on shortcomings in the implementation of specific commitments should be drawn upon more widely.

The Human Dimension aspect of the OSCE missions

- General rules of procedures for OSCE missions should be developed. This would accelerate the launching of missions and enhance their effectiveness and flexibility.
- The OSCE participating States should pay more attention and provide more support to long-term missions.
- Mission members must receive proper training, in particular human rights training. The OSCE should develop a plan for human rights training for mission members.
- Human rights related issues should play a greater part in the work of OSCE missions and this work should be systematically and regularly evaluated.
- Long-term missions should work with women's groups and other interested partners in supporting women's contribution to post-conflict rehabilitation.

The functioning of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights in the Human Dimension

- The ODIHR could specifically focus its projects and activities in countries that request assistance in order that its limited resources were channelled to areas where they would be welcome and effectively utilised.
- The co-ordination and contact between the ODIHR and OSCE field missions should be strengthened with each drawing on the exercise and resources of the other.
- The ODIHR should be encouraged to adopt further regional or country specific plans (like the Memorandum of Understanding signed with Uzbekistan).
- The ODIHR should enhance its role as an advisory body to the Permanent Council and the Chairman-in-Office, through more frequent participation in Permanent Council discussions by ODIHR representatives, more informal discussions with OSCE delegations in Vienna and by regular reports on projects and activities.

Further integration of the Human Dimension in the regular activities of the Permanent Council

- Heads of missions and field operations should be encouraged by the Permanent Council to address implementation of human dimension commitments, bringing cases of alleged non-compliance to the attention of Permanent Council as part of their "early-warning" functions.
- The subject matter of human dimension seminars should reflect Permanent Council objectives and priorities.
- Extraordinary meetings of Permanent Council or reinforced Permanent Councils might be devoted to human dimension issues, including the follow-up of implementation review meetings.
- Informal Permanent Councils should be regularly convened to examine human dimension issues, to follow-up on specific human dimension seminars and to discuss obstacles to non-compliance with human dimension commitments.

Review of the Activities of the High Commissioner on National Minorities

- ❑ Permanent Council and affected participating States should provide appropriate and continuing follow-up to the High Commissioner's recommendations.
- ❑ Co-operation between the HCNM, ODIHR and OSCE missions should be enhanced in order to maximise the positive impact of their actions.
- ❑ The participating States should to the fullest possible extent implement their commitments related to national minorities.

Review of the activities of the Contact Point for Roma and Sinti Issues

- ❑ The position of the ODIHR Contact Point should be strengthened.
- ❑ Roma and Sinti issues should be fully integrated into the work of Permanent Council in Vienna.
- ❑ Regular internships at the ODIHR should be established for Roma and Sinti representatives, instead of the presently established short-term internship programs.
- ❑ The ODIHR should train Roma and Sinti in election preparation and monitoring, as well as civic education, to enhance Roma participation in elections, increase their political participation, and further develop their administrative skills.
- ❑ Legal assistance for Roma and Sinti should be expanded, with particular emphasis on training directed at preparing for representation of Roma and Sinti issues before courts and tribunals.
- ❑ The Contact Point should develop a close relationship with the future OSCE Media Representative in an effort to combat expression of ethnic hatred and discrimination against Roma and Sinti and minority groups in general. The media should be sensitised to Roma and Sinti issues.

Elections observations; report, procedures and co-operation framework

- ❑ OSCE election report recommendations should be followed-up both by the participating State concerned and by the OSCE community and its institutions.
- ❑ The ODIHR should play the role of interagency co-ordinator in election monitoring operations and would be well placed to co-ordinate the final evaluation of election processes.
- ❑ Election observation missions should contain both an advance party to observe the political campaign as well as a team to remain to observe the implementation of election results and perform any follow-up action, including an implementation report.
- ❑ Election monitors should be of the highest quality in order to maintain the high standard of election monitoring. The development of clear criteria or guidelines for recruitment of election experts would be useful.
- ❑ A short list of observers for Long Term Monitoring missions should be drawn up on a contingency basis for the ODIHR's use as needed.
- ❑ The assistance of local non-governmental organisations should be sought during the election process.

Role of NGOs in OSCE Human Dimension activities

- ❑ The expertise of local NGOs should be better integrated into the work of OSCE field missions.
- ❑ Improved communication and information between NGOs and the OSCE and government delegations should take place in advance of important OSCE meetings.
- ❑ A revitalised structure for implementation meetings is needed to foster an enhanced dialogue with NGOs on concrete, substantive issues. This may include better use of the speakers list to stimulate discussion and thematic round tables.

ANNEX 3

ODIHR ORGANISATIONAL CHART

