

COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS (Covering Working Sessions 14 - 17)

This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is organized by working sessions and by what was submitted by delegations / international organizations / civil society to participating States and, separately, to OSCE institutions / field missions or other international organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language. This compilation contains recommendations from all documents received at the HDIM Documentation Centre by the end of working session 17; documents received after this time will be included later in the consolidated summary.

Wednesday, 30 September 2015

WORKING SESSION 14: Tolerance and non-discrimination II, including:

- **Combating racism, xenophobia and discrimination, also focusing on intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions**
- **Combating anti-Semitism**
- **Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims**

[Recommendations to participating States](#)

United States of America

- We urge participating States to support these efforts by increasing funding for ODIHR within the unified budget and through extra-budgetary projects. We welcome the launch of ODIHR's hate crimes website late last year. Thirty-two participating States have fulfilled the commitment to provide hate crimes data to ODIHR; we encourage the remaining participating States to do so without delay.
- We urge the EU and individual governments to ensure sustained attention to anti-Semitism by appointing envoys for that purpose. We also agree with the closing statement of the Swiss Chair-in-Office at last year's Berlin Conference that the Working Definition of Anti-Semitism disseminated by the EU Monitoring Center remains a useful tool for governments and civil society in explaining how anti-Zionism is frequently a mask for anti-Semitism.

Holy See

- We call upon the OSCE participating States, in particular, and the international community in general, as well as the media and other relevant role-players to combat intolerance and discrimination, as well as hate incidents and crimes against Christians, with the same determination as they would fight hatred against members of other religious communities.

Switzerland

La collaboration entre les Etats et la société civile est un élément déterminant pour renforcer la lutte contre l'intolérance et la discrimination. A cet effet, nous recommandons en particulier aux Etats participants

- Premièrement, de mettre en œuvre sans attendre la Déclaration ministérielle de Bâle sur le renforcement des efforts de lutte contre l'antisémitisme.

- Deuxièmement, de promouvoir toute forme de coopération et de partenariat avec la société civile, notamment avec les organisations culturelles et religieuses, pour sensibiliser aux effets négatifs de la discrimination et pour favoriser le respect ainsi que la compréhension entre les diverses communautés ethniques et religieuses.

European Union (EU)

Veiller à ce que chaque individu puisse jouir, sans distinction, des droits de l'Homme et des libertés fondamentales et dispose de moyens de recours effectif en cas de discrimination ou autre violation de ces droits et libertés ;

- Favoriser l'apprentissage de la diversité, du dialogue et de la tolérance et déconstruire les préjugés en promouvant les droits de l'Homme et des sociétés inclusives et solidaires ;
- Œuvrer à la compréhension et à la tolérance entre communautés ;
- Condamner de façon systématique les appels à la haine quels qu'en soient les auteurs, les motifs et les individus ou les communautés visées
- Coopérer activement avec le BIDDH pour prévenir et combattre toutes les formes d'intolérance.

ACT for America 5280 Coalition

- The ACT for America 5280 Coalition recommends that any complaints by self-defined Islamic entities concerning "intolerance" be ignored until such a time that these same entities show some of the tolerance to others that they are demanding from the West.

B'nai B'rith International

- We must continue to affirm commitments made at the landmark 2004 conference and reiterated at last year's review conference and assess the implementation of those commitments.
- We should widely promote, within the OSCE, the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency's comprehensive working definition of anti-Semitism.
- We must enhance funding for ODIHR's Tolerance and Non-Discrimination unit, which has now become a fixed and integral part of the OSCE's work. We must enable the TND unit to sustain and expand its critical activities, which include educational programs on anti-Semitism in more than a dozen countries.
- We must extend, for the foreseeable future, the terms of the three personal representatives on intolerance.
- Member-states must fulfill their reporting requirements with respect to hate crimes data. Far too few governments have done so until now.
- Finally, we must strongly reinforce the crucial principle declared at the 2004 Berlin Conference – That no political position, cause or grievance can ever justify anti-Semitism – and make clear that the demonization and delegitimization of the Jewish state is often none other than a pretext for the hatred of Jews themselves.

Buergerbewegung Pax Europa

BPE thus recommends:

- That our security organizations investigate the ideologies of any and all religious groups. - That any religious group promoting anti-Semitism and similar views

be re-categorized as political. - And that any such group be held legally responsible for how they motivate their members.

Center for Security Policy

- OSCE and participating States juristically define the terms they seek to impose on the citizens of participating States. Where appropriate, definitions should include identifying terms that have taken on divergent – even Orwellian – double meanings when used in official forums as opposed to their common and often defined use. When terms turn out to lack precise definition, their use when suppressing speech in the interest of hate should be suspended.

Centre of Civic Education "ALMENDA"

- Неукоснительно исполнять нормы Женевской конвенции от 12 августа 1949 года о защите гражданского населения во время войны, особенно в части принуждения о её соблюдении. Необходимо выработать конкретные механизмы, воздействующие на оккупирующую державу, для принуждения её к соблюдению конвенции.

Constantinopolitan Society

Property rights

- Return properties of minority foundations registered in the 1936 Declarations without precondition and bureaucratic obstacles to their rightful owners. If there is any kind of dispute as for the ownership of a particular property, the burden of proof should lay on the state and not on the foundations.
- Amend the Law on non-Muslim Welfare Foundations in such a way that would allow for, inter alia,
- Solving the question of property that was seized and sold to third parties.
- Issuing new regulations for the arbitrarily suspended elections within the minority foundations and immediately permit conduct of elections in all foundations.
- Returning the three churches of Panayia Kafatiani, Aya Yani and Aya Nikola in the district of Karakoy - Galata in Istanbul, as well as their immovable properties, which are illegally and forcibly occupied by the self-declared and nonexistent "Turkish Orthodox Patriarchate (TOP)", to their legal owners. Turkish authorities should grant them full legal entity status so as to be able to elect their governing bodies and freely administer and manage their own foundations.
- Returning the archives and the library of 50.000 valuable volumes of the Hellenic
- Literary Society of Constantinople (Ellinikos Filologikos Syllogos Konstantinoupoleos) - which has been illegally confiscated in 1925- to a Greek Minority Foundation in Istanbul. This library represents the intellectual heritage of the Hellenism of Constantinople.
- Ensuring that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property, by implementing as of March 2010 recommendations of the Council of Europe Venice Commission on the protection of property rights. Turkey should conform to the relevant rulings of the European Court for Human Rights.

Educational rights

- Amend the Law on Private Schools Education, so as the diplomas of students of European and other nationalities are officially recognized and validated for their admittance in Turkish Universities etc.
- Facilitate the approval of textbooks used by Greek minority schools through a simple and speedy process.

- Support financially minority schools, as it is foreseen by the 1923 Lausanne Treaty.
- Delete all anti-minority references from schoolbooks used for teaching in Turkey, as it forges historic realities, fosters discriminatory behavior against members of the minority and incites hate actions.

Human rights, non-discrimination issues

- Restitute Turkish Republic citizenship to Greek minority members living abroad and issue permanent residence and work permit to those who are willing to live in Turkey.
- Ensure that Greek citizens are able to fully enjoy their rights over inherited patrimonial property.
- Comply with decisions made by the European Court of Human Rights by removing the space listing religious affiliation on official identification cards.
- Fully implement the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and interpret the 1923 Lausanne Treaty so as to provide equal rights to the Greek Minority in Turkey.
- Sign and ratify the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM) of the Council of Europe.
- Revise the law on the National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) in order to make it an independent body which is adequately accountable to the public and which includes the participation of non-Muslim minorities' members.
- Turkey is urged to make sustained efforts to prevent and punish hate speech or crimes targeting persons belonging to minorities.

CST - Community Security Trust

- We have a right to expect States to take initiative, and to ensure that education of all students incorporates to history of Jews' contribution to European culture and science, greater awareness and understanding of contemporary anti-Semitism, as well as the history of the Holocaust and the learning that emerges from this. We also have the right to expect Participating States to facilitate continuing cooperation between Jewish and other faith communities.

