

# THE MOSCOW BUREAU FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

Mail address: 115455 Moscow, P.O.Box # 6
Tel./fax: +7 (495) 670 69 75, 506-0224

E-mail: humanrights@list.ru, Web: www.antirasizm.ru

### Anti-Semitism manifestations in Russian Federation in 2008

# (Review of Moscow bureau for human rights)

#### **Preface**

Anti-Semitism (archaic - Judeophobia) is a sort of xenophobia, ideology of hostile attitude towards the Jews as an ethnic or religious group manifested in persecution, humiliation, violence, forcing of hostility and enmity, discrimination and infliction of damage on the person, social group or part of population basing upon the indication of belonging to the Jewish nation or due to Jewish ethnic origins and/or religious affiliation with Judaism. At present, the term means hostility towards the Jews and/or Hebrews but not all the nations of Semitic linguistic group (http://ru.wikipedia.org/wiki/).

Anti-Semitism is still the constituent part of Russian radical nationalism. Being a complicated historical-social phenomenon, anti-Semitism is a conglomeration of various beliefs that are transformed in the course of historical process and permanently interacting dialectically. Religious, conspirological, "anti-capitalist' and everyday components are still distinctly expressed in today's Russian anti-Semitism. At the same time, one can speak about practically complete absence of the official anti-Semitism – this has become possible due to radical changes in social-political and economic life of Russia during recent 20 years as well as due to principal position of high-ranking officials.

As for undisguised anti-Semitism manifestations, their number is approximately on the same level during recent years: 7-10 attacks on the Jews, 8-10 attacks on the premises occupied by the Jewish organizations (2006 was an exception: attack of A. Koptsev on the synagogue at Bolshaya Bronnaya played its role and became an example for imitation). Relatively low number of attacks is caused both by some complexity of identification of the Jews in comparison with other ethnic minorities and by punishments for such attacks being strict enough. At the same time, growth of anti-Semitic graffiti and desecrations of Jewish cemeteries and monuments to the Holocaust victims are the evidence of impressing scale of anti-Semitism dissemination (38 cases in 2008).

The report reflects the monitoring data on anti-Semitism manifestations in Russian Federation in 2008 divided into the following categories: attacks and

vandalism, use of anti-Semitic rhetoric in election campaigns, dissemination of anti-Semitic produce, anti-Semitism in mass media, anti-Semitic statements and actions of the authority representatives, public anti-Semitic character actions, rehabilitation of Nazism and denial of the Holocaust, accusation of the Jews of so-called "ritual murders" ("blood libel"), religious anti-Semitism manifestations, and anti-Israeli statements. Response to anti-Semitism manifestations on the part of the authority representatives, Russian Orthodox church and Jewish community of Russia are reviewed separately as well as law-enforcement practice on the cases concerning crimes based upon anti-Semitism.

#### **Attacks and vandalism**

According to MBHR monitoring data, nine cases of attacks on synagogues, community centers and other Jewish organizations or cases of desecration of buildings of the Jewish organizations were recorded in 2008. The following attacks were recorded: attacks on the synagogue in Astrakhan (January 1)<sup>1</sup>, Nizhni Novgorod (January 23, August 16)<sup>2</sup>, Tomsk (March 5 night)<sup>3</sup>, Orenburg (April 10-11 night)<sup>4</sup>, Dzerzhinsk (Nizhni Novgorod region) (June 1-2 night)<sup>5</sup>, on Ulyanovsk Jewish community center (January 29)<sup>6</sup>, building of Tula Jewish charitable center "Hasdey Neshama" (May 9)<sup>7</sup>, representation of the Jewish agency in Russia (JAR) in Saratov and local charitable organization "Hesed" (October 26)<sup>8</sup>. A case of attack on the Orthodox church motivated by anti-Semitism was also recorded: on December 8 the wooden temple of St. Nicolas was set on the fire in Yekaterinburg, and at the same time the inscriptions appeared at the iron church fence: "Russian or Christian? You should choose one", "Christ was a circumcised Jew" as well as drawings of conventionalized swastika<sup>9</sup>.

Eight cases of attacks or attempted attacks on the Jews were recorded:

On February 20 a skinhead group met an ethnic Jewish woman in the Moscow underground and started yelling: "Yids – get out of Russia!". Only the fact that several militiamen happened to be in the vicinity saved the woman from more serious consequences<sup>10</sup>.

On March 20, while the Ulyanovsk Jewish community was celebrating Purim, several dozen skinheads assembled near the house where the celebration was

http://www.feor.ru/news/index.php?newsid=4867

http://www.blagovest-info.ru/index.php?ss=2&s=3&id=18394,

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?SECTIONID=244662&IID=512408

http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=48174/

http://www.blagovest-info.ru/index.php?ss=2&s=3&id=21462

<sup>5</sup> http://www.ng.ru/regions/2008-06-04/7\_vandalism.html

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?SECTIONID=244662&IID=448412,

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?STID=245090&SECTIONID=340564&IID=448430

http://www.vz.ru/news/2008/5/12/167063.html

http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article\_id=51157&PHPSESSID=79sc3gh28uj76u6q513g33t804

http://www.grani.ru/Events/Crime/m.145110.html

http://www.apn.ru/publications/article19318.htm

taking place. And again only a call for additional militia support prevented an attack<sup>11</sup>.

On May 11 the skinheads attacked two employees of Tula charitable Jewish center "Hasdey Neshama" <sup>12</sup>.

On May 16 the skinheads tried to attack the members of the Jewish community of Salavat (Bashkortostan). Militia was called and detained four of attackers <sup>13</sup>.

On June 5 neo-Nazis cruelly beat the member of local Jewish community Oleg Polonsky in Volzhsky town (Volgograd region)<sup>14</sup>.

On November 22 the famous bard, leader and soloist of Jewish musical consort Mikhail Altshuller was beaten in Moscow<sup>15</sup>.

On November 24 the organization "Center of inter-ethnic cooperation" received a letter by mail in the name of a leader of St. Petersburg nationalist organization BTO D. Borovikov killed in 2006 stating the following: "There is no place in Orthodox Rus for Yids, Moslems and tolerant shit like you who lick their asses! We killed you, kill and will kill, you bitches! Glory to Russia!" <sup>16</sup>.

On December 25 the chairman of Moscow building society "Magnolia" Irina Ustinova stated in public that she "wouldn't put up with Jews" in the house she manages. Suspicion of Jewish origins of a family that rented one of the apartments was the reason for this statement. The building society chairman burst into the apartment shouting anti-Semitic slogans and demanding that the tenants "get away to Israel" where "everything will be repaired in time for them". She also stated that "during 16 years she manages this building society" she "became a dab hand" in "ousting Yids and other visitant scumbags" from her house <sup>17</sup>.

Nine cases of desecration of Jewish graves and monuments to the Holocaust victims were also recorded. Thus, Jewish graves were desecrated at the cemetery in Petrodvorets (May 14), Nizhni Novgorod (about May 10, May 29, June 8, August 14)<sup>18</sup>, Bogorodsk (Nizhni Novgorod region, July 21)<sup>19</sup>, Makhachkala (August 11-12)<sup>20</sup>, as well as the memorial plaque in memory of the Holocaust victims on the territory of old Jewish cemetery in Kaliningrad (October 10)<sup>21</sup>, and memorial plaque which marks the place where over 600 Jews were executed during the fascist occupation of Stalingrad (January 28)<sup>22</sup>.

```
http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?SECTIONID=244662&IID=466126
```

\_\_\_

http://www.vz.ru/news/2008/5/12/167063.html

http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=49259/

http://www.kavkaz-uzel.ru/newstext/news/id/1224070.html

http://www.newsru.com/cinema/27nov2008/skinhead.html

http://www.interethnic.org/News/241108\_5.html

http://www.jewish.ru/news/cis/2008/12/news994270158.php

http://nnovgorod.rfn.ru/rnews.html?id=18389&cid=7, http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=24432, www.regnum.ru/news/1046897.html,

 $http://www.aen.ru/?page=articleoftheday\&article\_id=1812\&PHPSESSID=fkta1ionq1aii6e5j0hlvah7c1aii6e5j0hlvahaii$ 

http://www.vremyan.ru/news/vandaly\_razgromili\_kladbische\_v\_bogorodske.html

http://www.sem40.ru/lenta/news-dir/174950.html

www.regnum.ru/news/1067744.html

http://www.kavkaz-uzel.ru/newstext/news/id/1206616.html

Breaches of websites of Jewish organizations practically stopped: a single case of this kind was recorded during the year – on April 20 the website of "Holocaust" fund was breached<sup>23</sup>. This is probably explained by the following fact: whereas website breaches served attracting the attention of mass media before, now such actions don't attract the attention of the press any more. Besides, principal nationalist organizations and their leaders themselves became newsmakers anyway (breach of pro-Nazi website ns-portal.com by anti-fascists became an original "response" to such a breach<sup>24</sup>). The users created two anti-Semitic groups in Russian social web-net "Vkontakte" and placed there a film "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism and genocide of Russian nation" included into federal list of extremist materials<sup>25</sup>.

Most of anti-Semitic actions consisted in putting anti-Semitic graffiti upon the monuments, walls of houses etc. 29 cases of this kind were totally recorded.

The following places were desecrated: monument to Lenin in settlement Sovetsky, Republic of Mariy El (January 5)<sup>26</sup>, several apartment blocks in Barnaul (February 2-3)<sup>27</sup>, several buildings in Volgograd (mid-February)<sup>28</sup>, the Victory memorial in Komsomolsk-on-Amur (first half of March))<sup>29</sup>, military vehicles near the diorama-museum in Voronezh (March 13)<sup>30</sup>, building in the center of Tambov (April 3)<sup>31</sup>, house in Tomsk (April 15)<sup>32</sup>, monument to the writer Maxim Gorky in Nizhni Novgorod (April 18)<sup>33</sup>, house in Moscow where the Jewish anti-fascist committee worked in 1942-1948 (April 20)<sup>34</sup>, specimens of military technique exhibited at the Victory square in Khimki (April 20)<sup>35</sup>, monument to the tank "T-34" in Nizhni Tagil (April 20)<sup>36</sup>, monument to those perished during bombing of Nizhni Novgorod in 1941 (May 5)<sup>37</sup>, playbills of a concert of M. Shufutinsky in Samara (May 9), college of culture in Blagoveshchensk (June 22)<sup>38</sup>, monument to 36<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Victory day in Chara village (Transbaikalian region, early July)<sup>39</sup>, several houses in Vladivostok (early July) <sup>40</sup>, building in Kineshma (Ivanovo region, July 2 and 18)<sup>41</sup>, several buildings in Ivanovo (July 14)<sup>42</sup>, door of

23

```
http://echo.msk.ru/news/509112-echo.html
24
         http://piter.indymedia.ru/ru/node/4718
25
         http://www.feor.ru/news/index.php?newsid=6180
26
         http://www.rosbalt.ru/2008/01/14/447064.html
27
         http://www.bankfax.ru/page.php?pg=50025
28
         http://v1.ru/newsline/1359.html
29
         http://www.komcity.ru/news/?id=6235
30
         http://www.kp.ru/daily/24067/307016/
31
         http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=48626/
32
         http://tv2.tomsk.ru/news/2008/04/15/1208409790.html
33
         http://nnovgorod.rfn.ru/rnews.html?id=17373&cid
34
         http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=48852/
35
         http://www.nr2.ru/moskow/174893.html
36
         http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=49096/
37
         http://www.rbc.ru/rbcfreenews.shtml?/20080506161821.shtml
38
         http://www.amurpravda.ru/news/2008/07/03/2/
39
         http://www.chita.ru/news.php?id=14894
40
         http://news.vl.ru/vlad/2008/07/08/zakon/
41
         http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article_id=49844,
```

http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article\_id=50056

the leader of Ivanovo Jewish community Ervin Kirshtein (July 15-16 night)<sup>43</sup>, door of apartment of rights defender S. Dmitriyevsky (Nizhni Novgorod, mid-August)<sup>44</sup>, several houses in Vorkuta (August 14-15)<sup>45</sup>, grave of I.N. Ulyanov (V.I. Lenin's father), chapel of saint patron of Simbirsk Andrey the Blessed and several builders' trailers (Ulyanovsk, October 20)<sup>46</sup>, apartment house in the center of Volgograd (October 28)<sup>47</sup>, vocational school in Polyarniye Zori town (Murmansk region, early November)<sup>48</sup>, house in Kirovsk (Leningrad region, early November), garage in the center of Stavropol (November)<sup>49</sup>, garage in Saratov (December 15)<sup>50</sup>, walls of Moscow underground station "Mendeleyevskaya" (December 26)<sup>51</sup>.

