### COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS (Covering Working sessions 1-5)

This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is prepared by working sessions and by what was submitted by delegations / international organizations / civil society to participating States and, separately, to OSCE institutions / field missions or other international organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language of submissions. This compilation contains recommendations from all documents received at the HDIM Documentation Centre by the end of working session 5; documents received after this time will be included later in the consolidated summary. The text below does not reflect the views of the OSCE.

#### Monday, 11 September 2017

#### **Opening Plenary Session**

#### Recommendations to participating States

#### **Russian Federation:**

• ОБСЕ следует уделять значительно больше внимания правам детей. К сожалению, актуальными остаются такие вопросы, как рост насилия, в том числе сексуального, в отношении несовершеннолетних, торговля детьми, в том числе через интернет-биржи, эксплуатация детского труда и детская преступность. Вызывает озабоченность внедрение в ряде стран 7 принудительного просвещения в области сексуальности, которое нередко негативно сказывается на психическом развитии ребенка и идет вразрез с культурными и религиозными убеждениями родителей.

### Working session 1: Fundamental freedoms I, including: - Freedom of expression, free media and information

#### **Recommendations to participating States**

#### **United States of America**

To the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia:

Macedonia has experienced disturbing declines in media freedom in recent years.
Concerns include direct government interference in media content, and in some
cases intimidation by government officials. There has also been a rise in attacks
and harassment. We hope that the political changes in Macedonia will lead to an
improvement in the media environment.

#### To Poland:

Poland's parliament reportedly will consider legislation regulating the media. We
urge the government to ensure any such legislation is in line with its international
obligations and commitments.

#### To Turkmenistan:

 Turkmenistan should accredit members of the international press and take steps to protect domestic journalists.

#### To Ukraine:

• We call on Ukraine to find a way to protect itself that does not undermine its international obligations and commitments or its constitutional principles.

#### Austria

To the participating States:

- Condemn, promptly and unequivocally, all attacks and violence against journalists.
- Demonstrate political commitment to fight impunity by ensuring accountability for crimes committed against journalists.
- Encourage legislators to create national legal frameworks which protect the right to freedom of expression and strengthen a vibrant, pluralistic media environment.
- Acknowledge the specific risks faced by female journalists and its direct impact on media pluralism.
- Recognize the particular risks with regard to safety of journalists in the digital age, including violations of their rights to freedom of expression and privacy.
- Encourage counter-speech and counter-narratives to tackle the pertinent issue of hate speech and intolerance.

#### Estonia/European Union

To the participating States:

- Engage constructively with the RFoM and make use of expertise and recommendations.
- Respect the RFoM mandate and autonomy and provide the RFoM with the necessary resources to fulfil this mandate
- Abide in good faith by their commitments in the area of Freedom of Expression and free media and safety of journalists, and further strengthen the OSCE commitments in this regard.
- Take active steps to prevent and respond to violence and harassment against
  journalists ensuring that all those responsible are brought to justice, paying special
  attention to gender-based threats on-line and offline.
- Devote special attention to the phenomenon of disinformation campaigns. -Respect the freedom of expression and refrain from propaganda for wars of aggression.
- Refrain from unduly and disproportionally restricting freedom of speech, online and offline, and prosecuting critics under the guise of fighting extremism or terrorism.

#### France

 A titre de recommandations, nous invitons les Etats participants à tirer le meilleur parti de la fonction d'assistance du Représentant pour la liberté des médias, pour les accompagner dans la mise en œuvre leurs engagements

#### Lithuania

To the participating States:

 We urge all the OSCE participating States not only to respect the freedom of expression, but also to better cooperate in creating a coherent framework that would allow for sufficient remedies and prevention of violence against them, notably in light of the new challenges, such as widespread disinformation campaigns, restrictions for online media, obstacles faced by the investigative journalists, safety of female journalists, etc.

#### Buergerbewegung PAX EUROPA, Austria

- That participating States and the OSCE return to true and unrestricted freedom of expression and reestablish a marketplace of ideas rather than permitting "licensed speech".
- That participating States, especially those west of Vienna, cease prosecuting individuals with dissenting views.

#### **Belarusian Association of Journalists**

To the participating states:

- Прекратить практику нарушения свободы слова и прав журналистов.
- Ввести в правовое поле работу журналистов-фрилансеров.
- При рассмотрении дел, связанных с реализацией права на свободное выражение мнения, руководствоваться обязательствами, взятыми на себя на международном уровне, в том числе и рамках Организации и сотрудничества в Европу.

