

COMPILATION OF WRITTEN RECOMMENDATIONS
(Covering Working sessions 10-11)

This compilation contains recommendations submitted to the HDIM Documentation Centre in accordance with the established procedure. The compilation is organized by working sessions and by what was submitted by delegations / international organizations / civil society to participating States and, separately, to OSCE institutions / field missions or other international organizations. Recommendations are compiled in original language. This compilation contains recommendations from all documents received at the HDIM Documentation Centre by the end of working session 11; documents received after this time will be included later in the consolidated summary.

Monday, 26 September 2016

Working session 10: Tolerance and non-discrimination I, including address by the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities

[Recommendations to participating States](#)

United Kingdom

To participating States:

- Work together, in the spirit of consensus, to agree upon a suitably qualified and able successor to Astrid Thors to take forward this important work without further delay.

Analytical Center on Interethnic Cooperation and Consultations

To Georgia:

- we recommend to the government of Georgia to ensure full compliance to the obligations undertaken by the country within the OSCE Human Dimension framework and en-sure protection for the minorities in the country

Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

To Greece:

- We call upon Greece to restore the educational autonomy of the Turkish minority of Western Thrace. We request from Greek authorities to establish bilingual minority kindergartens in Western Thrace in line with the minority schooling system and allow the Turkish Minority to establish private kindergartens where the language of education will be in Turkish and Greek.

Legal Information Centre for Human Rights

To Estonia and Latvia:

- Власти Эстонии и Латвии должны обеспечить в самое ближайшее время на законодательном уровне предоставления гражданства своей страны без каких-

либо условий и ограничений всем проживающим на их территориях постоянным жителям лицам без гражданства.

- До полного решения проблемы безгражданства власти Эстонии должны обеспечить на законодательном уровне право на защиту представительства Эстонии в иностранном государстве всем негражданам – обладателям эстонского паспорта иностранца.

To participating States:

- В государствах при отсутствии процедур признания лицом без гражданства необходимо на законодательном уровне установить упрощенный порядок признания лицом без гражданства, предусматривающий выдачу необходимых документов удостоверения личности.

To the Russian Federation:

- Хочется надеется, что до решения проблемы безгражданства в Латвии и Эстонии власти России в ближайшее время рассмотрят вопрос упрощения визового порядка посещения страны для всех лиц без гражданства, проживающих в этих странах Балтии.

National Association “Northern Epirus 1914”

To Albania:

- We demand the implementation of the Protocol of Corfu that Albania signed in 1914 which offers us autonomy, as well as the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities so that the Ethnic Greek Minority of Northern Epirus in Albania will be efficiently protected.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

To Greece:

- we call upon the Greek State to have a concrete and constructive dialogue with the Turkish Minority representatives.

To participating States:

- we call upon the OSCE Participating States to monitor Greek implementations of the OSCE commitments.

[Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions](#)

Ahiska Turkish American Council

To OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities:

- В связи с вышеизложенными пунктами хотим обратиться к Верховному комиссару ОБСЕ по национальным меньшинствам с просьбой создать группу с участием правозащитников из России и Грузии, экспертов по проблемам малочисленных народов и представителей Ахыска турок с целью мониторинга положения нашего народа на юге России и выполнения Грузией обязательств по репатриации турок-месхитинцев.

Analytical Center on Interethnic Cooperation and Consultations

To OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities

- We recommend to the OSCE High Commissioner on National minorities to continue its monitoring and outreach work in the country and reinforce ties with the ethnic minority CSOs.

Salut et Miséricorde

To ODIHR:

- L'association Salut et Miséricorde demande à ce que l'ODIHR demande à l'ONU l'institution d'une commission chargée de lister au vu de leur élimination tous les nouveaux droits ne défendent pas la nature humaine, mais seulement des phantasmes personnels

Western Thracian Minority University Graduates Association

To OSCE High Commissioner for National Minorities

- We would like to repeat once more that we will be honored if a fact finding mission of OSCE High Commission on National Minorities pay a visit to Western Thrace.

Monday, 26 September 2016

Working session 11: Tolerance and non-discrimination I (continued), including prevention and responses to hate crimes in the OSCE area, and combating racism, xenophobia and discrimination, also focusing on intolerance on religious grounds

Recommendations to the participating States

United Kingdom

To participating States:

- We call on participating States to work with ODIHR to: improve hate crime recording; by creating a climate where victims feel able to report it.

Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

To participating States:

- Commit to (a) recording of Islamophobia as a category of hate crime by all police, (b) working with social media companies to protect free speech while developing good guidelines to tackle hate speech online (c) consider primary legislation to deal with social media offences and hate speech online.
- Commit to developing teaching materials to educate young people on Islamophobia, racism and anti-Semitism; to fund projects to promote educational programmes on Islam awareness; to prioritise religious education in the national curriculum to prepare young people for life in a religiously plural society.
- Commit to tackling religious discrimination in the workplace and address the low level of economic activity among Muslims through targeted interventions at stages of

recruitment, retention and promotion; improving access to employment for Muslim women.

- Commit to support the adoption of the EU Equal Treatment Directive to advance protection against discrimination on the grounds of religion to education, healthcare, housing, access to goods and services and social protection.
- Commit to preserving the Human Rights Act and the protection of minority rights including rights to religious slaughter, circumcision and wearing of religious dress or symbols.
- Commit to curbing the encroachment of counter-terrorism policies on civil liberties by working with Muslim communities not against them in the so-called `de-radicalisation` programmes;
- Commit to democracy and human rights promotion abroad, including the rights of religious minorities.
- It is still an urgent call that participating States should ensure implementation of OSCE Ministerial Decisions. We should reassess what capacity-building activities have been implemented for law-enforcement, prosecution and judicial officials dealing with anti-Muslim hate crimes and discrimination.

ACT for America – Minneapolis Chapter

To the United States of America:

- Recommends that the US authorities recognize the CVE (Countering Violent Extremism strategy) is not working, and apply an analytical approach to identifying the nature of security threats.

ADF International

To participating States:

- ADF International further calls on Participating States to repeal vaguely worded “hate speech” laws, and ensure that adequate safeguards against abuse of restrictions on freedom of expression are established, to ensure a free exchange in the marketplace of ideas.

Atheist Ireland

To participating States:

- We further recommend that you tackle prejudice-motivated crime against ex-Muslim atheists, and against Ahmadiyya Muslims.
- We recommend that genitally mutilating girls, and forcing women to wear specific clothing, be treated as prejudice-motivated crimes based on religion and gender.

To Ireland:

- We recommend that Ireland removes the blasphemy law and religious oaths, and obliges publicly funded schools to deliver all services, including employment, state curriculum and enrolment, in an objective, critical and pluralistic manner, and with no religious discrimination of any kind.

B'nai B'rith International

To participating States:

- We must continue to affirm commitments made at the landmark 2004 conference and reiterated at subsequent conferences and assess the implementation of those commitments.
- We must enhance funding for ODIHR's Tolerance and Non-Discrimination unit, which has now become a fixed and integral part of the OSCE's work. We must enable the TND unit to sustain and expand its critical activities, which include educational programs on anti-Semitism in more than a dozen countries.
- We must extend, for the foreseeable future, the terms of the three personal representatives on intolerance.
- Participating States must fulfil their reporting requirements with respect to hate crimes data. Far too few governments have done so until now.
- Finally, we must strongly reinforce the crucial principle declared at the 2004 Berlin Conference – That no political position, cause or grievance can ever justify anti-Semitism – and make clear that the demonization and delegitimization of the Jewish state is often none other than a pretext for the hatred of Jews themselves.

Buergerbewegung (Citizens' Movement) PAX EUROPA e.V.

To participating States:

- BPE calls on participating States to refrain from shackling freedom of expression by official censorship, which is disguised by charges of hate speech and which is imposed by governments, police and courts.
- BPE recommends that a clear and just definition of the term "hate speech" be provided by ODIHR and participating States, as this would improve general acceptance of the concept. If this cannot be achieved then the concept of hate speech must be abandoned altogether

East European Security Research Initiative Foundation (EESRI)

To the participating States of the OSCE:

- Increasing efforts on implementation of the OSCE Ministerial Council's Decision No.9/09 of 2009 on combating hate crimes;
- Taking effective measures to prevent the usage of intolerant and hate speech in political agitation and propaganda; providing proper response to the relevant violations of the international and national legislation;
- Providing full support to the activities of the Office for democratic Institutions and Human Rights in preventing hate crimes; providing full support and access to own territory to the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities;
- Improving identifying and recording of the hate crimes and regular submitting of the relevant data to the ODIHR;
- Paying proper attention to the Russia's responsibility for the human rights violations. Including the hate crimes, in the illegally annexed Crimea and de-facto occupied territories in the Donetsk and Luhansk regions.

