



**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
Permanent Council**

PC.DEL/833/13
21 October 2013

ENGLISH only

Chairmanship: Ukraine

**SUMMARY REPORT
OF THE
OSCE HIGH-LEVEL CONFERENCE
ON
TOLERANCE AND NON-DISCRIMINATION
(INCLUDING HUMAN RIGHTS YOUTH EDUCATION ON
TOLERANCE AND NON-DISCRIMINATION)**

**21-22 May 2013
Tirana, Albania**

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	2
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
I. INTRODUCTION	6
II. SUMMARY OF THE SESSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.	8
Opening ceremony: Welcoming remarks and formal opening of the Conference.....	8
Opening plenary session: Combating intolerance and discrimination in the OSCE area. Implementation of the relevant OSCE commitments.....	8
Part 1. Comprehensive approach to combating intolerance and discrimination ...	9
Plenary session 1: Combating intolerance and discrimination against any person, including racism, xenophobia and aggressive nationalism, in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments.....	9
Plenary session 2: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions	12
Plenary session 3: Combating anti-Semitism	14
Plenary session 4: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.....	16
Part 2. The way forward: Preventing and responding to intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes. Promoting mutual respect and understanding	19
Plenary session 5: The role of human rights youth education in promoting mutual understanding and respect for diversity in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments	19
Plenary session 6: The role of political leadership, legislation, law enforcement, data collection, and civil society in combating and preventing intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes.....	21
Closing plenary session	24
ANNEXES	25
ANNEX 1. Biographical Information on Keynote Speakers, Introducers and Moderators	25
ANNEX 2. Agenda	33
ANNEX 3. Summary of Participation	36

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The OSCE held a High-Level Conference on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, including Human Rights Youth Education on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, in Tirana, Albania on 21-22 May 2013 in accordance with OSCE Permanent Council Decision 1081.¹ The conference was opened by the representative of the Ukrainian OSCE Chairmanship His Excellency Mr. Yevhen Sulima, First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine, and His Excellency Mr. Sali Berisha, Prime Minister of Albania.² More than two hundred representatives from participating States, international organizations, non-governmental organizations, and OSCE institutions and field operations attended the conference. Participants were provided with the valuable opportunity to review and assess progress achieved since the 2010 OSCE High-Level Conference on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination in Astana, Kazakhstan,³ and to discuss current challenges and ways in which they might be addressed. The conference consisted of an opening session, six plenary sessions devoted to specific aspects of tolerance and non-discrimination and a closing session.

Participants recalled existing OSCE commitments in the area of tolerance and non-discrimination, including recent Ministerial Council decisions, and praised the comprehensiveness of the OSCE *acquis*. Ukraine's First Deputy Minister of Education and Science Mr. Yevhen Sulima highlighted the powerful role of human rights education for young people in promoting mutual understanding and respect for diversity, which belongs to the Ukrainian OSCE Chairmanship's priorities. Many participants, including the representative of the host country, Prime Minister Mr. Sali Berisha, emphasized that the major challenge resides in the insufficient implementation of existing OSCE commitments by the participating States rather than in the absence of an OSCE normative framework. Several speakers, however, spoke in favour of the adoption of additional, stronger or more detailed commitments.

Participants recognized that manifestations of intolerance, violence and hate crimes are reported on a permanent basis across the OSCE region. Such manifestations include hate crimes and other forms of intolerance against religious groups, minorities, migrants, Roma as well as against persons based on their sexual orientation or gender identity. Anecdotal evidence of cases of hate crimes and incidents in particular countries was referred to by participants. Many speakers argued that without comprehensive and reliable data on hate crime and incidents, it is impossible to assess the scope and understand the nature of these phenomena. Deploring the lack of data on hate crime across the OSCE region, many participants reminded authorities of their obligation to collect and publicize statistics on hate crimes.

A number of speakers stressed that manifestations of intolerance do not take place in a vacuum. They argued that intolerant speech in the public space and discriminatory policies form the backdrop for hate crimes and incidents. Discussions addressed the damage done by speech that is openly biased and hateful, especially when it is

¹ OSCE Permanent Council Decision No. 1081. The text is available at: <http://www.osce.org/cio/101271>

² A full list of the keynote speakers, moderators and introducers of plenary sessions is included in this report.

³ 28 – 30 June 2010.

authored by government officials or politicians. Intolerant discourse in the media – print and digital, social and other – was also identified as a factor conducive to the acceptance of intolerance and discrimination. There was undisputed agreement about the vital role state leaders and politicians should play in speaking out against expressions of intolerance, in particular the propagation of stereotype and bias about the groups targeted by manifestations of intolerance.

Many speakers underscored the intimate connection between discrimination and fundamental rights and freedoms such as freedom of religion or belief and freedom of speech. Speakers illustrated how discriminatory policies and attitudes restrict the freedom of religion or belief of certain groups, such as Muslims and Christians. They also debated whether restrictions on the freedom of speech are the best way to counter discrimination. Most speakers argued that producing effective counter-speech by implementing educational programmes, granting targeted communities access to major media outlets, promoting unbiased media reporting and fostering inter-faith and inter-cultural dialogue initiatives was preferable to criminalizing speech.

A large part of the conference was devoted to reviewing the problem of intolerance against individuals who are members of specific groups, with separate plenary sessions focusing on intolerance and discrimination against any person, including racism, xenophobia and aggressive nationalism as well as on intolerance against Christians and members of other religious communities, anti-Semitism and intolerance against Muslims. Recalling the indivisibility of human rights, speakers underscored that there should be no hierarchy among the different forms of intolerance. It was argued that specific attention should be paid to women, children, migrants and Roma who often are the victims of multiple discriminations. The negative impact of the lasting economic crisis on discrimination was stressed in all sessions. Speakers expressed concern about manifestations of aggressive nationalism and the proliferation of right-wing extremist groups, arguing that both robust responses and sustainable preventative measures should be implemented.

The debate on manifestations of intolerance against religious groups, including Christians, focused on the impact that discrimination against Christians has on their right to freedom of religion. Speakers also expressed alarm at the number of anti-Semitic crimes, the growth of anti-Semitic political platforms, the unabated proliferation of Holocaust denial and minimization. Discrimination in employment and education, restriction of the religious freedom, discriminatory counter-terrorism measures, misguided integration policies and the widespread expression of bias and prejudice were the main themes of the discussion on intolerance against Muslims. Inter-faith and inter-cultural dialogue was frequently mentioned as good practice.

Intolerance or discrimination against a number of other groups was also examined. Some speakers devoted particular attention to the continuing problem of discrimination against Roma and Sinti in parts of the OSCE area, deploring the implementation gap as the OSCE approaches the eve of the tenth anniversary of its Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti.⁴ The problems of intolerance and discrimination against lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgender persons was raised in several sessions,

⁴ OSCE Maastricht Ministerial Decision No. 3/03 of 2003. The text is available at: <http://www.osce.org/odihr/17554>

with some speakers calling for new OSCE commitments to protect these individuals and communities from discrimination.

Much of the conference was devoted to exchanging information on initiatives to address intolerance and discrimination. Robust hate crime and anti-discrimination legislation was mentioned as a prerequisite for effective action of the criminal justice system and relevant actors. Several delegations gave examples of good practices from their own countries in law enforcement capacity building and outreach to affected communities.

Special attention was paid at the conference to the importance of human rights education in addressing intolerance and discrimination. The value of education in promoting understanding was a common thread throughout discussions. Many speakers expressed the view that comprehensive and integrative educational initiatives are the only sustainable strategy for eradicating the root causes of intolerance and discrimination. The added value of human rights education was highlighted in many sessions, in particular the OSCE's experience in mainstreaming human rights education in conflict prevention and resolution activities. Several participants highlighted the importance of Holocaust education and Holocaust remembrance.

A frequent theme of the conference was the beneficial role of civil society organizations as allies in tackling manifestations of intolerance and promoting mutual respect and understanding. Many interventions featured examples of civil society contributions in areas such as monitoring, reporting, training, educating, disseminating positive messages, advancing intercultural and inter-religious exchanges, and supporting targeted individuals.

In each session of the conference, participants presented recommendations for OSCE participating States and for the OSCE and its institutions on combating intolerance and promoting mutual respect and understanding. These recommendations are summarized in this report. They do not necessarily represent the views of the OSCE, as they were not adopted or endorsed by the participating States.

I. INTRODUCTION

Since the 2003 Vienna Conferences on Anti-Semitism and on Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, OSCE participating States have re-affirmed their commitments to combating intolerance and discrimination and promoting mutual respect and understanding.

