

**Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
MISSION IN KOSOVO**

Department of Human Rights and Communities

**Kosovo non-majority communities within the
primary and secondary educational systems**

April 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. ACCESSIBILITY AND QUALITY OF EDUCATION	3
2.1. Access to mother tongue education and textbooks	3
2.2. Teachers, teacher training and school management.....	7
2.3. Establishment of private educational institutions	11
2.4. Alternative solutions	11
3. SEPARATION OF EDUCATION SYSTEMS AND OBSTACLES TO THE OPERATION OF MULTI-ETHNIC SCHOOLS	15
4. PRESENTATION OF KOSOVO COMMUNITIES WITHIN TEXTBOOKS	17
5. LEARNING OF OFFICIAL LANGUAGE BY NON-MAJORITY STUDENTS..	22
6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	23
7. ANNEX 1. Respondents interviewed by the OSCE disaggregated by community, gender and category (January-February 2009)	26
8. ANNEX 2. 2005 ethnic composition of Kosovo and list of locations where the OSCE conducted interviews for the purpose of this report	27

“Multicultural education involves the educational policies and practices which meet the separate educational needs of groups of society which belong to different cultural traditions, while intercultural education involves educational policies and practices by which the members of different cultures, whether in a majority or minority position, learn to interact constructively with each other. Intercultural education aims at highlighting the preservation of each group’s identity, accompanied by the acceptance of diversity and tolerance. To this end, intercultural education requires that both minority and majority learn about each other, about specific cultural characteristics, their respective histories and about the value of tolerance and pluralism.”

Montreal International Seminar on Intercultural and Multicultural Education, 31 March 2000, paragraph 6, E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.5/2000/WP.4, United Nations Commission on Human Rights, Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, Working Group on Minorities, Sixth session.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report focuses on the Kosovo and Serbian curriculum primary and secondary education systems available in Kosovo and deals with three key issues: the protection of the identity and rights of non-majority communities in education; the way in which the separate Kosovo and Serbian curriculum schools fail to promote inter-ethnic dialogue, respect and understanding of others and tolerance; and the integration opportunities afforded to non-majority students through the additional learning of official languages. This report is based on extensive field research and interviews with respondents from all communities conducted by the OSCE Mission in Kosovo (hereinafter: the OSCE) in January and February 2009. The report finds that curricula for community-specific “national” subjects for the most vulnerable Roma, Ashkali, Egyptian, Gorani, Kosovo Croat and Kosovo Montenegrin communities have not been developed yet. Insufficient availability of primary and lack of secondary education textbooks in the Turkish and Bosnian languages negatively affects the quality of education and prevents adequate learning of national subjects. Conflict over authority, the physical separation of the educational systems, the fact that within both systems learning of the other official language is not provided, no sustained efforts to promote interchanges between Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb teachers and students, and the content of history and other textbooks, all contribute to further separation and make the operation of multi-ethnic schools integrating children of all systems and communities a challenge. Insufficient and inadequate Albanian language education for non-Albanian communities results in poor learning of the language, lower opportunities for educational and employment integration, and puts non-Albanian students at a competitive disadvantage. Socialization opportunities with Kosovo Albanian peers contribute at times to successful learning of this language.

1. INTRODUCTION

The legislation applied in Kosovo provides for comprehensive and specific educational rights for non-majority communities.¹ These include the right to receive public education at all levels in one of the official languages (Albanian and Serbian). In areas inhabited by communities whose mother tongue is not an official language, students belonging to these communities are entitled to receive pre-school, primary, and secondary public education in their mother tongue. Where, due to an insufficient number of students or to other reasons, education in the chosen official or community language is not provided, alternatives should be guaranteed. Applied legal provisions further recognize the right of communities to set up private educational and training establishments and generate educational modules on their culture, history and traditions. Provisions in place also require that the educational curriculum cover the history, culture and other attributes of communities traditionally present in Kosovo, and foster a spirit of respect, understanding and tolerance among all communities. Kosovo authorities developed multi-year strategies for pre-university education and the

¹ On 15 June 2008, Kosovo promulgated the Law on the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Communities and their Members in Kosovo (2008 Law on the Rights of Communities). Article 1.4 defines communities as “national, ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious groups traditionally present in Kosovo that are not in the majority” and recognizes the Kosovo Serb, Kosovo Turk, Kosovo Bosniak, Roma, Ashkali, Egyptian, Gorani and other communities (such as Kosovo Croats and Kosovo Montenegrins). In addition, article 1.4 also recognizes that “members of a community in the majority in Kosovo as a whole who are not in the majority in a given municipality shall also be entitled to enjoy the rights listed in this law.” Therefore Kosovo Albanians in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë, Zvečan/Zveçan, Leposavić/Leposaviq and Štrpce/Shtërpçë are also considered a non-majority community for the purposes of the applied legislation.

educational integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian pupils,² organised a catch-up classes programme for some 1,800 Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian children from 2004 to 2007,³ and benefit from technical assistance programmes supporting the process of curriculum reform.⁴

In practice, there are two competing and separate educational systems. Kosovo Albanian students follow Kosovo's curriculum without any instruction in Serbian language, while Kosovo Serb students are educated according to curricula of, and schools run by Serbia and do not receive instruction in Albanian. The Kosovo educational system provides curricula for primary and secondary mother-tongue education in the Albanian, Turkish and Bosnian languages, but not in Serbian. A system for the recognition of Serbian curricula and textbooks to be used at the municipal level is not yet in place.⁵ The Serbian educational system imparts education only in the Serbian language, with scattered examples of language classes in Romani, Croatian, Bosnian and Albanian⁶ in a limited number of schools. None of the educational systems contains curricula and textbooks specific or adequately tailored to the culture and history of the Roma, Ashkali, Egyptian, Gorani, Kosovo Croat and Kosovo Montenegrin communities. To a certain extent, the separate curricula and systems provide for the intra-cultural educational needs of specific communities, but fall short of promoting intercultural education and sustained exchanges between students and teachers of the two systems. While no official figures are available regarding students attending Serbian curriculum schools in Kosovo,⁷ the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (hereinafter: Ministry of Education) assessed that, in the school year 2006/7, 13,446 (3.06 per cent) of the 439,445 students attending Kosovo curriculum primary and secondary schools belonged to non-majority communities.⁸

Following up on previous round tables on communities' education,⁹ to assess progress in availability and quality of education for non-majority communities, the OSCE conducted interviews and discussions throughout Kosovo's regions, municipalities, towns and villages¹⁰

² Strategy for the development of pre-university education in Kosovo, 2007-2017; Strategy for the integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo – education, 2007-2017; and Strategy for the integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo, 2009-2015, which was developed with the support of the OSCE and contains a specific chapter on education.

³ With OSCE support, the Ministry of Education conducted this project in nine municipalities.

⁴ UNICEF assistance for the development of a new pre-university curriculum framework; a Council of Europe "Inter-Culturalism and the Bologna Process" and the World Bank "Kosovo Institutional Development for Education" programme.

⁵ On 21 May 2008, Kosovo promulgated the Law on Education in the Municipalities of Kosovo (2008 Law on Education). It foresees an Independent Commission for the review of Serbian-language teaching materials, which is not established yet.

⁶ This is limited to Serbian curriculum courses attended by Gorani students in Dragash/Dragaš.

⁷ However, according to the draft "Strategy for Sustainable Subsistence and Return to Kosovo and Metohija" (p. 15) issued by the Serbian Ministry for Kosovo and Metohija in March 2009, in the school year 2008/2009, a total of 19,530 students were enrolled in 177 primary and 48 secondary schools managed by the Serbian Ministry of Education in Kosovo.

⁸ Source: Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, Indicators and Statistical Data in Education, 2004/05, 05/06, 06/07, Prishtinë/Priština, p. 103, table 7. This figure includes 4,504 (1.02 per cent) Kosovo Bosniak, 3,053 Kosovo Turk, 2,899 Ashkali, 1,265 Gorani, 1,086 Egyptians, 548 Roma and 70 Kosovo Croat students. These statistics include Gorani and Kosovo Croat students following Serbian-curriculum education. Kosovo Serb and Roma students following the same curriculum are not included.

⁹ Roundtables on education for the Kosovo Bosniak (16 October 2007, Rečane/Rečanë), Kosovo Turk (23 October 2007, Prizren) and Gorani (30 October 2007, Dragash/Dragaš) communities, co-organized by the OSCE, the Kosovo Ministry of Education, the Council of Europe, United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) and UNICEF.

¹⁰ Štrpce/Shtërpçë; Gjilan/Gnjilane; Novobërdë/Novo Brdo; Kamenicë/Kamenica; Ferizaj/Uroševac; Viti/Vitina; Obiliq/Obilić, Caravodicë/Crkvena Vodica, Babimoc/Babin Most and Plemetin/Plemetina (Obiliq/Obilić); Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje; Lipjan/Lipljan, Hallaq i Vogël/Mali Alaš and Janjevë/Janjevo

where these communities access education either in the Kosovo or the Serbian educational system. Interviews were conducted with primary and secondary education students, teachers and school directors, parents and representatives of municipal directorates of education from non-majority communities. A total of 738 persons, out of which 295 women (40 per cent), were interviewed, including 235 Kosovo Serbs, 136 Roma, 92 Ashkali, 82 Kosovo Bosniaks, 62 Kosovo Turks, 53 Kosovo Albanians, 35 Gorani, 26 Egyptians, and 17 Kosovo Croats (see Annex 1). This approach enabled the collection of information regarding the opinions, needs, concerns and interests of communities in relation to the education afforded to them. Unless otherwise specified, the terminology used in the present report refers to both males and females.

The following chapters contain findings and observations regarding the accessibility and quality of education for non-majority communities, the separation of the educational systems as well as the obstacles to the operation of multi-ethnic schools in which students of the two systems interact. Moreover, it explains the way in which the identities and histories of communities are represented within the two educational systems in Kosovo, and the arrangements taken to ensure that children receiving education in non-official languages can also learn the official language(s).

2. ACCESSIBILITY AND QUALITY OF EDUCATION

2.1. Access to mother tongue education and textbooks

Kosovo legislation recognises the right to receive public education at all levels in the chosen official language¹¹ and the right to receive pre-school, primary and secondary education in other languages of Kosovo's traditional communities in those municipalities where these communities live.¹² In practice, Gorani pupils experience difficulties to access Serbian-curriculum education as they wish. Kosovo Bosniak pupils who attend Serbian-curriculum education consider that this lacks sensitivity and adaptation to their cultural diversity. Roma students have access to classes on their mother tongue only in some schools of the Serbian-curriculum system. Within the Kosovo-curriculum, Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Turk students have access to mother tongue education but there are no books in their languages for secondary and, in some cases, primary education. Kosovo Albanian students in northern Kosovo have access to primary education in their mother tongue, but have no support from

(Lipjan/Lipljan); Podujevë/Podujevo; Shtime/Štimlje; northern and southern Mitrovicë/Mitrovica; Zvečan/Zvečan; Zubin Potok; Leposavić/Leposaviq; Skenderaj/Srbica; Vushtrri/Vučitrn; Pejë/Peć, Goraždevac/Gorazhdec, Sigë/Siga and Brestovik/Brestovik (Pejë/Peć); Istog/Istok and Osojane/Osojan (Istog/Istok); Klinë/Klina; Deçan/Deçane; Prizren, Planjane/Pllanjan and Reçane/Recan (Prizren); Mamuša/Mamushë/Mamuša; Dragash/Dragaš, Mlike/Mlikë, Globočica/Glloboçicë, Ljubovište/Lubovishtë, Brod and Kruševo/Krushevë (Dragash/Dragaš); Rahovec/Orahovac and Velika Hoča/Hoçë e Madhe (Rahovec/Orahovac).

