

COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS

(Covering Working Sessions 14-15)

This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is organized by Working Sessions and by what was submitted by Delegations / International Organizations / NGOs to participating States and, separately, to OSCE Institutions / Field Missions or other International Organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language.

Please note that the deadline for submitting Recommendations to the HDIM Documentation Centre is Thursday, 12 October 2006.

Wednesday, 11 October 2006

WORKING SESSION 14 – Tolerance and non-discrimination II, including:

Recommendations to participating States:

National Minorities

Germany – the autochthonous national minorities

- The Minority Council of the four autochthonous national minorities in Germany is emphatic on the concern of the Central Council for German Sinti and Romanies to step-up international efforts against the dissemination of hatred and racism on the Internet and to define new cross-national fight measures. The Federal Government is therefore asked to hold an international conference in Berlin against rightist extremist hate propaganda with participation of the media and provider industry in order to promote appropriate measures and clear-up unsolved questions of principle.
- **Involvement of the Federal Government concerning costs of the minority school system** In order to ensure their cultural reproduction, national minorities - like the majority of the population, too - must rely on the supporting mediation of knowledge and values that is provided by elementary educational institutions (schools etc.).
- The implementation of the European guidelines for protection against discrimination into national law has finally occurred in the middle of 2006 in the shape of the Equal Treatment Act. However, the adopted law does not grant any right to sue on behalf of the victims to acknowledged representations of national minorities (as anti-discrimination organisations) as required by guideline 2000/43/EG of June 29, 2000 (19). For an actual realisation of anti-discrimination measures the Minority Council regards it as necessary to allow organisations the right to sue in order to provide effective aid to victims of discrimination.

Council of Europe:

- To encourage States that have not yet signed or ratified the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities or the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, to do so.
- To stress the need to raise awareness about minority issues and about regional identity issues not only in Central and Eastern Europe, but also in Western Europe.
- To Stress the importance for States to fully implement the results of the monitoring under the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, including through the adoption of relevant legislation and its implementation in practice.
- To encourage States to ensure that there is no arbitrary exclusion of persons potentially concerned by the protection offered by the Framework Convention.
- To stress the importance of dialogue with minorities as a necessary pre-condition for further realising the rights of persons belonging to national minorities.
- To Underline the importance of the successful co-operation that has taken place between the OSCE HCNM and the relevant sectors of the Council of Europe dealing with minority issues, and encouraging the further use of the results of the monitoring under the Framework Convention and the Language Charter by the OSCE and by the field offices of the OSCE in their assessments and their actions.

AKDER - Women's Rights Organization Against Discrimination

- We request the responsible authorities to make an urgent solution to the immense disruption to career, personal and family life which overseas doctors are facing as a result of these new rules. Many of these doctors have been working hard in the NHS and serving the British public as an important component for several years.

Civil Rights Project – Vukovar:

We recommend to the government of Croatia to:

- Give a high priority to the provision of adequate housing and implement in a forceful and affirmative way without delay the programmes for former occupancy/tenancy right holders.

- Also, we recommend to the European Union and the OSCE Mission to Croatia to: continue providing assistance to the Government of Croatia so that it can successfully carry out this process.

Constantinopolitan Society:

Since Turkey has decided to make its relation with Europe more concrete and finally become a member of the European family, it has to abide by values such as rule of law and democracy. Unfortunately, until this very moment Turkey impeded the minorities from exercising their internationally recognized rights.

- Turkey should align itself with European standards and its policies should change in order to meet the spirit and the letter of article 9 of the European Convention on Human Rights.

Foundation of Regional Initiatives:

- Особенности статуса коренных народов Украины должны закрепляться предоставлением указанным этносам именно определенных характерных коллективных прав, которые предлагается назвать этническими; а также особых индивидуальных прав представителям коренных народов, для случаев предотвращения возможности исчезновения малочисленных народов Крыма и устранения последствий депортации крымских татар.

International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights:

*To the government of **Bulgaria**:*

- React promptly to hate speech in the media and any statements that incite ethnically motivated hatred against minority groups, thereby making it clear that such acts will not be tolerated, and encourage prosecutors to take legal steps in such cases;
- Enhance its efforts against discrimination against Roma and their social exclusion, particularly in the spheres of education, housing, employment, and healthcare, and ensure that demolition of Roma houses takes place only after consultation with the families and when alternative accommodation for them is found;
- Recognize identity, stop harassment and discrimination and ensure freedom of assembly and association of ethnic Macedonians. This includes putting an end to secret police monitoring of their activities.