Ministerial Council Decisions⁵ adopted since then have reiterated that the promotion of tolerance and non-discrimination goes hand-in-hand with the promotion of human rights and democratic values, and that respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, democracy and the rule of law are at the core of OSCE's comprehensive concept of security. Acknowledging the need to address the root causes of intolerance and discrimination which may give rise to wider conflict and violence as well as the need to fully respect the human rights and fundamental freedoms⁶ of every individual without distinction, these decisions call upon participating States to take a comprehensive approach to developing educational programmes to foster a greater understanding of and respect for different cultures, ethnicities, religions or beliefs⁷ and to raise public awareness of the existence and unacceptability of intolerance and discrimination.⁸ These decisions call on participating States to address intolerance and discrimination, including hate crime, and reiterate that educational efforts should target younger generations⁹ and contribute to the promotion of democracy, human rights and fundamental freedoms.¹⁰

In accordance with Permanent Council Decision No. 1081, adopted on 25 April 2013,¹¹ the OSCE High-Level Conference on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination (including Human Rights Youth Education on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination) was held in Tirana (Albania) on 21-22 May 2013 in order to sustain high-level political attention to the effective implementation of OSCE's commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination.¹²

⁵ Enshrined in the Helsinki Final Act of 1975, the 1990 Charter of Paris for a New Europe, the 1990 Copenhagen Document on the Human Dimension of the CSCE and the 1999 Charter for European Security, the commitments of OSCE participating States in the field of tolerance and non-discrimination are reflected in the OSCE Ministerial Council Decisions adopted in Porto (MC(10).DEC/6), Maastricht (MC.DEC/4/03), Sofia (MC.DEC/12/04), Ljubljana (MC.DEC/10/05), Brussels (MC.DEC/13/06), Madrid (MC.DEC/10/07), Helsinki (MC.DEC/6/08), and Athens (MC.DEC/8/09 and MC.DEC/9/09) and Permanent Council Decisions Nos. 607, 621 and 633.

⁶ Such as the freedom of expression and the freedom of peaceful assembly.

⁷ MC.DEC/13/06

⁸ MC.DEC/10/05

⁹ MC.DEC/5/03

¹⁰ MC.DEC/10/07

¹¹ PC.DEC/1081

¹² The conference will build on the outcomes of previous events, including: the 2003 Vienna Conferences on Anti-Semitism and on Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination; the April 2004 Berlin Conference on Anti-Semitism; the June 2004 Paris Meeting on the Relationship between Racist, Xenophobic and Anti-Semitic Propaganda on the Internet and Hate Crimes; the September 2004 Brussels Conference on Tolerance and the Fight Against Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination; the 2005 Cordoba Conference on Anti-Semitism and on Other Forms of Intolerance; the 2007 Bucharest High-Level Conference on Combating Discrimination and Promoting Mutual Respect and Understanding; and the 2010 Astana High-Level Conference on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination; the 2011 Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting on "Prevention of Racism, Xenophobia and Hate

The 2013 High-Level Conference aimed to achieve the following objectives:

1. Review follow-up steps taken to the 2010 conference and assess progress made since then.
2. Review and assess progress and challenges faced by participating States in implementing their commitments in the area of tolerance and non-discrimination, taking into account the inter-dependence of commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination and fundamental rights and freedoms, including freedom of movement, freedom of religion or belief, freedom of expression, freedom of assembly and freedom of association.
3. Share examples of good initiatives and lessons learned to combat intolerance and discrimination, including in the area of legislation and law enforcement, and to promote mutual respect and understanding through education and dialogue among communities.
4. Exchange examples of good practices with regard to international co-operation in this area, including co-operation involving OSCE structures and other inter-governmental organizations.
5. Identify recommendations for OSCE participating States to combat intolerance and promote mutual respect and understanding, including through human rights youth education.

The conference started with an opening ceremony followed by an opening plenary session, after which six plenary sessions were held over the course of 1 ½ days. Plenary sessions one, two, three and four were held on Tuesday, 21 May, and fell under part one of the High-Level Conference (Comprehensive approach to combating intolerance and discrimination). Part two (The way forward: Preventing and responding to intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes. Promoting mutual respect and understanding) was held on Wednesday, 22 May, and consisted of two plenary sessions. The conference concluded with a closing plenary session.

Documents related to the event, including statements by participants, are available on the High-Level Conference website.¹³

Crimes through Education and Awareness Raising Initiatives”; and the 2012 Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting on “Combating Racism, Intolerance and Discrimination in Society through Sport”.

¹³ The website is: http://www.osce.org/event/hltnd_2013

II. SUMMARY OF THE SESSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Opening ceremony: Welcoming remarks and formal opening of the Conference

The High-Level Conference was officially opened by the First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine, *H.E. Mr. Yevhen Sulima*.¹⁴ Thereafter, *H.E. Mr. Sali Berisha*, the Prime Minister of Albania, gave his opening remarks.

Opening plenary session: Combating intolerance and discrimination in the OSCE area. Implementation of the relevant OSCE commitments

The moderator of the opening plenary session was the Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council, *H.E. Ambassador Ihor Prokopchuk*. Opening remarks for the opening plenary session were provided by:

- *H.E. Mr. Aldo Bumçi*, Minister of Foreign Affairs, Albania
- *H.E. Mr. Adam Kobieracki*, Director of the OSCE Conflict Prevention Centre
- *Mr. Douglas Wake*, First Deputy Director, ODIHR
- *Mr. Roberto Battelli*, OSCE Parliamentary Assembly Treasurer and Special Representative on South East Europe

These remarks were followed by formal statements from the following delegations to the OSCE: European Union, Kazakhstan, Switzerland, Holy See, Canada, Russian Federation, United States, Turkey and Norway.¹⁵

¹⁴ The full text of his statement is available in Russian here: <http://www.osce.org/ru/cio/101894>

¹⁵ The full text of these statements are available here:
http://www.osce.org/event/hltnd_2013?view=conference_documents&display=page_4&arg=101273&session=101454

Part 1. Comprehensive approach to combating intolerance and discrimination

Plenary session 1: Combating intolerance and discrimination against any person, including racism, xenophobia and aggressive nationalism, in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments

Moderator: *Mr. Douglas Wake*, First Deputy Director, ODIHR

Introducers: *H.E. Mr. François Zimeray*, Ambassador at Large for Human Rights, France

Mr. Dennis van der Veur, Head of Sector Equality, Equality and Citizens' Rights Department, Fundamental Rights Agency

Ms. Saodat Olimova, Research Center SHARQ

Mr. Valery Engel, Vice-President, International Human Rights Movement "World without Nazism"

The first plenary session was devoted to the topic of intolerance and discrimination against any person, including racism, xenophobia, and aggressive nationalism. Participants agreed that no part of the OSCE region is immune from manifestations of intolerance and discrimination, and that many individuals and groups are subject to threats or acts of discrimination, hostility or violence as a result of their racial, ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious identity or their sexual orientation. It was acknowledged that the fulfilment of OSCE commitments continues to be a problem for participating States and that all forms of discrimination must be addressed, i.e., there is no hierarchy between various forms of intolerance. Engaging civil society to support States in the implementation of commitments was deemed crucial.

The global economic crisis was cited as fuelling new forms of intolerance and discrimination. One delegation suggested that the economic crisis has contributed towards attacks against migrants and other vulnerable groups, such as so-called 'visible' minorities. In general, several participants pointed out that discrimination faced by migrants in the area of employment, education and health had worsened in the wake of the ongoing crisis.

The dire situation of the Roma across the OSCE region was highlighted as an area of particular concern, especially during the year marking the tenth anniversary of the OSCE Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area. Roma people across the OSCE region were described as being victims of discrimination, alienation, segregation, exclusion and violent attacks. The absence of real progress of the integration policies and measures developed by various inter-governmental and non-governmental actors was alluded to by some speakers. One speaker reminded the conference that the primary responsibility for ensuring equality of Roma lies with governments.

Intolerance against Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transgender (LGBT) persons was emphasized as an issue of concern by some participants. Several examples of hate-motivated crimes against LGBT persons were presented by participants to illustrate the level of violence suffered by these groups. Underreporting was highlighted as particularly problematic for this group of victims. One delegation stressed that sexual orientation did not belong to the same realm as racism, xenophobia or religious

intolerance. Some delegations emphasized their commitment not to establish any hierarchy of victims and to protect each and every citizen without distinction.

Persons with disabilities were highlighted as another vulnerable group of concern. In the OSCE region, persons with disabilities face continuing challenges, including the lack of legal protections in a number of countries or weak enforcement of such protections. Concern was raised about the high levels of stigma and discrimination faced by persons with disabilities, and the high incidence of hate crimes on the basis of disability.

