TRAINING AGAINST HATE CRIMES FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT

PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION







TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND 3

WHAT IS TAHCLE? 5
WHY IMPLEMENT TAHCLE? 6
METHODOLOGICAL PRINCIPLES 7
PROGRAMME-IMPLEMENTATION STEPS 9
THE TRAINING OF TRAINERS 15
ANNEXES 18
ANNEX 1: Sample Memorandum of Understanding 18
ANNEX 2: Sample Terms of Reference for the National Liaison
Officer 21
ANNEX 3: Sample Terms of Reference for the National Implementation Working Group 22
ANNEX 4: Sample Agenda for the Training of Trainers 24
ANNEX 5: Sample Agenda for the Training of Police 25
ANNEX 6: Sample Table of Contents for the Curriculum 26
ANNEX 7: OSCE Commitments relevant to Hate Crimes 27

BACKGROUND

Training against Hate Crimes for Law Enforcement (TAHCLE) is a programme designed to improve police skills in recognizing, understanding and investigating hate crimes. Implementation of the programme should improve police skills in preventing and responding to hate crimes, interacting effectively with victim communities, and building public confidence and co-operation with law-enforcement agencies.

TAHCLE is designed and implemented by the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE). The OSCE is the world's largest regional security organization, while ODIHR is the principal OSCE institution dedicated to supporting States in implementing their commitments in the area of human rights and democracy.

OSCE participating States acknowledge that hate crimes pose a threat to security and may give rise to conflict and violence on a wider scale. They have, therefore, made a number of commitments¹, including to:

- investigate hate crimes promptly;
- take appropriate measures to encourage victims to report hate crimes;
- introduce or further develop professional training and capacitybuilding activities for law-enforcement officers addressing hate crimes; and

The principal commitments against hate crimes can be found in OSCE Ministerial Council, Decision No. 9/09, "Combating Hate Crimes", Athens, 2 December 2009, http://www.osce.org/cio/40695>.

 Conduct awareness-raising and education efforts, particularly with law-enforcement authorities.

OSCE participating States have tasked ODIHR with the collection and publication of data on hate crimes, with identifying good practices and responses in addressing hate crimes, and with the development of programmes to assist participating States in combating hate crime.

To these ends, ODIHR has developed the TAHCLE programme. This manual describes the programme and provides information for governments interested in participating. The manual sets out how the TAHCLE programme works and explains how it can assist participating States in meeting their commitments. TAHCLE is the substantially revised and updated successor to the Law Enforcement Officer Programme, developed by ODIHR in 2004. TAHCLE is one of a number of activities undertaken by ODIHR to address the problem of hate crime in the OSCE area.² Participating States interested in further information are encouraged to contact ODIHR, either directly or through their country's mission to the OSCE in Vienna.

Others include a practical handbook on hate crime laws, a resource guide for non-governmental organizations on preventing and responding to hate crimes, the ODIHR's annual report *Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region*, and other publications and activities. See http://www.osce.org/odihr/66388.

WHAT IS TAHCLE?

TAHCLE is a training programme for police on responding to hate crimes. It is tailored to the needs and experiences of each country in which it is used.

TAHCLE is a short, compact and flexible training programme. It is designed to be integrated into other training efforts, drawing on existing resources and curricula of police training institutions. Typically, a TAHCLE course for police officers takes just one full day.

TAHCLE can be provided directly to police commanders, officers, cadets, trainees and investigators as pre-service or in-service training. It is best implemented, however, through a "training of trainers" methodology, in which local police are trained as instructors, and they then train their colleagues. A course to train trainers typically lasts three days.

WHY IMPLEMENT TAHCLE?

Hate crimes are a serious problem throughout the OSCE area. They threaten the security not only of individuals, but of society at large, since they often spark broader violence and conflict. TAHCLE is intended to address the problem of hate crime by building knowledge and expertise among law-enforcement personnel on effective methods to address hate crime. TAHCLE aims to help police forces in:

- ensuring the effective investigation and prosecution of hate crimes;
- understanding the basis, context and special attributes of hate crimes;
- solidifying knowledge of domestic legislation related to hate crimes;
- contributing to crime prevention;
- encouraging public co-operation with and respect for police forces;
- building constructive ties with marginalized or threatened groups in society; and
- ensuring that police practices serve to protect and promote human rights and non-discrimination.

