

**AN EXTERNAL REVIEW OF TRAININGS DELIVERED
TO LOCAL GOVERNMENT STAFF 2004-2007**

**Prepared by
Brenda Lee Pearson**

For



Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
**Spillover Monitor
Mission to Skopje**

October, 2008

Acknowledgements

The assessment team is very thankful to the organizations and institutions involved, which cooperated and transparently provided needed data and documents as well as openly discussed their internal issues. We especially thank the organizations: CSA, EAR, MLSG, MCIC, UNDP, USAID, ZELS and the municipalities of Skopje, Tetovo and Struga.

We would also like to thank the OSCE staff responsible for Public Administration Reforms that coordinated and facilitated the communications. The project could not be fully completed without the OSCE administrative and logistical staff.

The period of the assessment, August . September 2008, took place mostly in Skopje but included field visits to Tetovo and Struga, examples of urban and rural municipalities.

Contents	Page Number
Abbreviations	
Executive Summary	
1. Main Findings	
2. Purpose of the Evaluation	
3. Methodology	
4. Policy Context	
5. Training Management	
Trilateral Commission	
Ministry of Local Government	
Association of the Units of Local Self Governments	
Civil Servants Agency	
Training Support Facility Project	
5.1 Training Design	
6. Key Donors	
7. Training Results	
7.1 Technical Assistance	
7.2 Financial Assistance	
8. Training Outcomes and Impact	
8.1 Relevance	
8.2 Effectiveness	
8.3 Efficiency	
8.4 Impact	
9. Recommendations for Future Training Topics and Capacity Building Priorities	
10. Conclusions	
11. References	
12. Annexes	

Disclaimer

The content of this publication does not necessarily represent the view or the position of the OSCE Spillover Monitor Mission to Skopje.

Abbreviations

ATP	CSA's Annual Training Program plan
CIRa	Center for Institutional Development
CoE	Council of Europe
CSA	Civil Society Association
DFID	Department for International Development
EAR	European Agency for Reconstruction
EU	European Union
FOSIM	Foundation Open Society in Macedonia
IPA	EU Instrument for Pre Accession Assistance
LED	Local Economic Development
LSGU	Local Self-Government
MCIC	Macedonia Center for International Cooperation
MLSG	Ministry of Local Self Government
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe
TCT	Trilateral Committee for Training Coordination
TNA	Technical Needs Assessment
TSF	UNDP-funded Training Support Facility
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
ZELS	Association of Local Self Government Units

Executive Summary

The purpose of this review is to provide the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) . Spillover Monitor Mission to Skopje with an assessment of the relevance, efficiency and impact of municipal trainings in the host country. The external review of trainings delivered to staff and elected officials local self government units (municipalities) from 2004-7 in the country is based on an assessment of existing documents from the government on national training policies and strategies as well as from international agencies, associations, donors and civil society organizations. Our evaluation is based on training data, evaluation reports and a series of semi-structured interviews with more than 40 selected senior Government officials, international agency staff and civic organizationsqrepresentatives. The findings have been reviewed by members of the OSCE Public Administration staff.

The host country since independence in 1991 has been perhaps the most highly centralized country in Europe because the authority and resources were concentrated entirely in the hands of the central government. The development of a decentralized government is the center piece of the 2001 Ohrid Framework Agreement, which provides the means by which citizens can participate in making decisions that affect their daily lives and will make a major contribution to the building of strong democratic institutions and traditions.

From 2001-2004, the main focus of decentralization was to create a new legal framework for local self government and to provide a basis for sustained debate on local government reform. The national policy debate was greatly influenced by external donors and international agencies that also provided assistance with legislation drafting, fiscal decentralization management, plans for transfers of competencies to municipalities, creation of state institutes and associations and perhaps thousands of trainings- the extent and catalogue of these interventions is beyond the scope of this review. This period, 2004-7 is often referred to as *Phase I* of decentralization, which gradually shifted responsibilities to municipalities while at the same time making financing consistent with expenditure responsibilities.

On July 1, 2004, the Government adopted enabling legislation on how to finance municipalities. There was a consequent readjustment in priorities from policy debate and national reforms to an immediate need to build institutional capacity at the local level and train thousands of civil servants and elected officials. Again, the donor community offered assistance but it was more focused than previously in that several government structures were created and a previously dormant association was revitalized.

In the local context, *Phase II* of decentralization, which began on July 1, 2007 transfers many state competencies to local levels, is likely to be the most important factor driving training needs in the near future. The municipalities generally lack the necessary administrative and financial management skills to meet the expectations of their citizens for critical issues such as

employment, education or health care. The municipality staff depends to a great degree on their donor collaborators and NGO implementers to provide skills training and capacity-building programs. While at the same time, there has been practically no training of civil servants at the central government that are responsible for coordinating the transfer of competencies from line-ministries. There seems to be little if any analysis regarding the evolution of training needs based on what was done previously.

The country adopted a hybrid training system that relies on the explicit cooperation of three main entities: the Ministry of Local Self Government (MLSG), Civil Servants Agency (CSA) and the Association of Local Self Government Units (ZELS). The Trilateral Committee, a governing body comprised of representatives from these three entities was formed in 2003 through a Memorandum of Understanding. This unwieldy decision-making mechanism has proved to be too cumbersome and diffused to serve as the leading force for a national training strategy and implementing agency. Much effort went into the creation of this mechanism but there seems to be very little incentive or good will to make it viable. Hence, stakeholders are again debating which state institute or association has ownership of training municipal staff and elected officials.

Training is a key component of the decentralization process but making the trainings effective is a real challenge in transition countries. Several of the newer members of the European Union like Estonia have developed national training systems that provide standardized and some customized training to all civil servants. Establishing a national training system is as much a political as technical challenge.

The local Government is strongly committed to pursuing the EU accession agenda that requires fully functioning local units of self government. The process of European integration is a demanding and expensive one that requires interventions, systemic adjustments and endeavors to be made in different sectors, primarily in terms of investments into harmonization of the EU acquis that will create more favorable environment for living and business operating in the country. The National Plan of Adoption of the Acquis clearly identifies reform activities that need to be undertaken to reach this strategic goal.

1. Main Findings

- More than 10,000 participants received some type of training from 2004-2007.
- Estimates vary but about 30 million euro has been spent by international donors on decentralization efforts, of which 15-20% appears to have been spent on training.

- Nearly every municipality and its staff have received some training in the areas of human resource management and fiscal accountability.
- About 55 municipalities have received instructions and trainings on how to conduct local Technical Needs Assessments.
- About 70 municipality staff participated in trainings on how to develop and draft quarterly reports for the Ministry of Finance.
- Methodology and municipal training needs are very different in urban and rural municipalities.
- Municipal councilors have not been trained, nor have central government civil servants working in line-ministries that will transfer competencies to local self government units.
- A clearer delineation of local and national government roles and responsibilities is needed in order to adequately address annual training needs.
- A coherent system of national training strategies and delivery and central database of trainings is needed and in its absence, the impact of trainings cannot be measured.
- The legal framework designed to transfer competencies to the local level was unclear about national priorities and did not address which kinds of delivery systems would be used for public services. The undefined roles of state and private sector provisions also delayed and prolonged the transfer of competencies. The organization model remains weak.
- Municipalities need to plan and organize what are the exact services local providers and what are national responsibilities.
- The current model of financing perpetuates disparity in municipalities. There is a legal focus on facilities rather than human resource capacities.
- The primary focus of the central government has been and continues to be legislative drafting whereas local self government units need skills to manage finances, develop functioning organizational structures and absorb the next round of transferred competencies.
- Municipal training activities are also in compliance with the national and political development priorities as stated in the Government's strategic priorities and the Stabilization and Association Agreement with the EU (SAA), and the official positions of the Government itself, expressed in numerous documents and legal acts. The main long-term strategic goal of the host country is to achieve EU membership, thus making many of

the country's priorities directed and adjusted to this main political objective.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation

The main evaluation objective is a review of the trainings of local municipal staff and elected officials, specifically mayors and city councilors. This review assesses the impact of national and international trainings delivered from the period of 2004-2007 and the development of key institutions and organizations primarily responsible for training of municipal staff. In this respect, the intention of this review is not to focus on the broader activities and achievements of government decentralization but to

General evaluation tasks are:

- ❖ Assess the process of training delivery from a qualitative perspective;
- ❖ Provide the Government and relevant stakeholders with an overview of the training delivered for the local self government, including training topics, trainers and training beneficiaries;
- ❖ Provide tools and suggestions for management of trainings, data collection, quality assurance and targeting of beneficiaries;
- ❖ Comment on capacity building initiatives conducted at all levels of local self government units;
- ❖ Contribute to the policy debate regarding the further advancement of the institutional mechanisms for training delivery.

3. Methodology

The OSCE SMMS External Review from 2004-7 on trainings to LSGU is a result of an assessment process based on the use of the following methods:

1. A comprehensive desk review (synthesis and data analysis) of existing documents from the government on national policies and strategies as well as from the international agencies and donors, i.e. training strategies, decentralization, fiscal management and;
2. Data collection through semi-structured interviews with mayors, government officials, organizations and donors. More than 40 interviews were conducted. (see Annex);

Possible evaluation shortcomings and biases:

- ❖ The following review may contain opinions gathered from the interviewed persons, which are a personal reflection, individual impression and experience obtained during the period of 2004-7.
- ❖ There is no centralized data collection related to trainings, despite earlier attempts to develop a national training database. Thus, various government agencies, associations, civil society organizations and donors all had their own methodology of documenting trainings and measuring impact and outputs.
- ❖ It should also be taken under consideration that many international organizations and donors that provided trainings no longer have offices

in Skopje or did not maintain records or evaluations for the period of our review.

4. Policy Context

The host country since independence in 1991 has been perhaps the most highly centralized country in Europe because the authority and resources were concentrated in the hands of the central government. Only 1.6% of the total state budget went to the local level. The previous 123 municipal governments (now 85) were weak and had limited competencies and few resources to carry out what little competencies they did exercise. This system also created patronage opportunities for political parties and allowed parties to direct resources to municipalities on a partisan basis. The development of a decentralized government is the center piece of the 2001 Ohrid Framework Agreement, which provides the means by which citizens can participate in making decisions that affect their daily lives and will make a major contribution to the building of strong democratic institutions and traditions. A more effective local government should contribute also to reducing ethnic tensions by allowing minority groups to resolve issues locally rather than relying on centralized decision-making in Skopje or political party headquarters.

The local decentralization process was planned to have a two-fold impact in the country. First, local authorities would be empowered to act directly for their constituents, thereby improving their ability to be responsive, more effective and accountable. The long-term objective is to improve the quality of service provision, increase the efficiency in the public sector at the local level, strengthen the democracy and bring the government closer to the citizens. And, secondly, decentralization would increase the total volume of revenues available to improve local infrastructure and encourage economic growth throughout the country. Since the beginning of the process in 1999, soon after the ratification of the European Charter of Local Self-Government¹, and from the benchmark of the 2001 Ohrid Framework Agreement, considerable progress has been made to date.

The local Government developed a Ministry for Local Self Government in 1999, which is unique to this country, Kosovo and Moldova, due in large part to the heavy concentration of ethnic minorities in areas of the country. Since its creation, this Ministry has not received sufficient financial support from the central government and at times has suffered from a deficit of strong leadership. The 2006 and 2008 parliamentary elections resulted in new coalition governments and consequently a series of top and mid-level personnel changes that have stymied the Ministry's efforts to wrest some of its assigned policy responsibilities from the Ministry of Finance, ZELS and donors.

¹ See also Council of Europe, CDLR (2007)42, European Committee on Local and Regional Democracy's Draft Recommendation on Capacity Building at Local and Regional Level, 22 September 2007.

Most of the legislative and regulatory framework for decentralization is in place. The key systemic laws were adopted², relevant laws and secondary legislation was adopted to further determine the scope of municipal competency in each specific sector. Municipalities acquired a wide range of competencies such as education, management of cultural institutions and sports facilities, environment, social services, civil defense, firefighting and local economic development. Moreover, the government empowered local self government units with financial resources from central public institutions, including assets and employees, while other funds were made available by the on-going fiscal decentralization process, which entered *Phase II* of fiscal decentralization in September 2007.

The Government still needs to establish a sustainable and effective national system for training of staff in local self-government units.

5. Training Management

The central government and local self government units both have responsibilities for providing training, technical needs assessments, human resources development and financial management. In theory, the Government has a National Training Program that is developed by the Trilateral Committee through adoption of quarterly training plans prepared by municipalities. The National Training Program is supposed to be coordinated by the Trilateral Committee, the donor community and local training providers. It is foreseen that a standardized curriculum is developed for both generic and customized trainings and financed from the State Budget but based on our assessment this goal is far from being realized.

Municipalities are required by law to conduct annual training needs assessments and to adopt annual programs for training in human resources management. The lack of training needs assessment resulted in supply-driven trainings that varied in effectiveness and sustainability. Most of the municipalities have received assistance in conducting needs assessments from one or all of the following: DFID, OSCE, UNDP, USAID, World Bank, bilateral donors and NGOs such as MCIC. Despite some donor claims that staff in more than 60 municipalities are adequately trained to conduct their own training needs assessments, our discussions with current mayors and municipal councilors did not recall such trainings and they did not prepare annual training programs for either 2007 or 2008³.

The Law on Civil Servants⁴ provides the general legislative framework for the training and the professional development of civil servants. This is the basis for a training system of civil servants and the defining of the national policy for training of civil servants. The Civil Servants Agency (described below) is the coordinating body for these trainings. The third body, ZELS, operates as a

² The Law on Local Self Government (2002); the Law on Financing of the Units of Local Self-Government (2004); the law on Territorial Boundaries (2004) and the Law on City of Skopje.

³ Based on more than 30 interviews and visits to Skopje, Tetovo and Struga municipalities.

⁴ Official Gazette 59/200, 34/2001, 103/2001, 43/2002, 98/2002, 17/2004, 69/2004 and 81/2005)

service center for the local self government units; it manages the education and training of elected officials.

A. Trilateral Committee

The Trilateral Committee was established through a Memorandum of Understanding in 2003; it is composed of representatives from the MLSG, CSA and ZELS as an institutional mechanism for mutual exchange of information, coordination and decision-making in the areas of professional development and training of civil servants in the municipal administration. The work of the Trilateral Committee is underpinned by the UNDP Training Support Facility (TSF) which played a key role from 2005 in planning and coordinating training delivery activities but did not monitor the quality or delivery of trainings. The CSA, ZELS, large NGOs and key donors such as Council of Europe and USAID were opposed somewhat or entirely to its establishment. They seem to have objected on two premises: 1) the structure was too complicated for efficient decision-making and 2) they objected to the pooling of Government and donor resources to an entity administered primarily by a UN agency. Some members of the Trilateral Committee believe it should facilitate and guide the allocation of funds provided by local and international organizations but others refute this authority and believe that only a fully functioning state training institution can provide this function.