¹¹ Art. 4.4(b), Constitutional Framework, UNMIK Regulation 2001/9, 15 May 2001, and subsequent amendments (Constitutional Framework); Art. 19.1, Law on the Use of Languages, UNMIK Regulation 2006/51 (Law on the Use of Languages); Art. 59.2, Constitution promulgated on 15 June 2008 (2008 Constitution); Art. 8.1, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities.

¹² Art. 4.4(b), Constitutional Framework; Art. 3.2(c), Law on Primary and Secondary Education in Kosovo, UNMIK Regulation No. 2002/19, 31 October 2002, (Law on Primary and Secondary Education); Art. 20.1, Law on the Use of Languages; Art. 59.3, 2008 Constitution; Art. 8.1, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities.

their municipalities.¹³ The Gorani, Kosovo Croat, Roma, Ashkali, Egyptian, and Kosovo Montenegrin communities have no access to community-specific educational subjects enabling the preservation of their identity.

Serbian-curriculum schools

Students who choose Serbian as their language of instruction follow the Serbian curriculum. Their actual access to education and textbooks differs depending on their place of residence and their economic situation. Textbooks are exclusively in the Serbian language. However, textbooks in other languages used in Serbia could be made available.¹⁴ The Serbian Ministry of Education provides textbooks free of charge for Roma first grade students in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica and Gjilan/Gnjilane regions, and for Gorani students in Dragash/Dragaš, while Kosovo Serb students must pay approximately € 60 for a set of education material for one grade. In the school year 2009/10, textbooks will be free of charge for all students.¹⁵ Teachers, parents and students praise these textbooks and curricula.

In general, Kosovo Serbs do not face difficulties in accessing curricula and textbooks for primary and secondary education. Serbian curriculum schools are generally in a comparatively good condition,¹⁶ school transport is provided, and, with the exception of Roma pupils, the drop-out rate is very low. University students commute to northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë (mainly through the humanitarian bus transportation provided by the Kosovo Ministry of Transport and Communications) or to universities in Serbia. Only in Bincë/Binač (Viti/Vitina municipality) and Viti/Vitina town parents escort their children to school for security reasons. Displaced Kosovo Serbs have full access to schooling at the site of their displacement. However, Kosovo Serb displaced families with school aged children deem lack of access to school facilities at their place of origin a major obstacle to return, second only to lack of job opportunities.

Gorani pupils face great difficulties in receiving education in Serbian as they desire, while there is no Kosovo curriculum in this language. In 2008/9, the continuity of Serbian curriculum education taking place in schools managed by the Dragash/Dragaš municipality has been challenged by a conflict between Gorani teachers and the municipality. Based on a request of the Serbian Co-ordination Centre for Kosovo and Metohija to opt for either Serbia or Kosovo contracts, these teachers have signed contracts with the Serbian Ministry of Education since 2006. This has caused a conflict between the Gorani community on one side, and the municipality and the Kosovo Bosniak community on the other.¹⁷ Following their refusal to sign contracts with the Dragash/Dragaš municipality, as of September 2008, Gorani teachers have been banned from entering the ‘Nezim Berati/Nebojša Jerković’ school (run by the municipality) in the Dragash/Dragaš town. As a result, Gorani children became unable to share the school premises with Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Bosniak students, as they had done since before 1999, and could not receive Serbian language education in the school. On 3 March 2009, following an agreement brokered by the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities, most of the Gorani teachers and children¹⁸ could return to the school and

¹³ These municipalities do not provide educational services to children whose language of education is Albanian language and do not receive and spend the central educational grant allocated to them by the Kosovo Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

¹⁴ For instance, Albanian language textbooks used in Preševo/Preshevë.

¹⁵ As confirmed by Serbian curriculum respondents in the Pejë/Peć region.

¹⁶ Cramped and in dire need of refurbishment, the school in Kamenicë/Kamenica town is an exception.

¹⁷ In contrast with Gorani, Kosovo Bosniaks opted for Kosovo-curriculum education in Bosnian.

¹⁸ This refers to children and teachers of grades 5-8 who returned to the school from 3 to 16 March 2009. Children of grades 1-4 did not return because the Kosovo-curriculum school director was preventing the return of two Gorani teachers.

lessons in the Serbian language resumed. Disagreements over rules of co-habitation of the two systems' educational staff led, however, to a withdrawal of Gorani teachers on 17 March 2009. Negotiations are ongoing to ensure their return. Gorani students pursue higher education in Serbia or in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, where education in the chosen official language or in a language of proficiency is available.

Kosovo Bosniak students who follow the Serbian curriculum consider that this system ensures a good educational development across academic fields. However, they underscore that it lacks sensitivity and adaptation to their cultural diversity. There are no special provisions to cater for the needs of these pupils, as for instance by introducing textbooks from Bosnia and Herzegovina.

In the Serbian-curriculum system, which a considerable number of Roma students follow, the main learning language is Serbian and only some primary schools of Gjilan/Gnjilane and Kamenicë/Kamenica,¹⁹ northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë, Ugljare/Uglar (Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje) and Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan) offer Romani language classes. Textbooks in Romani are drafted and bought in Serbia or in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia. They are thus not tailored to the Kosovo context, do not reflect the linguistic and cultural specificities of the local Roma community, are often not easy for students to understand, and are difficult to purchase.²⁰ In Mitrovicë/Mitrovica, Roma students have a limited number of Romani language textbooks, which belong to the school and cannot be taken home. Reportedly, only two Roma students attend secondary education under the Serbian curriculum. Most Roma students in Gjilan/Gnjilane region only complete primary education (in either Serbian or Albanian) or drop out of school. Provided that they can afford it or benefit from scholarships, those who complete secondary education and wish to obtain a higher degree, generally enrol at Serbian or former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia universities and complete their degree in either Serbian or Macedonian.

Kosovo-curriculum schools

Quality and availability of curricula and textbooks within the Kosovo curricula depend on the language in which they are developed, namely in Albanian, Bosnian and Turkish. The Kosovo framework curriculum is divided into general subjects and community-specific "national" subjects. These subjects are language, history, art and music. National subjects for Kosovo Turks and Kosovo Bosniaks are developed by experts from the respective communities. Curricula and textbooks for the general subjects are created by Kosovo Albanian experts and then translated into Turkish and Bosnian. In both cases, translation is often considered poor.²¹

The law on primary and secondary education obliges the Ministry of Education to ensure availability of free of charge textbooks for all grades (1-9) of compulsory education.²² The

19 A primary school in Gjilan/Gnjilane town, a primary school in Kamenicë/Kamenica town, and the school in the mixed village of Berivojce/Berivojcë offer one and a half to two hours per week.

20 According to Roma teachers, Roma students learn about the identity of their community in Serbia or in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, without reference to Kosovo. They learn Romani language and grammar as written and spoken in Serbia and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia. Romani language teachers often purchase books, copy and distribute them to students. Sometimes, books are donated by Serbia.

21 Translation is considered poor both technically and content-wise due to the limited language proficiency of translators or the fact that they are not familiar with the content of the textbooks.

22 Section 3.2 (b), Law on Primary and Secondary Education.

ministry, in co-operation with municipalities, is also responsible to provide students with adequate textbooks “in their mother tongues.”²³

In the northern municipalities of Mitrovicë/Mitrovica region, Kosovo Albanian students have access to the Kosovo curriculum. However, the purchase of textbooks has been an obstacle in the past years, particularly in the socio-economically marginalized Kosovo Albanian enclaves of Zvečan/Zveçan and Leposavić/Leposaviq. Since 2008, the Ministry of Education has been providing free textbooks for primary school children. Poor economic conditions also make educational costs unaffordable for Ashkali students in this region, resulting in non-enrolment and drop-out from education. They often rely on donations of textbooks and other support from the Ministry of Education, international organizations or private donors.

The lack of curriculum-based textbooks seriously affects the quality of mother tongue education in the Bosnian and Turkish languages. There are no (for upper secondary education, grades 10-13) or only few (for lower secondary education, grades 6-9) curriculum-based books available in these languages.²⁴ In 2008/9, Bosnian and Turkish language students have received incomplete sets of free-of charge textbooks from grades 1-5 from the Ministry of Education.²⁵ Education officials in Pejë/Peć confirm the shortage of textbooks and highlight that complete printing and provision of Bosnian language textbooks, especially on the community-specific “national” subjects, is hampered by the small number of qualified authors and the low profit or even economic loss related to the publication of limited-number copies. Publishing houses incur losses when issuing less than 1,000 copies per book, while – Kosovo-wide – no grade has more than 200 Kosovo Bosniak students. Therefore, a publication subsidized by the Ministry of Education is necessary. The same is true for Turkish language books.

In the towns of Prizren, Prishtinë/Priština, Mamuša/Mamushë/Mamuša and Gjilan/Gnjilane,²⁶ Kosovo Turk students have access to primary and secondary in their mother tongue. Courses in Turkish language are available in Prizren (Faculty of Education) and Prishtinë/Priština (Faculty of Philology). However, many textbooks are still not available, creating a disadvantage in relation to Kosovo Albanian students, in particular regarding the admission exams for secondary and higher education. Students often use books imported from Turkey and, in some cases, handwritten notes delivered by teachers. Most teaching time is used for lecturing and dictation, which is often perceived as biased or inconsistent with the curricula and does not allow for interaction or questioning by students. In the Pejë/Peć municipality, Kosovo Bosniak students, parents and teachers point out the shortage of textbooks in Bosnian. Those books either have not yet been prepared or printed, or their distribution is delayed. Teachers also observe differences in the distribution of books

²³ Section 7.6, Law on Primary and Secondary Education.

²⁴ For instance, Kosovo Bosniak students in Zllapek/Zlopek (Pejë/Peć) and Dobrushë/Dobruša (Istog/Istok), lack general-subject books and history books for grades 6-9.

²⁵ While the Ministry of Education invested Euro 200,000 in 2008/9, several books are not available or available only for purchase in the Bosnian and Turkish languages. For instance, in Prizren as of October 2008, the following national subject books were not available: Bosnian alphabet (grade 1), Bosnian language reader’s (grades 4-5), Bosnian art (grades 3 and 5) and Bosnian music (grades 3-5), Turkish reader’s textbooks (grade 5). Turkish music textbooks are not available and no Turkish alphabet textbook has been published in Kosovo. These books are imported from the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and are available only for purchase. Turkish art textbooks developed in Kosovo are only available for purchase in bookstores. Also general-subject books were missing in Prizren: mathematics (grade 3 and 5), practical work (grade 5), nature (grade 5), and civic education (grade 5) in Turkish; and the mathematics (grades 1,2 and 5), nature and civic education (grade 5) in Bosnian. Throughout Kosovo, Bosnian language fifth grade books are not available yet.

