

COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS (Covering Working sessions 6-9)

This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is prepared by working sessions and by what was submitted by delegations / international organizations / civil society to participating States and, separately, to OSCE institutions / field missions or other international organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language of submissions. This compilation contains recommendations from all documents received at the HDIM Documentation Centre by the end of working session 9; documents received after this time will be included later in the consolidated summary. The text below does not reflect the views of the OSCE.

Thursday, 14 September 2017

Working session 6: Fundamental freedoms II, including freedom of thought, conscience, religion, or belief

Recommendations to participating States

Estonia/European Union

Our recommendations are:

- Participating States should fulfil their commitments by facilitating groups, associations and communities built upon religious and/or non-religious beliefs to peacefully operate and publicly manifest their beliefs, and respecting their autonomy. We underline the importance of establishing fair and clear rules and procedures which do not infringe upon OSCE commitments and international human rights standards, as outlined in the OSCE/ODIHR “Guidelines on the legal personality of religious or belief communities”.
- States have an obligation to guarantee human rights protection, and to exercise due diligence to prevent, investigate and punish acts of violence against persons based on their religion or belief. Violence or the threat thereof – such as killing, execution, disappearance, torture, sexual violence, abduction and inhuman or degrading treatment – are widespread phenomena that have to be addressed.
- We assert that violence against persons, groups or communities, against their right to freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief, is unacceptable under any circumstances, and strongly encourage state and other influential actors in a society, whether religious or not, to speak out against acts of violence and to publicly denounce such acts at the highest level.
- The promotion of religious tolerance, respect for diversity and mutual understanding are of utmost importance with a view to creating an environment conducive to the full enjoyment by all persons of freedom of religion or belief. The EU calls on states to promote, through the educational system and other means, respect for diversity and mutual understanding by encouraging a wider knowledge of the diversity of religions and beliefs within their jurisdiction.
- States have a duty to protect all persons within their jurisdiction from direct and indirect discrimination on grounds of religion or belief, whatever the reasons advanced for such discrimination. This includes the duty to rescind discriminatory

legislation, implement legislation that protects freedom of religion or belief, and halt official practices that cause discrimination, as well as to protect people from discrimination by state and other influential actors, whether religious or non-religious.

- States must fight against violations of freedom of religion or belief in an inclusive manner, whereby avoiding any discrimination in favour of the detriment of a particular religion or belief.
- Freedom of religion or belief and the freedom of expression are interdependent, interrelated and mutually reinforcing rights. Taken together, freedom of religion or belief and freedom of expression play an important role in the fight against all forms of intolerance and discrimination based on religion or belief. We highlight the positive role that free and independent media can have on preventing the increase of bias and prejudice based on religion and in promoting mutual respect and understanding, including through specific educational and awareness-raising programmes.
- We stress the important role of political leaders, elected and state officials, as well as civil society and religious leaders, in denouncing in a clear and timely manner public manifestations of intolerance on religion or belief.
- Freedom of religion or belief is also an essential pillar of safe and peaceful societies. It is linked to freedom of opinion and expression, to freedom of association and assembly, without which there can be no freedom of religion or belief, as well as other human rights, and fundamental freedoms, all of which contribute to the establishment of pluralistic, tolerant and democratic societies. Conversely, violations of freedom of religion or belief are often early warnings of potential tensions or conflicts.
- We are concerned about the persistence of cases of violations of freedom of religion or belief in the OSCE area. These violations, whether committed by state or non-state actors, may take various forms: acts of discrimination or violence on the basis of religion or belief or committed in the name of religion, undue restrictions on freedom of religion or belief, in particular in the case of non-traditional or minority religions. Restrictions often imposed by States include the denial of legal personality to religious or belief communities, denial of access to places of worship, assembly and burial, repression of unregistered religious activities, the outright banning of a religion on the pretext of the fight against terrorism or extremism.
- We encourage the OSCE countries to invite UN Human Rights Special Procedures, particularly the Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief, and to accept and implement UN recommendations, including from treaty monitoring bodies and the Universal Periodic Review.
- We support the promotion of opportunities for an open dialogue among representatives of religious and non-religious groups and policy makers on all relevant issues.

Holy See

- that the OSCE participating States, adhering to their consensually agreed decision of 2014, elaborate Ministerial Council Declarations on intolerance and discrimination on religious grounds;
- that the OSCE participating States devote one meeting of the Human Dimension Committee in 2018 to the concept and understanding of the freedom of religion or

belief, in line with OSCE commitments (Cfr. Statement PC.SHDM.DEL/5/17, 23 June 2017);

ACT for America - Minneapolis

recommends:

- That OSCE Participating States take action against individuals and organizations practicing law incompatible with human rights
- That OSCE Participating States call upon religious representatives to accept publicly that the law of the land is superior to religious dictates
- That OSCE Participating States take action to reclassify organizations practicing law incompatible with human rights as political organizations rather than religious one.

All Faiths Network

To Russia:

- We urge the Russian authorities to lift the ban on Jehovah's Witnesses' activities in Russia, to reverse the closing of the Jehovah's Witnesses Administrative Center, to refrain from liquidating the Moscow Scientology Church and to release Dennis Christensen, the five Scientologists and any other members of religious minorities that continue to be unjustly detained for so-called "extremist" activities.
- We further urge Russia to respect the right of all to exercise the freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief. All religious minorities should be able to enjoy freedom of religion and assembly without interference, as guaranteed by the Russian Federation's Constitution.

Barnabas Fund

Consequently Barnabas Fund requests OSCE countries to:

- Carry out a needs assessment of the specific issues faced by religious minorities such as Christians and Yazidis within refugee populations in order to ensure that it adequately meets its "duty to protect".
- Develop a specific strategy to protect religious minorities who are refugees in their country from religiously motivated violence from other refugees.

Buergerbewegung (Citizens' Movement) PAX EUROPA e.V.

To Austria:

BPE ruft die österreichische Regierung auf, die Politik der Desinformation einzustellen und das Islamgesetz einer sofortigen Revision zu unterziehen, mit der die europäischen Werte der Nichtdiskriminierung und der Rechtsstaatlichkeit wiederhergestellt und die grundrechtswidrige und asymmetrische religionsrechtliche Privilegierung des Islam beendet wird.

Equal Rights Trust

calls on participating states to:

- Reiterate their commitments, made in Vienna in 1989, and Copenhagen in 1990, to ensure the freedom of thought, conscience and religion, including the right to manifest one's religion or belief.
- Condemn the adoption of legislation or the implementation of measures which restrict or limit the freedom of thought, conscience and religion.

- Repeal or amend regulations on the establishment of religious associations which have the effect of limiting or denying religious freedom, and discriminating directly and indirectly against members of religious minorities and non-orthodox religions.
- Refrain from applying anti-extremism laws in ways which persecute religious groups and individuals on the ground of national security.
- Provide adequate legal protection from discrimination on the basis of religion, and ensure that both state and non-state actors refrain from discriminating against individuals and groups on the basis of religion.

Federation Europeene des Centres de Recherche et d'Information sur le Sectarisme (FECRIS)

To Italy :

We furthermore, call on the Italian government to comply with European directives, respond to parliamentary questions submitted regarding the protection of individuals against sect abuse, and, lastly, not to be misled by impostors.

Forum 18 News Service

to address the causes of insecurity, **participating States**, OSCE institutions and field operations, and civil society could:

- understand in concrete terms the serious violations of the freedom of religion or belief and interlinked freedoms of expression, assembly and association taking place in the OSCE region – including the targetting by some participating States of women exercising these freedoms;
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, stressing implementation of all fundamental freedoms, including to be free from torture;
- insist in line with human dimension commitments that the non-negotiable most effective step to ensure security is to fully implement fundamental freedoms commitments;
- challenge the misuse of concepts such as “anti-terrorism”, “extremism”, “religious tolerance”, and “dialogue” to disguise human dimension commitment violations;
- use tools such as the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief, the OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities and on Freedom of Association, the OSCE Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, and on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders

Freedom Now

To Azerbaijan:

We urge the Government of Azerbaijan to amend its religious law to abide by international standards and to immediately and unconditionally release all prisoners of conscience.

“Giuseppe Dossetti” Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

Participating States are urged to:

- benefit from the Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religious or Belief Communities in drafting and reviewing legislation pertaining to registration of religious communities.
- respect the autonomy of religious or belief communities, by ensuring that national law leaves it to the religious or belief community itself to decide on its leadership,

its internal rules, the substantive content of its beliefs, the structure of the community and methods of appointment of the clergy.