#### **Human Rights Vision**

To Tajikistan:

 We urge the government of Tajikistan not to restrict the activities of independent media, stop harassment and intimidation of independent journalists for their professional activities, provide an opportunity for the population of the country without fear, allow access to alternative sources of information, and fulfill the obligations before the international legal contracts regarding freedom of speech.

#### **International Humanist and Ethical Union**

To Central Asian States:

 We urge the governments of the Central Asian states concerned to foster not hinder expression of belief so that an environment of debate, inquiry and tolerance can be fostered. Where such states might be in doubt, we recommend the UN OHCHR Rabat Plan of Action in helping clarify the scope of state obligations on prohibiting incitement to violence, hostility and discrimination whilst maintaining the right to free expression of its citizens.

#### **Human Rights Without Frontiers**

To the European Union:

- the EAW system can only be used for the most serious crimes;
- "wanted person" alerts can only be circulated throughout the EU with its stamp of approval after examination of possible abuses;
- the EU member state requested to hand over a "wanted person" keeps some margin of appreciation in its decision-making process;
- victims of abuse can have access to redress mechanisms through a fair, open and impartial process.

To Romania concerning the case of Alexander Adamescu:

• does not prosecute opposition newspapers because they criticize the authorities;

- ensures the rule of law and fair trials in line with EU standards and values:
- guarantees the independence of the judges; makes sure justice is not misused for political purposes and settlements of scores with opposition leaders and free media:
- cancel the European Arrest Warrant issued against Alexander Adamescu, the owner of Romania Libera

#### **International Partnership for Human Rights (IPHR)**

To participating States:

- Ensure that no one is subjected to arbitrary arrest, criminalization, unwarranted legal proceedings or any other forms of misuse of judicial authority for acts related to their human rights engagement (OSCE Guidelines, article 23).
- In the event that criminal charges are brought against them, ensure that human rights defenders are granted a fair trial before a competent, independent and impartial tribunal, in full accordance with international standards (OSCE Guidelines, article 36).
- Ensure that human rights defenders who are deprived of their liberty are always treated in accordance with international standards, without discrimination of any kind and without being singled out for selective treatment to punish them (OSCE Guidelines, article 34).
- Refrain from engaging in smear campaigns, negative portrayals or the stigmatization of human rights defenders and their work and take proactive steps to counter discrediting of human rights defenders (OSCE Guidelines, article 37).
- Take action, through their diplomatic missions, to support human rights defenders at immediate risk of arbitrary detention, imprisonment and persecution in other states; and raise threats, arbitrary arrests and other serious human rights violations against human rights defenders through appropriate means with the states concerned, for example, in high-level meetings or at international forums (OSCE Guidelines, articles 98 and 99).
- Whenever required, facilitate the issuance of emergency visas and relocation support for individual human rights defenders to allow them to promptly leave the country where they are at risk and to ensure effective protection of their family members (OSCE Guidelines, article 100).

#### Wiener Akademikerbund

To participating States:

- That OSCE participating States focus on protecting freedom of expression as such, for all topics.
- That OSCE participating States abstain from entering into pro-censorship agreements with private corporations.
- That OSCE participating States abstain from forcing private media providers to implement censorship.

#### Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions

#### **Russian Federation**

• Мы призываем исполструктуры ОБСЕ обратить пристальное внимание на нарушения прав российских журналистов, защитить их права и законные интересы, а также пресечь порочную практику «чисток» информационного

пространства от средств массовой информации, неугодных властям тех или иных стран.

#### Buergerbewegung PAX EUROPA, Austria

• BPE calls on the Representative on Freedom on Media to ensure that the truth cannot constitute "hate speech".

#### **International Partnership for Human Rights (IPHR)**

To ODIHR:

• The ODIHR should restore its focal point for human rights defenders and establish an expert panel on the protection of human rights defenders. The ODIHR should study the implementation of the Guidelines on the protection of human rights defenders by participating States in cooperation with civil society, using reports and information from such organizations.

#### To OSCE Chairmanship:

• OSCE Chairmanships should prioritize the protection of civil society space and the security of human rights defenders, similarly to several successive chairmanships.

#### To OSCE:

- OSCE actors should more systematically work with other inter-governmental organizations on the protection of civil society space and the security of human rights defenders.
- OSCE cooperation programmes should feature human rights conditionality. The benchmarks used should include implementation of UN Human Rights Committee views and European Court of Human Rights judgments issued in cases of persecution of civil society activists and human rights defenders.