Numerous participants drew attention to the perceived rise in aggressive nationalism. The current situation was described as threatening and worrying, and some participants called for attention to be paid to the recent political gains by neo-Nazi groups in the OSCE region. Authorities from several participating States were criticized for denying the existence of racism and discrimination in their countries. In those countries, civil society organizations, point to cases of racism and direct or indirect discrimination against different types of minorities. One participant expressed the opinion that some countries have seen nationalism and intolerance grow in recent decades. One delegation remarked that, in spite of the major efforts made by States and societies within the OSCE region, aggressive nationalism, intolerance and discrimination are worsening and that these phenomenon in the OSCE area and will pose challenges to democracy and democratic institutions if not addressed.

It was pointed out that it is important to uncover the connections between intolerant discourse and racism/hate crimes. Some participants called for the enactment of hate speech legislation, while others emphasized the role of counter speech as an effective response to hate speech. One participant emphasized that hate speech legislation should not affect freedom of expression, and that the prevention of intolerant discourse cannot result in establishing a right to be free from criticism or all adverse comment. It was stressed that it is the responsibility of the state to take the lead in confronting and responding to racism, xenophobia and intolerance, and that education is key to combating racism and xenophobia and providing young people with a “moral compass”. An inclusive learning environment in kindergartens and schools that is free of racism, discrimination, bullying and violence, and an education system that reflects the diversity of the population is essential. Other good practices to combat racism and xenophobia, foster inclusion of diverse populations, and prevent and prosecute hate crimes were shared.

Among the recommendations to participating States and OSCE institutions were the following:

To participating States:

- Consider adopting a Ministerial Council Decision in Kyiv reaffirming their commitment to combating intolerance and discrimination;
- Consider developing a relevant action plan aimed at combatting racism and xenophobia in the OSCE region;
- Deploy new technologies in the promotion of tolerance and non-discrimination;
- Effectively employ the use of counter-speech in response to hate speech and aggressive nationalism;

- Encourage inclusive learning environments focused on long-term efforts to properly combat discrimination and promote equality and promote educational and awareness-raising programs for combating intolerant discourse;
- Adopt and implement administrative and legislative measures, including the establishment of independent national institutions specialised in combating discrimination and promoting equality;
- Devote greater attention to campaigning against the dissemination of ideas based on racial supremacy or hatred and to promoting values such as equality, non-discrimination, diversity and democracy and promote public events against intolerance and discrimination, such as festivals, sporting contests, trade fairs and public holidays;
- Counter prejudice and misrepresentation in society, particularly targeting youth, in order to build up their understanding of the need for tolerance and the importance of reconciliation and peaceful coexistence;

For the OSCE and its institutions:

- Enhance coordination between the three Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on combating intolerance and discrimination and ensure a more balanced level of effort in their work;
- Develop a more holistic approach in order to define the role of the OSCE in the prevention of mass atrocities such as crimes against humanity and genocide;
- Increase co-ordination with the UN and the Council of Europe to overcome challenges presented by intolerance and discriminatory attitudes against different groups within multi-cultural societies;
- Strongly reject and condemn all manifestations of racism, xenophobia, discrimination and intolerance, including against LGBT people;
- To collect and disseminate information on States' efforts to improve the situation of Roma, including information on budgets and strategies for Roma inclusion in the planning and implementation of state-sponsored projects;
- The Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office and the Representative on Freedom of the Media, should stress the role and responsibility of political leaders and representatives, as well as the media, in combating manifestations of intolerance and hatred;

Plenary session 2: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions

Moderator: *H.E. Ambassador Tetiana Izhevskaya*, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also Focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

Introducers: *Dr. Gudrun Kugler*, Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians
Mr. Jehangir Sarosh, Inter-faith representative of the Zoroastrian Trust Funds of Europe

The second plenary session was devoted to the issue of combating intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions. Among the topics most raised were: discrimination, freedom of religion or belief as well as hate crimes targeting Christians.

A number of participants expressed concern about hate crimes targeting Christians both inside and outside the OSCE region. Some participants noted that under-reporting remains a challenge. Some participants also drew attention to incidents of damage of places of worship as well as to the destruction of symbols of Christian worship. The role of law enforcement agencies in protecting Christian sites of worship was stressed.

It was emphasized by several participants that Christians suffer discrimination even in places where they constitute the majority. Some participants specifically drew attention to the situation of minority Christian populations in OSCE participating States. It was noted that manifestations of intolerance towards Christians pose a serious threat to freedom of religion or belief. Some participants reported that Christians are faced with restrictions and limitations in the context of housing and employment. Others noted challenges with regard to the registration of religious communities. Difficulties in obtaining visas for Christian missionaries as well as restrictions on distributing religious material were also mentioned by some participants.

A number of delegations stated that freedom of religion or belief is a fundamental right which everyone is entitled to exercise. It was noted that the aim of freedom of religion or belief is to protect the rights of all persons to exercise the religion or belief of their individual choice, not to protect religions as such. It was also stressed that freedom of religion or belief may never be used to justify or condone the violation of human rights. One delegation emphasized that the right to freedom of religion or belief also encompassed the choice to not have a religion.

Some participants noted challenges related to intolerant public discourse and negative stereotyping of Christians. Several participants recalled that while promoting freedom of religion or belief, freedom of expression must not be limited. Another delegation explained that the response to hateful speech should be to speak out against it.

Many participants underlined the importance of inter-faith dialogue mechanisms. Such mechanisms can help build constructive relationships between different communities,

but they also serve as a way to hold policymakers accountable. The specific contribution of Christianity to the building and well-being of democratic societies was also highlighted. Participants also underlined the important role of religious leaders in the area of promoting tolerance and mutual respect and understanding.

Finally, one delegation expressed concern about a negative trend, with new values emerging that undermine the role of traditional religions, and called for a response to that.

Among the recommendations to participating States and OSCE institutions were the following:

To participating States:

- Collect and disaggregate data on hate crimes against Christians and submit the data to ODIHR;
- Investigate and prosecute incidents of desecration of places of worship as well as the destruction of symbols of Christian worship;
- Respect the autonomy of religious communities to associate freely and to exercise their religion or belief;
- Guarantee the right to well-defined conscientious objection in relation to morally sensitive matters;
- Respect the right of parents to ensure education and teaching in conformity with their own religious and philosophical convictions;
- Recognize the role of religious communities in fighting intolerance and hate crimes and draw on their expertise in this regard;
- Protect human rights defenders who strive to uphold freedom of religion or belief;
- Co-operate with the three Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office to promote greater tolerance and combat racism, xenophobia and discrimination and invite them to conduct country visits and follow-up on their recommendations;
- Draw on the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities, the OSCE field missions and the three Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office.

To the OSCE and its institutions:

- Engage with religious communities and recognize the role of interfaith mechanisms to combat intolerance and discrimination;
- Pay attention to discrimination of Christians at the workplace and to intolerance discourse against Christians;
- Organize a separate event focusing on trends undermining traditional religions.

Plenary session 3: Combating anti-Semitism

Moderator: *H.E. Ms. Edith Harxhi*, Deputy Foreign Minister of Albania

Introducers: *Dr. Mario Silva*, Chair of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance
Rabbi Andrew Baker, Personal Representative of the OSCE
 Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism

The third plenary Session was devoted to the issue of combating anti-Semitism. The session focused on challenges such as violent manifestations of anti-Semitism as well as manifestations of Holocaust denial. Several participants pointed out the upcoming anniversary of the 2004 Berlin Declaration on anti-Semitism and called on participating States to renew and implement their commitments to combatting anti-Semitism. Several speakers characterized anti-Semitism not as a Jewish problem, but as a problem that needs to be unequivocally condemned by governments and society at large.

Several participants expressed concern about violent manifestations of anti-Semitism and highlighted the high number of anti-Semitic hate crimes that occur in some OSCE participating States. Several participants emphasized that under-reporting continues to be a challenge and stressed that there is a need for more data on anti-Semitic hate crimes. Some participants stressed widespread feelings of insecurity among Jewish communities and referenced the results of the forthcoming anti-Semitism survey by the European Union's Fundamental Rights Agency. One participant expressed concern about the effect security challenges may have on the religious life of communities and called on governments to recognize these security challenges. The June 13 Expert Conference "Addressing the Security Needs of Jewish Communities in the OSCE Region: Challenges and Good Practices" co-organized by the OSCE Chairmanship and ODIHR was mentioned by several participants.

Participants also identified anti-Semitic discourse as a major challenge, noting that hate speech often forms the backdrop to violent anti-Semitic attacks. One participant stressed the role of the Internet as a medium to incite hatred without fear of repercussion. Another participant stressed the need to prosecute threats under criminal law. Several participants expressed concern about the rise of extremist anti-Semitic movements in the OSCE region, noting that these movements also target other minority groups. Some participants also expressed concern about the rise of anti-Semitic parties in some OSCE participating States. Participants engaged with both traditional anti-Semitic stereotypes as well as with the vilification of Jews in the context of debates about Israel. In this regard, one speaker recalled the Berlin Declaration and stressed that developments in the Middle East never justify anti-Semitism. It was also noted that the economic crisis may play a role in giving rise to anti-Semitism and xenophobia.

