



## **TOLERANCE IMPLEMENTATION MEETING: ADDRESSING THE HATE CRIME DATA DEFICIT**

**Hofburg, Vienna  
9–10 November 2006**

### **ANNOTATED AGENDA**

Under the 2003-2005 Ministerial Council Decisions OSCE participating States made commitments to collect and keep reliable information and statistics on hate crimes, including on forms of violent manifestations of racism, xenophobia, discrimination, and anti-Semitism.

Most recently, the 2005 Ljubljana Ministerial Council Decision committed participating States to:

- strengthen efforts to collect and maintain reliable information and statistics on hate crimes and legislation within their territories, to report such information periodically to the ODIHR
- make this information available to the public
- consider drawing on ODIHR assistance in this field
- nominate national points of contact on hate crimes to the ODIHR.

The same Decisions tasked the ODIHR to serve as a collection point for information and statistics collected by participating States and to regularly report on the collected information.

Under the Decisions the ODIHR was also tasked to assist participating States upon their request in developing appropriate methodologies and capacities for collecting and maintaining reliable information and statistics about hate crimes and violent manifestations of intolerance and discrimination, with a view to helping them to collect comparable data and statistics.

In response to its tasks under the Maastricht Ministerial Council Decision, the ODIHR sent out various Note Verbales in 2004, requesting that States provide the following information:

- All pertinent and reliable information, including statistics where available, on hate crimes, including violent manifestations of racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism, and other forms of intolerance and discrimination;
- Information concerning existing relevant criminal legislation – in particular which type of racist acts are defined as criminal offences;
- Information on national initiatives and best practices to combat racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic violence and crimes;
- The name of a designated authority responsible for the collection and provision of information to the ODIHR.

Throughout 2004, the ODIHR Director provided updates to the Permanent Council on information, statistics, and legislation submitted by participating States and reminded all States to submit their data by the end of 2004 in order to enable the ODIHR to undertake a preliminary analysis of the information collected.

In June 2005, the ODIHR published the report “Combating Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region: An Overview of Statistics, Legislation, and National Initiatives” which provides a preliminary overview of the types of information submitted by participating States, including an assessment of where information was deficient or inconsistent. The report also offers a working definition of hate crime and a police reporting form to support States in their efforts to strengthen data collection related to hate crime. In the report, it was concluded that a hate crime data deficit exists in many OSCE participates and several recommendations to States on how to further strengthen the quality and quantity of data were included within the report. Following this report, in October 2006 the ODIHR issued a second report on *Challenges and Responses to Hate-Motivated Incidents in the OSCE Region (January-June 2006)*, which included updated statistics, legislation and other information submitted by OSCE participating States.

The need for effective data collection systems on hate crime has also been highlighted by a number of international organizations, including the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance of the Council of Europe (ECRI), the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC), and the United Nations’ Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights (OHCHR), in recent reports published as well as in policy recommendations and commitments adopted by each of these organisations.

The main aim of the *Tolerance Implementation Meeting: Addressing the Hate Crime Data Deficit* is to provide a forum for experts and practitioners from OSCE participating States to exchange experiences and practices related to their hate crime data collection methodologies and to discuss ways to further strengthen approaches to data collection. The Meeting will be attended by experts from OSCE participating States, representatives of inter-governmental organizations and civil society.

The Meeting will consist of thematic sessions, where presentations of expert speakers from different OSCE States on their experiences and practices in dealing with specific aspects of the data collection process will be used as the basis for interactive discussions between participants of the Meeting. The thematic Sessions will include the following subject areas:

- The importance of data collection
- Data collection and police-community relations
- Data analysis and reporting
- Hate crime data: follow-up and policy implications

### **WEDNESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2006**

8:30-9:30

Registration (Hofburg Congress Centre, Segmentgalerie)

<b>NGO PREPARATORY MEETING</b>
--------------------------------

10:00-18:00

Segmentgalerie 1 (1<sup>st</sup> floor)

**THURSDAY, 9 NOVEMBER 2006**

<b>SESSION 1</b>	<b>OPENING SESSION</b>
------------------	------------------------

15:00-16:00

**Opening Remarks**

- Ambassador Christian Strohal, Director of the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights
- Representative of the OSCE Chairmanship

**Presentation of Civil Society Organizations' Recommendations**

Mr. Michael Whine, Director of Communications, Community Security Trust, UK

**Keynote Address: Hate Crime Data Deficit in the OSCE Region: Concerns and Implications**

Dr. Jack Levin, Brudnick Center on Violence and Conflict, Northeastern University, USA

<b>SESSION 2</b>	<b>THE IMPORTANCE OF DATA COLLECTION</b>
------------------	--

16:00-18:00 Moderator: Ms. Jo-Anne Bishop, Head of the ODIHR Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Programme

**The Need for Data on Hate Crime**

Dr. Joanna Goodey, European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia

**Challenges Posed by the Data Deficit**

Mr. Warren Silver, Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, Canada

**The Impact of Under-reported and Unrecorded Hate Crime Data**

Mr. Michael McClintock, Human Right First, USA

The lack of accurate and comprehensive official data is the first impediment to the effective combat against hate crimes. A data deficit not only hampers the ability of governments to assess and analyse the nature and extent of hate crime but more significantly prevents the development of effective measures and strategies to prevent and respond to hate-motivated acts. Without reliable hate crime data, the relevant authorities, notably the law enforcement and the judiciary, remain unaware of the trends in hate-motivated crimes and are therefore unable to suggest adequate policies and/or sufficient protection to vulnerable groups.

