

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe The Secretariat SEC.GAL/147/00 17 November 2000

**ENGLISH** only

## PREPARATORY SEMINAR FOR THE NINTH MEETING OF THE ECONOMIC FORUM

## "TRANSPARENCY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE IN ECONOMIC MATTERS"

Almaty, Kazakhstan, 2 and 3 November 2000

**SUMMARY** 

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	]	<u>Page</u>
OF THE ECONOM	OR THE PREPARATORY SEMINAR FOR THE NINTH MEETING HIC FORUM ON "TRANSPARENCY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE ATTERS"	
	SUMMARY OF THE OSCE SEMINAR ON TRANSPARENCY ERNANCE IN ECONOMIC MATTERS	5
REPORTS OF THE	E WORKING GROUP RAPPORTEURS	
Working Group I:	Global Instruments for Promoting Transparency and Good Governance	8
Working Group II:	Regional and National Instruments for Promoting Transparency and Good Governance	11
Working Group III:	Role of Civil Society and Public Education in Promoting Transparency and Good Governance	14
Annex: List of part	icipants	

#### **PROGRAMME**

#### PREPARATORY SEMINAR FOR THE NINTH MEETING OF THE ECONOMIC FORUM

#### "TRANSPARENCY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE IN ECONOMIC MATTERS"

Almaty, Kazakhstan, 2 and 3 November 2000

The first preparatory seminar for the Ninth Meeting of the Economic Forum is designed to help participating States prepare for the Forum, to be held in Prague from 15 to 18 May 2001. The topic of the seminar, Transparency and Good Governance in Economic Matters, includes a variety of themes. Deliberations and discussions at this seminar will cover issues such as the role of international organizations and foreign investors in promoting good governance; initiatives aimed at sustainable economic growth and fighting poverty; the establishment of regional and national instruments for promoting good and transparent governance; the role of mass media and domestic investors; and how to develop co-ordination and co-operation between governments, parliaments and civil society.

The Office of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities (OCEEA) is preparing the seminar in close consultation with the incoming Romanian Chair and with the OSCE offices in Central Asia. The field offices have been asked to propose suitable candidates to act as keynote and lead speakers, as well as moderators, in order to enhance the contribution of representatives of the Central Asian countries. These speakers include representatives of governments, the business community and non-governmental organizations (NGOs).

As during previous seminars, the field offices will invite government officials and other relevant actors, such as NGOs, journalists and academics. This approach has proved successful in identifying suitable participants for preparatory seminars and is consistent with the mandate of the Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities to develop stronger co-operation with OSCE field operations and to support the growth of civil society in the OSCE area.

Delegations to this seminar, which may come from any participating State in the OSCE, including our partner States in Asia and the Mediterranean, could include not only representatives of various ministries (such as Foreign Affairs, Foreign Economic Relations, Justice, Environment, Information, and Education) but also parliamentarians (especially those active in the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly), business people, NGOs, representatives of the academic community, journalists and educators. We would hope to attract a large and diverse participation from countries in the region and an equally large and diverse representation from other OSCE States.

Information on organizational modalities and the registration form have already been circulated to the delegations (SEC.GAL/117/00). These documents can also be found on the OCEEA website, www.osce.org/eea.

#### Thursday, 2 November 2000

10 a.m. Welcoming statement by H.E. Mr. Erlan Idrisov, Minister for Foreign Affairs, Kazakhstan

Welcoming statement by Mr. Gabriel Leonte, representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office for the Year 2001

Welcoming statement by Mr. Thomas L. Price, Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities

Keynote address by H.E. Mr. Igor Rogov, Minister of Justice, Kazakhstan

Keynote address by Mr. Paul Ross, International Monetary Fund (IMF) Resident Representative in Kazakhstan

Keynote address by Ms. Larisa Inayetova, Director of Businesswomen Association of Novyy Oblast, Uzbekistan

#### 11.15 a.m. Plenary discussion of keynote addresses

## 12 p.m. Working Groups Commence

Working Group 1: Global Instruments for Promoting Transparency and Good Governance

Moderator: Ms. Rachel Ehrenfeld, Director, Center for the Study of Corruption, New

York

Rapporteur: Ms. Shannon Berlin, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural

Organization (UNESCO), Almaty

Lead Speakers: H.E. Mr. Zhaksybek Kulekeyev, Minister of Economy, Kazakhstan

Mr. Robert Nowak, United Nations Economic Commission for Europe

(UN/ECE)

Mr. Michael Davey, European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

(EBRD) Director for Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan

Mr. Gary Linden, United States Agency for International Development

(USAID), Almaty

Mr. Kyriakos Revelas, Principal Administrator, OSCE Unit, European

Commission

Mr. Riccardo Lepri, Economic and Environmental Officer, OSCE Centre

in Ashgabad

This Working Group will address, *inter alia*, issues of relevance to international organizations and donor countries, such as:

- The role of international organizations and foreign investors in promoting good governance;
- Implementation of international laws and treaties;
- Initiatives aimed at sustainable economic growth and fighting poverty;
- How donors and lenders can reinforce attempts by governments to institutionalize broader policy dialogue; and
- How legal steps toward the protection of intellectual property rights can enhance economic development by attracting foreign direct investment.

Participants in this group include representatives of international institutions and donor countries, such as: European Commission, USAID, Swiss/Turkish/Norwegian assistance agencies, Council of Europe (CoE), European Investment Bank (EIB), EBRD, World Bank, IMF, UN/ECE, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Soros Foundation, Shore Bank, etc.

Working Group 2: Regional and National Instruments for Promoting Transparency and Good Governance

Moderator: Mr. David Pearce, Chief, Resident Mission of the World Bank,

Uzbekistan

Rapporteur: Ms. Janice Helwig, Advisor, US Delegation to the OSCE

Lead Speakers: Mr. Sergei Zlotnikov, Executive Director of Public Fund "Transparency,

Kazakhstan"

Mr. Mukhmedjon Umaraliev, Chairman, Parliamentary Committee on

Economic Reforms, Uzbekistan

Ms. Muatar Khaidarova, Chairperson, NGO "Society and Law", Tajikistan

Ms. Argul Kosherbayeva, Department of International Economic

Relations, Kazakh State National University

Ms. Londa Esadze, Chairperson, Independent Board of Advisors of the

Parliament of Georgia

Mr. Arman Temirzakov, President, International Business Center,

Western Kazakhstan Region, Kazakhstan

This Working Group will address issues of immediate relevance to States in the region such as:

- Regional and national instruments for promoting good and transparent governance;
- Efforts aimed at establishing the rule of law;

- Role of the court system, proper implementation of legislation, and reform of the legal system;
- How the consolidation of the rule of law can lead to increased foreign direct investment and thereby contribute to the prosperity of the region;
- How principles of good governance and transparency in decision-making and the establishment of the rule of law can contribute to enhancing regional security; and
- National programmes and regional co-operation for fighting poverty.