European Centre for Law and Justice

- To assess freedom of conscience legislations to fully secure conscientious objection; to refrain from interferences and to modify legislation that discriminates or interferes with freedom of conscience and religion; to follow the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly Resolution of July 2011.
- ECLJ recommends to employers to make possible the conscientious objection of medical staff.
- To publicly recognize the contribution of Christianity and Christians in all the fields of the society and to encouraged the media to do so too; to recognize and condemn crimes and discrimination against Christians and ensure their right to participate fully in public life; to monitor carefully the growing phenomenon of hostility against Christians and take appropriate measures in response; to brief and train law enforcement officials as to protect Christian activities adequately within the framework of the law; and to follow up the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly resolution of July 2011.

European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion (EMISCO)

- Encourage political leaders and public figures to speak out strongly and promptly when anti-Muslim incidents occur as well as for other majority religions;
- Re-define European values through an inclusive, pluralistic approach **based on a Reflexive VIRTUE ethics** that acknowledges the fruitful historical interaction between Judeo-Christian and Muslim values in order to move towards a more inclusive definition of what Europe stands for today;
- Introduce a new contract between governments, majority societies, and all ethnic and religious minorities, based on this re-defined discourse about “Western values”.
- Take steps to effectively address intolerance against Muslims in the OSCE area, both in preventing and responding to incidents by implementing concrete measures in every level;
- Implement existing OSCE commitments related to monitoring hate crime and collecting relevant data on incidents targeting Muslim communities, ensuring that data is disaggregated to show specific bias motivations related to religion;
- Ensure that security measures and anti-terrorism efforts are not directed at any specific ethnic, religious or cultural group, in their design, implementation or impact;
- Collaborate with local civil society groups, and Muslim communities, through effective partnerships and strengthened dialogue to address intolerance, discrimination and to promote mutual respect and understanding.
- Encourage cultural and religious diversity in public debates, as well as in consultations during important legislative initiatives.
- Make progress in **intercultural and interreligious education** as recommended in the Council of Europe Reference Book on Religious Diversity and Intercultural Education published in 2007 in line with the European Cultural Convention (1954) (ETS No. 18) which underlines the need for education to develop mutual understanding between peoples.

European Union of Jewish Students

- We recommend to the OSCE and participating states to undertake awareness raising measures that enable public stakeholders the following: To strongly differentiate between what it means to have a Jewish identity, one hand, and the political image of the State of Israel, on the other hand.
- We ask governments to implement their commitment to promote Holocaust remembrance and education, and to resist the political and revisionist motives behind distortion of the Holocaust.
- We recommend that various forms of Holocaust education should in no way be compromised.
- The online incitement of hatred may prepare the ground for offline violence. Therefore governments should support civil society initiatives which promote counter speech and a critical approach towards online content.

Forum for Religious Freedom Europe (FOREF)

To Germany:

- Investigate the disproportion of the measures taken by the local authorities and the instigating role played by so-called cult experts in the case of the Twelve Tribes community and **prioritize** the physical and psychological well-being of their children regardless of religious affiliation;
- Consider professional opinions of sociologists or accredited scholars of Religious Studies (*Religionswissenschaft*) instead of adopting the biased views of so-called cult-experts (*Sektenexperten*) or TV reporters when dealing with New Religious Movements such as the Twelve Tribes;
- Avoid stigmatization and bullying of children in foster homes (*Jugendheime*) and schools through promoting a culture of mutual tolerance and respect toward religious minorities;
- Encourage mediation, dialogue and de-escalation approaches instead of criminalization of religious communities;
- Implement OSCE commitments on the freedom of religion of thought, conscience, religion or belief as stated in the Helsinki 1975, Vienna 1989, Copenhagen 1990 and Kiev 2013 documents.

To Austria:

- Remove the pejorative cult term in the title of the BSS and all state sponsored observation offices or information centers.
- Revise the unconstitutional federal law to install a documentation and information center for cult issues (Bundesgesetz über die Einrichtung einer Dokumentations- und Informationsstelle für Sektenfragen (EDISG) 1998).
- Install a confessionally independent, scientific center for the purpose of collecting information and providing professional counseling on religious, spiritual and esoteric communities, regardless of their legal status. (e. g. the British model of INFORM – information network focus on religious movements, which encompasses experts from psychology, sociology and religious studies.)
- Introduce transparency and publicity as guiding principles of state documentation on religious minorities and inhibit state collaboration with established churches in emanating information on non-established religious minorities.
- Inhibit state collaboration with and monitor FECRIS-affiliated private information centers (e. g. GSK).
- Enable a due legal process for religious groups to present their standpoint, in the case that they are named in state reports.
- Introduce a reformed legislation on religion that fully respects the principle of equality, the autonomy of religious communities and the free practice of religion (cf. Art. 9 ECHR).

To Hungary:

- Remove the pejorative cult term in the title of the BSS and all state sponsored observation offices or information centers.
- Revise the unconstitutional federal law to install a documentation and information center for cult issues (Bundesgesetz über die Einrichtung einer Dokumentations- und Informationsstelle für Sektenfragen (EDISG) 1998).
- Install a confessionally independent, scientific center for the purpose of collecting information and providing professional counseling on religious, spiritual and esoteric communities, regardless of their legal status. (e. g. the British model of INFORM – information network focus on religious movements, which encompasses experts from psychology, sociology and religious studies.)
- Introduce transparency and publicity as guiding principles of state documentation on religious minorities and inhibit state collaboration with established churches in emanating information on non-established religious minorities.
- Inhibit state collaboration with and monitor FECRIS-affiliated private information centers (e. g. GSK).
- Enable a due legal process for religious groups to present their standpoint, in the case that they are named in state reports.

- Introduce a reformed legislation on religion that fully respects the principle of equality, the autonomy of religious communities and the free practice of religion (cf. Art. 9 ECHR).

Foundation "CitizenGO"

- To develop a policy on asylum, based on religious grounds, especially for persecuted Christians and other religious minorities.
- To establish a policy which will help Christians and members of other religious minorities forced to run to reunite with their families in their homeland as soon as possible.

Greek Helsinki Monitor

To Greece:

- Greece should see to it promptly that prosecuting and judicial authorities stop violating religious freedom, upholding instead the amended provisions of the Code of Criminal Procedure; launch disciplinary and criminal proceedings against all those who are liable for the violation of the Greek legal provisions after 2 April 2012; as well as award compensation to the individuals whose religious freedom has been violated through statements with a reference to their religion and a presumption of an oath to the Gospel.
- Greece should also adopt the proposed legislative amendments to implement the Greek National Commission for Human Rights' recommendation that religious oath should be completely replaced by political oath.

Human Rights Without Frontiers

To the Russian Federation:

- To release the 1 million brochures of Jehovah's Witnesses blocked by the customs in St Petersburg for allegedly containing extremist material while such brochures are distributed worldwide in more than 100 countries without any restriction or problem
- To lift the ban on the works of Turkish Muslim theologian Said Nursi as they do not contain any call to violence and to stop prosecuting those who read his books.
- To follow the repeated recommendations of the UN Human Rights Committee that the Federal Law on Combating Extremist Activity should be revised without undue delay with a view to clarifying the vague and open-ended definition of "extremist activity", ensuring that the definition requires an element of violence or hatred, and establishing clear and precise criteria on how materials may be classified as extremist.

MAZSIHISZ - Federation of Jewish Communities in Hungary

- I would recommend to all Participating States to have a fair position in criticizing Israel and do not use boycott as political tool, otherwise your Jewish communities will pay the price.
- To encourage cooperation between counter terrorist forces and Jewish communities and give aid to communities (if it is needed financially) to develop their security infrastructure, to have their members safe.

NGO Public Advocacy

- The international community has to pay careful attention to the processes currently taking place in Ukraine in view of the attitudes of state authorities to one of the biggest religious denominations in the country.
- Ukrainian authorities to halt the wave of illegal seizures of the UOC churches and take actions to bring the guilty to justice in order to put a stop to impunity and ensure defense of human rights in the country.