European Association of Jehovah's Christian Witnesses

request the authorities in the Donetsk and Luhansk regions of Ukraine to:

- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to carry out their worship peacefully, including their volunteer community service of talking to their neighbours about God's Word
- Allow Jehovah's Witnesses to assemble peacefully for worship
- Return all illegally seized Kingdom Halls (houses of worship)
- Legally register the activity of Jehovah's Witnesses, in harmony with the European Convention on Human Rights
- Legally register the activity of Jehovah's Witnesses, in harmony with the European Convention on Human Rights

request the government of Ukraine to:

- Prosecute vandals and hooligans who attack their houses of worship and harass and harm our members during their religious activity
- Lift the unconstitutional provision of Article 21(5) of the Law of Ukraine "On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Organizations" to allow renting of community facilities for religious meetings

European Forum of Muslim Women EFOMW

To participating States:

- We hence urge all the present country delegations to take heed of the issue of increased institutionalized discriminations through public discourses, more pressingly in countries such as France where it has become rampant, and to take the available means to hold such countries accountable to their commitment to fundamental rights.
- We hence urge all the present country delegations to acknowledge institutionalized discriminations and to hold such countries accountable to their commitment to fundamental rights.
- We urge all States to protect the rights of all women, including Muslim women, in their freedom of expression, of thought and of religion.

European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion (EMISCO)

To participating States:

- Encourage political leaders and public figures to speak out strongly and promptly when anti-Muslim incidents occur as well as for other majority religions;
- Re-define European values through an inclusive, pluralistic approach based on a Reflexive VIRTUE ethics that acknowledges the fruitful historical interaction between Judeo-Christian and Muslim values in order to move towards a more inclusive definition of what Europe stands for today;
- Introduce a new contract between governments, majority societies, and all ethnic and religious minorities, based on this re-defined discourse about "Western values".
- Take steps to effectively address intolerance against Muslims in the OSCE area, both in preventing and responding to incidents by implementing concrete measures in every level;
- Implement existing OSCE commitments related to monitoring hate crime and collecting relevant data on incidents targeting Muslim communities, ensuring that data is disaggregated to show specific bias motivations related to religion;
- Ensure that security measures and anti-terrorism efforts are not directed at any specific ethnic, religious or cultural group, in their design, implementation or impact;
- Collaborate with local civil society groups, and Muslim communities, through effective partnerships and strengthened dialogue to address intolerance, discrimination and to

promote mutual respect and understanding.

- Encourage cultural and religious diversity in public debates, as well as in consultations during important legislative initiatives;
- Make progress in intercultural and interreligious education as recommended in the Council of Europe Reference Book on Religious Diversity and Intercultural Education published in 2007 in line with the European Cultural Convention (1954) (ETS No. 18) which underlines the need for education to develop mutual understanding between peoples.

Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

To Greece:

- We request from the Greek Government to take result-oriented measures for eliminating discrimination and hate speech against the Minority and to improve diversity throughout the system by eliminating prejudices and to develop strategies that are inclusive of minorities which would be part of an overall governmental policy for the promotion and protection of minority rights in the country.

“Giuseppe Dossetti” Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

To participating States:

- record carefully hate crimes committed against religious properties.
- provide disaggregated data on hate crimes, paying more attention to the hate crimes against Christians – also where they are majority – in the questionnaire collecting data from national data collection point.
- compile and publish a national report on hate crimes.
- request the assistance of the OSCE/ODIHR in order to implement TACHLE and PAHCT at national level.
- develop training programs on hate crimes for public officials and law enforcement agencies operating at local level.
- adopt national action plan in order to prevent and respond to hate crimes

Human Rights Without Frontiers

To the Russian Federation:

- To put a moratorium on the implementation of the Yarovaya Law which restricts missionary activities and has already been used to criminalize activities of non-Orthodox religions and their members;
- To take into consideration the 100,000 signatures gathered by an online petition posted on the state-owned portal of "Russian Public Initiative" (RPI) and directed against "Yarovaya's package of laws;"
- To have the Yarovaya Law assessed by the Venice Commission of the Council of Europe.