- engage in consultations with religious communities in order to adopt anti-discrimination laws which do not violate the autonomy and self-organization of the religious communities.
- foster the participation of religious communities in public life and welcome the interventions in the public debate of the religious leaders.
- promote a dialogue between the representatives of the religious communities that are building a new place of worship and the religious communities historically present in the places in order to foster a climate of mutual tolerance and respect between believers of different communities.
- return to religious communities the place of worship which were confiscated by public authorities, returning them to the original owner instead allocating to other religious communities.
- adopt legislation and zoning laws which prohibits zoning of place of worship for different use than the original.
- guarantee the right to wear religious symbols and attire in public spaces.
- guarantee the conscientious objection not only to the compulsory military service but also in relation to all morally sensitive questions.
- not force children to a compulsory religious or ethical teaching which may be not consistent with the convictions of the children's parents, providing for this case non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities.
- request the assistance of the OSCE/ODIHR in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief.
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief in their foreign policies.

Human Rights Movement "Bir Duino Kyrgyzstan"

To Kyrgyzstan:

- привести в действие статью 13 Закона «О противодействии экстремистской деятельности» где предусмотрено, что наличия в информационных материалах экстремистских признаков, осуществляется судом;
- пересмотреть статью 299-2, УК Кыргызской Республики (приобретение, изготовление, хранение, распространение, перевозка и пересылка экстремистских материалов, а также умышленное использование символики или атрибутики экстремистских организаций) на соответствие его международным договором и обязательствам Кыргызской Республики в области прав человека;
- в соответствии со статьей 4 Закона «О противодействии экстремистской деятельности» создать координационный экспертный комитет для проведения экспертизы на предмет выявления экстремистского содержания в тех или иных информационных материалах и устных высказываниях.
- Разработать положение и утвердить Правительством его состав, в связи, с чем дальнейшее проведение религиозно-теологической и теологической экспертизы проводить координационным экспертным комитетом;
- разработать квалификационные требования, предъявляемые для экспертов по религиозно-теологической и теологической экспертизе. Должности судебного эксперта внести в Реестр государственных должностей Кыргызской Республики утвержденного Указом Президента Кыргызской Республики от 26 марта 2013г. №145

- рекомендовать Пленуму Верховного суда Кыргызской Республики обобщить судебную практику по вынесению приговоров связанных с экстремисткой деятельностью.

Human Rights Without Frontiers

To Russia:

Recommendations Human Rights Without Frontiers Int'l (HRWF) and Forum for Religious Freedom/ Europe (FOREF) urge the authorities of the Russian Federation:

- To lift the ban of Jehovah's Witnesses and to restore the full religious freedom of the 175,000 members of their movement
- To release Dennis Christensen, a Danish Jehovah's Witness detained since April 2017 for attending a religious meeting in Oryol.

KrymSOS

To Russia:

Призываем Россию, осуществляющую эффективный контроль над аннексированным Крымом, дать ответ где находится Ренат Параламов и прекратить практики насильственных похищений, обысков и политически мотивированных уголовных преследований в Крыму.

Order of St. Andrew

To Turkey:

The Order, therefore, recommends the following

- Officially recognize that the Ecumenical Patriarchate and its institutions have legal personality and standing, with rights to acquire, own, build and repair property. If necessary, the laws related to minority foundations should be amended.
- Officially recognize the "Ecumenical" status of the Patriarch and Patriarchate.
- Fairly and expeditiously implement the August 2011 decree allowing for the return of all confiscated property.
- Allow the Ecumenical Patriarchate to reopen the Theological School of Halki.
- Abstain completely from any national or local government interference related to the internal governance of the Ecumenical Patriarchate.
- Fully implement the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, to which Turkey has subscribed, and provide equal rights to all religious minority communities.

Set My People Free

As nongovernmental organizations promoting the freedom of religion, we are proposing an international dialogue among **nations** and United Nations experts that could show the way toward the abolishment of apostasy and blasphemy laws. We seek your ideas and your support

SOVA Center for Information and Analysis

Мы призываем российские власти:

- Отменить дискриминационное решение о запрете Свидетелей Иеговы, пересмотреть решения о запрете ряда мусульманских организаций.
- Отменить «антимиссионерские» поправки из «пакета Яровой», ограничивающие конституционное право на распространение религиозных убеждений.

- Пересмотреть в целом политику в отношении протестантских организаций и НРД (полностью), поскольку наблюдаемая легитимация «антисектантских» настроений не только противоречит принципу свободы совести, но и угрожает безопасности общества.
- Исключить из Уголовного кодекса норму об оскорблении религиозных чувств как избыточную и неуместную в условиях светского государства.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

To Greece:

- To guarantee freedom of religion to Turkish Minority including the election of Muftis and the WAQF boards
- To abolish the Law no 4115/2013 known as “240 Imam Law” that is against the religious autonomy of Turkish Minority

[Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions](#)

Estonia/European Union

To ODIHR:

- We encourage the ODIHR to address the connection between freedom of religion or belief and tolerance and non-discrimination issues, and we recommend this to be reflected to all relevant OSCE events and activities.
- We express our full support for the work of the ODIHR and its Advisory Panel on Freedom of Religion or Belief, which provides legal support to participating States in the implementation of their OSCE commitments. We also encourage cooperation between the OSCE, the Venice Commission, the Council of Europe and the United Nations Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief.

Holy See

To ODIHR:

that ODIHR continue its analysis and thinking concerning interreligious dialogue and dialogue between religious communities and governmental bodies, keeping in mind the differences between these two forms of dialogue

ACT for America - Minneapolis

recommends that OSCE establishes a working group to propose measures against law that violates human rights, with a particular emphasis on Sharia.

Americans for America

recommends that the word “discrimination” be omitted from official OSCE documents.

Constantinopolitan Society

Due to systematic and ongoing violations of religious freedom, OSCE / **ODHIR** is called upon to urge the Turkish government to bring its laws and practices into compliance with international standards on freedom of religion or belief. Specifically:

OSCE / ODHIR are called upon to urge Turkey - as OSCE participating State - to:

- Grant full legal personality to the Ecumenical Patriarchate, so that the latter may enjoy, inter alia, ownership rights and exercise property ownership, administration and management.

- End Turkish citizenship requirements for the Ecumenical Patriarch and the Holy Synod of the Greek Orthodox Church, and permit them to select and appoint their leadership and members in accordance with their internal guidelines and beliefs.
- Reopen without any delay and prerequisite the Theological School of Halki with exactly the same status it held before 1971 to offer religious education and permit students to enroll from both within and outside Turkey.
- Terminate any move towards conversion of Hagia Sophia Museum into a mosque.
1/2
- Return immediately the three churches of Panayia Kafatiani, Aya Yani and Aya Nikola in the district of Karakoy - Galata in Istanbul, as well as their immovable properties, which have been illegally and forcibly occupied by the self - declared and nonexistent "Turkish Orthodox Patriarchate (TOP)" to their legal owner, which is the Ecumenical Patriarchate, and grant full legal status so as to be able to elect their governing bodies and freely administer and manage its own foundation.
- Comply with decisions made by the European Court of Human Rights by removing the space listing religious affiliation on official identification cards.
- Fully implement the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights by withdrawing reservations that negatively impact religious freedom, and interpret the 1923 Lausanne Treaty so as to provide equal rights to all religious minority communities.

Forum 18 News Service

to address the causes of insecurity, participating States, **OSCE institutions** and field operations, and civil society could:

- understand in concrete terms the serious violations of the freedom of religion or belief and interlinked freedoms of expression, assembly and association taking place in the OSCE region – including the targeting by some participating States of women exercising these freedoms;
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, stressing implementation of all fundamental freedoms, including to be free from torture;
- insist in line with human dimension commitments that the non-negotiable most effective step to ensure security is to fully implement fundamental freedoms commitments;
- challenge the misuse of concepts such as "anti-terrorism", "extremism", "religious tolerance", and "dialogue" to disguise human dimension commitment violations;
- use tools such as the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief, the OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities and on Freedom of Association, the OSCE Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, and on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders

"Giuseppe Dossetti" Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

The OSCE/ODIHR is called upon to:

- raise awareness on the positive contribution of the religions to the building and the well-being of our democratic societies.
- assist – in cooperation with the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee (a) that the liberty of parents to

ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions is fully respected and (b) that the participating States provide non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities that would accommodate the wishes of parents.

- assist – in cooperation with the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee the right to conscientious objection in all morally sensitive questions, providing that the rights of others to be free from discrimination are respected and that the access to lawful services is guaranteed.

The OSCE Representative on the Freedom of the Media is called upon to:

- provide – in close cooperation with the OSCE-ODIHR and the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – guidelines for voluntary professional standards and selfregulation of the media aimed to (i) promote knowledge and understanding of religions, (ii) give a fair and accurate account of religious beliefs, and (iii) ensure that members of religious communities are given the chance to express their own views on the media.