On February 2008, on the eve of trial over founder and editor of newspaper "Orthodox Rus" Konstantin Dushenov, the leaflets were disseminated in St. Petersburg supporting him titled "Appeal of Orthodox Christians of St. Petersburg to arch-pastors, pastors and all the progenies of Russian Orthodox church" <sup>52</sup>.

On the night of November 16 the vandals exploded Lenin's monument in the outskirts of Ryazan. The shot-firers drew a swastika and crossed-out Star of David at the scene<sup>53</sup>.

On December 30 the coaches of 1<sup>st</sup> line of St. Petersburg underground were postered with fascist leaflets. One of them depicted a skinhead with a rifle, and the picture was accompanied by an inscription: "One should not just love his Motherland now. One must fight for it". Another leaflet included Ostankino TV tower depicted as the Star of David with inscription "All the mass media lie"<sup>54</sup>.

According to the results of MBHR monitoring, one can state that a number of attacks on the Jews is as quite small as before. In our opinion, this is explained not by decrease of anti-Semitism level but by the fact that the Jews (unlike natives of Central Asia or Caucasian region) are identified with much more difficulty in a crowd. This is the very reason for the fact that practically all the injured and objects of attacks are either religious Jews being recognizable in a crowd or inhabitants of small towns (or members of one small team) who are inevitably seen as "aliens". As for maintenance of similar number of attacks on synagogues and community centers as well as decrease of number of desecrations of Jewish graves and monuments to the Holocaust victims (14 cases of this kind were recorded in 2007), one can suppose that the trials over the persons guilty of such crimes played their role. This version is indirectly confirmed also by abrupt increase of number of

```
http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article_id=49994
```

www.regnum.ru/news/1028628.html

http://www.apn-spb.ru/opinions/article4025.htm

http://kp.ru/online/news/128772/

http://www.sm-k.narod.ru/archives/2008/oct/118/1.html

http://v102.ru/accidents/7073.html

<sup>48</sup> http://www.rosbalt.ru/2008/11/13/541306.html

http://www.stapravda.ru/20081129/Nacistskaya\_svastika\_na\_stene\_v\_centre\_Stavropolya\_34448.html

http://www.vzsar.ru/news/2008/12/30/v\_saratove\_arestovan\_nacist.html

www.regnum.ru/news/1105415.html

http://www.portal-credo.ru/site/?act=news&id=61438&cf=

http://kp.ru/online/news/165981/

<sup>54</sup> http://www.rosbalt.ru/2008/12/30/607575.html

anti-Semitic graffiti – their making is probably considered to be a safer occupation by the criminals. A splash of such actions on the eve of April 20 – Hitler's birthday marked by Nazis - can be also noted.

# Use of anti-Semitic rhetoric in election campaigns

Anti-Semitic rhetoric was actively used during election campaigns conducted in 2008. First of all this relates to the election of the President of RF. The version of alleged Jewish origins of principal candidate to this position D. Medvedev was actively disseminated on the Internet. This information was disseminated in particular by "Union of Russian people", St. Petersburg nationalist N. Bondarik, movement "Lukashenko-2008", and newspaper "Duel" 55.

The Communist party of Russian Federation (KPRF) used anti-Semitic rhetoric in its election campaign most often. Article by V. Akbulatov "And again "the eternal Jew"!" was published in the campaign newspaper "Pskov iskra" ("Pskov spark") printed in 50 thousand copies. The article accused the Jews of all the misfortunes of Russia since 1917<sup>56</sup>. At the same time the head of G. Zyuganov's election headquarters in Pskov region, Sergey Gogolev, stated on February 10 that he sees nothing abusive in the article "And again the "eternal Jew"!", that "the presence of Russians and Jews in the Government is disproportionate" and that a similar distortion was observed during for 1920s. Reproducing this whole set of antiquated anti-Semitic stereotypes, the leader of the Pskov Communists couldn't refrain from expressing his emotions concerning the opening of no-visa regime between Russia and Israel: "Do we already have a common state and the capital is not in Moscow!"57. Permanent stressing of "Russian origins" of Zyuganov and allegedly "non-Russian origins" of other candidates to the position of the President became one of the directions of KPRF activity. Speech of deputy of the State Duma, chairman of Central check-out-inspection commission of KPRF V. Nikitin on February 11 (reprinted later by G. Zyuganov's website) can be also noted. He stated there that Zyuganov is the only Russian candidate in spirit as A. Bogdanov, V. Zhirinovsky and D. Medvedev "have no strong roots connecting them with the state-forming Russian nation. So the Russian world outlook is genetically unavailable to them". Considering the facts that A. Bogdanov and V. Zhirinovsky have Jewish origins and that D. Medvedev is declared to be a Jew by nationalists. this thesis can be actually treated as anti-Semitic. The same speech also states that "genocide of Russian people" is allegedly conducted and also that "those who number less than 1% in Russia control the country, finance and mass media" (it's easy to understand that this means Jews)<sup>58</sup>. KPRF included dozens of candidates-

http://srn.rusidea.org/?a=50022,

 $http://www.rusnar.ru/index.php?categoryid=1\&p2\_articleid=264, http://www.duel.ru/200809/?09\_1\_1, http://www.lenta.ru/news/2008/02/23/march, http://rusmarsh.biz/nrsd.htm,\\$ 

http://www.inopressa.ru/haaretz/2008/02/22/12:08:13/medvedev, http://ndpr.ru/content/view/1266/

http://pln-pskov.ru/politics/50028.html

http://www.pln-pskov.ru/politics/50067.html

http://kprf.ru/rus\_soc/54855.html

nationalists (for example, from Moscow, Nerekhta) using anti-Semitic rhetoric into its lists quite willingly. As a result some nationalist organizations recommended their followers vote for Zyuganov or not at all<sup>59</sup>.

Nationalistic and anti-Semitic tendency was further developed in KPRF. G. Zyuganov stated at the 13<sup>th</sup> congress of KPRF that took place on November 29-30: Russians "are debarred from decisive influence in political, economic, informational and cultural life of the country. Look at the oligarchs actually governing the country, look at the list of those dominating in mass media, and there would be hardly necessary to prove anything". Thus G. Zyuganov actually reproduced an anti-Semitic stamp about "Jewish domination" among leading industrialists and journalists without mentioning the word "Jews" 60. The congress itself was interpreted by the nationalist wing of KPRF as a "dispersal of Yid-loving Leningrad city committee", defeat of the group "paid by the Jews" and turning of KPRF into "true Russian party" 61. It was found out in mid-December that St. Petersburg Central district committee of KRPF admitted journalist-nationalist D. Usov known for his anti-Semitic statements, including pro-Hitler ones, into the party. KPRF intended to nominate him for election to the deputies of municipal unit "Liteyny district" (the nomination took place but Usov received rejection of registration). There were some rumors later that radical nationalist N. Bondarik who spend already some time in prison for several murders also wrote an application for enlisting KPRF, as well as the editor of newspaper "Orthodox Rus" K. Dushenov being on trial<sup>62</sup>.

Anti-Semitic rhetoric was actively used during election to Ivanovo regional duma by one of candidates – the deputy chairman of the "Union of Russian people" and leader of the organization "Russian land" I. Pimenov. It was asserted in the leaflets disseminated by the candidate that representatives of an ethnic minority "grow rich at the expense of Russians" and rule Ivanovo region. They were also held responsible for all the difficulties people faced in the region. The leaflets also contained a promise "to make the traitors to the Russian people, and those who control them, account for all misdeeds". In response to a petition from the Ivanovo Jewish community calling for the expulsion of Pimenov from the list of candidates, the territorial election committee stated that the application had been sent too late. The regional office of public prosecutor promised to organize an investigation concerning availability of signs of inciting inter-ethnic dissension in I. Pimenov's leaflets <sup>63</sup>.

http://ndpr.ru/content/view/1308

<sup>60</sup> http://www.magkprf.mgn.ru/15.htm

http://www.com-piter.ru/1981.htm

http://skandalspb.ru/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=660&Itemid=1, http://www.zaks.ru/new/archive/view/53040, http://forum.msk.ru/material/news/693112.html, http://www.st-petersburg.vybory.izbirkom.ru/region/region/st-petersburg?action=show&root=1&tvd=478401787292&vrn=478401787292&region=78&global=&sub\_region=0&prver=0&pronetvd=null&type=220&number=3

http://www.chastnik.ru/info.html?section=1&id=25696&module=6, www.regnum.ru/news/964186.html

The election committee of Jewish autonomous region dismissed the activist of "Union of Russian people" and deputy of Khabarovsk city duma Dmitry Kovalchuk from participation in election of the head of administration of Priamurskoye settlement for incitement of inter-ethnic hatred and bribery of voters <sup>64</sup>. On October 20 representatives of "Union of Russian people" tried to arrange a picketing of building of the government of Jewish autonomous region in Birobidjan as a sign of protest against dismissal of D. Kovalchuk from election. The picketing failed due to non-attendance of picketers <sup>65</sup>.

# Dissemination of anti-Semitic produce

Anti-Semitic literature is still freely published (and sold in bookstores including the respectable ones) in Russia as well as other goods inciting hatred towards the Jews and advertising Nazism.

The forth edition of a book by infamous nationalist and racist A. Sevastyanov "What the Jews want of us" was published in February 66.

Also the participants of the workshop on legal education and justice improvement that was conducted by Moscow bureau for human rights in the building of Stavropol regional duma found that the books by ardent anti-Semites G. Klimov, O. Platonov, and V. Istarkhov are sold in the book kiosk located in the building. At the same time there was no response from the authority representatives to the requests of the workshop participants to look into the sale of literature propagating xenophobia and anti-Semitism, in the building of regional legislative body<sup>67</sup>.

On March 18 an article was published in "Moskovsky komsomolets" telling about free sale of frankly fascist literature (including "Mein kampf" by Hitler) near the walls of former Museum of V.I. Lenin<sup>68</sup>.