Participants in this group include representatives of the business community and of Ministries of the Interior, Justice, and Trade, presidential advisors, parliamentarians, police, judicial systems, and legal specialists from the following States: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, etc., and regional fora, such as the Interstate Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic, the Republic of Tajikistan and the Republic of Uzbekistan (ICKKTU), United Nations Special Programme for the Economic Development of Central Asia (SPECA), etc.

Working Group 3: Role of Civil Society and Public Education in Promoting Transparency and Good Governance

Moderator: Ambassador Herbert Salber, Head of the OSCE Centre in Almaty Rapporteur: Mr. Traian Hristea, Permanent Mission of Romania to the OSCE

Lead Speakers: Mr. Josef Aregger, Permanent Mission of Switzerland to the OSCE

Mr. Evgeniy Zhovtis, Director, Kazakhstani International Bureau for

Human Rights and Rule of Law

Mr. Curtis B. Masters, Partner, Baker and McKenzie, Kazakhstan Mr. Claude Potelle, Corporate Resources International Inc., Vienna

Mr. Boris Divjak, Consultant, Bosnia and Herzegovina

Ms. Gulnar Kurbanbayev, Executive Director, Business Association of

Karaganda Region, Kazakhstan

Ms. Valentina Sivryukova, Parliamentarian, President of Confederation of

NGOs of Kazakhstan

Ms. Matluba Uldjabaeva, Association of Small and Medium Businesses,

Tajikistan

This Working Group will address issues such as:

- The role of mass media and domestic investors;
- The role and development of a viable NGO community;
- Possibilities and ways for the NGO community to influence decision-making;

- Role of public information campaigns in promoting transparency;
- How business groups and associations can contribute to building institutions which facilitate a wider policy dialogue on economic questions;
- Building linkages and enhancing co-operation between global NGOs (such as Transparency International) and local/regional NGOs; and
- How to develop co-ordination and co-operation between governments, parliaments, and civil society.

Participants in this group include representatives of the following groups: NGOs, journalists, academics, businesspersons, representatives of business associations, bankers, parliamentarians, etc.

1.30 p.m. Lunch break

3 p.m. Working Groups resume for 90 minutes

4.30 p.m. Coffee break

5 p.m. Working Groups resume for 90 minutes

6.30 p.m. Reception given by the host government

#### Friday, 3 November 2000

Working Groups resume for 90 minutes 9.30 a.m.

11 a.m. Coffee break

11.30 a.m. Working Groups resume for 90 minutes to conclude previous discussions

1 p.m. Lunch

3.30 p.m. Closing Plenary Session to discuss and synthesize the separate sessions held

previously and to present the Rapporteurs' Reports

5 p.m. Formal Closing of Seminar

> CHAIRPERSON'S SUMMARY OF THE OSCE SEMINAR ON TRANSPARENCY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE IN ECONOMIC MATTERS

#### Almaty, Kazakhstan, 2 and 3 November 2000

- 1. The OSCE, in co-operation with the Government of Kazakhstan, held a seminar on Transparency and Good Governance in Economic Matters, in Almaty, Kazakhstan, 2 and 3 November 2000. This was the first in a series of preparatory seminars for the Ninth Meeting of the Economic Forum in Prague in May 2001. The seminar was attended by more than 180 participants representing the governments of Kazakhstan and the four other participating States in Central Asia, as well as by representatives of numerous international organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), other OSCE participating States, the OSCE Chairmanship, the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly and the OSCE Secretariat.
- 2. H.E. Mr. Erlan Idrisov, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Kazakhstan, welcomed the participants and underlined the universal relevance of the topic of transparency and good governance in economic matters, particularly in a time of globalization. He reported on the efforts of his government to foster transparency and good governance in economic matters, including a national dialogue between the government, the business community and civil society. The Minister welcomed the OSCE seminar as an opportunity to conceptualize transparency and good governance, and to discuss practical steps for their further improvement and co-operation in this area. Finally, Minister Idrisov suggested transborder water resource management as a concrete field for continued OSCE activities aimed at promoting transparency and good governance.
- 3. The representative of the incoming Romanian Chairmanship for the year 2001 reminded the seminar of the need for comprehensively addressing the manifold challenges to security, including measures in the human, economic and environmental, and the political/military dimensions. He stressed that Romania as the incoming Chairman-in-Office stood ready to further strengthen the economic and environmental dimension of the OSCE and to fully explore the input from the Central Asian region in the process of preparing for the next Economic Forum in Prague. The Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities stressed the interrelationship between transparency, good governance and economic prosperity and development. He outlined four key elements of good governance, based partially on the Aarhus Convention, namely transparency; public participation in decision making; accountability and the opportunity for the public to seek legal redress; and, finally, predictable legal regulations for investment and economic activity.
- 4. Keynote speakers and participants agreed on the close interrelationship between transparency, good governance and economic performance. The Minister of Justice of Kazakhstan reported on legal reform initiatives and other activities to further strengthen transparency and good governance in Kazakhstan, in particular recent legislative efforts to ensure independence of the judiciary and the protection of foreign direct investment in the country. The representative of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) in Kazakhstan reported on the IMF's approach towards good governance and transparency and various related activities of this institution, including policy advice, technical assistance in institution building, programmes to promote public information, and data dissemination. A representative of the Uzbek NGO community described the activities of NGOs and other public associations in the field of good

governance, in particular with a view to a stronger involvement of women in the economy. A representative of the European Commission underlined the need for simple, enforceable and effective rules as a further element of good governance. It was also stressed that corruption had an impact beyond the economic sector since it threatened public confidence in government institutions and the rule of law. The OSCE, therefore, had a special responsibility to address the issue.