METHODOLOGICAL PRINCIPLES

Adapted and Flexible

- The design of the programme is based on local resources and needs.
- Materials are adapted to reflect a country's laws and the domestic context of hate crimes.
- Course materials are prepared in the local language.
- ODIHR works with local authorities to design an optimal approach.
- The training can be conduced directly or through a train-the-trainers approach.
- The training can be tailored to fit into the broader curriculum of a police academy.

Interactive and Motivational

- The training is interactive, because learning by doing has been demonstrated to be the most effective approach.
- The training is motivational. It is aimed not only at building technical skills and knowledge, but also at demonstrating the adverse impact that hate crime has on society and motivating attendees to address the issue.

Human Rights Based

 The programme follows a human rights-based approach, because respect for fundamental human rights and the prevention of discrimination are essential to guarantee the security of individuals and communities.

Expert Led

 The training team is composed of professional trainers and police, as well as experts with comprehensive experience in prosecuting hate crimes. Ideally, the experts will have an understanding of and experience working within the local context.

Inclusive

• Consultation with civil society and community representatives is a crucial element of course development. These groups can offer significant intelligence and information on the nature of hate crimes in a country or community and are important partners in delivering effective responses to hate crimes.

Transparent and Accountable

- The success of the programme is dependent on the commitment and implementation efforts of the host country.
- The programme's implementation is monitored to identify difficulties that may arise, to recognize good practices that can be replicated, and to help authorities make informed decisions on further activities.
- The programme is evaluated upon its completion to help ensure its sustainability and to help integrate the initiative into comprehensive policy efforts aimed at addressing hate crime.

PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION STEPS

The programme requires a political commitment from the authorities and adequate allocation of resources and time. The political commitment ensures that the programme is fully implemented and that participants understand that it has the support of their leadership.

The typical steps in the implementation of TAHCLE are outlined below.

Step One: Initial Request

Any participating State or OSCE field operation (within the framework of its mandate) may request that ODIHR assist the participating State through the implementation of the TAHCLE programme.

Step Two: Desk Review of the Scope of Intervention

Based on existing information and in close consultation with authorities and other relevant actors, ODIHR will suggest the optimal scale of implementation of TAHCLE. Two options are available: the delivery of training of trainers, followed by cascade training to all levels of police; and/or the delivery of introductory, one-day training sessions to key actors.

The assessment of the scope of intervention will depend on the following elements:

- the extent and nature of hate crimes in a particular country;
- the current effectiveness of the responses by police to hate crimes;
- the level of available resources and personnel; and

 how TAHCLE can be integrated into existing training initiatives and structures.

Should the authorities commit to a full implementation of TAHCLE, all of the steps below should be carried out. Should ODIHR deliver introductory one-day sessions, only step nine is of relevance.

Step Three: Memorandum of Understanding

The national authorities and ODIHR sign a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), which outlines the responsibilities of both parties and sets out a mutually agreed basis on which all phases of the programme will be implemented. A sample text of an MOU is available in the Annex 1of this document.

Step Four: Nomination of a National Liaison Officer

Following the signing of the MOU, the host State assigns a National Liaison Officer (NLO) to support programme development and implementation. The role, responsibilities and suggested qualifications of the NLO are described in Annex 2.

Step Five: Appointment of the National Implementation Working Group

The host state appoints a National Implementation Working Group (Working Group), composed of staff involved in police training at all levels. The main tasks of the Working Group are to:

- provide information and recommendations on the part(s) of the training curriculum that need to be customized to match the local context;
- review and approve the curriculum before it is finalized;
- ensure that issues arising during the course of the TAHCLE delivery and implementation are dealt with effectively;

- co-ordinate follow-up activities conducted after the implementation TAHCLE; and
- define, together with ODIHR, the parameters for the monitoring and evaluation of the programme.

The Working Group could consider:

- putting in place a system to record the number and types of training sessions on addressing hate crimes that are delivered based on TAHCLE, and providing ODIHR with this information; and
- developing a communications and engagement strategy to begin or strengthen partnerships with civil society.