Several participants referred to the Holocaust in their interventions, including by referencing the Stockholm Declaration and by highlighting the issue of restitution of property. Several participants condemned manifestations of Holocaust denial. One delegation noted that the Holocaust began with hateful speech and the dehumanization of Jews. Others referenced a survey which reveals that many respondents believe Jews

wish to benefit from the Holocaust. One speaker noted that unequivocally condemning contemporary manifestations of anti-Semitism, including Holocaust denial, is the best way to honour the victims of the Holocaust. It was stressed that Holocaust remembrance can serve as a tool for governments to effectively combat anti-Semitism. Others also stressed the importance of education as well as the critical role of the media. Several speakers stressed the importance of counter-speech and called on political representatives and civil society to speak out against anti-Semitism.

One participant expressed concern about attempts to limit and curtail the practice of ritual circumcision and ritual slaughter in some OSCE participating States, noting that this is an issue that connects Muslim and Jewish communities.

Some participants stressed the need for co-operation between governments, communities and civil society in combating anti-Semitism. Several delegations referenced the work of ODIHR and expressed support for the Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office.

Among the recommendations to participating States and OSCE institutions were the following:

To participating States:

- Recommit to combating anti-Semitism, drawing upon the Berlin Declaration of 2004;
- Implement existing OSCE commitments on combating anti-Semitism;
- Improve hate crime data collection systems and investigate and fully prosecute any act and/or threat of violence motivated by hatred or racism;
- Hold perpetrators of threats and violence accountable under criminal law;
- Unequivocally condemn anti-Semitism and challenge extremists that espouse such opinions with counter-speech;
- Make counter-speech and other effective strategies for marginalizing voices of intolerance a key part of a comprehensive strategy to combat anti-Semitism;
- Recognize that the Holocaust is not a mere historical event and that diminishing or denying the Holocaust is a manifestation of anti-Semitism;
- Join, if they have not done so already, the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance and thereby recognize the universality of the Holocaust;
- Establish a Holocaust Memorial Day;
- Support the three Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office to promote greater tolerance and combat racism, xenophobia and discrimination and invite them to conduct country visits;
- Work together with civil society and different religious communities to combat anti-Semitism;

To the OSCE and its institutions:

- Organize a review conference on anti-Semitism in 2014

Plenary session 4: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims

Moderator: *H.E. Ambassador Tacan İldem*, Permanent Representative of Turkey to the OSCE

Introducers: *Ms. Engy Abdelkader*, ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief
Mr. Veysel Filiz, Spokesperson, European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion

The fourth plenary session was devoted to the issue of combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. Discussions focused on the need for public authorities to send a message to society that manifestations of intolerance and discrimination against Muslims are not acceptable. Participants raised concerns about the prohibition of headscarves in public, banning of minarets, obstacles to the establishment of mosques and initiatives to prevent Muslims from observing some of their religious practices, such as circumcision and halal slaughtering. Discrimination and exclusion of Muslim women and young people in employment and education were mentioned as particularly worrying manifestations of intolerance across the OSCE region. Discriminatory counter-terrorism measures and misguided integration policies were identified as main causes of this problem.

A number of interventions were related to the promotion and protection of freedom of religion or belief within the context of combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. One participant asserted that legal measures forbidding to bear religious symbols in public or the workplace violate freedom of religion or belief. Some participants condemned the use of anti-extremism legislation in order to justify raids on religious organizations, ban religious literature and restrict the freedom of worship of certain Muslim communities.

Several participants drew attention to the prevalence of hate crimes against Muslims across the OSCE region. Some stressed that the effects of such acts of violence were exacerbated by the fact that they were taking place in a climate of hostility towards Muslims, as expressed in the media and political discourse for example. Many participants stated that intolerant discourse that goes unchallenged erodes the confidence of victims of hate crimes to report to the authorities and seek justice.

In this regard, participants underlined the need for authorities to take stronger positions against anti-Muslim hate speech. Some participants expressed concerns over the uneven implementation of existing hate speech laws. Some others also stressed that political figures and media professionals should show more leadership to counter hate speech. In addition, there were several interventions concerning the importance of educational means and awareness-raising campaigns in countering negative stereotyping of Muslims.

Moreover, some participants expressed their disappointment that the majority of participating States failed to provide hate crime data to ODIHR, making it difficult to gain an accurate picture of the problem. Some others also pointed out the lack of capacity of community-based organizations to systematically monitor and address hate crime against Muslims. For this reason, they called for States to support civil society

initiatives combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. Participants also identified the need for countering anti-Muslim stereotypes among law enforcement officers and enhance co-operation between the police and communities to combat hate crimes.

Throughout the discussion, participants highlighted a number of good practices combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. These included several inter-community initiatives, such as public campaigns to stop bigotry and promote pluralism, joint declarations of religious leaders condemning hate speech, and partnerships to promote freedom of religion or belief and protection against discrimination. Some participants also provided examples of effective implementation of hate crime legislation and provided information instances in which political representatives and public figures took the leadership to counter expressions of anti-Muslim hatred.

Several delegations referenced the work of ODIHR and expressed support for the Personal Representatives of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office. A number of participants commented on the *Guidelines for Educators on Countering Intolerance against Muslims*.¹⁶

Among the recommendations to participating States and OSCE institutions were the following:

To participating States:

- Prevent violations against religious freedom by enacting and implementing anti-discrimination legislation;
- Create proper enforcement mechanisms facilitating the effective collection of complaints, provision of legal support to victims and avenues of redress and sanctions for discriminatory conduct;
- Develop and implement policies to effectively prevent and respond to hate crimes against Muslims, by adopting necessary legislative and administrative frameworks, training law enforcement officers as well as collecting and maintaining disaggregated data;
- Intensify the exchange of best practices in combating intolerance and discrimination towards Muslims, including examples of good cooperation between Muslim communities and law enforcement officers in combating hate crimes against Muslims;
- Develop training programs on intolerance and discrimination against Muslims for law enforcement officers, other public officials, and teachers, clergy and imams with support of ODIHR as appropriate;
- Increase co-operation to address intolerant public discourse concerning Muslims, including by political leaders, in the media, and on the internet;
- Support civil society initiatives combating intolerance against Muslims in the areas of anti-discrimination legislation, promotion of freedom of religion or belief, inter-faith dialogue, combating hate crimes and education;

¹⁶ Published by ODIHR, UNESCO and Council of Europe in five languages: English, French, German, Russian and Spanish

- Support and increase funding for the work of the ODIHR and the three Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office on combating intolerance and discrimination;
- Consider calling for the elaboration of an OSCE action plan on tolerance and non-discrimination into a possible draft decision on tolerance and non-discrimination for the Kyiv Ministerial Council.

To the OSCE and its institutions:

- ODIHR and the Representative on Freedom of the Media should enhance their collaboration in addressing anti-Muslim media activities, biased reporting and negative stereotyping;
- ODIHR should supporting participating States in the development and implementation of training programs on intolerance and discrimination against Muslims for law enforcement officers, other public officials, as well as teachers, clergy and imams;
- Following the expert Conference on the Security Needs of Jewish Communities,¹⁷ ODIHR should take the lead to hold a similar event with a particular focus on enhancing police-community co-operation in combating hate crimes against Muslims;
- OSCE should hold a high-level conference pertaining to intolerance and discrimination against Muslims in 2014.

17

Part 2. The way forward: Preventing and responding to intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes. Promoting mutual respect and understanding

Plenary session 5: The role of human rights youth education in promoting mutual understanding and respect for diversity in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments

Moderator: *Ms. Floriane Hohenberg*, Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, ODIHR

Introducers: *H.E. Mr. Yevhen Sulima*, First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine
H.E. Mr. Myqerem Tafaj, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Education and Science of Albania
H.E. Ambassador Blanka Jamnišek, Permanent Representative of the Republic of Slovenia to the UN, OSCE and other International Organisations in Vienna

The fifth plenary session was dedicated to the role of human rights youth education in promoting mutual understanding and respect for diversity in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments. First of all, the conference recalled in many instances that all persons, in virtue of their dignity as human beings, have an inalienable right to education. Participants stressed the importance of human rights education and youth education in combating intolerant and discriminatory attitudes. The exposure of young people from early on to the principles and values of human rights and fundamental freedoms was underlined by one of the speakers as crucial to eradicate the seeds of intolerance. The role of the family in this process was highlighted by some participants as worthy careful considerations. Some participants emphasized the role of human rights youth education in preventing conflicts and building confidence. Several participants underlined the positive role played by inter-governmental agencies, including the OSCE, in raising awareness of this subject and providing fora for exchanging experiences across the OSCE region.