- 5. The three Working Groups dealt with national, regional and global instruments for promoting transparency and good governance as well as with the role of civil society and public education in this endeavour. Participants underlined the need for strong political will to foster good governance and transparency at the highest political level, as well as within societies. There was general agreement that public participation and input from NGOs and the business community in the legislative process was crucial to ensure transparent, applicable and understandable legal frameworks. Participants acknowledged the need for an independent judiciary and supported the creation of public control mechanisms for the budgetary process and expenditure reporting, including stronger parliamentary oversight, and advocated the creation of an effective Ombudsman office, to address corruption. Existing international conventions and legal instruments were regarded as useful tools but the need for implementation and enforcement of those instruments was especially emphasized. Further international assistance in this process, including regional and local public information campaigns on existing legislation, was regarded as an important contribution by the international community.
- 6. It was recommended that international financial institutions strengthen the conditionality of their lending criteria and other assistance projects relating to concrete measurable progress in achieving good governance and transparency. Several specific recommendations on the role of the OSCE were made. For instance, it was suggested that the OSCE should implement programmes aimed at raising awareness, educating the public and training civil administrators. The OSCE was also encouraged to act as a facilitating forum for national and regional dialogue on good governance, transparency and corruption, and to assist in the channelling of international assistance and resources in this context. Participants also saw a strong role for the Organization in developing a civil society and in encouraging the local and international NGO community to address the issue of good governance and transparency. In this context, participants stressed the importance of a free media and the training of journalists. The OSCE could also assist in the adaptation of national legislation, in the development of effective mechanisms for the implementation of existing laws and regulations, and in the creation of independent public monitoring and control institutions in the field of good governance and transparency.

#### WORKING GROUP I

## Report of the Working Group Rapporteur: Global Instruments for Promoting Transparency and Good Governance

#### Good governance

Participants acknowledged that in order to achieve a system of governance, mechanisms to ensure public participation, accountability and transparency must be developed and implemented. The importance of good governance as an essential requirement for economic stability and development was stressed. The necessity of a strong political will to effect change and foster an environment conducive to encouraging economic growth, requiring the development of a transparent legal system, was recognized.

Globally a number of conventions had been signed, but laws and conventions had not been successfully implemented.

#### Recommendation

Improved implementation mechanisms need to be developed and adopted. International agencies should be involved in the development of mechanisms and in assisting and encouraging their successful adoption. However, assistance in this form should only be provided if national governments were willing to ask for assistance and undertook to adopt the recommendations of international organizations.

Legislation should be simple, clear and easy to understand. Participants stressed that international organizations should improve their co-ordination in order to help governments better to understand different national legislations, including their working mechanisms and underlying rationale.

Assistance should be given in designing and implementing laws regarding NGOs and private investment, in order to strengthen these sectors.

Participants suggested that a series of workshops, or roundtable discussions, be organized in rural areas throughout the region. The purpose of the workshops would be to inform and educate community members of the legal rights of individuals, NGOs, and entrepreneurs, and to increase access to and understanding of this information.

#### **Transparency**

When considering economic transparency the group supported the concept that without the development of a strong civil society, the economy of a nation would not improve. Although advances in civil society in Kazakhstan had occurred, an understanding of recent legal reforms was low. This was compounded by a lack of confidence in the effectiveness of the reforms.

In order for good governance to exist, a stable system had to be in place. Such a system must either be free of rules or the rules must be very well defined and understood by private investors and civil society.

#### Recommendation

Emphasis should be placed on raising awareness of changes. For example, in respect of the creation of an Ombudsman, there was a strong feeling at present that the level of understanding among the population of the actual function and responsibility of this position was low. Public awareness of the role and procedures needed to be raised. The media and civil society organizations could be effective tools for disseminating information to the public. However, for the media to be effective, freedom of the press needed to be assured.

#### Corruption

Corruption is a global problem, being fought everywhere, everyday. However, solutions have to be based on national characteristics. Corruption leads to instability and economic slow-down. At present there is a high level of corruption at both micro and macro levels.

Participants agreed that corruption was a basic obstacle to good governance and that only through the establishment of a solid legal system that fostered transparency could the problem of corruption begin to be solved.

Good governance is required for economic improvement, but corruption exists as a result of inadequate wages, etc. In order to eliminate corruption, this must become a government priority.

#### Recommendation

The suggestion that international organizations should begin to focus more on working with governments on the issue of why eliminating corruption was beneficial to the economy and society overall instead of concentrating on just how to combat corruption, could increase the effectiveness of their work. Strong political and social pressure would need to develop in order to combat corruption.

With increased political control came increased corruption and absolute power resulted in absolute corruption.

#### Lending

Debt financing is becoming a problem for countries.

#### Recommendations

International lending agencies should create mechanisms for following up repayments.

Regular sharing of information offers the opportunity for countries in transition to assess successful and unsuccessful mechanisms for good governance in other nations and to adopt only those that have proved successful.

#### Civil society

It was generally agreed that in order to better effect change, the population must begin to trust the government.

The position of Ombudsman is being created, but needs to be better understood. The mass media should be used as a vehicle for the dissemination of information.

#### Co-ordination

The working group expressed the opinion that there was a lack of co-ordination on four levels, between government and the international organizations, between government and NGOs, between central and regional governmental bodies, and between various international organizations.

## Additional recommendations for OSCE and international organizations

The OSCE could be a forum for discussion and a body to co-ordinate international agencies and activities, but it should not take on the role of an implementing agency. This should be the role of governments themselves.

New laws are being passed, but not properly implemented at either national or regional level.

A request was made for assistance in the implementation of new laws, and in monitoring and assessing their effectiveness and impact on the local situation.

Participants asked the OSCE to give concrete examples of successful practices, particularly when referring to small and medium business enterprises (SMBE).

The establishment of common priorities at regional and national levels is one way to increase and improve upon co-operation and co-ordination.