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- adopt practical measures to assure that the media as well as the political and public discourse are respectful for Christians, their representatives, teaching and symbols.
- foster the participation of Christians in public life and welcome the interventions in the public debate of the representatives of religious communities that give their view – based on moral convictions deriving from faith – about everyday's life and, in particular, on legislative and administrative provisions of their Countries.
- follow-up the Cordoba, Bucharest, Astana and Tirana Conferences by convening a Conference at the appropriate high-level in 2016 to examine in a balanced way racism, intolerance and discrimination, within the realm of the existing commitments.

Order of St. Andrew

- First, the Government of Turkey should reopen and extend the August 27, 2012 Decree deadline for the submission of applications to recover seized property, which did not give applicants sufficient time to respond. The Decree should be expanded to include all seized properties that were excluded. The Government should also revamp the manner by which the Decree is implemented. A Public Advocate, who is not a Government bureaucrat, should be employed to ensure that the Decree is implemented in a fair and expeditious manner.
- Second, the Government of Turkey should allow the Halki School of Theology to reopen and operate with its own theologians and in a manner consistent with its own Christian beliefs.
- Third, the Government of Turkey should refrain from interfering in the internal affairs of the Ecumenical Patriarchate. The 1923 and 1970 directives of the local Istanbul Government, relating to the citizenship of those who are entitled to vote for, or be elected as, a new Ecumenical Patriarch should be rescinded.

Wuestenstrom e.V.

Recommendations to OSCE/ODIHR and Participating States:

- Please do not support programs of sex education that are inappropriate for the young person's age.
- Please prevent children and youths from being harmed in the development of their personalities by nonscientific and ideologic agenda concerning sexuality.
- Please prevent children from being early sexualised by controversial sex educators.
- Please do not promote programs that threaten the fundamental rights of parents to educate their children and that do not respect the culture or the religion of parents and their children.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

- To take necessary steps to eliminate the problems derived from the duality of the religious leaders,
- To put an end to those policies that aim to create social division within the Turkish society,

- To recognize the popularly elected muftis of the Turkish Minority,
- To abolish the practice of state appointed officials / appointed muftis and imams that is against the religious autonomy of the Turkish-Muslim Minority,
- To respect the Greek historical leaders who signed 1913 Athens Treaty and 1923 Lausanne Peace Treaty,
- To have a dialogue with the representatives of the Turkish Minority while preparing laws and regulations related to Turkish Minority,
- To revise Law No: 3647/2008 regarding the charitable foundations (Waqfs) that undermines the religious autonomy of the Turkish Minority,
- To stop the implementation of the Law No: 4115/2013 regarding the appointment of imams.

[Recommendations to OSCE](#)

European Center for Democracy Development

- Take under control the situation with the xenophobic vandalism in Ukraine and to make every effort to stop the xenophobic campaign initiated by different political forces who are forming the public demand for radicalism.
- We are pleased to note that the OSCE plans to take forward the recommendations from the Vienna meeting held in April between some Participating States, civil society experts and Jewish community representatives and to now formulate concrete proposals for a programme to address the concerns.

[Recommendations to Chairmanship-in-Office](#)

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- Consult closely with the Personal Representatives and support their work.
- appoint a fourth Personal Representative on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against the members of other religious communities and against Roma and Sinti, in order to focus one Personal Representative's mandate on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians

[Recommendations to Personal Representatives of the Chairman-in-Office](#)

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- focus on, and adopt a standardized approach to, country visits and subsequent reports.
- intervene when incidents do occur, through public statements and engagement with authorities of relevant participating States

Holy See

- It is not necessary to be a Christian to recognize the growing intolerance, discrimination and hate crimes against Christians. Nevertheless, prevailing inaction highlights the urgent need for further raising awareness in society in general, and in the police and government representatives in particular. The OSCE and especially ODIHR could play an important role in this endeavour. Educational materials on countering and raising awareness of this negative phenomenon, as in the case of anti-Semitism and discrimination and intolerance against Muslims, should be urgently developed and widely circulated. This should be seen not only as a necessity, but also as the just thing to do. It would certainly elevate and enrich the profile of the OSCE/ODIHR.

European Union (EU)

- Poursuivre la réflexion sur l'articulation des travaux des représentants personnels de la présidence avec le BIDDH pour une meilleure cohérence et efficacité des activités au sein de la dimension humaine de l'OSCE ;
- Mieux prendre en compte les multiples formes de discrimination dans la promotion des droits de l'Homme et la lutte contre l'intolérance.

European Centre for Law and Justice

- The ECLJ requests OSCE/ODIHR and to international Governmental Human Rights institutions: to implement its Parliamentary Assembly resolution of July 2011 and to recommend appropriate action to their member states or participating states.
- to report on crimes and discrimination against Christians and recommend appropriate action to their member states; to encourage governments to monitor the situation of Christians carefully and to collect segregated data on hate incidents and crimes against Christians; to examine their own documents and recommendations with regard to indirect discrimination against Christians and to recommend to the EU not to adopt the proposed 5th equal treatment directive.

European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion (EMISCO)

- Facilitate open discussion and constructive dialogue among and between government officials, civil society, and religious or belief communities with the aim of implementing OSCE commitments on the freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief;
- Highlight patterns on intolerance and discrimination against Muslims, in order to better understand and proactively address intolerance and discrimination against Muslims;
- Foster broad civil society co-operations, and the sharing of best practices among stakeholders, on educational initiatives, as well as other measures to raise awareness of intolerance against Muslims;

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- develop Guidelines for educators on countering intolerance and discrimination against Christians.
- develop and strengthen capacity building activities with regard to the protection of religious properties, including the Christian ones.

Wednesday, 30 September 2015

WORKING SESSION 15: Fundamental freedoms II (continued), including:

- Freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief

Recommendations to participating States

United States of America

- Two years ago, that participating States made new commitments on freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief, including a commitment to the rights of non-believers. We call on all participating States to implement this and all of our existing commitments on human rights and fundamental freedoms.

European Union (EU)

- Participating States as well as OSCE Institutions and field operations should recognise, in their structures and activity, that violations of the right to freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief are violations of the fundamental freedoms of all citizens, regardless of their religious, deeply held ethical, or non-religious beliefs. They should address such human rights violations in a way which does not discriminate against or in favour of any belief and safeguards the right to freedom of expression, which includes the right to publicly criticise religious or other beliefs.
- Participating States should fulfil their commitments by facilitating groups, associations and communities, existing on the basis of religious or non-religious beliefs to peacefully operate and publicly manifest their beliefs, according to their legal status and respecting their autonomy. They should establish fair and clear standards of recognition which do not infringe OSCE commitments and international human rights standards, as outlined in the OSCE/ODIHR “Guidelines on the legal personality of religious or belief communities” is of utmost importance.
- We assert that violence against persons, groups or communities in violation of their right to freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief is unacceptable under any circumstances.
- We highlight the positive role that free and independent media can have on preventing the increase of bias and prejudice based on religion and in promoting mutual respect and understanding, including through specific educational and awareness-raising programmes.
- We stress the important role of political leaders, elected and state officials and civil society in denouncing public manifestations of religious intolerance with a loud and clear voice and in a timely manner.
- We support the participating States’ promotion of opportunities for religious and non-religious groups within society to have the possibility of open dialogue with each other and with policy makers on all relevant issues.

Alma-TQ

To Kazakhstan:

- Raise the issue of homophobic rhetoric, discrimination, censorship and acts of violence against LGBT people in routine and high-level meetings with government;

- Ensure that hate speech by religious and other community leaders against LGBT people are investigated and judged;
- Create a dialogue in society on freedom of belief that is inclusive of diversity;
- Strengthen the capacity of LGBT civil society organizations to systematically monitor freedom of thought.