#### **Anti-Semitism in mass media**

On January 9 an article was published in "Argumenty nedeli" stating that rabbis should be admitted to the Russian army only under condition of "mirror-like effect" – i.e. in case of admittance of the Orthodox priests to the Tzahal (Army of defense of Israel) units. The article also included an accusation towards the head of FEOR military department A. Gurevich who was called exclusively "Israeli citizen", of deliberate overstating of number of Hebrews serving in the army (with frank insinuation of the fact that very few Jews serve in the army at all)<sup>69</sup>.

http://www.jewish\_aut.izbirkom.ru/WAY/E7891CF9-1278-4E99-ACE8-CE34B99CEFCF.html, http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article\_id=51070&PHPSESSID=79sc3gh28uj76u6q513g33t804

http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article\_id=51070&PHPSESSID=79sc3gh28uj76u6q513g33t804

http://ndpr.ru/content/view/1267/

http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=47996/

<sup>68</sup> http://www.mk.ru/blogs/MK/2008/03/18/society/344019/

<sup>69</sup> http://www.argumenti.ru/publications/5689

On January 24 a test entitled "Are you a cultural person?" was published in the Murmansk newspaper "Polyarnaya pravda" on the page "An hour of leisure". One of the test questions was the following: "Do you have Jews in your family line or not?". In the case of a positive response, the author "reassured" the tested: "Don't be upset. You are a complete nonentity. But you are adored". However, after an indignant letter from the Jewish community, representatives of editorial board promised to present their apologies to the community saying that the anti-Semitic passage got into the newspaper "inadvertently".

On February 22 an article by a Jewish anti-Semite I. Shamir and a Polish author M. Glogochovsky "Salt upon the wounds: Katyn" was published on the website "InoSMI.ru" (where translated articles from the foreign mass media are usually published). This article asserted that the executions in Katyn were allegedly committed by Jews who served in the NKVD and were "full of vengeful feeling" for massacres during the Civil war<sup>71</sup>.

On June 20 colonel V. Kvachkov who attempted the life of A. Chubais and was found not guilty by the jury stated speaking on the radio "Echo of Moscow" that Russia is allegedly "occupied by Jewish mafia being the matrix for other criminal groups in Russia" and reproduced an anti-Semitic myth that Jews caught power in Russia<sup>72</sup>.

In October an article "Fico of jurist's son" was published in the newspaper "Trudovaya Tyumen" including some humiliating appraisals addressed to Jews as well as appeals to restrain their rights<sup>73</sup>.

In October an article titled "Yid-loving heresies" proved to be the front page material in one of the issues of newspaper "Eparchial bulletin" published in Syktyvkar<sup>74</sup>.

# Anti-Semitic statements and actions of the authority representatives

Late in March a group of Rostov-on-Don militia employees raised a flag with swastika during one of their informal visits to the countryside <sup>75</sup>.

#### **Public anti-Semitic character actions**

On January 27 not numerous meeting "in defense of Russian political prisoners" took place in Moscow. 70 persons at the most assembled to the meeting – mostly brothers-in-arms of B. Mironov and V. Kvachkov being on trial. B. Mironov himself delivered a speech at the meeting stating that "Jewish mafia" allegedly existed in Russia persecuting everybody trying to speak about it<sup>76</sup>.

http://in-brief.aen.ru/story-id=47646

http://www.inosmi.ru/translation/239802.html

http://www.inosmi.ru/translation/241853.html

http://72.rsoc.ru/news/index vprint.shtml?id news=40

http://www.komionline.ru/news/13118

http://sasha-ivanov.livejournal.com/9456.html

http://www.rusidea.org/forum/viewtopic.php?p=12889#12889

On March 26 members of local branch of "Union of Russian people" conducted a meeting in Samara defined as a "prayerful standing" with prayers about aid towards K. Dushenov and about "deliverance of Russia from aliens and alien believers and restoration of autocratic Russian Kingdom"<sup>77</sup>.

On April 18 meeting of local followers of "Union of Russian people" took place in Buzuluk - they stood up for the editor of a newspaper "For Belief, Tsar and Motherland"; proceedings were instituted against him for anti-Semitic statements under clause 282 of the Criminal Code (CC) of RF<sup>78</sup>.

On April 19 a meeting of nationalists took place in Moscow formally defined as a meeting against political repressions (radical nationalists treat the criminal persecution of persons who committed xenophobia-motivated crimes as political repressions). Slavic union (SS), DPNI and NDPR, Union of Orthodox Bannerbearers, Russian National-Bolshevik front and followers of the nationalist B. Mironov were organizers of the meeting<sup>79</sup>. B. Mironov, A. Sevastyanov, editor of "Duel" Yu. Mukhin, member of RNBF I. Strukov spoke at the meeting 80. The meeting slogans were mostly of pseudo-rights defending character: stop the political repressions; release all the political prisoners; abolish clauses 280 and 282 of the CC of RF allegedly breaking the Constitution of Russia and provisions of international law<sup>81</sup>. Some slogans were of frankly xenophobic and anti-Semitic character: "Tomorrow of Russia: Kvachkov in Kremlin, Chubais in the loop", "Jewish mafia in Russian Kremlin commits misdeeds on our land", "Jewish fascism! There is nothing more terrific today", "Russians! Let's protect Russian heroes", "Away with RUSSIAN clause 282 of the CC!". Classical nationalistic slogan – "Russia for the Russians!" was one of the slogans at the meeting, and swastika was depicted on some posters. One of the speakers stated that "Zionist fascism is worse than the German one". B. Mironov stated demagogically speaking at the meeting that fulfillment of the Constitution "comes under a section, section 10 of the Criminal Code: crimes against the government" and today's authorities are "more terrible than Hitler's fascism". He finished his speech with an appeal "Russian authority to Russia" 82. Several hundreds of people participated in the meeting.

On July 29 hundreds of radical nationalists arranged a march of protest in Moscow dated to 90<sup>th</sup> anniversary of death of the Tsar's family. During the procession they sold books and brochures including the book "Why do we hate the Jewish mafia" and "Protocols of the Elders of Zion" 83.

http://srn.rusidea.org/?a=400500014

<sup>78</sup> http://srn.rusidea.org/?a=403000002

http://news.nswap.info/?p=8481#comment-17177

http://nor-man-volk.livejournal.com/19580.html#cutid1

http://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/257004.html

http://www.rossija.info/view/41018/

http://www.aen.ru/?page=brief&article\_id=50171

On August 5 representatives of the movement "Black hundred" handed round xenophobic and anti-Semitic literature at the authorized meeting in St. Petersburg in support of Radovan Karadzic<sup>84</sup>.

On November 4 colonel V. Kvachkov, speaking during the authorized "Russian march", stated that "release from Judaic yoke is approaching", and that this yoke is "worse than SS"<sup>85</sup>.

Also on November 4 in Syktyvkar the member of local NDPR branch Ye. Cheglakov told the meeting participants about the plans of USA leaders concerning the collapse of Russia and concentration of the riches of the world in hands of so-called "Golden billion". As the speaker assured, exclusively Jews will be among the "billionaires" <sup>86</sup>.

On November 9 at "Russian march" in Tula the action participants shouted the slogans: "Suitcase! Railway station! Israel!", "Away with the Yids' power".

On November 30 similar slogans were heard at the "march" conducted in Perm: "Let's destroy the NATO countries, let's destroy the NATO countries. Don't hesitate, brother, don't hesitate, brother – beat the Yids and democrats, beat the Yids and democrats!", "Beat the Yids – save Russia, beat the Yids – save Russia", "Glory to Holocaust!"<sup>87</sup>

At the same time, some decline of public activity of anti-Semites can be stated. In many respects its reasons lay in strict response of the authorities to frankly anti-Semitic slogans. And as a result, anti-Semitic slogans proved to be removed from posters and were not available in speeches at the meetings and demonstrations of even such organizations as "Union of Russian people" having anti-Semitism as the component of its ideology.

#### Rehabilitation of Nazism and denial of the Holocaust

In January an attempt of rehabilitation of one of the Don Cossack leaders P. Krasnov who cooperated with Nazis, was made. On January 17 ataman of Allmighty host of Don and deputy of the State Duma V. Vodolatsky announced the creation of a working group for his rehabilitation. On January 30, after the statement of Jewish organizations against the attempt of rehabilitation, the deputy from KPRF N. Kolomeytsev and then the leaders of "United Russia" and representatives of Cossacks announced their refusal of inclination to rehabilitate Krasnov due to his collaborationism <sup>88</sup>.

On January 31 the chairman of Orthodox congregation «Radonezh» Yevgeny Nikiforov, in his interview to nationalist Internet-agency "Russian line", declared his "surprise" at the introduction of lessons on the Holocaust in Russian schools.

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?STID=245090&SECTIONID=337811&IID=536808

http://www.fontanka.ru/2008/08/06/082/

http://www.sobkorr.ru/news/491039965BABE.html

http://komionline.ru/news/12197

http://evgen-v.livejournal.com/213628.html, http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=22456, www.regnum.ru/news/946724.html, www.regnum.ru/news/946468.html, http://www.rusk.ru/newsdata.php?idar=175413

He insisted that the "Russian Holocaust" should be studied in Russia (this is the name radical nationalists give to the terror of 1917-1953; they think it was directed by Jews exclusively against Russians)<sup>89</sup>.

The statements appeared later on website of Orthodox fundamentalist M. Nazarov that repressions of 1920-1930s were also an analogue of the Holocaust as the persecution of the Russians was allegedly conducted by the Jews basing upon nationality or religion <sup>90</sup>.

M. Nazarov published a special statement later writing that the Day of commemoration in memory of the Holocaust victims is a "holiday of the triumph of world Jewry" that allegedly levies financial, political and spiritual reparations from the whole world (M. Nazarov understands these "reparations" as "tolerance towards Satanic Talmudism") and called for marking the Holiday of new Russian martyrs and confessors, allegedly "killed in aggressive and occupational war of the Yids' Bolshevism against Russia and in the victorious Holocaust of the Russian Orthodox Christian people that followed it". Nazarov accused the Jews of creating a kind of "religion of the Holocaust" being a "cunning parasitism on the human kindness of non-Jewish people for their exploitation". Calumnious statements that the Jews unleashed the war themselves and that the number of victims was exaggerated "so that they could speculate with these victims after that for their own political purposes" were also presented here<sup>91</sup>.

On May 9, on the anniversary of the Victory over fascism, a public prayer took place in Moscow near a memorial "Reconciliation of nations" on the territory of the temple of All the Saints in Vsekhsvyatskoye at Sokol in memory of generals-collaborationists arranged by "Memory" society<sup>92</sup>.

It was stated in an article by nationalist A. Savelyev published on the same day and devoted to the holiday that the Holocaust was "turned into a permanent tool of history falsification and private geschaeft by a narrow stratum of Jewish public". At the same time the fascist ideology was praised there. It was told there that "Communist and liberal doctrines are unable to withstand fascism", and that doctrine of fascism was far from real practice of Nazi Germany<sup>93</sup>.

On November 18 nationalist K. Krylov published his reasoning concerning Ukrainian concept of Golodomor on his blog where he accused the Jews of creating a special technology that was allegedly "adopted" from them by Albanians in Kosovo and by Ukrainians: "to announce beloved themselves the victims" and "deny themselves nothing", and then calumniate their victims and call them "butchers" <sup>94</sup>. K. Krylov wrote on another post dated November 30 that "all the

http://www.rusk.ru/newsdata.php?idar=175388

http://www.rusidea.org/index.php?a=2128

http://www.rusidea.org/index.php?a=2128

http://evgen-v.livejournal.com/238345.html, http://borovikov1.livejournal.com/2700.html

http://www.velikoross.ru/article/show/?id=28

http://krylov.livejournal.com/1738870.html

books "about Holocaust" are "artistic" hinting at inauthenticity during presenting of facts being allegedly peculiar to them" <sup>95</sup>.