#### WORKING GROUP II

# Regional and National Instruments for Promoting Transparency and Good Governance

#### National instruments

Participants in Working Group II focused on the need to develop legislative and judicial structures that will eliminate corruption, attract investment, and promote governmental transparency and public involvement in decision-making. Several participants said that first and foremost, there must be the political will at the highest level of the government to increase transparency and combat corruption; those in power sometimes use knowledge of corruption as a form of control. In addition, corruption can occur at lower levels because of inadequate salary scales. State policies to fight bribery and other forms of corruption affect not only a country's domestic investment climate, but can also impact on other countries through the actions of investors; these policies are therefore of international concern. In addition, there is a direct link between political stability, respect for human rights, and an attractive investment climate. Elected officials are accountable to voters. Several speakers stressed the inherent difficulties of transition from the Soviet system - such as a tradition of centrally-issued decrees - and the resulting need to ensure that reforms are carried out transparently and with public input.

Participants noted that many States lack transparency in legislative development, budgeting processes, and expenditure reporting; authorities should also be accountable for extrabudgetary expenditures. Many speakers noted the importance of an independent, impartial, and professional judiciary to combat corruption and foster investment confidence; this is hindered in several States by the dependence of the judiciary on the executive branch and a weak legislative framework. In all areas, international agreements and conventions can be a good basis for improvement if national legislation is brought into accordance with them and effectively implemented. Legislation concerning investment, taxation, and other financial issues can be complicated and frequently revised, often due to lack of public input during drafting. Existing legislation is often not implemented, sometimes due to lack of information on the part of judges and other officials. Several participants pointed to the lack of a strong, clear, publicly-available legislative framework as an impediment to monitoring or regulation.

## Regional instruments

Several speakers said that although regional mechanisms exist, they are generally ineffective. For example, although several bilateral trade co-operation agreements have been signed, they have not been ratified or implemented. Competition between States for regional leadership and access to the same markets impedes co-operation as well as the formation of a common market. In addition, the differing rates of reform and economic development make regional co-ordination difficult. Some participants believed that the development of national identities was impeding the formation of regional instruments. Some participants noted the negative effects of conflict on regional relationships: States involved in "frozen" conflict

situations cannot build co-operative relationships between themselves; States undergoing post-conflict rehabilitation often have trouble building investor confidence. Several speakers warned that regional water, energy, and transportation issues need to be resolved; otherwise they have the potential to lead to conflict. Environmental issues are often of a regional nature, and their resolution requires inter-State co-ordination and information-sharing.

#### Recommendations made by participants:

- Governments need to acknowledge a lack of transparency and the existence of corruption even at high levels in order to address it effectively. High-level officials should lead by example.
- States must implement political and democratic reforms to establish a climate for economic reform and investment. Voter awareness programmes could include anti-corruption issues.
- International financial institutions should more explicitly condition loans and other assistance on concrete progress on political, social, and economic reforms.
- Countries which have not signed and ratified the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Anti-Bribery Convention and others related to transparency should do so.
- National legislation should be brought into accordance with applicable international agreements and conventions.
- Legislation concerning investment, taxation, and other financial issues should be simple, understandable, and stable. Laws need to be enforced, not just created.
- The OSCE could play a role in awareness-raising concerning relevant legislation, including among non-governmental organizations (NGOs), judges, government officials, and the public at large.
- Judicial systems should be separated from executive branch control.
- States should increase transparency in the budgetary process through involvement of parliamentarians and NGOs, and make expenditure information publicly available.
- Government officials should receive adequate and appropriate salaries.
- NGOs and the business community should have input into relevant legislation; NGOs should be included on advisory investment and business commissions.
- The OSCE could act as a framework for national dialogue among government officials, parliamentarians, and NGOs.

- The OSCE could also act as a framework for dialogue among governments in the region.
- Taxation and customs duties should be simplified and regionally harmonized.
- In order to promote economic development, international organizations including the OSCE should pay attention to the creation of small businesses and entrepreneurial development. Micro-credit programmes are one means of combating poverty.

#### **WORKING GROUP III**

## Report of the Working Group Rapporteur: Role of Civil Society and Public Education in Promoting Transparency and Good Governance

The open atmosphere of the dialogue amongst the participants was stressed. Lively discussions and debates, as well as a strong interest in the topics, proved that this exercise was both useful and timely. During the discussions, new concepts such as "a democratic corridor" and "a market of intellectual products" emerged.

Several issues of great concern for the emerging civil society in the Central Asian countries were addressed both by the keynote speakers and by the participants, stressing the importance, among other things, of good governance, transparency, access to information, public participation in decision-making, and relations between citizens and governments.

Acknowledging that the interests of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and governments were not always contradictory, there was general agreement about the need to build, maintain and develop a dialogue among the social partners on:

- Countering the structural character of corruption; and
- Civil society's responsibility for reducing the risk of the development of a vicious circle that might endanger the stability of the very principles of a democratic State.

Transparency was most often mentioned as the instrument to be used by the emerging democratic societies to counter such a development. The challenges facing Kazakhstan and other Central Asian States underlined the value of transparency, since these challenges could not be adequately met without public participation.

In this context, the growing number of the NGOs was seen as a natural and democratic expression of the response of the civil society to such threats. At the same time, references to the need for more efficiency in the NGOs' activities were seen as signs of maturity. Factors impeding the development of civil society were also identified by the participants.

Better communication between NGOs and government, and the addressing of common concerns using a "common language" to define points of common interest would facilitate mutual understanding. In this context, the OSCE could offer a platform for different experts to express freely their views on topical issues of concern and interest.

Stressing the importance of the NGOs reaching self-sustainability, it was generally agreed that there was a need to continue the dialogue with the donor organizations. In this respect, it was the appropriate time for the partner institutions to assist NGOs in changing their focus from

the capitals to the regions and districts, in order to raise people's awareness of their political, civil, economic and social rights.

There was a general opinion that a more structured approach was required for the development of a civil society. NGOs with the same goals and methods should be encouraged to associate to strengthen their position *vis-à-vis* governments.

Participants stressed that the media are of paramount importance as part of the civil society in building bridges between NGOs and governments. The OSCE could assist in organizing training for journalists, particularly for younger ones. At the same time, the OSCE should focus on discussing with governments the follow-up to their commitments, as well as on the dialogue with the NGOs and their role in the democratization process.

A mechanism for the implementation of existing legislation and conventions to which the States were parties was desirable in order to reduce dependence on politicians' good will.

The participants showed an increase in interest in OSCE activities in this field, with suggestions and proposals for more focused activity. They expressed the view that the OSCE should play a larger role in channelling the resources made available by different international organizations for specific projects, in order to avoid overlapping.