Buergerbewegung Pax Europa

BPE recommends:

- That OSCE pS refrain from any form of contact with Hamas, Hezbollah and other anti-Semitic organizations.
- That 'religion' must not be a cover for promoting anti-Semitic sentiment and action.
- That teachers are supported in teaching about the Holocaust, even in the face of Islamist pressure.
- That any public grants or privileges are revoked from organizations promoting anti-Semitic dogma.

Center for Information and Analysis (SOVA)

- Do not use lists of banned literature as an instrument for protecting tolerance, including religious tolerance as this tool has already demonstrated a complete lack of efficiency, and it generates a lot of human rights violations.
- Accept the fact that religious tolerance should be protected by the same mechanisms as other forms of tolerance, and refrain from creating special rules that restrict certain freedoms for the sake of specifically religious tolerance.
- Disavow any and all laws that interpret religious polemics as incitement to religious hatred, and to revise the previously adopted solutions reflecting this spirit.
- Develop an effective mechanism for adopting decisions on the construction of religious buildings.
- Refuse the requirements to informal communities of believers to give their information to the public authorities if only they are not claiming any official status.

CSO "Equal Opportunities"

To Tajikistan:

- Take measures in policy and law to combat stigmatization and discrimination against LGBT people to protect their freedom of thought;
- Train law enforcement to protect LGBT people equally;
- Inform the public about tolerance and equality via campaigns and dialogue;
- Involve LGBT organizations and other civil society in drafting laws and policies.

European Association of Jehovah's Christian Witnesses

To Azerbaijan:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Azerbaijan to:

- Release immediately all of Jehovah's Witnesses currently imprisoned for their religious activities and beliefs

- Stop interfering with their worship and manifestation of belief
- Recognize the right to conscientious objection and provide an alternative service programme, conforming to international standards
- Recognize the right to religious freedom and fully register Jehovah's Witnesses
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses the unhindered use of their religious literature

To Bulgaria:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Bulgaria to:

- Ensure that law enforcement authorities provide appropriate protection against the physical assaults on Jehovah's Witnesses, and acknowledge acts of religious hatred
- Protect the right to manifest one's religious beliefs individually and jointly with others
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to build houses of worship without interference or discrimination
- Hold responsible those who slander others in the public media and incite religious hatred

To Kazakhstan:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request that the government of Kazakhstan:

- Stop imposing bans on religious publications of Jehovah's Witnesses
- Allow the free distribution of religious literature in locations other than places of worship and place authorized by the local authorities
- Stop the arrest, prosecution, deportation, and harassment of Jehovah's Witnesses for so-called unregistered missionary activity
- Annul the deportation of several of Jehovah's Witnesses for unregistered "missionary activity"
- Prevent police raids and harassment of peaceful gatherings of Jehovah's Witnesses
- Require that officials not make disparaging and discriminatory comments about minorities, including Jehovah's Witnesses
- Fulfil its obligations under international law to guarantee freedom of religion, expression, assembly, an association for all citizens, including Jehovah's Witnesses

To Kyrgyzstan:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Kyrgyzstan to:

- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to register their local religious organisations in the southern regions of Kyrgyzstan
- Stop harassment by authorities in Osh
- Terminate criminal proceedings of Mrs. Koriakina and Mrs. Sergienko

To Uzbekistan:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Uzbekistan to:

- Grant registration to the local community of Jehovah's Witnesses in Tashkent and in other cities of Uzbekistan
- Stop illegal searches of private homes and seizures of religious literature
- Stop harassing and molesting Jehovah's Witnesses
- Stop arrests and prosecutions for attending religious meetings and for peacefully and respectfully sharing one's belief with others
- Allow religious literature without censorship and access to the international website of Jehovah's Witnesses, jw.org
- Uphold the fundamental freedoms guaranteed by the constitution of Uzbekistan and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

To Russian Federation:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request that the Russian Federation to:

- Abide by the PACE Resolution 1896 (2012) and the 31 March 2015 concluding observations of the UN Human Rights Committee: Refrain from misapplying the law on extremist activities to Jehovah's Witnesses, and terminate all legal cases and criminal investigations against Jehovah's Witnesses based on extremist charges
- End the persecution of Jehovah's Witnesses in Taganrog, Samara, Abinsk, and elsewhere
- Remove all publications of Jehovah's Witnesses from the Federal List of Extremist Materials
- Ensure that Jehovah's Witnesses can peacefully enjoy freedom of religion and assembly without further illegal police interference

To Tajikistan:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Tajikistan to:

- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to register their local religious organization
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses legally to import and use their religious literature
- Recognize the right to conscientious objection to military service and provide for alternative civilian service so that Jehovah's Witnesses may serve their country with a clean conscience
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses peacefully to practise their religious beliefs and share them with their neighbours
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to own or use property for religious purposes, to receive donations, to carry out charitable activity, and to invite foreign citizens to participate in religious events

To Turkmenistan:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Turkmenistan to:

- Grant official registration to Jehovah's Witnesses
- Introduce genuine alternative civilian service
- Stop police threats, illegal searches and seizures, false accusations, beatings, and inhuman treatment of Jehovah's Witnesses
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to import and use their religious literature legally
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to hold religious meetings and assemblies and to practice their religious beliefs peacefully and share them with neighbours
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to own or use property for religious purposes, to receive donations, to carry out charitable activity, and to invite foreign citizens to participate in religious events

To Turkey:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Turkey to:

- Recognize the right to conscientious objection to military service and provide for alternative civilian service that Jehovah's Witnesses may serve their country with a clean conscience
- Apply the zoning law properly to allow them to build and register places of worship

To Ukraine:

Jehovah's Witnesses respectfully request the government of Ukraine to:

- Prosecute vandals and hooligans who attack our houses of worship and harass and harm our members, in order to discourage further violations of human rights
- Meet with local representatives to discuss the attacks and issues

European Humanist Federation

We urge Member States to

- treat women as first-class citizens and to ensure them – both in law and in practice – legal and safe access to abortion when they request it.

Finally, we respectfully call on the OSCE

- to include the promotion of abortion right – at least under certain circumstances – as part of its broad human rights strategy.

Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

We call upon the Government of Greece:

- not to diminish by no means autonomous establishment of the Turkish Minority of Western Thrace in accordance with Athens Treaty of 1913 and Its Third Protocol,
- to recognize the right of the Turkish Minority to elect its own religious leaders and repeal Law 4115/2013,
- to fully guarantee and realize that the members of the Turkish Minority would enjoy the same treatment and security in law and in fact as other Greek nationals in the management and control of their religious institutions and that they could exercise their religion freely therein,

Forum 18

- Insist that human dimension commitments are implemented in full by all participating States;
- situate freedom of religion or belief work within an all human rights for all perspective, making its aim assisting implementation of the freedoms of religion or belief and other fundamental freedoms including those of expression, assembly, and the right to be free from torture;
- mainstream work to ensure and promote freedom of religion or belief with its interlinked human rights, building on the other work of the ODIHR Human Rights and Tolerance and Non-Discrimination departments;
- use tools such as the *EU Guidelines on the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief*, the *OSCE/Venice Commission Joint Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities* and the *OSCE Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders*

Foundation "CitizenGO"

Participating States are urged to:

- Guarantee the right to conscientious objection not only in respect of compulsory military service but also in relation to all morally sensitive questions.
- Not force children to undertake compulsory sexual, religious or ethical teaching which may be inconsistent with the convictions of the children's parents, providing in this case non-discriminatory opt-out provisions.

Greek Helsinki Monitor

To Greece:

- Greece should abolish blasphemy laws, i.e. Articles 198 and 199 of its Criminal Code.
- Greece should promptly amend recent circulars that require parents to declare the non-Orthodox Christian identity of their children as a prerequisite to be exempted from religious education as well as revise the content of religious education so as to include an introduction to the history and the main values of each religion and be neutral towards all religions including the prevailing one.