²⁶ Three schools provide the Kosovo curriculum in Turkish in Gjilan/Gnjilane.

between regions and schools, and confirm that general availability of textbooks in Bosnian has not materialised. In addition, most “national” subject books are non-curriculum based, imported from Bosnia and Herzegovina, and are outdated or worn-out by intensive use. The shortage of books affects also students at the vocational secondary school of Zllapek/Zlopek (Pejë/Peć), and Pejë/Peć high school. Students are thus mostly exposed to a “listen-and-take-notes” teaching environment. They consider that civic education, history and Bosnian language textbooks do not or inadequately reflect the specific features of the Kosovo Bosniak community. Approximately 70 percent of these students enrol into tertiary education, although the number of education courses in Bosnian language provided by Prishtinë/Priština University is limited. Most enrolments take place at the Business and Management Faculty in Pejë/Peć, while enrolment and board and lodging at the Prizren Education Faculty or in Prishtinë/Priština (where education is only in Albanian), is often too expensive.

In the Gjilan/Gnjilane region, children of the small Kosovo Bosniak community learn entirely in Albanian, as the Kosovo curriculum in Bosnian is not available. Gorani students attend the Kosovo curriculum education system in Albanian in Ferizaj/Uroševac, and the Serbian curriculum education system in Kamenicë/Kamenica. In Mitrovicë/Mitrovica and Vushtrri/Vučitrn, Kosovo Turks follow the Kosovo curriculum in Albanian and they do not demand primary instruction or classes in their mother tongue.²⁷ However, some of them continue secondary education in a Turkish language school in Prishtinë/ Priština. In Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan), Kosovo Turk students follow the Kosovo curriculum in Albanian. The community representative has though expressed interest for the introduction of Turkish language instruction.

2.2. Teachers, teacher training and school management

Under applied legislation, authorities have the obligation to ensure that sufficient qualified personnel is available to train candidates seeking to become community language teachers. The training should be conducted in the community languages and selected candidates should be either native speakers or qualified speakers of that language. Further, the Ministry of Education and municipalities should ensure that heads and teachers of public educational institutions operating in community languages are mainly representatives of such communities or are familiar with the identity of the relevant community.²⁸

In practice, both in Kosovo and Serbian-curriculum schools, there is insufficient representation of non-majority communities in school management positions. The Kosovo-education system provides mother-tongue training for Turkish and Bosnian language teachers to some extent, but training in specialised subjects is available only in Albanian. University education in the Serbian language is available in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë but students with Kosovo diplomas face difficulties to enrol. Access to professional development training is difficult for Serbian-curriculum teachers, as this is provided outside Kosovo. No specific training in their language is being provided for Romani language teachers. There is a considerable number of under-qualified teachers in the Kosovo-curriculum system. The number of Turkish and Bosnian language teachers is insufficient in some municipalities. They receive professional development training through simultaneous interpretation, the quality of which is at times deemed insufficient.

Higher education for teachers

²⁷ A Turkish language pre-school class also ceased to exist in 2007/8 due to lack of demand.

²⁸ Arts. 8.8 and 8.9, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities.

Access to higher education is necessary to enable the training of a sufficient number of qualified teachers from all communities. Applied legislation provides for equal access to university education, including through special measures to ensure admission of candidates from all communities. The government is responsible for ensuring that existing opportunities for professional training and higher education in community languages are maintained. According to the applied legislation, additional higher education and training programmes in community languages have to be provided in accordance with expressed needs and financial viability.²⁹ In practice, however, in Kosovo there is a limited range of higher education opportunities in non-official languages,³⁰ and a number of obstacles to the accessibility of Serbian language higher education appeared after 17 February 2008.³¹ Students of non-majority communities often migrate³² to seek further higher education opportunities. Upon their return, these students are often confronted with long and costly mechanisms for the recognition of foreign qualifications, including an exam at the Prishtinë/Priština University.³³ Kosovo Turk students who attained Turkish university degrees for which an equivalent is not available in Kosovo, had problems in obtaining their validation. Implementation of an administrative instruction on principles and procedures for the recognition of university degrees obtained outside Kosovo³⁴ may bring about a solution. Reserved seats for Albanian language education are available at the Prishtinë/Priština University only for specific communities³⁵ and do not ensure additional linguistic support (i.e. through additional Albanian language courses) to ensure a successful academic performance.

Serbian-curriculum schools

Most parents, teachers, and school directors agree that the overall academic background and qualification of Serbian curriculum teachers is satisfactory, although in some cases they have

²⁹ Arts. 8.3 and 8.11, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities.

³⁰ The Prishtinë/Priština University offers some Bosnian and Turkish language courses on Turkish philology (50 seats), Bosnian and Turkish language for teachers (35 seats each), information technology (in Bosnian, 35 seats) and business administration (in Bosnian, 80 seats).

³¹ Higher education in the Serbian language is available at the University of Mitrovica/Mitrovicë. However, secondary education diplomas issued by Kosovo authorities after 17 February 2008 are not recognized by this university and by other public universities in Serbia. Kosovo Bosniak students wishing to pursue higher education in the Serbian official language were unable to enrol until, in December 2008, the Ministry of Education allowed the issuance of UNMIK stamped diplomas by the Prizren municipality. A sustainable solution is necessary to avoid these obstacles in future.

³² This is true not only for Kosovo Turk, Kosovo Bosniak, Gorani, Roma, and Kosovo Croat, but also for Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb students. Kosovo Turk students are at a competitive advantage due to higher education scholarships provided by the Turkish government (and also open to candidates of other communities). At least 300 Kosovo Turk students are currently enrolled in Turkish universities thanks to such scholarships.

³³ This is the so-called 'nostrification' procedure. However, in line with the Lisbon Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region (1997, CETS No. 165), harmonized and simplified 'recognition' procedures and methods can be introduced.

³⁴ Administrative Instruction No. 39/2008, Ministry of Education.

³⁵ In 2008/9, the Prishtinë/Priština University reserved 134 Albanian language seats only for Kosovo Turk, Kosovo Bosniak, Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian candidates. The exclusion clause according to which "non-Kosovan and minority applicants have the right to apply only within the quotas foreseen for them" and the requirement of a statement of a community representative organization as a proof of community belonging raise concern. There is no opportunity of self-identification, and community representative organizations are vested with unilateral certification power. No objective criteria, such as the language of prior education, or a linguistic test in the community language, are used. Reserved seats represent only 1.5 per cent of the 8,970 study slots open for registration. Source: University of Prishtinë/Priština, Announcement for the registration of students in the first year of studies in the academic year 2008/9, pages 1, 4, 8, 9 and 12.

only secondary education diplomas due to lack of candidates with university degrees.³⁶ While regular professional development training recommended by the Serbian Ministry of Education is provided in Serbia, most teachers cannot afford to participate, especially when there is a tuition fee and transport and accommodation are not reimbursed. The fact that most high school graduates are able to enrol at higher education institutions outside of Kosovo is considered as an indicator of teaching quality. Kosovo Bosniaks in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica are concerned about the preservation of their cultural and religious identity under the Serbian curriculum and demand enhanced training and sensitivity of teachers and school management to the specificities of their culture. Kosovo Bosniak and Gorani students wishing to become teachers can pursue tertiary education in Pejë/Peć and Prizren, where the local branches of Prishtinë/Priština University offer faculty courses in Bosnian.

There are only a few teachers of Romani language in Serbian curriculum schools in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë, Ugljare/Uglar (Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje), Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan), Gjilan/Gnjilane and Kamenicë/Kamenica. No training specific to their language and subject of teaching is available. The fact that most Roma students in Gjilan/Gnjilane region only complete primary education (in either Serbian or Albanian) or drop out of school before completing their education is an obstacle towards the training of qualified Roma teachers. Roma students who wish to attain tertiary degrees often cannot afford it or rely on scholarships, and frequently enrol at Serbia or the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia universities for reasons of linguistic proficiency. Furthermore, employed Roma teachers do not benefit from many in-service training opportunities, as such trainings are not provided in Kosovo in Romani language, and it is extremely difficult for them to attend the trainings in Romani language provided by the Serbian Ministry of Education.

Kosovo-curriculum schools

In 2008, Kosovo Albanian parents in Zvečan/Zveçan and Leposavić/Leposaviq complained about the quality of the education and teachers' outdated pedagogical techniques at the Kosovo curriculum school of Boletin/Boljetin. These students have generally lower performance and often drop out of education when attending secondary schools in southern Mitrovicë/Mitrovica. While municipal authorities north of the Ibër/Ibar river do not support education under the Kosovo curriculum, the Ministry of Education failed to provide pedagogical training for Albanian language teachers in Kosovo curriculum schools in northern Kosovo. In 2008, a Kosovo Education Centre's training funded by the OSCE brought visible improvement of pedagogical techniques and educational standards.

In Gjilan/Gnjilane region, municipal authorities and school managers often mention the lack of qualified mother tongue teachers and the low number of non-majority community students as reasons for the absence of education in non-official languages.³⁷ However, the lack of qualified mother tongue teachers is a major obstacle to high quality education even in municipalities where the education in non-official languages is provided.

Kosovo curriculum schools in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica have an insufficient number of Bosnian mother tongue teachers. Lessons in Bosnian are also provided by Kosovo Albanian teachers proficient in this language. Classes are organised even if the number of students is below the

³⁶ In the Serbian curriculum school of Janjevo/Janjevë, 18 out of 20 teachers have secondary education diplomas.

³⁷ Ferizaj/Uroševac, Novobërdë/Novo Brdo, Štrpce/Shtërpçë and Viti/Vitina do not provide education or weekly classes in a non-official language. Roma students attend the Serbian curriculum in all municipalities with the exception of Ferizaj/Uroševac and few students in Kamenicë/Kamenica.

minimum required.³⁸ Shortage of qualified teachers creates a serious need for training and improvement of education skills in all languages. In the Pejë/Peć Kosovo curriculum secondary school of economics, 80 out of 1,600 students are Kosovo Bosniaks. There are 13 qualified Kosovo Bosniak teachers, none of whom teach community-specific “national” subjects as these are not their field of expertise. This contributes to lack of community-specific “national” subject education. In Prizren, Kosovo Bosniak, Ashkali and Egyptian teachers participate in a training supported by the Ministry of Education. Training is generally conducted in Albanian (and in some cases in Bosnian). In the first case, interpretation is provided but teachers are dissatisfied with its quality.

Training sessions for Kosovo Turk teachers are sponsored by the Ministry of Education and by the Turkish government and offered in Albanian with simultaneous interpretation. Teachers stress that the training would improve if it were to be delivered directly in Turkish. Approximately 90 per cent of the Kosovo Turk teachers in Prizren have an adequate academic background and qualifications, while in Gjilan/Gnjilane, they are not enough to cover all grades, classes and subjects. Hence, there are teachers teaching more than one subject – although they are not qualified to do so – or teachers who do not have the necessary qualifications to teach at all. Students wishing to become teachers in Turkish language enrol at the faculties of education in Prizren, Turkish philology in Prishtinë/Priština, or in Turkey. Kosovo Turk teachers in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica region provide education in the Albanian language.

In Obiliq/Obilić, the temporary community shelter school in Plementinë/Plementina provides the Kosovo curriculum in Albanian for Ashkali, Egyptian and Roma children. The three Ashkali and one Roma school teachers do not possess the required professional qualifications, and neither the Ministry of Education nor the municipality have ensured their access to professional training. In the Shtime/Štimlje schools, there are approximately 150 Ashkali pupils but only one Ashkali teacher.

