

COMMUNITIES ACCESS TO PRE-UNIVERSITY EDUCATION IN KOSOVO

December 2018



TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	. 3
1. INTRODUCTION	. 4
1.1 Background information	.4
1.2 Scope and purpose of the report	5
1.3 Methodology	6
2. LEGAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK	8
3. ACCESS TO EDUCATION FOR COMMUNITIES AND PRE-CONDITIONS FOR QUALITY EDUCATION	0
3.1 Education in the Albanian language1	0
Albanian-language education in municipalities with the Kosovo Albanian community	
in a numerical minority1	11
3.2 Education in community languages1	2
Romani language extracurricular programme1	5
Additional community-specific subjects enabling communities to preserve their identity 1	6
3.3 Learning of official languages1	17
3.4 Institutional support for equal access to education1	8
4. OVERVIEW OF EDUCATION IN THE SERBIAN LANGUAGE	20
5. CONCLUSIONS	25
6. RECOMMENDATIONS	27

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CCC	Consultative Council for Communities
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against
	Women
CoE	Council of Europe
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental
	Freedoms
FCNM	Framework Convention on National Minorities
HCNM	High Commissioner for National Minorities
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
KCF	Kosovo Curriculum Framework
KESP	Kosovo Education Strategy Plan
LEM	Law on Education in the Municipalities of Kosovo
LLSG	Law on Local Self-Government
LPPRC	Law on Protection and Promotion of Rights and Interests of Communities
	and Their Members
LPUE	Law on Pre-University Education
LUL	Law on the Use of Languages
MCR	Ministry of Communities and Returns
MED	Municipal Education Directorate
MEST	Ministry of Education, Science and Technology
MESTD	Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development
OKiM	Serbian Government Office for Kosovo and Metohija
OLC	Office of the Language Commissioner
ОРМ	Office of Prime Minister
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PRTAN	Prevention and Response Teams towards Abandonment and Non-
UDHR	Registration and Non-Enrolment in Compulsory Education
UNESCO	Universal Declaration of Human Rights

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The report assesses the provision of pre-university education in Kosovo for communities in a numerical minority at the municipal level between 2014 and 2017. The focus of the report is on communities' access to education in Albanian and Serbian as the two official languages, and in Bosnian, Romani and Turkish as community languages in terms of: availability of education in a chosen language including physical access and alternatives when such education is not provided, such as subsidized transport; availability of textbooks and sufficient and qualified teaching staff; availability of community-specific subjects; institutional support to communities through scholarships and transport arrangements as well as opportunities for interaction among students from different communities.

This report assesses the compliance of the Kosovo education system with the norms contained in the Kosovo institutions' legal framework, whereas the report provides only a factual overview of the Serbian curriculum system on the ground. With regard to the assessed framework, institutions generally provide communities with an adequate level of support in accessing education, such as transport, scholarships, as well as catch-up classes that are mainly provided in co-operation with civil society organizations. A sustainable solution for the provision of Serbian-language education within the Kosovo education system is yet to be found. Education in community languages is generally available but the provision of textbooks in the Bosnian and Turkish languages remains uneven. Lack of organized transport for students remains an issue in some municipalities, particularly in those where Kosovo Albanians are in a numerical minority. Kosovocurriculum schools teaching in the Bosnian and Turkish languages have Albanian as an official language subject; however relevant textbooks for non-mother tongue learners have not been developed. Apart from the Romani language subject with elements of history and culture and subjects in Turkish and Bosnian, it would be recommendable to develop additional community-specific subjects.

The Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2017–2021 includes, as one of its aims, the development and implementation of policies and mechanisms to foster inter-ethnic relations through education. Opportunities for interaction among students from the two education systems however remain insufficient and sporadic in practice.

The report includes a set of recommendations to relevant institutions regarding the sustainable provision of education for communities, completion of the curricula translation in community languages, as well as the promotion of inter-community dialogue in education, in particular in mixed schools with premises shared by the two systems. The report further recommends development of textbooks for learning the Albanian language as a non-mother tongue subject, implementation of agreements on mutual diploma recognition, as well as a continuation of the verification of degrees issued by the University of Mitrovice North and expanding the process further.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background information

An earlier report by the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) Mission in Kosovo released in 2009¹ noted a duality of education systems in Kosovo² marked by a separation between the students from different communities in attendance. The report further highlighted that smaller communities such as Kosovo Roma, Kosovo Ashkali, Kosovo Egyptians, Kosovo Montenegrins, Kosovo Croats and Kosovo Gorani enjoyed fewer opportunities for learning about their cultures and identities, while textbooks were not provided for the secondary education in Turkish and Bosnian. Problems with physical access to schools and lack of organized transport were also noted in some municipalities. Additionally, opportunities for learning of the other official language were reportedly not provided within either education system. The previously published report recommended to the relevant educational institutions to develop community-specific subjects as well as ensure the complete development and distribution of textbooks for the Turkish and Bosnian language curricula. The report also recommended introduction of the second official language classes within the existing curricula, along with systematic promotion of opportunities for intercultural learning and interaction among schoolchildren from different communities.

According to the Kosovo Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST), communities in a numerical minority were enrolled in pre-university education in the school year 2016/2017 in the following numbers: 3,634 Kosovo Ashkali (1,927 boys, 1,707 girls); 3,774 Kosovo Bosniaks (1,919 boys, 1,855 girls); 27 Kosovo Croats (13 boys, 14 girls); 817 Kosovo Egyptians (404 boys, 413 girls); 598 Kosovo Gorani (319 boys, 279 girls); 1,424 Kosovo Roma (746 boys, 678 girls); 2,573 Kosovo Turks (1,317 boys, 1,256 girls); 197 others (101 boys, 96 girls).³

According to figures provided by the Serbian Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development (MESTD) School Administration based in Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North, Serbian curriculum schools were attended by approximately 18,300 pupils in 2015 – 13,500 pupils studying at primary level, and 4,800 in secondary schools.⁴

The most important development, in terms of education in Kosovo, in recent years was the approval of the Kosovo Education Strategic Plan (KESP) for the period 2017–2021 in December 2016.⁵ The plan incorporates community and gender perspectives into its seven strategic objectives which are further structured into a number of results comprising activities and measures.⁶ The first strategic objective of KESP "Participation and Inclusion"

¹ OSCE report Kosovo non-majority communities within the primary and secondary education systems (April 2009), <u>http://www.osce.org/kosovo/36978?download=true</u> (accessed 9 October 2018) (thereafter "2009 OSCE Report"). The scope and methodology of the current report only partially overlap with the 2009 OSCE Report.

² The Kosovo curriculum system provided education in the Albanian, Bosnian and Turkish languages, whereas the Serbian curriculum system provided education only in the Serbian language.

³ In 2015, the OSCE observed that despite the existing MEST central database "Education Management Information System", practices for the collection of information on ethnic belonging of pupils were not standardized across municipalities, resulting in the lack of complete community-disaggregated data. In addition, schools working under the Serbian curriculum do not share pupils' community belonging data with MEST

⁴ The figures were obtained for a research undertaken by the OSCE in 2015. OSCE was not able to obtain updated figures from MESTD at the time of interviews for this report in 2017.

⁵ MEST, Kosovo Education Strategic Plan (KESP) 2017–2021, July 2016. Available at: <u>https://masht.rks-gov.net/uploads/2017/02/20161006-kesp-2017-2021.pdf</u> (accessed 13 October 2018).

 ⁶ 1) Participation and Inclusion; 2) Education System Management; 3) Quality Assurance; 4) Teacher Development; 5) Teaching and Learning; 6) Vocational Education and Adult Education; and 7) Higher Education.

includes inter-community dialogue through education in its results, envisaging development of policies and mechanisms to promote diversity and foster inter-ethnic dialogue and contact among communities. However, the two systems have continued operating separately and with limited official co-operation, predominantly of financial and technical nature. With the exception of the mutual recognition of diplomas,⁷ the issue of a dual provision of education in Kosovo has not been included under the framework of the European Union (EU)-facilitated dialogue process on the normalization of relations between Prishtinë/Priština and Belgrade.⁸ Both education systems have taken steps over the past several years to introduce classes of the Romani language.

1.2 Scope and purpose of the report

This report provides an overview of the situation in communities' pre-university education under the Kosovo curriculum system during the school years September 2014 – June 2015, September 2015 – June 2016 and September 2016 – June 2017.

Focusing on the Kosovo curriculum system, the report examines the provision of preuniversity education for communities at the primary, lower-secondary and uppersecondary levels including vocational education,⁹ in terms of:

- Education in official¹⁰ and in community languages including physical access, and any legally prescribed alternatives provided by the institutions for education in the language of choice including subsidized transport to an area where such schooling is offered, as well as the availability of textbooks and teaching staff;
- The availability of community-specific subjects to enable the preservation of identity for communities in a numerical minority;
- Opportunities for learning of official languages for members of communities following the curricula in community languages and as a second official language for those instructed in the Albanian language;
- Institutional support for communities' equal access to education including measures to promote attendance, reduce dropouts and assist vulnerable schoolchildren, such as transport and scholarships.

Despite the duality of education systems, this report examines compliance of Kosovo institutions with the existing legal framework in Kosovo. In the case of Serbian curriculum, the report briefly depicts the existing situation concerning the provision of education. The report aims to highlight, analyse and make information on communities' education publicly available to all relevant stakeholders, so as to allow for evidence-based advocacy and policy development.¹¹

⁷ Ministry for Dialogue, Brussels Agreements Implementation State of Play, 16 June – 25 November 2016, <u>http://www.kryeministri-</u>

ks.net/repository/docs/Kosovo Report on State of Play in implementation of the Brussels Agreements 2 <u>5 November 2016.pdf</u> (accessed 10 April 2018), p. 26; and the Serbian Government Office for Kosovo and Metohija (OKiM), *Progress Report on the Dialogue between Belgrade and Priština* (April – October 2016), <u>http://www.kim.gov.rs/doc/2.1%20Izvestaj%20april-oktobar%202016%2018102016%20eng.pdf</u> (accessed 10 April 2018), p. 11–12.

⁸ The latest agreement on diplomas from 2016 has however not been functionalized yet.

 ⁹ In order to keep the report focused, pre-school and pre-primary levels of education are excluded from the assessment.
 ¹⁰ As per the Law No. 02/L-37 on the Use of Languages, 27 July 2006, Article 2.1, Albanian and Serbian are the official languages in Kosovo and have equal status in Kosovo institutions. At the municipal level, the Bosnian language has official status in Dragash/Dragaš, Pejë/Peć and Prizren, and; while it is recognized as a language in official use in Istog/Istok. Turkish is an official language in Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamusha and Prizren; whereas it is a language in official use in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Prishtinë/Priština and Vushtrri/Vučitrn. In addition, Romani is recognized as a language in official use in Gračanica/Graçanicë.

¹¹ Since the 2009 OSCE report, *supra*, note 1, there has been no comprehensive report published on communities' education that would account for all the complexities and different challenges encountered by communities in the two education systems and the distinct responsibilities of the municipal- and government-level institutions vis-à-vis providing education to communities.