In the article published on website APN.ru where K. Krylov is the editor-inchief he repeated another anti-Semitic myth that the Holocaust is used for selfish ends to "levy" more from other nations <sup>96</sup>.

#### «Blood Libel»

Accusation of Jews of committing so-called "ritual murders" became one of principal ideas disseminated by radical nationalists concerning the Jews.

On March 19 the leaflets were posted in Novosibirsk calling upon Russian parents to protect their children with special care on the eve of Jewish Passover as "the Jews need children's blood for the baking of matzo". "These monsters still commit bloody sacrifices to their gods", the lampoon asserts. "They steal little children, pump out their blood and mix their "sacred food" – matzo – on their blood, and eat it on their Passover, and throw the corpses to dump".

The leaflet asserts later that extensive "disappearance of little children around the cities of Russia is shifted onto Russian maniacs" while "simultaneous disappearance of little Russian children around the cities of Russia is the evidence that it's the organization that is acting but not a maniac". "Jews are masons, we know everything about you!", the leaflet tells in conclusion <sup>97</sup>.

In April 2008 associate professor of chair of social work in the Institute of humanities of Tyumen state oil and gas university (TSOGU) and member of Missionary department of Tobolsk-Tyumen eparchy of Russian Orthodox church Svetlana Shestakova delivered a lecture in TSOGU within the course "Fundamentals of religious culture" at the chair of religious studies of Institute of humanities in TSOGU for those willing to teach "Fundamentals of Orthodox culture" at schools. The lecture included offensive and xenophobic stuff concerning considerable number of religions and denominations. Concerning Judaism, S. Shestakova reproduced the notorious myth about "blood libel" stating that "the blood of Orthodox people is available in small amount in matzo". It was stated that Jews steal children, pump out there blood and "then collect the blood with rags, these rags are burned, and this ash is strewed upon the dead man or added into matzo". This was followed by accusation of ritual murder of the family of Nicolas II by the Jews: "they were stabbed through and through, it's necessary to stab the alive man through and through there until he dies, and while he is suffering all the blood would pour out. This was the way they tormented prince Alexey, in front of his parents, and then they killed the tsar and the tsarina". Husband of S. Shestakova, K. Shestakov, stated that "infants are regularly disappearing here, and there was a similar case in Krasnoyarsk not long ago". He also stated that Beilis was acquitted in the "Beilis case" because the jury was

http://krylov.livejournal.com/1746376.html

http://www.apn.ru/column/article21050.htm

http://www.newsru.co.il/world/19mar2008/novosib501.html

frightened [by Jews], and after overthrow of monarchy all the jurors who voted for conviction of Beilis were allegedly killed<sup>98</sup>.

In June, when the text of S. Shestakova's lecture was placed on the Internet and became broadly accessible, her husband stood for his wife. He published a statement on one of near-Orthodox websites that everything told by his wife "is a part of Doctrine and Holy Tradition of Orthodox church, a part of Orthodox tradition". He also stood in defense of idea that ritual murders are committed by Jews stressing that "to deny existence of the ritual practice of using Christian blood in Judaism – this means renouncing the Orthodox Tradition and discrediting the memory of the saints" <sup>99</sup>.

On June 25 the newspaper "New St. Petersburg" published an article "General Rodionov – here is the real candidate!". The article told about ritual murders allegedly committed in Krasnoyarsk in 2005-2007 and reproduced the speech of one of nationalist leaders, ex-minister of defense I. Rodionov full of anti-Semitic stuff<sup>100</sup>. In June 2008 information about the murder of two seven-former girls in April 2008 in Zlatoust (Chelyabinsk region) was published on website of Orthodox fundamentalist M. Nazarov with clear hint that this was the next ritual murder. To prove this, it was enough for M. Nazarov to state the availability of stab-cut wounds upon the corpses and availability of Jewish community in Chelyabinsk<sup>101</sup>.

Due to the fact that it was 90 years in 2008 since execution of Nicolas II and his family considered by anti-Semites to be the ritual, much attention was paid to this anniversary too. On May 27 the website of Agency of political news published an article by Orthodox fundamentalist Ye. Kholmogorov "Tsar of the past and of the future. Nicolas II and Russian hagio-politics" including the statement that "killing of the tsar on July 17, 1918 was a cabbalist ritual" 102. In his another article, "Tsarvictor", published on May 20 on web-sire "New chronicles" Ye. Kholmogorov asserted that "just a fool or scoundrel may doubt about the ritual character of Yekaterinburg murder", <sup>103</sup>. In December 2008 M. Nazarov published two articles on the same subject. One of them, "Mystery of tsar's relics in Russian emigration" devoted to the fate of relics of the family of Nicolas II, repeated a statement persistently about "ritual murder" of tsar's family and also about "useful idiot" Hitler who was trained by "Jewish banks of Wall Street" for "unleashing the war and removing all the European fascism using Slavic blood" <sup>104</sup>. In his second article M. Nazarov tried "to prove" that investigator N. Sokolov who conducted the investigation of tsar's family murder allegedly acknowledged the ritual character

100

http://www.sclj.ru/news/detail.php?ID=1902

http://www.rusidea.org/?a=2130

http://www.rusidea.org/?a=2130

http://www.apn.ru/publications/article19967.htm

http://novchronic.ru/1346.htm

http://www.rusidea.org/?a=6016

of the murder. At the same time unavailability of any mentioning of "ritual" in Sokolov's book was explained by dishonesty of its publishers <sup>105</sup>.

### **Religious anti-Semitism manifestations**

On June 29 an article was published on website of Orthodox fundamentalist M. Nazarov stating that "ideal of Talmudic Judaism" is the serving to intention of Satan aspiring to gain the world domination. The same Nazarov, commenting the protest of Federation of Jewish organizations of Russia (FEOR) against mandatory teaching of "Fundamentals of Orthodox culture" at schools, stated that this protest was caused by desire that the schoolchildren would not know "what "god" is worshipped by Talmudists-god-killers and the fact that their new "father" tempted them with Nazi arrogance to consider just them to be the people and all the goys – to be the beasts". In the interview published on M. Nazarov's website he announced that "Jewish nation has the signs of zombie as it was zombied by Satan himself as long ago as during the ancient period of their history when Satan managed to persuade the Jewry that it was chosen for ruling the world. And all the later history of Jewish nation is the belief in such a chosen status and actions according to this belief" 106.

On June 25, 2008, on the occasion of opening of Hierarchs' Council in Moscow, an open letter by bishop Diomid was sent to the Patriarch and participants of Hierarchs' Council repeating the arguments that "father of Jews is Devil" quoting "the Church Fathers" 107.

On October 27 an article was published on website of nationalist news agency "Russian line" with rude rebuff to the chief rabbi of Russia Berl Lazar who stood against teaching of "Fundamentals of Orthodox culture" at schools. It was proposed to the Jews, like to other non-Orthodox, "to watch with humbleness how Russia is returning to its spiritual sources" and "stagnate in their delusions until they are illuminated by the light of the Divine grace" <sup>108</sup>.

#### **Anti-Israeli statements**

According to interrogation conducted by Levada-center on May 16-19, 2008, 51% of population treat Israel good (such people amounted 46% in 2006) and 37% - bad (in 2006 – 31%). Thus it's possible to speak about growing polarization of opinions but not in favor of Palestinians as 61% of the interrogated stated they didn't support any side in Palestinian-Israel conflict <sup>109</sup>. At the same time 67% estimated Russian-Israeli relations within the range from normal to excellent.

http://www.rusidea.org/?a=25112307

http://www.rusidea.org/?a=2130

http://www.rusidea.org/?a=130086

http://www.rusk.ru/newsdata.php?idar=105501

http://www.polit.ru/research/2008/05/27/izrael.html

Anti-Israel publications were still the main direction of anti-Semitic political journalism. On February 26 an article by Jewish anti-Semite I. Shamir was placed on website of nationalist news agency "Russian line" where he asserted that discrimination based upon nationality and race is the basis of the Jewish state, and that racism penetrated literally into the whole Israeli society since the moment of appearing of the state Israel on the map<sup>110</sup>.

In the issue of newspaper "Duel" published on the same day, an article "Brutalities of the "chosen" was published where Israelis were accused of committing "an act of most cynical and undisguised fascism", of arranging the humanitarian catastrophe and "collective punishment" of Palestinians. At the same time the actions of terrorists from Islamist organization HAMAS were announced to be "the struggle against Israel for freedom of their land and just for human conditions of existence", and a direct analogy was drawn concerning the actions of Israelis with anti-partisan actions of Nazis in 1940s<sup>111</sup>.

Early in March deputy of the State Duma V. Ilyukhin said in his interview to "Noviye Izvestia" that the Communists support Lebanon and Palestine because the "policy of Israel is of a predatory character" and demagogically stated that in Russia "any criticism towards the persons of Jewish nationality is declared to be anti-Semitism"<sup>112</sup>.

Besides, some anti-Israeli statements of Moslem leaders and activists can be mentioned.

On March 4 the member of Council of muftis of Russia Nafigulla Ashirov stated at the presentation of book by Sergey Komkov "Wahabit" that "Zionism is a cancerous growth, in so far as Zionism is fascism" Ashirov's statement resulted in a great scandal – Jewish organizations, Ambassador of Israel in RF Anna Azari and commission of the Public chamber on inter-ethnic relations and freedom of conscience protested against his statements 114. Unfortunately the Council of muftis of Russia preferred giving no response to the statements of its co-chairman. Later, when FEOR announced breaking of its relations with CMR until the Council would determine its position concerning N. Ashirov's statement, the statement of the CMR head R. Gainutdin followed – he preferred citing "irresponsible assertions able to destroy inter-religious peace that appeared recently in some mass media" But N. Ashirov himself announced that decision of FEOR to suspend contacts with the Council of muftis shows that FEOR identifies itself with "Zionist regime" 116.

http://www.rusk.ru/newsdata.php?idar=175773

http://www.duel.ru/200809/?09\_4\_1

http://www.newizv.ru/news/2008-03-17/86543

http://www.annews.ru/news/detail.php?ID=158612

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=23223, http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=23231, http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=23230, http://www.islam.ru/rus/2008-03-26/#20367

http://www.muslim.ru/1/cont/18/1423.htm

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=23457

On March 27 Ashirov was supported by mufti of Moscow and Moscow region supported by Central spiritual directorate of Moslems of Russia competing with the Council of muftis of Russia, imam-hatib of the mosque "Yardam" in Otradnoye Mahmud Velitov who stated that the words of Nafigulla Ashirov about Zionism "are close to truth" and characterized his scandalous statements as a courageous act. Substantiating his words, Velitov stated, according to traditions of Soviet "anti-Zionist" propaganda, that it's impossible to identify Zionism as a political doctrine with Hebrews and Jews in general<sup>117</sup>.

On March 31 the mufti of Karelia Visam Ali Bardvil stated that "calling Zionism one of the forms of fascism, Ashirov said the pure truth". He also demanded that FEOR (he characterized its actions as those "conducted in the interests of an alien state") "stop its attacks on the mufti and come back to a dialogue, show respect towards the freedom of speech and statements, and reject the policy of "closed mouths" 118.