Meetings of the Working Group are normally convened and chaired by the NLO. Sample terms of reference for the Working Group are in Annex 3.

Step Six: Introductory Workshop (optional)

As an optional but recommended step, ODIHR suggests the delivery of a one-day workshop with mid-level and senior government and law-enforcement officials to raise awareness about hate crime and explain how the TAHCLE programme works and what it entails. The workshop can also help highlight specific issues to be included in the curriculum.

Step Seven: Needs Assessment

ODIHR conducts a needs-assessment visit. The assessment process relies on the NLO to co-ordinate and convene focus-group sessions and meetings with police officials and relevant authorities, such as prosecution services, institutions dealing with minority groups and human rights, civil society organizations and, where relevant, OSCE field operations and international organizations.

The objectives of the needs assessment are to:

- assess the nature and, where possible, the extent of hatemotivated violence, as well as the capacity of police, prosecutors, communities and civil society to address the issue;
- understand current police responses to hate crimes;
- identify policing structures and the legal framework relevant to hate crimes; and
- understand the approach to police training.

Step Eight: Customization

ODIHR is responsible for drafting the curriculum, in consultation with the host government. First, ODIHR and the Working Group agree on the general structure and content of the curriculum. The curriculum includes sections that are standardized and sections that need to be customized. Then, ODIHR and the Working Group agree on a process that will enable ODIHR to collect the information needed for the customized part of the curriculum.

ODIHR prepares the curriculum and the training materials for review by the Working Group. Depending on local circumstances, the curriculum and other materials are translated into the host country's language either before or after approval by the Working Group. The quality and accuracy of the translation will be discussed with a national expert. This might be the NLO, a legal consultant or another person who can advise on technical terms.

Step Nine: Delivery of Training

The training venue will be provided by the authorities. The ODIHR training team will generally be supplemented by national and/or international experts with police or prosecutorial experience or knowledge in other fields relevant to hate crimes, as identified in the customization process. Evaluation of the training is conducted at the end of the session through a questionnaire and a feedback session.

Those attending the training of trainers will be trained both in approaches to addressing hate crimes and in effective methods of training others.

Discussions on the workability of the different parts of the curriculum take place during the "training of trainers" practice sessions. The results of the evaluation will be used to amend the training curriculum and agenda to ensure their optimal use by the national training institutions.

Step Ten: Developing Tools for Improving Police Response to Hate Crimes (optional)

As an optional component of the TAHCLE programme, at the request of the national authorities, ODIHR can assist the police in developing additional practical tools for addressing hate crimes, such as standard operating procedures, reporting forms, checklists on bias indicators or other materials that can help police implement the skills acquired during the training effectively.

Step Eleven: Monitoring

With the support of the Working Group or the NLO, ODIHR will monitor the use of the curriculum during the training. The NLO will inform ODIHR about training activities in which the curriculum is going to be used. ODIHR should be invited to observe some training sessions.

The benefit of monitoring is to identify good practices, with a view to replicating these, and to identify difficulties that may arise and make appropriate modifications to the training modules, if needed.

Step Twelve: Evaluation and Presentation of Results

ODIHR will facilitate the evaluation of the implementation of the programme. This includes the evaluation of the training of trainers and the evaluation of the training that is delivered in national training institutions. The composition of the evaluation team will be agreed upon with the Working Group. Ideally, it should include an international, independent

evaluator and a national expert, who could be a member of or appointed by the Working Group.

The specifics of the evaluation approach are defined in close co-operation with the Working Group. Normally, the outcomes of the programme are evaluated against the following indicators: knowledge and understanding; skills and behaviour; and attitudes and values. The results of the evaluation will be presented to the national authorities.

THE TRAINING OF TRAINERS

Training Approach

ODIHR trainers use a mixture of delivery approaches, including:

- interactive group work (discussions, role playing and case studies);
- presentations; and
- learning-by-doing through practice sessions, in which participants teach parts of the one-day curriculum.

The training of trainers and the training delivered by national training institutions should each involve a maximum of 30 participants per session. The length of the training of trainers depends on the curriculum they will eventually deliver to others. In general, the training of trainers to deliver a one-day training programme lasts about three days.