Human Rights Vision

We appeal to all international organizations on human rights protection, **OSCE**, Committee of United Nations on human rights to pay close attention and to enhance monitoring on fulfillment by Tajikistan of their obligations according to International Covenant on civil and political rights.

[Recommendations to the OSCE Field Missions](#)

Forum 18 News Service

to address the causes of insecurity, participating States, **OSCE** institutions and **field operations**, and civil society could:

- understand in concrete terms the serious violations of the freedom of religion or belief and interlinked freedoms of expression, assembly and association taking place in the OSCE region – including the targetting by some participating States of women exercising these freedoms;
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, stressing implementation of all fundamental freedoms, including to be free from torture;
- insist in line with human dimension commitments that the non-negotiable most effective step to ensure security is to fully implement fundamental freedoms commitments;
- challenge the misuse of concepts such as “anti-terrorism”, “extremism”, “religious tolerance”, and “dialogue” to disguise human dimension commitment violations;
- use tools such as the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief, the OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities and on Freedom of Association, the OSCE Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, and on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders

“Giuseppe Dossetti” Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

The OSCE Field Mission are urged to:

- mainstream freedom of religion or belief in their programs and activities.

Recommendations to the International Organizations

Federation Europeene des Centres de Recherche et d'Information sur le Sectarisme (FECRIS)

We recommend that European and other inter-governmental forums exercise the necessary vigilance to monitor those who act as «transmitters of values» of our open societies and unmask those who pretend to carry these values to better disregard them.

Human Rights Vision

We appeal to all international organizations on human rights protection, OSCE, Committee of United Nations on human rights to pay close attention and to enhance monitoring on fulfillment by Tajikistan of their obligations according to International Covenant on civil and political rights.

Set My People Free

As nongovernmental organizations promoting the freedom of religion, we are proposing an international dialogue among nations and **United Nations** experts that could show the way toward the abolishment of apostasy and blasphemy laws. We seek your ideas and your support

Thursday, 14 September 2017

Working session 7: Tolerance and non-discrimination I, including: combating racism, xenophobia, and discrimination; combating anti-Semitism and intolerance and discrimination against Christians, Muslims and members of other religions; prevention and responses to hate crimes in the OSCE area

Recommendations to participating States

Estonia / European Union

Pour les Etats participants :

- Veiller à ce que chaque individu puisse jouir, sans distinction, des droits de l'Homme et des libertés fondamentales et dispose de moyens de recours effectif en cas de discrimination ou autre violation de ses droits et libertés ;
- Favoriser l'apprentissage de la diversité, du dialogue et de la tolérance et déconstruire les préjugés en promouvant les droits de l'Homme ainsi que des sociétés inclusives et solidaires ;
- Condamner de façon systématique les appels à la haine, quels qu'en soient les auteurs, les motifs ou les individus visés ; encourager à ce que les crimes de haine soient rapportés ;
- Coopérer activement avec le BIDDH pour prévenir et combattre toutes les formes d'intolérance, notamment en contribuant à ses statistiques sur les crimes de haine.

- Maintenir une approche inclusive de la lutte contre l'intolérance et les discriminations, basée sur l'universalité des droits de l'Homme et la lutte contre toutes les formes de discriminations sans distinction ;
- S'assurer que les activités de l'OSCE en matière de lutte contre l'intolérance et les discriminations réaffirment notre cohésion sur la base de principes communs, dont la lutte contre toutes les formes d'intolérance et l'égalité de dignité de tous les êtres humains sans exception ;
- Mieux prendre en compte les multiples formes de discrimination dans la lutte contre l'intolérance ;
- Encourager une meilleure articulation des travaux des représentants personnels de la présidence entre eux ainsi qu'avec le BIDDH dans le cadre d'une approche inclusive pour permettre une meilleure cohérence et efficacité de la lutte contre l'intolérance dans le contexte OSCE

Holy See

that the OSCE participating States, in their implementation of commitments related to tolerance and non-discrimination, carefully safeguard all universal human rights and fundamental freedoms, as they are understood in OSCE consensually agreed decisions

Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

- recording anti-Muslim/Islamophobic crimes as a category of hate crime by the police
- protecting free speech while developing good guidelines to tackle online hate speech and considering primary legislation to deal with social media offences and online hate speech
- developing teaching materials to educate young people on anti-Muslim hatred and discrimination and prioritising religious education in the national curriculum to prepare young people for life in a religiously plural society
- tackling religious discrimination in the workplace and address the low level of economic activity among Muslims through targeted interventions at stages of recruitment, retention and promotion; improving access to employment for Muslim women. (particularly after the ECJ decision which almost legitimises discrimination against Muslim women)
- preserving the Human Rights Act and the protection of minority rights including religious slaughter (on the contrary there are more and more bans on religious slaughter now), circumcision and the wearing of religious dress or symbols
- curbing the encroachment of counter-terrorism policies on civil liberties by working with Muslim communities, not against them, in the so-called "de-radicalisation" programmes
- committing to democracy and human rights promotion abroad, including the rights of religious minorities

Association of Religious Organizations of Kazakhstan (AROK)

To Kazakhstan:

Рекомендуем правительству Казахстана, в Министерстве по делам религий и гражданского общества создать специальный департамент по свободе вероисповедания и недопущения дискриминации. Работа в этом

направлении на системном уровне, помогло бы решить целый ряд серьезных вопросов, в том числе и на законодательном уровне.

В случае создания такого департамента для его сотрудников, БДИПЧ мог бы провести обучение, по вопросам связанным с безопасностью и обеспечению прав человека и противодействию дискриминации.

B'nai B'rith International

- We must continue to affirm commitments made at the landmark 2004 conference and reiterated at subsequent conferences and assess the implementation of those commitments.
- We must enhance funding for ODIHR's Tolerance and Non-Discrimination unit, which has now become a fixed and integral part of the OSCE's work. We must enable the TND unit to sustain and expand its critical activities, which include educational programs on anti-Semitism in more than a dozen countries.
- We must extend, for the foreseeable future, the terms of the three personal representatives on intolerance.
- Member-states must fulfill their reporting requirements with respect to hate crimes data. Far too few governments have done so until now.
- Finally, we must strongly reinforce the crucial principle declared at the 2004 Berlin Conference – That no political position, cause or grievance can ever justify anti-Semitism – and make clear that the demonization and delegitimization of the Jewish state is often none other than a pretext for the hatred of Jews themselves.

Buergerbewegung (Citizens' Movement) PAX EUROPA e.V.

- Participating States should reiterate their commitment in the Copenhagen Document to the ideals of democracy and political pluralism as well as their common determination to build democratic societies based on free elections and the rule of law.
- Participating States should renew their commitment to the Copenhagen Document's commitment to freedom of expression, which is being systematically impeded by Participating States in an effort to stifle criticism of Islam.
- Participating States should reiterate the Copenhagen Document's commitment against totalitarianism, anti-Semitism, and persecution on religious grounds, noting that the Islamic law known as Sharia mandates and results in all three.

Center for Security Policy

- Participating States should echo ECHR in affirming Sharia is incompatible with a democratic society.
- Participating States should expand existing bans on neo-Nazi and Communist ideologies to include Sharia
- Participating States should evaluate the degree to which citizens and immigrants embrace Sharia in determining migration and security policy in order to prevent future support for totalitarianism, religious discrimination, and anti-Semitism

Christian Evangelical Church, Temirtau

To Kazakhstan:

- Соразмерить уровень наказания за подобные виды нарушений с нарушениями сделанными в нерелигиозном контексте.

- Привести законодательство РК в сфере свободы совести в соответствии с международными стандартами права.

Christliche Gemeinde des Vollen Evangeliums "Neues Leben" e.V

Рекомендации для Казахстана:

Пересмотреть предлагаемые поправки в закон о религиозной деятельности, и привести предлагаемые нормы в соответствии с взятыми на себя международными обязательствами по недискриминации и права на религиозную свободу.

Constantinopolitan Society

To Turkey:

Overall, Turkey is called upon to take seriously into consideration the recommendations by EU and international organizations pertaining to human rights and act upon them and make more strenuous efforts to prevent discrimination and intolerance.

Eurasia Partnership Foundation

Recommendations to the Government of Armenia:

Legislation and policies relating to freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief.

General recommendation

- revise the Draft law on “Making Amendments to the Law of the Republic of Armenia on the Freedom of Conscience and on Religious Organisations” and amendments and/or supplements to adjacent laws bringing it into full compliance with the principles and norms of international law, excluding any provisions that would result in discriminatory approach towards religious organisations.