Only representatives of the competing structures stood against Ashirov's statements - those of Central spiritual directorate of Moslems and also mufti of Perm M. Khuzin and mufti of Yamal F. Salman. At the same time F. Salman just dared to note that reciprocal response of FEOR was quite a predictable measure but he also preferred not speaking about the essence of offensive and calumnious words of Ashirov about Israel<sup>119</sup>. On April 3 the chairman of St. Petersburg Islamic cultural center Mohammed Khenni stated in his interview to Internet-portal "Russian line" that he shared Ashirov's statements completely and also considered Zionism to be fascism and racism<sup>120</sup>. On April 16 the head of staff of Spiritual directorate of Moslems of Nizhni Novgorod, editor-in-chief of publishing house "Medina", doctor of political science Damir Mukhitdinov spoke in support of anti-Israeli statements of CMR co-chairman using the stamps about "murders of Moslems" allegedly committed by Israelis as his arguments 121. Some right-wing radicals also expressed their support of N. Ashirov: editor-in-chief of newspaper "Tomorrow" A. Prokhanov, leader of one of "Unions of Russian people" L. Ivashov<sup>122</sup>. Accusations of the leaders of Jewish organizations who tried to call Ashirov to order, of double loyalty, were repeated on nationalist Internet - mass media "Segodnya.ru" 123.

On April 3 a statement in support of N. Ashirov was published in newspaper "Tomorrow" signed by Islamic committee of Russia (led by G. Diemal) and Union of Moslems of Russia. The statement asserted that "any dog in the world knows anyway that Zionism is a form of racism (and one can say "fascism" for

<sup>117</sup> http://www.islam.ru/rus/2008-03-27/?single=20388 118

http://www.islamonline.ru/m/nov/?i=3131&j=552365DDDDFIOPNMQWE<MIOURJNKFFKJKFJFGJN%20KFJG KF 119

http://www.moslem.ru/doc\_salm\_001.htm

<sup>120</sup> http://www.rusk.ru/newsdata.php?idar=176283

<sup>121</sup> http://www.islam.ru/rus/2008-04-16/?single=20735

<sup>122</sup> http://www.islam.ru/rus/2008-04-3/?single=20502

<sup>123</sup> http://www.segodnia.ru/index.php?pgid=2&partid=41&newsid=5666

briefness)"; it also included classical anti-Semitic stamps about "murders of Palestinian children by Zionists", and about links of Zionists with neo-Nazis. It also included the accusation that these were the Jews who supported the skinhead activity. Ashirov is presented as a benefactor of Russian Jews in the statement as "he makes a gesture of good will and marks the Jewish nation off the Zionist crimes" 124.

On April 3 one of infamous Moslem activists D. Khalidov also published an article of the same sort. It dealt with opposition of Judaism to Zionism here <sup>125</sup>.

On May 29 G. Djemal stated that A. Koptsev who arranged a slaughter in synagogue at Bolshaya Bronnaya in January 2006, very much like anti-Semite K. Smirnov-Ostashvili known in late 1980s, was allegedly "trained by instigators from the circles willing to activate alia inflow to Israel and insisting upon the specific position of Jews in Russia". G. Djemal also imputed the training of skinheads to these "circles" (the Jewish community of Russia and the state Israel are probably meant here)<sup>126</sup>.

On December 31, in connection with the start of operation of Israeli army "Melted lead" in Gazah, Nafigulla Ashirov compared events in Gazah with "genocide executed by fascist Germany on the occupied territories of the Soviet Union during the Great Patriotic war", and he also compared blockade of Gazah with blockade of Leningrad <sup>127</sup>.

### Response of authorities to anti-Semitism manifestations

Councilor of the governor of Ulyanovsk region A. Pavlov, speaking early in February at the press conference in connection with attack of skinheads on the Jewish community center in Ulyanovsk, stated the necessity to go along the way of preventing inter-ethnic dissension "methodically and consistently" calling the attack a "scandalous event" and promised that "the administration would do everything necessary for punishing the guilty basing upon severity of the law" this statement, together with information about instituting criminal proceedings concerning the attack on the Jewish community center in Ulyanovsk, obviously threatened the nationalists. While at the beginning RONS representatives "recommended" the Jewish organizations "to think more over the fact that lots of evil were brought to Russia and Russian people by their congeners during recent 200 years" for "understanding the position of Russian youth" later, when it became clear that it would deal with quite real criminal case and possible withdrawal from election, the leader of local RONS branch hurried to announce the pogrom to be a "provocation" intended to "discredit RONS" and stated that

http://www.islamnews.ru/news-10813.html

http://www.islamnews.ru/news-10796.html

http://www.islam.ru/rus/2008-05-29/21472

http://www.islam.ru/rus/2008-12-31/#24550

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?SECTIONID=244662&IID=448430

http://www.rons-inform.org/more.html?id=596\_0\_17\_0\_C

members of his organization "didn't participate in events near the Jewish community" and that "management of regional branch didn't authorize anybody for such actions" <sup>130</sup>.

On February 27 chairman of Central election committee V. Churov stated at the meeting in Moscow Jewish community center that he knew about the situation in Pskov where anti-Semitic article was published in newspaper "Pskov iskra" and added that "all the measures were taken. The guilty were punished, the newspaper was arrested, and the trial is in progress. ... We suppress such things at once. The Communists dissociated themselves from this at once" <sup>131</sup>.

On March 18 the governor of St. Petersburg V. Matviyenko noted at the meeting with FEOR president A. Boroda that the city leaders treat the xenophobia facts most seriously. "There are no unsolved crimes committed basing upon xenophobia, in the city", she stated. Also, in the opinion of the governor, "there are few facts of anti-Semitism in St. Petersburg now, and this is the evidence of the good work of the city management, law-enforcement bodies and of the fact that level of tolerance among the townsfolk had grown" 132.

The authorities responded negatively to the report of the USA State department about global anti-Semitism that asserted that Russian authorities combat against anti-Semitism poorly. Russian Ministry of foreign affairs criticized the report and stated that it is politically committed. "There are enough examples of anti-Semitism in the world, so there is no need to blame single Russia of this", Russian diplomats noted. The head of the State Duma committee on international affairs Konstantin Kosachov estimated criticism of Russia in the report on anti-Semitism as another attempt to "present Russia as a source of every possible problem, and both for own population and for neighboring countries at that" 133.

### Response of Russian Orthodox church to anti-Semitism manifestations

On April 15 the Holy synod of Russian Orthodox church prohibited the dissemination of Orthodox fundamentalist newspapers "Spirit of a Christian" (Moscow) and "Easter of the Third Rome" (Vyksa town, Nizhni Novgorod region) in all the institutions of Russian Orthodox church and at Orthodox exhibitions and fairs 134 (it's possible however that not just anti-Semitic spirit of these papers became the reason for prohibition but the campaign of support of Chukotka exbishop Diomid who spoke with rough criticism of the Patriarch including accusing him of heresy). On the same day an employee of Hierarch's Resurrection town church of Russian Orthodox church in Cherepovets was fired: he arranged viewing of a film by K. Dushenov "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism and

http://www.rons.ru/dim-prov.htm

Mailing list dispatch of FEOR press service dated 28.02.2008

http://www.rosbalt.ru/2008/03/19/466290.html

http://lenta.ru/news/2008/03/15/mid/

http://www.blagovest-info.ru/index.php?ss=2&s=8&id=20080

genocide of Russian nation" that was acknowledged to be extremist, in the town church library 135.

# Response of Jewish public to anti-Semitism manifestations

On March 17 the interview with chief rabbi of Russia Berl Lazar was published on website "Interfax-Religion"; he stressed that the most problem place on the post-Soviet space is Ukraine where number of anti-Semitic incidents grows while in Russia it decreases <sup>136</sup>.

On May 12 the Russian Jewish congress made a statement concerning attacks on employees of Jewish charitable center in Tula. "Actions of anti-Semitic vandals look especially blasphemous and cynical as they were committed in hero-city Tula during celebration of the Day of victory over fascism ... Unavailability of response on the part of local authorities and law-enforcement bodies already after the first incident surprises in this concern. ... It's obvious that such inactivity towards extremists gives birth to new crimes, and this was proved two days later when attack on the employees of the Jewish center took place. Russian Jewish congress thought and thinks that any incident in Russia directed at incitement of inter-ethnic hostility shouldn't be unpunished: it threatens the very fundamentals of our multinational motherland", the statement said 137.

In June the chief rabbi of Russia Berl Lazar gave an interview to the correspondent of German newspaper «Deutsche Welle» Vladimir Sergeyev. He stated in his interview that "nobody is ready to combat" against xenophobia. "Skinheads, fascists, nationalists go out to the streets where our children are walking. Places where they assemble are also known as well as the actions being prepared by them but nobody takes any measures. And the authorities understand the danger of these groups but perhaps keep them for themselves as a kind of marginal force, for some of their own purposes. But the situation had already become uncontrollable as this force had overgrown what was expected from it and is becoming dangerous for Russia in general. The consequences may be destructive. We first get aggressive slogans as represented by this force, then actions and then murders", he stated <sup>138</sup>.

On August 13 Tyumen Moslems, Hebrews, Catholics and Protestants addressed the Patriarch Alexiy II and archbishop of Tobolsk and Tyumen Dimitry (Kapalin) concerning the scandalous lecture delivered by Svetlana Shestakova with request to answer one question: "Are the statements of Svetlana Shestakova really a part of Orthodox doctrine and to what extent such statements on behalf of Russian Orthodox church are legitimate?" <sup>139</sup>

http://www.severinfo.ru/news/17099

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=interview&div=173

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?SECTIONID=244662&IID=480810

http://www.aen.ru/?page=brief&article\_id=49579&PHPSESSID=n26j4eoa3tne3auir1diq4p380

http://www.portal-credo.ru/site/?act=news&id=65092&cf=

In August the FEOR department on rights defense and combating anti-Semitism made the next attempt to close anti-Semitic website "Orthodox Rus" sending the corresponding letter to American host-keeper <sup>140</sup>.

On August the appeals were sent to administration of social web-net "Vkontakte" with demand to remove two groups of brightly anti-Semitic character. Besides, the Department sent an application to the office of public prosecutor of St. Petersburg with request to call the persons involved in dissemination of the film "Russia with the knife in its back" to account as envisaged by RF legislation. Administration of "Vkontakte" expressed its readiness to cooperate with FEOR actively in the combat against manifestations of anti-Semitism, chauvinism and inter-ethnic hatred stating that the accounts of both identified groups were removed <sup>141</sup>.

### **Law-enforcement practice**

Law-enforcement bodies maintain high activity in their combat against anti-Semitism manifestations including those to which the attention was practically not paid before (anti-Semitic graffiti, publication of anti-Semitic literature and newspapers). 57 persons were totally convicted in 2008 for crimes based upon anti-Semitism. These include 23 persons that got suspended sentences, 11 that were sentenced to fines, 10 that were sentenced to imprisonment for the term from 1 to 3 years, 4 – sentenced to compulsory work, 3 – to imprisonment in colony-settlement, 3 – to 3 years and 2 months of imprisonment, 1 – to 3,5 years of imprisonment, 1 – to 7,5 years of imprisonment (the punishment was fixed on the strength of all the sentences together with that passed earlier - for 6 years of imprisonment). One of the accused was released from liability due to exceeding of the statute of limitation. Extremely large share of suspended sentences attracts attention – this results in the people who commit the crimes feeling unpunished. In our opinion, large penalty would be more efficient measure of punishment (especially in the province).

Early in January the punishment was made tougher for the editor of anti-Semitic newspaper "Native Siberia" I. Kolodezenko sentenced in 2007 to 2 years and 10 months of imprisonment – he was transferred from the colony-settlement into the general regime colony. The transfer was caused by the fact that Kolodezenko tried to continue his activity interpreted by the court as incitement of inter-ethnic dissension, in the colony too <sup>142</sup>.