The methodological principles outlined above form the basis of both the three-day training of trainers and the one-day police training that they eventually deliver.

Three-day Train-the-Trainers Agenda

The agenda for the training of trainers is designed to provide participants with:

- knowledge about hate crime laws and strategies for investigation and response;
- skills for conducting training for police officers; and

 an understanding of the importance of examining their own biases.

The training gives participants the opportunity to experience, practice and discuss the curriculum in the following sessions:

- presentation of the curriculum that police trainers will deliver to others – participants experience parts of the training;
- practice sessions participants deliver parts of the curriculum to their peers. Participants split up into small groups and simulate the delivery of the module to the rest of the group. Every presentation is followed by a feedback-and-assessment discussion;
- feedback sessions on training techniques participants will share information about their training experience, discuss difficult questions and situations, and exchange tips on how to overcome difficulties; and
- short sessions where trainers can share their own reflections about prejudice and stereotypes.

A sample agenda for the training of trainers can be found in Annex 4.

Curriculum for Trainers

The curriculum is a resource to support trainers when delivering the training for police. The curriculum consists of 12 basic modules, which enable police trainers to enhance:

- recognition and understanding of the hate crime dynamic and its impact on victims;
- understanding of the legal framework related to hate crime;
- acquisition and realization of practical skills to respond to and investigate hate crimes; and
- the sensitivity of participants to their particular role in responding to hate crimes.

Each module is designed on the same model and contains the following elements:

- the objectives and desired outcome of the module;
- the anticipated duration of the session;
- detailed instructions for implementing the activities;
- optional activities that can be used to extend or enhance the concept of the module; and
- tips and frequently asked questions.

The curriculum also contains:

- sample training agendas;
- sample case studies, developed on the basis of real cases drawn from the local context, as well as from other experiences;
- handouts; and
- an evaluation questionnaire.

The table of contents for the curriculum is included in Annex 6.

One-day police training

The agenda for the one-day training of police is structured to have participants:

- understand the dynamics of hate crimes and their impact on victims;
- understand the legal framework related to hate crime;
- acquire skills to respond to and investigate hate crimes; and
- examine their own prejudices.

The one-day training ends with officers working in small groups on case studies, enabling participants to apply the learning they have gained from the day. A sample agenda of the training for police can be found in Annex 5.

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: Sample Memorandum of Understanding

Memorandum of Understanding between
The Ministry of Interior of [participating State X] and
The OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) regarding
Implementation of the Training against
Hate Crimes for Law Enforcement Programme

The Ministry of Interior of [participating State X] and the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights OSCE (ODIHR),

On the basis of mutual interests and convinced that hate crimes constitute a violation of human rights and a threat to the rule of law and democratic stability,

Recalling the provisions of:

- The OSCE Strategy to Address Threats to Security and Stability in the Twenty-First Century (2003),
- The Athens OSCE Ministerial Council Decision No. 9/09 on Combating Hate Crimes,
- The International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (1965),

Recognizing that the ODIHR's Training against Hate Crimes for Law Enforcement programme (hereinafter referred to as TAHCLE) was

developed in order to provide OSCE participating States with police training on hate crimes,

Convinced that a partnership between the Ministry of Interior of [participating State X] and the ODIHR on the implementation of TAHCLE will assist in achieving mutual goals and objectives in the fight against crimes motivated by hatred,

Have agreed as follows:

The Ministry of Interior of [participating State X] shall:

- 1. Appoint a National Liaison Officer as its authorized representative to work with ODIHR and co-ordinate the implementation of TAHCLE;
- Appoint a National Implementation Working Group to advise on the customization of the curriculum, to ensure effective implementation of TAHCLE, and to facilitate monitoring, evaluation and follow-up activities;
- 3. Appoint [number] of officers to be trained as trainers to deliver TAHCLE and [number] of officers to receive the one-day TAHCLE training programme;
- 4. Facilitate TAHCLE planning and delivery, including through the provision of logistical and infrastructure support for the needs assessment mission, the train-the-trainer portion of the programme and the subsequent direct delivery of TAHCLE to police officers;
- 5. Ensure institutionalization of relevant parts of the training curriculum into the national police training curriculum for cadets and in-service training;
- 6. Invite ODIHR to observe training sessions and assist with programme evaluation.