1.3 Methodology

The methodology used for this report relies on the analysis of qualitative and quantitative information gathered between May and June 2017 through a set of standardized questionnaires for each of the groups of respondents. The data collected from the interviews, complemented by additional desk research and findings of the regular OSCE Mission in Kosovo monitoring were assessed against the key international and Kosovo legal standards and policies.

At the local level, three groups of interlocutors were interviewed between May and June 2017 by the OSCE Mission in Kosovo field teams as follows:

- (i) A total number of 93 community representatives, either civil society organizations representatives involved actively in communities' education issues, or parents active in the teacher-parent councils or school boards, or members of the municipal administration or bodies, were interviewed in 33 municipalities, including those with Serbian curriculum schools, in order to gain insights into their perspectives regarding education.¹²
- (ii) Municipal education directorates (MED) representatives were interviewed in 29 municipalities with schools/classes attended by members of communities in a numerical minority in a given municipality, including Serbian curriculum schools.¹³
- (iii) A total number of 66 school directors, excluding Serbian curriculum schools,¹⁴ were interviewed in 27 municipalities¹⁵: Eleven directors in municipalities with the Kosovo Albanian community in a numerical minority where education in the Albanian language is offered,¹⁶ 13 in schools with the Bosnian language of instruction,¹⁷ nine in schools with Turkish as the language of instruction,¹⁸ three

¹² Interviews were held with one representative of each community distinctly present in a given municipality *i.e.*, where the community represents a majority in a village/neighbourhood in a municipality, or it is represented through a civil society organization at the level of the municipality or in the municipal structures, or it has a parent actively involved in school governance (based on combining information from the Kosovo 2011 census, OSCE Mission in Kosovo communities profiles and OSCE field team monitoring). Interviews were conducted in all municipalities, with the exception of the five municipalities with predominantly Kosovo Albanian community population (Gllogoc/Glogovac, Hani i Elezit/Elez Han, Junik, Kaçanik/Kačanik and Malishevë/Mališevo). In total, ten Kosovo Albanians (including one woman), 15 Kosovo Ashkali men, 11 Kosovo Bosniaks (including eight women), two Kosovo Montenegrin, 15 Kosovo Roma (including two women), 24 Kosovo Serbs (including eight women) and six Kosovo Turks (including one woman) were interviewed.

¹³ In addition to the five mono-ethnic municipalities of Gllogoc/Glogovac, Hani i Elezit/Elez Han, Junik, Kaçanik/Kačanik and Malishevë/Mališevo, the four northern municipalities of Leposavić/Leposaviq, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North, Zubin Potok and Zvečan/Zveçan were not included in this group as they did not have MEDs established at the time of interviews. In total, 21 Kosovo Albanians (out of whom seven were women), seven Kosovo Serbs (including two women), three Kosovo Turks (all men) and two Kosovo Bosniaks (both men) were interviewed as the representatives of the municipal education directorates in 29 selected municipalities.

¹⁴ Schools operating under MESTD were not analysed from a compliance perspective, and their representatives were not interviewed. OSCE only interviewed relevant communities' representatives from the municipalities that have Serbian curriculum schools. Data for the overview of these schools are based on the information obtained from the Serbian curriculum School Administration based in Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North in 2015, and additional OSCE field teams monitoring and desk research conducted in 2016/2017.

¹⁵ As opposed to the previous two groups, the municipalities of Kamenicë/Kamenica, Parteš/Partesh, Ranilug/Ranillug, Skenderaj/Srbica, Viti/Vitina and Vushtrri/Vučitrn were not included in this group as they did not have any schools of relevance for the assessment at the time of interviews.

¹⁶ Nine municipalities: Gračanica/Graçanicë, Klokot/Kllokot, Leposavić/Leposaviq, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Štrpce/Shtërpcë, Zubin Potok, Zvečan/Zveçan. Ten Kosovo Albanian (including two women) and one Kosovo Turk (male) directors were interviewed.

¹⁷ Seven municipalities: Deçan/Dečane, Dragash/Dragaš, Istog/Istok, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë South, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Prizren. Ten Kosovo Albanians (four of whom were women) and three Kosovo Bosniaks (including one woman) were interviewed.

¹⁸ Five municipalities: Gjilan/Gnjilane, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamusa, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë South, Prishtinë/Priština, Prizren. Six Kosovo Albanians (one of whom was a woman) and three Kosovo Turks (including one woman) were interviewed.

directors of schools that have provided classes of the Romani language, history and culture in Gjakovë/Đakovica, Ferizaj/Uroševac and Prizren (all Kosovo Albanian, including one woman), and 30 in schools attended by either Kosovo Roma or Kosovo Ashkali or Kosovo Egyptian pupils (in municipalities with a proportion of either of the three communities higher than 0,5 per cent of the municipal population).¹⁹

At the government level, interviews were conducted with Head of Division for Communities Education of MEST and representatives of three other governmental institutions or mechanisms with mandates partially pertaining to the education of communities.²⁰

The report consists of three sections and is structured as follows:

In the first section, the report outlines international and Kosovo legal standards and policies pertaining to communities' education in Kosovo. The second section provides an overview of education in the Albanian language and in community languages including community-specific subjects, opportunities for learning of the official languages, and institutional support for communities' equal access to education. The third section provides statistical information on the number of pre-university schools, communities in attendance and the main challenges faced by the Serbian curriculum system. The report concludes by summarizing the main findings and provides recommendations to relevant stakeholders for addressing identified shortcomings. The annexes, at the end of the report, provide a number of tables presenting an overview of types of education provided in each municipality, as well as overviews for each community.

¹⁹ Fifteen municipalities: Deçan/Dečane, Ferizaj/Uroševac, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Istog/Istok, Klinë/Klina, Lipjan/Lipljan, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Obiliq/Obilić, Pejë/Peć, Podujevë/Podujevo, Prizren, Rahovec/Orahovac, Shtime/Štimlje, Suharekë/Suva Reka. In total, 29 Kosovo Albanians (including three women) and one male Kosovo Ashkali school directors were interviewed.

²⁰ The Language Commissioner of the Office of the Language Commissioner (OLC), the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Communities and Returns (MCR), and the Senior Legal Adviser of the Consultative Council for Communities (CCC) Secretariat and members of the CCC Working Group for Education. The Director of the Office for Community Affairs (OCA) located within the Office of the Prime Minister (OPM) was not available for an interview during the information collection phase of the preparation of this report.

2. LEGAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK

The right to education and related rights are recognized in a number of international human and minority rights instruments which are directly applicable in Kosovo including Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child, European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms and its Protocols, Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women.²¹

The rights contained in the provisions of these instruments include free-of-charge and compulsory primary education and general access to secondary education,²² equal access to education and equal opportunities,²³ or the right of parents to choose the kind of education they wish to have for their children.²⁴ Additionally, persons belonging to communities have the right to learn their own language²⁵ or to be taught in their own language in areas traditionally inhabited by communities in substantial numbers, depending on sufficient demand,²⁶ without prejudice to learning of the official language, or teaching in this language.²⁷ Furthermore, international human rights instruments specify the aim of education which shall be directed, *inter alia*, to develop a child's own cultural identity, language, personality and abilities to their fullest potential, while preparing the child for a life in the spirit of understanding, peace, tolerance, equality of genders, and friendship among all peoples, ethnic, and religious groups.²⁸

Moreover, a number of international instruments developed by the OSCE High Commissioner for National Minorities (HCNM) and the Council of Europe (CoE) provide further guidance and set standards specific to communities' education.²⁹

Kosovo's legal framework on education³⁰ largely incorporates international standards. The Constitution and the relevant laws recognize Albanian and Serbian as the official languages of Kosovo,³¹ and guarantee and regulate the right to receive public education in one of the official languages of choice at all levels.³² Furthermore, "persons belonging to

Article 22 of Constitution lists the directly applicable international human and minority rights instruments, including: Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), UN General Assembly Resolution 217 A(III), 10 December 1948; Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), UN General Assembly Resolution 44/25, 20 November 1989; entered into force 2 September 1990; European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (ECHR), Council of Europe (CoE), 4 November 1950, entered into force 3 September 1953, and its Protocols; Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM), CoE, 1 February 1995, entered into force 1 February 1998; Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW), UN General Assembly Resolution 34/180, 18 December 1979, entered into force 3 September 1981. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), General Assembly Resolution 2200A (XXI), 16 December 1966, entered into force 3 January 1976, is not listed in the Article 22 of the Constitution as directly applicable. However, reference will be made to ICESCR as it contains instrumental provisions pertaining to the right to education.

See Article 26(1) of UDHR; Article 13(2) ICESCR; Article 2 of the First Protocol to the ECHR, 20 March 1952; Article 28 of CRC.

See Article 13(2) of ICESCR; Article 12(3) of FCNM.
 Article 20(2) of UDUB: Article 12(2) of ICESCR.

²⁴ See Article 26(3) of UDHR; Article 13(2) of ICESCR; Article 2 of the First Protocol to the ECHR; Article 29 of CRC.

²⁵ See Article 14(1) of FCNM.

²⁶ See Article 14(2) of FCNM.

²⁷ See Article 14(3) of FCNM.

²⁸ See Article 26(2) of UDHR; Article 13(1) of ICESCR; Article 29(1) of CRC.

²⁹ OSCE HCNM The Hague Recommendations regarding the Education Rights of National Minorities, 1 October 1996, <u>http://www.osce.org/hcnm/32180</u> (accessed 8 September 2018); OSCE HCNM The Ljubljana Guidelines on Integration of Diverse Societies, 7 November 2012 (42), <u>http://www.osce.org/hcnm/96883</u> (accessed 8 September 2018); and the CoE FCNM Advisory Committee First Thematic Commentary on Education under the Framework Convention, 2 March 2006, <u>http://www.coe.int/en/web/minorities/thematic-commentaries</u> (accessed 8 September 2018).

³⁰ Law No. 04/L-032 on Pre-University Education in Kosovo (LPUE), 31 August 2011; Law No. 03/L-047 on Protection and Promotion of Rights and Interests of Communities and Their Members (LPPRC), 13 March 2008; Law No. 03/L-068 on Education in the Municipalities of Kosovo (LEM), 15 June 2008; Law No. 02/L-037 on the Use of Language in Kosovo (LUL), 20 October 2006; Law No. 02/L-052 on Pre-School Education in Kosovo, 6 March 2006; Law No. 03/L-040 on Local Self-Government (LLSG), 15 June 2008.

³¹ See Article 5 of the Constitution.

³² See Article 59(2) of the Constitution; Article 8(1) of LPPRC; Article 19(2) of LUL.

communities" whose mother tongue is neither of the official languages are entitled to receive preschool, primary and secondary public education in their own language.³³ In cases when education in the chosen official or community language is not available, alternatives have to be provided, such as subsidized transport to an area where such schooling is offered.³⁴ Finally, KESP 2017–2021 is the main policy document that includes government's obligations for the provision of quality education for communities. The first strategic objective of KESP "Participation and Inclusion" envisages a number of measures targeting different areas of communities' education such as increasing the enrolment rates of vulnerable communities, teacher training on inclusive education, promotion of diversity and interaction among communities, and language learning. The remaining six objectives³⁵ are further inclusive of communities. Within KESP focus areas, various actions are foreseen to achieve increased involvement of communities in education management, expand opportunities for professional development and address communities' specific needs in line with the relevant legislation. This includes development of specific mechanisms in different areas, monitoring of different aspects of work of educational institutions, awareness raising and other activities.