*To the government of **Croatia**:*

- Continue to make it clear in public statements that discrimination, hate-speech and violence against national and ethnic minorities shall not be tolerated, and encourage prosecutors to take legal steps in cases that amount to violations under international standards on minority rights and protection, and under Croatian legislation;
- Take practical steps to ensure the full implementation of regulations against ethnic discrimination: control the local outlets of public (state) administration lest they commit or tolerate any kind of discrimination;
- Take measures to enforce the acts on rights of ethnic minorities and on local elections, which oblige the local authorities to update the regional and municipal statutes to the effect of guaranteeing proportional minority representation in local bodies. It should also consider introducing repercussions for those regions/municipalities, which refuse to follow the standards set by national legislation;
- Pass appropriate legislation (notably the Act on Free Legal Aid) to provide possibilities for human rights NGOs to take an active part in the protection against discrimination.

*To the government of **Turkey**:*

- As the first steps toward adequate minority policy, promptly reform its official minority policy so as to reflect the actual existence of minorities in Turkey, and to officially recognize all national, ethnic and religious minorities and provide them the support and protection guaranteed by the international human rights instruments Turkey is party to;
- In the meantime, actively promote the education, language, property and other rights of the three now formally recognized minority groups.

Take steps to revoke laws that can be used to restrict the legitimate rights of minorities, and open discussion on minorities, including articles 216 and 301 and of the Penal Code, and articles 6 and 7 of the recently amended Law on the Fight against Terrorism, as well as several articles of the Law of Political Parties which restrict the minorities' freedom of association.

Rainbow - Organization of the Macedonian Minority in Greece

- The most democratic and accurate way to measure the number of persons belonging to a linguistic or national minority is not through elections but through the national census. Unfortunately the right to express one's linguistic or national

identity is not possible through the Greek census. We strongly encourage the Greek government to make this possible at the next census in 2011.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

- We recommend Greece fully implement the provisions of the 1990 OSCE Copenhagen Document.
- We recommend Greece to ratify the Council of Europe's Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities that has signed 1997.
- Furthermore, we recommend Greece to fully implement all the regional and international instruments, which has signed and ratified, for the protection of minority rights.

Prevention of aggressive nationalism, chauvinism and ethnic cleansing

International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights:

To the Russian authorities:

- Publicly acknowledge the seriousness of the problem of racism and intolerance in the country and speak out firmly against any forms of racism or xenophobia. Make clear that racist behavior will not be tolerated by any actors, including government officials and political leaders;
- With active participation of civil society, elaborate and adopt a comprehensive strategy for preventing and combating racism and intolerance in different areas of society and make available sufficient resources to facilitate adequate implementation of this strategy at the federal, regional and local levels;
- Establish a country-wide system for monitoring and documenting the occurrence of racist attacks and engage in efforts to encourage the victims of such attacks to report their experiences to police, including by ensuring that all complaints of discrimination at the hands of law enforcement authorities are effectively dealt with and that officials guilty of discrimination are held accountable;
- Ensure that all reported cases of racist and xenophobic violence are promptly, thoroughly and effectively investigated and prosecuted with due consideration given to the motivations of the perpetrators. With a view to facilitating the full and active application of Criminal Code provisions allowing for the prosecution of crimes with racial hatred as an aggravating circumstance, guidelines should be adopted and trainings organized for law enforcement and judicial authorities;

- Take effective measures to promote understanding and appreciation of ethnic, cultural and religious diversity. Such efforts could include campaigns to raise awareness among the public of the positive contribution of migrants and minority members to Russian society, economy and culture; tolerance education for students; and trainings for journalists on how to exercise responsibility and avoid perpetuating prejudice when reporting on issues related to migrants and minority members.

Recommendations to the OSCE:

National Minorities

Russian Federation:

- Положение национальных меньшинств в Латвии и Эстонии нуждается в постоянном мониторинге со стороны институтов ОБСЕ. Особо хотелось бы подчеркнуть необходимость наращивания усилий Верховного комиссара ОБСЕ по защите и поощрению прав и свобод нетитульного населения этих стран в рамках традиционно присущего ему конструктивного и сбалансированного подхода.
- Ожидаем от Действующего председательства и Верховного комиссара ОБСЕ принципиальной оценки ситуации с правами национальных меньшинств в Грузии.