ODIHR shall:

1. Appoint a liaison officer as its authorized representative to work with the Government of [participating State X] in implementation of the TAHCLE programme;

- 2. Offer an introductory, one-day workshop to familiarize officials with TAHCLE and to raise awareness of key issues to consider when addressing hate crimes;
- 3. Undertake a needs assessment mission to establish the basis for designing a customized TAHCLE curriculum for [participating State X];
- 4. Draft a curriculum and consult with the National Implementation Working Group to customize it appropriately;
- 5. Provide the curricula and training materials for TAHCLE in the required quantity, as well as providing for their translation into [official language of participating State X].
- 6. Conduct comprehensive "training of trainers" [or, conduct one-day training sessions] for designated officers from the structures of the Ministry of Interior of [participating State X].
- 7. Conduct a post-implementation evaluation and provide support to the Ministry of Interior in following up on the programme.

Signed in [city] on [date] in two originals, in [official language of participating State X] and English, both texts being equally authentic. In case of any difference in interpretation, the English text shall prevail.

For the Ministry of Interior of	
[participating State X]	For ODIHR

ANNEX 2: Sample Terms of Reference of the National Liaison Officer

The Role of the National Liaison Officer (NLO)

The NLO is the principal contact point for the day-to-day planning and operations of TAHCLE and serves as the key liaison between ODIHR and the government. Hence, the NLO is tasked to:

- co-ordinate the agenda for the needs assessment visit with the ODIHR training team, which may include meetings with police representatives, front-line officers, prosecutors, officials from other justice-sector agencies/ministries, and civil society organizations;
- convene and chair the National Implementation Working Group and co-ordinate its activities;
- co-ordinate the training of trainers component of TAHCLE, by ensuring the selection criteria are met for participants, and organize logistical issues relating to training in consultation with ODIHR;
- provide comments and input into the customization of the materials; and
- provide ODIHR with information relating to the number of training sessions and types of training undertaken, and the number and types of officers trained.

Qualifications:

- police officer with investigative experience or with substantial experience in training others;
- professional experience of at least eight years;
- · ability to communicate professionally in English; and
- understanding of issues relating to hate crimes and community engagement would be an asset.

ANNEX 3: Sample Terms of Reference of the National Implementation Working Group

The role of the National Implementation Working Group (the Working Group) is to advise on the customization of the curriculum for the Training against Hate Crimes for Law Enforcement (TAHCLE) programme, to ensure effective implementation of TAHCLE, and to facilitate monitoring, evaluation and follow-up activities.

Another function of the Working Group is to serve as an expert group that will conduct follow-up activities after the implementation of TAHCLE, and particularly the institutionalization of the curriculum at police academies. Meetings of the Working Group are normally convened and chaired by the National Liaison Officer.

Composition:

- The size of the Working Group should be small; ODIHR recommends five to six people:
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs representative (International Organizations or Human Rights Department);
- Ministry of Interior Human Rights Department representative;
- Police representative;
- National Training Institution representative;
- Justice Ministry representative; and/or
- Prosecutor's Office representative.

Additionally, the presence of a representative of the Human Rights Commission or Ombudsperson is desirable.

The Role of the Working Group

The Working Group is tasked primarily with:

- providing information and recommendations on the part(s) of the training curriculum that need to be customized for the local context;
- ensuring that issues arising during the course of TAHCLE's delivery and implementation are dealt with effectively;
- co-ordinating follow-up activities after the implementation TAHCLE; and
- defining, together with ODIHR, the parameters for the monitoring and evaluation of the programme.

Other issues or activities the Working Group will be asked to address are:

- reviewing translations with ODIHR of materials to/from English and ensuring the quality of the final materials;
- agreeing with ODIHR on the selection criteria for participants in the training of trainers;
- agreeing on and developing an action plan for cascade training on addressing hate crimes for all levels of the police;
- ensuring the incorporation of the materials developed by ODIHR into the national police curricula (with ODIHR's assistance, when relevant);
- Putting in place a system to record the number and types of training sessions on addressing hate crimes that are delivered based on TAHCLE, and providing ODIHR with this information; and
- Developing a communications and engagement strategy with civil society to create or strengthen partnerships.