³³ See Article 59(3) of the Constitution; Article 8(1) of LPPRC; Article 20(1) of LUL.

³⁴ See Article 13(3) of LPUE; Article 8(2) of LPPRC; Article 19(4) of LUL.

³⁵ See *supra*, note 4.

3. ACCESS TO EDUCATION FOR COMMUNITIES AND PRE-CONDITIONS FOR QUALITY EDUCATION

Members of communities in Kosovo enrol in schools under either education system depending on a number of factors such as their language, geographical location, religion and/or political affiliation.³⁶ Members of Kosovo Albanian, Kosovo Bosniak, Kosovo Turk, Kosovo Roma (residing in Kosovo Albanian-majority areas), Kosovo Ashkali and Kosovo Egyptian communities principally attend Kosovo curriculum schools; while Serbian curriculum schools are attended largely by pupils from Kosovo Serb, Kosovo Gorani, Kosovo Croat, Kosovo Montenegrin and Kosovo Roma (living in predominantly Kosovo Serb-inhabited areas) communities. In addition, members of the Kosovo Bosniak community in Leposavić/Leposaviq, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North and Obiliq/Obilić also opt for the Serbian curriculum education. Depending on the system attended, the specific rights of different communities are addressed to a different extent and the communities encounter different challenges in education.Kosovo pre-university education is formulated by the MEST's Kosovo Curriculum Framework (KCF).³⁷ At the local level, Kosovo curriculum pre-university institutions are under the authority of municipalities *i.e.*, municipal education directorates (MEDs).

3.1 Education in the Albanian language

Relevant legal provisions:

Every person in Kosovo has the right to receive public education at all levels in their preferred official language.³⁸ MEST is responsible for regulating the implementation of this right. Furthermore, municipalities are obliged to ensure teaching in a person's chosen official language or provide alternatives, such as subsidized transport to an area where such schooling is offered.³⁹

Pre-university education in Kosovo in the Albanian language is principally pursued by the Kosovo Albanian community, as well as by members of Kosovo Ashkali and Kosovo Egyptian communities whose mother tongue is also Albanian. Additionally, members of other communities whose mother tongue is not Albanian opt for it as a language of instruction; specifically Kosovo Bosniaks, Kosovo Gorani, Kosovo Turks and Kosovo Roma (living in Kosovo Albanian-majority areas).⁴⁰ According to the interviewed MED in Gjilan/Gnjilane, members of other communities enrol in pre-university education in Albanian for a number of reasons including the lack of qualified staff teaching in community languages, unavailability of textbooks in Bosnian and Turkish as community languages, and most importantly because of the better opportunities for university education in Albanian as the Kosovo majority language.

³⁶ See OSCE Mission in Kosovo Communities Rights Assessment Report Fourth Edition, November 2015, <u>http://www.osce.org/kosovo/209956?download=true</u> (accessed 9 October 2018).

³⁷ KCF was introduced in 2011, with its piloting phase continuing at the time of publication. KCF is accessible at: <u>http://www.ibe.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/archive/curricula/kosovo/kv_alfw_2011_eng.pdf</u> (accessed 13 October 2018). The curriculum follows a 5+4+3 model, starting at UNESCO International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED) Level 1 (primary education, five years, from the age of 6), continuing to Level 2 (lower secondary education, four years, from the age 12) and Level 3 (upper secondary education, three years, from the age of 15).

³⁸ See *supra*, note 32.

³⁹ See *supra*, note 33.

⁴⁰ Kosovo Bosniak community in Dragash/Dragaš, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South and Prizren; Kosovo Gorani community in Mitrovica/Mitrovicë South and Prishtinë/Priština; Kosovo Roma community in Ferizaj/Uroševac, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Istog/Istok, Kamenicë/Kamenica, Klinë/Klina, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Obiliq/Obilić, Pejë/Peć, Podujevë/Podujevo, Prizren, Rahovec/Orahovac and Suharekë/Suva Reka; and Kosovo Turk community in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South and Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

Albanian-language education in municipalities with the Kosovo Albanian community in a numerical minority

Pre-university education in Albanian is provided in nine out of ten municipalities with Kosovo Albanian community in a numerical minority. ⁴¹ With the exception of Štrpce/Shtërpcë and Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Albanian-language education is limited to the primary and lower-secondary levels.⁴² Students in the non-Albanian majority municipalities without available upper-secondary education in the Albanian language thus commute to the neighbouring Albanian-majority municipalities in order to continue with education after completion of the primary and lower-secondary levels.⁴³ At the time of assessment, in the four northern municipalities, ⁴⁴ the Albanian-language schools operated despite non-existent MEDs that were yet to be established as part of the Kosovo curriculum administration.⁴⁵ In all schools in the nine municipalities students are regularly provided with adequate textbooks for the Albanian language curriculum. No issues were reported by any of respondents with regards to the number of qualified teaching staff in these schools.

Municipalities with Kosovo Albanian community in numerical minority	Schools with Albanian instruct		
	Primary and lower secondary	Upper secondary, including vocational	
Gračanica/Graçanicë	×		
Klokot/Kllokot	✓		
Leposavić/Leposaviq	✓		
Mamuşa/ Mamushë/ Mamuša	\checkmark		
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North	\checkmark		
Novo Brdo/ Novobërdë	✓	\checkmark	
Ranilug/Ranillug	No schools operating in the Albanian language. The municipality provides transport for 13 Kosovo Albanian pupils from primary, lower and upper secondary schools who are attending schools in Kamenicë/Kamenica town.		
Štrpce/Shtërpcë	✓	✓	
Zubin Potok	✓		
Zvečan/Zveçan	\checkmark		

Table 1 - Education of Kosovo Albanian community in municipalities where they constitute a numerical minority

⁴¹ Gračanica/Graçanicë, Klokot/Kllokot, Leposavić/Leposaviq, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Štrpce/Shtërpcë, Zubin Potok and Zvečan/Zveçan. Pre-university education in the Albanian language is not available in Ranilug/Ranillug but the municipality provides transport for Albanian pupils attending schools in Kamenicë/Kamenica town.

⁴² The Albanian language upper-secondary education is available in the non-Albanian majority municipalities of Novo Brdo/Novobërdë (in Llabjan/Labjane, upper-secondary school) and Štrpce/Shtërpcë (in Ferajë/Feraja, vocational school).

 ⁴³ For example, pupils from the four northern municipalities attend upper-secondary education in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, pupils from Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša travel to Prizren.
 ⁴⁴

⁴⁴ Leposavić/Leposaviq, Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North, Zubin Potok and Zvečan/Zveçan.

⁴⁵ Post-reporting period updates: the mayor of Leposavić/Leposaviq appointed a director of education in 2017,

who was replaced by another official in February 2018. In Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North Administrative Office, there is a director of education culture youth and sports. The remaining two municipalities of Zubin Potok and Zvečan/Zveçan do not have an officer or a director in charge of education appointed yet.

However, transport-related issues negatively affect access to education for students from some of these schools. In Leposavić/Leposavig, schoolchildren commuting from Koshutovë/Košutovo and Cerajë/Ceranje to a school in Bistricë e Shalës/Šaljska Bistrica used to be serviced by a minibus of poor quality, eventually replaced by the municipality in October 2017. In Zvečan/Zvecan, there is no school bus for pupils from Lipë/Lipa and Zhazhë/Žaža attending lower-secondary education in Boletin/Boljetin. The lack of organized and subsidized transport to upper-secondary schools in Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South hinders school attendance of pupils coming from vulnerable families. Transport is also not organized to the school in Mikronaselje/Kodra e Minatorëve (Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North). Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Ashkali pupils from Radevo/Radevë, Suvi Skulanevo/Skullan villages (Gračanica/Gracanicë) attending Kosovo Do/Suhadoll. curriculum schools providing education in the Albanian language in the municipality of Lipjan/Liplian are also not regularly provided with transport. Additionally, respondents from Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Roma communities in Giilan/Gniilane. Novo Brdo/Novobërdë and Strpce/Shterpce stated that the lack of a sustainable provision of transport for students is one the challenges to communities' access to education.

Respondents also noted poor infrastructure in a school in Kishnicë/Kišnica (Gračanica/Graçanicë),⁴⁶ and a school in Mikronaselje/Kodra e Minatorëve that is placed in a container. In the latter case, the situation causes decreased enrolment rates as parents opt to enrol their children in schools south of the Ibar/Ibër river. Concerns over insufficient funding for education were noted by the interviewed school directors in Štrpce/Shtërpcë and Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, who said that the budgets allocated by their municipalities for education are not sufficient to fully cover the expenditures of all schools. Apart from the provision of transport, institutions did not provide any additional alternatives in order to ensure schooling in one's language of choice.

3.2 Education in community languages

Relevant legal provisions:

Persons belonging to communities whose language is not official in a given municipality have the right to education in their language.⁴⁷ The government should establish integrated curricula for community languages that are not an official language.⁴⁸ The minimum threshold for establishing classes in community languages should be lower than thresholds normally stipulated for educational institutions.⁴⁹ MEST shall ensure, within available resources, that sufficient personnel are trained for teaching community-language curricula. Respective teachers should be familiar with the identity of community languages of instruction. When such teaching is not available within their territories, municipalities shall provide alternatives. These can include subsidized transport to an area where such schooling is being offered.⁵¹ Textbooks in community languages at the primary and lower-secondary levels shall be provided free of charge.⁵²

⁴⁶ The Kosovo Albanian chairperson of the municipal communities committee in Gračanica/Graçanicë reported to the OSCE Mission in Kosovo field teams about the poor condition of the primary and lower secondary school "Ditët e Minatorit" in Kishnicë/Kišnica, which was confirmed by its school director. A new school building is being constructed at the time of writing this report, under an agreement between the municipality and MEST.

⁴⁷ See *supra*, note 34.

⁴⁸ See Article 8.7 of LPPRC

⁴⁹ See Article 8.1 of LPPRC.

⁵⁰ See Article 8.9 of LPPRC.

See supra, note 33. 5^{2}

⁵² See Article 27(2) of LPUE.

As regards pre-university education in community languages under the Kosovo curriculum system, MEST has developed curricula for pre-university education in Turkish and Bosnian. According to the interviewed Head of Division for Communities Education of MEST, communities have not been involved or consulted in the curricula development apart from hiring experts from the communities for the design of the subjects of language, history, music and arts. The MEST respondent stated that the translation of general subjects from Albanian to the Bosnian and Turkish languages is in progress under the 2011 pre-university curriculum framework. It remains in progress at the time of publication.