Human Rights Without Frontiers

To France:

- to prevent and prosecute any form of state-sponsored or tolerated stigmatization and defamation of minority religious or belief groups and their members, and to revise in this regard the mandate of MIVILUDES;
- to cancel its support of, and its collaboration with, private associations which stigmatize some religious groups and promote hostility and discrimination based on religion or belief;
- to give unimpeded and equal access to the spiritual assistance of their choice to prisoners of all religions or beliefs;
- to monitor the compatibility of the implementation of the *laïcité* principle with the international standards related to freedom of religion or belief, and to sanction or prosecute the state agents or private persons who violate them;
- to guarantee the equal access to education to Muslim girls who wear headscarves;
- to end the criminalization of Muslim women who choose to cover their faces, and protect those who are coerced to do so without excluding them from public space.

Novae Terrae Foundation

- Participant States to consider the OSCE/ODIHR *Guideline on The Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities* as good way to understand and implement their commitments and adapt their legislation accordingly.

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- benefit from the Guidelines on the Legal Personality of Religious or Belief Communities in drafting and reviewing legislation pertaining to registration of religious communities.
- engage in consultations with religious communities in order to adopt anti-discrimination laws which do not violate the autonomy and self-organization of the religious communities.
- foster the participation of religious communities in public life and welcome the interventions in the public debate of the religious leaders.
- promote a dialogue between the representatives of the religious communities that are building a new place of worship and the religious communities historically present in the places in order to foster a climate of mutual tolerance and respect between believers of different communities.
- return to religious communities the place of worship which were confiscated by public
- authorities, returning them to the original owner instead allocating to other religious communities.
- adopt legislation and zoning laws which prohibits zoning of place of worship for different use than the original.
- guarantee the right to wear religious symbols and attire in public spaces, which is encompassed by the freedom of religion or belief.
- guarantee the conscientious objection not only to the compulsory military service but also in relation to all morally sensitive questions.
- not force children to a compulsory religious or ethical teaching which may be not consistent with the convictions of the children's parents, providing for this case non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities.
- request the assistance of the OSCE/ODIHR in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief.
- mainstream freedom of religion or belief in their foreign policies.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

- First, we respectfully remind participating states to combat underreporting by collecting disaggregated data on hate crimes against Christians. For example, in some countries, vandalism against a Christian church is merely reported as vandalism against a public building.
- Secondly, we recommend to participating states to be aware of unintended discrimination, which could be caused as a side effect of anti-discrimination or equality policies. Excessive regulation of private conduct often forces Christians to choose to either violate their sincerely held beliefs or abandon their businesses or professions. An example of such overbroad legislation is the proposed EU fifth Equal Treatment Directive.

Office of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints

- We would like to address the participating States about the importance of regular, structured and open dialogue with churches and religious communities
- We commend the European Union for its commitment to an open, transparent and regular dialogue with churches, according to Article 17 TFEU and we invite participating States to adopt similar provisions at the national and local level, if not already in place.

Redeemed Lives

Central Recommendation: I am requesting the participating States of the OSCE acknowledge that some Christians with unwanted sexual attractions are denied their fundamental right to self-emancipation, through legislation that blocksacting on the convictions of their religious beliefs and conscience. These Christians —

- Have the fundamental freedom to the right to self-emancipation from unwanted sexual attractions of all kinds, because of the convictions of their religious beliefs and conscience that such practices are incompatible with the faith they hold.
- Freely choose to self-identify exclusively according to their Christian conscience, and do not self-identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgender (LGBT) because they believe their only genuine identity is that of Christian.
- Suffer from *intolerance* when Social and Print Media assert they are living in a closet of lies, when according to their Christian belief system they are actually living in the truth of their faith.
- Are *discriminated* against when labeled as LGBT by Society and even some Christians, when they hold to the Christian conviction that human sexual behavior is a practice, not a constitutional orientation in which to invest their human identity.
- Are *discriminated* against when Governments outlaw therapies that may help them overcome their unwanted sexual attractions, when their Christian religious beliefs strongly motivate them to seek to inhibit sexual behavior outside of heterosexual marriage and to change the internal motivation that might lead them to violate the sacramental bond of Holy Matrimony, faithful Christian abstinence until marriage and the spiritual gift of life-long celibacy should they never marry.

Soteria International

- We recommend the proper authorities to investigate possible human rights violations in the case of Jaroslav Dobes and Barbora Plaskova, especially when it comes to collaboration between police, prosecutor, anti-sect movements and media.
- We recommend the Belgian authorities to not use the “sect-list” as a reference in any way.

The Values Foundation

To France, United Kingdom and Sweden:

We also call on the Swedish, French and UK delegations, where we are aware of genuine Christian minorities being demonized and targeted as dangerous, suicidal cults or sects, that they do more to understand the seriousness of this and provide the needed protection of the fundamental rights of these minorities.

Twelve Tribes

To Germany:

The German Authorities Need To Be Called To Uphold Their Own Laws, Declarations, Treaties And Agreements That They Have Signed.

- From the protocol of the Bavarian Parliament it is clear that the German Federal Office of Justice has been involved. The Jugendamt is required by law to work with parents individually before considering removal; the Twelve Tribes' parents were not contacted about their own children before they were indefinitely put in custody for an indeterminate period.
- We ask the Germany Government to keep its commitments to rights pertaining to Freedom of Religion and Belief issues as defined in the OSCE International Standards. To proceed, we request to have an official meeting with the German Delegation present today. And a further meeting with our lawyers to facilitate the return of the children still held. Some are very young, 5 years and under.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

To Greece:

- To respect the Turkish Minority's religious autonomy and stop the implementation of appointed imams,
- To respect the Turkish Minority's right to elect its imams according to the minority's long lasting traditions,
- To stop creating disturbance within the Turkish society via appointed officials,

[Recommendations to OSCE](#)

European Center for Democracy Development

- Develop guidelines and general criteria for determination of the unacceptable abuses of freedom of expression in the media, visual media advertising and the Internet. There is a fine line between freedom of speech and expression, which shall not be violated, and the rights of minorities are violated as a result of abuse of these rights. This boundary should be defined.
- Develop guidelines for the application of sanctions for Internet resources that allow the publication of materials inciting hatred against minorities.
- To pay attention to the governments of Hungary and Ukraine on inadmissibility of hate propaganda on the Internet and in the media of visual advertising.

NGO Public Advocacy

- Рекомендуем ОБСЕ принять все меры для прекращения дискриминации и прямого насилия в отношении общин Украинской Православной Церкви в Украине.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

- We reiterate our previous 2014 recommendation to OSCE to develop materials on how to combat intolerance against Christians and to disseminate them through the OSCE region. Manuals on how to combat anti-Semitism and discrimination against Muslims have previously been developed.
- Ladies and Gentlemen, let me conclude with a fourth recommendation: In the light of horrifying global developments, combating persecution of Christians outside the OSCE area must become a priority of the foreign secretaries of participating states in their foreign policy.

Soteria International

- We recommend international and national institutions of the OSCE member states to consider any use of the term “sect” as religious discrimination.

The Values Foundation

- Christian groups must be able to manifest their conscience and faith, to operate schools that fulfil national curriculum, to have fiscal benefits as appropriate to religious churches, be recognized that they are for public-benefit – many of them have integrated with society for many years and are part of Europe’s cultural heritage. We call on the OSCE to issue guidelines to highlight this concern to member states

Twelve Tribes

- We also request that the OSCE call the German officials involved to uphold the OSCE international agreements that they have signed including the United Nations Declaration of Universal Human Rights and Convention on the Rights of the Child, specifically Art. 2 and 14 which have been denied the children of the Twelve Tribes.

[Recommendations to OSCE/ODIHR](#)

European Union

- We encourage the ODIHR to address the connections between fundamental human rights, especially freedom of religion or belief and tolerance and non-discrimination issues and we recommend that this be reflected to all relevant OSCE events and activities.
- We acknowledge the crucial role played by the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Council on Freedom of Religion or Belief, noting particularly its legal assistance to participating States, and call for the Council to be supported and for its activities to be expanded, be made more visible and accessible. We call for resources to be given to enable this to happen.