Latvian Human Rights Committee

Recommendations for Latvia:

- To restore the network of minority schools and use of minority languages as languages of instruction. To differentiate Latvian language exam requirements for Latvian-only and minority (bilingual) schools.

- To grant voting rights to permanently resident “non-citizens” (and other permanent residents) in local elections. To simplify naturalization and to allow judicial review for all refusals to naturalise. To ensure automatic registration of newborn children of “non-citizens” as citizens of Latvia.
- To lower Latvian language requirements for local councillors so as not to interfere with popular choice and not to hinder minority participation in public life in Eastern Latvia.
- To allow “non-citizens” to work as notaries. To equate their rights to pensions with those of citizens.
- -To allow use of minority languages in daily communication with local authorities, and to allow writing personal names in identity documents without Latvian-language gender endings and with those double consonants not doubled in Latvian.
- To condemn discourses: a) honouring those having collaborated with Nazi Germany; b) equating phenomenon of refugees to terrorism threats.
- To raise both the benefits for refugees and the minimal pension.
- To adopt a comprehensive anti-discrimination law. In the meantime: to add anti-discrimination provisions to the Law on Residential Tenancy; to include language, sexual orientation and gender identity in the lists of grounds of discrimination prohibited in the Education Law, Law on the Rights of Patients, Consumer Rights Protection Law and Law on Social Security.
- To allow submitting individual complaints under CEDAW and ICERD. To join the protocol to the Convention against Discrimination in Education.

Legal Information Centre for Human Rights

To Latvia and Estonia:

- Властям Латвии и Эстонии отменить пресловутые «40 на 60» в системе образования на русском языке в школах и гимназиях и обеспечить в детских учебных заведениях для детей представителей русскоязычного сообщества образование на родном русском языке в соответствии с нормами международного права по недопущению дискриминации и соблюдению культурных, религиозных и языковых прав меньшинств, в частности, с Международным пактом о гражданских и политических правах (ст. 26 и 27).
- Министерству образования и науки Эстонии, учитывая выводы и рекомендации результатов добросовестно проведённых независимых исследований результатов проводимой реформы школьного образования, разработать стратегию образования в сотрудничестве с руководителями и педагогами де-факто русских школ; подготовить и внедрить эффективные программы обучения эстонскому языку, методике и учебники.
- Создать институцию на государственном уровне по обращению жителей по проблемам дискриминации и неравного обращения и создать государственный механизм эффективного решения этих проблем, в том числе и в сотрудничестве с неправительственными организациями.
- Повсеместно обеспечить государственную поддержку НПО, оказывающим защиту пострадавшим от дискриминации лицам, независимо от их национальной принадлежности.

NGO Public Advocacy

To Ukraine:

- Содействовать повышению эффективности реагирования полиции на преступления на почве ненависти, в частности путем разработки и принятия специальных разъяснений органам, ответственным за поддержание правопорядка, - о необходимости тщательного расследования правонарушений на почве ненависти по религиозному признаку;
- Обеспечить понимание органами местной власти необходимости воздерживаться от необоснованного вмешательства в межконфессиональные отношения, в особенности путем поддержки одной стороны конфликта;
- Содействовать неукоснительному исполнению принципа верховенства закона, признав необходимым во всех случаях перехода прав на объекты спорного имущества использовать только юридические процедуры, рекомендуя и разъясняя участникам конфликтов право обращения в суд и в особенности акцентируя их внимание на необходимости принудительного выселения или передачи имущества от одного лица другому только специально уполномоченными органами, исключая любые случаи самоуправства, ведущие к столкновениям и насилию;
- Устранить любые предпосылки неравного и предвзятого отношения к верующим УПЦ и юридическим лицам относящимся к юрисдикции УПЦ, привлекая к административной, а при наличии оснований - к уголовной ответственности лиц, виновных в разжигании религиозной вражды;
- В ближайшее время разработать на основе стандартов БДИПЧ и ОБСЕ законопроекты и подзаконные акты специального законодательства о предотвращении преступлений и речей ненависти, направленных на дискриминацию по религиозному признаку;
- Приложить все возможные усилия для создания, как это предусмотрено методическими рекомендациями ОБСЕ БДИПЧ, - комитетов и специальных групп, содействующих сближению полиции, органов власти и местного сообщества с целью предотвращения вражды, речей и преступлений ненависти;
- Обратить внимание медийного сообщества на необходимость соблюдения профессиональных этических правил и норм, ограничивая высказывания, способствующие разжиганию вражды на религиозной почве;
- Признать полезным и продолжить практику примирительных и медиативных процедур, с участием миссии СММ ОБСЕ между представителями конфессий с целью предотвращения конфликтов.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