Pre-university education in the Bosnian language is offered in seven⁵³ out of nine municipalities⁵⁴ with substantial Kosovo Bosniak population. It is also available in the municipality of Gjakovë/Đakovica where a class in the Bosnian language was established at the primary level in the school year 2016/2017 based on a request by a Kosovo Bosniak family that wished for their two children to be educated in the Bosnian language. Information on the number of schools with Bosnian as a language of instruction is available in the Table 2 below.

Municipalities with distinct Kosovo Bosniak community	Schools with classes in Bosnian as a language of instruction ⁵⁵				
enrolled in pre-university education	Primary and lower secondary	Upper secondary, including vocational			
Deçan/Dečane	1	0			
Dragash/Dragaš	9	1			
Gjakovë/Đakovica	1	0			
Istog/Istok	2	0			
Leposavić/Leposaviq	Pupils follow education in Serbian language, administered by MESTD				
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North	Pupils follow education in Serbian language, administered by MESTD				
Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South	1	1			
Pejë/Peć	6	4			
Prishtinë/Priština	1 1				
Prizren	21	4			

Table 2 – Pre-university education of Kosovo Bosniak community

Pre-university education in the Turkish language is offered in five⁵⁶ out of six municipalities with substantial Kosovo Turk community. Information on the number of schools with Turkish as a language of instruction is available in Table 3 below.

⁵³ Deçan/Dečane, Dragash/Dragaš, Istog/Istok, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština and Prizren.

Education in the Bosnian language is not available in Leposavić/Leposaviq and Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North municipalities, where Kosovo Bosniak community attend education in the Serbian language through Serbian curriculum institutions.
 The list contains both main and satellite schools.

 ⁵⁶ Pre-university education in the Turkish language is offered in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Prishtinë/Priština, and Prizren. It is not offered in Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

Municipalities with distinct Kosovo Turk	Schools with classes in Turkish as a language of instruction ⁵⁷			
community enrolled in pre- university education	Primary and lower secondary	Upper secondary, including vocational		
Gjilan/Gnjilane	2	1		
Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša	1	1		
Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South	1	-		
Prishtinë/Priština	1	1		
Prizren	6 4			
Vushtrri/Vučitrn	no schools with classes in Turkish as a language of instruction			

Table 3 - Pre-university education of Kosovo Turk community

The main challenge for members of communities who follow education in the Bosnian and Turkish languages remains the provision of textbooks in these languages. Some students need to use photocopied books as not all textbooks are available for the upper-secondary level.⁵⁸ A Kosovo Bosniak representative from Istog/Istok mentioned that textbooks are not delivered to pupils timely at the beginning of a school year. Most MEDs also noted the lack of textbooks developed in both languages mostly for upper-secondary education, but also at the primary and lower-secondary education levels. To satisfy the need for textbooks, MEST has been importing textbooks from Bosnia and Herzegovina and from Turkey. According to communities and MED representatives, however, some textbooks are not adapted to the Kosovo context and not fully in line with the Kosovo curricula at the upper-secondary level.⁵⁹

The respondents did not report any issues related to physical access to schools and transport.

Kosovo Furthermore, the interviewed Bosniak community respondents in Gjakovë/Đakovica, Dragash/Dragaš and Prizren noted a lack of secondary level educational programmes in the Bosnian language. The respondent from Gjakovë/Đakovica stated that the provision of only primary education in the Bosnian language in the municipality could pose challenges to students at further educational levels as they could continue their education in Gjakovë/Đakovica only in Albanian. The respondent expressed concern about the children's future academic performance if they opted for Albanian as the main language of instruction after finishing primary education. It would help if the provision of Albanian language classes as an official language subject was intensified for such pupils at the primary level or if the municipality offered further pre-university educational levels in Bosnian.

With regards to the availability of qualified staff for teaching in Bosnian and Turkish, MEDs of Gjilan/Gnjilane, Prishtinë/Priština, Dragash/Dragaš and Prizren have mentioned challenges related to finding candidates from communities with proper educational qualifications, adequate language skills as well as difficulties with the recognition of

⁵⁷ The list contains both main and satellite schools.

⁵⁸ Communities' representatives in Dragash/Dragaš and Prishtinë/Priština stated that pupils use photocopied books, whereas in Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša only few textbooks are available in the Turkish language for the upper-secondary level.

⁵⁹ A Kosovo Turk community respondent in Gjilan/Gnjilane stated that textbooks are adapted to the Kosovo context at the primary level however pupils at the upper-secondary level study geography and history of Turkey. Respondents in Dragash/Dragaš and Prizren noted that textbooks in Bosnian are also not adapted to the Kosovo context. As noted by the Dragash/Dragaš MED, this negatively impacts the students' results in the final 'matura' exam, also affecting their chances for enrolment at public universities that consider the 'matura' exam results). In addition, the respondent also mentioned that the translation of textbooks from Albanian into the Bosnian language is of low quality.

Serbian university degrees and nostrification of those obtained in Bosnia and Herzegovina. MEDs in Prishtinë/Priština and Dragash/Dragaš further noted additional barriers that they encounter in recruiting qualified female candidates. According to the respondents from schools teaching in Turkish in Gjilan/Gnjilane and Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, teachers in those schools work voluntarily with a symbolic financial support provided by the Turkish Embassy in Kosovo. The school directors in Dragash/Dragaš confirmed that low numbers of female university graduates lead to a recruitment of a low number of female teachers.

Positively, all of the municipalities with schools operating in community languages except Dragash/Dragaš reportedly give consideration to the community belonging and language skills of the candidates with adequate professional background when employing teachers for instruction in the Bosnian and Turkish languages, thus encouraging employment of members of communities. This is mainly done through the assessment of candidates' language skills and the participation of municipal co-ordinators for education in community languages in the interview panels. On a related note, the University of Prizren is the only higher education institution in Kosovo offering teacher training and pedagogical bachelor programmes of pre-school education and primary education in the Bosnian and Turkish languages.

Interaction among schoolchildren from different communities in schools with both official Albanian and community-language curricula is mainly positive. For instance, schoolchildren in such schools in Dragash/Dragaš and Prizren reportedly use the same school entrance door, schoolyard, cabinets and other school facilities. Teaching staff in these schools share one teachers' room, which gives them additional opportunities for communication and co-operation. Schoolchildren participate in joint sport and cultural activities. Similar situation was observed in such schools in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Istog/Istok, Pejë/Peć and Prishtinë/Priština.

In Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Bosnian language students at the upper-secondary level are not physically divided from their peers following Albanian language curriculum. This has led to a comparatively high level of interaction without any altercations between students. However, physical division between the Bosnian language and Albanian language pupils at the primary and lower-secondary levels has resulted in very low levels of interaction, reaching the point where Kosovo Bosnian language pupils did not leave their classroom to play in the yard with the other pupils during lunch breaks following minor verbal altercations between pupils.

Romani language extracurricular programme

MEST has developed a module of the Romani language with elements of history and culture for the primary level which was first introduced in Prizren in 2011, following the approval of the *Strategy for the Integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities* 2009–2015⁶⁰ and the adoption of MEST Administrative Instruction 07/2010. ⁶¹ Through the Serbian curriculum system, Romani language classes are provided in several schools in Gjilan/Gnjilane, Kamenicë/Kamenica and Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North.

In addition to the existing classes in Prizren, MEST issued a call for recruitment of Romani language teachers in 2015, in order to expand the teaching of the Romani language, culture and history classes programme to the municipalities of Ferizaj/Uroševac, Fushë

⁶⁰ OPM, Strategy for the Integration of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian Communities, 2009–2015, December 2008.

⁶¹ MEST Administrative Instruction 07/2010 "Implementation of plan and the revised program with supplements for subject: Romani language with elements of culture and history", 21 June 2010.

Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Obiliq/Obilić and Pejë/Peć.⁶² MEST has also developed textbooks in Romani for the second, third and fourth grades at the primary level of education and the textbooks are provided to pupils free of charge.

Despite all these efforts, MEDs reported that the classes in Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje and Obiliq/Obilić never took off the ground as the schools that were targeted to provide such classes were part of the Serbian curriculum system in Kosovo.⁶³ On the other hand, the classes in Pejë/Peć municipality did not start due to lack of funding by the MED. The classes in Gjakovë/Đakovica municipality were initiated, but discontinued in 2016 due to unpaid teacher's salary. The classes in Ferizaj/Uroševac were ongoing, including several Kosovo Albanian and Kosovo Ashkali pupils in attendance, until the end of the 2015/2016 school year, since the teacher who was working on a voluntary basis found a paid job.

The interviewed Kosovo Roma representative in Podujevë/Podujevo stated that provision of the Romani language classes is an aspect addressed in the local action plan for the integration of Kosovo Roma, Kosovo Ashkali and Kosovo Egyptian communities adopted in 2016, but so far it has not been integrated in programmes of any of the municipal schools. According to the respondent, there is an overall high interest among the community for learning Romani but they have never formally addressed a request to the MED. According to the community respondent in Prilužje/Prilluzhe (Vushtrri/Vučitrn), Romani is taught at a local learning centre.

Additional community-specific subjects enabling communities to preserve their identity

Relevant legal provisions:

Communities are entitled to develop educational modules concerning their own culture, history and traditions, in co-operation with the government.⁶⁴ One of the purposes of pre-university education is to prepare the pupils for a responsible life in the spirit of peace, tolerance, gender equality and friendship with members of all communities in Kosovo.⁶⁵

MEST has not initiated development of any additional community-specific subjects following the introduction of the Romani language, history and culture module for the primary level. However, KESP 2017–2021 includes development of community-specific subjects under its activities related to communities' education. None of the interviewed MEDs have received any requests from communities for the development of community-specific subjects concerning their culture, history and traditions or for learning about other communities. All of the interviewed communities' representatives confirmed that they have not requested any subjects of that kind. The Kosovo Ashkali (Vushtrri/Vučitrn) and Kosovo Gorani (Prizren) respondents stated that they would welcome the introduction of such subjects. In Gjilan/Gnjilane, the Kosovo Turk community representative stated that although many members of their community follow education in the Albanian language, they have not requested any community-specific modules in the Turkish language to be introduced in schools. The Kosovo Turk respondent in Vushtrri/Vučitrn, on the other hand, stated that their local community is preparing a request for MED to enable secondary school students to learn the Turkish language as an extracurricular subject.

⁶² The programme was established as part of the CoE project "ACCESS - Increasing access to education and intercultural understanding" in co-operation with the MEST and MEDs.

⁶³ The Serbian-curriculum system did not permit the organization of Romani language classes in the targeted schools with Kosovo Roma pupils.

⁶⁴ See Article 8.7 of LPPRC.

⁶⁵ See Article 1.2.5 of LPUE.

3.3 Learning of official languages

Relevant legal provisions:

Kosovo legislation foresees learning of one of the official languages.⁶⁶ Learning of both languages concurrently is not foreseen. This means that communities following education in one of the two official languages are not required to learn the second official language; whereas communities attending education in a non-official language can study an official language of their choice.⁶⁷

Under the Kosovo-curriculum, classes of Albanian as an official language subject are offered in the extent of two hours per week starting from the third grade of primary education in the Bosnian and Turkish languages. According to the interviewed MEST official, Serbian as an official language subject remains unavailable for pupils receiving education in Albanian as well as for those receiving education in the Bosnian or Turkish languages.