This session will focus on the important role that data plays in defining the scope and nature of hate crime within a State and the impact that published data and statistics can have in demonstrating a State's ability to recognize, report on and respond to hate crime. Challenges that governments face in classifying and collecting hate crime will also be discussed.

18:00-20:00 Reception

**FRIDAY, 10 NOVEMBER 2006**

<b>SESSION 3</b>	<b>DATA COLLECTION AND POLICE-COMMUNITY RELATIONS</b>
------------------	---

9:30-11:00 Moderator: Ms. Daniela Petković, Police Academy, Ministry of Interior, Croatia

**The Role of Police in Data Collection: Practical Implications**

Assistant Chief Constable Drew Harris, Police Service of Northern Ireland, UK

**Bridging the Information Deficit in Bias Crime Reporting**

Dr. James Nolan, West Virginia University, USA

**Police and Civil Society Cooperation in Data Collection**

Commissaire Thierry Hartmann, General Directorate of the National Police, Ministry of Interior, France (to be confirmed)

As the first respondents to hate crime, law enforcement officers, play a key role in recognizing and reacting to hate crimes and incidents and in collecting and recording information about such cases. Proper training for the police is therefore crucial for efficient data collection. The accuracy and comprehensiveness of collected data also depends on the ability of law enforcement officers to work closely with community-based and other civil society organizations which can be instrumental in contributing to comprehensiveness and accuracy of collected data.

This session will examine the specific role of law enforcement officers in collecting and recording hate crime data. The session will focus on two aspects, namely methodology, as well as specific tools and procedures in data collection. Technical aspects of data collection by police – such as bias motivation, type of offence, and follow-up to recorded and reported incidents – will also be considered in this session. The session will further examine the main causes that obstruct effective data collection – such as underreporting, under-recording and other institutional gaps – and will point out solutions to overcome them.

<b>SESSION 4:</b>	<b>DATA ANALYSIS AND REPORTING</b>
-------------------	------------------------------------

11:00-12:30 Moderator: Dr. James Nolan, West Virginia University, USA

**Processing Hate Crime Statistics**

Mr. Ulrich Kinitz, Detective Superintendent, Head of State Security Division, Police Headquarters, Münster, Germany

**Reporting Data on Hate Crimes**

Ms. Ladislava Tajchmanova, Security Policy Department, Ministry of Interior, Czech Republic

**Publishing Statistics on Hate Crime**

Dr. Christine Magill, Research, Development and Statistics Directorate, Officer for Criminal Justice Reform, Home Office, UK

In order to enable government authorities to adequately respond to the social realities revealed by collected data on hate crimes and incidents, the figures and statistics have to be processed, analysed

and reported. This process involves the collection and compilation of information from the police, courts and numerous other officials within the judicial system and other bodies. It also calls for the input of statisticians as well as criminologists, sociologists, researchers and other relevant experts.

This session will look at the different actors involved in process of statistics development and publication. By looking at examples, it will seek to reconstruct the route a set of data takes through the institutions of different countries. This session will also explore issues such as: How is data transferred into quantitative information? How is it analyzed and reported? How to set up and build the capacity of national institutions responsible for data collection and analysis? How to bridge the organizational/institutional gaps between those agencies that collect and report data, and those that receive, analyze and publicize data?

12:30-14:00 Lunch

<b>SESSION 5</b>	<b>HATE CRIME DATA: FOLLOW-UP AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS</b>
------------------	---

14:00-15:30 Moderator: Dr. Jack Levin, Brudnick Center on Violence and Conflict, Northeastern University

**The Connection between Hate Crime Data and Policy Development**

Prof. Valery Tishkov, Director of the Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology of the Russian Academy of Sciences, the Russian Federation (to be confirmed)

**Data Collection as an Effective Tool for Improving Policy Responses Aimed at Combating Hate Crime**

Ms. Heike Klempa, Secretariat of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance

**Ensuring Continuity and Further Action**

Ms. Astrid Mattijssen, Ministry of Justice, the Netherlands

Data is collected for a specific reason, namely to assess the magnitude of the problem, to determine the causes and consequences, to identify impact of hate crime on affected communities and to suggest policy implications and the need for follow-up actions. There is an increasing need for qualitative data and analysis on how hate crime legislation is applied and enacted in order to bridge the information disconnect between the initial reporting of a hate crime and the outcome.

This session will focus on the need for information and statistics on the outcome of reported cases of hate crime, such as the numbers of recorded convictions and sentences handed down and the number of acquittals or discontinued cases. This session will look into effective policy responses and measures that can result from data collection processes as well as examine the steps that need to be taken once the data is collected, analyzed and reported.

<b>SESSION 6</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS AND PRACTICAL RECOMMENDATIONS</b>
------------------	--

15:30-16:45 Moderator: Ms. Jo-Anne Bishop, Head of ODIHR Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Programme

**Presentations by Session Moderators**

This closing Session will consider the recommendations made during previous discussions and will look into future priorities and joint actions pertaining to effective data collection. The identified recommendations and suggestions will be addressed to the participating States, OSCE Institutions, as well as other inter-governmental and non-governmental organisations. This Session will be also an opportunity to follow-up on recommendations made in previous events and publications and to discuss areas for concrete support to States in strengthening their efforts to improve their data collection methodologies.

16:45-17:00 **Closing Remarks**

- Ambassador Christian Strohal, Director of the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights
- Representative of the OSCE Chairmanship