Serbia:

There are certainly few things that OSCE could do to improve gloomy and grim situation for Kosovo Serbs.

- Since 2003 there is no monitoring of human rights by the OSCE. Revitalizing this monitoring would be more than helpful.
- [In accordance with that], Ombudsperson, an international one that would deal only with human rights of non-Albanians and Serbs would be a great help for those communities and their survival.
- OSCE could be a helping hand in the process of establishing mechanisms that would prevent outvoting of Serbs during future participation in the Assembly of Pristina.

International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights:

To the OSCE, the Council of Europe, and the European Union:

- Continue close monitoring of the implementation of all relevant regulations on minority protection and against discrimination in all the above-mentioned countries, recognising that their implementation, as well as public awareness, are now more critical than formal reforms on legal and institutional levels;
- Ensure the continuation of such monitoring also after the possible closure of their own networks of local offices, utilising the networks of local NGOs.

Prevention of aggressive nationalism, chauvinism and ethnic cleansing

Russian Federation:

- Мы призываем ОБСЕ, Верховного комиссара ОБСЕ по делам нацменьшинств Р.Экеуса, а также Евросоюз активизировать усилия по обеспечению в полном объеме прав русскоязычного населения в Латвии и Эстонии.

Order of St. Andrew:

- The OSCE should undertake a thorough examination of the Turkish judiciary, which Cengiz Candar, a prominent columnist for the Turkish newspaper *Bugun*, has called “one of the most reactionary and backward institutions in Turkey.”
- The OSCE should undertake a thorough examination of the “properties” issue, and seek to expose how the Turkish judiciary is conspiring with government officials in the confiscation of property belonging to the Ecumenical Patriarchate and its affiliated institutions, such as hospitals, monasteries, community schools, and seminaries.

WORKING SESSION 15 – Tolerance and non-discrimination II (continued), including:

Recommendations to participating States:

Roma/Sinti; Implementation of the OSCE Action Plan on Roma and Sinti Issues

United States of America:

- The practice of arbitrary eviction [...] is a recipe for disaster and is inconsistent with the commitments that participating States here have undertaken to respect the rights of Roma, and to seek to end their marginalization. [...] We urge governments to exercise appropriate oversight in this area, and to intervene when necessary to ensure that the rights of Roma are respected. Given the scope of this problem, the United States believes the OSCE participating States should consider giving greater attention to this subject, perhaps in the form of specialized meeting.
- The United States urges the Russian authorities to aggressively investigate and prosecute such violent crimes [against Roma].
- We urge the Czech Government to implement the Public Defender's recommendations [on the matter of sterilization of Romani women without informed consent].

European Union:

- The Decade of Roma Inclusion and the OSCE Action Plan for the Improvement of the Situation of Roma and Sinti in the OSCE Area represent a good policy framework. However, they should be fully used in order to increase co-operation between International Organisations, Governments, as well as between Governments and NGOs. Cooperation is essential for trust building and better mutual understanding.
- It is important to ensure Roma and Sinti the opportunity to participate fully in the economic, social and political life. As a first step, we need to work together to overcome centuries of biased, prejudiced discrimination and social exclusion. Participation requires real involvement;
- The problems Roma and Sinti face could only be solved with the will and support of the Roma and Sinti communities themselves. An assistance-oriented approach to their problems should be discouraged and the initiatives stemming from within the respective ethnic communities be supported. An inclusive Romani grassroots movement that would focus on equal opportunities should replace the existing project-based approach.

- Roma and Sinti should be given the means to decide for themselves. Alongside with the support of the Central or regional Government or of local authorities, Roma and Sinti communities must participate and be fully associated with their own inclusion and development. This task would require a coordinated action in a number of fields, in particular those of education, employment, housing, health and social services. The responsibility for finding a solution to these issues will mainly lie with national bodies and with regional and local authorities, as the latter are the places where the Roma are most likely to participate and be represented.
- Acknowledgement, respect and support for Roma and Sinti culture and languages should be prerequisites to adopting and implementing national policies for the inclusion of Roma and Sinti.
- We welcome the recommendations made by the above-mentioned international conferences on the implementation of Roma, Sinti and Travellers-related policies held in Warsaw, Poland, in October 2005 and in Bucharest, Romania, in May, 2006 outlining the need to set up task forces, with national and international representation and resources, to fight against racism and discrimination, in particular in policy areas relevant for Roma and Sinti (e.g. defining the legal status of the settlements and housing facilities inhabited by Roma families, curbing the practices of segregated classes and schools for Roma and Travellers children and youth, combating racist attitudes of the general public towards Roma and Sinti).