In both Kosovo and Serbian educational systems, school management positions are mainly kept by representatives of the respective majority community. Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians are under-represented within teachers and not represented at the level of school management. The Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Turk communities lack sufficient management representation within mixed language schools,³⁹ but do have school management positions where education is conducted in non-official languages.⁴⁰ Kosovo Croat and Kosovo Albanian directors appointed by the municipality co-exist with a Serbian-curriculum Kosovo Serb director in the same school in Janjevë/Janjevo.⁴¹

³⁸ Article 2 of the Ministry of Education Administrative Instruction No. 16/2002 on Defining the Teacher/Student Ratio, provides that primary and secondary education classes have a minimum of 21 students. This policy is lowered to 15 students per teacher for education in non-majority languages.

³⁹ In Prizren town, only one of the six primary schools providing education also in Turkish (Motrat Qirijazi) has a Kosovo Turk deputy director. None of Prizren’s four secondary schools providing education in Turkish has a Kosovo Turk manager. In the Zllapek/Zlopek (Pejë/Peć) school, most students and teachers are Kosovo Bosniaks, the co-ordinator is Kosovo Albanian. Kosovo Bosniak teachers of the primary schools Prapaqan/Prapaçane (Deçan/Deçane) and Dobrushë/Dobruša (Istog/Istok) are dissatisfied with their lack of representation.

⁴⁰ In the mono-ethnic Bosnian language schools of the Župa/Zhupë valley (Prizren) and in Vitomiricë/Vitomirica (Pejë/Peć) teachers and principals belong to the Kosovo Bosniak community. Directors of the primary and secondary schools in Mamuša/Mamushë/Mamuša are Kosovo Turk. Although appointed by the municipality, directors of the schools in Restelica/Restelicë, Brod/Brod and Rapča/Rapqë (Dragash/Dragaš), where all or most of the student attend Serbian-curriculum education are all from the respective villages and are familiar with the community’s identity.

⁴¹ The school has three different names: “Vladimir Nazor”; “Janjevo”; and “Shtefan Gjeqovi”.

2.3. Establishment of private educational institutions

The legislation applied in Kosovo recognizes the right of communities to set up private educational and training establishments, to seek public funding, and to request accreditation by the Ministry of Education.⁴² Currently, the only private educational institutions imparting education in the languages and the cultures of non-majority communities are located in Prishtinë/Priština and Štrpce/Shtërpçë. Intervention by the Ministry of Education is limited to setting recognition and licensing rules,⁴³ without financial or other support. Current initiatives are confined to projects of international or local non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and providing extra-curricular educational activities, mainly for primary school children. The Kosovo Turk community enjoys a comparative advantage due to the support of the government of Turkey.

In Prishtinë/Priština, the Gulistan Education Centre⁴⁴ provides primary and secondary education in English, Turkish and Albanian. In Štrpce/Shtërpçë, a private university from Novi Sad, the Faculty for Business Services (Fakultet za Uslužni Biznis), provides for lectures in the Serbian language.⁴⁵ In northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë a Culture and Art Society of the Kosovo Bosniak community has ceased to operate due to lack of funds. It helped students of this community to preserve their culture and historical diversity in ways not afforded by either educational system.

In Gjilan/Gnjilane region, Ashkali students have occasional access to catch-up classes organized by NGOs to support their integration in elementary and secondary schools. In Mitrovicë/Mitrovica and Vushtrri/Vučitrn, civil society initiatives offer extra-curricular activities on Turkish language, history, culture, music and dance for Kosovo Turk pupils. In northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë and Leposavić/Leposaviq the NGOs Caritas Kosovo and Padem have implemented pre-primary classes and primary supplementary Romani and Serbian language education for Roma children. In Fushë-Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, the NGO Balkan Sunflowers and the Centre for Co-operation and Integration run a “learning centre” project for some 350 Ashkali and Egyptian pupils.⁴⁶ In Podujevë/Podujevo, Care International promotes school integration of Ashkali, Roma and Albanian pupils through joint projects.⁴⁷ In Gračanica/Gračanicë, Balkan Sunflowers operates a Roma education centre for pre-school children in Shtime/Štimlje. This NGO implements an “after school homework” project targeting approximately 100 pre-school to fifth grade Ashkali pupils. Since 2002, the NGO Bethany Christian Services has provided supplementary education to 170 Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian pre-school and primary education pupils in the Kolonia informal settlement (Gjakovë/Đakovica).

2.4. Alternative solutions

⁴² Art. 22, Law on the Use of Languages; Art. 8.4, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities.

⁴³ Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, Administrative Instructions No. 3/2003 on Licensing and Registration of Private Primary and Secondary Education Institutions in Kosovo; and No. 14/2003 on Licensing of Private Higher Education Institutions in Kosovo.

⁴⁴ Private educational institution jointly managed by the International School of Prishtinë/Priština and the Mehmet Akif College: mixed classes, integrating the Kosovo and Republic of Turkey curricula.

⁴⁵ The centre is licensed by the Serbian Ministry of Education.

⁴⁶ The project started in March 2008. It supports Ashkali and Egyptian pupils in doing their homework.

⁴⁷ “After school homework” (pupils of grade 1-5) and “Stop illiteracy”, (women’s education).

If education in the chosen official language or in the native community language is not available, the legislation applied in Kosovo requires that municipalities or the government offer alternatives, including subsidized transport to an area where such education is available, distance learning, roving teaching arrangements or offers of boarding.⁴⁸ In practice, where mother tongue education is not available, alternative solutions are mainly limited to transport arrangements. However, Kosovo Serb majority municipalities in northern Kosovo do not support transportation of Kosovo Albanian pupils. In 2009, the construction of more schools in the Kosovo-curriculum system has insufficiently prioritised non-majority communities. In the absence of tangible central measures and guidance, active initiatives to ensure the educational integration of the vulnerable Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian students are in place only in some municipalities. The impact of educational scholarships being introduced for pupils of these communities needs to be further assessed, particularly as it refers to completion of primary and secondary education and access to tertiary education.

Transport arrangements

The Kosovo Serb majority municipalities of Zvečan/Zveçan, Zubin Potok, and Leposavić/Leposaviq municipalities do not provide transport for Kosovo Albanian children travelling to southern Mitrovicë/Mitrovica, where they follow secondary education in Albanian. Transport is provided either by private bus (funded by private or external donors) or through the Kosovo Ministry of Transport and Communications' humanitarian bus lines. In Leposavić/Leposaviq, there is a private bus temporarily supported by a private donation and parents pay transport fees. Kosovo Albanian children living in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë are privately transported or walk to southern Mitrovicë/Mitrovica. At present, walking is not considered safe for the Kosovo Albanian students of the Mikronaselje/Kodra e Minatorëve enclave (northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë), who have to pass through Kosovo Serb areas. Thus, children whose families cannot afford private transport receive education in a temporary, inadequate school container lacking the necessary logistical conditions. The municipal director of education refuses to provide transport⁴⁹ for these children until adequate school premises are available, because, in his opinion, this initiative would be contrary to the goal of inter-ethnic integration in the divided town.

For Kosovo Bosniak students, attending secondary education often implies travel and transport costs⁵⁰ that are not covered by municipalities. In Podujevë/Podujevo, Ashkali and Roma pupils living in remote areas have no access to school transport. Vushtrri/Vučitrn,⁵¹ Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje⁵² and Lipjan/Lipljan⁵³ municipalities provide free transport to

⁴⁸ Art. 19.4, Law on the Use of Languages; Art. 8.2, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities. Roving teachers are teachers that would travel and provide mother tongue education to small groups of students living in different locations. Offers for boarding would ensure that a child for which mother tongue education is not available in the municipality of origin can attend such education in another location with board and lodging expenses paid for by the Kosovo government or by the municipality of origin.

⁴⁹ Article 22 of the Law on Primary and Secondary Education obliges the municipalities to provide transport for pupils attending compulsory education within their territory. The municipality may provide, and charge fees, for transport for pupils attending non-compulsory secondary education.

⁵⁰ For instance, in Prapaqan/Prapaçane (Deçan/Deçane), a Kosovo Bosniak family relying on social welfare assistance pays Euro 50 per month for transport of two children to the closest Bosnian language secondary school in Pejë/Peć, as they cannot receive education in Bosnian in Deçan/Deçane.

⁵¹ Kosovo Serb children of Gojbulja/Gojbulë, Grace/Gracë and Banjskë/Banjska attending secondary education in Priluzhje/Prelluzhë or northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë. They also use the humanitarian bus lines provided by the Kosovo Ministry of Transport and Communications.

⁵² Kosovo Serb and Roma students attending Serbian curriculum in the "Sveti Sava" school, in Bresje.

⁵³ Kosovo Croat, Roma, Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Serb students attending Serbian curriculum secondary schools in Suvi Do/Suhodoll, Donja Gušterica/Gushtericë e Ulët, Laplje Selo/Llapplassellë and

Kosovo Serb and Roma students attending Serbian curriculum education. To counter the drop-out of Ashkali students, Lipjan/Lipljan municipality finances catch-up classes and provides school transport. Gjilan/Gnjilane municipality also facilitates transportation of Roma children from the Abdullah Presheva to the Ivo Lola Ribar neighbourhood, where the Serbian-curriculum school 'Vuk Karadžić' offers classes in Romani language. The municipality also pays the rent for the school premises, located in a private house. In contrast, other municipalities of this region where education in non-official languages is not available⁵⁴ have taken no steps to provide alternative solutions.

Kosovo Turk students in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica receive education in Albanian but the municipal director of education is willing to set up classes in Turkish if requested. In Vushtrri/Vučitrn, the Kosovo Turk representative in the municipal assembly recently requested bus transportation to enable Kosovo Turk pupils' attendance of a secondary Turkish language school in Prishtinë/Priština in the next school year.

Building new schools

Throughout Kosovo, the disproportion between a growing number of students and insufficient school facilities, combined with admission tests, leads to numerous cases of exclusion from secondary education⁵⁵ that also affect non-majority communities, including Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians.⁵⁶ In this context, the admission test may result in improper exclusion from secondary education rather than orienting students towards the most appropriate type of secondary education. International standards regarding the right to education specify that secondary education must be "generally available" regardless of the students' apparent capacity or ability.⁵⁷ Even when students are admitted, municipalities generally increase the maximum number of students per class, resulting in overcrowding and lower quality education.⁵⁸ This situation has prompted the Ministry of Education's allocation of € 27,260,000 for the construction of new schools in 2009. Only two of the planned new schools are for non-majority communities, with an investment of € 234,000, or 0.9 per cent of the total allocation.⁵⁹

Measures to integrate children of the Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities

Following a 2004-2007 catch-up classes programme which targeted some 1,800 Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian children in nine municipalities,⁶⁰ the need for sustained measures to

Gračanica/Gračanicë. The municipality provides two mini vans and covers maintenance costs, while parents pay for the driver's salary.

⁵⁴ Education is not available in Romani and Bosnian in Ferizaj/Uroševac where Kosovo Bosniaks, Gorani and Roma live, and in Romani in Novobërdë/Novo Brdo, Štrpce/Shtërpçë, and Viti/Vitina.

⁵⁵ In August 2008, 240 out of 698 students were not admitted to secondary education in Shtime/Štimlje, and 230 out of 582 in Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje. Priority is given based on the Kosovo test results and students' marks. Children of poverty-stricken families, in particular Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians, are more likely to score low on admission tests and, therefore, particularly vulnerable to exclusion.