Specific recommendations

- to avoid misinterpretation of the Draft as well as based on Constitution of Armenia, which guarantees prohibition of discrimination on the grounds of religion, the Draft should equally cover the relations pertaining to the activities of AAC and stipulate its legal status as a “religious organization”
- Replace the ground of “state security” for limiting the freedom of religion, introduced in the Draft, with “public safety”, in conformity with paragraph 2 of Article 9 of the ECHR. At the same time, the standard of “necessary in democratic society” shall be added in the same clause in compliance with paragraph 2 of Article 9 of the ECHR.
- amend the Draft, making restrictions on barring out religious preaching in educational institutions equally applicable to the activities of AAC.
- Remove the reference to the RA Law “On non-governmental organisations”, which in fact confuses religious organisations with non-governmental organisations from the Draft and introduce a new provision envisaging the procedure of establishment of religious organisations.
- remove a blanket prohibition on foreign financing of religious organisations bearing in mind the OSCE/ODIHR-Venice Commission Joint Opinion for Armenia, which considers the blanket prohibition on foreign financing of religious communities to be unreasonable and emphasises the incompatibility of such prohibition with the requirements of Article 9 of the ECHR, i.e. absence of the “necessary in democratic society” standard.
- replace the term “member” of the religious organisation be replaced by “follower” and “servant” concepts and remove the requirement of record-keeping of the members of the organization. Further, clearly provide an exhaustive list of

documents on activities of the religious organization to be requested by the Authorised Body (which carries out supervision over activities of religious organization) in case such necessity arises.

- include a provision in the Draft law removing the prohibition of law enforcement servants' membership to religious association and/or religious organisations.

Freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief and the right to education.

- based on the recommendations of the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, 2013 and the recommendations addressed to Armenia during the Universal Periodic Review in 2015 and bearing in mind the secular nature of education in Armenia stipulated by national legislation, revise the content of the "History of the Armenian Church" subject reflecting the coverage of historical events and excluding religious preaching.
- eliminate the instances of religious preaching at school by AAC as well as anti-preaching against other religions and beliefs, which lead to intolerant and discriminatory practices, through intervention of authorised bodies (where necessary) guaranteeing the the education on religion is provided in line with the objective, impartial and democratic principles of pluralism.
- eliminate prayer, crossing oneself and other religious ceremonies while teaching the "History of the Armenian Church" at schools.
- opt-out the "History of the Armenian Church" compulsory school subject, in parallel to it or as an option, introduce the subject of "World Religions" and/or "History of Culture" in the line with recommendations of the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, UN Committee on Racial Discrimination, European Commission of Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) and OSCE Toledo Guiding Principles on Teaching About Religions and Beliefs in Public Schools. The teaching process should be exclusively secular avoiding elements of religious indoctrination, usage of religious symbols or rituals in public school which is in line with Armenia's Constitution and Law on Education

European Association of Jehovah's Christian Witnesses

REQUEST THAT THE GOVERNMENT OF BULGARIA:

- Ensure that law-enforcement authorities provide appropriate protection against physical assaults on Jehovah's Witnesses and acknowledge acts of religious hatred
- Prosecute vandals and hooligans who attack houses of worship and who harass and harm worshippers
- Protect the right to manifest one's religious beliefs individually and jointly with others
- Strike down discriminatory municipal ordinances that restrict peaceful religious expression
- Hold responsible those who slander others in the public media and incite religious hatred

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF AZERBAIJAN TO:

- Grant full registration to Jehovah's Witnesses in Baku and in other parts of the country
- Stop interfering with their worship and manifestation of belief
- Recognize the right to conscientious objection and provide an alternative civilian service programme conforming to international standards
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses the unhindered use of their religious literature

REQUEST THAT THE GOVERNMENT OF BELARUS:

- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to register additional religious communities
- Grant permission for Jehovah's Witnesses to build new Kingdom Halls
- Issue occupancy permits for Jehovah's Witnesses to hold religious meetings in rented venues
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to express their beliefs and to distribute their religious publications freely without fear of being accused of illegal religious activity

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF KAZAKHSTAN TO:

- Release Teymur Akhmedov from prison
- End the arrest, prosecution, and harassment of Jehovah's Witnesses for so-called unregistered missionary activity
- Lift imposed bans on religious publications of Jehovah's Witnesses and restrictions on distribution
- Fulfil its obligations under international law to guarantee freedom of religion, expression, assembly, and association for all citizens, including Jehovah's Witnesses
- Prosecute vandals and hooligans who attack houses of worship of Jehovah's Witnesses and who harass and harm their adherents
- Enforce media standards prohibiting libel and slander

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF KYRGYZSTAN TO:

- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to register local religious organisations in the southern regions of Kyrgyzstan
- End harassment of individual Witnesses and interference with their religious services by the police in the southern regions of Kyrgyzstan
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to import religious literature

REQUEST THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION TO:

- Respect the fundamental freedoms of Jehovah's Witnesses
- Reverse the Supreme Court decision of 17 July 2017 that implements the repression of Jehovah's Witnesses in Russia
- Abide by the Constitution of the Russian Federation and the international law to which Russia has obligated itself, including the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights
- Release Dennis Christensen and stop persecuting Jehovah's Witnesses for the peaceful practice of their religious beliefs
- Remove the religious literature of Jehovah's Witnesses from the Federal List of Extremist Materials
- Void the 17 August 2017 ruling of the Vyborg City Court, which declared that the New World Translation of the Holy Scriptures is not a Bible and is "extremist material"

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF TAJIKISTAN TO:

- Release Daniil Islamov from the military training camp and stop his criminal prosecution
- Recognize the right to conscientious objection to military service and provide for alternative civilian service
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to register their local religious organisation
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses legally to import and use their religious literature
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses peacefully to practice their religious beliefs and to share them with their neighbours

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF TURKEY TO:

- Recognize the right to conscientious objection to military service and provide for alternative civilian service
- Apply zoning laws correctly to allow them to build and register places of worship

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF UKRAINE TO:

- Investigate, prosecute, and appropriately punish vandals and hooligans who attack their houses of worship and harass and harm our members during their religious activity
- Eliminate the interference with constructing and occupying houses of worship, as has come from State Architect Building Inspection/Council Departments.

REQUEST THE AUTHORITIES IN THE DONETSK AND LUHANSK REGIONS OF UKRAINE TO:

- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to carry out their worship peacefully, including their volunteer community service of talking to their neighbours about God's Word
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to assemble peacefully for worship
- Return all illegally seized Kingdom Halls (houses of worship)
- Legally register the activity of Jehovah's Witnesses, in harmony with the European Convention on Human Rights

REQUEST THE GOVERNMENT OF UZBEKISTAN TO:

- Grant registration to the local community of Jehovah's Witnesses in Tashkent and other cities
- Terminate illegal searches of private homes and seizures of religious literature
- Stop arrests and prosecutions for attending religious meetings and for peacefully and respectfully sharing one's beliefs with others
- Cease harassing Jehovah's Witnesses for mere possession of religious literature
- Uphold the fundamental freedoms guaranteed by the Constitution of Uzbekistan and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

Ev. Freikirche "Mittelpunkt" Braunschweig e.V

To Kazakhstan:

мы призываем Казахстан пересмотреть свою репрессивную политику направленную на все более жесткий контроль религиозных общин, которые не представляют никакой угрозы государству.

Forum 18 News Service

participating States, OSCE institutions and field operations, and civil society could:

- understand in concrete terms the serious violations of the freedom of religion or belief and interlinked freedoms of expression, assembly and association taking place in the OSCE region – including the targetting by some participating States of women exercising these freedoms;
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, stressing implementation of all fundamental freedoms, including to be free from torture;
- insist in line with human dimension commitments that the non-negotiable most effective step to ensure security is to fully implement fundamental freedoms commitments;
- challenge the misuse of concepts such as “anti-terrorism”, “extremism”, “religious tolerance”, and “dialogue” to disguise human dimension commitment violations;
- use tools such as the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief, the OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal

Personality of Religion or Belief Communities and on Freedom of Association, the OSCE Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, and on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders.