Interviews with MEDs confirmed that pupils in all schools with Bosnian or Turkish as languages of instruction learn Albanian as an official language subject.⁶⁸ None of the MEDs and school directors was aware of any informal or extracurricular activity organized by schools for learning Albanian in addition to the existing curricular subject or introducing any facultative classes of the Serbian language. Out of 13 interviewed respondents from the Kosovo Bosniak and Kosovo Turk communities in the municipalities providing classes in Bosnian and Turkish under the Kosovo curriculum, nine stated that they were satisfied with the extent of provision of the Albanian language classes. However, all interviewed directors of schools teaching in the Turkish and Bosnian languages noted the lack of textbooks for learning the Albanian language as a non-mother tongue. According to the respondents, textbooks for learning Albanian in schools with community languages should be adapted to learners whose mother tongue is different from Albanian, instead of using textbooks identical to those used in education in Albanian as a language of full instruction. Notably, MEST has worked with the OSCE HCNM Office on developing such textbooks in 2011; the textbooks however were not integrated into MEST's programmes.⁶⁹

⁶⁶ See *supra*, note 32.

⁶⁷ See Article 24.6.2 of LPUE; Article 8.10 of LPPRC; and Article 21 of LUL.

⁶⁸ All nine municipalities with schools at the primary and lower secondary education level (Deçan/Dečane, Dragash/Dragaš, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Istog/Istok, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština and Prizren; in Gjakovë/Dakovica, the only class in the Bosnian language is a first grade class, where no learning of Albanian is foreseen), as well as all schools at the upper-secondary level (Dragash/Dragaš, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Prizren;

⁶⁹ Interview with Head of Division for Communities Education of MEST, conducted on 4 July 2017.

3.4 Institutional support for equal access to education

Relevant legal provisions:

The Constitution guarantees the right to free basic education for all⁷⁰ and obliges institutions to ensure equal opportunities for education for everyone, in accordance with their abilities and needs.⁷¹ MEST is obliged to promote the protection of vulnerable groups within the education system and measures to prevent drop-outs.⁷² To promote attendance and reduce drop-out, a municipality shall arrange safe and efficient transport for pupils in compulsory education to attend school. It may charge, and at its discretion waive, fees at full economic costs for school transport for: a) pupils living within the catchment area but within four kilometers distance from the school, other than pupils with disabilities; and b) pupils living outside the catchment area.⁷³

Out of 28 MEDs,⁷⁴ 16 stated that they provide transport for students from communities in a numerical minority living outside the catchment area or farther than four kilometres from the school.⁷⁵ According to ten MEDs there was no need for provision of transport as all schools attended by members of communities in a numerical minority were within a four kilometre radius of the catchment area.⁷⁶ Shtime/Štimlje only provided transport for students from the majority Kosovo Albanian community, whereas in Kamenicë/Kamenica, transport for Kosovo Serb, Kosovo Roma and Kosovo Gorani students was funded by the Serbian Government Office for Kosovo and Metohija (OKiM). Kosovo Roma community representative mentioned the lack of transport as an issue affecting students from their community.

To ensure improved access to education for communities, MEST and municipalities provide various scholarships, with the support of donors and international organizations. Seven municipalities provided scholarships for pupils at pre-university level during the school year 2016/2017.⁷⁷ In addition, MEST in co-operation with international partners has been providing scholarships for secondary education to students from Kosovo Roma, Kosovo Ashkali and Kosovo Egyptian communities to support their educational needs. According to the Head of Division for Communities Education of MEST, in the school year 2016/2017, MEST in co-operation with civil society organizations⁷⁸ provided 500 scholarships in the monthly amount of EUR30 for secondary school students from Kosovo Roma, Kosovo Ashkali and Kosovo Egyptian communities.

⁷⁰ See Article 3.1 of LPUE.

⁷¹ See Article 3.3 of LPUE.

⁷² See Article 5.1.4 of LPUE.

⁷³ See Article 15.5(1) and 15.5(2) of LPUE.

⁷⁴ Excluding Parteš/Partesh MED who did not respond to this question as Parteš/Partesh is a mono-ethnic municipality. See supra, note 12 for additional mono-ethnic municipalities with Kosovo Albanian population, which are not part of this report. Of note, Parteš/Partesh is inhabited by Kosovo Serbs and hence it is included in this report.

⁷⁵ Deçan/Dečane, Dragash/Dragaš, Gjakovë//Dakovica, Gračanica/Graçanicë, Istog/Istok, Klinë/Klina, Klokot/Kllokot, Lipjan/Lipljan, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Prizren, Rahovec/Orahovac, Ranilug/Ranillug, Skenderaj/Srbica and Štrpce/Shtërpcë.

⁷⁶ Ferizaj/Uroševac, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Obiliq/Obilić, Podujevë/Podujevo, Suharekë/Suva Reka, Viti/Vitina and Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

⁷⁷ Scholarships were provided for the secondary-level students in the municipalities of Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje (ten scholarships, EUR250 per year per each beneficiary, no community or gender disaggregated data of beneficiaries were obtainable), Istog/Istok (one Kosovo Egyptian male and one Kosovo Bosniak male student, amount not specified), Podujevë/Podujevo (three Kosovo Ashkali, EUR150 to 180 per year) and Suharekë/Suva Reka (two Kosovo Ashkali, one male and one female beneficiary, EUR30 monthly). In Gjakovë/Đakovica, Shtime/Štimlje and Skenderaj/Srbica, students from communities in a numerical minority either did not apply or they were not selected for any scholarships.

⁷⁸ Roma Education Fund; Kosovo Foundation for Open Society; Voice of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians; Swiss Church Aid.

As regards non-enrolment, late enrolment and dropouts, all MEDs apart from Gračanica/Graçanicë, Prishtinë/Priština, Dragash/Dragaš and Kamenicë/Kamenica, Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša have reportedly established municipal-level Prevention and Response Teams toward Abandonment and Non-Registration and Non-enrolment in Compulsory Education (PRTANs). Additionally, all MEDs apart from Kamenice/Kamenica, Gračanica/Graçanicë, Suharekë/Suva Reka. Dragash/Dragaš and Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša have also established school-level PRTANs.⁷⁹ Furthermore, MEDs in six municipalities⁸⁰ have undertaken additional measures to prevent or address the cases of non-enrolment, late enrolment and dropouts. At the level of schools, apart from Klinë/Klina where reportedly no dropouts were recorded, all of the interviewed directors of schools attended by a significant number of members of Kosovo Roma, Kosovo Ashkali and/or Kosovo Egyptian communities in 14 municipalities⁸¹ stated that their schools have undertaken measures to prevent or address dropouts. The schools have cooperated with donors and civil society organizations to provide catch-up/supplementary classes, teaching assistants as well as financial support to students at risk of dropping out. In addition, outreach activities and awareness raising campaigns were organized with parents. Thirteen municipalities⁸² additionally supported civil society-led learning centres, working with students from vulnerable communities, with funds, allocation of premises, and provision of firewood and classroom space for activities.

According to six MEDs,⁸³ training on the multicultural aspect of education and on communities' culture and specificities was provided for teaching staff. Training was organized either by MEST as part of the KCF, or by civil society organizations such as Kosovo Education Center and "Qendra Kulturore Turke". The interviewed school directors in eight additional municipalities⁸⁴ stated that teachers from their schools took part in training activities organized by civil society organizations and donors such as the Voice of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians (VoRAE), Kosovo Foundation for Open Society (KFOS) and the OSCE Mission in Kosovo on the topics of diversity and inclusion in education. Regular professional training for teaching staff working with students from different communities is however not provided in a systematic fashion and not always co-ordinated between the educational institutions.

⁷⁹ Establishment of PRTANs is foreseen and regulated by MEST Administrative Instruction 07/2011 "Creating and strengthening of teams for prevention and response toward abandonment and non-registration in compulsory education", 14 October 2011, amended and supplemented by the Administrative Instruction 19/2012 "Establishment and enforcement teams for prevention and response toward abandonment and non-enrolment in compulsory education," 14 October 2012.

⁸⁰ Kamenicë/Kamenica (not specified, for three Kosovo Roma students), Podujevë/Podujevo (financial support

and school materials), Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje (EUR7,000 allocated for catch-up classes for vulnerable communities), Istog/Istok (meetings with communities on dropouts), Prizren (awareness raising of parents), Suharekë/Suva Reka (provision of premises for catch-up classes).

⁸¹ Deçan/Dečane, Ferizaj/Uroševac, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Istog/Istok, Lipjan/Lipljan, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Obiliq/Obilić, Pejë/Peć, Podujevë/Podujevo, Prizren, Rahovec/Orahovac, Shtime/Štimlje and Suharekë/Suva Reka.

⁸² Ferizaj/Uroševac, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Istog/Istok, Klinë/Klina, Lipjan/Lipljan, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Podujevë/Podujevo, Prizren, Rahovec/Orahovac, Shtime/Štimlje and Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

⁸³ Ferizaj/Uroševac, Gjakovë/Đakovica, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Istog/Istok, Klinë/Klina and Viti/Vitina.

⁸⁴ Deçan/Dečane, Klokot/Kllokot, Leposavić/Leposaviq, Lipjan/Lipljan, Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South, Prishtinë/Priština, Rahovec/Orahovac and Suharekë/Suva Reka.

4. OVERVIEW OF EDUCATION IN THE SERBIAN LANGUAGE

Relevant legal provisions:

Schools teaching in the Serbian language may apply the curriculum or textbooks developed by the Serbian MESTD upon notification to MEST and following a review process. ⁸⁵ Municipalities have competences to create conditions for providing educational services in the MEST-authorized Serbian language curriculum. ⁸⁶ This includes co-operation with Serbian institutions ⁸⁷ and receiving their financial assistance.⁸⁸

The Serbian-language schools in Kosovo use a curriculum developed by the Serbian Institute for the Improvement of Education.⁸⁹ Based on the Comprehensive Proposal for the Kosovo Status Settlement, the relevant Kosovo legal provisions provide for the authorization of the Serbian curriculum in Kosovo, but these provisions have not yet been implemented in practice. Kosovo institutions have also not worked to develop a separate Serbian language curriculum in Kosovo.⁹⁰ Thus far, MEST has not received any requests from the Serbian curriculum schools regarding the usage of curriculum. There are 131 Serbian curriculum pre-university schools operating in 24 municipalities in Kosovo.⁹¹ These include 56 main primary schools (with 30 satellite schools), 26 main secondary schools (with 13 satellite schools). Primary and secondary Serbian curriculum schools often share the same premises, as most of the Serbian curriculum schools were dislocated from their original seats after 1999, especially those from urban centres, and are today located in primary schools, mainly in rural areas.⁹²

Additionally, there are schools in nine municipalities where premises are shared between schools belonging to the Kosovo curriculum and Serbian curriculum systems.⁹³ Such schools share premises either through shifts or physical separation (e.g., different floors for different systems). With regards to the co-ordination of educational activities between the two systems, the Head of Division of Communities' Education of MEST stated that no

⁸⁵ See Article 8.5 of LPPRC.