⁵⁶ In September 2008, an Ashkali student was not admitted to the secondary school in Podujevë/Podujevo due to the test results and enrolled later upon intervention of the Ministry of Education.

⁵⁷ Article 13.2(b), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Economic and Social Council, Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, E/C.12/1999/10, General Comment on the Right to Education, 08/12/1999, paragraph 13.

⁵⁸ The number of students per teacher is 32. In Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje it was increased to 37, and classes are generally of 45 students. In Shtime/Štimlje, the threshold was augmented to 44.

⁵⁹ Law on Budget of Kosovo for Year 2009, 30 December 2008; Tables of budget of Kosovo for 2009; Specific budget items: "construction of primary school for minorities," Euro 200,000; and "construction of primary school in Bostane/Bostan" (Novobërdë/Novo Brdo), Euro 34,000.

⁶⁰ Prishtinë/Priština, Lipjan/Lipljan, Suharekë/Suva Reka, Pejë/Peć, Istog/Istok, Prizren, Shtime/Štimlje, Gjakovë/Đakovica and Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje.

ensure the educational integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian pupils is recognized in a multi-year strategy of the Ministry of Education.⁶¹

In Prizren and Gjakovë/Đakovica, where Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian pupils, and particularly girls, are affected by high drop-out and low enrolment rates mostly due to a poor economic situation, the municipalities have organised public awareness campaigns encouraging parents to enrol their children into schools. The Gjakovë/Đakovica municipal directorate of education has instructed school directors to monitor and submit regular reports on school attendance of children belonging to non-majority communities. Aiming at supporting educational integration through enhanced access to pre-school education, the Swiss Caritas and Prizren municipality jointly established two pre-school education facilities where half of the staff belongs to the Roma community in November 2008. Roma parents requested that their children be taught in Albanian. In Prizren and Ferizaj/Uroševac, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) has provided scholarships to Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian students attending secondary school and university.⁶² Other scholarships for the same communities are distributed in 2009 by the Ministry of Communities and Returns and envisaged by the Prime Minister's Office for Community Affairs.⁶³

Although the Roma community is particularly affected by drop-outs due to economic constraints, traditions particularly affecting girls (for example, early marriage), exclusion, and the intermittent supply of school books, municipalities in the Gjilan/Gnjilane region did not take effective action. Measures could have included a systematic approach to prevent drop-outs, such as organising catch-up classes, supporting activities for drop-out students, or organising awareness campaigns on the importance of education. Some school directors held *ad hoc* meetings with parents of drop-out students. School books for Roma pupils are at times provided by the Kosovo or the Serbian Ministry of Education, depending on the curriculum of study, or by international or non-governmental organizations. In Pejë/Peć, Istog/Istok, and Klinë/Klina, there are catch-up classes for Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian children or parents request that they resume.⁶⁴ The NGOs Caritas Kosovo in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë and Padem in Leposavić/Leposaviq, provide supplementary education for Roma children in Serbian and Romani. In Osojan/Osojanë (Istog/Istok) and Pejë/Peć, where the lack of Romani language classes and of qualified Romani language teachers is a major obstacle, the Roma community is in danger of losing its mother tongue. Pending the development of a Romani language subject within the Kosovo curriculum, some Roma parents proposed that the ministry and the municipalities organize a professional training and recruit prospective and current Romani language teachers living in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, where the Romani language is more widely used.

⁶¹ Strategy for the integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo – education, 2007-2017. The government Strategy for the integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo, 2009-2015, also contains a specific chapter on education.

⁶² To date, the UNDP Roma Regional Project funded 26 scholarships in Prizren (24 for secondary and 2 for university students) and 13 in Ferizaj/Uroševac (10 for secondary and 3 for university students).

⁶³ Ministry of Community and Returns' scholarships (50 for secondary and 10 for university education) refer to the period January-June 2009. The Office of Community Affairs plans establishing a Euro 100,000 communities' scholarship fund to support a minimum of 10 non-majority communities' students per year.

⁶⁴ Primary school "Vaso Pash Shkodrani" in Pejë/Peć; a project by the Italian NGO "Avsi/Tavolo Trentino con il Kosovo"; a request by the Kosovo Egyptian NGO "Vizioni 02" to Istog/Istok municipality; and catch-up classes project implemented by Care International in Klinë/Klina.

3. SEPARATION OF EDUCATION SYSTEMS AND OBSTACLES TO THE OPERATION OF MULTI-ETHNIC SCHOOLS

In both Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb majority areas, the Kosovo and the Serbian educational systems seclude Kosovo Serb and Kosovo Albanian students from the surrounding social environment of the majority community, as much as they ensure education in the mother tongue. In this way, education perpetrates and reinforces separation. Other communities gravitate around one of the educational systems depending on geographical, linguistic and other identity factors. Based on the educational system attended, there are multi-ethnic schools with either Kosovo Albanians or Kosovo Serbs and other communities, but schools combining Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb students are rather the exception. Even in the isolated cases in which students of these communities attend education under the same roof, separate educational shifts are in place, and with few exceptions, there is no interaction between students of the Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb communities. The fact that Kosovo Serb students learn only Serbian and Kosovo Albanian students learn only Albanian further prevents communication.

While Kosovo-curriculum schools hosting Kosovo Albanian children and children from non-Serb communities⁶⁵ and Serbian-curriculum schools with Kosovo Serb children and children from non-Albanian communities⁶⁶ are present throughout Kosovo, Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb children do not attend education together. The integration and social interaction of students attending the Kosovo and Serbian education systems within the same schools remains problematic. The ‘Sveti Sava’ school in Bresje (Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje) is a case in point. Prior to the events of March 2004, this school hosted only Serbian curriculum students. At the same time, the Kosovo Albanian municipal leadership and political parties were raising concerns that the school was not used in its full capacity, while the municipality had a deficit of classrooms space. The school was destroyed in March 2004 and reconstructed and reopened in September 2004. Fruitless discussions between Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb representatives regarding the joint use of the school lead to an Executive Decision of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General of the United Nations, making it a “multi-ethnic school”, which is used in different Serbian and Kosovo curriculum shifts. The United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) opened an office to administer and monitor the school. In October 2008, the office was closed and the municipality assumed responsibility for the implementation of the Executive Decision. Since then, a decreasing number of Kosovo Serb and Roma children⁶⁷ and a

⁶⁵ Schools in southern Mitrovicë/Mitrovica, Vushtrri/Vučitrn and Skenderaj/Srbica host Kosovo Albanian, Ashkali and Kosovo Bosniak students. Kosovo Turks and Kosovo Albanian students attend Albanian language education in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica and Vushtrri/Vučitrn. Kosovo Bosniaks and Kosovo Albanian in the Pejë/Peć region attend the same schools, though in separated language courses. In the Pejë/Peć region, in Fushë-Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Podujevë/Podujevo and Shtime/Štimlje, Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian and Kosovo Albanian students attend the same schools. In Prishtinë/Priština, Kosovo Turk, Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Bosniaks students share the same classes or schools. The same applies to Kosovo Bosniak, Kosovo Turk, Roma, Ashkali, Egyptian and Kosovo Albanian children throughout the Prizren region, and to Kosovo Albanian, Kosovo Turk, Ashkali, Gorani and Kosovo Bosniak students in various schools of the Gjilan/Gnjilane region.

⁶⁶ Serbian curriculum schools of Mitrovicë/Mitrovica and Gjilan/Gnjilane regions, Osojan/Osojanë, Istog/Istok, Fushë-Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Obiliq/Obilić and Gračanica/Gračanicë (Prishtinë/Priština) integrate Kosovo Serb and Roma students. Serbian curriculum schools are also attended by Kosovo Bosniak students in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë and Leposavić/Leposaviq, and by Kosovo Croats, Kosovo Bosniaks and Roma in Janjevo/Janjevë (Lipjan/Lipljan).

⁶⁷ There are 62 primary school Serbian language students in five classes of the first floor (12 students per class on average). Regardless of their number, UNMIK Executive Decision 2005/7 protects the rights of Kosovo Serb and other non-Albanian students to continue education in the school.

growing number of Kosovo Albanian and Ashkali students⁶⁸ attend education at separate times and on separate floors without communication between school managers, teachers and students of the two systems. The decreasing Kosovo Serb population feels that Serbian curriculum education in the school may be at risk.⁶⁹

During the school year 2008/9, in Dragash/Dragaš town, Gorani and Kosovo Albanian teachers and students did not share premises in the two schools that were used by both communities.⁷⁰ In September 2008, a decision of the mayor has prevented Gorani teachers without Kosovo contracts to enter the school premises. Since 2006, Gorani teachers have signed contracts exclusively with the Serbian Ministry of Education.⁷¹ This situation has deprived 135 Gorani children of education in the Serbian language. As of January 2009, after losing an entire semester, students and teachers of the Dragash/Dragaš ‘Nezim Berati/Nebojša Jerković’ primary school had no other option but to move to satellite schools located in four neighbouring villages. However, allegedly due to lack of space and the distance between the villages, the organization of regular education has been seriously disrupted. For example, students of grades 5-8 only attend thirty minutes classes two days per week. After a visit of the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities in February 2009, the municipality, the Prime Minister and the Minister of Education promised to ensure the prompt return of Gorani students and teachers to the said school. On 3 March, Gorani students of the grades 5-8 returned to the school while students of the grades 1-4 did not. However, on 17 March also teachers and students of the grades 5-8 withdrew from the school, allegedly due to interferences of the Kosovo-curriculum director in the readmission and activities of Serbian-curriculum teachers.⁷²

The school in Poneš/Ponesh (Gjilan/Gnjilane) is another example of division of the the Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb communities along political lines. The school building was constructed with financial support from the British Embassy for the two communities to be taught in their own language and curricula, but to share classes such as physical education. However, the setup of a sign naming the school after a Kosovo Liberation Army member and a “Republic of Kosovo” sign proved too divisive and ran counter to the spirit of the project, which endeavoured to bring communities together under a shared roof with common values. In Rahovec/Orahovac, a multi-ethnic primary school established in 2001 in an attempt to bring Kosovo Albanian, Kosovo Serb, Roma and Egyptian students together, is not used by

⁶⁸ According to the municipal directorate of education, 383 Kosovo curriculum students of the ‘Selman Riza’ school attend seven classes of the second floor, with an average of 54 students per class. Current use of the school does not exempt the municipality from the obligation to build new school premises to cater for a growing number of students.

⁶⁹ Kosovo Serb students come from the village of Uglar/Ugljare, where the Kosovo Serb population has been steadily decreasing since March 2004 and only ten of the previous 80 families have remained. Inter-ethnic property sales continue, while several Kosovo Albanian young families settle in the village. Roma students in the school reportedly consider opting for Kosovo curriculum education.

⁷⁰ Gorani students and teachers do not use the Dragash/Dragaš town secondary school premises since 2007, and have not used the “Nezim Berati/Nebojša Jerković” primary school since September 2008.

⁷¹ While a Kosovo curriculum in the Serbian language is not provided, in 2006 the Serbian Co-ordination Centre for Kosovo and Metohija requested that Gorani teachers sign either Republic of Serbia or Kosovo contracts. Gorani teachers have declined to sign Kosovo contracts since. Teachers contracted by the Republic of Serbia in Kosovo enjoy better contractual and salary conditions.