Alliance Defending Freedom

- ADF International notes the contribution to the drafting process of the advisory panel on freedom of religion or belief yet notes a dearth of publicly available information on the membership of this panel, its remit, the term, or selection criteria. To afford the panel maximum legitimacy, ADF International calls on ODIHR to publish these details as a priority so civil society can better understand this work.

Church of Scientology; Human Rights Office

OSCE participating States promised to abide by fundamental human rights standards protecting freedom of religion in OSCE Commitments such as Paragraph 16 of the Vienna Concluding document. Yet, Belgium is egregiously violating these standards by initiating a heresy trial against basic Scientology beliefs.

- On behalf of the Scientology religious community, we call on ODIHR to implement legal standards regarding freedom of religion for prosecutors similar to the 2004 ODIHR and Venice Commission Guidelines for Review of Legislation to ensure that such heresy trials never happen again.

Constantinopolitan Society

Due to systematic and ongoing violations of religious freedom, OSCE / ODIHR is called upon to urge the Turkish government to bring its laws and practices into compliance with international standards on freedom of religion or belief. Specifically: OSCE / ODIHR are called upon to urge Turkey -as OSCE participating State- to:

- Grant full legal personality to the Ecumenical Patriarchate, so that the latter may enjoy, inter alia, ownership rights and exercise property ownership, administration and management.
- End Turkish citizenship requirements for the Ecumenical Patriarch and the Holy Synod of the Greek Orthodox Church, and permit them to select and appoint their leadership and members in accordance with their internal guidelines and beliefs.
- Lift the prerequisite that the election of the Ecumenical Patriarch depends on the pre-approval of the Prefecture of Istanbul.

Reopen without any delay and prerequisite the Theological School of Halki with exactly the same status it held before 1971 to offer religious education and permit students to enroll from both within and outside Turkey.

- Return immediately the three churches of Panayia Kafatiani, Aya Yani and Aya Nikola in the district of Karakoy - Galata in Istanbul, as well as their immovable properties, which have been illegally and forcibly occupied by the self - declared and nonexistent "Turkish Orthodox Patriarchate (TOP)" to their legal owner, which is the Ecumenical Patriarchate, and grant full legal status so as to be able to elect their governing bodies and freely administer and manage its own foundation.
- Comply with decisions made by the European Court of Human Rights by removing the space listing religious affiliation on official identification cards.
- Restore historical Byzantine churches of Haghia Sophia in Nicaea (Iznik) and Haghia Sophia in Trebizond, which were arbitrarily turned into mosques, to their previous function as museums.
- Fully implement the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights by withdrawing reservations that negatively impact religious freedom, and interpret the 1923 Lausanne Treaty so as to provide equal rights to all religious minority communities.

Foundation "CitizenGO"

The OSCE/ODIHR and to the OSCE/ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief are called upon to:

- Assist – in cooperation with the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee the right to conscientious objection in all morally sensitive questions, providing that the rights of others to be free from discrimination are respected and that the access to lawful services is guaranteed.
- Assist the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining to freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee (a) that the liberty of parents to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions is fully respected and (b) that the participating States provide non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities that would accommodate the right of parents.

Institute for Religious Freedom (IRF), Kyiv

- We recommend the ODIHR and the OSCE Special Monitoring Mission in Ukraine to conduct the monitoring of the religious situation in the eastern Ukraine and make a report based on results. Donetsk and Luhansk regions also require a permanent independent human rights monitoring.

Muslim Denomination in Bulgaria

- To Observe whether Bulgarian authorities are implementing the religious rights of Muslims in the country, as well to recommend and advise Bulgarian government on the issue of Freedom of Religion or Belief and Fundamental Rights.
- To undertake measures for better supporting OSCE participating States in implementing their commitments on the issue;
- To observe closely the Freedom of Religion of Muslim Minorities in non-Muslim countries.

Novae Terrae Foundation

OSCE/ODIHR to assist the member states in the use of its *Guideline on The Legal Personality of Religion or Belief Communities*, especially on the aspect of their autonomy;

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- Raise awareness on the positive contribution of the religions to the building and the well-being of our democratic societies.
- assist – in cooperation with the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief –the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief in order to guarantee (a) that the liberty of parents to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions is fully respected and (b) that the participating States provide non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities that would accommodate the wishes of parents.
- assist – in cooperation with the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – the participating States in reviewing or drafting legislation pertaining freedom of religion or belief in order

to guarantee the right to conscientious objection in all morally sensitive questions, providing that the rights of others to be free from discrimination are respected and that the access to lawful services is guaranteed.

Recommendations to FoM

Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom 'Giuseppe Dossetti'

- Provide – in close cooperation with the OSCE-ODIHR and the Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief – guidelines for voluntary professional standards and self-regulation of the media aimed to (i) promote knowledge and understanding of religions, (ii) give a fair and accurate account of religious beliefs, and (iii) ensure that members of religious communities are given the chance to express their own views on the media.

Recommendations to the OSCE Field Missions

- Mainstream freedom of religion or belief in their programs and activities.

Thursday, 1 October 2015

WORKING SESSION 16: Tolerance and non-discrimination I (continued), including:

- **Roma and Sinti issues, including:**
- **Implementation of the OSCE Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti**

Recommendations to participating States

Azerbaijan

To Czech Republic:

- More efforts should be taken to combat hate crimes against the Roma, to put an end to the negative public attitude towards the Roma, to reduce high unemployment rate and this is just a few to mention. In this regard, we call on the Czech Republic to accelerate its efforts in line with the Roma integration Strategy 2014-2020.

European Union (EU)

- Increase the efforts to implement all OSCE commitments, in particular the Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area, as well as continue the regular review of its implementation; in this context, participating States should respond promptly and comprehensively to all ODIHR's requests for information;
- Continue to ensure the complementarity of the OSCE Action Plan on improving the situation of Roma and Sinti and the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies.
- Take effective policy measures to ensure the equal treatment and the respect of fundamental rights, including access to education, employment, healthcare and housing; take measures to ensure that all Roma population is registered and holds identity documents;

- Enhance efforts to increase enrolment for Roma and Sinti children and youth at all levels in State-provided education and reduce school dropout rate; enhance efforts to eliminate segregation of Roma and Sinti at all levels in education; adopt measures to avoid the children fall victims to labour exploitation and trafficking;
- Enhance efforts to strengthen the rights of Roma women and girls and to eliminate discrimination on multiple grounds; fight violence, including domestic violence, against women and girls, trafficking, underage and forced marriages; promote the effective and equal participation of Roma and Sinti women in public and political life, including through the promotion of women's access to public office, public administration and decision making positions;
- Prevent further marginalization and exclusion of Roma and Sinti and address the rise of discrimination and violent manifestations of intolerance against Roma and Sinti, including Roma and Sinti migrants, refugees and IDPs, who may be subject of multiple discrimination;
- Enhance the participation of Roma and Sinti in the elaboration, implementation and evaluation of the policies that affect them; where appropriate, promote the training and employment of qualified mediators dedicated to Roma and use mediation as one of the measures to tackle inequalities in terms of access to education, employment, healthcare and housing;
- Enhance implementation of the OSCE commitments with regard to Roma and Sinti by local authorities;
- Enhance data collection with regard to the situation of Roma and Sinti in all fields of the Action Plan, as far as this is in compliance with the legal framework and overall policy of a Member State
- Include, where appropriate, a monitoring and assessment component in strategies, policies, measures and programmes related to Roma and Sinti, as well as review mechanisms taking into account the respective results of monitoring and assessment, as far as this is necessary by taking into account any existing monitoring mechanisms enhance cooperation among international organizations with regard to improving the situation of Roma and Sinti;
- The full implementation of all OSCE commitments continues to be the EU's guiding principles. We take this opportunity to reiterate our calls for full implementation of all OSCE commitments regarding Roma and Sinti and our firm determination in this respect.