“Giuseppe Dossetti” Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

Participating States are urged to:

- record carefully hate crimes committed against religious properties.
- fully implement their commitment to adopt policies to promote respect and protection for places of worship and properties of all religious communities, benefiting from the expertise of the ODIHR in this field.
- provide disaggregated data on hate crimes, paying more attention to the hate crimes against Christians – also where they are majority – in the questionnaire collecting data from national data collection point.
- compile and publish a national report on hate crimes.
- request the assistance of the OSCE/ODIHR in order to implement TACHLE and PAHCT at national level.
- develop training programs on hate crimes for public officials and law enforcement agencies operating at local level.
- adopt national action plan in order to prevent and respond to hate crimes.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

Recommendations to Participating States:

- Train and educate police, social welfare office staff, and accommodation security on the topic of religiously-motivated conflict.
- Educate and inform civil servants about what the Christian faith is, what it means to convert and what kind of consequences this can bring about, both in the event of a return to the home country, but also in Europe.
- Improve the balance in ethnic/religious composition of refugees, as well as staff, security, and translators in asylum centres, and remove offending staff in incidents of religiously-motivated bias or violence.
- Provide refugees and asylum seekers more information about religious freedom and freedom of speech, what these rights mean in practice, as well as information on how to report incidents to the police.
- Permit anonymous reporting of religiously-motivated incidents, protect whistleblowers, remove perpetrators from accommodations, and deport violent offenders.
- Move Christians to safe homes as quickly as possible.
- Support private accommodations for Christians. As a last resort or temporary measure, in the absence of the above-mentioned protections, establish separate accommodations for Christian refugees.

Order of St. Andrew

To Turkey:

- First, the Government of Turkey should reopen and extend the August 27, 2012 Decree deadline for the submission of applications to recover seized property, which did not give applicants sufficient time to respond. The Decree should be expanded to include all seized properties that were excluded. The Government should also revamp the manner by which the Decree is implemented. A Public Advocate, who is not a Government bureaucrat, should be employed to ensure that the Decree is implemented in a fair and expeditious manner.

- Second, the Government of Turkey should adopt a policy which enables election of Orthodox Christians to be board members of minority foundations, in a manner which assures that all the minority foundations will be able to manage returned property effectively.
- Third, the Government of Turkey should allow the Halki School of Theology to reopen and operate with its own theologians and in a manner consistent with its own Christian beliefs.
- Fourth, the Government of Turkey should refrain from interfering in the internal affairs of the Ecumenical Patriarchate. The 1923 and 1970 directives of the local Istanbul Government, relating to the citizenship of those who are entitled to vote for, or be elected as, a new Ecumenical Patriarch, should be rescinded.
- Fifth, the Government of Turkey should desist from its recent policy of converting museums which were historic Christian sites into mosques, especially when there is no overriding need for additional mosques in such locations. This policy is an impediment to harmony among religious groups.

Organisation Franco-Egyptienne pour les Droits de l'Homme

We are recommending that the OSCE States:

- End the use of the term Islamophobia in all official documents and speeches and if necessary use the term Blasphemy, in case there is a need.
- Send an official call to the Egyptian president for the release of all those who have been convicted by the courts on account of their accusation of blasphemy of religion and mainly Imam Mohamed Abdallah Nasr, a real victim of the Islamists Extremists.

Representation of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church to the International Organizations

To Ukraine:

- Recommends to the State of Ukraine, by virtue of statements of its civil servants, to publicly condemn actions of radical organizations and offenders who commit overt crimes against religious organizations and believers of our confession.

To participating States:

- Recommends that the OSCE participating States make recommendations to the State of Ukraine in the UN Universal Periodic Review of the 28th session of the Human Rights Council, which in November 2017 will consider the fulfillment of our country's obligations to provide for human rights. Supplying such recommendations on the above problems will undoubtedly contribute to the protection of human rights and ensure de facto freedom of religion in our country.
- Calls upon the OSCE, the participating States of this meeting: via counseling and other means of communication, to facilitate the removal of discriminatory bills Nos. 4128, 4511, 5309 from the agenda of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine, and to assist in the cessation of offenses against the Ukrainian Orthodox Church.

Soteria International

Soteria international recommends that authorities engage to combat hate crimes and other manifestations of intolerance and discrimination by creating educational programs, including raising awareness with regards to the direct correlation between the Freedom of Religion and Belief and the Freedom of Expression. Soteria international considers the role of education in raising awareness on the correlation between freedom of expression

and the freedom of conscience, thought, and belief while ensuring the respect of one another's dignity and beliefs to be very important.

SOVA Center for Information and Analysis

For the OSCE Participating States:

- Change the hate crime reporting system so that suspected hate motive could be recorded at any stage, including the earliest one. Specialized police units are more effective in investigating hate crimes, but regular police should conduct such investigations as well.
- Publish hate crime statistics, highlighting the different types, regions, and number of victims. Official statistics should be based both on court decisions (for both proven and unproven cases), and on the number of opened criminal cases.
- More actively use the information collected by non-governmental organizations that perform systematic monitoring of racist groups, and consult NGOs on law enforcement issues. Despite methodological, and even political, differences, such cooperation can be very productive.
- Take statements from victims of suspected hate crimes also at mediation with such NGOs and specialized public authorities, dealing with discrimination problems.
- Adjust the legislative framework covering hate crimes and related activities, including public incitement, organizing, financing, etc. Legislation should focus law enforcement efforts, first and foremost, on prosecuting the most dangerous crimes against the person. The internal policies and regulations of law enforcement agencies should reflect the same priorities.
- To give an evaluation to the national laws on incitement to hatred and their implementation, with reference to the Rabat Action Plan, adopted by UN Human Rights Council in 2013.
- There is a need to adopt and develop comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation or a series of individual acts containing effective rules and procedures of proving discrimination
- Public officials should have no right to express publicly their intolerance or even disrespect to any minorities. Civil service legislation should include effective sanctions against such actions. These penalties also need be made public.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

To Greece:

we recommend Greece to recognize the existence of the historical Turkish Minority in the Greek territory that has been living in Western Thrace before the region of Western Thrace became a Greek territory and before the Peace Treaty of Lausanne.

[Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions](#)

Estonia / European Union

Pour les structures exécutives de l'OSCE et la société civile

- Maintenir une approche inclusive de la lutte contre l'intolérance et les discriminations, basée sur l'universalité des droits de l'Homme et la lutte contre toutes les formes de discriminations sans distinction ;
- S'assurer que les activités de l'OSCE en matière de lutte contre l'intolérance et les discriminations réaffirment notre cohésion sur la base de principes communs, dont

la lutte contre toutes les formes d'intolérance et l'égalité de dignité de tous les êtres humains sans exception ;

- Mieux prendre en compte les multiples formes de discrimination dans la lutte contre l'intolérance ;
- Encourager une meilleure articulation des travaux des représentants personnels de la présidence entre eux ainsi qu'avec le BIDDH dans le cadre d'une approche inclusive pour permettre une meilleure cohérence et efficacité de la lutte contre l'intolérance dans le contexte OSCE

Holy See

that ODIHR evaluate its tolerance and non-discrimination work in light of universal human rights and fundamental freedoms, assuring that these rights and freedoms are not made competitors with one another.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

calls upon the OSCE and other International Communities:

- To urge Greece to end discriminative implementations targeting the Turkish Minority immediately,
- To monitor the legislation process in Greece,

Americans for America

recommends that OSCE align itself forthrightly and firmly against any legislation that would criminalize words, thoughts, and feelings under the color of so-called "hate speech" laws.

Center for Security Policy

- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should reiterate the commitment expressed by all Participating States in the Copenhagen Document to the ideals of democracy and political pluralism as well as their common determination to build democratic societies based on free elections and the rule of law.
- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should echo ECHR in affirming that the institution of Sharia law is incompatible with the requirements of a democratic society.
- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should restate its commitment to Copenhagen Document's commitment to fundamental freedoms, including freedom of expression, which is being systematically impeded by Participating States in an effort to stifle criticism of Islam.
- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should express concern over various Islamic scholars' assertions that: a. Islam is a militant ideology and program which seeks to alter the social order of the whole world and rebuild it in conformity with its own Islamic tenets and ideals; b. Islamic Jihad would necessarily destroy non-Islamic systems and would bring about a universal revolution; and c. Non-Muslims could be tolerated but apostates could not on pain of death.
- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should express serious concern that while Adolph Hitler devoted only 7% of Mein Kampf to "anti-Jew text," fully 9.3% of the Islamic trilogy of the Koran, Sirah and Hadith falls into the same category, according to a recent study.
- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should express concern that according to another recent study: a. Religious persecution is very much worse in Muslim-majority countries b. 62% of Muslim-majority countries have moderate to high levels of persecution c.

Persecution of more than one thousand persons is present in 45 percent of Muslim majority countries, compared to 11 percent of Christian-majority countries and 8 percent of countries where no single religion holds a majority. Thirteen of the fourteen countries in the worst group with respect to religious persecution are predominantly Muslim; and that e. The cause of this religious persecution is not ethnic or wealth-related but stems from Muslim teachings and internal movements towards stricter Islam.

- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should express concern that according to another recent study, the traditional sources of the Islamic faith provide justification for the entire program of militancy experienced by Participating States today.
- The OSCE HDIM 2017 should reiterate the Copenhagen Document's commitment against totalitarianism, anti-Semitism, and persecution on religious grounds, noting that the Islamic law known as Sharia mandates all three

Constantinopolitan Society

Due to significant restrictions and serious limitations on human rights which are threatening the sustainable vitality, survival and vibrant future of the Greek Minority in Turkey, OSCE / **ODHIR** are called upon to urge Turkey -as OSCE participating State- to:

Property rights

- Issue immediately new regulations for the arbitrarily suspended elections within the minority foundations and permit conduct of elections of board members in all foundations.
- Put an end to the fragmentation of minority Foundations (70 in number), thus allowing for the unification of the various minority Foundations by establishing a Body of Coordination of minority Foundations, as a key to their survival, efficiency and cost - effective functioning.
- Solve the question of property that was seized and sold to third parties.
- Return the archives and the library of 50,000 valuable volumes of the Hellenic Literary Society of Constantinople- which has been illegally confiscated in 1925- to a Greek Minority Foundation in Istanbul. This library represents the intellectual heritage of the Hellenism of Constantinople.
- Ensuring that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property, by implementing as of March 2010 recommendations of the Council of Europe Venice Commission on the protection of property rights. Turkey should conform to the relevant rulings of the European Court for Human Rights.

Educational rights

- Amend the Law on Private Schools Education, so as the diplomas of students of European and other nationalities are officially recognized and validated for their admittance in Turkish Universities etc.
- Facilitate the approval of textbooks used by Greek minority schools through a simple and speedy process.
- Support financially minority schools, as it is foreseen by the 1923 Lausanne Treaty.
- Delete all anti-minority references from schoolbooks used for teaching in Turkey, as it forges historic realities, fosters discriminatory behavior against members of the minority and incites hate actions.

Human rights, non-discrimination issues

- Restitute Turkish Republic citizenship to Greek minority members living abroad and issue permanent residence and work permit to those who are willing to return to Turkey.

- Ensure that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property.
- Fully implement the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and interpret the 1923 Lausanne Treaty so as to provide equal rights to the Greek Minority in Turkey.
- Sign and ratify the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM) of the Council of Europe.

Forum 18 News Service

participating States, **OSCE institutions** and field operations, and civil society could:

- understand in concrete terms the serious violations of the freedom of religion or belief and interlinked freedoms of expression, assembly and association taking place in the OSCE region – including the targetting by some participating States of women exercising these freedoms;
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, stressing implementation of all fundamental freedoms, including to be free from torture;
- insist in line with human dimension commitments that the non-negotiable most effective step to ensure security is to fully implement fundamental freedoms commitments;
- challenge the misuse of concepts such as “anti-terrorism”, “extremism”, “religious tolerance”, and “dialogue” to disguise human dimension commitment violations;
- use tools such as the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief, the OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities and on Freedom of Association, the OSCE Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, and on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders.

“Giuseppe Dossetti” Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

The OSCE/ODIHR is called upon to:

- develop and strengthen capacity building activities with regard to the protection of religious properties, including the Christian ones.
- train law enforcement agencies, media and civil society to consider carefully also the hate crimes perpetrated against majority groups.
- develop Guidelines for educators on countering intolerance and discrimination against Christians.
- enhance the cooperation among its departments in order to guarantee a comprehensive and coherent approach in protecting freedom of religion or belief and combating religious intolerance and discrimination

The Chairmanship-in-Office is urged to:

- consult closely with the Personal Representatives and support their work.
- appoint a fourth Personal Representative on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against the members of other religious communities and against Roma and Sinti, in order to focus one Personal Representative’s mandate on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians.

The Personal Representatives of the Chairmanship-in-Office are called upon to:

- focus on, and adopt a standardized approach to, country visits and subsequent reports.

- intervene when incidents do occur, through public statements and engagement with authorities of relevant participating States.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

Recommendations to OSCE and ODIHR

- Make the situation for Christians in refugee accommodations a priority; conduct research and surveys.
- Prepare educational materials specifically addressing this problem.
- Work with NGOs to address this problem.

Representation of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church to the International Organizations

Calls upon the OSCE, the participating States of this meeting: via counseling and other means of communication, to facilitate the removal of discriminatory bills Nos. 4128, 4511, 5309 from the agenda of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine, and to assist in the cessation of offenses against the Ukrainian Orthodox Church.

Soteria International

Soteria International recommends that the OSCE and all forums of concern create educational programs explaining that the fundamental rights and freedoms we have are composed of both rights and responsibilities which are our obligation to uphold, promote, and encourage at all times. They should also teach that it is the responsibility of individuals, groups, and associations to promote respect for and foster knowledge of human rights and fundamental freedoms at the national and international levels.

SOVA Center for Information and Analysis

For the OSCE

- Compile and distribute experience gained from comprehensive efforts against groups that practice racist violence, including specific criminal investigations, detection and destruction of the groups' infrastructure, isolation of their funding sources, identifying organizers and coordinators of violent actions, etc. Hold an international expert workshop on this topic, if needed.
- Organize a series of seminars for law enforcement officials from different countries, presenting a summary of successful practices for collecting information and recording hate crimes statistic
- Conduct a comparative analysis of a wider range of national laws in the area of combating intolerance, as they pertain to incitement to hatred, discrimination, or activity of relevant groups, based on the existing experience of comparative analysis of the Participating States' hate crimes legislation.
- Supplement the comparative analysis of legislation with an additional comparative analysis of law enforcement in OSCE countries, primarily focusing on combating hate crimes and incitement of hatred.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

calls upon the OSCE and other International Communities:

- To urge Greece to end discriminative implementations targeting the Turkish Minority immediately,
- To monitor the legislation process in Greece,

[Recommendations to the OSCE Field Missions](#)

Forum 18 News Service

participating States, **OSCE** institutions and **field operations**, and civil society could:

- understand in concrete terms the serious violations of the freedom of religion or belief and interlinked freedoms of expression, assembly and association taking place in the OSCE region – including the targeting by some participating States of women exercising these freedoms;
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, stressing implementation of all fundamental freedoms, including to be free from torture;
- insist in line with human dimension commitments that the non-negotiable most effective step to ensure security is to fully implement fundamental freedoms commitments;
- challenge the misuse of concepts such as “anti-terrorism”, “extremism”, “religious tolerance”, and “dialogue” to disguise human dimension commitment violations;
- use tools such as the EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief, the OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities and on Freedom of Association, the OSCE Guidelines on Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, and on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders.

[Recommendations to the International Organizations](#)

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

calls upon the OSCE and other **International Communities**:

- To urge Greece to end discriminative implementations targeting the Turkish Minority immediately,
- To monitor the legislation process in Greece,

Friday, 15 September 2017

Working session 8 (specifically selected topic): Tolerance and non-discrimination

[Recommendations to participating States](#)

Estonia / European Union

Les recommandations de l'Union européenne en matière de lutte contre les crimes de haine sont les suivantes:

- Coopérer activement avec le Bureau des institutions démocratiques et des droits de l'Homme (BIDDH) et soutenir pleinement ses activités dans la prévention des crimes de haine. A cet égard, nous encourageons vivement tous les Etats participants à communiquer au BIDDH toutes les données pertinentes sur les crimes de haine pour alimenter son rapport annuel sur les crimes de haine dans

l'espace OSCE, en lien avec les engagements pris dans la décision d'Athènes de 2009 sur la lutte contre les crimes de haine ;

- Soutenir et renforcer l'action de la société civile et sa contribution à la prévention et à la lutte contre les crimes de haine ; renforcer en particulier la coopération et la confiance entre la police, les autres autorités compétentes et les ONG concernées, notamment en échangeant des données pertinentes ; instaurer des mécanismes de signalement par de tiers ; former la police et les juristes à la reconnaissance des crimes de haine
- Prendre toutes les mesures appropriées pour améliorer la collecte statistique sur les crimes de haine, à savoir leur signalement et leur enregistrement, dans le but de garantir l'accès de toutes les victimes à la justice, et ce faisant d'améliorer les performances de la police et du corps judiciaire dans la lutte contre les crimes de haine ;
- Renforcer la lutte contre les crimes de haine commis sur internet dans le plein respect de la liberté d'expression ;
- Prévenir et combattre les discours et crimes de haine par l'éducation aux droits de l'Homme et la promotion des vertus de la diversité, de l'égalité et de l'inclusion ;
- Mobiliser les jeunes dans les causes de la paix, de la diversité et du respect mutuel, pour qu'ils contribuent à la lutte contre l'intolérance.