⁷² While two Gorani teachers of the grades 1-4 were not being allowed back in the school, the Kosovo-curriculum director took the initiative to issue ‘house rules’ and, in response, all Gorani teachers and students withdrew from the school on 17 March. The OSCE contacted both representatives of the Dragash/Dragaš municipality, who consider the ‘house rules’ invalid (20 March), and the representative of the Serbian Ministry of Education in Kosovo, who reassured the Gorani children would return to the school upon a written decision of the municipality invalidating the ‘house rules’ (23 March). The municipality fulfilled this request on 24 March.

Kosovo Serb pupils due to perceived lack of security and parents' concerns that Kosovo education may limit the possibility of pursuing education outside Kosovo.

Primary education in Janjevë/Janjevo illustrates further paradoxes of co-habitation. The school has three different directors and names. The Serbian curriculum director calls it "Vladimir Nazor"; the Kosovo Croat director calls it "Janjevo;" the Lipjan/Lipljan municipality and Kosovo Albanian director call it "Shtefan Gjeqovi." The Kosovo Croat director is appointed by the municipality but pupils of this community attend Serbian-curriculum education. Kosovo Albanian, Ashkali and Kosovo Turk students receive education in Albanian on one floor; Kosovo Croat, Kosovo Bosniak, and Roma students receive education in Serbian on the other.

A relatively positive example comes from the elementary schools of Mogila/Mogille and Binač/Bincë (Viti/Vitina), where some classes of the Kosovo and Serbian educational systems share the school building during the same shift. In Poneš/Ponesh (Gjilan/Gnjilane) and Jasenovik (Novobërdë/Novo Brdo), schools operating under the two different systems share the same building although in different shifts. Space allocation arrangements disable or enable the possibility of interaction between students. For instance, in the Poneš/Ponesh school there is a break of 45 minutes between the two shifts, and therefore the students of the different communities do not meet. In Jasenovik, 15 to 30 minutes of break between shifts allows some interaction between students, especially in summer when they practice sports together in the school yard.

The satellite elementary school of "Pandeli Sotiri" in the Plemetinë/Plemetina temporary community shelter (Obiliq/Obilić), represents an example of poor quality and segregated education attended exclusively by Roma and Ashkali pupils, who receive tuition from under-qualified teachers. The construction of a new school in the same village is expected to enable the integration of these students with Kosovo Albanian students in the forthcoming school year. In 2008 two previously classrooms catering exclusively for 53 Ashkali, Egyptian and Roma pupils were already successfully integrated in the multiethnic primary school "Selman Riza" in Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje.

In some cases, the mere fact of sharing the same school or class does not mean that integration is achieved. In Ferizaj/Uroševac, Ashkali respondents have highlighted how, in some cases, during the winter, students of their community are being placed in seats far from the stove and close to the window. Outside the school, they are often bullied, addressed in a derogatory manner or even beaten up by Kosovo Albanian students. After a series of recent alleged beatings by Kosovo Albanian students,⁷³ Ashkali parents appear increasingly afraid of sending their children to school.

4. PRESENTATION OF KOSOVO COMMUNITIES WITHIN TEXTBOOKS

In consonance with the Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities,⁷⁴ the applied legislation on the rights of communities requires that the Kosovo educational curriculum cover the history, culture and other attributes of communities traditionally present in Kosovo and foster a spirit of respect, understanding and tolerance

⁷³ A rapid succession of incidents of assault allegedly took place on 10 February, 1 and 3 March 2009.

⁷⁴ Article 6.1 of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities provides that authorities: "[s]hall encourage a spirit of tolerance and intercultural dialogue and take effective measures to promote mutual respect and understanding and co-operation among all persons living on their territory, irrespective of those persons' ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious identity, in particular in the fields of education, culture and the media."

among all of them.⁷⁵ It also provides that communities' representative organizations be consulted during the development of such curricula. In practice, in a post-conflict environment, the existence and practices of two separate school systems is not conducive to the creation of a system of inter-cultural education where the identity of each group is preserved, the identity of other groups is learned and acknowledged, and mutual understanding, acceptance and tolerance is promoted. Conflicting historical representations tend to prioritize either the Kosovo Albanian or the Kosovo Serb community. They do not or insufficiently accommodate the specific histories of other communities. The lack of community-specific "national" subjects and mother tongue classes for some of the most vulnerable communities (Roma, Ashkali, Egyptians, Gorani, Kosovo Croats, and Kosovo Montenegrins) impedes adequate preservation of their identities.

Separation and conflict over authority

The reality in Kosovo is characterised by social, political and administrative separation between the Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Serb communities. Separation and conflict over authority became even more pronounced after 17 February 2008. In the education field, the existence of two separate, divergent and often competing school systems is not conducive to promoting "understanding, tolerance and friendship among nations, racial or religious groups" or "contributing to the maintenance of peace", as enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.⁷⁶ As previously explained, Kosovo Serb students attend schools financed and managed by the Serbian Ministry of Education, while Kosovo Albanian students attend schools maintained by the Kosovo Ministry of Education. Overall, smaller communities tend to gravitate towards either curricula depending chiefly on their geographical location and, to a lesser extent, on language and/or religion. Those who live within Kosovo Serb enclaves follow the Serbian curriculum, while others will normally follow the Kosovo curriculum.

The two educational systems have, in fact, contributed to entrench the chasm which divides communities in Kosovo. That both Kosovo Albanian and Serbian textbooks tend to present a slanted and one-sided view of history is a case in point. They do not confine themselves to present a history of Kosovo, but tend to be more geared toward presenting the history of either the Albanian or the Serb community. Kosovo Albanian history school books focus on ethnic Albanian protagonists, while Slavs are said to have come to "Albanian lands" where they fought, pillaged, destroyed and assimilated proto-Albanian tribes (except in Kosovo and Albania).⁷⁷ Serbian textbooks present Kosovo as the "Cradle of the Serbian Nation" and underline that Kosovo Albanians have come from Albania.⁷⁸ In both curricula, both ethnic communities' histories are presented as a long enduring sequence of oppression and national struggle to break away from the Ottoman Empire. According to the version of history taught in the Kosovo curriculum, the oppression of the Albanian people and their national struggle⁷⁹

⁷⁵ Art. 8.12, 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities.

⁷⁶ Article 26, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948; Art. 13.1, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; General Comment No. 13: The Right to Education, Art. 13.4, Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Twenty-first session (1999).

⁷⁷ Fehmi Rexhepi & Frasher Demaj, 2006, *Historia 6, Libri Shkollor Prishtinë/Priština*, p. 113-4.

⁷⁸ Suzana Rajić, Kosta Nikolić & Nebojša Jovanović, 2005, *Istoria 8: Za 8 Razred Osnovne Škole, Stampa "Kultura" Bački Petrovac*, p. 27 & 134-5.

⁷⁹ "Freedoms and political rights promised by the young Turks did not last for long. After they established their authority, they started actions against the national Albanian movement. Young Turks started to create obstacles to Albanian schools and cultural clubs, to arrest Albanian patriots etc. These actions as well as taxes and military service raised the anger of the Albanian population against the regime of the young Turks ... Under-cover Albanian committees started their attempts to organize general armed uprising against the Ottomans. At the beginning of April 1910 uprising erupted in the Prishtinë region. It spread quickly to other

did not end with the dissolution of the Ottoman empire but continued with Kosovo's "forced" inclusion into Serbia.⁸⁰ Kosovo Serb eight graders are taught that most Albanians keep cattle and live in rural villages, and that during World War II Kosovo was part of a Greater Albania, under which time a great number of Kosovo Serbs were killed or deported in an effort to ethnically cleanse Kosovo.⁸¹ On the whole, Serbian history school books steer clear of contemporary Balkan history.⁸² Kosovo Albanian school books do discuss contemporary history.⁸³ Kosovo Albanian elementary school children are taught, for example, that the Serbian military and police massacred Kosovo Albanians in 1998-1999.⁸⁴ Two pages are spent on the Kosovo Liberation Army Commander Adem Jashari alone.

Serbian-curriculum schools

The Serbian curriculum for primary education (grades 1-4) includes 20 classes a week of which 9 are devoted to the study of the Serbian language, literature, art, music and religion. The teaching of history is introduced in the grade 5. The number of teaching hours increases from 27 to 30 in the grades 5-8 and approximately one third of the classes (or 10 hours) remains devoted to community-specific "national" subjects. This curriculum is applied Serbia-wide, with no special reference to Kosovo Serbs. Textbooks do not present a history of Kosovo, but rather of the Serbian nation as a whole, and stay clear of contemporary history (period from 1998 to present) or cover it only through a general presentation of facts and dates lacking analysis. Kosovo Serb students learn mainly about Albanians and their history from World War II onward. As for geography, children are taught that Kosovo is the southern province of Serbia where most of the Albanian minority lives.⁸⁵

places throughout Kosovo and the Dibra province" Fehmi Rexhepi & Frasher Demaj 2005, *Historia 8 shkolla e mesme e ulet, Shtepia Botuese "Libri Shkollor" Prishtinë/Priština*, page 105. See also pages 68, 78 & 104-111.

⁸⁰ Later incorporated in 1918 into the Kingdom of Serbs, Croats and Slovenes.

⁸¹ Suzana Rajić, Kosta Nikolić & Nebojša Jovanović, 2005, *Istorija 8: Za 8 Razred Osnovne Škole*, Stampa "Kultura" Bački Petrovac, p. 27 & 134-5.

⁸² In a sample of history books from fifth and eighth grades, there is, for instance, no reference to the Kosovo conflict of 1998-1999. The Milosević era is roughly described as a period in which relations with other republics of the former Yugoslavia took a turn for the worse.

⁸³ In accordance with Kosovo Albanian history books from grades 6-9.

⁸⁴ "In these conditions Serbian occupiers initiated their military and police propaganda machinery not just against KLA (Kosovo Liberation Army) but also against the civilian population, result of which were unbelievable scenes of barbarianism, killings and massacres of innocent people (children, women and elderly), burning of the houses and massive imprisonment of youngsters etc. The biggest massacres were undertaken during February and March 1998 especially in the Drenicë/Drenica region. Such massacres on Albanian civil population were done during the entire year 1998 throughout Kosovo." Source: Fehmi Rexhepi, 2006, *Historia 9, Libri Shkollor, Prishtinë/Priština*, p. 168. The Drenicë/Drenica region comprises the Skenderaj/Srbica, Glogoc/Glogovac and Malishevë/Mališevo municipalities, as well as the South western part of Mitrovicë/Mitrovica region. The Bosnian language version of "Man and Nature", reads: "Serbian power, despite many attempts did not manage to change the ethnic structure of the inhabitants in my country. The peak of madness of these barbarians was achieved between 24 March and 12 June." Source: Rasim Bejtullahu, Muhamet Bicaj, Ragip Rrustemi, "Man and Nature", 3rd grade of primary school, *Libri Shkollor, Prishtinë/Priština 2007*, p. 67.