The Trilateral Committee has ceased to function effectively because CSA and ZELS have withdrawn their cooperation. Opinion among central and local authorities is divided as to its future. The Trilateral Committee succeeded in coordinating some government and donor-led trainings from 2005 and 2006. It raised awareness for the importance of locally conducted needs assessments and gave increased visibility to a clearly neglected aspect of decentralization. On the other hand, due to the complexity of the system and inherent conflicts among members, the TRILATERAL COMMITTEE collapsed in early 2008.

B. Ministry of Local Self Government (MLSG)

The MLSG should perform the overall coordination and monitoring of the decentralization process, which also includes the identification of training needs and undertaking capacity-building measures. According the Law on Civil Servants (article 24, paragraph 5) provides funds from the State Budget for training and professional development of civil servants. In addition, the central government, in turn, provides generic trainings mostly through IPA funds but many of these trainings are more focused on EU priorities rather than the actual needs of municipality staff.

The Ministry suffers from its own lack of capacity in human and organizational resources. The Ministry has not yet implemented a system to collect data regarding municipal training needs or the types of trainings that have been conducted. There is not a centralized database to track trainings by topic, participants nor municipal beneficiaries. At different points in time, senior MLSG staff attempted to archive some of the training data but gave up due to lack of support, resources and cooperation.

Many of the functions assigned to a Ministry of Public Administration should be the responsibility of the MLSG but this is not the case in the local context. Due to its principal function as a coordinating body, the ministry has diminished authority and does not yet seem to have strong enough support from the Ministry of Finance, other ministries and Parliament. The problem is further compounded by the fact that ZELS, which is a project-based association, has been far more successful in attracting donor assistance and funds.

According to senior staff at the MLSG, the next areas of training priorities for 2008-9 will be: 1) practical implementation of remaining legislation and regulatory procedures, 2) regional development in order to attract EU funds and 3) proper management of IPA funds.

C. Association of the Units of Local Self Governments (ZELS)

ZELS serves to aggregate municipal interests, develop appropriate positions and lobby national decision makers on legislation and regulations. ZELS is based on similar model local government associations that are operating successfully in Bulgaria and Serbia. The association has benefited from extensive direct donor assistance to build its capacity as the leading advocate on policy matters essential to a functioning, robust local government. It has created a *ZELS 2006-2011 Strategic Plan* and the developed a new five-year implementation plan. The new *ZELS Strategic Plan* provides a direction for self-sustainability as donor support declines or inevitably ceases. Internally, trainings have focused on upgrading staff skills on a regular basis, diversity of funding sources, creations of strategic partnerships and introduction of new services. The mayors hope to lobby successfully for a line-item in the State Budget to pay for municipal trainings.

ZELS created an Office for Municipal Training Coordination in 2005 for newly elected mayors and council members; it developed a curriculum and a manual of good municipal organization, governance and service delivery which was delivered in a series of training programs for more than 400 newly elected officials. In July 2008, ZELS organized two country-wide trainings on how to prepare municipal quarterly reports to the Ministry of Finance. Based on these two trainings, ZELS board members and senior staff believe future trainings need to focus on specific topics that are common to all municipalities in addition to generic trainings like financial management.

ZELS does not have currently a strategic plan for addressing the training needs of municipal councilors. It is exploring ways to expand the organizational structure of ZELS in order to develop a branch specific to the needs of approximately 1,600 municipal councilors.

D. Civil Servants Agency (CSA)

The Civil Servants Agency is an autonomous state body accountable to Parliament that has the legal responsibility to coordinate the training of civil

servants. CSA also has a consultative role in the support of personnel who manage human resources in state bodies as determined by the Law on Civil Servants⁵ (LCS). The CSA recently adopted a *National System of Coordination of Civil Servants Expert Training and Development in the Republic of Macedonia*,⁶ identifies four main priorities for 2009: 1) training and professional development of civil servants is essential for EU integration, 2) investing in civil servants' capacities will increase the efficiency of state institutions and make them more attractive employment options, 3) there should be a more systematic approach to assessing training needs and implementing a national training plan, and 4) professional development and training need to be viewed in the context of strategic capacity building of state institutions.

Estimates vary from about 80,000 to 120,000 as to exactly how many civil servants are employed in the country⁷. The huge variance seems to be due to the difficulty of determining how many of these civil servants are employed every day. In other words, many civil servants have employment contracts but do not actually work daily. Of this total number, there may be about 2,000-3,000 employed in municipalities; CSA has training oversight responsibility for about 11,000 civil servants employed in both levels of government. The fact that there is no accurate statistical data after extensive government reforms points to the difficulty of implementing a coherent national training strategy.

The CSA has a complicated organizational structure that seems to increase the difficulty of assessing civil servants' training needs. The CSA is required to develop a *national System for Coordination of Public Administration trainings* (2006-2010), and to adopt an *Annual Training Programme (ATP)* for the municipalities that is administered by the CSA Training Council. This Council has 13 directors of administration from central and local governments and within this structure is a Training Expert Working Group composed of 13 heads of human resources management units. The Training Council should identify training policies, draft the Annual Training Programme and monitor the implementation of the ATP. Another added complexity is that these trainings should be financed from the State Budget, the municipality budgets and donor funds. The unwieldy mixed allocation of funding is one of the main reasons that training funds are not transferred from the state to local level. Currently, CSA is not able to lobby for adequate budget allocations for its operations and training programs.

The CSA has about 50 employees who have been with the agency for nearly 10 years, which means that CSA should have the staff capacity to work at both the local and central levels of government. They are responsible for coordinating training needs and delivery of trainings with each of the 85 local

⁵ Law on Civil Servants; Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia; no. 59/2000. The Law is amended 12 times thus far. A consolidated text of the law was published in the Official Gazette, no. 108/2005.

⁶ Published on 9 July 2008 in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia; no. 108/2005. It replaces the previous act of 18 October 2005.

⁷ Data from the Ministry of Finance indicates that there were 71,449 employees paid by public funds.

self government units. Yet, its low institutional capacity, unmanageable organizational structure and lack of consistent financial support undermine its effectiveness to deliver timely and appropriate trainings at both levels of government. The CSA should keep training records for each civil servant but there is no mechanism in place to make this operational.

E. Training Support Facility Project (TSF)

The UNDP provided substantial financial and expert support to create a Training Support Facility. The very able UNDP staff designed a comprehensive Training Planning System in 2006 for both levels of government. They assisted the municipalities in conducting locally based Technical Needs Assessment (TNA) to identify the local training needs; while the TRILATERAL COMMITTEE and the central government institutions responsible for the decentralization process identified the national level training needs in order to support implementation of the state priorities. The TCF succeeded in helping about 50 municipalities conduct TNAs in 2005-6. The TCF issued quarterly training strategies in 2004, 2005 and 2006 and in 2007, it facilitated the publication of an annual training strategy. Despite this enormous investment, most municipalities do not have an adequate human resources management system to conduct annual TNAs for training needs because of other responsibilities and a plethora of other reporting requirements.

The future of the Training Support Facility is unclear. On the one hand, it substituted for a national level training institute and made the Trilateral Committee sustainable for about two years. Based on our interviews⁸, the absence of endorsement by CSA and ZELS and other donors to support the TRILATERAL COMMITTEE, it seems unlikely that the current configuration of the TSF will survive but perhaps its nucleus could be preserved and transformed into state institution for training. This national institute for training, however, could not be administered by an international agency.