#### **Legal Media Center**

To OSCE:

• я хочу обратиться к ОБСЕ и другим международных организациям призвать Казахстан не принимать законы, которые могут уничтожить свободу слова в Казахстане.

#### **Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association**

To the OSCE and international organizations:

- To raise the issue of Western Thrace Turkish Minority in terms of fundamental freedoms in the bilateral meetings with Greek authorities.
- To monitor effectively the situation of the Turkish Minority regarding the discrimination and intolerance and also violation of the basic human rights.
- To pay a visit to Western Thrace in order to get first-hand information and to observe objectively through the High Commissioner on National Minorities, the Representative on Freedom of Media and the Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims.

#### Wiener Akademikerbund

To OSCE:

- That OSCE gives "Hate Speech" a clearer and legally workable definition.
- That OSCE scale back subsidies of old media to create a more level playing field.

 That OSCE establishes a working group to identify and counter censorship and discriminatory practices against new media, with the aim to suggest guidelines for protecting new media.

To the OSCE Representative on Freedom of Media:

- And finally, that the OSCE Freedom of the Media representative clarifies that publishing the truth can never constitute "Hate speech".
- And finally, we call upon the OSCE Freedom of the Media Representative to clarify that publishing the truth can never constitute "hate speech", and never be a punishable offense.

#### Tuesday, 12 September 2017

Working session 2: Fundamental freedoms I (continued), including: – Freedom of peaceful assembly and association – National human rights institutions and the role of civil society in the protection of human rights

#### **Recommendations to participating States**

#### **Azerbaijan**

To participating States:

• I call the OSCE, its member states, as well as my colleagues to make decisive efforts and to take actions for restoration of the state borders and territorial integrity of Azerbaijan recognized by UN and for ensuring return of hundred thousand internally displaced persons to their lands.

#### Estonia/European Union

To participating States:

- OSCE participating States must avoid using security concerns as a justification for restricting peaceful assembly when those restrictions are not prescribed by law and consistent with international standards. Participating States must avoid the excessive use of force and the use of pre-emptive detentions when engaging with the organisers and participants of peaceful assemblies.
- Participating States should actively engage with ODIHR in ODIHR's work to monitor peaceful assembly. Participating States should recognise the benefits of systematic monitoring of peaceful assembly, including benefits to the State, the organisers and the participants.
- States should take advantage of tools such as the ODIHR/Venice Commission guidelines on the Freedom of Peaceful Assembly, Freedom of Association and the ODIHR guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders.
- States should allow civil society (meaning both individuals and organisations) the freedom to maintain contacts and cooperate with other individuals and organisations within their own country and abroad, as well as with foreign governments and international organisations.

- Participating States, in accordance with OSCE commitments, must permit
  organisations and individuals associated with them to seek, receive, manage and
  administer financial support from domestic, foreign and international entities
  without undue restrictions.
- Participating States should limit the use of legislation designed to restrict civil society activity and the increasing criminalisation of peaceful activity by individuals from the civil society sector.
- Participating States must respect dissenting views and recognise that human rights defenders face specific risks and are often targets of serious abuses as a result of their human rights work. States must refrain from any act that violates the rights of HRDs, protect HRDs from abuses by third parties, and take proactive steps to promote the full realisation of the rights of HRDs, including specifically the right to defend human rights

#### **Finland**

To participating States:

- Guaranty a free and active participation of civil society and free civil society space, as well as promote cooperation with civil society.
- Guaranty an enabling environment for the work of human rights defenders so that they can work safely and without fear and harassment. Particular attention should be given to women human rights defenders.
- Support and promote the implementation of the Guidelines on the Protection of the Human Rights Defenders published by ODIHR as well as guiding documents on freedom of peaceful assembly.
- Support the work of the OSCE independent institutions and their strong and independent mandates.

#### **ACT for America - Minneapolis**

To the United States of America:

- That police and other authorities clearly differentiate between perpetrators and victims of violence.
- That police effectively protects any peaceful assembly against intimidation, threats and attacks, using any force that may be necessary.
- That violent groups attacking Freedom of Peaceful Assembly be investigated and prosecuted under the law.
- And that it should be made a punishable offense to interrupt peaceful assemblies.

#### **Buergerbewegung Pax Europa**

To Austria:

 BPE ruft den österreichischen Staat auf, sowohl im Hinblick auf die Durchführung behördlicher Genehmigungsverfahren als auch im Hinblick auf den Schutz von Kundgebungen durch die polizeilichen Einsatzkräfte die durchgehende Demonstrationsfreiheit wiederherzustellen.