Many participants stressed the importance of schools as melting-pots of cohabitation that can provide ideal venues for promoting tolerance and respect for diversity. They suggested that educational programs should promote values such as peace, non-discrimination, equality, justice, non-violence, tolerance and respect for human dignity. They also highlighted the importance of imparting knowledge about different religions, cultures and ethnicities in school to reduce misunderstandings and stereotypes. Referring to successful national initiatives against bullying based on race, color, national origin, sex or disability, some participants recalled that robust laws and policies in this area are of crucial importance.

Many participants underlined that xenophobia, racism and intolerant attitudes stemmed from prejudices which were learned at an early age. They pointed to the key importance of educational curricula and teaching methods in promoting mutual respect, understanding and the value of diversity. They discussed the important role of exchanging best practices, highlighting that history books should be continuously reviewed with the aim of removing statements which could inspire prejudice.

Participants also discussed the need for countering violent extremism and neo-Nazi movements across the OSCE region by educational means. One participant underlined the importance of using both formal and informal educational methods. Drawing attention to the challenges posed by digital media, another one raised concerns over the spread of ideologies on the Internet and expressed the need for empowering young people to counter hate on the Internet.

Some other participants stressed that the OSCE has mainstreamed human rights education in the realm of commemorating victims of past genocides, especially the Holocaust, and pointed out that such work was essential to protect future generations from such tragedies. They further welcomed the OSCE's efforts related to reconciliation, emphasizing in this context that work at the societal level cannot yield results without the necessary political will.

Moreover, there were interventions providing information on national educational initiatives addressing specific forms of intolerance, such as anti-Semitism and discrimination against Roma. Participants also expressed their appreciation for ODIHR's educational materials to address anti-Semitism, intolerance against Muslims and promote remembrance of the Holocaust.

Among the recommendations to participating States and OSCE institutions were the following:

To participating States:

- Strengthen the commitments in the field of human rights education for youth;
- Implement OSCE commitments systematically to empower the young generation;
- Develop a comprehensive OSCE Action Plan for Human Rights Education and Tolerance Building;
- When developing educational programs, respect the right of parents to ensure the religious and moral education of their children in conformity with their own convictions;
- Provide non-punitive and non-discriminatory opt-out possibilities in cases when ethical or religious education in schools is compulsory;
- Mainstream the issue of reconciliation into a possible draft decision on tolerance and non-discrimination for the Kyiv Ministerial Council.¹⁸

To the OSCE and its institutions:

- ODIHR, in cooperation with the Representative on Freedom of the Media, should organize a seminar on hate crimes and conduct an expert assessment on the subject in order to determine possible countermeasures;
- ODIHR should build on the *Guidelines for Educators in Combating Discrimination against Muslims* by placing stronger emphasis on activities involving the training of teachers and educators.

¹⁸

2013.

The 20th meeting of the OSCE Ministerial Council will take place in Kyiv on 5-6 December

Plenary session 6: The role of political leadership, legislation, law enforcement, data collection, and civil society in combating and preventing intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes

Moderator: *Mr. Michael Schmunk*, Deputy Head of the Permanent Mission of Germany to the OSCE

Introducers: *H.E. Ambassador Harald Neple*, Special Envoy for Minorities, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Norway
Mr. Paul LeGendre, Director, Fighting Discrimination Programme, Human Rights First

The final plenary session dealt with a wide range of issues. Discussions focused on measures to effectively prevent and respond to intolerance and discrimination, including hate crime as well as the role of civil society coalitions in gaining a better understanding of the prevalence of hate crime.

Many speakers recalled the existing OSCE commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination, in particular hate crime and the OSCE Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area. While praising the progress that has been achieved in many countries in this area, some participants expressed concerns that governments are not fully implementing the commitments. Many speakers called on participating States who have not done so to enact legislation to address discrimination and hate crimes and to adopt comprehensive strategies to prevent and respond to intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes.

While some speakers acknowledged positive developments in combating intolerance and discrimination including hate crimes, most interventions underlined that manifestations of intolerance, including hate speech, remain widespread across the OSCE region. Individuals are targeted and become victims of hate crimes because of their real or perceived religion, race, gender, gender identity, disability or sexual orientation. Many participants commented on the lack of reliable data and underlined the necessity to record disaggregated data on discrimination and hate crimes. One speaker deplored that many participating States do not submit data to ODIHR for the preparation of its annual report on hate crime and that, therefore, the only available information, in particular on hate crimes targeting Roma and LGBT, is provided by civil society. There was an emphasis on the need to set up official mechanisms to collect reliable, comprehensive and comparable data in order to gather an accurate picture of the situation and to formulate effective policy responses.

Many delegations stressed the important role of civil society and representatives of minority groups as partners in combating, responding to and reporting hate crimes, intolerance and discrimination. One speaker emphasized the importance for States to reach out to civil society groups to develop educational programs on tolerance and non-discrimination. Many participants underlined that civil society should contribute to reports by collecting data on bias-motivated incidents. The invaluable contribution of civil society groups representing or assisting victims and raising awareness about their situation was stressed several times.

The plenary session also included discussions about the important role of law enforcement. Several speakers pointed out the need for more specialized training activities for law enforcement on recognizing, investigating and recording hate crimes and other forms of discrimination. Some speakers expressed appreciation for ODIHR's Training against Hate Crimes for Law Enforcement (TAHCLE) programme and its annual meeting of the National Points of Contact on Hate Crime.

The role of the media was another issue discussed at this plenary session. Some participants underlined the important role of the media in combating discrimination and promoting tolerance and mutual respect. Others mentioned the need for the introduction of ethical journalism, highlighting that the media should always report facts in context. Some delegations noted the difficulty in finding the right balance between safeguarding such fundamental rights as freedom of expression and opinion, and fighting against intolerance, discrimination, hate crime and hate speech.

Most participants agreed that political leaders play an important role in demonstrating consistent leadership by publicly standing against discrimination and hate crime and by developing and implementing action plans to combat discrimination, hate crime and related forms of intolerance. Many speakers noted politicians, national human rights institutions, civil society need to engage in discussion on these issues.

Among the recommendations to participating States and OSCE institutions were the following:

To participating States:

- Adopt a comprehensive approach to combat intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes committed on the grounds of religion, race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, disabilities or other status;
- Enact legislation on discrimination incidents and bias-motivated crime;
- Engage in a consistent manner with civil society and other relevant stakeholders to support capacity-building for civil society;
- Develop educational programmes on tolerance and non-discrimination and implement systems to train law enforcement officers, civil society and media;
- Maintain and improve data collection and monitoring systems, collect disaggregated data and report on bias-motivated incidents and provide data to ODIHR;
- Ensure that political leadership refrains from hate speech and publicly condemns cases of intolerance, hate crimes and discrimination;
- Support adequate resources and policy for effective investigation and prosecution to address hate crime;
- Offer necessary assistance to victims of discrimination and hate crimes;
- Make use of ODIHR's educational guidelines and implement ODIHR's training programme for law enforcement to combat intolerance, discrimination and hate crimes;
- Support national points of contact on combating hate crimes and ensure participation in annual meetings.

To the OSCE and its institutions:

- ODIHR should continue assisting participating States through the TAHCLE programme and devote more resources to training civil society on tolerance, non-discrimination and responding to hate crimes.
- ODIHR should continue collecting data on bias-motivated incidents.

Closing plenary session

The closing plenary session offered a final opportunity for participants to comment on conclusions and recommendations emerging from the High-Level Conference.

The highlight of the session was a statement by Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council, *H.E. Ambassador Ihor Prokopchuk*.

Closing remarks were given by the European Union, Russian Federation, United States, Turkey, and Norway. The full statements are available on the High-Level Conference website.¹⁹

¹⁹ The website is: http://www.osce.org/event/hlnd_2013

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1. Biographical Information on Keynote Speakers, Introducers and Moderators

Opening plenary session: Combating intolerance and discrimination in the OSCE area. Implementation of the relevant OSCE commitments

H.E. Ambassador Ihor Prokopchuk, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

Ambassador Ihor Prokopchuk is currently Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council. He is a career diplomat who joined the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Ukraine in 1992. In 1997-1998, Ambassador Prokopchuk was appointed Adviser of the President of the 52th UN General Assembly. From 2004 to 2008, Ambassador Prokopchuk served successively as Director of the Third Territorial Department, Deputy Director-General of the Second Territorial Directorate and Director-General of the Fourth Territorial Directorate (Central and Eastern Europe, the Balkans, South Caucasus and Turkey). In 2008 he was appointed Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of Ukraine to the Republic of Lithuania. In 2010 he was appointed as Permanent Representative of Ukraine to the International Organizations in Vienna. He graduated in 1992 from Kyiv State University.