⁸⁶ See Article 12.1 of LEM.

⁸⁷ See Article 4.3 of LEM.

See Article 30.2 of LLSG.

⁸⁹ The Serbian curriculum system is structured according to a 4+4+3(4) model, having a mandatory pre-primary grade – ISCED Level 0 (age 5 to 6.5), primary school (two cycles of four years, eight years total, from the age of 6.5 to 7.5) and secondary school (three or four years, enrolment for pupils younger than the age of 17).

⁹⁰ The Comprehensive Proposal for the Kosovo Status Settlement (2007) contained strong guarantees for the rights of Kosovo Serbs including education. It was thus made possible for the Serbian curriculum schools in Kosovo to use textbooks developed in Serbia upon notifying MEST, a provision which those schools never utilized. If MEST had any objections to the usage of a particular textbook or curriculum, an independent commission would review such textbook or curriculum. The relevant provisions contained in the Proposal were integrated into the legal framework in Kosovo concerning communities. Specifically, the provision on the usage of the Serbian-curriculum textbooks is contained in Article 12.2 of LEM. In 2010, a comprehensive report released by an independent commission established by the Kosovo curriculum institutions recommended a creation of a new Serbian language curriculum. However that recommendation was never implemented, as it never gained consent of the Serbian curriculum education institutions; MEST Independent Commission for the review of Serbian language teaching materials, Comprehensive Report, 24 June 2010. http://archive.erisee.org/sites/default/files/-

^{%20}Comprehensive%20Report%20of%20Independent%20Commission%20for%20the%20review%20of%20serbian%20la nguage%20teaching%20materials.pdf (accessed 8 September 2018).

⁹¹ The information is acquired by MESTD, and verified through the OSCE Mission in Kosovo monitoring. For further details, please see Annex 2.

⁹² Consequently, the number of schools does not correspond to the number of school premises *i.e.*, the number of premises is lower than the number of schools.

⁹³ Dragash/Dragaš, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Kamenicë/Kamenica, Klokot/Kllokot, Lipjan/Lipljan, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Obiliq/Obilić and Viti/Vitina.

formal co-operation exists. There are no systematic institutional initiatives promoting interaction, inter-cultural and language learning among schoolchildren following the two separate curricula in those schools. Sporadic extra-curricular activities bringing schoolchildren from the two systems together are mainly initiated and funded by civil society and international donors. Non-existent opportunities for learning a second official language within both systems have resulted in a language barrier further perpetuating the existing lack of interaction and dialogue.

In their daily functioning, Serbian curriculum schools face challenges regarding adequate space and conditions. Congestion is a serious problem, particularly in cases where a school was dislocated from its former premises in order to share space with another school. Such cases are notable in Prishtinë/Priština secondary schools which are now housed within school premises in Gračanica/Graçanicë. Additionally, some schools such as the "Peti oktobar" primary school in Globočica/Glloboqicë, Dragash/Dragaš municipality,



Picture 1 - Primary School "Vuk Karadžić", Gjilan/Gnjilane

Furthermore, the communities' respondents from Gjilan/Gnjilane, Klinë/Klina, Zubin Potok, Obilig/Obilić and Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North noted as a problem the insufficiently qualified staff. Respondents Štrpce/Shtërpcë. education in Viti/Vitina. Vushtrri/Vučitrn. Skenderai/Srbica complained about the lack of resources and teaching materials. Inadequate infrastructure and physical conditions of schools, obsolete equipment and a lack of science cabinets were reported by the respondents in Partes/Partesh, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Viti/Vitina, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Lipjan/Lipljan, Skenderaj/Srbica and Dragash/Dragaš. In Rahovec/Orahovac, the two Serbian curriculum schools have used the premises intended for a community centre since 1999. Logistical issues, related to the working hours of schools that share premises of the two different education systems, have been observed by the representatives of the OSCE Mission in Kosovo.

For example, in Dragash/Dragaš, Kosovo Gorani pupils had difficulties physically accessing school premises during official and school holidays which are different as well. In this case, the Kosovo curriculum directors, as education officials in charge of school premises, locked the shared premises during the school break/holidays, thus preventing access for the pupils following the Serbian curriculum. To address this, the two education systems in Dragash/Dragaš have, since late 2015, been engaged in an OSCE Mission in Kosovo-facilitated dialogue initiative on the technical issues affecting communities' access to education in the municipality so as to minimize the issues affecting access to schools. The process has thus far resulted in different technical agreements regarding the functioning of shared school premises.⁹⁴



Picture 2 - Business-commercial high school, Mlike/Mlikë (Dragash/Dragaš)

As regards contact with the Kosovo institutions, the interviews conducted with MEDs in 20 municipalities (excluding the four northern municipalities without MEDs) where Serbian curriculum schools exist indicate that some co-operation exists between the two systems at the local level. All of the interviewed MEDs except Istog/Istok, Klinë/Klina and Dragash/Dragaš⁹⁵ were aware of the exact number of Serbian curriculum schools functioning in the respective municipalities.⁹⁶ Most of the information MEDs possess is of informal nature, however 13 of them were able to provide either exact or approximate numbers of pupils attending Serbian curriculum schools.⁹⁷ Istog/Istok and Klinë/Klina reportedly do not maintain any form of formal co-operation or contact with the Serbian curriculum education structures.

⁹⁴ In the mixed schools in Brod and Restelica/Restelicë, the two curricula have reached a mutually acceptable agreement on the calendar differences and making up for lost classes. Improvements have been made regarding the joint maintenance of the shared school premises and the sharing of firewood and the school key in Brod has been shared with the Serbian curriculum director.

⁹⁵ The respondent stated that the Serbian curriculum structures in the municipality had never reported officially on the number of the Serbian curriculum schools there.

⁹⁶ These three municipalities reportedly did not possess such information.

⁹⁷ Fushë Kosovë/ Kosovo Polje, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Gračanica/Graçanicë, Kamenicë/Kamenica, Klokot/Kllokot, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Obiliq/Obilić, Parteš/Partesh, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Rahovec/Orahovac, Ranilug/Ranillug and Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

An increasing number of municipalities have in recent years started to provide some form of support to the operation of Serbian curriculum schools. In 2016/2017 school year, 15 municipalities⁹⁸ assisted with covering maintenance or repairs of school buildings. Payment of public utilities such as water or electricity was supported by 16 municipalities⁹⁹ and provision of firewood by 15 municipalities.¹⁰⁰ Support to the transportation of pupils enrolled in the Serbian curriculum schools was provided by five municipalities.¹⁰¹ In addition, the Ministry for Communities and Returns (MCR) provided funds for infrastructural projects in some areas.¹⁰²



Picture 3 - Satellite branch of the primary school, "Aziz Sylejmani" Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North

⁹⁸ Dragash/Dragaš, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Gračanica/Graçanicë, Kamenicë/Kamenica, Klokot/Kllokot, Lipjan/Lipljan, Novo Brdo/Novobërde, Obiliq/Obilić, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Rahovec/Orahovac, Ranilug/Ranillug, Štrpce/Shtërpcë and Viti/Vitina.

⁹⁹ Dragash/Dragaš, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Gračanica/Graçanicë, Kamenicë/Kamenica, Lipjan/Lipljan, Novo Brdo/Novobërde, Obiliq/Obilić, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Rahovec/Orahovac, Ranilug/Ranillug, Skenderaj/Srbica, Štrpce/Shtërpcë, Viti/Vitina and Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

¹⁰⁰ Dragash/Dragaš, Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje, Gjilan/Gnjilane, Gračanica/Graçanicë, Kamenicë/Kamenica, Klokot/Kllokot, Lipjan/Lipljan, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Obiliq/Obilić, Pejë/Peć, Prishtinë/Priština, Rahovec/Orahovac, Ranilug/Ranillug, Skenderaj/Srbica and Vushtrri/Vučitrn.

¹⁰¹ Novo Brdo/Novobërdë pays for transport for all Serbian curriculum schools in the municipality, while Pejë/Peć provides fuel for transportation for Kosovo Serb pupils who live in the villages to study in Goraždevac/Gorazhdec village. Transport for the members of communities attending Serbian curriculum schools is also funded by the municipalities of Lipjan/Lipljan, Prishtinë/Priština and Rahovec/Orahovac. However, Kosovo Roma and Kosovo Croat students commuting from Janjevë/Janjevo (Lipjan/Lipljan) to Serbian curriculum schools in Gračanica/Graçanicë are not regularly provided with transport.

¹⁰² For instance, for the improvement of physical conditions of schools in the villages of Ajnovce/Hajnoc (Kamenicë/Kamenica), Banje/Bajë (Skenderaj/Srbica) and Ugljare/Uglar (Gračanica/Graçanicë) – interview with the Permanent Secretary of the MCR conducted on 2 June 2017.

Another challenge related to access to education in Serbian curriculum schools noted by the respondents from communities was the impeded provision of textbooks in the Serbian language resulting from a ban on the intake of Serbian curriculum textbooks introduced by Kosovo institutions in September 2015 and still in effect at the time of publication. The ban was introduced as a counter-measure to Serbian authorities not allowing Kosovo curriculum textbooks to be shipped to the Preševo Valley in southern Serbia, inhabited by ethnic Albanians. Unavailability of textbooks was reported to the field teams by communities following the Serbian curriculum system in Kamenice/Kamenica, Klokot/Kllokot, Novo Brdo/Novobërdë, Parteš/Partesh, as well as by the Kosovo Croat community representative in Lipjan/Lipljan. Respondents from Pejë/Peć and Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North reported about the retention of the Serbian language textbooks by the Customs service, affecting schools following the Serbian curriculum Kosovo-wide. As a communities' protection and participation mechanism, the Consultative Council for Communities (CCC) under the auspices of the President, advocated for the withdrawal of this decision but did not use their mandate to send an official recommendation to MEST.¹⁰³ Upon the incumbent CCC's mandate expiration, the succeeding composition did not follow up on the Serbian curriculum textbook ban issue. In addition, a respondent from Klokot/Kllokot stated that purchasing textbooks from MESTD presents a financial burden for many parents as MESTD only provides free-of-charge textbooks for pupils from families under the social assistance scheme.

As regards the issue of mutual diploma recognition, the initial technical agreement, reached in 2011, within the framework of the EU-facilitated dialogue between Prishtinë/Priština and Belgrade pertained exclusively to university diplomas. In 2016, this agreement was expanded to include primary, secondary and vocational training diplomas, and diplomas of the fifth level of qualification as per the European Qualification Framework (EQF).¹⁰⁴ Implementation of the renewed agreement was supposed to commence in March 2016. However the agreement has not been implemented to date.¹⁰⁵ On a positive note, verification of degrees issued by the Serbian-language University in Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North (UMN) is implemented through a government regulation adopted in 2015,¹⁰⁶ although it is not a subject of the Prishtinë/Priština and Belgrade agreement. The process enables UMN graduates to apply for jobs, obtain professional licences and take professional examinations with public institutions in Kosovo.