Greek Helsinki Monitor

To Greece:

- Greece should compile credible statistics on homelessness including among Roma and undocumented migrants; as well as on evictions of Roma and other marginalized groups with information about provision of adequate alternative housing to all persons evicted from their homes and where applicable compensation for unlawful forced evictions.
- Greece should provide a comprehensive report on all persons, Roma or other, who live under the minimum adequate standards and of the specific measures taken to relocate them providing them with adequate housing which is the State party's obligation under international treaties ratified by Greece.
- Greece should promptly implement the letter and the spirit of the three ECtHR judgments on discrimination and segregation in education of Roma not only in the two communities concerned but throughout the country so that from 2015-2016 onwards the Ministry of Education make sure that all Roma children of mandatory school age attend school with appropriate support to secure their successful integration and that all those hindering school attendance by Roma children, be they authorities, non-Roma neighbours or even Roma parents, are sanctioned.
- Greece should fully investigate the phenomenon of unequal hence unfair treatment of Roma in the judicial system, establish statistics on the length of investigations of cases with Roma as plaintiffs and Roma as defendants, and impose sanctions on those who discriminate against Roma seeking justice, so as to combat the phenomenon.

- Greece should be commended for having abandoned the Xenios Zeus police profiling operations against migrants and is urged to also discontinue the similar sweep operations in Roma settlements as well the reference to the Roma identity of persons arrested or charged for alleged crimes.

Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre

To Ireland:

- Recognise Travellers as a minority ethnic group as a matter of urgency and include Travellers in anti-racism and discrimination legislation and intercultural initiatives
- Introduce an ethnic identifier across all administrative systems in line with human rights framework to develop responsive, adequate and non-discriminatory policies, and monitor and assess their impact on Travellers and Roma
- Base all budgetary decisions on comprehensive human rights impact assessment so that such measures do not result in increased inequalities and discrimination
- Ensure funding is reinstated and increased for national and local Traveller/Roma organisations to undertake autonomous community development work
- Develop a progressive Traveller Roma Integration Strategy with clear goals, indicators, timeframes and budget through meaningful consultation with Traveller and Roma representative organisations
- Integrate strong goals to promote the inclusion of Traveller and Roma women and youth
- Introduce an independent institutional mechanism to monitor and drive the implementation of the Strategy
- Undertake impact assessment of the HRC based on gender and ethnicity to eliminate its discriminatory impact on disadvantaged individuals and groups
- Introduce an exemption in the HRC for women affected by gender-based violence to ensure all women have equal access to safety and protection
- Ensure consistent and transparent application of the HRC criteria by providing clear guidelines and training to relevant officials, including anti-racism and discrimination training
- Resource initiatives to support national and local Traveller/Roma organisations to work towards greater empowerment, participation and inclusion of Roma and Travellers. Specifically target Traveller and Roma women and youth with a specific focus on gender equality, gender-based violence and early marriage
- Renew/introduce a new National Action Plan against Racism with strong civil society involvement in its development and implementation

Romani CRISS

To Romania:

- To take seriously the commitments made as a member of various regional and international bodies, and to put into practice the recommendations received from the OSCE and from the Venice Commission
- To modify the legislation on electoral process as to ensure a correct competition between the organizations of the national minorities, without favoring the organizations which are represented in the Council for National Minorities or in the Parliament
- To add to the existent affirmative measures to ensure women participation to elections, affirmative measures to ensure the participation of citizens of national minorities
- To make sure the current project law on the election of the Senate and of the Deputy Chamber and for the organization and functioning of the Permanent Electoral Authority is modified accordingly

Slovo 21

To Czech Republic:

- take and invite Romani women as members of your national delegation
- support the political trainings for Romani women to empowerment and support of Roma women for full participation in both society and politics.
- join Romani women to the country observing in election
- monitor and support financial compensation for victims of forced sterilization

Recommendations to OSCE

United States of America

- We commend ODIHR Director Link for speaking up on displacement and other issues relating to the human rights of Roma. We encourage other OSCE officials to continue to mainstream Romani issues into their work. We also encourage participating States to collect and learn from data to address issues identified to more fully implement OSCE commitments, whether related to Roma and Sinti, tolerance and non-discrimination, or other human dimension priorities.

European Union (EU)

- Continue activities of the OSCE field operations with regard to improving the situation of Roma and Sinti,
- Ensure effective coordination between the OSCE, EU and the Council of Europe.
- The European Union commends the work of OSCE institutions, notably the ODIHR Contact Point for Roma and Sinti Issues and the High Commissioner on National Minorities, for their dedicated efforts in advancing the implementation of the OSCE commitments and assisting participating States to this end.

Association "ARA ART"

- Commit to sharing information and expertise on the situation of LGBTIQ Roma, Gypsy, Sinti and Travellers across Europe as part of the envisaged international cooperation that will aim to further provide the responsible authorities and other relevant stakeholders at local, regional, national and international level, such as the Council of Europe, the European Commission, the European Parliament LGBT group, the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe, the United Nations based on our recommendations;
- In Czech Republic exist municipal decree called zero tolerance. Decree says where you can sit or not, but most of the places where you can't sit is situated in streets where live mostly Roma. This is the practice of the Duchcov city, but other cities implemented this practice too. In Czech Republic zero tolerance is silence supported by society. My recommendation is observing this practice in member countries OSCE.

Zentralrat Deutscher Sinti und Roma e.V.

- Outlaw in general antigypsyism as well as anti-Semitism. Antigypsyism is not only a direct threat to Roma in the OSCE region, but it constitutes a threat to our democracy and our community of values.
- We call upon the OSCE to document antigypsyism as part of its election observation missions and to respond with their institutions.
- Finally, the OSCE should encourage the Member States to enforce the relevant international agreements such as the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities of the Council of Europe, which prohibits any discrimination on grounds of membership to a national minority.

Recommendations to OSCE/ODIHR

Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre

- Apply pressure on the Irish State to give legal recognition to Travellers as a minority ethnic group
- Explicitly name Travellers as a target group in all OSCE Roma related
- Actively promote public duty in participating States to disaggregate data by ethnicity and develop initiatives to ensure participating States undertake such data collection in line with human rights standards and principles
- Develop and support the capacity of participating States in instituting human rights impact assessments in their policy-making processes
- Endorse the work of national Traveller/Roma organisations and promote community development as an effective approach to address the marginalisation and exclusion of Travellers/Roma
- Support the European Union institutions to maximise the potential of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020
- Apply pressure on participant States to amend any policy or legislation, which discriminates against minority ethnic groups and victims of gender-based violence
- Undertake an assessment of the criteria and implementation of the right to reside in the EU and its impact on Travellers and Roma
- Reinforce initiatives whereby Traveller and Roma women and youth are resourced to become leaders in issues affecting their communities
- Prioritise the elimination of gender-based violence and early marriage within Traveller and Roma communities
- Show leadership and innovation in the prevention of gender inequality and gender-based violence by developing initiatives which not only target women but men and young people

Romani CRISS

- To urge the Romanian state to make the adequate legislative amendments, as described previously in the OSCE report on the Romanian Parliamentary Elections and as stated below
- To continue to take steps to put into practice the OSCE Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti, with respect to enhancing the participation in political life

Thursday, 1 October 2015

WORKING SESSION 17: Tolerance and non-discrimination II (continued),

including:

- **Address by the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities**
- **Rights of persons belonging to national minorities**
- **Preventing aggressive nationalism, racism and chauvinism**

Recommendations to participating States

Switzerland

La Suisse souhaite adresser trois recommandations aux Etats participants:

- Premièrement, redoubler d'efforts pour favoriser la création de conditions de vie respectueuses des droits fondamentaux des personnes appartenant à une minorité nationale.
- Deuxièmement, traduire les textes normatifs d'importance de sorte à les rendre accessibles dans leur langue aux personnes appartenant à une minorité nationale.
- Troisièmement, mettre en oeuvre de manière effective le droit fondamental à l'assistance gratuite d'un interprète dans les procédures judiciaires impliquant des personnes appartenant à une minorité nationale.