On January 15 Sortavala city court (Karelia) passed a suspended sentence of 9 months of imprisonment for 19-year-old A. Zazhigin, author of nationalist graffiti that appeared in March 2007, with probationary period of 7 months<sup>143</sup>.

http://www.aen.ru/?page=brief&article\_id=50406&PHPSESSID=fkta1ionq1aii6e5j0hlvah7c1

http://www.feor.ru/news/index.php?newsid=6195

http://www.interfax.ru/r/B/siberia/373.html?menu=37&id issue=11943467

http://prokuratura.karelia.ru/news\_folder.php?itemId=4587

On January 17 a search was executed in the apartments of chairman of Khabarovsk branch of Union of Russian people P. Onopriyenko and his deputy V. Chulkin within the criminal proceedings instituted under clause 282 of the CC of RF (incitement of ethnic, racial or religious hostility)<sup>144</sup>.

On January 17 the investigatory committee for Yuzhno-Sakhalinsk of investigatory directorate of the Investigatory committee of the Office of public prosecutor of RF for Sakhalin region instituted criminal proceedings under clause 280 part 1 and clause 282 part 1 (incitement of hatred and hostility using mass media) of the CC of RF concerning the fact of discovery of website with Nazi symbols containing appeals to extremist activity, incitement of hatred, hostility and use of violence towards the persons based upon ethnicity. Five persons were interrogated as the suspects <sup>145</sup>.

On January 21 Vyborg people's court sentenced retired captain V. Nikolsky to 1 year of imprisonment under clause 280 (attempt at public appeals to violent change of political system) and clause 282 of the CC of RF for production of brochure "What should we do now (program-minimum of Russian people)" 146.

On January 25 the trial started in Ivanovo concerning the case of attack on the head of Jewish community and Canadian rabbi with his wife in June 2007<sup>147</sup>.

On January 28 Leninsky district court of Tyumen passed a sentence to S. Shipulin who was accused under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF for posting extremist leaflets. He got suspended sentence of 1-year imprisonment with probationary period of 2 years <sup>148</sup>.

On February 5 Sovetsky city court of Kaliningrad region found the local inhabitant A. Shchetinin guilty under clause 282 part 1 – on behalf of Russian Pagan Community "Heritage of ancestors" he disseminated leaflets with anti-Semitic and anti-Christian appeals. He was sentenced to 180 hours of compulsory work 149. On February 12 Sovetsky city court acknowledged the leaflets the extremist materials 150.

On February 10 one of users of local network of the company SC "VyatKTV" was summoned for conversation to Kirovsky UBOP (Directorate for combating organized criminality) and warned that he may be called to criminal liability under clause 282 of the CC of RF for downloading and placing the film "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism" that was acknowledged extremist, into general access folder. The user deleted the film from his hard disk<sup>151</sup>.

On February 12 Central district court of Novosibirsk found former head of Roscompechat (Russian committee on press) B. Mironov guilty of inciting interethnic dissension but he was released from criminal liability due to exceeding of

http://www.rusidea.org/forum/viewtopic.php?t=875

http://www.sakhalinprokur.ru/news.php?id=878

http://lenta.ru/news/2008/01/22/nikolsky/

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=22542

http://www.nr2.ru/160945.html

http://www.prokuratura39.ru/00news/20080205-01.html

http://klops.ru/news/2415.html

http://www.nabludatel.ru/numers/2008/7/17.htm

the statute of limitation<sup>152</sup>. Such a sentence became possible after re-interpretation of accusation from part 2 to part 1 of clause 282 of the CC of RF<sup>153</sup>. B. Mironov himself stated in his last speech that he is allegedly tried by "Zionists and Hebrews" "for the deed that I dared to touch upon the most forbidden subject in the country since as long ago as 1918 – crimes of Jewish mafia" 154.

On February 18 Basmanny court of Moscow sentenced the leader of ultranationalist group "Format 18" M. Martsinkevich to 3-year imprisonment in general regime colony. He was accused of attempt to derail the political debates in the "Bilingua" club at Chistiye prudy on February 28, 2007<sup>155</sup>. On April 9 Moscow city court upheld the verdict<sup>156</sup>.

On February 22 Pervomaisky district court of Izhevsk found A. Krinitsyn who put anti-Semitic graffiti upon the building of Jewish community center in the city thrice in November-December 2007 guilty under clause 282 part 1 and clause 214 part 2 of the CC of RF (vandalism committed basing upon ethnic hatred and hostility); he got suspended sentence of 3-year imprisonment with probationary period of 2 years. He was also obliged to get registered and present himself regularly for registration to the authorized specialized state body 157.

On March 13 Kursk regional court found ex-candidate to the position of the deputy of Representative assembly of Kursk district of Kursk region from NDPR who disseminated anti-Semitic materials guilty of committing crime under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF and set the punishment as a suspended sentence of 1-year imprisonment 158.

On March 18 the Federal court of Sovetsky district, Samara, upheld the suit of the city public prosecutor on acknowledging journal "Khors" the extremist literature and on prohibiting the dissemination of this edition<sup>159</sup>. On April 25 Samara city court sentenced the journal publisher Sergey Salamatin accused under clause 282 of the CC of RF to penalty of 30 thousand rubles for dissemination of forbidden extremist literature<sup>160</sup>.

On March 20 in Krasnoyarsk the office of public prosecutor exempted the book by V. Istarkhov "Blow of Russian gods" from bookstores as the proceedings on acknowledging this book the extremist material were instituted <sup>161</sup>.

On March 26 Mozhaisk city court upheld the suit of Mozhaisk city office of public prosecutor on acknowledging an informational material in newspaper "Eupathy Kolovrat" extremist and including it into the Federal list of extremist materials <sup>162</sup>.

http://gzt.ru/incident/2008/02/18/093550.html

<sup>152</sup> http://www.nr2.ru/163707.html

http://www.rusidea.org/forum/viewtopic.php?p=13055#13055

http://www.newsru.com/russia/19feb2008/tesak.html

http://www.rian.ru/society/20080409/104186662.html

http://susanin.udm.ru/news/2008/02/22/60183

http://www.islamnews.ru/news-10309.html

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=23409

http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/povoljiePol/202.html?menu=4&id\_issue=12016012

http://www.sibnovosti.ru/articles/48477

www.regnum.ru/news/978994.html

In April the proceedings started against Yu. Mukhin under clause 280 part 2 of the CC of RF (public appeals to execution of extremist activity committed using mass media); he is the editor of newspaper "Duel" being one of mass editions confessing anti-Semitism<sup>163</sup>. On November 26 Zamoskvoretsky district court of Moscow passed a decision on closing the newspaper "Duel" 164.

On April Zheleznodorozhny district court of Ryazan upheld the suit of Ryazan regional public prosecutor on liquidation of the city RNE (Russian National Unity) organization <sup>165</sup>.

On April 7 the suit of Ulyanovsk regional office of public prosecutor was upheld on acknowledging leaflets mailed by unknown persons around Ulyanovsk city territory extremist and anti-Semitic 166.

On April 9 bill of particulars was upheld on criminal case against B. Tolshchin and V. Maslikov who published nationalistic newspaper "Region" in Khabarovsk and were accused of inciting hatred and hostility using mass media (clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF)<sup>167</sup>.

On April 15 criminal proceedings were instituted in Kemerovo region against 19-year-old youth who propagated Nazism on the Internet <sup>168</sup>.

On April 16 Sovetsky district court of Samara acknowledged informational materials placed on website of informational-legal agency "Alex" (led by infamous anti-Semite O. Kitter) extremist and forbade activity of the informational resource <sup>169</sup>.

On April 17 the court decision came into force in Ufa on acknowledging online variant of newspaper "White fist" as well as contents of CD including materials and flag with symbols resembling Nazi ones "up to mixing", extremist<sup>170</sup>. On the same day anti-Semitic leaflet discovered in November 2007 was acknowledged extremist in Nizhni Novgorod<sup>171</sup>.

On April 18 inter-district department of Investigatory directorate for Novosibirsk region instituted criminal proceedings basing upon the fact of selling literature and DVD-discs of frankly anti-Semitic character in one of Novosibirsk bookstores<sup>172</sup>.

On April 25 panel of judges of Sverdlovsk regional court dismissed an appeal of leader of local People's national party branch S. Kotov convicted in June 2006 under clause 282-1 part 1 (arrangement of extremist community) and clause 280 part 1 of the CC of RF<sup>173</sup>.

<sup>163</sup> http://www.duel.ru/200804/?08 1 3 164 http://www.rsoc.ru/site/news/?id\_news=1584 165 http://www.prokrzn.ru/news/2008/52/ 166 http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/povoljieObw/432.html?menu=4&id\_issue=12002338 167 http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/fareastObw/475.html?menu=8&id\_issue=12003903 168 http://www.gazeta.ru/news/lenta/2008/04/15/n\_1206683.shtml 169 http://prokuror.samara.ru/news/21.04.2008/6/13160/ 170 http://www.jewish.ru/news/cis/2008/04/news994261661.php 171 http://www.jewish.ru/news/cis/2008/04/news994261694.php 172 http://www.gzt.ru/society/2008/04/18/171647.html 173 http://www.zavolu.info/1514.html

On May 13 the case on accusing former publisher of journal "Russian master", leader of unregistered "Great-Russian political party" and disseminator of anti-Semitic literature A. Chervyakov under clause 282-1 part 1 of the CC of RF was sent to court <sup>174</sup>. In July 2008 Moscow office of public prosecutor addressed the court demanding that self-published journal "Great-Russian master" published by Chervyakov be acknowledged an extremist material.

On May 13 Primorsky district court of St. Petersburg convicted a resident of St. Petersburg who disseminated a film "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism and genocide of Russian nation", to a penalty of 100 thousand rubles <sup>175</sup>.

On May 14 office of public prosecutor of Pervomaisky district, Kirov region, within supervision over observing the legislation on counteraction of extremist activity, announced warnings on inadmissibility of breaking the law to heads of printing-houses SC "Vanguard", SC "Kirov regional printing-house", and SC "BIG" which printed xenophobic character materials <sup>176</sup>.

On May 18 Novosibirsk regional court suspended the work of local newspaper "Motherland" for disseminating materials directed at "inciting inter-ethnic dissension" (according to the nationalists themselves, there was no trial at all but a search during which the clerical aids were exempted, and this made the newspaper publication impossible)<sup>177</sup>.

On May 26 the criminal case against local resident accused under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF of producing and disseminating anti-Semitic leaflets in November 2007 was sent to Pravoberezhny district court of Magnitogorsk city<sup>178</sup>.

On May 26 editor-in-chief of newspaper "People's opinion" N. Djavatkhanov got suspended sentence of 1,5-year imprisonment with probationary period of 1 year for placing anti-Semitic article in his newspaper in January 2005. The article's author A. Balabekov was found guilty under clause 282 of the CC of RF but released from criminal liability due to exceeding of the statute of limitation. The article itself was acknowledged extremist by the district court after the suit of Sovetsky district public prosecutor (Makhachkala city)<sup>179</sup>.

On May 27 Samara regional office of public prosecutor sent a suit to the court on acknowledging journal "Russian will" and article placed in it extremist materials <sup>180</sup>.