5.1 Training Design

The country adopted a hybrid training system that relies on the explicit cooperation of three main entities: the Ministry of Local Self Government (MLSG), Civil Servants Agency (CSA) and the Association of Local Self Government Units (ZELS). This unwieldy decision-making mechanism has proved to be too cumbersome and diffused to serve as the leading force for a national training strategy and implementing agency. Much effort went into the creation of this mechanism but there seems to be very little incentive or good will to make it viable. Hence, stakeholders are again debating which state institute or association has ownership of training municipal staff and elected officials.

The three partners in the training coordination process have distinct responsibilities regarding the decentralization process. Their functional role in

⁸ See Annex for interview schedule.

the process influences to a great extent their role in the system of training delivery. More concretely, the MLSG is charged with the overall coordination and policy support to the process. On the other hand, the Civil Servants Agency (CSA) is in charge of recruitment and professional upgrading of the skills of municipal civil servants. ZELS, being a representative of Mayors and elected officials is naturally part of the consultative process regarding the trainings of the local elected officials. The current institutional set-up is characterized by existence of cooperation but absence of leadership. The diversity of the actors and their interests in the process of training coordination has exacerbated leadership deficit in the process and lack of assessment on the effectiveness of the trainings that were already delivered.

The *Training Strategy for Municipalities 2006-2010* was adopted by the Government in March 2006 in order to develop professional skills and to build local capacity. The government adopted *Programme for Implementation of the Decentralization Process 2008-2010* also gives a high priority to the improvement of municipal capacities. As stated in the Programme, the Government must identify the training needs of the municipalities, develop methodology for recruitment of trainers and implement annual training programs. So far, relevant authorities stated that only training modules on fiscal decentralization and management of the EU Instrument for Pre Accession Assistance (IPA) funds are already part of the Annual Training Programmes, while the other priority training areas have not yet been identified.

Overall, the system of training delivery has two distinct components, institutional and the qualitative. Even though these two aspects cannot be firmly separated, one can argue that the system of training delivery in the country still lacks a sustainable institutional framework. The lack of coordination due to the idleness of the Trilateral Committee may have influenced the quality of the delivered trainings.

At present, four main donors: OSCE, UNDP, USAID and EAR (which will be folded into the European Commission office by December 2008) and several NGOs conduct trainings at the local level. These donors try to coordinate activities and there is some indication that there is not nearly as much overlap in activities as previously. For example, EAR has delivered extensive trainings on financial management, tax administration and budgeting while USAID is working on strengthening the credit worthiness of municipalities and increased tax collection and MCIC, a major NGO, has invested in 14 rural municipalities overlooked by other donors. OSCE currently is training extensively in local administration of education.

6. Key Donors

European Agency for Reconstruction has provided about 3 million euro in training funds since 2001. EAR trainings focused on fiscal management and tax administration from 2004-7. EAR programs trained about 1,400 civil servants over the course of about 120 training days.

OSCE The Public Administration Reform Unit of the OSCE Mission to Skopje provides training for municipal civil servants, mayors and councilors in specific areas relevant to local governance. Since mid-2005, over 1,000 municipal officers have been trained to improve municipal performance in public finance management, participatory planning techniques and leadership skills. Several manuals on topics related to financial decentralization have been produced and delivered to all units of local self government.

Council of Europe in cooperation with ZELS, has recently launched a *Leadership Benchmark* program in selected municipalities and a citation of *Best Practices* to increase the transparency of the work in the municipalities and to identify the best local management practices. The Council of Europe is also supporting capacity building initiatives from policy perspectives, by organizing conferences and regional meetings to share best practices and lessons learned during other countries' reform processes.

Foundation Open Society Institute Macedonia in cooperation with UN Habitat and the Civil Service Agency, has carried out a comprehensive Train-the-Trainer program in the sectors of local government reform and service delivery.

MCIC implements the program *Local Community Development (LRZ)*. The program is focused on the marginalized communities: rural municipalities, small municipalities, suburban areas, villages, local neighborhood units and urban communities in Dolneni, Mogila, Karbinci, Lozovo, Staro Nagoricane, Saraj, Prilep and Veles. The participants work in groups to analyze the needs for capacity building on improved transparency and accountability, improving the services delivered to the citizens and the communication with them, initiating and improving the public private partnerships, improved access to state and international funds, improved generation of income and more effective lobbying and advocacy of the rural municipalities.

UNDP has been one of the primary supporters of the Trilateral Committee and established the Training Support Facility. The TSF developed a TNA for municipalities and provided on-going training on how to conduct training assessments. UNDP contributed significantly to the development of quarterly and annual training strategies. It assisted the Trilateral Committee to establish a database of trainings but only the UNDP and OSCE contributed training data to this central database, rendering it rather incomplete. In addition, UNDP has carried out number of trainings for the municipalities with a focus on local development, establishment of a pool of local trainers, curricula on local development planning and delivery of training on citizen participation in local development process.

USAID is a longstanding supporter of the decentralization process and has invested more than \$15 million in assistance to local government initiatives. The 2007-11 priorities are: 1) support of the development of the intergovernmental finance system, 2) improving municipal financial management capacities, 3) strengthening the creditworthiness of municipalities to enable municipal infrastructure investments, 4) improving tax

and fee collection at the local level, 5) helping municipalities stimulate local economic development and, 6) increasing local government transparency and accountability

In addition, DFID, the Dutch and Swiss development agencies have provided extensive training assistance in the areas of organizational capacity-building, budget forecasting, urban planning and management.

7. Training Results

There is no comprehensive evaluation of the impact of municipal staff trainings from 2004-7. Many donors conducted their own evaluations but there were no common benchmarks or indicators to measure the effectiveness of trainings. Thus, it is very difficult to evaluate the improvement of performance of civil servants as a result of participation in trainings. Many donors and NGOs have records of training outputs (See Annexes) but there is no overall management of the training data that allows an even superficial analysis of the training impact. Although, some observations can be made:

- More than 10,000 participants received some type of training from 2004-2007.
- Estimates vary but about 30 million euro has been spent by international donors on decentralization efforts, of which 15-20% appears to have been spent on training.
- Nearly every municipality and its staff have received some training in the areas of human resource management and fiscal accountability.
- About 55 municipalities have received instructions and trainings on how to conduct local Technical Needs Assessments.
- About 70 municipality staff participated in trainings on how to develop and draft quarterly reports for the Ministry of Finance.
- Methodology and municipal training needs are very different in urban and rural municipalities.
- Municipal councilors have not been trained, nor have central government civil servants working in line-ministries that will transfer competencies to local self government units.

7.1 Technical Assistance

Presently, the trainings for staff in local self government units are mostly being financed by international donors following mainly supply-driven approach of the intervention policies. In the absence of comprehensive national training system and standards for quality training, most of the donors established their own training standards and curricula and trained their own staff to deliver the trainings. Having in mind the variety of actors involved in training delivery and

their different approaches, the setting up of standards of the trainings have not been possible so far, although foreseen by the Strategy for training in the Local Self-Government 2006-2010. A sound system for trainings quality assurance is also a goal yet to be achieved. From the perspective of municipalities, there is a general feeling of training fatigue, especially among the municipal civil servants, who are often faced with overlapping and duplication of similar training programs

Regardless from the institutional framework of the future national training system, the quality of training depends on factors such as training needs assessment, training curricula, training materials and trainers. Therefore, the issue of quality assurance in the training delivery faces challenges like accreditation and certification systems, and evaluation techniques. These matters are particularly important when considering the diversity of delivered training programs as well as their different recipients (elected representatives, civil servants employed in various sectors of municipal administrations).