#### **Election Monitoring and Democracy Studies Center (EMDS)**

To Azerbaijan:

Most of the above-mentioned problems related to the legal framework of civil society organisations are rooted in the NGO legislation. Thus, as a result of this comparative analysis, the following are recommended for elimination of legislative problems of NGOs:

- The length of time for NGO registration procedures should be shortened. The time of NGO registration should be 3 days or close to 5 days, which is required for the registration of commercial entities;
- The requirement of permanent residence for foreigners and stateless persons wishing to establish an NGO should be abolished. The requirement for foreign legal entities to appoint local residents as deputies in the registered NGO should also be abolished.
- The requirement for religious NGOs to acquire permission of the state body regulating the religious entities for registration should be abolished.
- The list of grounds for denial of state registration should be shortened and be more precise. The reasons for denial of state registration should be limited to
  - (a) failure to submit all required documents;
  - (b) non-compliance with the legislation regarding the names of legal entities;
  - (c) inclusion of an activity against the Constitutional order of the state or against democratic society into the objectives of the organisation, stated in its Statutes;
- Groundless restriction for funding of NGOs should be lifted. In particular, the norms and regulations limiting foreign funding and requiring state registration of grants should be lifted. Foreign donors should enjoy same status and equal legal framework with the local donors.
- The scope of the sanctions against NGOs and the power of state authorities in applying sanctions should be limited.
- The number of administrative offences applied to NGOs should be reduced.
- Suspension of activity or termination of NGO should only be applied in the case of serious violations (for examples, if it is established that the founders or managers profit from the revenues of organisation, which are supposed to be spent for noncommercial purposes).
- Imprecise provisions, used as a ground for suspension or termination of NGOs should be lifted from the legislation.

#### **European Association of Jehovah's Christian Witnesses**

To the Government of Azerbaijan:

- Grant full registration to Jehovah's Witnesses in Baku and in other parts of the country
- Stop interfering with their worship and manifestation of belief
- Recognize the right to conscientious objection and provide an alternative civilian service programme conforming to international standards
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses the unhindered use of their religious literature

#### To the Government of Turkmenistan:

- Release Bahram Hemdemov, who was imprisoned for peaceful religious activity
- Permit Jehovah's Witnesses to register their religious organisations in the country
- Recognize the right to conscientious objection to military service and provide for alternative civilian service Allow Jehovah's Witnesses legally to import and share Bibles and their Bible-based literature Ú Terminate illegal searches and seizures of religious literature from homes of believers Ú Stop arresting and prosecuting people for attending peaceful religious gatherings

#### Freedom Now

To Tajikistan:

 We call on Tajikistan to end its repression of political opposition groups and to immediately and unconditionally release all political prisoners in the country

#### **Human Rights Without Frontiers**

To Denmark, EU and OSCE:

To use all the institutional mechanisms at their disposal in order to get:

- the repeal of the ban on Jehovah's Witnesses, Tabligh Jamaat and Said Nursi followers
- the release of Dennis Christensen, who is a citizen of the European Union, as well as Russian Muslims belonging to the Said Nursi and Tabligh Jamaat movements.

To the Russian Federation:

- to implement the last recommendations of the UN Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination of the United Nations about the laws on 'foreign agents' and 'undesirable organizations', and about the definitions of 'extremist activity' and 'extremist material' in the Law Combating Extremism;
- to repeal the ban of peaceful religious groups such as Jehovah's Witnesses, the Tabligh Jamaat and Said Nursi movements;
- to release Dennis Christensen, a Danish Jehovah's Witness who has been put under pretrial detention for at least six months for attending a religious meeting in Oryol;
- to release Tabligh Jamaat and Said Nursi followers who have been sentenced to prison terms for exercising their right to freedom of assembly.

#### Hungarian Helsinki Committee

To participating States:

- Continue monitoring the situation of human rights defenders and independent civil society organisations in Hungary and intensify efforts to empower and support them, including through political, legal and financial assistance.
- Urge the Government of Hungary to fully implement the OSCE Guidelines on the Protection of Human Rights Defenders. Most notably, the government should be urged to refrain from using accusatory and labelling rhetoric against human rights defenders and independent civil society organisations; instead, it should be encouraged to take proactive steps to counter discrediting of human rights defenders and independent civil society organisations by political leaders and in the media.
- Engage with the Government of Hungary to encourage meaningful dialogue between the Government and civil society, in order to ensure that institution-building, development and other programmes are human rights compliant.
- Explore and strengthen non-governmental, alternative sources and means of funding for independent civil society, with a view to ensuring free and nonpoliticized access to funding for all civil society organizations.
- Monitor the impact of legislation as well as other measures and related actions (including communication) by state actors and the media targeting the funding and operations of civil society organisations in Hungary.