“AMALIPE” Center for Interethnic Dialogue and Tolerance

- A straightforward policy should be developed at the national and international level taking into consideration the cultural and social profile of the most vulnerable groups subject to trafficking. This means de-segregating data to show who is most vulnerable to trafficking.
- A set of measures should be developed at the national level to foster the adequate re-integration of children and women victims to trafficking. Social services in countries of origin, like Bulgaria, need to become more inclusive towards Roma communities.
- Programs and projects should include Roma experts as equal partners with organizations working in the field.
- Tougher measures (including legislation) should be developed at the national level in both countries of origin and destination. In addition, those responsible in countries of destination for fueling the demand for trafficking of babies should face criminal prosecution.

Several immediate steps are necessary for ensuring the process of Roma educational integration and SEI implementation:

- ***Mainstreaming the Roma educational integration and SEI implementation.*** MES should raise the issues of Roma integration as integral part and mean for modernization of Bulgarian education. This includes usage of main programs managed by MES (the component for providing bus transportation from the National Program for Better Inclusion of Students Compulsory to Education, the program for computerization and others) for the needs of SEI implementation. Significant changes in the National Program for Development of School and Pre-school Education (2006-2015) directed to incorporation of the main SEI points as well as to avoiding those points from the Program that would deteriorate the educational level of Roma community are necessary.
- ***Establishing proper administrative infrastructure for SEI implementation.*** This includes strengthening the infrastructure at national level (within MES) and establishing regional one.
- Special experts whose main responsibilities would be Roma educational integration and SEI implementation should be appointed. Their Roma origin would be an asset.
- ***Connecting SEI implementation with EU structural funds.*** SEI implementation as a whole and the work of the Center for Educational Integration should be connected with the process of Structural funds absorption. It is a subject of urgent activities to include important points connected with Roma educational integration in the Operational Program for Human Recourse Development.
- ***Establishing proper forms for cooperation between Roma NGOs and MES.*** The Consultative Council for Education of Children and Students from the Ethnic Minorities' 17th important disadvantage of all programs for training of teacher assistants until now is that they do not provide employment after the training should be re-established. It is important for it to provide opportunities for proper Roma representation and not to limit it. Clear and democratic procedures for defining the Roma representatives in the Council are necessary. The same is valid for selecting Roma representatives in the Board of the Center for Educational Integration.

NATIONAL PROGRAM FOR IMPROVING THE LIVING CONDITIONS OF ROMA (2005 – 2015)

- The Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works in cooperation with the National Council for Cooperation on Ethnic and Demographic Issues and approved by the Council of Ministers should develop a concept for the establishment of a special “Directorate” for implementation of the National

Program for improving the living conditions of Roma in Bulgaria, involving Roma professionals;

- The Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works should establish a Steering Committee composed of representatives of all concerned ministries and state institutions involved in the Program implementation, as well as representatives of local Roma communities and leading Roma NGOs with proven record of activities in addressing housing issues in order to bring transparency and build credibility of the Program;
- The Ministry of Regional Development and Public Works should implement a wide information campaign amongst the public society and the Roma community about the Program and its implementation on ongoing basis;
- The government should develop in joint collaboration with local NGOs and respective institutions a stronger policy framework and sustainable settlement of legal and property issues that also corresponds to the understanding and respect of the ethnic diversity;
- The government should provide the availability of financing instruments and cease the wrongful practice of delegating the responsibility and stay put only to the EU funds;
- Action and indicators should be envisaged in the Operational programs that would support the implementation of the Program for Improving of the Living Condition of Roma
- The government should cease the discrimination practice of evicting Roma slums and instead develop concrete housing projects with the support of technical expertise and monitoring mechanisms of EU Commission, World Bank, EBRD, UNDP Bulgaria, Roma NGOs, etc.
- Solving the housing problem of Roma living in rural areas should become an object of special concern and actions;
- Solving the housing issues of Roma in Bulgaria has to be set as priority and urgent need to be addressed, however other problems have to be also tackled and solutions provided – provision of employment, improvement of access to quality education and health care services.

SOCIAL POLICES FOR THE ROMA COMMUNITY IN BULGARIA

- The Government needs to collect official data about the ethnic origin of the recipients of different programs. This will help the relevant bodies to apply more effective programs in the social inclusion process.