In this interim period while the current institutional framework for sustainable training delivery is being in the phase of reconsideration, it would be of need for the policy makers to be provided with a tool that will elaborate options and provide recommendations for establishment of a system for quality assurance of the trainings. Such recommendations will complement the debate on the organizational set up for trainings and provide solid background for exploring the different modalities that would be applicable in the national context.

7.2 Financial Assistance

The funding system for training of the civil servants, according to the National Training System, in the medium term should be characterized as a mixed funding system, in which the CSA as central human resources management entity will manage funds from the State Budget to implement generic trainings, while the appropriate state entities⁹ will receive at least funds from the municipal budgets to implement customized technical trainings. In the long term, the mixed funding system should be gradually transformed from a shared financing between the CSA and entities, to a full allocation of funds to the entities and a shift towards a repayment system for generic training which actually means completely decentralized funding system. This funding approach of training is regulated in the Law on Civil Servants, in which the funds required for covering the needs for training and professional

⁹ Article 3, paragraph 2, Law on Civil Servants; Civil servant as defined in paragraph (1) of this Article shall be a person employed in the state administration bodies, in the municipal administration and in the administration of the City of Skopje and in the expert services of: the Parliament of the Republic of Macedonia, the President of the Republic of Macedonia, the Government of the Republic of Macedonia, the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Macedonia, the Supreme Court of the Republic of Macedonia, the courts, the Republic's Judiciary Council, the Ombudsman, the Public Prosecutor's Office, the State Electoral Commission, the State Commission for Prevention of Corruption, the Directorate for Protection of Personal Data, the Commission for Protection of Competition, the Civil Servants Agency and the State Audit Office (hereinafter: the bodies referred to in Article 3, paragraph 2 of this Law).

development of the civil servants shall be provided from the State Budget and the budgets of the municipality or the City of Skopje.

From the other side, the combined system of funding in terms of the type of training on local level is foreseen in the Strategy for training in Local Governments 2006 . 2010. Namely, the specific (vertical) trainings should be completely financially supported by the municipal budgets, while the generic (horizontal) training including state training priorities should be responsibility of the central government and other funds, channeled and administrated by central training institution. Due to the lack of implementation of the above mentioned funding system, the majority of completed and ongoing training, over the recent years, has been financed by donors, which, by their nature, are finite and non-sustainable. The recent trend of donors is to focus on selected pilot municipalities, which leads to distortions in capacities of municipalities. Presently, only a handful of municipalities and state entities have allocated minimal budget lines but the requests are insufficient to cover the real training needs. In addition, the sources allocated in the CSA budget have not been sufficient to carry out its competency related to the training of civil servants assigned by the LCS. Considering the training funds, there is no unified database that would accurately indicate the amounts invested in training of the civil servants.

Based on our interviews, more than 30 million euro was spent on technical assistance for decentralization, of which about 15-20% was spent on trainings. The largest donor USAID has funded more than \$15 million dollars in local government activities since 1998. We asked donors to estimate the amount of funding that has been dedicated to local government training but these calculations are very rough and our suggested figure should only be used as very approximate estimate.

8. Training Outcomes and Impact

8.1 Relevance

The decentralization process has been in underway for more than a decade. The decentralization process is unique to each country and each country must develop its own model. The transfer of new competencies from the central government to the local self government units began on 1 July 2005 and is referred to as Phase 1 of the fiscal decentralization. This first phase has made local authorities responsible for the administration of their own revenue sources such as local taxes, dues and fees.

Trainings conducted for and by local government staff from 2004-2007 focused predominately on budgetary and financial management skills development. A review of the trainings carried out from 2004-2007 confirms that the training topics were in line with the broader process of decentralization. Although there was not a coherent national training agenda, more than 10,000 local government employees and elected officials received some type of training. The impact of these trainings, however, cannot be adequately measured.

8.2 Effectiveness

The majority of municipalities have demonstrably increased their capacities. More than 2/3 of the municipalities have graduated from Phase I to Phase II of the fiscal decentralization process. The municipalities still in Phase I are burdened by outstanding debts, which prevents them from passing to Phase II. The increased governing and administrative capacity of municipalities is assumed to be linked to the extensive training that was conducted from 2004-2007.

8.3 Efficiency

Many of the training topics were duplicative, instead of demand-driven trainings, as well as overlapping of the training topics offered by many training providers. Also, the numerous trainings supported by the local and international training providers did not result in a developed competitive local training market, which could contribute towards the improved quality of trainings.

9. Recommendations for Future Training Topics and Capacity Building Priorities

Based on our analysis, extensive desk review and interviews, the following issues have been consistently identified as important:

A. Local Government Concerns that Influence Ability to Absorb New Capacities

- Unavailability of local resources, especially natural resources, to the municipalities and the inability to manage them through concessions;
- Centralized management of concessions without direct financial benefit to the municipality and without obligation to pay usage fees or renew local infrastructure;
- Poor coordination between the local and the central government as well as line ministries on the scope of competences pursuant to the decentralization process;
- Poor mechanisms on local level for exercising the legal competences
- No legal mechanism at the local level to enforce the compliance with the transfer of competences
- No operational legal framework on decentralization and lack of appropriate bylaws.

B. Capacity Building Assistance Needed

- Adequate staffing of the municipal administration (number of employees, educational and professional background);
- Introduction of one-stop-shop in all municipalities;

- Training of municipal administration in IT and other computer support areas, especially for older workers; inadequate internet connections;
-Further training of the municipal staff for each competence and the specific laws regulating these areas:

1. GIS application (database, software, procedures)
2. Tax Administration and Real Estate Appraisal
3. Promotion and Establishment of partnerships among the civic, public and business sectors for Local Economic Development strategies
4. Management of Budget Execution and Block Grants
5. Management of Current Arrears and Future Borrowing
6. Realization of campaigns (for presentation of projects, informing the public on the municipal competences, informing the public on decisions such as budget, urban plans)
7. Financial Planning and Liquidity Management
8. Preparation of Financial Statements and training in internal audits

9. Team work
10. Creative work
11. Human Resource Management for managers
12. Developing project proposals to utilize EU pre-accession funds

C. Improved Transparency and Accountability; improving the services provided for the citizens and improved communication with the citizens

-Enhanced media presentation skills so that local governments can utilize web-sites of their municipalities, distribution of bulletins in local neighborhood units and local organizations, installing and maintaining bulletin boards in every settlement, increased cooperation with local media, radio, television

-Frequent meetings with the representatives of the local neighborhood units and citizens

-Opening of citizens' service center

-Opening satellite offices of the municipality

-Training needs:

1. Financial management and reporting
2. Participation of citizens in the decision making process, with special emphasis on the development of strategic documents
3. Communication skills
4. Media relations
5. Introduction of efficient one-stop-shop

D. Improved Access to State and International Funds and improved generation of income on different grounds

-Development of software for tax collection, database of property and tax payers

-Strengthening the inter-municipal, regional and international cooperation of municipalities

- Building partnerships with NGOs for accessing donor funds
- Establishing teams for developing project proposals
- Lobbying for changes in the legislation regarding the distribution of VAT per municipality (produced goods and services)
- Lobbying for changes and supplements to the legislation regarding the penalty provisions for delayed payment of taxes and levies
- The following trainings were specified:
 1. Access to donors
 2. Developing applications for different donors
 3. Sustainable development and limited resources
 4. Tax and income administration