ANNEX 4: Sample Agenda of the Training of Trainers

Training of Trainers for Police Responding to and Investigating Hate Crimes: Agenda

Day 1	
09:00 - 09:45	Introduction Pre-evaluation
09:45 - 12:00	
12:00 - 13:00	Lunch
13:00 - 17:00	Presentation of one-day training
17:00 - 19:00	Break
19:00 - 20:00	Dinner
20:00 - 20:45	Discussion of stereotypes and expectations

Day 2	
09:00 - 09:15	Questions or activity
09:15 - 09:30	Principles of adult learning
09:30 - 10:30	Case studies
10:30 - 10:45	Break
10:45 - 11:45	Debrief of training curriculum
11:45 - 12:15	Discussion of difficult training experiences
12:15 - 12:45	Introduction to practice sessions
12:45 - 13:30	Lunch
13:30 - 14:30	Preparation of practice sessions
14:30 - 17:00	Practice session
17:00 - 17:30	Practice session: Introductions to training
17:30 - 18:00	Discussion on issues of communication
18:00 - 18:45	Activity: Personal items

Day 3	
09:00 - 09:15	Questions or activity
09:30 - 10:30	Discussion of difficult questions
10:30 - 12:30	Practice session
12:30 - 13:15	Lunch
13:15 - 13:45	Discussion of logistical issues
13:45 - 14:15	Questions and answers
14:15 - 15:30	Practice session: Case studies
15:30 - 17:00	Closing and evaluation

ANNEX 5: Sample Agenda of the Training of Police

Training for Police Responding to and Investigating Hate Crimes: Agenda

09:00 - 09:15	Introduction
09:15 - 09:30	Assessment and community statements
09:30 - 09:45	Definition of hate crimes
09:45 - 10:15	Hate crimes legislation
10:15 - 10:30	Break
10:30 - 11:00	Exploring diversity
11:00 - 11:30	Impact of hate crimes
11:30 - 12:15	Examining the evidence: Bias indicators
12:15 - 13:00	Lunch break
13:00 - 13:30	Communities most at risk of hate crimes
13:30 - 14:00	Barriers to investigating hate crimes
14:00 - 15:00	Response and investigation
15:00 - 15:15	Break
15:15 - 16:30	Case studies
16:30 - 17:00	Closing and evaluation

ANNEX 6: Sample Table of Contents of the Curriculum

	Module Title	Purpose	Time (minutes)
1	Introduction	 Introduce the trainers Explain the goals of the training Develop ground rules 	15
2	Assessment and community statements	 Assess the extent of bias and prejudice in the local context Understand the extent of degrading language, slurs and jokes used in the local context 	30
3	Definition of hate crimes	• Discuss the specific attributes of hate crimes	15
4	Hate crimes legislation	 Acquire a basic understanding of national hate crime provisions Introduce international and regional obligations 	30
5	Exploring diversity	 Increase awareness about diversity in the group and in society Develop understanding about the impact of bias, prejudice and harassment 	30
6	Impact of hate crimes	 Increase understanding of the harm caused by hate crimes Gather reports on hate- motivated incidents from the participants 	30
7	Examining the evidence: Bias indicators	Define the process for assess- ing evidence of bias motivation	45
8	Communities most at risk of hate crimes	Identify groups that are likely to be the targets of hate crimes	30
9	Barriers to investigating hate crimes	 Identify barriers to investigation Develop strategies to over- come those barriers 	30

10	Response and investigation	 Identify the steps and techniques to provide practical and effective responses to hate crimes Identify and discuss investiga- tive techniques 	60
11	Case studies	Develop and practice skills and strategies to respond to hate crimes	75
12	Closing and evaluation	Fill out the evaluation questionnaireShare feedback on the training	15

Note: The agenda for one-day training on preventing and responding to hate crimes does not contain a module entirely focused on community policing. However, strategies for investigating and responding to hate crimes through effective community policing are contained in 8 of the 12 modules (modules 2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 12).