- Systematic research is needed on the situation of the Roma communities in relation to their access to public services and their relations with the bigger society, which could feed in the process of policy design.
- There is a need for better targeted social programs involving the stakeholders from the Roma communities. Such programs should address the specific needs of different target groups like children, unemployed people, elderly people and other vulnerable groups in the Roma community.
- There is a need to upgrade the skills of people in helping professions to work in a modern, flexible and client friendly way. This should produce even better results than the efforts on improving the targeting of social programs.
- Working in the field of social inclusion all programs addressing Roma need to include Roma people in the managing bodies. This approach will help the better implementation of the projects.
- There is a need to create good monitoring mechanisms under all mainstream employment and social programs especially under the programs targeting vulnerable minority groups because the general public is very sensitive to such public spending. The new generation of such programs include The National Roma Literacy and Training Program and the Program “Integration on the Labor Market of Vulnerable Ethnic Minority Groups. These programs are an indication that the Ministry of labor and Social Policy is seeking a balance between access of Roma to mainstream actions and special targeted programs. It is still to be evaluated whether such a balance will be successfully achieved.
- There is a need to continue the trend to promoting more active attitudes on the labor market and creating the right incentives, which encourage activity and discourage dependence. In this process it is crucial however to keep in mind the special situation of some groups of Roma where long-term dependence on social benefits has already reached high levels. The quick and straightforward enforcement of the new rules can create social tensions and exacerbate the existing problems of such groups.
- Significant changes in the draft of Operational Program for Human Resource Development both inside and outside the “Roma part”. The Program should include nonformal tangible specific activities directed to Roma in most of its operations as well as relevant indicators. Roma should be defined as one of the target groups. As a whole the Program should define the future framework for actions for Roma integration and to establish guarantee for their implementation.

Association of Christian Churches in Russia

I would like to introduce following proposals for the OSCE:

- To propose to the State-members of the OSCE to spread among the officials and judges of their countries information about international agreements in the field of religious freedoms, about the judicial opinion of the European Court of Human Rights;
- To recommend to the European Council to shorten the terms of examination of the cases about the violation of the rights of the believers in the former Soviet Union countries in the European Court of Human Rights.

Athinganoi

- Member States should request from the OSCE institutions and field operations to assist them in implementation of measures related to Police.

Belarusian Roma Lawyers Group

- I want to ask more attention from international community for national minorities right in Belarus. Without yours attention nothing can happens.

Circle of Youth:

THE RECONSTRUCTION OF THE RROMANI MAHALA IN MITROVICA Analysis and proposal for a durable solution

Travels and conferences

- A budget for travels between Kosovo and Diaspora sites is needed during all the period of elaboration of this project. It included 4 to 6 travels yearly for 2 persons of the steering committee in Paris and 1 to 2 travels for the heads of families who will be consulted in order to make the project acceptable by the families.

Summer schools and other extra school activities

- At least 3 or 4 weeks of summer schools every year during the 5 first years of the program will be necessary, preferably on the spot, in order to familiarize the young potential returnees with the conditions of life in Mitrovica, while providing them with useful knowledge in Rromani and active citizenship especially.
- Similarly, excursions to other Rromani settlements in the Balkan can be of great effect for the children's self-esteem, as well as correspondence (including through web-cam) with other young Rroms in the world.

Media lobby

- This part of the program is momentous since it will accompany and mirror for the wide readership in Kosovo all the positive steps taken by the negotiations and

reconstruction itself; it will include a well devised strategy of inter-ethnic reconciliation and a small group of 2 to 4 persons, speaking as well Rromani as Albanian, Serbian and English will be needed on a regular basis for this purpose. A specific training will be probably needed for them at the beginning of their action.

Publications

- It will be very important to start the publication of educational material in Rromani for the future curriculum and extra school programs. Printing will be trust afterwards to Kosovo implants after approbation by the Ministry of Education and Science. Material about the Ashkali/Egyptian minority will also be developed in Albanian and Serbian languages.
- Standing consultation with this Ministry and with the school book expert group at INALCO (acting for dozens of minority languages all over the world, under prof. Genevève Zarate's headship) will be granted to the preparatory team of the school and extra school publications.

Political support to achieve recognition of Rromani as a European language and the Rroms as a European Minority with no compact territory

- Not only funds are necessary, but also political support at all the levels where it can be of some profit for the restoration of intercultural life, including the European (CoE, OSCE, EU etc...) and world wide (UNO and similar) levels. Special attention will be drawn to exchanges with governments of countries where important Rromani communities live, including countries where a very positive pilot action has resulted very benefic during the last decade in this field.