E. Improved Public and Private Partnerships

- Involve the business sector in developing LED strategies
- Transfer certain competences from the local government to the business sector
- Capacity building of the Communal Services Enterprise (CSE) for cooperation with the business sector
- Mandatory translation of the laws into English language (when there is an international partner)
- The participants assessed that following training needs:
 1. Establishment and work of mixed CSEs
 2. Documenting positive examples in the country and the region
 3. Procedures and possibility for transferring certain communal activities to private operators
 4. Capacity building for public private partnership (PPP)
 5. Local economic development
 6. Participation of the private sector in setting the priorities and making strategic decisions

F. Improved Human Resources Management Capacities at Local Level

- Training of managerial civil servants, especially in Strategic Planning of HR
- Training the managerial civil servants in designing the work place for their staff . job description, Job analysis, and System of effective performance appraisal
- Training the managerial civil servants on the topics of Training Needs Assessment and on preparing the Annual Training Programms for Professional Training of the Civil Servants
- The Training Needs in terms of Human Resources Management ar as follows:
 1. Strategic planning of human resources
 2. Design of work place . job description and job analyses
 3. Career and promotion of civil servants
 4. System of effective performance appraisal
 5. Legal regulations relevant for human resource management
 6. Recruitment, selection and retain the employees

G. Specific Needs of Rural Municipalities

- Develop analytical skills to assess rural needs
- Construct national strategy for equal economic development
- Associations and linkages are needed among rural municipalities
- Joint capacities-building initiatives for rural municipalities
- Establish committees of rural municipalities in all relevant institutions
- Training on how to advocate and lobby for rural development

10. Conclusions

One of the weakest spots in the system is the state administration and the unevenness of required professional skills, which if not addressed adequately may become an impediment for the reform efforts of the country. Donors should begin to play less of a role in designing and implementing trainings. The Government will need to become less dependant on not just external funding but donor coordination of trainings. Municipal and central government staff have received enough trainings (at least in quantitative terms) to have some sense of which types of trainings are useful. They should have some role in the policy debate of what type of state institution should be created in the near future. The civil servants and elected officials need to develop more ownership of the training activities and assume higher level of responsibility to implement them.

The decentralization process and related training strategy must be an inclusive process that ensures the participation of all stakeholders, mayors, line ministries, Parliament and citizens. Legislative reform took longer than expected and political will from all parties will be needed to avoid replacement of most municipal staff following the 2009 local elections.

The TSF organized study tours in 2005 for municipal staff to research and observe how similarly sized countries like Estonia and Lithuania manage civil servant trainings. Estonia has a national institute that is supported by the state budget and offers standardized trainings to all public employees. The director of the institute reports directly to the Cabinet of the Prime Minister and not to Parliament. The system seems to function well but there are few safeguards to ensure that the trainings offered meet national standards. In Lithuania, there are centralized training centers in about 20 municipalities, which are easy to manage and accessible to all public employees. The national training strategy is unified and does not provide much flexibility for customized trainings that may be required by small, rural municipalities. Both of these models are appropriate for this country and should be reassessed.

Development of a national training strategy and state institution is a complex long-term process. It requires commitment by the Government and support by the international community. In order to ensure synergies and avoid duplications, coordination among state entities and donors should be better enforced. When designing and implementing training programs, the Government should take into consideration the linkages between municipalities and central ministries, social sectors and economic growth.

11. References

Civil Servants Agency

Report: Training Needs Assessment of Civil Servants in the Local Self Government for 2007

Priority Training Areas and Topics for the Local Self-Government Civil Servants for 2006

Strategy for Training in the Local Self-Government, 2006-2010

National System of Coordination of Civil Servants Expert Training and Development in the Republic of Macedonia, 9 July 2008

Commission of the European Communities

Commission Staff Working Document, FYROM 2007 {COM(2007)663}

Council of Europe

Approach to Quality Assurance in Local Government Training, 2005

National Training Systems for Local Government, International Workshop on Effective Training Systems in Local Government, December 2007

European Committee on Local and Regional Democracy: Abridged Meeting Report of the 39th Meeting of the Commission: Draft Recommendation on Capacity Building at Local and Regional Level, 22 June 2007

*(CDLR(2007)42

European Agency for Reconstruction (EAR) Public Finance Management Support to Municipalities 05/MAC01/07/08/001

List of On-Going and Planned Projects, 2005-7

Training Needs Analysis Report June 2008

Government of the Republic of Macedonia

Operational Programme for Decentralization of the Government, 2003-2004
Assessment Report: FYR Macedonia Governance and Public Administration, 21 October 2004

Local Self-Government Reform in the Republic of Macedonia: Programme for the Implementation of the Decentralization Process, 2004-7

Programme for Implementation of the Decentralization Process, 2008-2010

International Monetary Fund

FYROM Preparing for Fiscal Decentralization, September 2003

Macedonia Center for International Cooperation/Management for Development Foundation

From Organizational Support to Capacity Building: An Evaluation of Four Organizational Support Programs, October 2003
General Report from the Need Assessment Capacity Building Plans of OSCE Partners, December 2006

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)

Assessment of Intra-Municipal Relations and the Role of Neighborhood Self Government, July 2004
Report: The Supervision Mechanisms in the Country and Their Role in Context of the Decentralization Process, 2008
Assessment: Law Drafting and Regulatory Management in FYROM, 2007
Programme on Support to the Implementation of the Inter-Municipal Cooperation Initiatives, January 2008

Stability Pact

Southeast Europe Compact for Reform, Investment, Integrity and Growth, Progress in Policy Reform in Southeast Europe Monitoring Instruments, June 2001

Support for Improvement in Governance and Management (SIGMA), joint initiative of OECD and European Union

FYROM Public Service and the Administrative Framework Assessment June 2006, Summary of Main Findings

Trilateral Committee: Civil Servants Agency, Ministry of Local Self Government, ZELS, Support to Training System for Local Government Administration

Training Needs Assessment of the Civil Servants in the Local Self Government Units, June 2005
Review on Trainings for Period April . December 2005

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP): Support to the Training System for Local Government Administration

Report: Training Plan 2005, April - June
Report: Training Plan 2005, July - September
Report: Training Plan 2005, October - December
Report: Training Plan 2006, July - September
Report: Training Plan 2006, April . June
UNDP Support to Training System for Local Government Administration Newsletters, 2006
Fiscal Decentralization in FYR Macedonia: An Assessment, 2006
Evaluation Report for the Local Governance for Sustainable Human and Economic Development Project, April 2007
Report: Annual Training Programme for Local Self Government for 2007

Best Practice Form Local Governance and Decentralization Survey, 2007

United Nations

Common Country Assessment, 2003

UNDAF 2005-9 Evaluation Report for the FYROM, July 2008

United States Agency for International Development (USAID)

USAID/Macedonia Strategic Objective Closeout Report:: More Effective, Responsive and Accountable Local Government, 1998

OTI Macedonia: Confidence Building Evaluation Report, 2007

USAID Decentralization Project Municipal Capacity Index (MCI) Year Three Annual Progress Report, June 2007

USAID Decentralization Project, More Effective and Accountable Local Government, 2004-2007

World Bank – Skopje

Status of EIB, EBRD and World Bank Financing in FYROM, 2005, 2006, 2007

Studies: Public Expenditure and Institutional Review, 2006, 2007

ZELS

Report on the Current Situation and Needs of Municipalities Regarding their Entry into the Second Phase of Fiscal Decentralization in the Republic of Macedonia, December 2007

Action Plan for ZELS, 2008

Newsletters, 2006-8

Annexes

Questions for Mayors

1. How long have you been in office?
2. Have you participated in trainings since last election? Sponsored by which organizations (ZELS, other donors)
3. Which trainings, if any, have been the most useful?
4. Which types of trainings do you believe are most urgently needed for elected officials? (Financial, managerial, regional cooperation)
5. Does your municipality submit the Annual Program for trainings and professional development?
6. How often do you meet with your colleagues, mayors from other cities?
7. Have any of the city council members participated in trainings recently? What kind and when?
8. Are you aware of the trainings offered to civil servants?
9. Does the municipality organize trainings or is it done at the state level?
10. How much of your municipality's annual budget is allocated for trainings? Has this increased over time?