#### **International Humanist and Ethical Union**

To the Russian Federation and Kazakhstan:

• We call on Russia to repeal its discriminatory provisions and urge Kazakhstan to halt the process of introducing its 'gay propaganda' and 'foreign agent' laws.

- We call on both states to protect LGBTI persons seeking to associate and assemble from attacks and reprisals through preventive measures and by investigating attacks, prosecuting perpetrators and ensuring remedy for victims.
- Finally, we call for full investigation of all the facts about unlawful repression in Chechnya of LGBTI population, punishment for the guilty parties and an end to the practice of extra-judicial violence and killings in the republic.

#### **International Partnership for Human Rights (IPHR)**

#### To Kazakhstan:

- Stop detaining, prosecuting and imprisoning journalists, human rights defenders, trade union activists and other critical voices in retaliation for their exercise of freedom of expression and other fundamental rights.
- Release all those who have been deprived of their liberty for their independent civic engagement, journalist work or criticism of the authorities and abolish restrictions on the movement and public engagement imposed on individuals prosecuted on such grounds.
- Put an end to the pattern of pressure on independent and opposition-minded media and journalists.
- Refrain from using tax legislation to unduly interfere in and restrict the activities of NGOs, and revise the draft legislation in media and religious activities currently under consideration to ensure that it is consistent with Kazakhstan's international obligations.
- As a matter of priority, reform legislation and law enforcement practice on the conduct of assemblies to bring them into line with international human rights standards, as also called for by international human rights bodies.

#### To Kyrgyzstan:

- Refrain from using hostile and stigmatizing language against independent media and journalists, human rights groups and defenders and others who voice concerns about current policies and criticize those in power, including the president, and ensure that they are not subjected to punitive measures on the grounds of their legitimate activities.
- Abolish the role of the General Prosecutor with respect to initiating legal action to defend the honour and dignity of the president, and ensure that all legal proceedings initiated on this ground are terminated.
- Drop the unfounded criminal charges on inciting inter-ethnic hatred initiated against journalist Ulugbek Babakulov and ensure the safety of his family.
- Fully implement the UN Human Rights Committee's decision in the case of Azimjan Askarov, including by releasing him, quashing his initial conviction and granting him adequate compensation.
- Refrain from imposing blanket bans on holding assemblies in certain locations, and safeguard the right to freedom of assembly in accordance with national and international law. Carry out through, prompt and impartial investigations into any alleged violations of this right.

#### To Uzbekistan:

- Carry out systematic human rights reforms with a view to bringing about concrete improvements.
- Immediately and unconditionally release all those who have been detained solely for peacefully exercising their rights to freedom of expression, association and assembly.

- Put an end to state persecution of human rights defenders, journalists, dissidents and other critical voices and allow them to carry out their activities without intimidation.
- Abolish the use of exit visas in practice and stop restricting the right of former political prisoners and other critical voices to travel abroad for urgent medical treatment and other reasons.
- Enable independent human rights NGOs to register through a simple and uncomplicated procedure and allow them to carry out their work without undue interference.
- Issue invitations to all the UN Special Rapporteurs who have asked for permission to visit the country and constructively cooperate with these experts on the implementation of visits and follow-up on their recommendations.

#### To Tajikistan:

- Take concrete and effective measures to implement the recommendations made by the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of opinion and expression in his final report on his visit to Tajikistan.
- Ensure that media and journalists are not subjected to pressure and can carry out their work without fear and intimidation.
- Put an end to the pattern of arbitrary blocking of news, social media and other
  websites and refrain from conducting invasive surveillance of the internet use of
  residents in violation of international standards.
- Ensure that NGOs are not subjected to undue restrictions and interference in their work.
- Ensure that no lawyer is arrested, charged or imprisoned in retaliation for his or her work; promptly release those held on such grounds.