To participating States:

- Provide disaggregated data on hate crimes, paying due attention to hate crimes against Christians in all areas, including where they are majority.
- Register religious affiliation of refugees and asylum seekers at reception centres.
- Declare the systematic targeting and killing of Christians and other religious minorities in Iraq and Syria genocide.
- Recognise the special status of Christians and other religious minorities, and receive refugees and asylum seekers from alternate channels, instead of solely from UNHCR camps.

- Train and educate police, social welfare office staff, and accommodation security on the topic of religiously motivated conflict.
- Improve the balance in ethnic/religious composition of refugees, as well as staff, security, and translators in asylum centres, and remove offending staff in incidents of religiously-motivated bias or violence.
- Permit anonymous reporting of religiously-motivated incidents, protect whistleblowers, remove perpetrators from accommodations, and deport violent offenders.
- Support private accommodations for Christians. As a last resort or temporary measure, in the absence of the above-mentioned protections, establish separate accommodations for Christian refugees.
- Compile and publish a national report on hate crimes, including against Christians.
- Develop training programs on hate crimes for public officials and law enforcement agencies operating at local level.
- Adopt national action plans in order to prevent and effectively respond to hate crimes.

Order of St. Andrew

To Turkey

- First, the Government of Turkey should reopen and extend the August 27, 2012 Decree deadline for the submission of applications to recover seized property, which did not give applicants sufficient time to respond. The Decree should be expanded to include all seized properties that were excluded. The Government should also revamp the manner by which the Decree is implemented. A Public Advocate, who is not a Government bureaucrat, should be employed to ensure that the Decree is implemented in a fair and expeditious manner.
- Second, the Government of Turkey should allow the Halki School of Theology to reopen and operate with its own theologians and in a manner consistent with its own Christian beliefs.
- Third, the Government of Turkey should refrain from interfering in the internal affairs of the Ecumenical Patriarchate. The 1923 and 1970 directives of the local Istanbul Government, relating to the citizenship of those who are entitled to vote for, or be elected as, a new Ecumenical Patriarch, should be rescinded.
- Fourth, the Government of Turkey should desist from its recent policy of converting museums which were historic Christian sites into mosques, as there is no overriding need for additional mosques in such locations, and the policy is an affront to harmony among religious groups.

Religious Society Path Guru Jara

To Czech Republic:

- to issue a new passport to Jaroslav Dobes and Barbora Plaskova, detained for being undocumented at the Immigration Detention Center of Manila in the Philippines since spring 2015 because the Czech embassy withdrew their passport;
- to take into consideration the cancellation of the sentence to a prison term of Jaroslav Dobes and Barbora Plaskova by the High Court of Olomouc and the ensuing presumption of innocence;
- to actively resolve the case of Guru Jara and Barbora Plaskova in a timely matter, with diplomacy and respect for basic human rights, the presumption of innocence and the Geneva Convention;

- to actively support and protect religious diversity and tolerance in Czech society, and to prosecute cases of hate speech or hate crimes;

SOVA Center for Information and Analysis

For the OSCE Participating States

- Change the crime reporting system so that suspected hate motive could be recorded at any stage, including the earliest one. Specialized police units are more effective in investigating hate crimes, but regular police should conduct such investigations as well.
- Publish hate crime statistics, highlighting the different types, regions, and number of victims. Official statistics should be based both on court decisions (for both proven and unproven cases), and on the number of opened criminal cases.
- More actively use the information collected by non-governmental organizations that perform systematic monitoring of racist groups, and consult NGOs on law enforcement issues. Despite methodological, and even political, differences, such cooperation can be very productive.
- Take statements from victims of suspected hate crimes also at mediation with such NGOs and specialized public authorities, dealing with discrimination problems.
- Adjust the legislative framework covering hate crimes and related activities, including public incitement, organizing, financing, etc. Legislation should focus law enforcement efforts, first and foremost, on prosecuting the most dangerous crimes against the person. The internal policies and regulations of law enforcement agencies should reflect the same priorities.
- To give an evaluation to the national laws on incitement to hatred and their implementation, with reference to the Rabat Action Plan, adopted by UN Human Rights Council in 2013.
- There is a need to adopt and develop comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation or a series of individual acts containing effective rules and procedures of proving discrimination
- Public officials should have no right to express publicly their intolerance or even disrespect to any minorities. Civil service legislation should include effective sanctions against such actions. These penalties also need be made public.