Who, if anyone keeps records of past trainings and participants?

OSCE Training Assistance to Local Self Government, 2004-7

Year	Project	Training topics	No of participants
2004	Curriculum Development and Training Delivery	1. Municipal finance	12 participants (local government officials from Saraj, Butel, Gjorce Petrov)
		2. Participatory planning	15 participants (municipal councilors)
2005	Workshops on Preparing budgets of the Local Self Governments Units	Preparing budgets of the Local Self Governments Units	73 local financial officers (2 workshops in the period 10-11 June 2005 and 2 workshops in the

Year	Project	Training topics	No of participants
			period 17-18 June 2005)
2005	Developing the Budgeting and Reporting Process in the Units of Local Self Government	1. Budgeting process in the local self government units	1. 76 financial officers from 71 local self government units (4 two-day workshops in Oct/Nov 2005)
		2. Reporting process in the local self government units	2. 70 financial officers from 58 local self government units (4 three-day workshops in Nov / Dec 2005)
2005	Financial Management and Budget Operation Training	Budget Management within the Financial Management Cycle; Budgeting Purpose; Budgeting Benefits Budgeting process: Roles; Phases; Budget Calendar Budgeting Process: Participatory Budgeting Defining Goals and Fiscal Strategy, Analysis Forecasting Revenues Classification & Estimations of expenditures Capital budgeting Budget adoption Budget execution	100 financial officers (2 workshops in Skopje and 2 workshops in Stip)
2006	Preparing the Financial Reports of the Local Self Government Units	Integrated financial management; Interactions and roles in local government financial management Phases of the budgeting process; Participatory Budgeting; Current methods and the importance of revenue forecasting; The concept and methods of expenditure classification; Use of trend analysis; Elaboration of the capital budgeting process; Cost Benefit Analysis; Interested parties in the budget adoption process; The new concept of the budget calendar - sequence of steps	80 financial officers from 75 local self government units (2 two-day workshops)
2006	Implementation of System of Internal Control, Internal	Internal Control, Internal Audit and Fraud Prevention	72 financial officers from 50 local self

Year	Project	Training topics	No of participants
	Audit and Fraud Prevention in the Local Self Government Units		government units (3 two-day workshops in Nov/Dec 2006)
2006	Capacity building for the councilors of Kumanovo and Gostivar training	Different leadership skills for the councilors <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - decision making - institution building - leadership 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 5 workshops organized in each municipality - 20 participants per workshop
2006	Administering Local Taxes and Fees in the Local Self Government Units	General introduction about local taxes; Practical implementation of the local taxes.	149 financial officers from 76 local self government units (3 workshops in Sep/Oct 2006)
2006	Advanced training of trainers program	Local Government Management – Management Styles	11 participants (1 one-day training for Heads of Departments and Units in the Municipality of Gj. Petrov in Sep 2006)
2006	Capacity Building of Councilors from the Municipality of Caska	Decentralization – general; Law on Local Self-Government; Participatory planning; Concept of citizen participation; Financing of the local self-government units	15 participants (1 two-day training for the eleven council members and representatives of municipal administration in Aug 2006)
2007	Supporting the Implementation of the Process of Fiscal Decentralization	Assistance in the Field of Administration of Local Taxes and Fees;	125 tax officers from 67 local self government units (3 workshops in May 2007)
		Supporting the Functioning of the Treasury System;	119 financial officers from 64 local self government units (3 workshops in Jun/ Oct/ Nov 2007)
		Implementation of the System of Internal Control and Internal Audit in the Local Self Government Units	50 internal auditors from 45 local self government units (3 workshops in

Year	Project	Training topics	No of participants
			Sep 2007)
2007	Summary Conference on the Tax System and Administering Local Taxes	Building capacities of the local tax officers in administration of local taxes and fees Providing updated information for the regulations regarding local taxes and fees	130 participants (tax officers) from 80 local self government units (one workshop in Nov 2007)
2007	Capacity Building of Local Government Councilors	Councilors as communicators; Councilors as facilitator; Councilors as decision maker; Councilors as negotiator; Councilors as financier	60 participants (municipal councilors) from 5 local self-government units (Valandovo, Dojran, Probistip, Dolneni, Makedonski Brod) – 5 trainings in the period Sep/Nov 2007
2008	Anti-corruption strategies at local level	Strategic approach for diagnosing, curing and preventing corruption in the local self-government units	28 participants from 13 local self government units (one workshop in Jan 2008)
2008	Capacity Building of Local Government Councilors II	Councilors as communicators; Councilors as facilitator; Councilors as decision maker; Councilors as negotiator; Councilors as financier	25 participants (municipal councilors) from 4 local self-government units (Berovo, Suto Orizari, Debar, Makedonska Kamenica) – 5 trainings in the period Apr/ June 2008
2004	Promotion of Gender Equality at Local Level	Presentation skills (such as public speaking and writing); Project proposal development; advocacy and general management; Networking; Institutional set-up	10 municipal Gender Equality Commissions (225 participants)
2007	Implementation of the Law on General Administrative Procedure in the	Legal framework on administrative procedures Legal framework on urban planning	230 (municipal urbanism inspectors, state inspectors,

Year	Project	Training topics	No of participants
	Urbanism Departments in the Local Self-Government Units		municipal administration on urbanism)
2008	Implementation of the Law on General Administrative Procedure in the field of education	Administrative procedures in the field of education	250 (school secretaries, municipal education inspector)
2004	PDU project on CAG	Process of decentralization and local self government	331 CAG members – respected citizens, NGO and police officers
2005	PARU training activities	to present the concept of local self government and decentralization	658 neighborhood self government representatives in different municipalities workshops for NGO representatives and OSCE mission members
	ToT for municipal officers	Training of trainers – adult learning principles, preparation of training	Selected municipal finance officers – the selection was done by USAID
2006	PARU training	Leadership skills for municipal councilors	78 Municipal councilors in several municipalities
	PARU training	Process of decentralization and local self government	80 NGO representatives, neighborhood self government
2007	Capacity building for CICR	CICR concepts, establishment and operations.	80 CICR members, municipal councilors and administration

Civil Servants Agency

List of trainings delivered to Civil Servants in the local self government in the period 2004-2007

2007

P.6.	Subject	Number of participants
1.	Training on production of Rulebook on systematization	60
2.	Financial Management and Fiscal Decentralization Trainng	60
3.	Human Resource Management Workshop	(no information)
	Total	120

2006

P.6.	Subject	Number of participants
1.	Training on training needs assessment and Annual training programme	57
2.	Training on evaluation	203
3.	Training on interview	75
	Total	335

2005

P.6.	Subject	Number of participants
1.	Civil Service and Public Administration System in R.M	75
2.	Workshop on organizational structure and human resources in municipalities	277
3.	Human resource Management Workshop	38
	Total	390

2004

P.6.	Subject	Number of participants
1.	Civil Service and Public Administration System in R.M	61

In the period 2004-2007 , CSA has organized 32 thematic trainings in total (2004 - 6, 2005 - 13, 2006 – 5, 2007 - 8)* for Civil Servants on central and local level.