⁸⁵ Consultation of textbooks and discussion with Kosovo Serb students in Štrpce/Shtërpçë, Viti/Vitina, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Novobërdë/Novo Brdo, and Kamenicë/Kamenica. See also Rada Sitarica & Milutin Tadić, 2008, *Geography for Sixth Grade of Primary School*, Institute for Textbooks, Belgrade, pp. 90-91 where the 2002 statistical data for Serbia also include Kosovo and Metohija: "number of inhabitants: 9,396,000 (the 2001 estimate for Kosovo and Metohija is 1,900,000 inhabitants)" and where the maps of Serbia displayed at pages 90 and 91 also include Kosovo. Rada Sitarica & Milutin Tadić, 2008, *Geography Workbook for Sixth Grade of Primary School*, Institute for Textbooks, Belgrade, p. 66 (where the territory of Serbia is described as comprising Central Serbia, Vojvodina, and Kosovo and Metohija) and p. 63 (where the cardinal points of

Respondents have different opinions on the actual content of Serbian textbooks and the way they represent other communities. These opinions range from textbooks providing comprehensive information on ethnicities traditionally inhabiting Kosovo,⁸⁶ to geography and history books making reference to all communities traditionally present in Serbia, including Kosovo,⁸⁷ and contents on nations and nationalities included in some lessons on communities (Bosniaks, Croats and Albanians) with limited reference to the Turk community.⁸⁸

In some cases the linguistic needs of other communities are accommodated, such as in the Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan) school, where Kosovo Croat, Kosovo Bosniak and Roma students can learn their languages three hours per week. From 2003, in one school of northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë and in a few primary schools in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Kamenicë/Kamenica and Ugljare/Uglar (Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje), two Romani language grammar classes per week are provided for Roma students. Controversy over the expression of the Romani language in the Cyrillic or Latin script has been solved in favour of Latin-based books. However, even where *ad hoc* provisions enable children to be taught their mother tongue, there are no provisions to promote and teach their culture, history and religion.

In Dragash/Dragaš, directors of schools where Gorani pupils attend Serbian curriculum primary and secondary education confirmed that, as permitted by Serbian legislation on education, teachers modify up to 30 per cent of the curriculum in order to cover history, culture, and other specific attributes of local communities. Therefore, parents and students feel that their community is sufficiently represented in textbooks and the teaching process. However, the educational material contains little reference to the Gorani community. Kosovo Bosniak students who follow the Serbian curriculum in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë and Leposavić/Leposaviq believe that the history and culture of their community is not duly recognised, as they study the history and culture of Serbia, with little variation, dispensation, or additional subjects offered to accommodate the Kosovo Bosniak identity.⁸⁹

Kosovo-curriculum schools

Within the Kosovo curriculum, during primary education (grades 1-5) community-specific “national” subjects on mother tongue, art, music and history cover from one third to half (9-11 hours) of the total imparted classes (20 to 25 hours). The teaching of history is introduced

the map of Serbia are displayed and the southernmost tip of Kosovo is identified as the southern cardinal point of Serbia).

⁸⁶ According to teachers in Goraždevac/Gorazhdac, Sigë/Siga, Brestovik/Brestovikë (Pejë/Peć), and Osojane/Osojan (Istog/Istok), the history of Serbs and the Serbian state is studied in primary and secondary education; history books provide comprehensive information on ethnicities traditionally inhabiting Kosovo; and the Kosovo Albanian community’s history is covered from the settlement of Illyrian tribes, through the Ottoman occupation, the conversion to Islam, the Balkans’ wars, the first and second League of Prizren, the world wars, and the events of the 80s’ and 90s’. The Roma and Kosovo Bosniak communities would also be covered in lessons concerning the history of the region.

⁸⁷ School directors and teachers in Rahovec/Orahovac and Velika Hoča/Hoçë e Madhe.

⁸⁸ Respondents in Prishtinë/Priština highlight that the Serbian curriculum features contents on nations and nationalities, including Bosniaks, Croats and Albanians, focusing on the former Yugoslavia or the Balkans context. The Kosovo Turk community is mentioned only in relation to the Ottoman empire.

⁸⁹ The Kosovo Bosniak community is concerned about the preservation of their cultural and religious identity under the Serbian curriculum, and criticizes teachers and school directors for being insensitive to the specificities of their identity. For instance, the recently introduced religious studies’ subject raised particular concern when a school director in northern Mitrovica/Mitrovicë initially insisted that Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Serb students attend the same classes of this subject.

in grade 5. National subjects represent slightly less than one third of the study programme in lower secondary education (grades 6-9).

In the northern municipalities of Leposavić/Leposaviq, Zvečan/Zveçan and Zubin Potok, the isolated Kosovo Albanian community, receives primary education in their mother tongue according to the Kosovo curriculum, including community-specific “national” subjects. Mother tongue secondary and tertiary education is available only south of the Ibër/Ibar river. There are no initiatives aiming at establishing contacts with Kosovo Serb students or promoting the learning about this community and its language.

Kosovo Turk students receive education either in Turkish⁹⁰ or Albanian.⁹¹ The Turkish language curriculum includes community-specific “national” subjects whose syllabus were drafted by Kosovo Turk experts. Twenty to 30 per cent of history books cover the history of the Kosovo Turk community as well as Turkey and its influence on the Balkans. While primary education curriculum-based textbooks are generally available, those used in secondary education are imported from Turkey, and do not contain reference to Kosovo and to the Kosovo Turkish community. Respondents in Prishtinë/Priština and Mitrovicë/Mitrovica are dissatisfied with the insufficient representation of their community within the Kosovo curriculum and concerned over the representation in history books of Turks as occupiers. Following a complaint of the Kosovo Turk community and recommendations of the Republic of Turkey Liaison Office in Kosovo, in 2007 the Ministry of Education introduced curricular and textbook changes, enabling a more objective cultural and historical representation of this community. While in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica and Vushtrri/Vučitrn the Kosovo Turk community has not requested to receive mother tongue and national-subject education,⁹² the Kosovo Turk representative in Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan) has recently done so.

Kosovo Bosniak respondents in Prishtinë/Priština are dissatisfied with the insufficient representation of their community within the Kosovo curriculum. Negative presentation of the Kosovo Serb community, especially in relation to the recent conflict, is noticeable in some books used by Kosovo Bosniak students.⁹³ These students consistently confirm that they learn sufficiently about the Bosnian language and literature, but need to learn more about the history of the Kosovo Bosniaks. Bosnian language teachers need further support, in terms of textbooks and for the organization of educational and cultural activities that would enhance students’ motivation and help to transmit and preserve the community’s identity.

The Romani language and the history and culture of the Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities are not included in the Kosovo curriculum. Roma parents in Klinë/Klina are concerned that their children cannot speak or be taught their language beyond the private sphere, and risk losing their historical and cultural heritage. Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian respondents attending either the Serbian or Kosovo education systems request that these curricula be amended to include information or subjects regarding their culture, history and identity.⁹⁴ Ashkali respondents also note that the Kosovo curriculum does not enable children

⁹⁰ Prizren, Mamuša/Mamushë/Mamuša, Gjilan/Gnjilane, and Prishtinë/Priština.

⁹¹ Mitrovicë/Mitrovica, Vushtrri/Vučitrn, Janjevo/Janjevë (Lipjan/Lipljan).

⁹² Self-assertion of identity appears to be contextually-dependent. Community members will at certain times declare themselves Turks and at other times they will integrate seamlessly into the Kosovo Albanian community, as seems to occur through the education system.

⁹³ See footnote 79. Source: Rasim Bejtullahu, Muhamet Bicaj, Ragip Rrustemi, “Man and Nature”, 3rd grade of primary school, Libri Shkollor, Prishtinë/Priština 2007, p. 67.

⁹⁴ Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian respondents in Obiliq/Obilić, Hallaq i Vogël/Mali Alaš (Lipjan/Lipljan), Klinë/Klina and Shtime/Štimlje.

to learn about identities of other non-majority communities.⁹⁵ Roma and Egyptian respondents object to Kosovo books providing oversimplified representations tracing their origins in India and Egypt.

While in Prizren and Ferizaj/Uroševac the Roma community has taken various initiatives aimed at developing educational modules on their culture, history and traditions,⁹⁶ the Egyptian and Ashkali communities in Pejë/Peć and Mitrovicë/Mitrovica share language and religious traditions of the Kosovo Albanian community and prioritise educational integration over the introduction of community-specific educational curricular subjects. The Roma Ashkali and Egyptian communities in the Prizren region have expressed high expectations regarding the implementation of the government's strategy for the integration of the Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo, which foresees the development of "basic modules on Romani, Ashkali, and Egyptian tradition, culture and history in the general curricula of other languages of instruction."⁹⁷ In 2009, a project of the Ministry of Education intends to address this gap for the Roma community, by developing a teaching subject in the Romani language.⁹⁸ The project involves the participation of Roma community representatives, but its funding, the short period of time foreseen for its development, the lack of clear long-term institutional plans regarding the training of a sufficient number of Romani language teachers, and the lack of a proper assessment of the potential demand and financial disbursement implied by the publication of books, suggest that the project should be further developed in order to achieve a sustainable impact.⁹⁹

5. LEARNING OF OFFICIAL LANGUAGE BY NON-MAJORITY STUDENTS

Under the legislation applied in Kosovo, in primary and secondary schools or classes where the language of instruction is not an official language, pupils are obliged to study an official language of their choice.¹⁰⁰ However, the Kosovo curricula in the Bosnian and Turkish languages do not envisage the second official elective language as a compulsory subject, but rather as one of the additional subjects that parents and students can choose. Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Turk parents consistently avail of this option and request that their children receive two additional classes per week in the Albanian language.¹⁰¹ While parents have in theory this possibility, they cannot opt for the Serbian language, since there is no provision of and curriculum for Serbian language education.

Insufficient and inadequate Albanian language education results in poor learning of this language as well as lower opportunities for educational and employment integration and thus

⁹⁵ Respondents in Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje and Podujevë/Podujevo.

⁹⁶ As requested of the communities in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Prizren and Gračanica/Graçanicë, a Roma writer from Prizren established a commission to work on a curriculum for the Roma community in 2002. The commission never proposed recommendations and curricular changes. In 2003 and 2006, Roma communities in Ferizaj/Uroševac and Prizren also requested additional classes in Romani and proposed a curriculum for a subject on the Romani language, culture and history.

⁹⁷ Strategy for the integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo, 2008, p. 24.

⁹⁸ Ministry of Education's Project on 'Curricula of Roma Language, as a native language of Roma, Egyptians and Ashkali', April 2008.

⁹⁹ In 2004, a feasibility study supported by the OSCE and the Ministry of Education recommended that the development of a Romani language curriculum includes external expertise (from countries where similar curricula have been developed), is taught by teachers of the Roma community and provides qualified lifelong training for Romani language teachers.

¹⁰⁰ Art. 21.1, Law on the Use of Languages; Art. 8.10, the 2008 Law on the Rights of Communities; Ministry of Education, Administrative Instruction No. 10/2007 on Learning in the Elective Official Language.

¹⁰¹ As confirmed in the Prizren, Pejë/Peć, Gjilan/Gnjilane and Prishtinë/Priština regions.

puts non-Albanian mother tongue students at a disadvantage. As highlighted by Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Turk students in Prizren, while the Ministry of Education has developed a curriculum for the second elective Albanian language, school-books have not been printed and are not available. Instead, teachers and students are provided with textbooks for Albanian mother tongue learners that are too complex and are not used in practice. In the primary school of Dobrushë/Dobruša (Istog/Istok), the situation is worse, considering that there is not a single book of Albanian for Kosovo Bosniak students of any grade. According to Kosovo Bosniak students and parents in the Pejë/Peć region, Albanian language lessons are of good quality, but insufficient in number and frequency to enable a good command of the language. Kosovo Bosniak secondary school students not fluent in Albanian cannot benefit of internship opportunities available for Kosovo Albanian within private firms of the region. Following their education, they will have difficulties to work in Albanian speaking enterprises, even in their areas of expertise.