Ukraine

- We call upon Russia to address the root causes of the rise of violent radicalism, neo-Nazism and xenophobia in the Russian Federation and to use the valuable expertise of the OSCE Institutions to assist in this process.

European Union (EU)

- Participating States meet the commitment made by all OSCE participating States, without exception, to fully cooperate with the High Commissioner in order to enable the High Commissioner to fulfil the mandate.
- Participating States extend an invitation to the HCNM and make full use of the expertise of this Institution. Quiet diplomacy, which characterizes the work of the High Commissioner, is sometimes less visible to the public but brings results of lasting importance.
- Participating States should always grant HCNM full, free and unrestricted access in order to fulfil the mandate.

Council of Europe

- Member States of the Council of Europe are once more encouraged to sign and ratify Protocol No. 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights, which provides for the general prohibition of discrimination.

- OSCE participating States are encouraged to sign and ratify the Additional Protocol to the Council of Europe's Convention on Cybercrime, on the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems.
- Member States of the Council of Europe are once again encouraged to enact legislation against racism and racial discrimination, if such legislation does not already exist or is incomplete; they are also encouraged to ensure that such legislation reflects the key elements in ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 7, including the setting up of an independent body specialised in the fight against racism and racial discrimination; moreover, they are encouraged to ensure that this legislation is applied effectively.
- OSCE participating States are encouraged to allocate sufficient resources to national independent bodies entrusted with the fight against racism and intolerance.

ABTTF - Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

To Greece:

- We call upon Greece to restore the educational and religious autonomy of the Turkish minority of Western Thrace enshrined in the 1923 Lausanne Treaty. A mechanism for dialogue between governmental authorities and the Minority should be established in the form of advisory or consultative bodies that would be the channel for the Turkish minority to raise its own voice.
- ABTTF recommends the establishment of a department of Turkish Literature and Language in Democritus University of Thrace for educators who will teach in Turkish curriculum at minority schools.
- To take into consideration its international obligations and respect to the Turkish Minority's right to education,
- To eliminate the inequality within the educational system and provide equal opportunity for all segments of the society to access to compulsory education, especially for the Turkish minority which is the only recognized minority in Greece,
- To promote the mother tongue education that is Turkish within the compulsory education system in Western Thrace,
- To allow the Turkish Minority to establish its bilingual nursery schools,
- To give bilingual education in public nursery schools where the Turkish students/ children attend until the bilingual minority ones are established,
- To stop state-hand discrimination within the education system,
- To have a concrete dialogue with the Turkish Minority representatives during the legislation process,

Ecumenical Federation of Constantinopolitans

To Turkey:

- Reinstitution of the right of Turkish citizenship which showed progress but there are still problems to be tackled such as the discriminatory attitude towards the members of our Community on the provision of civil rights recognized to ex-citizens under the "Blue Card" arrangement contrary to the fact that the Law doesn't foresee any such exception.
- Establishment of a long term and state supported repatriation programme, focused especially to young generations, which will guarantee the survival of the shrinking population of Community. Last summer's pilot program in the form of an educational visit by a group of expatriated youngsters, supported by the Department of Citizen Abroad belonging to Prime-Minister's Office, showed the importance of establishing a long-term project.

- Establishment of research centers, as proposed by our federation, in cooperation with Turkey should be taken seriously as a measure of remedy.
- Remedy on the ownership rights by establishing a service department providing legal advice to expatriated citizens.
- Reinstitution of the cultural heritage by approving as a symbolical gesture, the return to Istanbul Foundation the Historic Library and Archive of the Greek Literary Society of Istanbul.
- Take initiatives on the appointment of minority members to public service functions.

European Center for Democracy Development

Recommendations to countries of OSCE:

- To withdraw its reservations to the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and to revise the model of integration of ethnic minorities towards the rejection of the principle of assimilation.

Federal Lezghin National and Cultural Autonomy (FLNCA)

To Azerbaijan:

- Conduct accurate census of the population numbers, disaggregating it to take into account minority groups;
- Adopt laws that will give the opportunity to the entire minorities divided by the state border to hold dual citizenship;
- Establish quotas for the State service for ethnic minorities;
- Observe ethnic balance in sending conscripts to the frontlines of the Nagorno-Karabakh border;
- Develop the educational system in minority areas, including through construction of schools, the development of quality scientific and educational material in minority languages, the inclusion of native languages as a mandatory option of the school curriculum, and specific trainings for minority language teachers;
- Ensure regular broadcasting in minority languages and publishing of newspapers and other periodicals in these languages;
- Give legal status as a regional language of the Republic of Azerbaijan to the Lezghin language;
- Guarantee freedom of conscience in the country, notably by removing obstacles created for the registration of Sunni communities and functioning religious institutions relating to them;
- Recognize and promote the existence of minorities' cultural heritage in Azerbaijan, and stop the process of modification of the toponymy in minority areas;
- To allow creation of all-Azeri cultural, linguistic and other associations of Lezghin people;
- Improve the living conditions in minority areas, including construction of adequate infrastructure, facilities, and development of communications and transportation networks;
- Create conditions for unhindered functioning and development for Lezghin NGOs in the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Greek Helsinki Monitor

To Greece:

- Greece must acknowledge all groups that aspire to a minority status, and respect the names they choose to define their identity, as well as register all minority associations with names reflecting those identities, including “Macedonian” and “Turkish”, so as to implement repeated ECtHR judgments.
- Greece should implement the UN Independent Expert on Minorities’ recommendation “*to reconsider its position* with regard to the recognition of other ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities which may exist within its territory in accordance with recognized international standards, and ... to ratify the 1995 Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities;”
- Greece must additionally grant to the Muslims of Rhodes and Kos the special minority protection regime enjoyed by the Muslims of Thrace; and promptly implement the recommendations of PACE on the rights of Muslims of Rhodes and Kos including the right to be offered classes in their mother Turkish language.
- Greece should grant both Muslim communities of Thrace and of Rhodes and Kos the right to freely choose their religious leaders and administer their religious foundations, while Muslims religious leaders should be restricted to religious duties.
- Greece should abolish the new discriminatory provisions against Turkish language minority teachers and continue instead the implementation of the current provisions which also have the approval of the minority and of minority teachers or alternatively establish a comprehensive Turkish-language teachers’ academy in consultation with the minority and its teachers.

Latvian Human Rights Committee

To Latvia:

- To sustain the network of public minority schools;
- To reconsider the language policy based on wider freedom to use minority languages as media of instruction in public education and as a means of communication with local authorities;
- To withdraw the restrictive declarations to Articles 10 and 11, made while ratifying the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities;
- To send a clear signal from the top officials that honouring of Nazi collaborators by politicians is unacceptable, even if some of the collaborators weren’t volunteers;
- To refrain from pressure upon Latvian minority rights activists and to stand up against pressure on them exerted by other participating states;
- To grant non-citizens of Latvia the right to vote in the municipality and European elections;
- To simplify and accelerate the naturalization procedure.

[Recommendations to OSCE](#)

Ukraine

- We reiterate the need for the HCNM to continue to seek access to the occupied Crimea. It is critical to continue close and permanent monitoring of the situation with the national minorities’ rights in Crimea and react to unacceptable cases of serious human rights violations and increasing repressions against the Crimean Tatar and Ukrainian communities. We welcome the joint work in this area undertaken by HCNM and ODIHR.

Council of Europe

- OSCE institutions are encouraged to continue their co-operation in the fight against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance with the Council of Europe, and in particular ECRI, by further strengthening mechanisms enabling the exchange of information and data to support common action.

Latvian Human Rights Committee

- To reaffirm its commitment to the use of minority languages in education, as expressed in the Hague Recommendations Regarding the Education Rights of National Minorities of 1996;
- To reaffirm its commitment to the Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders and the relevant provisions of Moscow Document and Copenhagen Document;
- To send a clear signal that honouring of Nazi collaborators by politicians is unacceptable, even if some of the collaborators weren't volunteers.