*Note: in the evidence are included BAO, ММП (except for 2006) и and the Venice Commission

2007

Total number of traianings	Total number of participants
8	301

2006

Total number of trainings	Total number of participants
5	522

2005

Total number of trainings	Total number of participants
13	480

2004

Total number of trainings	Total number of participants
6	354

MCIC Review of trainings in 2004 – programme “Enabling of communities and institutions” (OZI)

Training/Workshop	Municipality	Days	Participants	Men	Women	LSG U/ NGO /bys
Project Cycle Management (RPC)						
Training for the municipality administration on PCM ZELS project supported by SDC . (MCIC was a provider)	106 municip.	10x2=20	173	112	61	173/0/0
Institutional Development/Organisational Strengthening						
Training for the communities and NGOs on ID/OS	1. Vinica (4) 2. Podares (4) 3. Lozovo (2) 4. Staro Nagoricane (4) 5. Mavrovi Anovi (3) 6. Resen (4) 7. Gazi B. (2) 8. Saraj (3)	2x3=6	30	15	15	16/14/0
Administrative work						
Training for the communities and NGOs on administrative work	1.Sv.Nikole(4) 2.Gevgelija (4) 3. Lozovo (4) 4. Podares (4) 5. Vasilevo (3) 6. Zrnovci (4) 7. Kocani (4) 8.Radovis (4)	2x2=4	37	20	17	16/21/0
Fundraising						
How to approach the donors	1.Valandovo(4) 2.Saraj (4)	1x3=3	19	14	5	8/11/0

	3. Gazi B. (4) 4. Podares (4)					
New products						
Strategic orientation for economic development of Jegunovce Municipality - workshop	1. Jegunovce 22	2	22	15	7	8/11/0
Capacity building for LER	1. Stip 2. Kicevo	14	35	20	15	
Workshop for the communities how to apply for preparation of LEAP	1. Jegunovce(5) 2. Karbinci(4)	2	9	4	5	5/4/0
Total		51	325	200	125	

MCIC Review of trainings in 2005 – programme "Enabling of communities and institutions" (OZI)

Training/Workshop	Municipality	Days	Participants	Men	Women	LSG U/ NGO/ bys
Project Cycle Management (PCM)						
Training on PCM for the public utility companies (PUC)	14 PUC	2 x 3=6	28	17	11	
Training for the communities and NGOs on Project Planning	Kocani (4) Karbinci (4) Krivogastani (4) Prilep (4) Bitola(2) Valandovo (4) Kr.Palanka(3) Probistip (4)	2 x 3=6	30	20	10	15/15/0
Institutional Development/Organisational Strengthening (ID/OS)						
Training for the communities and NGOs on Strategic Planning	Debarca (4) Strumica (4) Prilep (4) Rosoman (4) D.Hisar (3) Lozovo (3) Zelenikovo (1) Caska (4)	2 x 3=6	27	15	12	12/15/0
Administrative work						
Training for the communities and NGOs on administrative work	Gazi B. (4) Cair (4) Oslomej (2) Rankovce (4) Cesinovo-	2 x 2=4	26	14	12	14/12/0

	Ob(4) Zelino (4) Jegunovce (4)					
Fundraising		6	32	23	9	
Training on How to Access the Donors	Novo Selo (4) Debarca (4) Novaci (4) Zelenikovo(4) Jegunovce(4) Rankovce(4) Zelino(4) Ilinden (4)	2 x 3=6	32	23	9	16/16/0
Participation in Decision Making		3	14	11	3	
Training on Citizensq Participation in the Decision Making	Karbinci (14)	1 x 3=3	14	11	3	10/4/0
Taylor made trainings, consultation and facilitation		24	60	48	12	
Workshop: Preparation of Communities for Developing Application Forms	Veles (3) Gradsko (4) Caska (2)	1 x 3=3	9	4	5	9/0/0
Workshop: Preparation of Communities for the Application Process	Kocani (5) Bitola (4) Dolneni (3) Krivogastani (3)	1 x 3=3	14	7	7	14/0/0
Training on Sustainability Practices for the public utility companies	16 PUC	3 x 6=18	16	16	0	
Study visit to foreign municipalities	Mayors of Mogila Debarca Zelino St.Nagorica ne C.Zupa	1 x 4=4	5	5	0	5/0/0
Visit of success stories	Lozovo (6) Zelino (2) Mogila (4) S.Nagorica (4)	1 x 3=3	16	16	0	16/0/0
Total		62	217	148	69	

MCIC Review of trainings in 2006 – programme "local development of the communities" (LRZ)

Training/Workshop	Municipality	Days	Participants	Men	Women	LSGU/ NGO/bys
Training: Project planning	Shtip	2	14	10	4	7/7/0
Training:: Regional development and spatial	Kriva Palanka	3	20	13	7	13/7/0

planning of Kriva Palanka						
Training: Scenario planning for local economic development of Debar	Debar	3	16	15	1	9/1/6
Workshop: Planning and management with the agriculture land property and the other natural resurces in Macedonia	13 rural municipalities	2	17	14	3	14/3/0
Workshop: Defining the priorities of capacity building in communities	Dolneni Prilep Lozovo Karbinci S,Nagoricane Veles Saraj	2	14	13	1	13/1/0
Training: The citizen participation in the decision making process	Lozovo	3	16	14	2	5/6/5
Total:		15	97	79	18	61/25/11

MCIC Review of trainings in 2007 – programme “local development of the communities” (LRZ)

Training/Workshop	Municipality	Days	Participants	Men	Women	LSGU/ NGO/bys
Project cycle and project portfolio management						
Project planning 07 08 202	Caska (4) Konce (3) Tearce (3)	3	11	7	4	9/3/0
Workshop for project formulation 07 08 203	19 ADKOM reepresent.	2	19	15	4	
Workshop for identifying the priorities in the communities 07 08 201	Prilep (2) Dolneni (2) Staro N (2) Tearce (2) Jegunovce (2) Caska (2) Konce (2) Saraj (2) Lozovo (1) Karbinci (2) Mogila (2) Veles (2)	2	23	17	6	23/0/0
Relations with the Stakeholders(Institutional Development)						
Participative approaches of work in the communities 07 08 204	Prilep/FPR(17)	2	17	15	2	
Development of local partnerships	Prilep/FPR(21)	2	21	21	0	

07 08 204						
Workshop for lobbying and representation 07 08 203	13 ZELS reeprerent.	3	13	4	9	
Visit of the positive examples 07 08 202	Caska (5) Konce (3) Tearce (3)	3	12	9	3	9/3/0
Organizational strengthening						
Human recourses management 07 08 201	Prilep (2) Dolneni (2) Saraj (2) Lozovo (4) Karbinci (2) Veles (2)	3	14	7	7	14/0/0
Team work and team management 07 08 201	Dolneni (2) Saraj (2) Lozovo (2) Staro N (2) Karbinci (2) Veles (3)	3	13	9	4	13/0/0
Resources						
Training on How to Access the Donors and preparation of applications 07 08 201	Dolneni (2) Saraj (1) Lozovo (2) Mogila (1) Prilep (2) Karbinci (2) Veles (2)	3	12	5	7	12/0/0
Introduction in Instrument for Pre-Accession Assistance IPA 07 08 201	Dolneni (2) Saraj (1) Lozovo (2) Mogila (1) Prilep (2) Karbinci (1) Veles (2) Staro N. (2)	2	13	7	6	13/0/0
Total:		28	168	116	52	