Aid for the involvement of elder Rroms with a good command of Rromani

- Many activities can be done with elder Rroms, for example research of collective memory and local history through Rromani language exchanges with them.

Health aid for the Rroms settled in the polluted areas of Trepça

- The sanitary conditions of many Rroms living in Trepça of scavenging lead are quite appalling and a specific aid for them is very much needed. The recent evacuation does not seem to address the problem, since the new location is also polluted. This topic, as well as the concrete steps to be taken for ensuring an appropriate health aid could be discussed in the meetings of the commission.

European Roma Rights Centre

- The authorities of the OSCE participating states should immediately stop the deportation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians to Kosovo, as well as to the rest of Serbia and Montenegro, because these forced expulsions violate our dignity and our fundamental human rights. These states should also cease, without delay, any

forms of arbitrary pressure on Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians to go to Kosovo, Serbia or Montenegro.

National Roma Centrum

Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians after the war conflicts in the Balkan region are still refugees, IDP's, failed asylum seekers, or are facing with deportation from countries of Western Europe. Although their free and safe return to Kosovo is guaranteed with various measures and standards. About 100.000 Roma are still refugees from Kosovo.

- All efforts therefore must be made to remove existing obstacles with regard to the return to the places of origin, and refugees and internally displaced persons have the fundamental human right to return to their homes, irrespective of their ethnicity, in either a spontaneous or an organized and assisted manner.
- The issue of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian returnees from Western Europe should be discussed in the status talks in the framework of decentralization.
- All efforts therefore must be made to remove existing obstacles with regard to the return to the places of origin,

IDPs/refugees within and outside Kosovo live in unstable and often unacceptable conditions in locations other than their place of origin, facing with many difficulties and problems that are endangering their existence and future.

- Concrete Plan and Strategy for the Roma refugee and IDP's community should be adopted and implemented.
- Civil registration and lack of personal documentation among the Roma community must be solved due to the proper statistic database for census or elections on Kosovo, and the fact that personal documentation is condition for performing other civil rights.
- Special programmes for return and reintegration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians (RAE) on Kosovo, based upon free will and real opportunity to integrate in the society.
- To assist to IDP's and returnees to repossess their real estate and personal property on Kosovo as pre-condition for normal living or to secure for them normal living standards and housing if needed in other possible areas.

OSI Joint Roma Women Initiative:

Taking in consideration the increased awareness on the situation of Romani women in OSCE Area and that this group reflect the intersectional discrimination and multiple discrimination; the

OSI Joint Roma Women initiative is signaling its coalition with the other groups in Europe facing multiple discrimination and calls :

- Participating states to support the organization of an OSCE conference on multiple discrimination.

Roma Participation Program, Open Society Institute Budapest

- Housing policies of governments past and present in Central and Eastern Europe have led to regional and geographic isolation and segregation of Roma settlements. [...] These settlements need to be incorporated into urban plans, public services must be available so that living conditions for Roma meet WHO concept of adequate housing. In the short term we strongly urge that the governments in both Romania and Bulgaria to seek recourse to more humane resolutions than forced evictions.

Romani CRISS:

- Most European countries have still to set up, make functional or extend the following minimum mechanisms:
 - Publicly and unequivocally condemn racism against national minorities, including Roma
 - Design and implement police intervention plans taking into account the minimum use of force
 - Put in place an independent structure to adequately investigate law enforcement officials' misbehavior.
- This is not just a question of misbehavior, but also a question of taking concrete measures, ab initio and post factum to avoid such conduct. It is therefore of utmost necessity to work on preventive measures, to ensure to the highest degree possible that misbehavior does not appear in practice. To this end, it should be made use of OSCE expertise and institutions and make the OSCE Action Plan on Roma and Sinti work, to actually implement it and in the same time to contribute to OSCE institutions to fulfill their mandate.
- On a concrete manner, member countries should invite OSCE institutions, particularly the ODIHR and the Strategic Police Matters Unit to assist on the measure/mechanisms mentioned above, as well as on others, based on para. 10, 11, 16, 17, 22, 27 and 35 of the Action Plan.
- We are kindly asking the Romanian Government to provide information about the involvement of the state representatives, especially the representatives of the Ministry of Administration and Interior in raising awareness at all levels about the

illegality of police forces interventions in Roma communities, from criminal and administrative point of view.