H.E. Mr. Aldo Bumçi, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Albania

Mr. Bumçi was appointed as a Minister of Foreign Affairs in April 2013. Previously he served as Minister of Tourism, Culture, Youth and Sports (2011 – 2013) and the country's Minister of Justice in the government of Prime Minister Sali Berisha. He holds a degree in international relations from the Eastern Mediterranean University in Famagusta and Bilkent University in Ankara. Mr. Bumçi is a fellow of the Open Society Institution (SOROS) conducting research on “Cross-border relations between Albania and Montenegro”. Mr. Bumçi is an author of numerous articles and publications including “Regional perspectives for an independent Kosovo-Albania and Macedonia”, “Albania in search of security”, “Macedonia and Albania: Borders of ethnic policy”.²⁰

H.E. Ambassador Adam Kobieracki, Director of the OSCE Conflict Prevention Centre

Ambassador Adam Kobieracki currently serves as Director of the OSCE Conflict Prevention Centre (appointed in June 2011) and Deputy Head of the OSCE Secretariat. He is a Polish career diplomat, specializing in international security and arms control. He was Permanent Representative of Poland to the OSCE and UN in Vienna 1997-2000. In the years 2001-2003 and 2008-2011, he was Director of the Security Policy Department in the Polish Ministry of Foreign Affairs. From 2003 to 2007 he was NATO Assistant Secretary General for Operations. He graduated in 1982 from the Moscow State Institute of International Relations.

Mr. Douglas Wake, First Deputy Director, ODIHR

²⁰ All references to Kosovo are consistent with UN Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to status.

Mr. Douglas Wake has been ODIHR's First Deputy Director since July 2009. Before assuming this position, Mr. Wake served as a senior Foreign Service officer for the United States Department of State. He focused much of his diplomatic career on European security, human rights, transition processes in Central Europe and Eurasia, post-conflict stabilization, and multilateral organizations. His experience with the Helsinki process began as a member of the U.S. delegation to the Vienna follow-up meeting of the Conference on Security and Co-operation (CSCE) in the 1980s. He subsequently served as OSCE co-ordinator in the U.S. Department of State (from 2003 to 2004) and as deputy head of the OSCE Mission to Serbia and Montenegro (from 2004 to 2006). He also served in Washington, Stockholm, New York, Leningrad, Rangoon, Riga, and Moscow.

Mr. Roberto Battelli, OSCE PA Treasurer and Special Representative on South East Europe

Roberto Battelli was elected Treasurer of the Assembly at the Vilnius Annual Session in 2009 and was re-elected in 2011. Since becoming a member of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly in 1992, Mr. Battelli has been particularly active in election observation. He has observed 19 elections across the OSCE area, and has served as head of the OSCE PA delegation and as Special Co-ordinator of the OSCE short-term observers in Serbia, Montenegro, and the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia. In the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, Mr. Battelli has been active in the Democracy Team for Moldova, the Sub-committee on Rules of Procedure, and the Sub-committee on Transparency and Accountability. In addition to serving as Treasurer, he is also currently the OSCE PA's Special Representative on South East Europe, a position he has held since 2006. Mr. Battelli has been a member of the National Assembly of the Republic of Slovenia since 1990, where he is a member of the parliamentary expert group responsible for drafting the Constitution of the Republic of Slovenia.

Plenary session I: Combating intolerance and discrimination against any person, including racism, xenophobia and aggressive nationalism, in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments

Mr. Douglas Wake, First Deputy Director, ODIHR

See above

H.E. Ambassador Francois Zimeray, French Ambassador-at-Large for Human Rights

Ambassador Zimeray was appointed Ambassador-at-Large for Human Rights in February 2008. He has been the first non-career diplomat to hold this position since its creation. He was elected to present France's Universal Periodic Review (UPR) at the Human Rights Council in 2008, as well as to represent France to the Alliance of Civilizations. Ambassador Zimeray was a Member of the European Parliament from 1999 to 2004 and a member of the Foreign Affairs & Defense Policy Committee. During his mandate, he participated in drafting the Charter of Fundamental Rights. As Ambassador in charge of Holocaust issues, Ambassador Zimeray has launched initiatives to raise awareness about contemporary anti-Semitism. Ambassador Zimeray is a trained lawyer who represented plaintiffs before the European Court of Human Rights and has a proven track record in supporting civil society initiatives to promote and protect human rights.

Mr. Dennis van der Veur, Head of Sector Equality, Equality and Citizens' Rights Department, European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights

Before joining the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA), Mr. van der Veur served as an Adviser to the Council of Europe's Commissioner for Human Rights and as a Monitoring Officer at the OSCE Office of Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR). His areas of expertise include equality, hate crime, civil society, and networking as well as lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) communities. He has written articles, inter alia, on hate crime against LGBT persons and the policy response of international organizations. He has postgraduate degrees in educational sciences, University of Amsterdam and Human Rights/Democratisation, European Inter University Centre, Venice.

Ms. Saodat Olimova, Head of the Public Opinion Department, SHARQ, Tajikistan

Ms. Olimova is an Associate in the al-Farabi Carnegie Program on Central Asia and Head of the Public Opinion Department at the Sharq Research Center in Dushanbe, Tajikistan. She is an internationally recognized expert on labour migration, Islam and society, and political and social issues in Central Asia. Ms. Olimova holds a Ph.D. degree from the USSR Academy of Sciences, Institute of Philosophy. Before she joined the Sharq Research Center, Ms. Olimova was the Department Head and a Senior Researcher at the Tajik Academy of Sciences' Institute of World Economy and International Relations.

Mr. Valery Engel, Vice-President, International Human Rights Movement, World without Nazism

Mr. Engel graduated in history from the Moscow State Pedagogical and received his degree as a teacher of history, social sciences and law. He holds a Ph.D. degree from the Institute of Universal History of the Russian Academy of Science on the "Jewish Question in the Russian-American relations since the end of the 19th. - beginning of 20 centuries". Mr. Engel is an expert on human rights in international relations, as well as on Jewish history. For many years Mr. Engel has been an active member of the Jewish democratic movement. In October 1987 he initiated the creation of the Jewish Historical Society. Mr. Engel was also a president of the Association of Jewish Studies and Jewish Culture of the USSR, a vice-president of the Congress of the National Organizations of Russia, and a member of the Advisory Council on National-Cultural Autonomy of the Russian Government. He is an honorary doctor of the Department of Hebraic University of Sorbonne in Paris. From June 2010 Mr. Engel is a vice-chairman of the International Human Rights Movement "World Without Nazism".

Plenary session 2: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions

H.E. Ambassador Tetiana Izhevskaya, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also Focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

Ambassador Izhevskaya has been in the diplomatic service since 1990. She is currently Ambassador of Ukraine to the Holy See and to the Sovereign Military Order of Malta. She was previously Director-General for Cultural and Humanitarian Co-operation at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. She has been involved in activities related to gender

issues, national minorities, interethnic and inter-religious dialogue. She was a member of the Bureau of the Council of Europe Steering Committee on Culture, a member of the Committee on Equality, Vice President of the National Commission for UNESCO and general rapporteur for numerous international conferences. Ambassador Izhevskaya has been awarded the Grand Cross of the Order of Pius IX and the Order of Princess Olha.

Dr. Gudrun Kugler, Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians

Dr. Kugler is the founder of the Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians. In this function Mrs. Kugler is a member of the Fundamental Rights Platform Advisory Panel of the EU FRA. She was a Director of World Youth Alliance - Europe in Brussels and a co-founder of Kairos Consulting for Non Profit Initiatives in Vienna. Dr. Gudrun Kugler majored in Law, Women's Studies as well as Theological Studies on Marriage and the Family. She holds a Ph.D. in International Law. She worked as an Adjunct Professor at the International Theological Institute for Studies on Marriage and the Family in Vienna.

Mr. Jehangir Sarosh, Inter-faith representative of the Zoroastrian Trust Funds of Europe

Mr. Saraosh is an Inter-faith representative of the Zoroastrian Trust Funds of Europe (the principal body of the Zoroastrian community in Europe) and the World Zoroastrian Organisation. He has written internationally published papers on various subjects including Globalisation: Responsibility of Religions, Role of Media and Religions and is regularly invited to participate in regional and international meetings. He is a Zoroastrian, and has been President of the World Conference of Religion and Peace (Europe Region). He has also held the Co-chair of the Week of Prayer for World Peace and was an Executive Member of the Inter-Faith Network for United Kingdom (1994 – 2006) and the Chairman of the Watford Inter-faith Association (1975 – 1984 and 2003 – 2005). He is a former Executive Member of the World Congress of Faiths.