Thinkout

To participating States:

- Encourager les acteurs politiques a lutter efficacement contre le terrorisme;
- Encourager, soutenir le dialogue et la coopération avec les ONG ;
- Encourager le dialogue interculturel et interreligieux au sein de débat public

Unconstrained Analytics, Inc

To participating States:

- Unconstrained Analytics recommends that the OSCE and all participating States rethink the narratives they are so casually putting in motion on the assumption that 'we all know what it means' when what it appears to mean is the suppression of dissent through intimidation under color of state authority.

Western Thrace Minority University Graduates Association

To Greece:

- To take urgent measures to eliminate attacks targeting Muslim Turkish minority as well as other non-Greek ethnic origin inhabitants of Greece.
- To arrest those who are responsible for the hate motivated attacks and crimes against the Turkish Minority and its foundations.

[Recommendations to the OSCE Institutions](#)

Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims

To OSCE Chairmanship:

- We also hope and expect that the current Chairmanship and the next Chairmanship uses its power to secure a stable budget to support activities on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.

ACT for America – Minneapolis Chapter

To OSCE:

- Jihad (which Islamic law defines as warfare against non-Muslims) be included in the OSCE guidelines as a hate crime.
- That OSCE recognize jihad as part of an attempt to replace democratic law with shariah, and thus, an assault of the freedoms of non-Muslims as well.

ADF International

To OSCE:

- ADF International strongly urges the OSCE to restate the foundational importance of freedom of expression, particularly as applied to undesirable ideas and minority opinions.

Atheist Ireland

To OSCE:

- We recommend that the OSCE promotes the separation of the State from either religion or atheism, as the foundation of protecting everybody equally.

Buergerbewegung (Citizens' Movement) PAX EUROPA e.V.

To OSCE:

- BPE recommends that the words “hate” and “hatred” be abandoned by all official OSCE organs and in all OSCE publications.
- BPE recommends that a clear and just definition of the term “hate speech” be provided by ODIHR and participating States, as this would improve general acceptance of the concept. If this cannot be achieved then the concept of hate speech must be abandoned altogether.

East European Security Research Initiative Foundation (EESRI)

To the OSCE Secretary General:

- Elaborating measures to provide access of the OSCE monitoring missions to the whole territory of Ukraine, including the Crimea and Donbas;

- Calling on Russia to fulfil its international commitments, to stop preventing the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities from access to the illegally annexed Crimean peninsula, and to stop discrimination of the Crimean Tatar and Ukrainian-speaking communities in the Crimea and Donbas;
- Facilitating exchange of experience among the OSCE participating States on prevention and responses to hate crimes and combating racism, xenophobia and discrimination.

To the ODIHR:

- Elaborating measures to organise regular monitoring and reporting on human rights situation in the annexed Crimea and de-facto occupied territories in the Donetsk and Luhansk regions;
- Appointing a special rapporteur on the cases of intolerance, discrimination and hate crimes committed in the Crimea and Donbas;
- Supporting regional, subregional and national initiatives on monitoring and protecting human rights, including the issues of tolerance and non-discrimination;
- Providing assistance to Ukrainian public authorities to further improve the legislation in the sphere of combating hate crimes, racism, xenophobia and discrimination.

