

CHAPTER 4

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DATA

Introduction

Given the limitations and the exploratory nature of the project, as well as the lack of sufficient amount of cases from police and prosecutorial services for in-depth analysis, the decision was made to select cases from a wide variety of sources in a number of different countries aiming at exploring various forms of trafficking into different markets. The top priority was to collect cases with adequate information concerning the various aspects of human trafficking to include the modus operandi, the various relationships between criminals within the organization and the nexus between upper- and underworld activities. This chapter will elaborate on the data collected before turning to an analysis of the cases in the following chapter. A short description of the cases can be found in Appendix 1.

Selection of Countries

Geographical coverage was a concern in the selection of cases. An attempt was made to examine cases from as many OSCE participating States as possible, given the limitation of contacts, time and fluency in the languages of the research team members. Researchers selected cases where enough detail was provided to allow an analysis of the structure of the organization as well as information on how the organization or individual traffickers operated. An attempt was made to examine cases from a number of OSCE participating States. This report contains cases from the following destination countries: Belgium, Germany, Netherlands, Russian Federation, Tajikistan, United Kingdom, United States and Uzbekistan.¹⁴² These cases say nothing about the seriousness or prevalence of trafficking within particular countries. The selection of cases was, in part, determined by the researchers' access to and availability of texts in English, German, Russian and Dutch.

Selection of Cases

In order to portray trafficking in all of its many facets, the decision was made to gather cases of trafficking in commercial sexual exploitation and labour exploitation in various markets – agricultural, construction, domestic service, food service and waste disposal. Table 4.1 provides information on the countries of destination and markets of exploitation.

¹⁴² In a number of cases in this study, other destination countries for trafficked victims were mentioned. These include Greece, Israel, Italy and the United Arab Emirates.

Table 4.1 Cases, Destination Countries and Markets of Exploitation

Case	Destination Country	Market of Exploitation
1 Belgium construction	Belgium	Construction
2 Belgium Chinese cooks	Belgium	Private Service Sector: Gastronomy
3 Germany Chinese cooks	Germany	Private Service Sector: Gastronomy
4 International trafficking	France and Italy	Commercial Prostitution
5 Netherlands (Operation Ablak)	Netherlands	Commercial Prostitution
6 Netherlands (Operation Sneep)	Netherlands	Commercial Prostitution
7 Netherlands (Operation Koolvis)	Netherlands	Commercial Prostitution
8 Russian-Moldovan-Israeli Criminal Group	Various	Commercial Prostitution
9 Krasnodar slave labour at public dump	Russian Federation	Public Service Sector: Waste disposal
10 Uzbek migrants' slave labour in vegetable cellar	Russian Federation	Private Service Sector: Food retailing
11 Slavery on farm in Omsk region	Russian Federation	Agriculture
12 Forced labour of psycho-neurological patients in Karelia	Russian Federation	Private Households
13 Tajikistan international prostitution	Various	Commercial Prostitution
14 UK (Maka)	United Kingdom	Commercial Prostitution
15 UK (Tavoraite)	United Kingdom	Commercial Prostitution
16 UK (Plakici)	United Kingdom	Commercial Prostitution
17 UK (Elezaj)	United Kingdom	Commercial Prostitution
18 UK (Operation Celsius)	United Kingdom	Commercial Prostitution
19 UK (Operation Ruby)	United Kingdom	Agriculture
20 San Antonio sex trafficking of minors	United States of America	Commercial Prostitution
21 California domestic slave	United States of America	Forced domestic labour in private household
22 Korean prostitution ring	United States of America	Commercial Prostitution
23 Forced labour in hair braiding salons	United States of America	Private Service Sector: Hair braiding salons
24 Family prostitution business	Uzbekistan	Commercial Prostitution
25 Forced work on a construction site	Uzbekistan	Construction site

Sources

Cases

Cases included in the study were obtained from experts in the field and official publications. These included publications from the Centre for Equal Opportunity and Opposition to Racism (*Centrum voor Gelijkheid van Kansen en voor Racismebestrijding*) in Belgium, the National Police in the Netherlands, and court documents obtained from the Human Trafficking Centre in the United Kingdom and the Investigative Committee of the Prosecutor's General Office of the Russian Federation. Press and media reports were utilized when they provided enough information suitable for the analysis.

Additional information used for this report, but not included in the list of cases, was obtained from Eurojust's 2007 Annual Report and a crime pattern analysis of human trafficking from the National Crime Squad of the Netherlands Police Agency. Both of these sources provided information on the criminal organizations involved in human trafficking and other crimes.

Expert Interviews

Interviews with experts were held in Austria, the Netherlands, the United Kingdom, the Russian Federation and Tajikistan. In Austria, no cases were included in the study and information comes almost exclusively from interviews with experts. Experts were asked to provide information on human trafficking into or within their country looking at such factors as the typology and modus operandi of trafficking organizations, the roles of actors within the organizations, manipulation and control of victims, the markets of exploitation, links with other organized criminal activities and criminal groups as well as links to the legitimate business sector. Examining human trafficking

from a criminal business perspective, the researchers sought information on the mechanisms used by organizations to increase profits and reduce costs and risks as well as the money laundering process and investment of profits of the trafficking organizations. Successes and gaps in current responses to human trafficking were sought. The interview protocol as well as a list of experts interviewed can be found in Appendices 2 and 3 respectively.