On May 27 Voronezh court convicted the leader of "National-socialist society" (NSO) D. Rumyantsev to 1-year imprisonment (suspended) with 2-year probationary period for inciting ethnic hatred. Rumyantsev's speech at the meeting held in Voronezh in July 2007 was the reason for the sentence <sup>181</sup>.

http://www.mvd.ru/news/16137/

http://www.rian.ru/society/20080513/107239339.html

http://www.nabludatel.ru/lenta.htm?act=lenta&id=6639&year=2008&mon=5

http://www.dpni.org/articles/lenta\_novo/8628/, http://rons.ru/otch-naezd.htm

http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/uralObw/443.html?menu=6&id\_issue=12039594

www.regnum.ru/news/1005539.html

http://www.tltnews.ru/topnews/fullnews.php?id=1604

http://lenta.ru/news/2008/05/27/rymyantsev/

On May 29 Sovetsky district court of Lipetsk passed a sentence under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF on 18-year-old student of vocational school No 23 A. Klimov who created an anti-Semitic website. Taking into account that Klimov was under age at the moment the crime was committed, the court sentenced him to penalty of 20 thousand rubles <sup>182</sup>.

On June 4 Akhtubinsk city court passed a conviction on V. Naidanov being one of members of association "To god-sovereignty!" that existed in the city in 2002-2007. He was found guilty of committing crimes envisaged by clauses 282-1 part 1 and 2, 282 part 2 item "c" of the CC of RF and got suspended sentence of 2-year imprisonment. Besides, he was deprived of a right to occupy some positions and be involved into some activities for 3 years 183. On September 24 the decision of Akhtubinsk city court on acknowledging the organization extremist and its ban came into force 184. On October 29 the sentenced was passed on other three organization members – S. Pospelov, V. Salnikov and V. Rogozhkin. They were found guilty of committing crime envisaged by clause 282-1 part 2 of the CC of RF. V. Salnikov and S. Pospelov were also found guilty under clause 282 part 2 item "c" of the CC of RF and S. Pospelov – under clause 282-1 part 1. The court sentenced S. Pospelov to 3,5-year imprisonment, V. Salnikov – to 3-year imprisonment and V. Rogozhkin – to 1-year imprisonment to be served in colony-settlement 185.

It became known on June 11 that office of public prosecutor of Moscow South-Eastern district instituted criminal proceedings against editor-in-chief of "Russian Truth Press" publishing house A. Bragin – the book "Why people do not like Jewish mafia" was published there <sup>186</sup>.

On June 15 office of public prosecutor of Novokuznetsk district, Kemerovo region, instituted criminal proceedings on the facts of inciting ethnic hate (including anti-Semitism) on the Internet<sup>187</sup>.

On June 25 Sovetsky district court of Krasnoyarsk announced its verdict on three vandals who desecrated the Jewish cemetery in October 2007. One of the accused was sentenced to 2,5-year imprisonment, another one – to 2-year imprisonment and the third one was found mentally irresponsible and sent for compulsory treatment <sup>188</sup>.

In June individual undertaker was called to administrative account in Omsk for selling the movies "Eternal Jew" acknowledged extremist by the court. The undertaker was sentenced to a penalty of 2000 rubles <sup>189</sup>.

On June 30 leader of Amur branch of nationalist organization "Union of Russian people" I. Terekhov was sentenced to 3-year imprisonment in colony-

http://www.civitas.ru/news.php?code=5023

http://www.astrprok.ru/?viewnews=343&m=14

http://www.blagovest-info.ru/index.php?ss=2&s=3&id=22949

http://www.nr2.ru/203665.html

http://www.rosbalt.ru/2008/06/11/493371.html

http://www.kemprok.ru/index.php?par=5&new=15052008-01

http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/siberiaObw/448.html?menu=7&id\_issue=12072663

http://www.prokuratura.omsk.ru/0107081.html

settlement. Two of his companions-in-arms Ye. Smirnov and S. Sychov got suspended sentences of 1,2 and 2,5 years <sup>190</sup>.

In June brochures by Alexey Dobrovolsky (Dobroslav) included into federal list of extremist materials were discovered in reading-room of Herzen library of Kirov. It was ordered to the library management to remove the infringement and study the federal list of extremist materials <sup>191</sup>.

On July 4 criminal case was sent to Kirovsky district court of Tomsk against 29-year-old resident of Tomsk under clause 282 part of the CC of RF for placing video-materials of studio "Format 18" on the Internet – these were films of beating of non-Slavic appearance persons as well as those propagating fascist, racist ideology<sup>192</sup>.

On July 7 Verkh-Isetsky district court of Yekaterinburg upheld demands of Verkh-Isetsky district public prosecutor of Yekaterinburg on acknowledging three books published by two Moscow publishing house extremist. The court upheld the suit completely, the materials contained in all three of books were acknowledged extremist, and unsold number of copies was subject to confiscation <sup>193</sup>.

On July 8 the proceedings started in Ryazan against participants of Ryazan regional branch of Inter-regional public movement for national revival "National-Imperial way of Russia" accused under clause 282 part 2 of the CC of RF<sup>194</sup>.

On July 10 Central district court of Chita upheld demands of first deputy regional public prosecutor on acknowledging the materials of newspaper "Russian Transbaikalia" No 2 dated 22.02.2008 published by local department of Union of Russian people extremist, and passed a decision on confiscation of mentioned mass media<sup>195</sup>. Panel of judges of Chita regional court on civil cases upheld this decision<sup>196</sup>. On September 19 deputy public prosecutor of Transbaikalian region B. Dorzhiyev passed his next warning about inadmissibility of executing extremist activity and disseminating extremist materials to the founder and editor-in-chief of newspaper "Russian Transbaikalia" A. Yaryomenko<sup>197</sup>.

On July 11 the verdict came into force on M. Mayunov who posted anti-Semitic leaflets in Vladivostok. Pervorechensky district court of Vladivostok found him guilty of committing crime under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF and passed a sentence of 1-year imprisonment (suspended) on him with probationary period of 1 year. Panel of judges of Primorsky regional court on criminal cases upheld the verdict <sup>198</sup>.

http://www.demushkin.com/content/news/index.php?news=2069

http://www.new-pressa.ru/newsview.htm?id=662

http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/siberiaObw/448.html?menu=7&id\_issue=12080240

http://www.prokuratura.ur.ru/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=2082&Itemid=39

http://russ-wolf.livejournal.com/34439.html

http://www.prokuratura.chita.ru/press-service/news/?id=724

http://tayga.info/news/32289/

http://www.chita.ru/news/15482/

http://www.prosecutor.ru/pressrelease/1215765656

On July 16 Kirovsky district court of Saratov acknowledged anti-Semitic leaflets posted upon informational panel in the city center extremist 199.

On July 20 investigatory department of Investigatory committee of Office of public prosecutor of RF for Sakhalin region instituted criminal proceedings against leaders of regional branch of "Slavic union" (SS) under clause 282 of the CC of RF<sup>200</sup>.

On July 22 Sovetsky district court of Bryansk passed a sentence on the owner of a shop "Patriot" D. Kovalyov under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF; in 2006-2007 he disseminated the film "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism and genocide of Russian nation". The court found him guilty and sentenced to penalty of 25 thousand rubles<sup>201</sup>.

On July 22 the court proceedings started in Bryansk against four skinheads who regularly broke glasses in Jewish kindergarten in October-November 2007. They shouted Nazi call "Sieg heil!" and drew swastikas on the kindergarten walls<sup>202</sup>.

On July 30 Cherepovets city court passed a sentence on two nationalists who published journal "Arotomans" included into federal list of extremist materials. One of the accused, Yu. Gagarin, got suspended sentence of 3-year imprisonment with probationary period of 2 years. The second of the accused, A. Skvortsov, was sentenced to 7,5-years imprisonment in strict regime correctional colony (the sentence was passed considering the sentence for beating the foreigner passed on Skvortsov earlier)<sup>203</sup>.

Late in July Promyshlenny district court of Stavropol acknowledged the brochure "Russian national union. Ideology. Actions. Figures and facts" an extremist material <sup>204</sup>.

In July the investigatory department for Kirovsky district of Rostov-on-Don instituted criminal proceedings against editor-in-chief of newspaper "Azov region" V. Kuchkov for inciting religious hostility. Appearing of material "Friend among aliens, alien among friends" in the newspaper No 19 dated May 22, 2008 was the reason for proceedings. Linguistic study was conducted, and it found that the article contained statements able to incite religious hostility towards the citizens of Jewish nationality confessing Hassidism<sup>205</sup>.

Early in August the criminal proceedings were instituted in Arkhangelsk under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF against A. Mikhailov being one of leaders of regional branch of "People's Union" party. Mikhailov's public xenophobic and anti-Semitic statements were the cause for instituting criminal proceedings<sup>206</sup>.

```
http://www.interfax.ru/society/news.asp?id=22038
```

http://www.rg.ru/2008/07/24/reg-sakhalin/rasizm.html

http://www.brprok.debryansk.ru/br/news/2008/7/22 1.shtml

http://www.rg.ru/2008/07/22/reg-centr/nazi-anons.html

http://www.zaks.ru/new/archive/view/49371

<sup>11</sup>ttp://www.zaks.ru/new/archive/view/49

http://www.stapravda.ru/20080801/Soderzhanie\_broshyury\_Russkogo\_Obschenacionalnogo\_Soyuza\_priznan\_3213 1.html

http://www.kavkaz-uzel.ru/newstext/news/id/1225543.html http://www.rons-inform.org/more.html?id=817\_0\_17\_0\_C

On August 1 it became known that the criminal proceedings under clause 282 of the CC of RF were instituted in Karelia due to discovery of the folder "For Russian fascists" on one of network exchange portals<sup>207</sup>.

On August 13 the Federal court of Kirovsky district started the court proceedings on criminal case against editor-in-chief of "Orthodox Rus" K. Dushenov as well as P. Meleshko and A. Malyshev<sup>208</sup>.

On August 14 court of the peace of Sovetsky district of Samara passed a sentence on two activists of organization "National-socialist community" M. Bozhenov and V. Ignatyev. They were found guilty and got suspended sentences of 2-year and 1-year imprisonment correspondingly<sup>209</sup>.

On August 26 office of public prosecutor of Tyumen region instituted criminal proceedings concerning the lecture delivered in public on April 18, 2008 within the course "Fundamentals of religious knowledge" for future teachers of "Fundamentals of Orthodox culture" by associate professor of Tyumen state oil and gas university S. Shestakova<sup>210</sup>.

Early in September Promyshlenny district court of Stavropol passed a decision on acknowledging books by M. Sherstnev "Who rules us: psychology of managers", "Psychological control over the people" and "Secret mechanisms of control over the people" extremist materials. The court also banned their production, storage and dissemination on the territory of Russian Federation<sup>211</sup>.

On September 2 the sentence was passed on 18-year-old resident of Nizhni Novgorod who desecrated Jewish graves more than once in May-June 2008. He got suspended sentence of 2,5-year imprisonment<sup>212</sup>.

On September 2 investigatory department of Investigatory committee of Office of public prosecutor of RF for Tomsk city instituted criminal proceedings against 20-year-old resident of Tomsk who placed xenophobic and anti-Semitic video-reels on the Internet<sup>213</sup>.

On September 2 the court proceedings started in Cherepovets city court against former librarian of Cherepovets Bishop's Resurrection town church N. Yuganova accused of dissemination of the film "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism and genocide of Russian nation" included into federal list of extremist materials<sup>214</sup>.