Plenary session 3: Combating anti-Semitism

H.E. Ms. Edith Harxhi, Deputy Foreign Minister of Albania

Ms. Harxhi was appointed as a Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Albania in 2005. Since then she covers bilateral diplomacy, multilateral diplomacy, regional affairs, international treaties, relations of the Republic of Albania and EU integration, and management of the Albanian diplomatic corp. Previously Ms Harxhi served as security policy advisor to the Kosovo Prime Ministers. She established the Office for Public Safety as well as prepared the strategy of the transfer of competencies in the security sector on behalf of the Kosovo Government. She is presently writing her Ph. D. thesis on “The Ethnic Conflicts and the Albanian Disorder in the Balkans”. Ms. Harxhi is author of the publication “An Invitation to Albania”, an overview of Albania’s Economy and Resources.

Dr. Mario Silva, Chair of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance, former Chair of the Enquiry Panel of the Canadian Parliamentary Coalition to Combat Antisemitism

Dr. Silva is a legal scholar and a former Canadian politician. Dr. Silva served as a Canadian Member of Parliament from 2004 to 2011. He holds a B.A. degree in

political science from the University of Toronto, a "Certificat de Langue Francaise" from Paris-Sorbonne University, and a Master's degree in International Human Rights Law from University of Oxford. Dr. Silva holds a Ph.D. in the Faculty of Law at the National University of Ireland, Galway. He was appointed to chair the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance in 2013. He also serves as the Honorary Chair of the International Forum of Rights and Security (IFFRAS). Dr. Silva chaired the inquiry panel of the Canadian Parliamentary Coalition to Combat Antisemitism (CPCCA), a multi-partisan group of MPs which has investigated the issue of anti-Semitism. He is a Vice-Chair of the CPCCA's Steering Committee, which organized an international conference on anti-Semitism in Ottawa in 2010.

Rabbi Andrew Baker, Personal Representative of the Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism

Rabbi Andrew Baker is director of International Jewish Affairs at the American Jewish Committee (AJC), which he joined in 1979. In January 2009 he was appointed the Personal Representative of the OSCE Chair-in Office on Combating Anti-Semitism. A leading expert on anti-Semitism in Europe, he travels extensively to strengthen relations between the AJC and Jewish communities worldwide. Throughout most of the 1990s, as director of European Affairs, Rabbi Baker promoted tolerance in the emerging democracies of Central and Eastern Europe. He is active in Holocaust restitution issues and in 2003 was awarded the Officer's Cross of the Order of Merit by Germany for his work in German-Jewish relations.

Plenary session 4: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims

H.E. Ambassador Tacan Ildem, Permanent Representative of Turkey to the OSCE

Ambassador Ildem was appointed as Permanent Representative of Turkey to OSCE in 2011. Previously, he occupied a post of the Director General for International Security Affairs at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Turkey. He joined the Ministry of Foreign Affairs as a Second Secretary at the NATO Department in 1978. He graduated from the Faculty of Political Science of Ankara University.

Ms. Engy Abdelkader, ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief

Ms. Engy Abdelkader serves as a member of ODIHR's Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief. Since 2011, she has been the Vice President of 'Karamah: Muslim Women Lawyers for Human Rights'. She conducts research and provides expert analysis on Muslims, Muslim women, post 9/11 civil rights and Islamic Law for the Institute of Social Policy and Understanding in Washington D.C. Between 2008 and 2012, Ms. Abdelkader was a Board Member of the Arab-American Anti-Discrimination Committee. In this role, she organized seminars on post-9/11 bias-based bullying, attended by state and federal government officials. For a short period in 2004, she was the Director of Civil Rights at the Council on American Islamic Relations.

Mr. Veysel Filiz, Spokesperson, European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion

Mr. Filiz joined civil society in 1992 in France through the "Conseil de la Jeunesse Pluriculturelle" (COJEP) 's activities and worked during many years as human right activist. He is a graduate from the University of Strasbourg on Turkish and

anthropology studies. Since 2010, Mr. Filiz is the Spokesperson of European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion (EMISCO), which is an international NGO based in Strasbourg and mainly focused on intolerance and discrimination, especially Islamophobia in Europe. His expertise on issues of multiculturalism, minority rights, citizenship and around Islamophobia is recognized by many organizations across Europe. After completing a three-year term as Vice-President of the Civil Society and Democracy Committee of the Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe, Mr. Filiz is its current Rapporteur.

Plenary session 5: The role of human rights youth education in promoting mutual understanding and respect for diversity in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments

Ms. Floriane Hohenberg, Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, ODIHR

Floriane Hohenberg has been working for ODIHR since 2005. She has acted as the Head of the Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department since 2009. From 2000 until 2004 she was the Head of the Representation in Germany of the French Commission for the Victims of Spoliation Resulting from the Anti-Semitic Legislation in Force during the Occupation. She co-authored a study commissioned by the French government on the extent of the confiscation of Jewish assets in France during World War II published in 1999.

H.E. Mr. Yevhen Sulima, First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine

Mr. Sulima is the First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine since 2010. Previously to this position, Mr. Sulima served as a Deputy Head of the Verkhovna Rada Secretariat in questions of budgeting. In 2004 he acquired Ph.D on the topic of "Global Social Order of Postindustrialization". Mr. Sulima is an author of a series of research works, editor and co-author of the Globalistics and Political Philosophy textbook for students of higher educational establishments. He is also a Corresponding Member of the National Academy of Pedagogical Sciences of Ukraine since 2010, and a member of the Supervisory Board of National University of Mines since 2011.

H.E. Myqerem Tafaj, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Education and Science of Albania

Mr. Tafaj was appointed as a Minister of Education and Science in 2009. In the course of 2005-2009, he served as an Advisor of Education and Science to the Prime Minister, holding also the post of Secretary General of the Council of Ministers during 2006-2007. In the framework of the Stability Pact and the European Union's PHARE program, he was selected as an expert on education policy in the Balkans. Mr. Tafaj is also a member of the "Albanian Humboldt Association League", Chairman of the Council of Higher Education and Science, Chairman of the Assessment Commission of Academic Titles. He also has been Chairman of the Experts Group on Reform of Scientific Research System.

H.E. Ambassador Blanka Jamničnik, Permanent Representative of the Republic of Slovenia to the UN, OSCE and other International Organisations in Vienna

Ambassador Blanka Jamnišek, M.A. graduated in Psychology at the University of Ljubljana and completed her Master of Arts Degree in International Politics in Brussels at the “Centre Européen de Recherches Internationales et Stratégiques”. In 1994 she held the post of the Head of Public Relations Office of the Ministry of Defense. In 1996 she joined the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, dealing with bilateral relations with the US, Canada, UK and Ireland. Later, Ms. Jamnišek led the Department of OSCE and Council of Europe. In 2011 she was appointed as Ambassador – Permanent Representative at the Permanent Representation of the Republic of Slovenia to UN, OSCE and other international organizations in Vienna. She is the author of the publication "OUR RIGHTS" – a human rights education tool for children, which was implemented during the Slovenian OSCE Chairmanship in 2005 and is still being used.

Plenary session 6: The role of political leadership, legislation, law enforcement, data collection, and civil society in combating and preventing intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes

Mr. Michael Schmunk, Deputy Head of the Permanent Mission of Germany to the OSCE

Previously to his current position as Deputy Head of the Permanent Mission of the Federal Republic of Germany to the OSCE in Vienna, Mr. Schmunk was Special Representative of the German Foreign Office and Ambassador-at-Large for Foreign and Security Policy Related Cooperation with Universities, Foundations and Think Tanks. He is the author of numerous publications and research regarding peace-, state- and nation-building; genocide and reconciliation; “protracted” territorial conflicts in the OSCE area; civil-military cooperation in post-conflict situations; Germany’s civil and military role in multilateral stabilization and reconstruction operations. Mr. Schmunk holds University Degrees in Law and Political Science. He started his career as a teaching and research fellow at the Political Science Department of the University of Bonn.

H.E. Ambassador Harald Neple, Special Envoy for Minorities, Section for Human Rights and Democracy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Norway

Ambassador Harald Neple holds a degree from the Norwegian School of Business and Administration. With a background from the Ministry of Trade and Shipping, Mr. Neple joined Norway’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 1977. He has held various positions in the Foreign Ministry and at embassies over the years, mainly focusing on trade issues and policies. From 2002-2006, Mr. Neple was director General in the Department for Trade Policy, Natural Resources and Environmental Affairs in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. During the period 2006-11 Mr. Neple was Norway’s Ambassador to the OECD, IEA and UNESCO in Paris. Mr. Neple served as Norway’s lead negotiator during the Rio +20 negotiations during the spring of 2012. Mr. Neple is currently Norway’s Special Envoy for Minorities, leading Norway’s Minority Project from the Ministry’s Section for Human Rights and Democracy.