European Muslim Initiative for Social Cohesion (EMISCO)

To the OSCE:

- Given new challenges, OSCE political bodies and institutions should draft new, consolidated and deepened commitments on fighting the manifestations of direct and indirect Islamophobia experienced by Muslim communities, based on best practices and decisions of international human rights bodies, including opinions of the UN Human Rights Committee and jurisprudence of ECHR over the last decade. This work should be taken forward in the framework of Helsinki+40 process;
- OSCE should move beyond a focus on discrimination based on race/ ethnicity and expand the focus on discrimination based on religion. Discussion of Islamophobia should be more visible and institutionalized.
- OSCE terminology used in the field of religious discrimination should be updated and refined to bring it in line with the most progressive approaches.
- The OSCE/ODIHR unit dealing with Islamophobia should be strengthened.¹
- OSCE political bodies and institutions should strengthen cooperation with other relevant intergovernmental bodies addressing the issues of Islamophobia - for example, EU Commission's coordinator relating to Islamophobia, newly established initiative to deal with Islamophobia in the EU Parliament, EU Fundamental Rights Agency, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance – ECRI , UN special rapporteur on Islamophobia, etc.
- OSCE political bodies and institutions should urge participating States to provide funding for independent civil society groups among Muslim communities working on issues of Islamophobia.

To OSCE Chairmanship:

- The OSCE Chairmanship should publicly and consistently uphold the position that religious beliefs or traditional values cannot serve as justification for hate crimes against Muslims.

¹ Note from ODIHR: OSCE/ODIHR Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department

To ODIHR:

- Facilitate open discussion and constructive dialogue among and between government officials, civil society, and religious or belief communities with the aim of implementing OSCE commitments on the freedom of thought, conscience, religion or belief;
- Highlight patterns on intolerance and discrimination against Muslims, in order to better understand and proactively address intolerance and discrimination against Muslims;
- Foster broad civil society co-operations, and the sharing of best practices among stakeholders, on educational initiatives, as well as other measures to raise awareness of intolerance against Muslims;
- ODIHR should develop and promote new guidelines for combating and preventing hate crimes against Muslims, including legislation, systems of registration and collection of statistical data on hate crimes, assistance to victims, etc., based on best practices and decisions of international human rights bodies, including decisions of the UN Committee for Human Rights and jurisprudence of ECHR over the last decade.
- Presentation of ODIHR's annual report on Islamophobia and its discussion by participating States should be included in the agenda of the Permanent Council and Human Dimension Committee.²

Federation of Western Thrace Turks in Europe

To OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities:

- We kindly request OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities Ms. Astrid Thors and her Office to pay greater attention to the risk of escalation of tensions in the region of Western Thrace in Greece.

Foundation for Research and Support of the Indigenous Peoples Crimea

To OSCE:

- Органам, должностным лицам и экспертам ОБСЕ, таким образом, следует уделять особое внимание терминологии применительно к отдельным категориям населения Украины, имеющим гарантированные ООН коллективные права коренных народов и использовать при этом исключительно терминологию, закрепленную в Декларации ООН о правах коренных народов и в иных универсальных актах международного права.

"Giuseppe Dossetti" Observatory for Religious Tolerance and Freedom

To ODIHR:

- Develop and strengthen capacity building activities with regard to the protection of religious properties, including the Christian ones.
- Train law enforcement agencies, media and civil society to consider carefully also the hate crimes perpetrated against majority groups.
- Develop Guidelines for educators on countering intolerance and discrimination against Christians.

To the Chairmanship-in-Office:

- consult closely with the Personal Representatives and support their work.
- appoint a fourth Personal Representative on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against the members of

² Note from ODIHR: OSCE/ODIHR publishes only Annual Hate Crime Report (available at: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/>)

other religious communities and against Roma and Sinti, in order to focus one Personal Representative's mandate on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians.

To the Personal Representatives of the Chairmanship-in-Office:

- focus on, and adopt a standardized approach to, country visits and subsequent reports. Intervene when incidents do occur, through public statements and engagement with authorities of relevant participating States.

International Association of Independent Democrats Against Authoritarian Regimes

TO ODIHR:

- Мы просим ОБСЕ-БДИПЧ не делать упор на дискриминации по признаку веры, существует огромное число дискриминаций по другим базовым Правам Человека. Просим также обсуждать и такие примеры.