Ukraine

To Russia:

We call on Russia and its proxies for these people and all other Ukrainian detainees and political prisoners to be released.

Barnabas Fund

To Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan:

requests that Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan review their performance in the area of religious freedom to respect their constitutional provisions, and their obligations under the ICCPR.

Christian Evangelical Church, Temirtau

To Kazakhstan:

- Соразмерить уровень наказания за подобные виды нарушений с нарушениями сделанными в нерелигиозном контексте.
- Привести законодательство РК в сфере свободы совести в соответствии с международными стандартами права.

Christliche Gemeinde des Vollen Evangeliums "Neues Leben" e.V

Рекомендации для Казахстана:

Пересмотреть предлагаемые поправки в закон о религиозной деятельности, и привести предлагаемые нормы в соответствии с взятыми на себя международными обязательствами по недискриминации и права на религиозную свободу

Eurasia Partnership Foundation

Recommendations to the Government of Armenia:

The lack of an anti-discrimination legislation.

- With the engagement of civil society, ensure the adoption of the Law of the Republic of Armenia "On Equality" guaranteeing the protection and promotion of

equal rights and freedoms and equal opportunities for every person and citizen. The anti-discrimination law should, inter alia, prescribe:

- the definitions of key concepts and forms of discrimination
- a wider scope protected attributes directly mentioning sexual orientation and gender identity among them, which is due to the necessity of setting forth additional safeguards against discrimination for the most vulnerable groups of society.
- a separate chapter on the mechanisms for prevention and countering of discrimination, which defines in detail the obligations and rights of the National Assembly, the Human Rights Defender, Government, State and local self-government bodies, non-governmental organisations, natural and legal persons.
- the formation of the Equality Council as a collegial body adjunct to the Defender with minimum interference by the Defender in its activities (particularly within the context of its functions, election of its members, termination of powers, approving its Rules of Procedure and the Code of Conduct for its members) for the purpose of providing the objectivity, impartiality and independence of the Equality Council.
- the competence of the Equality Council, non-governmental organisations and other associations carrying out activities prescribed by law to bring an *actio popularis* claim before the court in discrimination cases, taking into account decision No. 906 of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Armenia dated September 7, 2010 explicitly acknowledging the right of the aforementioned organisations whose statutory purposes cover protection from discrimination to bring an *actio popularis* claim before the court.
- a provision regarding the burden of proof in compliance with European Union Council Directive 2000/43

Hate speech and hate crime.

- introduce the definition of “hate speech” and define liability for hate speech against persons with protected features, including on the ground of sexual orientation and gender identity.
- amend the existing criminal legislation on hate crimes to consider committal of a crime on the basis of sexual orientation and/or gender identity of a person as a circumstance aggravating the guilt.

Tolerance and education.

- the school textbooks before being officially approved shall undergo scrutiny by human rights experts in order to exclude presence of elements leading to intolerance or discrimination.
- study the perceptions of some or all school textbooks by schoolchildren to be able to identify the impact of apparently intolerant approaches the textbooks contain on schoolchildren.
- eliminate subjective interpretation of literary pieces by the authors of the textbooks, particularly, on Armenian literature, to enable children to form and express their own views regarding Armenian literature and develop critical thinking skills.
- revise the content of the “History of the Armenian Church” subject, reflecting the coverage of historical events and excluding religious preaching.
- eliminate the instances of religious preaching at schools by AAC as well as anti-preaching against other religions and beliefs, which lead to intolerant and discriminatory practices, through intervention of authorised bodies (where

necessary) guaranteeing that the education on religion is provided in line with the objective, impartial and democratic principles of pluralism.

- eliminate prayer, crossing oneself and other religious ceremonies while teaching the “History of the Armenian Church” at schools.

The lack of an anti-discrimination legislation.

- accompany the process of the adoption of the anti-discrimination law with a coherent, meaningful, carefully crafted and well-coordinated public campaign, which should be done in a manner of delivering pro-active messages to society before conservative, religious and marginal organisations start aggressive campaigning against the anti-discrimination legislation. It shall be borne in mind that the majority of governmental offices, MPs and other decision makers are oftentimes ignorant of what discrimination is, hence they should be well prepared through informal explanatory discussions facilitated by MoJ before the draft law reaches them for consideration.
- the nation-wide media, having a strong influence on the public, communities, community-based CSOs and local authorities should also be the targets of the campaign.
- undertake special trainings and other capacity building measures for judges and lawyers following or in parallel with the adoption of the anti-discrimination legislation; conduct intensive work with CSOs, educational institutions and society in general.

Ev. Freikirche "Mittelpunkt" Braunschweig e.V

To Kazakhstan:

Мы призываем Казахстан пересмотреть свою репрессивную политику направленную на все более жесткий контроль религиозных общин, которые не представляют никакой угрозы государству.

NGO Public Advocacy

To Ukraine:

рекомендуем государству Украина принять меры для восстановления нарушенных прав и охраняемых законом интересов верующих УПЦ.

The Path of Guru Jara

To Czech Republic:

- We are calling for independent and proper investigation of various hate crimes committed since 2010 on members of the religious minority, Path of Guru Jara, and that those convicted of hate crimes are acknowledged and publicly condemned by the relevant authorities and by the political leadership (according to point 6 of OSCE Ministerial council decision from 2009).
- We are calling for a remedy to our serious situation in the Czech Republic, a situation that has been officially and publically acknowledged by experts of national and international law, by domestic and international human rights organizations, such as Soteria International from Denmark, Human Rights Without Frontiers (HRWF) from Belgium, Coordination for Freedom of Conscience (CAP) from France, Forum for religious freedom Europe (FOREF) from Austria, the Helsinki Committee in Czech Republic (CHC), and Office of International Religious Freedom (IRF) USA in 2015 and 2016.

- We kindly ask also for reconsideration of all recommendations raised in OSCE HDIM conferences from Soteria International in 2015, Human Rights Without Frontiers in 2016 and 2017 in our case.
- We would like to ask for a re-examination of our appeal for registration as a religious society which has been pending at Ministry of Culture of the Czech Republic. The appellation process seems to be dubious and in serious contradiction with the Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religious or Belief Communities of Venice Commission and OSCE/ODIHR. In the USA and in the Philippines, the registration process of our religious society, as a legal subject, has been successful, without any delay.
- We are calling again for establishing a dialog between representatives of state and civil societies in Czech Republic. In our case, despite enormous effort, no effective dialogue with state representatives has been initiated (despite conciliatory declaration of the Czech Republic delegation in OSCE HDIM 2016). As an effective and extremely helpful solution for vulnerable discriminated religious minorities, we should see the allowing of mutual dialogue between religious minorities and state representatives.

Social Action Centre

To Ukraine

- To ensure implementation of the Action Plan for implementation of the National Human Rights Strategy 2020, namely introducing amendments to the Criminal Code to include characteristics sexual orientation and gender identity among others.
- To ensure a comprehensive and coordinated approach towards promoting tolerance and non-discrimination principles, including effective implementation of components related to preventing and combating discrimination of the Action Plan for implementation of the National Human Rights Strategy 2020.
- To ensure coherence between the Protocol on receiving a crime report of the National Police and the Unified registry of pre-trial investigations, as well as establish a mechanism for publishing the results of investigation in these cases.
- To improve cooperation with civil society organizations in relation to reporting, investigation and prevention of hate crimes., provide victims with effective access to justice and to encourage them to report hate crimes.
- To develop and ensure effective conduct of comprehensive professional training for law-enforcement, prosecution and judicial officials dealing with hate crimes.
- Promptly investigate hate crimes and ensure that the motives of those convicted of hate crimes are acknowledged and publicly condemned by the relevant authorities and by the political leadership of Ukraine.
- To ensure that all manifestations of hate crime are recognized and condemned by the state authorities, to prevent any displays of intolerance by the law enforcement bodies.

To participating States:

urges member-states to continue monitoring Ukraine's progress in implementation.