#### Recommendations:

- Attempt to change mindsets by building a co-operative platform with State organizations, as well as by education and by upgrading the skills of the NGOs, the civil servants, and population, in order to counteract for the lack of information. This eventually should bring a change in the common attitude to acts of corruption;
- Spread information on the experience of foreign and western NGOs and channel it to local level;
- Improve dialogue with parliamentarians;
- Foster the freedom of the media and support their interests;
- Promote and use the instruments of monitoring and alternative reporting;
- Encourage participation of the free trade unions, where they exist, in fostering respect for legislation;
- Encourage governments in various international fora to take more into account the expertise provided by the NGOs.

#### LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### Germany

RICHTSTEIG, Dr. Michael

Counsellor, Permanent Mission of the Federal Republic of Germany to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 711 54 167

SHUNUSALIEVA, Ms. Galia

Representation of German Economy in Kazakhstan

## **United States of America**

BRETT, Ms. Diana

Executive Director, American Chamber of Commerce

CAMPONOVO, Mr. Chris

Legal Advisor, U.S. Department of State

phone: +1 202 647 4053

e-mail: camponoca@ms.state.gov

DE SOTO, Mr. Oscar

Deputy Political Counsellor, U.S. Delegation to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 31 339 74 3201 e-mail: desotoog2@state.gov

EHRENFELD, Ms. Rachel

Center for Study of Corruption, New York

phone: +1 212 399 4246

HELWIG, Ms. Janice

Advisor, Helsinki Commission, U.S. Delegation to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 31 339 74 3201 e-mail: helwigx@state.gov

LINDEN, Mr. Gary

Director, Office for Market Transition, USAID Mission for Central Asia

phone: +7 3272 50 76 35 e-mail: glinden@usaid.gov

- 2 - Annex

SCOTT, Mr. Robert

OSCE Desk Officer, U.S. Department of State

phone: +1 202 647 2128 e-mail: scottak@state.gov

SCHOFIELD, Mr. William

OSCE Co-ordinator, U.S. Department of State

phone: +1 202 736 7290

STERLING, Mr. Adam

U.S. Embassy to the Republic of Kazakhstan

## Austria/Chairperson-in-Office

ATZLER, Dr. Elke

Minister, Head of Unit, Permanent Mission of Austria to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 53 115 3453 e-mail: elke.atzler@bmaa.gv.at

#### Azerbaijan

ISAYEV, Mr. Aydin

Consultant, Division of Economic Legislation, Parliament of the Republic of Azerbaijan

KOCHARLI, Mr. Mais

Chief Consultant, Parliament of the Republic of Azerbaijan

MEHDIZADE, Mr. Shovgi

Head of Department, Ministry of Commerce, Republic of Azerbaijan

PASHAYEV, Mr. Fikret

Head of Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Azerbaijan

## France/European Union

SEARA, Colonel Jacques

Military Advisor, Permanent Representation of France to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 501 82 524

DE LA RONCIERE, Philippe

Delegation of the European Commission, Almaty, Kazakhstan

- 3 - Annex

DE TOLEDO, Ms. Blanca

Delegation of the European Commission, Almaty, Kazakhstan

GERLACH, Mr. Dirk

Delegation of the European Commission, Almaty, Kazakhstan

LEVCHENKO, Ms. Elena

Delegation of the European Commission, Almaty, Kazakhstan

REVELAS, Mr. Kyriakos

Principal Administrator, OSCE Unit, European Commission

phone: +322 299 3437

e-mail: kyriakos.revelas@cec.eu.int

## Georgia

ESADZE, Ms. Londa

Chairperson, Independent Board of Advisors of the Parliament of Georgia

phone: +995 32 23 28 95

e-mail: londaesadze@hotmail.com

#### **United Kingdom**

WALLER, Mr. Mark

Embassy of Great Britain to the Republic of Kazakhstan

phone: +7 3272 50 61 41/2

e-mail: mark.waller@almaty.mail.eco.gov.uk

#### Greece

HATAUPIS, Mr. Nicolas

Ambassador, Embassy of Greece to the Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty

MARINOS-AKTYPIS, Mr. Antonios

Attaché, Embassy of Greece to the Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty

SAMARAS, Mr. Antonis

Attaché, Embassy of Greece to the Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty

- 4 - Annex

#### Italy

PIAHHESI, Ambassador Fabrizio

Embassy of Italy to the Republic of Kazakhstan

phone: +7 3272 91 00 07 e-mail: ambalma@nursat.kz

#### Kazakhstan

IDRISOV, Mr. Erlan

Minister for Foreign Affairs, Republic of Kazakhstan

BAIMENOV, Mr. Mikhan

Minister of Labor and Social Protection, Republic of Kazakhstan

KULEKEYEV, Mr. Zhaxybek

Minister of the Economy, Republic of Kazakhstan

phone: +7 3172 117 511

e-mail: mineconom@nursat.kz

ROGOV, Mr. Igor

Minister of Justice, Republic of Kazakhstan

ABIKEEV, Mr. Aidarkhan

Chief Lawyer, The Chamber of Commerce and Industry

ABILOV, Mr. Bulat

Parliamentarian, Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan

ABISHEV, Mr. Eugene

Deputy Director, Association on "Business Incubators and Innovation Centers"

ABISHEVA, Ms. Togzhan

Graduate Student, Kazakh State National University

ABT, Mr. Nick

President, Closed Corporation "Orgcomitet MJK", Karaganda

ABULKHSTAEV, Mr. Marat

Counsellor, Ministry of Interior

AKHMETGALIEV, Mr. Bolat

Leader of Information Center, Integration Committee

- 5 - Annex

AKIMBEKOVA, Ms. Kamila

Graduate Student, Kazakh State National University

AKNAZAROV, Mr. Sestager

Director, NGO "Ecology of Biosphere"

ALIGUZJINOV, Mr. Serik

The Chief of the Main Department, Integration Committee

ALIMZHANOV, Mr. Issakhan

Parliamentarian, Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan

ALIYEVA, Ms. Saltanat

Graduate Student, Kazakh State National University

ALMASOV, Mr. Akylzhan

Head of the Department of International Cooperation, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan

ARGYNOV, Mr. Arman

Director, Information and Research Center for Civic Education

ASANOV, Mr. Zhakip

Head of the Department on the Rule of Law and on the Socio-economic Issues, General Office of the Public Prosecutor of the Republic of Kazakhstan

ASTANINA, Ms. Lidia

Environmental News Agency "Greenwomen"

AUYEZOV, Mr. Olzhas

Journalist "Delovaya Nedelya", Kazakhstan

BAIBOLOVA, Ms. Sholpan

Director, Tax Standards Formation Fund

phone: +8 3272 633551

e-mail: taxfund@taxfund.samal.kz

BAIDYBEKOVA, Ms. Dana

Assistant Press Attaché, Head Department of the Tax Police Committee of Almaty

BAKHTOV, Mr. Isa

Graduate Student, Kazakh State Academy of Management

BONDARTSOVA, Ms. Ludmila

Journalist, "Legal Newspaper"

- 6 - Annex

DAURANOV, Mr. Ildar

Director of Business Center, Institute of Economic Research, Kazakhstan

DOSMUKHAMBETOVA, Ms. Madina

Leading Specialist, Department of International Relations, Kazakh State Academy of Management

DUGALOVA, Ms. Gulnar

Vice-rector, Department of International Relations, Kazakh State Academy of Management

DUKENBAYEV, Mr. Eric

President, Association on "Business Incubators and Innovation Centers"

HOODASHTIAN, Mr. Ata

Director, KIMEP Public Research Centre

ILDENIZ, Mr. Ilhan

President, Kazakhstan Turkish Businessmen Association

ISINGARIN, Mr. Nigmatzhan

Chairman, Integration Committee

JANTSEN, Ms. Natalyi

Lawyer, Tax Standards Formation Fund

JARASOV, Ms. Surikjan

Tax Police Officer, Deputy Chief of the Department of Struggle Against Economic Crimes, Head Department of the Tax Police Committee of Almaty

KAKIMZHANOVA, Ms. Zharkin

Deputy Representative to the Kazakhstan Coordinator, German Agency for Technical Cooperation

KAZBEKOV, Mr. Beket Kazbekov

Advisor, Integration Committee

KAZYKHANOV, Mr. Erzhan

Director, Department on Multilateral Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

KERIMKULOV, Mr. Kanat

Director, Almaty Business Incubator

KHUSAINOV, Mr. Bulat

Institute of Economy, Kazakhstan

- 7 - Annex

#### KILUBAYEV, Mr. Dauletkhan

Deputy-Chief of Legal and Insurance Department, Almaty Power Consolidated Co.

#### KILUBAYEV, Mr. Dauletkhan

Graduate Student, Kazakh State National University

#### KOPBAYEV, Mr. Aset

Research Assistant, KIMEP Public Research Centre

#### KOSENKO, Mr. Evgeny

Journalist, "Time"

#### KOSHERBAYEVA, Ms. Aigul

Associate Professor, International Economic Relations Chief, Kazakh State National University

#### KOSHERBAYEVA, Ms. Higul

Associate Professor, Institute of Economics and Law, Kazakhstan

#### KOTOV, Mr. Anatoliy

Member of Constitutional Council

#### KOZYKEYEV, Mr. Assan

President, "The League of Entrepreneurs of Kazakhstan"

#### KULBAEV, Mr. Aidos

Public Prosecutor Assistant, Office of Public Prosecutor

#### KUNAYEV, Mr. Eldar

Chief of International Department, Administration of Almaty Region

#### KURBANBAYEVA, Ms. Gulnar

Association of Businessman in Karaganda Region

#### LATYPAEV, Mr. Shukhrat

Leading Specialist, Department on Information Maintenance and Computers, Institute on Strategic Studies under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan

#### LUKINA, Ms. Evgenya

Graduate Student, Kazakh State Academy of Management

#### MAKALKIN, Mr. Valentin

Parliamentarian, Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan

- 8 - Annex

MASHAN, Mr. Meirzhan

Institute of Development of Kazakhstan

MOROZOV, Mr. Sergey

General Director, Kazakhstani Association of Food Enterprises

MOROZYUK, Mr. Vladimir

Director, Center for Entrepreneurship Support

MOSTAFA, Mr. Golam

Dean of Graduate Studies and Research, Kazakhstan Institute of Management

phone: +7 3272 64 08 57 e-mail: glms@kimep.kz

MUKHAMEDGALIEVA, Ms. Asya

Accountant, Tax Standards Formation Fund

NADYROV, Mr. Sharipzhan

Head of Laboratory on Economic, Social and Political Geography, Institute of Geography

NIGMATGAZH, Mr. Isingaren

Chairman of the Integration Committee

OKAYEY, Mr. Yermek

Chairman of the Board, Kazakhstan

OMARKHANOV, Mr. Kurmanbek

Member, Constitutional Council of the Republic of Kazakhstan

phone: +7 3172 15 27 95

OSPANOV, Mr. Serikzhan

Rector, University of Economy and Law

PARDO, Mr. Philip

Professor, KIMEP

PIMENOVA, Ms. Irina

Kazakh State National University, Master's Course Student

POLIAKOV, Mr. Alexander

Public foundation "21 Century"

SABIEVA, Ms. Aigul

Head of Department of Policy and Common Programs, Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of Population

- 9 - Annex

SARSEMBAEVA, Ms. Raushan

President, Association of Businesswomen in Kazakhstan

SARYBAYEV, Mr. Kaisar

Graduate Student, Kazakh State Academy of Management

SCHMIDA, Mr. Stephen

Regional Director, Eurasia Foundation

SEMBAEV, Mr. Daulet

Chairman of the Council, Financiers Association of Kazakhstan

SHAIKH, Ms. Ajar

Graduate Student, Kazakh State Architectural Academy

SHAIKH, Mr. Kazybek

President, Business Center of Youth Programme "SHAIKH"

phone: +7 3272 917795

SHAMSUTDINOVA, Ms. Svetlana

President, Association of the Faultless Business Enterprises

SHAZIPOVA, Ms. Julia

Student, Kazakh State University

SIVRYUKOVA, Ms. Valentina

President, Confederation of NGOs of Kazakhstan, Astana

phone: +7 3272 32 21 49 e-mail: v\_sivryukova@mail.ru

SOLOMIN, Mr. Leonid

President, Confederation of Free Trade Union of Kazakhstan

SPANOV, Mr. Magbat

Institute of Development of Kazakhstan

SULTAN, Ms. Aliza

Manager, "SHAIKH", Graduate Student, Kazakh State National University

phone: +7 3272 817 795

SVITELMAN, Mr. Semyon

Project Director, NGO "Green Salvation"