¹⁰³ Interviews with the CCC Working Group on Education and the CCC Secretariat Senior Legal Adviser were conducted on 30 May and 9 June 2017 respectively.

¹⁰⁴ See OKiM Negotiation Process with Pristina, University Degrees <u>http://www.kim.gov.rs/eng/p10.php</u> (accessed 10 April 2018); OPM, Conclusions on mutual diploma recognition based on the original agreements from 2011, 19 January 2016 <u>http://www.kryeministri-</u>

ks.net/repository/docs/Conclusions on mutual diploma recognition based on the original agreements from 2011.pdf (accessed 10 April 2018); ibid., Operational conclusion of the working group on Diplomas, Brussels, 21 March 2016 http://www.kryeministri-

ks.net/repository/docs/Operational conclusion of the working group on Diplomas Brussels,21 March 2016.pdf (accessed 10 April 2018).

¹⁰⁵ For progress reports on the implementation of agreements issued by Prishtinë/Priština, see <u>http://www.kryeministri-ks.net/?page=2,252</u> (accessed 5 February 2018); for the ones issued by Belgrade, see OKiM Negotiation Process with Pristina, Progress Report on the Dialogue between Belgrade and Pristina . <u>http://www.kim.gov.rs/eng/pregovaracki-proces.php</u> (accessed 5 February 2018).

⁶⁶ See government Regulation no. 21/2015 on procedures and criteria for the issuance of certificates to citizens of Kosovo who have obtained degrees from the university of Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North, for the purpose of applications for jobs, obtaining professional licences and taking professional examinations with public institutions, 14 January 2016, <u>http://kryeministri-ks.net/repository/docs/RREGULLORE (QRK)</u> -

NR. 212015 PËR PROCEDURAT DHE KRITERET PËR LËSHIMIN E CERTIFIKATAVE SHTETASVE TË REPUB LIKËS SË KOSOVËS TË CILËT KANË MARR.pdf (accessed 21 September 2018).

CONCLUSIONS

Kosovo institutions have made commendable efforts and sufficiently fulfilled their legal obligations pertaining to education of communities in Kosovo. MEST has developed integrated curricula in Turkish and Bosnian languages, and the two communities generally have access to education in mother tongue at the municipal level. In addition, the Romani language classes with elements of history and culture have been introduced at the primary level and textbooks developed for this programme. The classes have however continued only in Prizren.

Education in the official or community language of choice is generally available in most municipalities where members of communities whose mother tongue is not an official language reside; however, it is not available for all levels of pre-university education in all municipalities. Consequently, some students enrolled in pre-university education in community languages can attend only primary and/or lower-secondary levels and then continue with upper-secondary education in another municipality or enrol in uppersecondary schools in the Albanian language. Transport is usually provided as an alternative in such cases. However, students who commute in order to pursue lowersecondary and/or upper-secondary education in their chosen language do not have organized transport in some municipalities. This is particularly the case for education in the Albanian language for students from non-Albanian majority municipalities.

Another challenge faced by communities is the unavailability of textbooks in community languages i.e., Turkish and Bosnian, and the failure of MEST to adapt the content of textbooks imported from Turkey and from Bosnia and Herzegovina to the Kosovo context. Particularly, the provision of textbooks for the upper-secondary level remains problematic. Furthermore, the insufficient number of qualified staff teaching in community languages as well as insufficient number of employed women as teachers in some schools operating in community languages is an issue. Irregular payment of teachers working in those schools is an additional problem.

There is no co-operation between educational institutions belonging to the Kosovo curriculum and the Serbian curriculum systems, with the exception of municipalities' financial support to the Serbian curriculum schools for expenditures, scholarships and transport services for students. The municipalities generally provide support to members of communities in a numerical minority attending Kosovo curriculum schools so as to facilitate those communities' access to education through transport arrangements and scholarships.

The key issue remains a parallel existence of the two education systems and the lack of interaction between them. Legal provisions exist for adequate supervision over Serbian-curriculum schools by Kosovo institutions, but the system has not been enacted.

Lack of inter-community dialogue and growing language barriers among the younger generations, due to lack of initiatives for learning of the official languages, is an issue requiring attention. Albanian as an official language subject is available to pupils following education in the Bosnian and Turkish languages in all schools. Specific textbooks for learning Albanian as a non-mother tongue however remain unavailable. As a positive development, the *Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2017–2021* provides a formal basis for the educational institutions to work on inter-community dialogue in education.

Apart from the Romani language, history and culture programme, and the four subjects of language, history, arts and music in Bosnian and Turkish curricula, no additional subjects have either been requested by any of the communities or initiated by MEST, even though the *Kosovo Education Strategic Plan 2017–2021* foresees activities in this regard. Training on multicultural aspect of education has only sporadically been provided for education staff.

As regards the mutual diploma recognition process, the agreement between Prishtinë/Priština and Belgrade from 2016 that included pre-university diplomas has not been implemented. Delayed implementation affects employability and education opportunities for members of communities in Kosovo public institutions.

RECOMMENDATIONS

To the Ministry of Education Science and Technology:

- Provide textbooks and accompanying materials for all pre-university education levels in Albanian and community languages, and free-of-charge distribution for compulsory education;
- Complete the translation of curricula in community languages and adapt all imported textbooks in the Bosnian and Turkish languages to the Kosovo context;
- Undertake efforts to ensure a sustainable provision of the Serbian-language education in Kosovo and initiate a consultation process to begin implementation of relevant legal provisions in this regard;
- Develop textbooks for Albanian as an official language (non-mother tongue) subject and ensure that a sufficient number of copies are prepared and distributed among students learning Albanian in schools teaching in community languages;
- Ensure wider participation and inclusion of communities in the development of policies concerning communities' education through public debates, and the inclusion and consultation of the communities' protection and participation mechanisms and relevant Assembly of Kosovo committees in the processes of development of educational policies and legislation affecting communities in a numerical minority;
- Ensure implementation of the relevant parts of KESP 2017-2021 referring to communities and gender equality, in particular the Strategic Objective 1 "Participation and Inclusion" and its results, including the activity No.1.8 foreseeing development of policies and mechanisms for the promotion of inter-community dialogue, tolerance and gender equality through education. For this purpose, allocate funds for implementation of the relevant points of KESP 2017-2021 as per the timeframe foreseen by the KESP Action Plan, co-ordinate efforts within MEST as well as with external partners and donors, including other relevant institutions, such as the Office of the Language Commissioner and municipal education directorates;
- Develop and provide training to education staff from all communities on multicultural aspect of education in a systematic manner;
- Ensure a sustainable provision of teacher training programmes in community languages through support to and monitoring of the universities offering such programmes to meet all legally prescribed criteria for the provision of quality education in community languages;
- Resume the implementation of agreements on mutual diploma recognition with Belgrade in order to enhance communities' employability in teaching, as well as education opportunities for communities. Also, continue with the process of verification of the University in Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North-issued degrees and expand the process so as to include degrees issued by the Serbian-curriculum pre-university educational institutions in Kosovo to enable access to higher education and employment for members of communities who obtained their degrees from these educational institutions.

To municipalities:

- Following the example of Prizren, municipalities should continue to make efforts to sustainably implement the Romani language classes. This includes ensuring a regular payment of salaries of the Romani language teachers;
- Promote contact, co-operation and interaction in mixed schools with premises shared by the two systems through the organization of extracurricular artistic, sport, environmental, intercultural and language-learning activities involving students, education staff and parents from both systems and earmark funds for such activities;
- As may be relevant for the given Kosovo Serb-majority municipalities: organize transport for members of communities who commute in order to pursue education in Albanian as an official language, as well as for members of other communities where required by law. The same applies to other municipalities not fulfilling the relevant legal obligation to provide transport as an alternative for persons belonging to communities in a numerical minority in a given municipality who have to commute to other municipalities in order to pursue pre-university education in their language of choice;
- Ensure regular payment for education staff teaching in community languages;
- Undertake measures to attract more women in teaching for schools operating in community languages through promotion of gender parity in recruitment and outreach to potential female candidates in order to encourage them to apply for vacant teaching posts in those schools.

	Kosovo curriculum system						Serbian curriculu system	im	chools
	By language By communities						о С		
Municipality	Albanian	Turkish	Bosnian	Romani	Mixed communities	Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities	Serbian language	Attended by mixed communities	Mixed curricula schools
Deçan/Dečane	✓		✓		✓	✓			
Dragash/Dragaš	✓		✓		✓		✓	✓	✓
Ferizaj/Uroševac	✓				✓	✓			
Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo Polje	✓				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Gjakovë/Đakovica	✓				✓	✓			
Gjilan/Gnjilane	✓	 ✓ 	1	1	✓		✓	✓	✓
Gllogoc/Glogovac	✓			1					
Gračanica/Graçanicë	√ ^{1,2}	1					 ✓ 	✓	
Hani i Elezit/Elez Han									
Istog/Istok	✓		✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	
Junik	✓								
Kaçanik/Kačanik	 ✓ 								
Kamenicë/Kamenica	✓						✓	✓	 ✓
Klinë/Klina	 ✓ 				✓	✓	✓		
Klokot/Kllokot	✓ ¹						✓ √	√ ³	✓
Leposavić/Leposaviq	√ ¹						✓	· •	
Lipjan/Lipljan	· ·				✓	✓	✓ √		✓
Malishevë/Mališevo	 ✓ 				✓	√3			
Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša	✓ ¹	 ✓ 			✓ ✓				
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North	√ ¹						✓	✓	
Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South	· ·	✓	✓		✓	✓			
Novo Brdo/Novobërdë	√ ¹						✓	✓	✓
Obiliq/Obilić	· •				✓	✓	✓ √	· ·	✓
Parteš/Partesh	X								
Pejë/Peć	× ✓		✓		✓	✓	· ·		
Podujevë/Podujevo	✓ √								
Prishtinë/Priština	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓ →	✓	✓	
Prizren		✓ ×	· ·		✓	· · ·	✓ √		
Rahovec/Orahovac	 ✓ 				✓	✓ ✓	✓	√3	
Ranilug/Ranillug	x			<u> </u>			· ✓	-	
Shtime/Štimlje	▲ ✓				✓	✓	· ·		
Skenderaj/Srbica	· ✓		<u> </u>	1			✓		
Štrpce/Shtërpcë	\checkmark^1	<u> </u>					· ✓		
Suharekë/Suva Reka	· ✓			<u> </u>	✓	✓			
Viti/Vitina	· ✓			<u> </u>	· ✓	· •	✓		✓
Vushtrri/Vučitrn	· ✓			<u> </u>	· ·	· •	· ✓	✓	
Zubin Potok	√ ¹	<u> </u>			-		· ✓		
Zvečan/Zveçan	✓ ✓ ¹						· ·	✓	
Totals	36/ 9 ¹	5	7	1	22	18	25	16	9

Annex 1 – overview of municipalities by types of education provided

Notes: 1 – Albanian language schools in municipalities where Albanian community is in numerical minority; 2 - school in Kishnicë/Kišnica, although located in the municipality, is still under Prishtinë/Priština, with the process of transfer to Gračanica/Graçanicë municipality ongoing; 3 – schools attended by a very low number of members of communities