NGO Public Advocacy

To OSCE:

- Содействовать повышению эффективности реагирования полиции на преступления на почве ненависти, в частности путем разработки и принятия специальных разъяснений органам, ответственным за поддержание правопорядка, - о необходимости тщательного расследования правонарушений на почве ненависти по религиозному признаку;
- Обеспечить понимание органами местной власти необходимости воздерживаться от необоснованного вмешательства в межконфессиональные отношения, в особенности путем поддержки одной стороны конфликта;
- Содействовать неукоснительному исполнению принципа верховенства закона, признав необходимым во всех случаях перехода прав на объекты спорного имущества использовать только юридические процедуры, рекомендуя и разъясняя участникам конфликтов право обращения в суд и в особенности акцентируя их внимание на необходимости принудительного выселения или передачи имущества от одного лица другому только специально уполномоченными органами, исключая любые случаи самоуправства, ведущие к столкновениям и насилию;
- Устранить любые предпосылки неравного и предвзятого отношения к верующим УПЦ и юридическим лицам относящимся к юрисдикции УПЦ, привлекая к административной, а при наличии оснований - к уголовной ответственности лиц, виновных в разжигании религиозной вражды;
- В ближайшее время разработать на основе стандартов БДИПЧ и ОБСЕ законопроекты и подзаконные акты специального законодательства о предотвращении преступлений и речей ненависти, направленных на дискриминацию по религиозному признаку;
- Приложить все возможные усилия для создания, как это предусмотрено методическими рекомендациями ОБСЕ БДИПЧ, - комитетов и специальных групп, содействующих сближению полиции, органов власти и местного сообщества с целью предотвращения вражды, речей и преступлений ненависти;
- Обратить внимание медийного сообщества на необходимость соблюдения профессиональных этических правил и норм, ограничивая высказывания, способствующие разжиганию вражды на религиозной почве;

- Признать полезным и продолжить практику примирительных и медиативных процедур, с участием миссии СММ ОБСЕ между представителями конфессий с целью предотвращения конфликтов.

Observatory on Intolerance and Discrimination Against Christians in Europe

To the Chairmanship-in-Office:

- Consult closely with the Personal Representatives and support their work.
- Appoint a fourth Personal Representative focused on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians.

To the Personal Representatives of the Chairmanship-in-Office:

- Focus on, and adopt a standardized approach to, country visits and subsequent reports.
- Intervene when incidents do occur, through public statements and engagement with authorities of relevant participating States.

To ODIHR:

- Develop guidelines for educators on countering intolerance and discrimination against Christians.
- Develop and strengthen capacity-building activities for the protection of all religious properties, including Christian sites.
- Train law enforcement agencies, media, and civil society to recognise and report hate crimes perpetrated against majority groups.

SOVA Center for Information and Analysis

To OSCE:

- Compile and distribute experience gained from comprehensive efforts against groups that practice racist violence, including specific criminal investigations, detection and destruction of the groups' infrastructure, isolation of their funding sources, identifying organizers and coordinators of violent actions, etc. Hold an international expert workshop on this topic, if needed.
- Organize a series of seminars for law enforcement officials from different countries, presenting a summary of successful practices for collecting information and recording hate crimes statistic
- Conduct a comparative analysis of a wider range of national laws in the area of combating intolerance, as they pertain to incitement to hatred, discrimination, or activity of relevant groups, based on the existing experience of comparative analysis of the Participating States' legislation aimed at combating hate crimes.

Unconstrained Analytics, Inc

To OSCE:

- Unconstrained Analytics recommends that the OSCE and all participating States rethink the narratives they are so casually putting in motion on the assumption that 'we all know what it means' when what it appears to mean is the suppression of dissent through intimidation under color of state authority.

East European Security Research Initiative Foundation (EESRI)

To the Project Co-ordinator in Ukraine:

- Further supporting of the interaction between public authorities and civil society oriented on human rights monitoring and protection, including combating hate crimes and other manifestations of intolerance;
- Assisting Ukrainian law-enforcement authorities in improving the identification and recording of hate crimes; establishing programs to encourage victims to report hate crimes;
- Continuing project activity on the conflict sensitive journalism, including teaching on objective reporting from the conflict zone, tolerance, non-discrimination, and avoiding harsh language;
- Establishing projects on teaching tolerance in the education institutions; elaborating together with the Ministry of Education and Science of the program to include the human rights into the educational curricula at all levels;
- Establishing cooperation with the OSCE field presences in Western Balkans to exchange experiences in prevention of hate crimes and combating discrimination.

To the Special Monitoring Mission to Ukraine:

- Recording all detected hate crimes, cases of intolerance and discrimination in the territory of its monitoring with subsequent transmitting of such records to the Ukrainian law-enforcement authorities and the OSCE ODIHR for the further response.