Mr. Paul LeGendre, Director, Fighting Discrimination Programme, Human Rights First

As Director of the Fighting Discrimination Program, Paul LeGendre leads Human Rights First’s effort to combat discrimination by reversing the tide of anti-Semitic, anti-immigrant, homophobic, and anti-Muslim violence and reducing other bias crime

in Europe, the Russian Federation, and North America through research, analysis, and advocacy. Prior to joining Human Rights First, he worked for the Parliamentary Assembly of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe as Program Officer, providing staff support to the Assembly's work in Eastern Europe and Central Asia and to its General Committee on Human Rights and Humanitarian Questions. Mr. LeGendre also worked for the International League for Human Rights as Europe Program Coordinator, for the Committee to Protect Journalists as the Acting Program Coordinator for Europe, and for CAF-Russia, a Russian non-profit resource center, as Director of Publications. He has a B.A. in History from Boston College (1993) as well as a Master of International Affairs from Columbia University (2000).

ANNEX 2. Agenda

Tuesday, 21 May 2013

9:00-9:20 **Opening ceremony: Welcoming remarks and formal opening of the Conference**

H.E. Mr. Yevhen Sulima, First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine
H.E. Mr. Sali Berisha, Prime Minister of Albania

9:20-10:30 **Opening plenary session: Combating intolerance and discrimination in the OSCE area. Implementation of the relevant OSCE commitments**

Moderator: H.E. Ambassador Ihor Prokopchuk, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

Opening remarks by

- *H.E. Mr. Aldo Bumçi, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Albania*
- *H.E. Ambassador Adam Kobieracki, Director of the OSCE Conflict Prevention Centre*
- *Mr. Douglas Wake, First Deputy Director, ODIHR*
- *Mr. Roberto Battelli, OSCE PA Treasurer and Special Representative on South East Europe*

Opening statements by delegations

Part 1. Comprehensive approach to combating intolerance and discrimination

10:30-12:30 **Plenary session 1: Combating intolerance and discrimination against any person, including racism, xenophobia and aggressive nationalism, in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments**

Moderator: Mr. Douglas Wake, First Deputy Director, ODIHR

Introducers:

- *H.E. Mr. François Zimeray, Ambassador at Large for Human Rights, France*
- *Mr. Dennis van der Veur, Head of Sector Equality, Equality and Citizens' Rights Department, Fundamental Rights Agency*
- *Ms. Saodat Olimova, Research Center SHARQ*
- *Mr. Valery Engel, Vice-President, International Human Rights Movement "World Without Nazism"*

12:30-14:00 **Lunch**

14:00-15:30 **Plenary session 2: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Christians and members of other religions**

Moderator: H.E. Ambassador Tetiana Izhevskaya, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also Focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

Introducers:

- *Dr. Gudrun Kugler, Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians*
- *Mr. Jehangir Sarosh, Inter-faith representative of the Zoroastrian Trust Funds of Europe*

15:30-17:00 Plenary session 3: Combating anti-Semitism

Moderator: H.E. Ms. Edith Harxhi, Deputy Foreign Minister of Albania

Introducers:

- *Dr. Mario Silva, Chair of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance*
- *Rabbi Andrew Baker, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Anti-Semitism*

17:00-17:30 Coffee Break

17:30-19:00 Plenary session 4: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims

Moderator: H.E. Ambassador Tacan İldem, Permanent Representative of Turkey to the OSCE

Introducers:

- *Ms. Engy Abdelkader, ODIHR Advisory Panel of Experts on Freedom of Religion or Belief*
- *Mr. Veysel Filiz, Spokesperson, European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion*

20:00-21:30 Dinner hosted by the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Albania Durrës, “Hotel Adriatik” (Departure from Hotel Sheraton at 19:15)

Wednesday, 22 May 2013

Part 2. The way forward: Preventing and responding to intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes. Promoting mutual respect and understanding

10:00-11:30 Plenary session 5: The role of human rights youth education in promoting mutual understanding and respect for diversity in accordance with the existing OSCE commitments

Moderator: Ms. Floriane Hohenberg, Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, ODIHR

Introducers:

- *H.E. Mr. Yevhen Sulima, First Deputy Minister of Education and Science of Ukraine*
- *H.E. Mr. Myqerem Tafaj, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Education and Science of Albania*
- *H.E. Ambassador Blanka Jamnič, Permanent Representative of the Republic of Slovenia to the UN, OSCE and other International Organisations in Vienna*

11:30-13:00 **Plenary session 6: The role of political leadership, legislation, law enforcement, data collection, and civil society in combating and preventing intolerance and discrimination, including hate crimes**

Moderator: Mr. Michael Schmunk, Deputy Head of the Permanent Mission of Germany to the OSCE

Introducers:

- *H.E. Ambassador Harald Neple, Special Envoy for Minorities, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Norway*
- *Mr. Paul LeGendre, Director, Fighting Discrimination Programme, Human Rights First*

13:00-14:30 **Lunch**

14:30-16:00 **Closing plenary session**

Moderator: H.E. Ambassador Ihor Prokopchuk, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

- Reports by the rapporteurs of the plenary sessions
- Conclusions and recommendations
- The way ahead: Consolidating progress and facing new challenges

ANNEX 3. Summary of Participation

Representatives from the following participating States attended the High-Level Conference:

Albania	The former Yugoslav Republic of
Germany	Macedonia
United States of America	Liechtenstein
Andorra	Lithuania
Armenia	Luxembourg
Austria	Malta
Azerbaijan	Moldova
Belarus	Monaco
Belgium	Mongolia
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Montenegro
Bulgaria	Norway
Canada	Uzbekistan
Cyprus	Netherlands
Croatia	Poland
Denmark	Portugal
Spain	Romania
Estonia	Russian Federation
Finland	San Marino
France	Holy See
Georgia	Serbia
United Kingdom	Slovakia
Greece	Slovenia
Hungary	Sweden
Ireland	Switzerland
Iceland	Tajikistan
Italy	Czech Republic
Kazakhstan	Turkmenistan
Kyrgyzstan	Turkey
Latvia	Ukraine

Representatives from the following OSCE institutions/field operations attended the High-Level Conference:

OSCE Secretariat – Conflict Prevention Centre
OSCE Secretariat – Conference Services
OSCE Parliamentary Assembly
OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR)
OSCE Presence in Albania

Representatives from the following international organizations attended the High-Level Conference:

Council of Europe Office, Albania
European Commission against Racism and Intolerance
European Union Office to Albania
European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights
International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance
United for Intercultural Action, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia

Representatives from the following non-governmental organizations attended the High-Level Conference:

Albanian Catholic Church
Albanian Evangelical Community
Albanian Helsinki Committee
Alliance against Discrimination of LGBT People, Albania
ARRISEC, Albania
Associazione Dossetti, Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom
Bektashian Community
B'nai B'rith International, Belgium
Children's Human Rights Centre of Albania/CRCA Albania
Civil Rights Defenders, Albania
Cojep International, France
Council for Foreign Policy, Albania
Council of Government and Muslims, Netherlands
Council of Muftis, Russian Federation
Ecumenical Federation of Constantinopolitans, Greece
Episcopal Conference
Estonian Institute of Human Rights
Evangelical Albania
Europartners
European Jewish Congress
European Movement, Albania
European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion, France
Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe (ABTTF), Germany
Forum for Alliance of Civilizations (AFALC), Albania
Human Rights First
ILGA-Europe, Belgium
Institute for Contemporary Studies, Albania
Institute for Democracy and Mediation

Institute for International Studies, Albania
Institute of Dialogue and Communication, Albania
Institute of Roma Culture (IRCA), Albania
International Human Rights Movement “World without Nazism”
Islamic Union for Religious Issues (DITIB), Turkey
Jewish Committee, Ukraine
Jewish Muslim Platform, Belgium
Media Institute, Albania
Muslim Community, Albania
Observatory of Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians in Europe, Austria
Orthodox Autocephalous Church, Albania
Peace Foundation, Russian Federation
Pink Embassy/LGBT Pro Albania
Pro LGBT Albania
Research Center Sharq (Oriens), Tajikistan
Roma Active, Albania
Roma Civil Society, Roma Woman Rights Center, Albania
Roma Education Fund
Roma for Integration Association, Albania
Students’ Union, Azerbaijan
The Association of Cultural and Historical Heritage of the Baltic Slavs, Lithuania
The Association of “Lithuania without Nazism”
The Olof Palme International Centre, Albania
The Religious Administration of Ukrainian Muslims
The World Headquarters of the Bektashi Order, Albania
Turkish Community Switzerland
Verein Perspektive, Austria
Western Trace Minority University Graduates Association
Zoroastrian Trust Funds of Europe