

**OSCE  
MEETING**

**OSCE MEETING ON THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN RACIST, XENOPHOBIC  
AND ANTI-SEMITIC PROPAGANDA ON THE INTERNET AND HATE CRIMES  
Paris, 16-17 June 2004**

**Annotated Agenda**

**Opening of the Meeting: Keynote session**

In the Maastricht decision on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, participating States reaffirmed their commitment to promote tolerance and non-discrimination and combat hate crimes, which can be fuelled by racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet. To further these goals, the participating States decided to hold a meeting in Paris, fully respecting the rights to freedom of information and expression, on the relationship, if any, between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crimes.

The goals of the initial session are the following:

- to reiterate our commitment to combat hate crimes;
- to recall the importance of enhancing the rights to freedom of expression and information;
- to underline the importance of promoting tolerance, including through the Media and the Internet;
- to stress the necessity of initiating a broad debate on the possible link between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crimes with the relevant actors, including governments, international organisations, civil society and the Internet industry, with a view to identifying possible best practices.

Opening speeches:

H.E. Michel Barnier, Minister of Foreign Affairs of France  
Representative of the Chairman-in-Office

Keynote addresses:

Robert Badinter, Former Minister of Justice, France  
Dan Bryant, Assistant Attorney General, US Department of Justice  
Dalil Boubakeur, Chairman of the Council of French Muslims, France

<p><b>Session 1: Legislative Framework, Including Domestic and International Legislation Regarding Propaganda on the Internet and Hate Crimes</b></p>
---

Moderator: Amb. Christian Strohal, Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights

Introducers: Guy de Vel, Director General of Legal Affairs, Council of Europe  
Suzette Bronkhorst, Board Member for Magenta, Dutch Complaints Bureau  
for Discrimination on Internet and Secretary-General of the International  
Network Against Cyber Hate

Rabbi Abraham Cooper, Simon Wiesenthal Center, USA

This session will focus on the legislative framework surrounding racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crimes.

Topics may include, inter alia:

- National legislation and constitutional provisions regarding racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, regarding hate crimes, and regarding the link between Internet propaganda and hate crimes;
- Legal obligations of the different actors on the Internet, including the Internet Service Providers, backbone operators, e-commerce businesses, content providers, telephone, satellite and cable carriers and users;
- Factors that might limit the ability of governments, NGOs, industry groups, etc., to address racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet;
- An overview of existing initiatives by international organisations, such as inter alia, the United Nations, the OECD, the Council of Europe, the European Union, on the issue of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, hate crimes, and the potential relationship between them.

<p><b>Session 2: The Nature and Extent of the Relationship Between Racist, Xenophobic and anti-Semitic Propaganda on the Internet and Hate Crimes</b></p>
---

Moderator: Dr. Beate Winkler, Director, European Union Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia

Introducers: Michael Whine, Community Security Trust, United Kingdom  
Christopher Wolf - Partner, Law Firm of Proskauer Rose LLP and Chair of the Internet Task Force of the Anti-Defamation League  
Stieg Larsson, Director, Expo Foundation, Sweden

This session will focus on the relationship between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda and the commission of hate crimes. Special attention will be paid to studies carried out by various actors (government bodies, NGOs, industry groups, experts, etc.) to assess the effects, if any, of propaganda on the Internet on violence, including criminal behavior, specifically with respect to the commission of hate crimes.

Topics may include, inter alia:

- An overview of existing public and private initiatives aimed at providing information and analysis based on sound methodology on the possible link between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda and hate crimes with a view to assessing the objectives and effect of these initiatives and, where necessary, their validity;
- An analysis of the contents of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and of the means used by their authors (sites, discussion forums, etc.);
- An assessment, based on reliable statistics, where such exist, of the effects, if any, of propaganda on the Internet on violent and/or criminal behavior with respect to the commission of hate crimes.

**Session 3: Public and Private Partnerships in the Fight  
Against Racism, Xenophobia and Anti-Semitism  
on the Internet – Best Practices**

Moderator: Isabelle Falque-Pierrotin, Chairperson of the Internet Rights Forum, France

Introducers: Miklos Haraszti, OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media  
Brian Marcus, Director of Internet Monitoring, Anti Defamation League  
Anton Nosik, Editor-in-Chief of Rambler.ru, Russian Federation

This session will aim at identifying and assessing measures taken by government bodies, civil society, including NGOs, religious associations, and industry groups – on a voluntary basis - to address racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and its relationship to hate crimes with a view to highlighting best practices and fostering regular information-sharing throughout the OSCE area.