Checklists for the Analysis of Cases

A checklist was developed for the analysis of cases.¹⁴³ Items contained in the checklist include aspects of the *trafficking process* (whether the case was domestic or international, the countries involved, recruitment, transportation, markets of exploitation, coercion and economic investments of criminals); the *criminals* (the number, gender, nationality, legal residency and criminal antecedents); the *criminal organizations* (the structure, tasks, division of labour, involvement of women as traffickers, co-operation or competition with other criminal organizations); *secondary activities* (other crimes in addition to human trafficking); and intersection with the *upperworld* (intersection with legitimate markets and actors, government corruption). The checklist for the analysis of cases can be found in Appendix 4.

A second instrument was developed to analyse the measures that trafficking networks, operating as businesses, take to increase their profits while reducing risks and costs. Measures taken to *increase profits* might involve such things as trafficking victims into areas in which there is a high market demand and high prices paid for workers, in the case of prostitutes, forcing them to have unprotected sex, using children to fetch higher prices, rotating or selling victims to bring fresh faces on the market, selling or renting out victims to other traffickers, keeping all of the profits and forcing victims to work long hours and earn a specific amount of money before they can stop working. *Reducing costs* may include such practices as housing numerous victims in a single dwelling, subjecting them to inhuman conditions (failing to provide food or sanitary conditions), refusing to pay for medical services and recruiting/exploiting those residing legally in a country. *Risk reduction* would entail the use of fraudulent documents, recruiting women working as prostitutes in their own country, exploitation of vulnerable victims such as homeless persons, drug or alcohol addicts, or irregular migrants (no one will miss them and they are less likely to seek help), use of safe houses and bodyguards to escort victims to work, manipulation and violence to control victims, recruitment and exploitation of locals, forced prostitution in escort services (or less visible sectors), use of corrupt officials, use of aliases, replacement of telephones and talking in code to avoid police taps, use of legitimate businesses to aid the trafficking operation – legal services, banking, travel agencies, property management, and others. This checklist can be found in Appendix 5.

Timeframe of Data Collection and Compilation

While initial interviews were held with experts in Austria in October and November 2008, data collection and the majority of interviews were held during a three month period between October and December 2009. While interviews were held and cases were collected by all members of the research team, the data were compiled using the checklist for the analysis of cases by a single member of the team. Data was collected between mid-September 2009 and mid-December 2009 and compiled between November and December 2009.

Strengths and Challenges of the Research Methodology and Data

The methodology employed in this study allowed systematizing known cases of human trafficking along some basic criteria. Since the criteria variables (see checklist in Appendix 4) were chosen by researchers for this particular study focused on the business model of human trafficking, they would be insufficient or might not match the needs of studies focused, for example, on victims. At the same time, the indicators/variables in the checklist are fairly diverse and can be used in other studies of the involvement of criminal networks or organized criminal activities.

The research methodology was based on real trafficking cases from selected countries. This was the point of principal importance and at the same time the major challenge. Although a number of trafficking cases were successfully investigated and prosecuted in all countries selected for this study, due to the limited time available to collect original case material, the research relied heavily on secondary sources of data. In addition to time constraints, researchers were limited due to widely dispersed spatial allocation of cases,¹⁴⁴ and bureaucracy. Relying upon secondary sources

143 H.G. Van de Bunt and E.R. Kleemans, *Georganiseerde criminaliteit in Nederland* (Meppel: Boom Juridische Uitgevers, 2007), <http://www.wodc.nl/images/ob252_vollledige_tekst_tcm44-81966.pdf>, accessed 31 March 2010: Information was taken, in part, from the checklist to analyse case files for the Organized Crime Monitor of the Dutch Research and Documentation Centre of the Ministry of Justice.

144 For example, in Russia cases were selected in Moscow, Far East, Karelia (West) and Krasnodar (South).

and being unable to access complete police investigation or prosecution case files, the researchers utilized cases which sometimes lacked sufficient information for some indicators/variables from the checklist. The decision was made not to exclude the variables from the checklist, but to keep them in order to at least identify more precisely the gaps in data that need to be collected in further research.

It is impossible to conduct empirical research on markets, trafficking modus operandi and the involvement of criminals and criminal organizations in trafficking in all 56 OSCE participating States in this exploratory exercise. The strength of this methodology lies in the creation of tools (see the interview protocol and case-file checklist in Appendices 2 and 4) which researchers in OSCE countries can use to further their knowledge of the phenomenon in their own countries.

Concluding Remarks

This chapter has provided insight into the data collection and has introduced the tools generated by this study for the analysis of cases of human trafficking included in this study. Some of the strengths and challenges of the study have been identified.