The social environment and socialization opportunities provided by contacts with peers of the Kosovo Albanian community play a key role in contributing to a successful learning of its language. For instance, in Pejë/Peć Kosovo Bosniak children who do not come from ethnically mixed villages where the Albanian language is predominant have more difficulties and fewer opportunities to learn this language. Teachers propose summer courses of Albanian language to help catching up this deficit, as additional Albanian language classes within regular teaching hours would pose an excessive burden on these students. However, there would be no overburden if elective official language classes were an obligatory teaching subject. Kosovo Turk students in Gjilan/Gnjilane learn Albanian from mother tongue teachers. At the end of secondary education, they are well integrated into the Kosovo Albanian society and have a fair command of the Albanian language. Nonetheless, this result seems to be linked to socialization factors (such as physical proximity to and daily interaction with Kosovo Albanian peers both in private and public spaces) rather than indicating an intrinsic good quality of the formal Albanian language education. Two Albanian language classes per week would be insufficient without supplementary social learning opportunities.

During the primary school age, poor knowledge of each other's languages seriously limits interaction between Kosovo Turk and Kosovo Albanian children. Kosovo Turk students do not speak fluent Albanian and find it difficult to engage in daily activities with Kosovo Albanian children. The situation improves during secondary education, when increased knowledge of the Albanian language favours interaction and socialization also beyond school premises. During this phase, Kosovo Turk male students undertake joint activities (such as sports and others) with Kosovo Albanian colleagues more frequently than their female colleagues. This determines a visible gap in Albanian language skills acquired by Kosovo Turk school boys and girls, respectively, leaving girls more exposed to the risk of exclusion.

The Serbian and Kosovo curricula equally fail to provide students with the opportunity to learn the other official language. In this context, future generations of the two largest communities will be unable to communicate with each other (other than in foreign languages). In the future the Kosovo civil service is likely to be composed of civil servants unable to speak both official languages. Therefore, the implementation of the law on the use of languages and the equal use of the official languages is at risk. The only exception to this negative pattern is noticeable in Dragash/Dragaš, where Serbian-curriculum Gorani students are being taught two optional Albanian language classes per week in the grades 3-8.

6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

As the Montreal Seminar on Intercultural and Multicultural Education concluded: “Multicultural education involves the educational policies and practices which meet the separate educational needs of groups of society which belong to different cultural traditions, while intercultural education involves educational policies and practices by which the members of different cultures, whether in a majority or minority position, learn to interact constructively with each other. Intercultural education aims at highlighting the preservation of each group’s identity, accompanied by the acceptance of diversity and tolerance. To this end, intercultural education requires that both minority and majority learn about each other, about specific cultural characteristics, their respective histories and about the value of tolerance and pluralism.”¹⁰² To a certain extent, the separate curricula in Kosovo satisfy the intra-cultural educational needs of specific communities, but fall short of promoting mutual respect, understanding and tolerance. Practices of the separate educational systems suggest the need of initiatives to promote integration within diversity and intercultural education.

In addition to the current curriculum reform process, accompanying processes of transitional justice, inter-ethnic dialogue and truth seeking would help Kosovo communities develop a commonly understood and reconciled view of their recent past. A more balanced, diversified and agreed upon history is crucial, embracing rather than dividing communities. Until then, there should ideally be a moratorium on teaching contemporary history. If not, prejudice and ethnic hatred will only endure further entrenching divisions and historical grievances, which may trigger further conflict. The past is usually not conceived as a finished affair, but rather a deep-seated justification for yesterday’s – and quite possibly even for tomorrow’s – actions. As things stand now, an emerging generation of Kosovo youth from different communities will find it difficult to communicate, be it through a commonly understood language, a shared and non-divisive history, or culture.

In a context of limited resources and despite progress achieved, within the Kosovo educational systems, students belonging to smaller communities continue to enjoy lower opportunities to maintain, develop and foster knowledge of their culture and identity. In this respect, subjects on the language, history, art and music of the Roma, Ashkali, Egyptian, Gorani, Kosovo Croat, and Kosovo Montenegrin communities are not available. No curriculum based textbooks in Turkish and Bosnian are available for secondary education and insufficient funds are allocated for their publication.

On the other hand, separation between the students of the two education systems, inadequate opportunities for integration, and, in some cases, harassment of non-majority community students remain matters for concern. While there is no Kosovo curriculum in the Serbian language, students and teachers of the separate school systems do not have contacts, and bi-lingual education enabling learning of both official languages is not provided. In the Kosovo curriculum, students learning in non-official languages have the opportunity to receive official language classes in Albanian but not in Serbian. Moreover, insufficient and inadequate Albanian language education for non-Albanian students results in poor learning of this language and lower opportunities for educational and employment integration.

For these reasons, the OSCE recommends that the educational systems in Kosovo:

- Prioritize the participatory development of curricula and community-specific “national” subjects on the language, history, art and music of the most vulnerable communities;

¹⁰² Montreal International Seminar on Intercultural and Multicultural Education, 31 March 2000, paragraph 6, E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.5/2000/WP.4, United Nations’ Commission on Human Rights, Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, Working Group on Minorities, Sixth session.

- Further expand graduate studies in non-official languages to increase the number of qualified teachers and foster professional development training for these teachers;
- Ensure the complete subsidised publication and distribution of Bosnian and Turkish language textbooks for primary and secondary education, improve the quality of national-subject books and ensure professional translation of general subject books;
- Introduce a subject on intercultural education and mainstream communities and communities rights as a cross-curricular issue,¹⁰³ to promote intercultural education;
- Consistently promote social learning opportunities, interaction and contacts among students and teachers of all communities and educational systems;
- Prevent and address, especially at the school level, acts of discrimination, hostility or violence to which students have been or may be subject as a result of their ethnic, cultural, religious or linguistic identity;
- Afford, on a voluntary basis, additional classes on the second official language to students of both curricula;
- Provide, in line with the Hague Recommendations Regarding the Educational Rights of National Minorities¹⁰⁴ whose mother tongue is different from the official language(s) and compatibly with parents and students' wishes:
 - *pre-school and kindergarten education* in the mother tongue of the child;
 - *primary school* in the mother tongue with the addition of a subject on the official language(s) being taught on a regular basis, and with the introduction, towards the end of this period, of a few practical subjects taught through the medium of the official language(s);
 - *a substantial part of the secondary school curriculum* in the mother tongue, while ensuring that the official languages are taught on a regular basis and the number of subjects taught in the official languages is gradually increased.

¹⁰³ The Kosovo-curriculum framework of 2001 envisages the following issues as cross-curricular subjects: life and personal skills; democratic citizenship and human rights; entrepreneurship; health; environment; information and communication technology; and media.

¹⁰⁴ Recommendations issued under the auspices of the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities, The Hague, October 1996, paragraphs 11-13.

7. ANNEX 1. Respondents interviewed by the OSCE disaggregated by community, gender and category (January-February 2009)

Community	Respondents by category	Primary school students	Secondary school students	Parents	Primary school teachers	Secondary school teachers	Primary school directors	Secondary school directors	MDE	Total	%
	Sex										
Kosovo Albanian north	Female	0	0	2	6	1	1	0	3	13	25
	Male	0	2	4	6	1	14	4	9	40	75
	Total	0	2	6	12	2	15	4	12	53	100
Kosovo Serbs	Female	18	16	23	21	7	12	3	9	109	46
	Male	19	14	20	19	13	18	10	13	126	54
	Total	37	30	43	40	20	30	13	22	235	100
Kosovo Turks	Female	8	3	5	3	1	0	0	0	20	32
	Male	6	2	7	7	8	4	4	4	42	68
	Total	14	5	12	10	9	4	4	4	62	100
Kosovo Bosniak	Female	5	4	8	11	7	3	1	0	39	48
	Male	4	4	9	7	7	3	3	6	43	52
	Total	9	8	17	18	14	6	4	6	82	100
Roma	Female	17	16	19	2	0	0	0	0	54	40
	Male	23	16	35	5	1	0	1	1	82	60
	Total	40	32	54	7	1	0	1	1	136	100
Ashkali	Female	12	4	13	2	0	1	0	0	32	35
	Male	18	12	23	5	0	0	1	1	60	65
	Total	30	16	36	7	0	1	1	1	92	100
Egyptians	Female	3	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	6	23
	Male	3	4	11	2	0	0	0	0	20	77
	Total	6	6	12	2	0	0	0	0	26	100
Kosovo Croat	Female	2	1	3	4	0	1	0	0	11	65
	Male	1	1	1	3	0	0	0	0	6	35
	Total	3	2	4	7	0	1	0	0	17	100
Gorani	Female	4	3	2	2	0	0	0	0	11	31
	Male	3	3	5	7	3	2	1	0	24	69
	Total	7	6	7	9	3	2	1	0	35	100
Total gender	Female	69	49	76	51	16	18	4	12	295	40.
	Male	77	58	115	61	33	41	24	34	443	60
	Total	146	107	191	112	49	59	28	46	738	100
% by category		19.8	14.5	25.9	15.2	6.6	8	3.8	6.2	100	-

Legend: MDE means representatives of Municipal Directorates of Education.

Detail of respondents by community

Community	Female	Male	Total	% of total	% females	% males
Albanian	13	40	53	7.2	24.5	75.5
Serb	109	126	235	34.3	46.4	53.6
Turk	20	42	62	13.8	32.3	67.7
Bosniak	39	43	82	19.2	47.6	52.4
Roma	54	82	136	33.5	39.7	60.3
Ashkali	32	60	92	24.9	34.8	65.2
Egyptian	6	20	26	9.4	23.1	76.9
Croat	11	6	17	6.7	64.7	35.3
Gorani	11	24	35	14.9	31.4	68.6
Total	295	443	738	100	40	60

8. ANNEX 2. 2005 ethnic composition of Kosovo and list of locations where the OSCE conducted interviews for the purpose of this report



Legend: **This map is not an official document and is provided for reference only.** Others also includes Kosovo Montenegrins. This report is based on interviews conducted by the OSCE in: Štrpce/Shtërpçe; Gjilan/Gnjilane; Novobërdë/Novo Brdo; Kamenicë/Kamenica; Ferizaj/Uroševac; Viti/Vitina; Obiliq/Obilić, Caravodicë/Crkvena Vodica, Babimoc/Babin Most and Plemetin/Plemetina (Obiliq/Obilić); Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje; Lipjan/Lipljan, Hallaq i Vogël/Mali Alaš and Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan); Podujevë/Podujevo; Shtime/Štimlje; northern and southern Mitrovicë/Mitrovica; Zvečan/Zvečan; Zubin Potok; Leposavić/Leposaviq; Skenderaj/Srbica; Vushtrri/Vučitrn; Pejë/Peć, Goraždevac/Gorazhdec, Sigë/Siga and

Brestovik/Brestovik (Pejë/Peć); Istog/Istok and Osojane/Osojan (Istog/Istok); Klinë/Klina; Deçan/Deçane; Prizren, Planjane/Pllanjan and Reçane/Recan (Prizren); Mamuša/Mamushë/Mamuša; Dragash/Dragaš, Mlike/Mlikë, Globočica/Glloboçicë, Ljubovište/Lubovishtë, Brod and Kruševo/Krushevë (Dragash/Dragaš); Rahovec/Orahovac and Velika Hoča/Hoçë e Madhe (Rahovec/Orahovac).