STOP Extremism

The declaration calls upon the OSCE states:

- To further increase their efforts to prevent and counter violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism in their countries, following a multi-dimensional approach, and in this regard to make use, as appropriate and where necessary, of the OSCE executive structures, including field operations within their respective mandates
- To strengthen their efforts to counter and suppress the financing of terrorism
- To consider, as appropriate, developing and updating national counter-terrorism strategies and action plans, including specific policies and measures to prevent and counter violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism
- To foster a comprehensive approach at all levels in preventing and countering violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism, including co-ordination among national authorities, co-operation among participating States, and co-operation with relevant international and regional organizations
- To encourage political leaders and public figures, including civil society and religious leaders to contribute to preventing and countering violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism, by speaking out strongly and promptly against violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism
- To further promote public-private partnerships in countering terrorism, where appropriate, among public authorities, the private sector, civil society, members of, or representatives of religious communities, and the media.
- To invite the OSCE Partners for Co-operation to actively engage with us to strengthen our dialogue and co-operation in preventing and countering violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism, respecting and protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms in this context, preventing and countering manifestations of intolerance and discrimination, including on the basis of religion or belief, xenophobia, violence
- To develop, where appropriate, national counter-terrorism strategies and action plans, including policies and measures to counter violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism
- To assist participating States in developing practical activities, in partnership with civil society and the private sector as appropriate, to support the elaboration of policies, approaches, and strategies to prevent and counter violent extremism and radicalization that lead to terrorism 10. To address negative socio-economic factors in the context of preventing terrorism and countering violent extremism and radicalization

Wiener Akademikerbund

recommends that OSCE participating States fully repeal all laws against blasphemy

[Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions](#)

Ukraine

We encourage the OSCE and its Institutions to be more persistent in their efforts to ensure monitoring of human rights situation in the temporarily occupied territories of Ukraine.

ABTTF - Federation of Western Thracian Turks in Europe

ODIHR should pay more and continuing attention to hate-motivated incidents and crimes against Muslims in the OSCE area and establish a more concrete cooperation mechanism with NGOs in reporting racism and racist hate crimes they face in countries which they

live, which indeed needs organization of an OSCE High Level Conference on Intolerance against Muslims.

Buergerbewegung (Citizens' Movement) PAX EUROPA e.V.

recommends to the OSCE that the terms 'tolerant' and 'intolerant' get precise legal definitions that do not in any way infringe on our fundamental freedoms

Moscow Patriarchate

Мы рекомендуем ОБСЕ расследовать множественные факты дискриминации наших собратьев на Украине и воспрепятствовать принятию дискриминационных законопроектов.

The Path of Guru Jara

To ODIHR:

- Please help us and provide assistance to the Czech Republic to fulfill its commitments from Ministerial Council Decision of 2009, as well Basil Declaration from 2014, mainly in reference to hate crimes towards religious minorities. If these OSCE commitments had been properly implemented, no long-term persecution in our case would have ever happened.
- Also another OSCE document that wasn't properly implemented is Venice commission Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religious or Belief Communities from 2015. Non-recognition of recommendation of this document has stopped our right to be registered as a legal institution in the Czech Republic, and therefore our ability to protect our human rights in a more effective way

ThinkOut

asks OSCE to accept the crime of islamophobia. As long as the hate crimes against Muslims are not recognized as islamophobic attacks, the perpetrators will never get punished.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

calls upon the OSCE and other International Communities to monitor the legislation process in Greece since the current legislation is far from protecting the Turkish Minority from hate-based attacks.

[Recommendations to the International Organizations](#)

Eurasia Partnership Foundation

Recommendations to international community:

The lack of an anti-discrimination legislation.

- accompany the process of the adoption of the anti-discrimination law with a coherent, meaningful, carefully crafted and well-coordinated public campaign, which should be done in a manner of delivering pro-active messages to society before conservative, religious and marginal organisations start aggressive campaigning against the anti-discrimination legislation. It shall be borne in mind that the majority of governmental offices, MPs and other decision makers are oftentimes ignorant of what discrimination is, hence they should be well prepared through informal explanatory discussions facilitated by MoJ before the draft law reaches them for consideration.

- the nation-wide media, having a strong influence on the public, communities, community-based CSOs and local authorities should also be the targets of the campaign.
- undertake special trainings and other capacity building measures for judges and lawyers following or in parallel with the adoption of the anti-discrimination legislation; conduct intensive work with CSOs, educational institutions and society in general.

Political Movement "Group 24"

просит мировое сообщество и международные организации по защите прав человека обратить особое внимание на факты ущемления прав человека в Таджикистане и принять необходимые меры в отношении правительства Республики Таджикистан.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

calls upon the OSCE and other International Communities to monitor the legislation process in Greece since the current legislation is far from protecting the Turkish Minority from hate-based attacks

Friday, 15 September 2017

Working session 9 (specifically selected topic): Tolerance and non-discrimination (continued)

Recommendations to participating States

Association of Religious Organizations of Kazakhstan (AROK)

To Kazakhstan:

Рекомендуем Правительству Республики Казахстан пересмотреть 490 статью Административного кодекса в сторону гуманизации.

- Обязательно должна быть введена норма: предупреждение, как для физических и должностных лиц, так и для организации в целом.
- Следует ввести разделение между правонарушением участника (члена) объединения, должностного лица и организации в целом. Нарушение должностным лицом своих обязанностей, а равно участником (членом) объединения не должно вести к штрафам и приостановки деятельности организации и тем более к прекращению ее функционирования. (За индивидуальное нарушения не должна применяться мера коллективной ответственности)
- Сократить все административные штрафы для религиозных объединений, так как сейчас они завышены и сопоставимы скорее со штрафами для субъектов крупного предпринимательства.
- Убрать из статьи норму “прекращение деятельности”, так как это позволяет исполнительным и судебным органам произвольно толковать их состав и на основании этого выносить решение о прекращении деятельности религиозного объединения Кроме того, наказание по данной статье наступает не за умышленное противоправное действие с причинением вреда

и ущерба, а за действия, исповедания религии, обряды и т.п. Норма о применении меры взыскания “прекращение деятельности” должна иметь понятные и четко определенные юридические границы, чтобы не было злоупотреблений.

Barnabas Fund

OSCE states should therefore:

- Promote better education among police, social services and other authorities on issues of violence towards those who change their religious faith.
- Include crimes motivated by hostility to apostates among their classification of hate crimes.
- Work to promote wider understanding of the absolute right to follow the religion of your choice or none among the general population and particularly among communities where this is poorly respected.
- Robustly reject calls to introduce blasphemy laws, but rather protect individual freedom of religion and speech.
- Promote the concept of equality before the law for all and reject moves to make any religious law anything more official than a voluntary code of conduct’.

Christian Evangelical Church, Temirtau

To Kazakhstan:

- привести законодательство республики Казахстан в сфере свободы мысли, совести и религии в соответствие с международными стандартами.
- обеспечить равные права и возможности для представителей всех религиозных групп.
- вести политику толерантности и не дискриминации, а так же особо защищать права малочисленных религий и религиозных групп, проживающих на территории Республики Казахстан

Christliche Gemeinde des Vollen Evangeliums "Neues Leben" e.V

рекомендации для Казахстана:

- Пересмотреть предлагаемые поправки в закон о религиозной деятельности, и привести предлагаемые нормы в соответствии с взятыми на себя международными обязательствами по недискриминации и права на свободу религии.
- А также требуем прекратить дискриминацию по религиозному признаку.

Ev. Freikirche "Mittelpunkt" Braunschweig e.V

To Kazakhstan:

- Мы призываем Министерство по делам религий Казахстана пересмотреть свое отношение к религии в целом и отказаться от репрессивной практики в отношении религиозных общин и различных групп верующих придерживающихся мирных взглядов.
- Прекратить маргинализировать религию и вытеснять из правового поля религиозные организации

"Giuseppe Dossetti" Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

In this respect participating States are called upon, on one hand, to create an atmosphere of tolerance and appreciation of religions and beliefs within which religious and belief

communities can engage in full and fruitful dialogue and, on the other hand, to foster the participation of religious and belief communities in a constructive public discourse.

KrymSOS

To Russia:

- Призываем Россию, осуществляющую эффективный контроль над Крымом прекратить практики незаконных задержаний, насильственных похищений, пыток, обысков и политически мотивированных уголовных преследований в Крыму.

To participating States:

- Международные и межправительственные организации, **правительства стран** обеспечить независимый мониторинг нарушений прав человека на территории Крыма, а также продолжить политику непризнания аннексии Крыма.

Soteria International

recommends for the OSCE member states to consider freedom of conscience as the foundation of the whole human rights edifice. Negligence of this foundation makes the whole concept of human rights fragile. In order to construct such a foundation, we must instate educational programs for children and adults, in order to make everyone aware that we are responsible for our lives, for the environment, and for harmony in society, and that change begins with our own example

[Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions](#)

ABTTF - Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

We would like to the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief to ensure that the participating States respect the right of the religious minorities and communities to select, appoint and replace their personnel in accordance with their respective requirements and standards in accordance with Vienna 1989, Questions Relating to Security in Europe

[Recommendations to the International Organizations](#)

KrymSOS

- **Международные и межправительственные организации**, правительства стран обеспечить независимый мониторинг нарушений прав человека на территории Крыма, а также продолжить политику непризнания аннексии Крыма.