#### To Turkmenistan:

- Promote media pluralism and put an end to government censorship and interference into the editorial policies of media.
- Promote universal, affordable and unobstructed internet access and refrain from arbitrarily blocking access to websites.
- Stop forcibly dismantling satellite dishes and refrain from measures of intimidation against social media users, RFE/RL listeners and other individuals seeking to obtain information from alternative, foreign sources.
- Stop persecuting independent journalists, civil society activists and other critical voices; carry out thorough investigations into all reported cases of harassment of such individuals with a view to holding the perpetrators accountable; and release all who have been detained on the grounds of exercising their fundamental rights.
- Put an end to the practice of forcibly mobilizing residents for participation in mass events.

#### Legal Resources Centre from Moldova (LRCM)

#### To participating States:

We call on the international community to disapprove all actions that undermine
freedom of association and expression in the republic of Moldova. We also call on
international community to encourage the Moldovan authorities to effectively
uphold the international standards on freedom of association and take effective
actions in developing a robust civil society in Moldova, rather than supress it by
direct and tacit actions.

#### **Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association**

To Greece:

- To respect and implement the 2008 decisions of European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) about the re-opening of "Xanthi Turkish Union".
- To respect and promote the establishment of "The Cultural Association of the Turkish Women of the Region of Rhodopi" and "Evros Minority Youth Association" based on 2008 decision of ECtHR.
- To ensure that the right to freedom of peaceful assembly and association is enjoyed by the whole society, either individually or as group, without discrimination and restriction on the basis of ethnic or social origin.
- To repeal any restrictions on the right to freedom of association discriminating against Turkish Minority.

#### Wiener Akademikerbund

To participating States:

- That OSCE pS' protect peaceful assemblies much more proactively.
- That authorities clearly identify the primary sources of violence.
- That extremist groups such as Antifa be investigated and dissolved under the law.
- And that the OSCE Guidelines be amended to remove the right of "counterdemonstrators" to be close to the demonstration they oppose.

#### **Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions**

#### **Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights**

To ODIHR:

- The ODIHR should restore its focal point for human rights defenders and establish an expert panel on the protection of human rights defenders.
- The ODIHR should study the implementation of the Guidelines on the protection of human rights defenders by participating States in cooperation with civil society, using reports and information from such organisations.

#### To OSCE:

- OSCE actors should more systematically work with other inter-governmental organisations on the protection of civil society space and the security of human rights defenders.
- OSCE cooperation programmes should feature human rights conditionality. The benchmarks used should include implementation of UN Human Rights Committee views and European Court of Human Rights judgments issued in cases of persecution of civil society activists and human rights defenders.

#### Recommendations to the International Organizations

#### Rights and Freedoms of Turkmenistan's citizens

• Международное сообщество должно принять меры и призвать Туркменистан разрешить независимым СМИ свободно работать в Туркменистане.

## Working session 3: Democratic institutions, including: – Democracy at the national, regional and local levels – Democratic elections

#### **Recommendations to participating States**

#### Estonia/European Union

To participating States:

- Participating States shall take all appropriate measures to increase participation of persons belonging to under-represented groups in decision making and political life, in particular, a stronger emphasis should be placed on the involvement of women, youth, and persons belonging to marginalized groups such as national, ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities as well as persons with disabilities,
- We invite participating States to further enhance transparency, accountability and inclusiveness of elections, encourage political pluralism and to make sure that the voters are given a genuine democratic choice;
- Participating States shall ensure adequate conditions for the development of effective local democracy;
- Participating States shall further engage in promoting genuine dialogue with civil society and refrain from imposing unnecessary limitations on activities of the civil society organizations. They shall also enhance efforts to protect human rights defenders from any persecution or infringements on their human rights;
- We encourage the Participating States to actively support freedom of the media, which constitute a prerequisite for credible, inclusive and transparent democratic processes;
- We advocate for a closer cooperation with ODHIR Election Observation Missions (EOMs), i.e. through extending early and unrestricted invitations, which enable ODIHR to conduct a Needs Assessment Mission in a timely manner, as well as through engaging on follow-up activities, especially by implementing ODIHR recommendations and submitting voluntary reports to the OSCE Human Dimension Committee;
- We call on participating States to make sure that ODIHR has sufficient resources to conduct its activities, as well as to continue seconding observers or contributing to the ODIHR's Observation Sustainability Fund;
- We also encourage the participating States to further develop cooperation with the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly in the overall OSCE's work in the field of election observation.

#### **Czech Republic**

To participating States:

• We encourage participating States to increase their contributions to OSCE EOMs.

#### **Election Monitoring and Democracy Studies Center (EMDS)**

To the Government of Azerbaijan:

 The government should demonstrate a political will to improve election legislation in an inclusive process involving discussions with all stakeholders, including civil society.