Topics may include, inter alia:

- Cooperation between government agencies, NGOs, religious associations, and industry groups on the issues of racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crime;
- Assessment of appropriateness of government action versus voluntary action;
- Assessment of whether limitations on racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda are effective in preventing hate crimes;
- Presentation of initiatives taken by relevant international organizations (i.e. European Union, Council of Europe ECRI) to tackle the issue of the relationship between racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crimes (goals, results achieved, perspectives);
- Voluntary steps, if any, taken by the Internet industry in each participating State to address racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet;
- Technical and other means used by organizations or networks to research and/or monitor racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda and incitement to violence on the Internet.

**Session 4: Promoting Tolerance on and through the Internet – Best Practices to Educate  
Users and Heighten Public Awareness**

Moderator: Amb. Prof. Luigi Vittorio Ferraris, Former Deputy Foreign Minister of Italy

Introducers: Andras Nyiro, Founding Editor-in-Chief of Index.hu, Hungary  
Stefan Glazer, Manager of the project on right-wing extremism on the internet,  
Jugendschutz.net, Jugendschutz, Germany  
Cathy Wing, Director of Community Programming, Media Awareness Network,  
Canada

The broad debate initiated in 2003 at the Vienna Conferences on Anti-Semitism (June) and on Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination (September), and continued at the Human Dimension Implementation Meeting (October), has highlighted education as a vital factor in developing tolerance and understanding. This session aims at assessing the steps taken

throughout the OSCE area to inform the public about racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, hate crime, and the potential relationship between them. It will also explore the Internet's potential as a critical tool in promoting tolerance through education of users and public awareness raising.

Topics may include, inter alia:

- The need to promote broader access to diverse opinions on the Internet throughout the OSCE area as a crucial educational and awareness-raising tool to foster tolerance and combat hate crimes;
- Programs designed for young people and educators to inform them about hate crimes and about the negative effects of racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, and to explore the potential relationship between such propaganda and hate crime;
- Training programs for public authorities, especially for law enforcement officials, on hate crimes and on racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, and on exploring the potential relationship between them;
- Private initiatives (NGOs and/or industry groups) to educate users about hate crimes and about racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, and to explore the potential relationship between them.

### **Closing session: Conclusions and Recommendations**

In the closing session the four moderators will summarize discussions and recommendations in the sessions on how the OSCE participating States and OSCE structures can strengthen and operationalize their efforts to address the relationship, if any, between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crimes, while fully respecting the rights to freedom of information and expression. There will be also the possibility for reactions from the floor. The outcome of the Meeting, in particular as regards the promotion of best practices, will be brought forward to the Human Dimension Implementation Meeting in Warsaw in October 2004.

In order to more accurately reflect the results of the Meeting, participants are encouraged to submit in writing to the Chairmanship-in-Office any recommendation they wish to make. It would be helpful if participants could specify for whom the recommendations are intended, for example individual OSCE participating States, the OSCE as a whole, or OSCE structures and institutions.

**Agenda**                    **OSCE Meeting on the Relationship Between Racist, Xenophobic and anti-Semitic Propaganda on the Internet and Hate Crimes**

**Day 1**                    **16 June 2004**

9:00 – 10:15    OPENING SESSION – PRESENTING THE CONTEXT

- Reiterating our commitment to combat hate crimes,
- Recalling the importance of enhancing the rights to freedom of expression and information,
- Underlining the importance of promoting tolerance, including through the media and the Internet,
- Stressing the necessity of initiating a broad debate on the possible link between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crimes with the relevant actors, including governments, international organizations, civil society and the Internet industry, with a view to identifying possible best practices.

Opening speeches:

H.E. Michel Barnier, Minister of Foreign Affairs of France  
Representative of the Chairman-in-Office

Keynote addresses:

Robert Badinter, Former Minister of Justice, France  
Dan Bryant, Assistant Attorney General, US Department of Justice  
Dalil Boubakeur, Chairman of the Council of French Muslims, France

10:15 – 10:45    BREAK

10:45 – 12:30    SESSION 1: LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK, INCLUDING DOMESTIC AND INTERNATIONAL LEGISLATION REGARDING PROPAGANDA ON THE INTERNET AND HATE CRIMES

Topics may include, *inter alia*:

- National legislation and constitutional provisions regarding racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, regarding hate crimes, and regarding the link between Internet propaganda and hate crimes;
- Legal obligations of the different actors on the Internet, including the Internet Service Providers, web hosting services, backbone operators, e-commerce businesses, content providers, telephone, satellite and cable carriers and users;
- Factors that might limit the ability of governments, international organizations, NGOs, industry groups, etc., to address racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet;
- An overview of existing initiatives by international organizations, such as *inter alia*, the United Nations, the OECD, the Council of Europe, the European Union, on the issue of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, hate crimes, and the potential relationship between them.