Annex 2 - Serbian-language curriculum schools in Kosovo municipalities (excluding the ones sharing premises with the Albanian-language curriculum schools listed separately)

Municipality	Municipality Type of school				
	Primary Schools Secondary Schools + vocational education and training (VET) schools				attendance
	Main	Satellite	Main	Satellite	
Dragash/Dragaš	2		1		Kosovo Gorani
Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo	1	1			Kosovo Serbs,
Polje					Kosovo Roma
Gjilan/Gnjilane	1	3	1	1	Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma
Gračanica/Graçanicë	6		8		Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma,
					Kosovo Gorani
lstog/Istok	1	1			Kosovo Serbs
Kamenicë/Kamenica	2	1		1	Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma
Klinë/Klina		1			Kosovo Serbs
Klokot/Kllokot	2		1		Kosovo Serbs
Leposavić/Leposaviq	3	6	2		Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma
					(primary level),
					Kosovo Bosniaks
					(primary level)
Lipjan/Lipljan	1	2			Kosovo Serbs
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North	7	1	4 +1 VET		Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma
					(primary level),
					Kosovo Bosniaks,
					Kosovo Gorani
Novo Brdo/Novobërdë	6	8	1 + 1 VET	1	Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma
Obilić/Obiliq	3			2	Kosovo Serbs,
					Kosovo Roma,
					Kosovo Ashkali
					(primary level),
					Kosovo Egyptians
					(primary level),
					Kosovo Bosniaks
Doutož (Doutoch	0				(primary level)
Parteš/Partesh	2		0	5 +1 VET	Kosovo Serbs
Pejë/Peć			2		Kosovo Serbs
Prishtinë/Priština			1		Kosovo Serbs
Rahovec/Orahovac	2		1 2		Kosovo Serbs
Ranilug/Ranillug	2	1		3 + 1 VET	Kosovo Serbs
Skenderaj/Srbica	I		1 VET		Kosovo Serbs

Štrpce/Shtërpcë	3	4	1 (Gymnasium, Medical and Economics School "Jovan Cvijić")		Kosovo Serbs, Kosovo Roma (primary level)
Viti/Vitina	1				Kosovo Serbs
Vushtrri/Vučitrn	3	1	1		Kosovo Serbs, Kosovo Roma (primary level)
Zubin Potok	2		1		Kosovo Serbs
Zvečan/Zveçan	3		1 VET		Kosovo Serbs
TOTAL	56	30	30 (out which 4 VET)	15 (out of which 2 VET)	131

Municipality	Location	School	Languag e of instructi on	Communitie s in attendance	Premises
			Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	In 2016 both curricula pupils moved to a new building funded
Gjilan/Gnjilane	Ponesh/Poneš	PS "Sveti Sava" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	by the USAID and the municipality, and continue to share premises.
Kamenicë/Kamen ica	Kamenicë/Kamenic a	Primary Secondary and Vocational School "Desanka Maksimović" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs, Kosovo Roma	Separate buildings in a joint compound and joined heating system
		PS "Fan Noli" (main)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	oyotem
		PS "Ndre Mjeda" (satellite)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	Two adjacent
Viti/Vitina	Binq/Binač	PS "Mladen Marković" (satellite, first to fourth grade)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	small buildings for each of the systems
Klokot/Kllokot	Mogillë/Mogila	Primary and Lower Secondary School (PLSS) "Gjon Sereqi" (main)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	One building used by both
		PS "Marko Rajković" (satellite)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	systems
		PS "Minatori" (satellite)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	One building
Novo Brdo/ Novobërdë	Jasenovik	PS "Sveti Sava" (satellite)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	used by both systems

Annex 3 - "Mixed" schools with shared premises

		PLSS "Shtjefan Gjeqovi"	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	One building
Lipjan/Lipljan	Janjevë/Janjevo	(main) PS "Vladimir Nazor" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs, Kosovo Croats	used by both systems
		PLSS "Drita" (main)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	One building
	Rubofc/Rabovce	PS "Braća Aksić" (satellite)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	used by both systems
Fushë Kosovë/Kosovo		PLSS "Daut Bogujevci" (main)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	
Polje	Bresje	PS "Aca Marović" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	One building used by both systems
	Crkvena	PS "Dositej Obradović" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Serbs	One building
Obiliq/Obilić	Vodica/Caravodicë	PLSS "Fazli Graiçevci" (main)	Albanian	Kosovo Albanians	used by both systems
	Restelice/Restelica	PS "22. decembar" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Gorani	One building used by both
	nestence/nestenca	PLS "Restelica" (main)	Bosnian and Albanian	Kosovo Bosniaks	systems
	Brod	PS "Zenuni" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Gorani	One building used by both
		PLS Zenuni (main) PS "9. maj"	Bosnian	Kosovo Bosniaks Kosovo	systems
Dragash/Dragaš	Rapća/Rapqë	(main) PLS "9.	Serbian	Gorani Kosovo	One building used by both
		maj"(main)	Bosnian	Bosniaks	systems
	Krsteč/Kërstec	PS "9. maj" (satellite)	Serbian	Kosovo Gorani	One building used by both
		PLS "9. Maj" (satellite)	Bosnian	Kosovo Bosniaks	systems
	Vranište/Vranishtë	PS"25. maj" (main)	Serbian	Kosovo Gorani	One building used by both
		PLS "25. maj" (satellite)	Bosnian	Kosovo Bosniaks	systems

Annex 4 – Education of Kosovo Montenegrin community (source: OSCE Communities Profiles, 2010; OSCE monitoring)

Municipalities with Kosovo Montenegrin community enrolled in pre-university education	Serbian curriculum schools
Istog/Istok	\checkmark

Annex 5 - Education of Kosovo Gorani community

Municipalities with Kosovo Gorani community enrolled in pre-university education	Kosovo curriculum Bosnian language schools	Kosovo curriculum Turkish language schools	Kosovo curriculum Albanian language schools	Serbian curriculum schools
Dragash/Dragaš	✓			\checkmark
Gračanica/Graçanicë				\checkmark
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North				✓
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë South	✓		✓	 ✓ (attending schools in Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North)
Prishtinë/Priština	✓	✓	✓	
Prizren	✓	✓		

Annex 6 – Education of Kosovo Croat community (sources: OSCE Communities Profiles, 2010; OSCE municipal profile Lipjan/Lipljan, September 2015; OSCE monitoring)

Municipalities with Kosovo Croat community enrolled in pre-university education	Serbian curriculum schools	
Lipjan/Lipljan ¹⁰⁷	 ✓ (primary level, continuation with secondary education in other municipalities with secondary schools operating in the Serbian language) 	

¹⁰⁷ In Janjevë/Janjevo, primary school "Vladimir Nazor".

Annex 7 – Education of Kosovo Roma, Kosovo Ashkali and Kosovo Egyptian communities

Municipalities			Classes	of Romani	Kosovo	
with distinct	Kosovo	Roma		history and	Ashkali	
Kosovo Roma,		nunity		nary level of	communit	Kosovo Egyptian
Kosovo Ashkali	Com	lancy	education)		у	community
and Kosovo					(following	(following
Egyptian	Serbian-	Kosovo	Serbian	Kosovo	education	education in
communities	curriculu	curriculu	curriculum	curriculum	in	Albanian provided
enrolled in pre-	m system	m system	system	system	Albanian	by MEST)
university	(Serbian	(Albanian			provided	
education	language)	language)			by MEST)	
Deçan/Dečane						✓
Ferizaj/Uroševac	✓	✓		✓	✓	
Fushë						
Kosovë/Kosovo	✓	✓			✓	\checkmark
Polje						
Gjakovë/Đakovic	~	1			1	
a	¥	¥			v	v
Gjilan/Gnjilane	✓		✓			
Gračanica/Graça	✓					
nicë	•					
Istog/Istok	✓	✓				✓
Kamenicë/Kame	v		1			
nica	•		•			
Klinë/Klina	✓	✓				√
Leposavić/Lepo	✓					
saviq						
Lipjan/Lipljan	~				✓	
Mitrovica/Mitrov	✓		✓			
icë North	•		•			
Mitrovicë/Mitrov	✓	~			1	
ica South	•	•			•	
Novo	1		1			
Brdo/Novobërdë	v		•			
Obiliq/Obilić	~	✓			✓	
Pejë/Peć	~	✓				✓
Podujevë/Poduj	✓	✓			1	
evo	•	Ť				
Prishtinë/Prištin					✓	
а						
Prizren	✓	✓		✓	✓	
Rahovec/Orahov	✓	✓			✓	✓
ac	•	Ť				•
Shtime/Štimlje					✓	
Suharekë/Suva	✓	✓			✓	
Reka		•				
Vushtrri/Vučitrn	✓				✓	

Municipalities with distinct Kosovo Bosniak	Schools with classes in Bosnian as a language of instruction ¹⁰⁸		
community enrolled in pre-university education	Primary and lower secondary	Upper secondary, including vocational	
Deçan/Dečane	1	0	
Dragash/Dragaš	9	1	
Gjakovë/Đakovica	1	0	
Istog/Istok	2	0	
Leposavić/Leposaviq	Pupils follow education in Serbian language, administered by MESTD		
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North	Pupils follow education in Serbian language, administered by MESTD		
Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South	1	1	
Pejë/Peć	6	4	
Prishtinë/Priština	1	1	
Prizren	21	4	

Annex 8 – Education of Kosovo Bosniak community

Annex 9 – Education of Kosovo Turk community

Municipalities with distinct Kosovo Turk community enrolled in pre-university education	Schools with classes in Turkish as a language of instruction ¹⁰⁹		
	Primary and lower secondary	Upper secondary, including vocational	
Gjilan/Gnjilane	2	1	
Mamuşa/Mamushë/Mamuša	1	1	
Mitrovicë/Mitrovica South	1	-	
Prishtinë/Priština	1	1	
Prizren	6	4	
Vushtrri/Vučitrn	no schools with classes in Turkish as a language of instruction		

 ¹⁰⁸ The list contains both main and satellite schools.
 ¹⁰⁹ The list contains both main and satellite schools.

Annex 10 – Education of Kosovo Albanian community in non-Albanian majority		
municipalities		

Municipalities with Albanian community in numerical minority	Schools with Albanian as a language of instruction		
	Primary and lower secondary	Upper secondary, including vocational	
Gračanica/Graçanicë	✓		
Klokot/Kllokot	✓		
Leposavić/Leposaviq	✓		
Mamuşa/ Mamushë/ Mamuša	✓		
Mitrovica/Mitrovicë North	✓		
Novo Brdo/ Novobërdë	✓	✓	
Ranilug/Ranillug	No schools operating in the Albanian language. The municipality provides transport for 13 Kosovo Albanian pupils from primary, lower and upper secondary schools who are attending schools in Kamenicë/Kamenica town.		
Štrpce/Shtërpcë	✓	✓	
Zubin Potok	✓		
Zvečan/Zveçan	\checkmark		

COMMUNITIES ACCESS TO PRE-UNIVERSITY EDUCATION IN KOSOVO