- In order to create an enabling political environment prior to the 2018 Presidential Elections, the government should lift legal and practical restrictions on fundamental freedoms of 56 The Election Code, Articles 45-47 16 expression, assembly and association, stop persecution of people with dissenting political views and release political prisoners.
- To restore confidence in electoral administration, the Parliament should ensure removal from their posts of members of election commissions, including the Central Election Commission who are linked to violations of election rights recognized in judgments of the European Court of Human Rights.

#### Fund for Development of Parliamentarism in Kazakhstan

To Kazakhstan:

Рекомендации Казахстану по совершенствованию и либерализации законодательства о политических партиях:

- привести законодательство в соответствие с международными стандартами в части создания, регистрации, реорганизации, финансирования и осуществления деятельности политических партий;
- исключить финансирование политических партий юридическими лицами;
- внести в выборное законодательство нормы, регулирующие порядок голосовании за политические партии только по открытым партийным спискам.
- Более того, Казахстану следует законодательное регулирование партийной системы обеспечить соответствующей правоприменительной практикой.

#### **Human Rights Vision**

To Tajikistan:

On behalf of Human Rights Vision Foundation we appeal to Tajikistan authorities to
overturn the laws that contradict to democratic principles; to provide to
representatives of civil society unimpeded access to propose own candidacy for
election of all levels; to provide access to international organizations to
independent monitoring of holding elections in order to provide to international
community the impartial assessment of their legitimacy.

#### **International Humanist and Ethical Union**

To participating States:

• In order for democracy to stand robust and flourish, OSCE participating states need to better engage with the fear and frustration of so many of their citizens; they need to do more to acknowledge and respond to the voters' feeling of dejection, being failed by the state and mainstream parties and better heed their concerns.

#### **Latvian Human Rights Committee**

To Latvia:

- To grant all permanent residents including non-citizens of Latvia, stateless people recognized under 1954 Convention, and citizens of all OSCE participating States the right to vote in local elections;
- To grant citizenship, unconditionally and immediately, to all "non-citizens" under age of 18;
- To simplify and accelerate the naturalization procedure;

- To repeal the provisions for depriving local councillors and MPs of their mandates for allegedly insufficient command of Latvian language;
- To be represented in the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly by people committed to OSCE values and to condemn on the highest level the attacks by politicians on those values;
- To allow all political parties to submit their lists to parliamentary and European elections.
- To adopt without further delay a bill on local referendums, allowing all permanent residents to participate;
- To cancel the prohibition for former activists of legal opposition organisations to run for elections;
- To lower the threshold of signatures needed for popular legislative initiatives;
- To reject the bill No.901/Lp12.

#### Wiener Akademikerbund

To participating States:

- Blasphemy laws and other meaningless regulations be abolished.
- Governments and relevant authorities counter the threat from those promoting Sharia.
- Sovereignty of the people over international conventions be reasserted.

#### **Political Movement "Group 24"**

To participating States:

• Facilitate for civil human rights protectors and freedom fighters everywhere, those who want to establish a real democratic country and survive democratic idea in the mind of people in future.

#### **Promo-LEX Association**

To participating States:

- To concede and support any legal request initiated within the country for the abolition of the mixed voting system and the return to a proportional voting system in Moldova;
- To monitor the implementation of the recommendations of the Venice Commission and OSCE/ODIHR produced in connection with the recently held elections and the amended electoral system in Moldova.

#### Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions

#### **Russian Federation**

To ODIHR:

• БДИПЧ должно одинаково наблюдать за выборами во всех странах ОБСЕ.

#### Ukraine

To ODIHR:

 On behalf of Ukrainian delegation I ask the ODIHR and other election observation missions and organizations to refrain from any observation activity in illegally occupied Crimea.

#### Recommendations to the International Organizations

#### **Election Monitoring and Democracy Studies Center (EMDS)**

- The Secretary General, the Committee of Ministers and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe should examine the implementation of joint recommendations of the Venice Commission and the OSCE/ODIHR on the Election Code of Azerbaijan and the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights, and should exert pressure on the Azerbaijani government to proceed with electoral reforms.
- The Ministerial Council, the Parliamentary Assembly and the Permanent Council of the OSCE should investigate the implementation status of recommendations of the OSCE/ODIHR election observation missions covering elections during 2003-2013 and should encourage Azerbaijani government to closer cooperation with the OSCE/ODIHR.
- The European Commission and the European Parliament should consider the implementation of the recommendations of the Venice Commission and the OSCE/ODIHR as a priority in bilateral discussions with Azerbaijani government.