- 10 - Annex

TEMIRZAKHOV, Mr. Arman

Director, International Business Centre, Uralsk

TOGUSBAYEV, Mr. Olzhas

Second Secretary, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan

TOIBAYEVA, Ms. Assel

Student, Kazakh State University

TOKSEITOR, Mr. Rakimbergen

Deputy Minister

UTEGULOV, Mr. Maulen

Deputy Director of Department, Ministry of Finance

YANOVSKAYA, Ms. Elena

Graduate Student, Kazakh State Academy of Management

YELEMESSOV, Mr. Raushan

Director of the International Economics Department, Kazakh State National University

ZHOVTIS, Mr. Yevgeniy

Director, Kazakhstani International Bureau for Human Rights and the Rule of Law

## **Kyrgyzstan**

BAKETAEV, Mr. Bakit

Head of the Department on International Affairs and Interparliamentary Relations, Legislative Assembly, Yogorku Kenesh, Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic

DAIRBEKOVA, Ms. Azalia

Project Officer, NGO "National Council on Development"

ESYENALIEV, Mr. Saginbek

Director of the Kyrgyz Branch of the Moscow University of Business and Information Technologies

JUSUEVA, Ms. Elmira

Head Finance and Administration, Economist, Kyrgyz Republic Centre InterBilim, NGO Support Organization

KUBENOV, Mr. Nurlan

Second Department of CIS, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan

- 11 - Annex

#### MATISAKOV, Mr. Anazbek

Head of the Center for Parliamentarism and Legislative Drafting, Legislative Assembly, Yogorku Kenesh, Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic

## RYSPEKOV, Mr. Sergey

Deputy Chairman, NGO "National Council on Development"

### RYZHIKH, Ms. Irina

Executive Director, Tax Consultants Chamber,

#### SHAIMKULOV, Mr. Muratbek

Advisor of the Meeting of the National Representatives of Zhogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic

#### SYRDYBAYEV, Mr. Daniar

First Secretary of the Department on Strategic Problems and Information, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Kyrgyzstan

#### Lithuania

#### GINTAUTAS, Mr. Shulis

First Secretary, Embassy of Lithuania in Kazakhstan

#### <u>Uzbekistan</u>

#### BOUTAYAROV, Ambassador Tourdigul

Ambassador, Embassy of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan

#### HIDOYATOV, Mr. Maksut

NGO Centre for Economic and Social Innovation

#### ISAKOV, Mr. Rustam

Director of the Company "Rusman"

#### ISAKOVA, Ms. Muhtaram

Entrepreneur

#### KUMAEV, Mr. Hudaibergen

University of Diplomacy

- 12 - Annex

MAHMUDOV, Mr. Murat

Entrepreneur

MURTAZAEV, Mr. Enver

Entrepreneur

NIAZOV, Mr. Rustam

TAIROV, Mr. Satavayady

Counsellor, Embassy of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan

UMARALIEV, Mr. Mukhmedjon

Chairman, Parliamentary Committee on Economic Reforms, Uzbekistan

URIPOVA, Ms. Larisa

Association of Business Women

## **Netherlands**

SLAGTER, Mr. Wicher

Counsellor, Embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands to the Republic of Kazakhstan

#### Poland

NOWICKI, Mr. Jan

Senior Counsellor to the Minister for Foreign Affairs

phone: +48 22 523 9324

e-mail: jan.nowicki@ms2.gov.pl

#### Portugal

CALDEIRINHA, Mr. Manuel

Deputy Head of Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

phone: +351 21 3946 271 e-mail: g@sg.mne.gov.pt

#### Romania

STANESCU, Mr. Marin

Ambassador of Romania in Kazakhstan

- 13 - Annex

HRISTEA, Mr. Traian

Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of Romania to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 504 9847

e-mail: tlhristea@netscape.net

LEONTE, Mr. Gabriel

Attaché, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

phone: +401 230 7579

e-mail: dorce@mae.kappa.ro; gleonte@yahoo.com

## **Russian Federation**

CHEKMAZO, Mr. Vadim

First Secretary, Embassy of Russian Federation to Kazakhstan

DOBUDKO, Mr. Sergei

Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Department of Economic Co-operation

phone: +95 203 22 11

#### Switzerland

AREGGER, Mr. Josef

Minister, Swiss Delegation to the OSCE

phone: +43 1 505 89 25 17

e-mail: josef.aregger@vie.rep.admin.ch

## **Tajikistan**

ALIZADE GAFAROVICH, Mr. Bahrom

Ministry of Economy, Office of Economic Reforms

phone: +992 372 21 64 09

KHAIDAROVA, Ms. Muatar

Lawyer

phone: 992 372 216 514 e-mail: khaider@ac.tajik.net

MUKHTAR, Mr. Ibrahimov

Expert, Trade-Industrial Chamber

phone: +992 372 274 757

- 14 - Annex

#### RAHMATOV MIRZOYEVICH, Mr. Rustam

Vice-Chief of the Financial Department of the Presidential Office

phone: +992 372 21 34 07

#### ROSTANOVA, Ms. Nuriniso

Director, Association of Business Women

phone: +992 372 21 8514

e-mail: nurinisso@microcredit.tajnet.com

#### SABZOV RAHMONOVICH, Mr. Usmon

Parliamentarian, Committee on Economics, Finance, Budget and Tax

phone: +992 372 21 1454

#### SADYKOV, Mr. Dowletgeloy

Head of Department, State Tax Service of Turkmenistan

#### ULDJABAEVA, Ms. Matluba

President of the National Association of Small Businesses

phone: +992 372 210 682 matluba@unaps.tajnet.com

#### **Turkmenistan**

#### GATNAZAROW, Mr. Basim

Director of Special School on Economics and Language Studies of the Ministry of Education

## HATANOWA, Ms. Oguljamal

Member of NGO, "SAHY"