Annex 7: OSCE Commitments relevant to Hate Crimes

Ministerial Council Decisions on participating States' commitments relating to hate crimes:

- "collect, maintain and make public, reliable data and statistics in sufficient detail on hate crimes and violent manifestations of intolerance, including the numbers of cases reported to law enforcement, the numbers prosecuted and the sentences imposed. Where data-protection laws restrict collection of data on victims, States should consider methods for collecting data in compliance with such laws" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "enact, where appropriate, specific, tailored legislation to combat hate crimes, providing for effective penalties that take into account the gravity of such crimes" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "take appropriate measures to encourage victims to report hate crimes, recognizing that under-reporting of hate crimes prevents States from devising efficient policies. In this regard, explore, as complementary measures, methods for facilitating, the contribution of civil society to combat hate crimes" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "introduce or further develop professional training and capacitybuilding activities for law-enforcement, prosecution and judicial officials dealing with hate crimes" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "in co-operation with relevant actors, explore ways to provide victims of hate crimes with access to counselling, legal and consular assistance as well as effective access to justice" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "promptly investigate hate crimes and ensure that the motives of those convicted of hate crimes are acknowledged and publicly condemned by the relevant authorities and by the political leadership" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "ensure co-operation, where appropriate, at the national and international levels, including with relevant international bodies

- and between police forces, to combat violent organized hate crime" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "conduct awareness raising and education efforts, particularly with law enforcement authorities, directed towards communities and civil society groups that assist victims of hate crimes" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "nominate, if they have not yet done so, a national point of contact on hate crimes to periodically report to the ODIHR reliable information and statistics on hate crimes" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "consider drawing on resources developed by the ODIHR in the area of education, training and awareness raising to ensure a comprehensive approach to the tackling of hate crimes" (MC Decision No. 9/09);
- "increase their efforts, in co-operation with civil society to counter
 the incitement to imminent violence and hate crimes, including
 through the Internet, within the framework of their national legislation, while respecting freedom of expression, and underlines at
 the same time that the opportunities offered by the Internet for the
 promotion of democracy, human rights and tolerance education
 should be fully exploited" (MC Decision No. 10/07);
- "collect and maintain reliable data and statistics on hate crimes and incidents, to train relevant law enforcement officers and to strengthen co-operation with civil society" (MC Decision No. 10/07);
- "facilitate the capacity development of civil society to contribute in monitoring and reporting hate-motivated incidents and to assist victims of hate crime" (MC Decision No. 13/06);
- "collect and maintain reliable data and statistics on hate crimes which are essential for effective policy formulation and appropriate resource allocation in countering hate motivated incidents and, in this context, also invites the participating States to facilitate the capacity development of civil society to contribute in monitoring and reporting hate motivated incidents and to assist victims of hate crimes" (MC Decision No. 13/06);

- "promote capacity-building of law enforcement authorities through training and the development of guidelines on the most effective and appropriate way to respond to bias-motivated crime, to increase a positive interaction between police and victims and to encourage reporting by victims of hate crime, i.e., training for front-line officers, implementation of outreach programmes to improve relations between police and the public and training in providing referrals for victim assistance and protection" (MC Decision No. 13/06);
- "Strengthen efforts to collect and maintain reliable information and statistics on hate crimes and legislation, to report such information periodically to the ODIHR, and to make this information available to the public and to consider drawing on ODIHR assistance in this field, and in this regard, to consider nominating national points of contact on hate crimes to the ODIHR" (MC Decision No. 10/05);
- "Strengthen efforts to provide public officials, and in particular law
 enforcement officers, with appropriate training on responding to
 and preventing hate crimes, and in this regard, to consider setting
 up programmes that provide such training, and to consider drawing on ODIHR expertise in this field and to share best practices"
 (MC Decision No. 10/05);
- "consistently and unequivocally [speak] out against acts and manifestations of hate, particularly in political discourse" (MC Decision No. 10/05);
- "Combat hate crimes which can be fuelled by racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda in the media and on the internet, and appropriately denounce such crimes publicly when they occur" (MC Decision No. 12/04);
- "condemn publicly, at the appropriate level and in the appropriate manner, violent acts motivated by discrimination and intolerance" (MC Decision No. 4/03).