On September 2 the court proceedings started in Leninsky district court of Novosibirsk against A. Budnikov accused of extremist appeals on the Internet. According to the criminal case materials, in 2007 A. Budnikov was entering one of Runet websites under nickname "Svyatozar" and regularly placing anti-Semitic

http://www.zaks.ru/new/archive/view/49421

http://www.russia-talk.com/rf/dush-8-14-8.htm

http://63.ru/factsline/6287.html

http://www.portal-credo.ru/site/?act=news&id=65092&cf=

http://www.regions.ru/news/2166306

http://www.portal-credo.ru/site/?act=news&id=65004&cf

http://www.interfax-russia.ru/r/B/siberiaObw/448.html?menu=7&id issue=12138253

http://www.cherinfo.ru/index.php?newsid=9762

orientation articles there, incited religious hatred and called upon overthrowing of existing authority<sup>215</sup>.

On September 18 the Investigatory directorate of Investigatory committee of RF Office of public prosecutor for St. Petersburg sent the criminal case against leader of nationalist "Party of freedom" Yu. Belyayev under clause 282 part 1 of the CC of RF to court<sup>216</sup>.

On September 18 Ulyanovsk city court passed a verdict on four city residents who attacked the Jewish community center in January. The court found the accused guilty under clause 282 of the CC of RF. Two of the accused were sentenced to imprisonment for the term from 1 to 3 years and another two of them were sentenced to correctional work<sup>217</sup>.

On September 19 criminal case of 21-year-old metalworker suspected of putting xenophobic graffiti and swastikas upon the walls of some buildings was sent for examination to Armavir city court<sup>218</sup>.

On September 23 the investigatory department for Maikop city of Investigatory directorate of Investigatory committee of Office of public prosecutor of RF instituted criminal proceedings against editor of newspaper "Zakubanye" V. Karatayev for publication of a poem by Ye. Skvoreshnev "Be Russian!" under clause 282 part 2 of the CC of RF<sup>219</sup>.

On September 29 criminal case against 29-year-old city resident was sent to Novgorod city court; he was accused of placing folders on the Internet on FTP-server of SC "Novgorod-Datacom"; these contained the agitation-propagandist materials including pictures of A. Hitler, signs of swastika, emblems "White Power", neo-Nazis' slogans with direct statements that migrants and Jews are the principal enemies of Russia at present<sup>220</sup>.

On September 30 Khabarovsk office of public prosecutor sent the criminal case against persons who disseminated a newspaper "Black hundred" in 2006, to court<sup>221</sup>.

In September justice of the peace of court district No 49 of Kaluga city imposed a penalty upon M. Dubovich who placed a file on local web-net containing materials of a film "Eternal Jew". The film is included into federal list of extremist materials, and the file containing the film was deleted <sup>222</sup>.

On October 6 Bauxitogorsk city court (Leningrad region) sentenced former militia employee A. Smirnov to 2,5-years imprisonment (suspended) with probationary period of 3 years for inciting inter-ethnic dissension – placing the articles inciting hatred towards Jews and Caucasians on specially created website

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=26305

http://www.zaks.ru/new/archive/view/50772

http://www.islamnews.ru/news-14461.html

www.regnum.ru/news/1057683.html

http://www.yuga.ru/news/135822/

http://www.procuratura.nov.ru/?q=node/457

http://primamedia.ru/news/show/?id=81993

http://prokuror.kaluga.ru/news/808/

www.swastika.ueuo.com and on LiveJournal as well as for illegal storage of ammunition<sup>223</sup>.

On October 7 Promyshlenny district court of Stavropol acknowledged brochures "If there is no water in crane... 666, or occupation authority", "Give us Motherland back, or Railway station – Baku (no suitcases)" extremist as well as the brochure ""Russian national union. Ideology. Actions. Figures and facts. Program. Statute" 224.

On October 15 the decision of Primorsky district court of St. Petersburg came into force. It upheld the suit of district public prosecutor and acknowledged films "Modern Russian idea under Yids' yoke" and "Russia with the knife in its back. Jewish fascism" extremist materials<sup>225</sup>.

On October 15 court proceedings started in Novosibirsk against newspaper "Motherland" published by local nationalists<sup>226</sup>.

On November 13 office of public prosecutor of Polyarniye Zori town (Murmansk region) instituted criminal proceedings concerning the fact of appearing anti-Semitic graffiti<sup>227</sup>.

On November 13 it became known that office of public prosecutor of Republic of Komi intends to conduct inspection of newspaper "Eparchial bulletin" concerning incitement of religious intolerance <sup>228</sup>.

On November 18 it became known that Sovetsky inter-district investigatory department for Samara of Investigatory directorate of Investigatory committee of RF Office of public prosecutor instituted criminal proceedings against unknown persons who posted anti-Semitic leaflets around the city in 2007<sup>229</sup>.

The federal list of extremist materials increased up to 300 titles in 2008 (301 titles for December 22, 2008). 80% of these materials at least are of anti-Semitic character. Rossvyazokhranculture and Roscomsvyaznadzor that replaced it passed 15 warnings at least in 2008 for anti-Semitic statements. Such a decrease of warnings number can be explained by numerous reorganizations the institution was subject to. Uncertainty that was occurring during these reorganizations affected the work badly.

In April 2008 the list of public and religious associations and other non-commercial organizations was published concerning which the decision on liquidation was made that came into effect under provisions envisaged by Federal law "On counteraction of extremist activity". Four organizations included into the list of six are anti-Semitic – three institutions of so-called Ancient-Russian

HTTP://NEWSRU.COM/RUSSIA/06OCT2008/BLOGGER.HTML

http://spb.rbc.ru/freenews/20081006125508.shtml,

http://www.interfax-religion.ru/?act=news&div=26831

http://www.prokuratura.sp.ru/news.html?/news/2008/10/15/2

http://rons.ru/get-10-08.htm

<sup>227</sup> http://www.rosbalt.ru/2008/11/13/541306.html

http://www.komionline.ru/news/13118

http://news.smbc.ru/main/2008/11/19/15310.html

Ingliistic church of Old-believers-Inglings abolished in 2004 and organization "Council of Kuban Spiritual Ancestral State of land of Rus" closed in 2006<sup>230</sup>.

On April 21 the Office of general public prosecutor issued an address to the head of Federal Customs service A. Belyaninov demanding that infringements be removed connected with suppression of importing extremist orientation printed and audio-visual produce (literature, films etc) onto the territory of Russia<sup>231</sup>.

On the other hand, law-enforcement bodies sometimes prefer ignoring anti-Semitic manifestations. Decision of Moscow city court dated February 28 can be noted as an example when, after examining the suit of newspaper "Duel" concerning decision of Zamoskvoretsky court about ceasing its activity, the court cancelled this decision and sent the case for new examination 232. On May 19 Frunzensky district court of Saratov examined the civil case on acknowledging book by Hans F.K. Gunter "Selected works on raceology" published by Moscow publishing house "White alvae" the extremist literature. The court passed the negative decision 233. On June 20 Leninsky district court of Kostroma region rejected the suit of acting public prosecutor of Kostroma region Ye.A. Muravyova concerning acknowledging the book "Blow of Russian gods" the extremist material and confiscating this book 234.

According to the head of Ivanovo regional Jewish community Ervin Kirshtein, the authorities and law-enforcement bodies actually announced the Jews themselves who "put out" too much guilty of attacks on the community members<sup>235</sup>. Ivanovo branch of assembly of peoples of Russia didn't support the proposal of Ervin Kirshtein to condemn the fascist manifestations and had the position towards the city Jewish community being generally non-amicable<sup>236</sup>.

Re-interpretation of accusation against skinheads who attacked the Jewish school in Bryansk in autumn 2007 to common hooliganism also looks strange<sup>237</sup>. Militia employees who guarded the meeting of nationalists in St. Petersburg on August 5 preferred not responding to addresses concerning dissemination of xenophobic literature at the meeting<sup>238</sup> (though this hardly deals with conscious assistance to the anti-Semites in this case but rather with unwillingness of lawenforcement body employees to receive any additional load upon themselves).

The response of Moscow office of public prosecutor to the request of so-called "Russian anti-fascist committee" (being one of nationalist organizations actively using pseudo-rights defending rhetoric) looks even more surprising. The committee demanded that the book "Tanya" written by the founder of Lyubavichi Hassidism Shneur-Zalman Shneerson be acknowledged extremist. In the response

HTTP://WWW.ROSREGISTR.RU/INDEX.PHP?MENU=3003250000

http://gzt.ru/society/2008/04/22/063003.html

http://forum.msk.ru/material/news/445157.html

http://www.vzsar.ru/news/2008/05/19/sud\_otkazalsya\_priznat\_knigu\_ekstremistskoy.html

http://ndpr.ru/content/view/1652/

www.regnum.ru/news/1023564.html

http://www.aen.ru/index.php?page=brief&article\_id=50056

http://base.ijc.ru/new/site.aspx?SECTIONID=244662&IID=492421

<sup>238</sup> http://www.fontanka.ru/2008/08/06/082/

that came in May the information was contained that the public prosecutor inspection "concerning publication and dissemination of book "Likkutei Amarim (TANYA)" in Moscow and legality of its use in educational process of "Moscow university Touro" was arranged<sup>239</sup>.

### Recommendations

Anti-Semitism, still being the constituent of Russian radical nationalism, affects the population – and first of all the conscience of spiritually misinformed and embittered youth that is filled with nationalistic and sometimes Nazi conscience. The situation is aggravated by profound economic crisis leading to worsening of material situation, unemployment and, as a consequence, to searching enemies among "aliens".

Imperfection of legislation is one of the reasons for modern Russian anti-Semitism. Broad publication of anti-Semitic literature is continued, and numerous publications of anti-Semitic materials in mass media do not stop. Noting the increased activity of law-enforcement bodies in persecution of persons committing illegal actions, one should stress at the same time that these persons get mostly suspended sentences that do not unable their recovery and also create the image of "those who suffered from authorities" among nationalists for them.

Combat against anti-Semitic propaganda that caused considerable expansion of federal list of extremist materials and several court procedures touched mostly upon marginal editions and didn't almost affect the pillars of anti-Semitic publicism and book publication. Besides, law-enforcement bodies willingly or unwillingly allowed some "extremes" in their combat against anti-Semitism manifestations when accusations of committing crimes motivated by anti-Semitism were brought against opposition editions basing upon formal factors, and scientific works were included into the lists of extremist materials.

Practically complete absence of anti-Semitism prevention should be also noted.

Basing upon the above-stated, the following recommendations can be proposed for state structures and NGOs in the field of combat against anti-Semitism:

1. It is advisable that Ministry of home affairs and Investigatory committee of the office of public prosecutor improve the work with argumentative base of criminal cases concerning anti-Semitism attracting larger number of competent experts. This would allow avoiding unfortunate mistakes like attempt to acknowledge scientific biography of Hitler extremist material or attempt to examine the Jewish book written late in 18<sup>th</sup> century concerning extremism.

<sup>239</sup> 

Besides, it's necessary to stop making forced incriminations of anti-Semitism against representatives of opposition liberal mass media as this just discredits combat against anti-Semitism in front of the public.

- 2. We consider it efficient to replace most part of suspended sentences with large penalties and "ban on profession" (for journalists and publishers-anti-Semites).
- 3. Conduction of educational preventive work directed against dissemination of anti-Semitic moods in Russia should be the task of Ministry of education and science and NGOs representatives. It may deal with inclusion of materials revealing anti-Semitic prejudices into school and college program on history, publication (or re-publication) of popular literature on this subject, creation of corresponding websites and holding of conferences and round tables.
- 4. Combat against anti-Semitism requires joint efforts of authorities, national-cultural autonomies, rights defending organizations, and cultural institutions and can be executed just within general combat against racism, xenophobia and ethnic prejudices.