Moderator: Amb. Christian Strohal, Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights

Introducers: Guy de Vel, Director General of Legal Affairs, Council of Europe  
Suzette Bronkhorst, Board Member for Magenta, Dutch Complaints Bureau for Discrimination on Internet and Secretary-General of the International Network Against Cyber Hate  
Rabbi Abraham Cooper, Simon Wiesenthal Center, USA

#### General Discussions

12:30 – 14:30 LUNCH BREAK

14:30 – 16:15 SESSION 2: THE NATURE AND EXTENT OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN RACIST, XENOPHOBIC AND ANTI-SEMITIC PROPAGANDA ON THE INTERNET AND HATE CRIMES

Topics may include, *inter alia*:

- An overview of existing public and private initiatives aimed at providing information and analysis based on sound methodology on the possible link between racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda and hate crimes with a view to assessing the objectives and effect of these initiatives and, where necessary, their validity;
- An analysis of the contents of racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and of the means used by their authors (sites, discussion forums, etc.);
- An assessment, based on reliable statistics, where such exist, of the effects, if any, of propaganda on the Internet on criminal behavior with respect to the commission of hate crimes.

Moderator: Dr. Beate Winkler, Director, European Union Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia

Introducers: Michael Whine, Community Security Trust, United Kingdom  
Christopher Wolf - Partner, Law Firm of Proskauer Rose LLP and Chair of the Internet Task Force of the Anti-Defamation League  
Stieg Larsson, Director, Expo Foundation, Sweden

#### General Discussions

16:15 – 18:00 SESSION 3: PUBLIC AND PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP IN THE FIGHT AGAINST RACISM, XENOPHOBIA AND ANTI-SEMITISM ON THE INTERNET – BEST PRACTICES

Topics may include, *inter alia*:

- Co-operation between government agencies, international organizations, NGOs, religious associations, and industry groups on the issues of racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet and hate crime;

- Assessment of appropriateness of government versus voluntary action in the fight against racism, xenophobia and anti-Semitism on the Internet;
- Assessment of whether limitations on racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda are effective in preventing hate crimes;
- Voluntary steps, if any, taken by the Internet industry in each participating State to address racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet;
- Technical and other means used by organizations or networks to research and/or monitor racist, xenophobic and anti-Semitic propaganda and incitement to violence on the Internet.

Moderator: Isabelle Falque-Pierrotin, Chairperson of the Internet Rights Forum, France

Introducers: Miklos Haraszi, OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media  
 Brian Marcus, Director of Internet Monitoring, Anti Defamation League  
 Anton Nosik, Editor-in-Chief of Rambler.ru, Russian Federation

General Discussions

18:00 CLOSE OF DAY ONE

## RECEPTION

**Day 2 17 June 2004**

9:30 – 11:15 SESSION 4: PROMOTING TOLERANCE ON AND THROUGH THE  
 INTERNET – BEST PRACTICES TO EDUCATE USERS AND HEIGHTEN  
 PUBLIC AWARENESS

Topics may include, *inter alia*:

- The need to promote broader access to diverse opinions on the Internet throughout the OSCE area as a crucial educational and awareness-raising tool to foster tolerance and combat hate crimes;
- Programmes designed for young people and educators to inform them about hate crimes and about the negative effects of racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, and to explore the potential relationship between such propaganda and hate crime;
- Training programmes for public authorities, especially for law enforcement officials, on hate crimes and on racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, and on exploring the potential relationship between them;
- Private initiatives (NGOs and/or industry groups) to educate users about hate crimes and about racist, xenophobic, and anti-Semitic propaganda on the Internet, and to explore the potential relationship between them.

Moderator: Amb. Prof. Luigi Vittorio Ferraris, Former Deputy Foreign Minister of Italy

Introducers: Andras Nyiro, Founding Editor-in-Chief of Index.hu, Hungary  
 Stefan Glazer, Manager of the project on right-wing extremism on the internet,  
 Jugendschutz.net, Jugendschutz, Germany  
 Cathy Wing, Director of Community Programming, Media Awareness Network,  
 Canada

General Discussions:

11:15 – 11:45 BREAK

11:45 – 13:00 CLOSING PLENARY

Conclusions and recommendations

Reports by the Plenary Sessions Moderators

Comments form the floor

Representative of the Chairman-in-Office

13:00

CLOSE OF DAY TWO