- We are kindly asking the Romania Government to provide information about the penalties imposed on local government officials who engage in discriminatory practices against Roma in the area of housing.

To governments of Romania, Macedonia and Bulgaria:

- Kindly provide information if Romanian, Macedonian and Bulgarian Governments consider inviting the OSCE relevant institution (Strategic Police Matters Unit, HCNM and CPRSI) to assist them undertaking effective analyses and investigation for most recent cases of police abuse in mentioned countries.

To the Bulgarian Parliament:

Considering the article 40 of the Document of the Copenhagen Meeting of the Conference on the Human Dimension of the CSCE and the articles no. 9, 19, 96 and 98 of the OSCE Action Plan on improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti in the OSCE area and the article IV.41 of the OSCE Action Plan for promoting gender equality in participating States.

- Kindly provide information about concrete cases of penalties imposed on officials who engage in discriminatory practices and hate speeches against Roma in the OSCE Area.

Romani NGOs registered to the ODIHR Human Dimension Implementation Meeting:

We are concerned about the lack of international response to the plans to demolish the Sulukule settlement in Turkey.

- We would like the meeting to also address the other Romani neighborhoods being demolished in Istanbul. Without proper consideration being made to the inhabitants they are as a result being made homeless.
- Moreover we are recommending implementing our recommendation to renovate the neighborhoods and complying with the article 43 of the Action Plan for Roma and Sinti Issues.

The participants of Workshop in Durres (Albania, July 2006) for Developing the Strategy for Integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities:

- We hereby urge the Kosovo Negotiation Group to commits itself in the Cambridge Document and the document on the final status of Kosovo to develop and implement, in close cooperation with the communities, a Strategy for the Improvement of the Situation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians. Therefore, we

suggest, that the following paragraph be included in the Cambridge Document: “The government of Kosovo will develop, in close cooperation and coordination with the Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities, and implement a Strategy for the Improvement of the Situation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians in Kosovo.”

The voice of the Rroms:

Recommendations to Participating States:

- Adopting mechanisms of participation drawing upon the recommendations of the Romani working group, and especially on the proximity principle.
- Adopting concrete measures to make full use of the existing human resources among Roma and Sinti, while financing educational programs to expand the Romani elite, able to act as a full partner in the implementation of the policies.
- Making reasonable use of specially targeting Roma and Sinti in social policies, so as to respond to specific problems faced by this population while avoiding raise of hostility among the majority population belonging to the same economically and socially excluded segment

Particular recommendations to France:

- Withdraw the provision of the Finance law year 2006, setting up a habitation tax for caravans, which is both contestable in its principle (the caravan is not recognized as a habitation in terms of social advantages) and exorbitant in its amount (it is 3 times higher than the tax applied to built habitations in the heart of Paris).
- Recognizing the presence on French soil of Roma and Sinti population as a component of the French society diversity and national identity.
- Taking a clear political position and concrete measures to stop useless police violence on Roma and Sinti, both French and foreign citizens.
- Reforming the functioning of the “*Commission consultative des gens du voyage*” so as to achieve effective participation and legitimacy of this body.
- Putting in place the necessary caravans’ sites as provided for by the French law, taking into account the legitimate request of those concerned to have access to family sites.
- Financing scholarships for French and foreign candidates to Romani studies in Paris, as a means of long-term solution to a series of problems recurrently identified in France and more largely in Europe.

- Ensure equality through a balanced financial support of the NGOs called “*amis des tsiganes*” and the Romani NGOs, based on expertise and potential of these organisations.

Recommendations to the OSCE:

Roma/Sinti; Implementation of the OSCE Action Plan on Roma and Sinti Issues

European Union:

- Education should be a priority in all policies regarding Roma and Sinti. The OSCE must, therefore, pursue its work in this field.
- Roma-related policies should be elaborated and implemented by the relevant authorities “for Roma, with Roma”, as explicitly underlined in the OSCE Plan for Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti in the OSCE Area.

Athinganoi

- OSCE should promote priorities of the Action Plan and support the Member States toward their implementation.
- OSCE should establish a fund to support initiatives on Roma and police

Here, I would have some specific questions:

1. In Skopje CPRSI, HCNM and SPMU promised to establish a fund for Roma NGOs in order to address the issue on police and Roma. Is there any development regarding this commitment?
2. As general approach of the OSCE is to assist the Member States upon the request - Which state is ready to invite HCNM, SPMU, and CPRSI for undertaking the action regarding police and Roma in the framework of the OSCE Action Plan on Roma?