#### Wednesday, 13 September 2017

# Working session 4: Specifically selected topic: Ensuring equal enjoyment of rights and equal participation in political and public life

#### **Recommendations to participating States**

#### Estonia/European Union

To participating States:

- Ensure equal enjoyment of rights and equal participation of women, persons belonging to marginalized groups or minorities, persons with disabilities and persons in vulnerable situations, including young persons, to participate in political and public life, including through identifying and eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices.
- Support policies, initiatives and effective measures that promote nondiscrimination, inclusiveness and equal access to opportunities, including access to education and training.
- Strengthen regional coordination in efforts to implement the Women, Peace and Security resolutions, including by developing an OSCE- Wide Action Plan on the implementation of the Women, Peace and Security agenda.
- Enhance the OSCE's focus on supporting implementation of UNSCR 1325 and its follow-on resolutions, including through tailored assistance to participating states in development and implementation of national action plans on women, peace and security.
- Continue to implement the OSCE Action Plan on Improving the Situation of Roma and Sinti within the OSCE Area as well as Ministerial Council Decisions 6/08 and

- 4/13, including by addressing practical obstacles to enhanced public and political participation of Roma and Sinti persons, paying particular attention to the effective and equal participation of Roma and Sinti women.
- Find proactive ways to enhance youth political participation and activism, including via new forms of on-line political participation, the inclusion of youth perspective into the political debate and a strengthened role of youth in the promotion of democracy, human rights and fundamental freedoms.

#### Ukraine

To the Russian Federation:

- We demand from the Russian authorities to immediately halt persecution of the Ukrainians and their institutions, including state-owned, which promote Ukrainian culture in the territory of the Russian Federation. Such steps would signal willingness to comply with international obligations on human rights and the rights of persons belonging to national minorities, including their cultural, educational and linguistic rights.
- We encourage the OSCE and its institutions to give immediate attention to these worrying trends and assist the Russian Federation to fully comply with relevant OSCE commitments on national minorities.

#### Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

To Greece:

• We call upon the Greek State to take all necessary steps in line with the international standards in order to ensure the effective and full participation of the Turkish Minority of Western Thrace to the political life in Greece and to withdraw the 3% electoral threshold.

#### Wiener Akademikerbund

To participating States:

- Religious organisations working against democracy be recategorized as political
- Efforts to replace constitutional law with Sharia be considered a punishable offense
- Foreign preachers advocating non-constitutional law shall not be granted religious status.

#### Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions

### **International Platform Global Rights of Peaceful People** To OSCE:

• Наша международная платформа «Глобальные Права Мирных Людей» требует у ОБСЕ провести специальное расследование, чтобы прекратить геноцид Левых Сил, обеспечить равное осуществление прав и участие в политической жизни всех партий и общественных организаций на Украине

#### Recommendations to the International Organizations

#### **Eurasian Dialogue**

 The time has come for the UN, the OSCE and the guarantor states of the Tajik Peace Agreements to assist the Tajik government and moderate political opposition in seeking peaceful coexistence;

- To allow international observers and lawyers to provide legal assistance to detainees and convicts of representatives of the Islamic Renaissance Party of Tajikistan and their lawyers in reviewing their cases;
- We urge the Office of the High Commissioner for Refugees of the United Nations draw attention to the situation of the supporters of former United Tajik Opposition, the Islamic Renaissance Party of Tajikistan and other opposition parties and movements.

# Working session 5: Specifically selected topic: Ensuring equal enjoyment of rights and equal participation in political and public life (continued)

#### **Recommendations to participating States**

#### **Holy See**

To participating States:

• that participating States continue their implementation of the Ministerial Council Decision 3/13 on Freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief;

#### Ukraine

To the Russian Federation:

We urge Russia, as an occupying power, to take responsibility for stopping all
human rights violations on the peninsula and to facilitate free and unconditional
access of the international monitors to Crimea. We urge Russia to reverse the
illegal occupation of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol
which are an integral part of the sovereign territory of Ukraine.

#### **Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions**

#### **Holy See**

To ODIHR:

• that ODIHR consider elaborating a compendium of States' best practices on engaging with religions in public debate.

#### Ukraine

 we call on the OSCE Chairmanship and the OSCE Institutions – HCNM, ODIHR and RFoM - to use all assets at their disposal for distant monitoring, documentation and reaction to human rights situation in the illegally occupied Crimea.