#### PALATOW, Mr. Batyr

Head of Evaluation Department on Investment Projects, State Agency on Foreign Investments under the President of Turkmenistan

#### SADYKOW, Mr. Dövletgeldy

Head of Department of State Tax Service of Turkmenistan

#### **Turkey**

## ALDEMIR, Ambassador Cinar

Ambassador of the Republic of Turkey in Kazakhstan

#### DENIZ, Mr. Ruhi

Embassy of the Republic of Turkey in Kazakhstan

- 15 - Annex

GÖRÜR, Mr. Cemal

Expert, Ministry of Finance, Financial Crimes Investigation Board

phone: +90 312 4281 537

ILDENIZ, Mr. Ilhan

President, Kazakhstan-Turkish Businessmen Association

SUNAR, Mr. Mert

Director, Undersecretariat of Treasury

phone: +90 312 212 97 99

e-mail: sunar@pm.treasury.gov.tr

TUNCDEMIR, Mr. Erkan

Assistant Expert, Ministry of Finance, Financial Crimes Investigation Board

phone: +90 312 4281 537

#### Ukraine

KARTASHOV, Mr. Eugeniy

Ambassador of Ukraine in Kazakhstan

EDAMENKO, Mr. Anatoli

Advisor, Embassy of Ukraine in Kazakhstan

## Mediterranean Partners for Co-operation

## **Egypt**

SAAD, Mr. Mahmoud

Counsellor, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Arab Republic of Egypt

#### **OSCE** Secretariat

PRICE, Mr. Thomas L.

Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and Environmental Activities

phone: +43 1 514 36 151 e-mail: tprice@osce.org

BALTES, Mr. Marc

Senior Economic Advisor phone: +43 1 514 36 742 e-mail: mbaltes@osce.org

HEISKANEN, Mr. Janne Environmental Advisor phone: +43 1 514 36 519 e-mail: jheiskanen@osce.org

KIRSTE, Dr. Knut

Chief, Meetings Assistance Unit

phone: +43 1 531 37 352 e-mail: kkirste@osce.org

THURMAN, Ms. Aleksandra

Secretary

phone: +43 1 514 36 575 e-mail: athurman@osce.org

#### **OSCE Parliamentary Assembly**

BAIGELDI, Mr. Omirbek Deputy Chair of Senate of Kazakhstan

#### **OSCE Field Missions**

## **OSCE Centre in Almaty**

SALBER, Ambassador Herbert Head of Centre phone: +7 3272 62 17 62

ACIKEL, Mr. Asim Economic and Environmental Officer phone: +7 3272 62 17 62

IBRASHEVA, Ms. Madina Expert on Economic and Ecological Affairs

SEITMURATOVA, Ms. Natalya Legal/Project Expert

## OSCE Centre in Ashgabad

LEPRI, Mr. Riccardo Economic and Environmental Officer

phone: +99312 35 30 92 e-mail: oscetu@cat.glasnet.ru

## OSCE Centre in Bishkek

VISAPÄÄ, Mr. Markku Economic and Environmental Officer

phone: +996 312 66 41 80 e-mail: mv@osce.it.kg

## OSCE Liaison Office in Central Asia (CALO)

GANTCHEV, Ambassador Gantcho Head of CALO

phone: +998 71 132 01 52

## OSCE Mission to Tajikistan

FROTSCHER, Ms. Ann Economic and Environmental Officer

phone: +992 372 214 063 e-mail: ann@osce.tajik.net

#### OSCE Office in Yerevan

EVERS, Mr. Frank Economic and Environmental Advisor

phone: +374 1 541063

e-mail: osceam@arminco.com

- 18 - Annex

## **International Organizations**

## <u>United Nations Economic Commission for Europe</u>

NOWAK, Mr. Robert Economic Affairs Officer phone: +41 22 917 1267

e-mail: robert.nowak@unece.org

## United Nations Development Programme

ELEUSIZOV, Mr. Akylbai Programme Assistant, Kazakhstan

## United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

BERLIN, Ms. Shannon IEC Specialist, Kazakhstan

## **International Monetary Fund**

PAUL, Mr. Ross IMF Resident Representative, Kazakhstan

## European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

MICHAEL, Mr. Davey EBRD Director for Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan

#### World Bank

PEARCE, Mr. David Chief, Resident Mission of the World Bank, Uzbekistan - 19 - Annex

## The Secretariat of the Economic Co-operation Organization

KILEI, Mr. Metin

Director

phone: +9821 229 1305

e-mail: registry@ecosecretariat.org

## Non-Governmental Organizations

## Counterpart Consortium

COOPER, Mr. Jay Regional Director

## International Arbitration Court of the Juridical Center "IUS"

GRESHNIKOV, Mr. Igor Executive Director, International Arbitration Court of the Juridical Center "IUS"

## <u>Institute for Development Cooperation</u>

FRANTS, Ms. Inessa Director

## Central Asian Regional Environmental Center (REC)

YESEKIN, Mr. Bulat Executive Director, REC, Almaty phone: +7 3272 980 538

## Businesswomen Association of Novyy Oblast

INAYETOVA, Ms. Larisa Director

- 20 - Annex

## Transparency Kazakhstan

VORONOV, Mr. Vitaliy Chairman

ZLOTNIKOV, Mr. Sergei Executive Director

## Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation

GELY, Mr. Johan Swiss Coordination Office in Bishkek

WEYERMANN, Mr. Reto Swiss Coordination Office in Bishkek

phone: +996 312 66 64 80 e-mail: reto@swisscoop.kg

## **Business Community**

## Corporate Resources International, Inc.

POTELLE, Mr. Claude

Chairman

phone: +43 1 512 05 90 e-mail: eastwester@aol.com

#### Michael Wilson and Partners, Ltd.

EARL, Mr. Michael Managing Director, European Business Association

## Baker and McKenzie, Kazakhstan

MASTERS, Mr. Curtis B.

Partner

- 21 - Annex

## AMRO Bank Kazakhstan

KIRILLOVSKAYA, Ms. Elena Head of Legal Department, Almaty

VAN DEN BOSCH, Mr. Jan Willem General Manager, Kazakhstan

## **Prosperitet-International Consulting Partners**

DIVJAK, Mr. Boris Managing Director

phone: +387 51 306 456

e-mail: bdivijak@prosperitet.com