To conclude all questions are delivered to respected delegations also in written form, therefore we ask you to answer them in written form to ODHIR Contact Point For Roma and Sinti.

- Therefore we call upon the Contact point to collect all the answers for the questions in written form, and we ask them to distribute to the registered Romani organization for the HDIM 2006

OSI Joint Roma Women Initiative:

Taking in consideration the increased awareness on the situation of Romani women in OSCE Area and that this group reflect the intersectional discrimination and multiple discrimination; the OSI Joint Roma Women initiative is signaling its coalition with the other groups in Europe facing multiple discrimination and calls :

- OSCE to explore spaces of interlinks in implementing provisions of different Action Plans, such as the ones on Roma and Sinti, for promotion of gender Equality, on Anti –trafficking and the OSCE decisions on Tolerance and non discrimination;

The voice of the Rroms:

Recommendations to the OSCE and its institutions:

- Recognizing the Romani people according to its own identity, avoiding social stigmatisation, by modifying the paragraph 72 of the Action Plan as follows: “*consider measures to ensure the respect, protection and promotion of the Romani language and its teaching, and of a Roma culture as an integral part of the Roma and Sinti cultural heritage as and integral part of the European cultural heritage*”. This formulation was the one proposed by the Romani working group and reiterated in Cordoba conference on Anti-Semitism and other forms of Intolerance.
- Associating, as a consequence, the working group on the Action Plan in the implementation, assessment and review. Mandating and budgeting ODIHR-CPRSI to set up the “Group 2018” drawing upon the experience and the expertise of the Romani working group on Action Plan.
- Mainstreaming social problems faced by Roma and Sinti in all relevant OSCE activities.

Addition:

Recommendations submitted by Roma representatives during the HDIM’s Side Events organized by the OSCE ODIHR Contact Point for Roma and Sinti Issues:

Recommendations to participating States and to the OSCE:

- International Organizations and in particular national governments shall move from pilot projects to a comprehensive, administrative approach on local level to effectively address the Roma housing issue.

- National governments should take the main responsibility in resolving the housing issue.
- National governments should undertake a top-down approach to complement the bottom-up approach.
- National governments should allocate a budget for the improvement of informal settlement in a transparent manner.
- To the international community and the PiSG to include RAE representatives in the negotiation process on the future status of Kosovo
- To the OSCE to ensure that the interest of minorities is taken into account in the future status of Kosovo.
- To the international community to involve Roma women in project/policy implementation aiming to improve the situation of women in Kosovo
- To ODIHR to co-operate with the OSCE field missions on the implementation of the OSCE Roma and Sinti AP to integrate Roma into the labor market
- To ODIHR to raise awareness of the OSCE Roma and Sinti AP among the OSCE field missions and the OSCE staff
- To ODIHR and national governments to interlink Chap. IV (Addressing socio-economic issues) with Chap. VII. (Roma and Sinti in crises and post-crises situations) of the OSCE Roma and Sinti AP.
- To ODIHR and national governments to ensure that Chap. IV (Addressing socio-economic issues) with Chap. VII. (Roma and Sinti in crises and post-crises situations) of the OSCE Roma and Sinti AP are incorporated into the national strategies for Roma.
- To governments to report regularly on progress of the implementation of the relevant articles outlined in the OSCE Roma and Sinti Action Plan.
- To include concrete benchmarks (clear measures, time-frame, budget) into the OSCE Roma and Sinti AP as well as into national strategies to improve the situation of Roma
- To IOs and national governments to include Romani expertise in all Roma policy related bodies.

- To IOs and national governments to ensure Roma participation in all Roma related policies/programs/projects
- To IOs to establish a set of indicators to be applied by all IOs throughout their Roma related work
- To IOs and governments to undertake long term planning with regard to human resources and build on the capacity of Roma (employ Roma)
- To IOs and national governments to staff Roma related bodies with the adequate number of employees to ensure that these bodies can fulfill their mandate properly.
- To ODIHR to interlink the CPRSI projects on police and Roma with the anti-hate crime program of the ODIHR tolerance and non-discrimination unit
- To national governments to replicate best practice models building on the improvement of the relationship between police and vulnerable communities
- To national governments to abolish ethnic statistics on criminal offences